

THEOSIS IN ROBERT BARCLAY (1648-1690):
A WAY FORWARD IN ‘TRUE CHRISTIAN DIVINITY’

by

KEVIN MORTIMER

A thesis submitted to the University of Birmingham for the degree of

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

School of Philosophy, Theology and Religion

College of Arts and Law

The University of Birmingham

May 2024

University of Birmingham Research Archive e-theses repository



This unpublished thesis/dissertation is under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International (CC BY 4.0) licence.

You are free to:

Share — copy and redistribute the material in any medium or format

Adapt — remix, transform, and build upon the material for any purpose, even commercially.

The licensor cannot revoke these freedoms as long as you follow the license terms.

Under the following terms:



Attribution — You must give appropriate credit, provide a link to the license, and indicate if changes were made. You may do so in any reasonable manner, but not in any way that suggests the licensor endorses you or your use.

No additional restrictions — You may not apply legal terms or technological measures that legally restrict others from doing anything the license permits.

Notices:

You do not have to comply with the license for elements of the material in the public domain or where your use is permitted by an applicable exception or limitation.

No warranties are given. The license may not give you all of the permissions necessary for your intended use. For example, other rights such as publicity, privacy, or moral rights may limit how you use the material.

Unless otherwise stated, any material in this thesis/dissertation that is cited to a third-party source is not included in the terms of this licence. Please refer to the original source(s) for licencing conditions of any quotes, images or other material cited to a third party.

Abstract

Robert Barclay (1648-1690), a key Quaker theologian, claimed that the Quaker path of the Christian faith is the final end of the Protestant reformation of Roman Catholic Christianity, which concluded in the United Kingdom with the implementation of the Tolerance Act of 1688 by royal assent in 1689. This thesis, using the Bernard Lonergan (1904-1984) Method in Theology, argues that Barclay's articulation of 'true Christian divinity' corresponds with the salvation economy of theosis in Eastern Orthodox Christianity. This idea is a variance fundamentally from what became Reformed Protestantism. Through a chronological exegesis of Barclay's collective work (1670-1679) using the Lonergan Method, each Barclay chapter begins with recent scholarship on Robert Barclay and concludes with Eastern Orthodox scholarship while using the Lonergan Method with a Quaker and Orthodox practitioner in the footnotes of the main of Barclay's work. This dissertation demonstrates that Barclay's 'true Christian divinity' aligns with the salvation economy of theosis in Eastern Orthodoxy, namely, 'Humanity becomes by Grace indwelling what God is by nature'.

Table of Contents

CHAPTER 1: Introduction.....	1
Key Ideas.....	2
Eastern Theosis in the West	11
Literature Review	54
Research Originality.....	69
Reception of Barclay’s epistemology in the Quaker Tradition	72
Methodological approach.....	114
CHAPTER 2: Historical Context in which Barclay defines ‘True Christianity Divinity’	119
Robert Barclay encounters Quakerism as a Christian sect 1663-1667.....	120
Robert Barclay joins the Quaker path of the Christian faith 1667	124
Robert Barclay defends Quakerism as Prelapsarian Life and Christianity.....	131
CONCLUSION:	146
CHAPTER 3: Barclay and the Saints and Fathers	148
INTRODUCTION:.....	148
BARCLAY SCHOLARSHIP RELATED TO THE SAINTS AND THE FATHERS	149
BARCLAY AND THE SAINTS AND THE CHURCH FATHERS [LONERGAN METHOD]	154
1 The Church Fathers give the Foundation to Barclay’s arrival at Theosis	154
2 The Saint Becomes Pure through the Spirit of Christ who Indwells.....	155
3 The Lord’s Teaching through the Nous brings forth the Righteous Life	157
4 The Life and Teaching of Christ in the Lives of the Saints are Priority.....	158
5 Saints experience oneness with God like the Father and the Son experience Oneness.....	160
6 Saints become ‘Fools for Christ’ in the eyes of the Christian Professor and the Worldly Profane....	160
7 Fathers’ Exhort, Instruct, Reprove, Condemn, and Judge those Begotten in Christ Jesus.....	161
8 The ‘True Seed’ of God’s Love’ is communicated unanimously by the Fathers.....	164
9 GOD is superior to the Scriptures in Communicating to the Saints	168
10 The Righteous in Scripture and the Saints in History are a Telios to the Christian	169
11 The Augustinians, Pelagians, and Semi-Pelagians have not arrived at the Nature of Christ’s evangelical Principle as have the Church Father’s and the Quakers.....	172
12 The Saints and Quakers communicate the Full Extent of God’s Uncreated Grace to all Humanity 173	
13 Cyril of Alexandria (367-444) and Clement of Alexandria (150-215) articulate the New Covenant Light of the Son shining in All.....	174
14 Operative Faith and Cooperative Works were embraced by the Fathers, First Reformers, and now by the Quakers.....	178
15 The <i>Telios</i> of the Saints is ‘Hitting the Mark’ of God’s Prelapsarian - Christian Righteousness	180

16 The Quakers join with the Saints in rejecting the Scholastic Apostasy from the 8 th through the 16 th Centuries.....	182
17 The Saints being translated from the Kingdom of this World into the Kingdom of God was lost in the Apostasy.....	182
18 Silence, Waiting, and Listening followed by Obedience is the Heart of Monastic Life throughout History.....	184
19 Saints jointly Partake of the One Son of Man; the Incarnation of God.....	187
20 Christ is compared to the Grain of Mustard Seed in the teaching of Clement of Alexandria (150-215).....	190
21 Quakers are uniform with the Fathers in Christ's indwelling being more than Scholastic Election	194
ORTHODOX SCHOLARSHIP AND CONCLUSION.....	196
CHAPTER 4: Barclay and the Essence and Energy of God	203
BARCLAY SCHOLARSHIP ON THE ESSENCE & ENERGY OF GOD.....	203
BARCLAY AND THE ESSENCE & ENERGY OF GOD [LONERGAN METHOD].....	207
1 The incarnation of God has experienced Deicide at the hands of Fallen Humanity so as to be resurrected within Humanity.....	207
2 Christ as Sunbeam cannot be Separated from Christ the Sun who shines in All	208
3 The Incarnation, Jesus Christ, being the Worker in humanity is the ground of Justification.....	209
4 The Spirit of Pentecost is undefilable as Fire is undefilable in what it touches, being the New Covenant fulfillment of the Incarnation and the Father.....	209
5 The Light of Christ and Day of the Lord is as Darkness in those who reject Christ's coming within	210
6 The One Bread of which the Body uniformly partakes is the Resurrected Jesus Christ (John 6:53).	212
7 Jesus seals the Gospel dispensation by his Blood in defeating Death, and appears to his disciples Post-resurrection giving Life through the pouring forth of the Spirit.....	213
8 Jesus as Head, and the Spirit who fills, Guides the 'Church' today as in the Garden.....	214
9 The unknowable Essence and the knowable Energy are two metaphysical Realities in 'knowing' God	215
10 Heart Knowledge coming by the New Covenant Spirit transcends Fallen Head Knowledge.....	216
11 There is no knowledge of the Father but by the Son who is Bodily Mediator, Revelation of God, and Son of Man	217
12 The Quaker prelapsarian faith Present, and the Ancient faith Past is in One and the Same Rock...	218
13 The Spirit, sent of the Father in the name of Christ, indwells the Body of the Saint as New Covenant Temple.....	220
14 The Eternal Word and Spirit supersede the canonized Scriptures.....	222
15 The Incarnation, in his Death and Resurrection, provides the evangelical principle of Light and Life in all People	224
16 The Energy of God is the uncreated Spiritual, Heavenly, and Invisible principle in which God as Father, Son, and Spirit dwell, a measure of which is the seed of the 2 nd Adam	225

17 The Atonement and Sacrifice of Jesus Christ without coincides as one with the New Covenant Evangelical Dispensation within.....	226
18 The Light of the World is never separate from Jesus Christ, who has his Habitation in his Light Forever, being separate from Fallen Brain Knowledge	227
19 Christ lies humbly in the seed of the 2 nd Adam in same way as Christ came as incarnation to lay down his Life for All.....	228
20 The Soul gives witness to the Light per Augustine, but the Light is not ‘the Light’ as taught by the Platonists	229
21 The Name of Jesus comes to be in All where the Nature and Fallen part, not One with Christ is Judged Out.....	231
22 According to Jesus, the Author of the Christian Religion, Worship is performed in the Spirit, and accompanied by occasional Gatherings of Christ’s Body	232
23 Jesus’ Final Call is Baptism in-into the Father, the Son, and Holy Spirit.....	232
24 Jesus is the Bread from Heaven by which the New Creation is Nourished	234
25 The humble seed of Christ within provides the Rebirth necessary to Fellowship with the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit	236
26 Created Humanity and Fallen nature are comforted through God becoming Incarnate through the <i>Theotokos</i>	239
27 God became incarnate through the <i>Theotokos</i> , and is the Resurrected Seed in the Human heart....	240
28 The Illumination of Jesus Christ in the heart is the Spirit’s uncreated inspiration.....	241
29 The Kataphatic and Noetic seed of the 2 nd Adam received is at the same time the Heavenly and Metaphysical Jesus Christ, and the Earthly and Physical Jesus Christ	241
30 Barclay writes to the Christian world concerning things in which He Disagrees rather than things for which He Agrees such as God being ‘Trinity’	245
31 The Formal Object before the Fall was the LORD God, and the Formal Object since the Resurrection is the LORD God	248
32 Jesus the incarnation, being begotten of the Father through the seed of the Spirit in the <i>Theotokos</i> did not exercise the same seed of sin as did the Descendants of 1 st Adam	249
33 The uncreated nature of God and light of Christ, being unintelligible to the rational senses, causes the later Reformers to make ‘God’ to align with Satan and his bottomless pit than with the fullness of God as Trinity.....	250
34 Rebirth through the uncreated Spirit of God results in Regeneration unto Prelapsarian Being	251
35 The Christ of eternity is the Christ of history to be begotten of and brought forth in all Humanity	252
36 Uncreated Light or Grace that is Christ, is the holiness of God in Humanity	253
37 The Eternal Body of Jesus and the Physical Incarnation are the two Bodies of Christ as One to be partaken of unto Glorification and Life Eternal	253
ORTHODOX SCHOLARSHIP AND CONCLUSION	255
CHAPTER 5: Barclay and the Purification of the Christian	263
BARCLAY SCHOLARSHIP RELATED TO THE PURIFICATION OF THE CHRISTIAN.....	263
BARCLAY AND THE PURIFICATION OF THE CHRISTIAN [LONERGAN METHOD]	267

1 For Healing to take affect Christ's Blood and Wine must be applied as Kingdom Plaster on the Wound	268
2 Faith in Degrees Purifies the Heart as Combined with Works.....	270
3 The Path of 'being made Right' with God includes Mortification.....	271
4 Submitting to the living Word and Law of God in the Heart brings Peace.....	273
5 The noble Universal principle is Jesus Christ mercifully and justly cutting away the wicked Nature and Spirit.....	275
6 The Inward Bond with Christ is first broken before any Outward Bond with the Body is Broken ...	275
7 Though Doctrines are Accepted and Doctrines Rejected, there is No Imposition placed on Christian Liberty of Conscience	277
8 The Spirit leads the Disciple into Pureness of Life beyond all Outward Forms	278
9 Holiness is the Accident that denominates a Person holy through Cooperation with the Divine	280
10 Salvation comes by Knowing Jesus as Word and Light indwelling the heart, establishing His Reign	282
11 Justification comes by 'Becoming a Doer' of the Fulfilled Inward Law of Christ	284
12 Works are integral in the Justification of our person through Christ's seed	290
13 Hitting the Mark is a constant Battle in response to Humanities fallen Nature and the Adversary .	291
14 Christ was made Manifest to Destroy the Works of the Devil and to take away Sin through Mortification.....	293
15 Waiting on the Light and Seed of Christ within is the heart of Justification.....	297
16 The Work in Gathered Worship is Purification of the Soul	298
17 The Conflict is between the Fallen Adam and the New Adam	299
18 Waiting in Silence upon the Lord is the singular New Covenant Imperative required in the New Testament	300
19 New Birth springs from the Seed of the 2 nd Adam as a Mustard Tree springs from a Mustard Seed	301
20 God who is Spirit is to be worshiped in spirit from the Heart.....	302
21 The burning up of 1 st Adam's fallenness comes by God's Purifying Judgment through the 2 nd Adam	305
22 Being Turned from Darkness to Light, beginning in the Conscience, is the New Covenant <i>telios</i> of God	306
23 Application of Christ's Justification results in Love, Peace, and Righteousness through the Conscience renewed	308
24 The Work of Justification is Cooperative and Synergistic with Christ Within	311
26 Christ Formed in the Mind Noetically is the <i>telios</i> of Christ's indwelling Habitation.....	313
27 Barclay's view of Purification in Justification coincides with the Church Fathers and the shadow Scriptures.....	314
ORTHODOX SCHOLARSHIP AND CONCLUSION	316
CHAPTER 6: Barclay and the Universal Call of God	320
BARCLAY SCHOLARSHIP RELATED TO THE UNIVERSAL CALL OF GOD.....	320
BARCLAY AND THE UNIVERSAL CALL OF GOD [LONERGAN METHOD]	324

1 The breathing seed of the 2 nd Adam calls those claiming Infusion, Imputation, or Election to hear the Shepherd and Bishop of their Soul.....	325
2 Faith is wrought through Cooperating with Christ who dwells in the Soul	326
3 The Voice of the Father supersedes the Canon of the Church in calling all too Prelapsarian Communion	327
4 The light of Christ and the gospel of Christ are one in calling all through the Resurrected seed of the Incarnation.....	328
5 The Voice of the Father is a witness greater than Jesus's miracles and John the Baptist's testimony.....	329
6 The Voice of the Spirit is more than the immovable wax of Scripture in calling every Person	329
7 The Offer of Restored Communion with God is complete through Participation.....	333
8 The Twelve Consequences of being informed by the light and seed of the second Adam, the Spirit of Pentecost, and the Fulfilled Law of Christ written in the Heart	334
9 Through the seed taking Root, the new Person or Creation is born, bringing forth Prelapsarian Communion	336
10 The History of the Incarnation is Profitable and Comfortable with the Mystery, and never without the Mystery.....	337
11 God directs in the Application of the light of Christ in every Person	338
12 God's Mercy and Justice Work consequentially in those responding to God's seed	339
13 People can know Jesus kataphatically and savingly in their Heart without knowing His incarnational Name	341
14 The Prayer of those responding to the Seed comes by the Spirit	343
15 The Result of God's Universal Love is that the Well Disposed Understanding receives God's Revelation.....	343
16 Gentiles do the Things contained in the Law by Visitation of the New Covenant seed of God Within.....	344
17 The Disciple joins in God's Universal Call by entering Prelapsarian Life with God through God's light and seed	345
18 The Preaching of the Gospel in all People is more universal than the Vineyard Workers receiving Wages from their Owner	346
19 Doing Justice, Loving Mercy, and Walking Humbly with God is the indefinite Universal Call of God in all People	347
20 The Gospel to be preached is in Every Creature under Heaven.....	348
21 Jesus Christ and His Body are Uniform in the Way in which the Gospel is to be preached.....	350
ORTHODOX SCHOLARSHIP AND CONCLUSION	351
CHAPTER 7: Barclay and the Testimony of the Saint	355
BARCLAY SCHOLARSHIP RELATED TO THE TESTIMONY OF THE SAINT	355
BARCLAY AND THE TESTIMONY OF THE SAINT [LONERGAN METHOD]	360
1 Inward Holiness and Righteousness is the means by which the twice born experiences Christ and His Kingdom.....	360
2 Restored Communion with God comes by the Spirit of Pentecost by whom one knows God and prays.....	362

3 Questions of Equity and Justice amongst the Body are determined by the Body	364
4 The True Seed of the Ancient Christians is joined with by the Quakers according to God's Love...	365
5 The Grace of God, Uncreated, has been communicated to all Humanity	366
6 Jesus Christ Formed Within is the Means of Hitting the Prelapsarian Mark of God's Righteousness	367
7 Humility is at the Heart of God's Kingdom being established through Watchfulness and Diligence	367
8 The Church under the leadership of the one Spirit has been disrupted through Scholasticism.....	368
9 The Day is restored whereby the Gospel as New Covenant Reality is realized.....	370
10 The Singular Nature of Worship amongst Quakers has a Cleansing Effect in all Participants.....	371
11 Worship in Spirit and in Truth produces Fruit in keeping with Christ indwelling as seed	373
12 God's Kingdom is propagated organically through Liberty of Conscience and Persuasion.....	377
13 Six Practices affecting the realization of God's Kingdom to be ascetically implemented.....	380
14 God's Prelapsarian Mark is expressing the Perfection of the Father through Mercy, Love, Integrity, and Transparency	381
15 The way of Christ (<i>Theosis</i>) in returning to the Father is inconvenient and reprehensible in the World's eye	383
16 Barclay argues that True Christian Divinity begins within the prelapsarian Disciple of Jesus Christ	384
ORTHODOX SCHOLARSHIP AND CONCLUSION.....	387
CHAPTER 8: Conclusion	396
Future Research.....	400
Universalism and Hesychasm in Quakerism and Orthodoxy	406
Bibliography	419
Bibliography of Consulted Works.....	424
Appendix Bernard Lonergan: Method in Theology	431

CHAPTER 1: Introduction

INTRODUCTION: Arguably, Robert Barclay (1648-1690) has been misunderstood within Protestant Christianity because his core soteriology - what this researcher distills as ‘humanity becomes by Grace indwelling what God is by nature’ - is at odds fundamentally with Western Christianity, instead comporting with the Eastern Orthodox notion of Theosis. This introductory chapter includes definitions of the following for purposes of assessment in the concluding chapter: Theosis in the East and within the West, deification, apophatic knowledge, and kataphatic knowledge, followed by the Protestant definitions of Scripture alone, faith alone, grace alone, and Christ alone. At the conclusion of this section a history of the differentiation between the East and West will be included which reveals where Theosis is found in the West with an emphasis on scholasticism. Following that is a literature review of what scholars have written on Robert Barclay, why this dissertation is an original argument, and concludes with a summary of the reception of Barclay’s epistemology within Quaker tradition. The next section is a summary of Bernard Lonergan’s (1904-1984) speculative, empirical, and transcendental method in theology used as the means of uncovering the equivalent of Theosis in Barclay’s writing. Chapter two provides the historical context in which Barclay defines ‘true Christian divinity’ through his encounter with Quakers, his joining with Quakers, and his defense of Quakerism as prelapsarian life and Christianity. This will be followed by five chapters in Barclay’s own words using the Lonergan Method in Theology on the Saints and Fathers, the Essence and Energy of God, the Purification of the Christian, the Universal Call of God, and the Testimony of the Saint introduced by Barclay scholarship and concluding with Orthodox scholarship. Chapters 2-8 will engage Barclay’s thought through the 2016 PhD dissertation of Joanna Clare Dales on John William Graham (1859-1932):

Quaker Apostle of Progress and the 1991 published work of St Sophrony of Essex on Orthodox St Silouan the Athonite (1866-1938) in the footnotes. Chapter eight summarizes the argument by assessing the content of the introductory chapter, Barclay's conversion to the Quaker path in chapter two, exegetical Barclay in chapters three through seven with introductions by Quaker practitioners and conclusions by Orthodox practitioners along with Quaker John William Graham and Orthodox Saint Silouan in the footnotes. Suggestions for further research to include analysis of key historical figures Barclay draws upon, and parallels of Hesychasm and universalism in Barclay and Orthodoxy.

Key Ideas

Theosis in Eastern Orthodoxy

Norman Russell (b. 1945) begins his answer to the question of 'What is Theosis' with Jesus quoting Psalm 82:6 to the Jews where God speaks, saying 'I said, "You are gods, sons of the Most High-all of you"' (John 10:34). These words spoken by Jesus to human beings provide the scriptural basis for Theosis.¹ Russell states that it is Clement of Alexandria (c. 150-215) who first used the technical vocabulary of deification informally, but it was pseudo Dionysius the Areopagite in the late fifth century² who declared that 'Deification is the attaining of likeness to God and union with him so far as possible'.³

¹ Russell, Norman. *Fellow Workers with God: Orthodox Thinking on Theosis*. SVS Press, NY. 2009, 13. Jesus draws from the Old Testament Jewish text which preceded New Covenant Christianity.

² Rolt, Clarence. *Dionysius the Areopagite on The Divine Names & The Mystical Theology*. Cosimo, Inc, NY, 2007, 1. Clarence Rolt (1880-1917) claims that the 'Hierotheus' who figures in the writing could be the Syrian mystic Stephen bar Sudaili, but most likely is an unnamed monk writing in the late 5th century.

³ Russell, Norman. *The Doctrine of Deification in the Greek Patristic Tradition*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004, 1.

Russell shows a contrast in early Christian thought between Justin Martyr (c. 100-165) and Irenaeus of Lyons (c. 130-202). Justin argued that as a result of the failure of Adam and Eve, who were called to be gods, but died like men (Psalm 82:6-7) that with the victory of Christ over bodily death, human history was recapitulated as God intended it. Justin suggested that Christians in his time were in sharp competition with Jews for Gentile converts. He argued that it is the Christians, not the Jews, who are the true people of God, because it is only Christians who participate in God's plan through obedience to the commands of Christ by the seed of the second Adam. In so doing, they become 'gods' as God intended.⁴ Irenaeus claims that God himself has intervened directly in human life through the Incarnation in order to bring the created realm into close relationship with the divine. The sons of the Most High who are 'gods' are those who have received the grace of adoption. Irenaeus uses this to support the reality of the Incarnation and the reality of Christian life.⁵ Both Justin and Irenaeus affirm becoming a 'god' as realized eschatology, being the prelapsarian end for which God intended. Participation in immortality and incorruption is attained in principle as a result of the believer's incorporation into Christ. For Irenaeus, created things are necessarily inferior to the Creator. But in Christ the created is united with the Uncreated with humanity at the center. Justin and Irenaeus both affirm that the Incarnation is central in the larger salvation economy that enables humanity to participate in the divine attributes of immortality and incorruption and attain the end for which Adam was created.⁶ Barclay's idea of the salvation of humanity flowing out of God's Incarnation finds affinity with Eastern Orthodox thought. He blends the combined God-man with the seed of the second Adam in humanity being restored to prelapsarian communion with God.

Deification in Eastern Orthodoxy

⁴ *ibid.* 112

⁵ *ibid.* 113

⁶ *ibid.* 113

In 2019, Metropolitan Hilarion Alfeyev (1966-), a hierarch of the Russian Orthodox church, completed the fifth of a five volume detailed and systematic exposition of the history, canonical structure, doctrine, social and moral teaching, liturgical services and spiritual life of the Orthodox Church which he began in 2011. I draw from the second volume of his work, published in 2012, from his chapter entitled ‘Salvation as Deification’⁷ in which Alfeyev follows the line of the Church Fathers in particular.

Alfeyev states that ‘the term deification is not found in the Holy Scriptures and bears little meaning for modern man. Much clearer and much more widely used is the traditional Christian term “salvation”’.⁸ In his ensuing definition of salvation, he refers to being saved from sin, the power of the devil, and finally death and hell itself. In salvation, Alfeyev argues that the Eastern tradition sees salvation as more than correcting the consequences of the fall, and freedom from the power of the devil, but is above all ‘the realization of that goal to which humanity was called by being formed in the image and likeness of God’.⁹ The Fathers of the church use the term ‘deification’ to describe this goal.

Alfeyev concludes that the theme of deification grows out of the teachings of the New Testament in which all humanity is called to become ‘partakers of the divine nature’ (II Peter 1:4). The background being Jesus’s claim to be God, the foundation of which comes from Jesus quoting Psalm 82:6 when he called all people ‘gods’ in response to the Jewish leaders who rejected his insinuation that he and the Father were one, making himself God (John 10:24-39). Equal with Jesus’s statement are the words of John the Theologian concerning the adoption of humanity for those who receive him (John 1:12) and the divine image in humanity in becoming like him (I John

⁷ Alfeyev, Hilarion. *Orthodox Christianity Volume II: Doctrine and Teaching of the Orthodox Church*, SVS Press, NY, 2012, 371-385.

⁸ *ibid.* 371

⁹ *ibid.* 371

3:2-3).¹⁰ Alfeyev points too many texts by the apostle Paul referring to the image and likeness of God in humanity (Romans 8:29; I Corinthians 15:49; II Corinthians 3:18; Colossians 3:10), God's adoption of humanity (Galatians 3:26, 4:5), and the teaching on humans as a divine temple (I Corinthians 3:16).¹¹ Alfeyev concludes with Paul's eschatological vision of the exalted state of humanity after the resurrection, when humankind will be transfigured and raised by Christ its head (Romans 8:18-23; Ephesians 1:10), when God will be in finality 'all in all' (I Corinthians 15:28).¹² Barclay's idea of the realization of God's original Garden of Eden intent is similar to the idea of Orthodox deification in that humanity through communion with Christ's resurrected body and blood enters into the image and likeness of God in which humanity was created.

Orthodox Apophatic Knowledge

Bradley Nassif, in his *Evangelical Theology of the Orthodox Church*¹³ wrestles with the Gospel reality which permeates the liturgical service of the Eastern Church. In distinguishing between the apophatic and kataphatic knowledge he states that apophatism emphasizes the limitations of human reason concerning the knowability of God and the positive experience that come from that ignorance.¹⁴ In the gospel one discovers a many-sided mystery that can be described, but never fully defined. Nassif concludes that because the incarnation of God is a mystery that unites the human and divine natures in one person 'without confusion, without change, without division, and without separation' it can never be fully defined.¹⁵ The gospel also bears witness to the absolute transcendence and divine essence of the Holy Trinity, which according to Gregory Palamas (1296-1359), humans can never experience either in this world or the next. Nassif concludes that through

¹⁰ *ibid.* 372

¹¹ *ibid.* 372

¹² *ibid.* 372

¹³ Nassif, Bradley. *The Evangelical Theology of the Orthodox Church*. SVS Press, NY, 2021. Bradley Nassif was trained at Friends University in Wichita, KS, a university founded by the Religious Society of Friends.

¹⁴ *ibid.* 26

¹⁵ *ibid.*

apophatic knowledge, a sense of awe and transcendent mystery pervades the Divine Liturgy and shapes the spiritual senses creating an overwhelming feeling of other-worldliness. For the Orthodox, the Divine Liturgy is only a precursor of what is to be expressed in all of life.¹⁶ Apophatic knowledge resulting from the distinction between Uncreated Divinity and created humanity is comfortable with Orthodoxy and consistent with Barclay's first through sixth propositions.¹⁷

Orthodox Kataphatic Knowledge

Nassif posits that kataphatic knowledge, on the other hand, emphasizes what Christians can know about God. Affirmative statements about the gospel appeal to all five senses. The kataphatic message can be summed up simply as the work of the Holy Trinity through the incarnation of the Son, and the procession of the Spirit intended to restore humans to union with God, and communion with one another for the good of the world.¹⁸ Nassif states that a Christian need not be a 'professional' theologian to be formed and transformed by this 'good news'. Every Christian, literate and illiterate alike, appropriates the gospel kataphatically.¹⁹ This is because the gospel is not just a message; it is the Person of Jesus Christ and the actualization of his presence in their lives. This is realized through joint participation in His Body.²⁰ Kataphatic knowledge to the degree it can be positive related to the incarnation and Trinity of God is embraced by the Orthodox, and by Barclay in the real presence of the bodily second Adam, the seed and light of the resurrected and ascended Christ, and in the evangelical principle of the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit.

¹⁶ *ibid*, 27

¹⁷ Irenaeus of Lyon. *The Scandal of the Incarnation: Irenaeus against the Heresies*, Ignatius Press, 1990, 31-2. Humanity was created along with those things contained by God. 'And God formed man, taking clay of the earth, and breathed into his face the breath of life' (cf Gen 2:7). God, being more than angelic being, created through Word and Wisdom, the Son and the Spirit who were always with Him. Through Them and in Them the Father freely and spontaneously created all things. Irenaeus' position is consistent with Barclay's first six propositions of New Covenant Knowledge, Christian Revelation, Sacred Scripture old and new, the fallen nature of first Adam, and the combined redemptive seed of the second Adam with the universal light of Jesus Christ. Propositions five and six are inclusive of the universal Spirit of Pentecost.

¹⁸ *ibid*.

¹⁹ *ibid*.

²⁰ *ibid*, 28

Reformed Protestant: Scripture Alone

Michael Barrett in his *God's Word Alone-The Authority of Scripture: What the Reformers Taught... and Why It Still Matters* states that *Sola Scriptura* means that only Scripture, because it is God's inspired Word, is the inerrant, sufficient, and final authority for the church. Scripture alone is the sufficient, final, and magisterial authority. In short, Barrett concludes that the Bible is enough for us.²¹ It is the Bible which is inspired or God breathed and not tradition. What Scripture says, God says. Barrett concludes that the God of truth has breathed out his Word of truth, and the result is nothing less than a flawless inerrant Authority for the church.²² Barclay and the Orthodox reject the 'Word of God' being confined to scripture text at the diminution of the eternal, incarnate in time, Word of God. (John 1:1-18)

Reformed Protestant: Faith Alone

Thomas Schreiner in his *Faith Alone: The Doctrine of Justification* advocates that righteousness is not achieved by works. The 'works of the law' refer to boundary markers dividing Jews from Gentiles, and later dividing Judaism from Christianity.²³ Drawing on the gospel according to John, Schreiner reduces faith to belief. Only those who 'believe' will enjoy life in the age to come. Those who refuse to 'believe' are condemned and stand under God's wrath. They will die in their sins for refusing to 'believe' in Jesus.²⁴ Schreiner quotes Jesus's words in John chapter 6 that the work of salvation is 'belief'. True belief dominates a person's life and changes dramatically how he or she relates to God.²⁵ Schreiner concludes that understanding truth is imperative for saving faith, for 'faith comes from hearing', (Romans 10:17) and what must be heard is the gospel of Christ. Faith is

²¹ Barrett, Matthew. *God's Word Alone-The Authority of Scripture: What the Reformers Taught... and Why It Still Matters*, 2016, 23-4.

²² *ibid*, 24-5

²³ Schreiner, Thomas. *Faith Alone: The Doctrine of Justification*, 2015, 111.

²⁴ *ibid*, 117

²⁵ *ibid*.

never less than a mental assent.²⁶ Barclay and the Orthodox both find faith as ‘not faith’ without intentionally cooperating with God through action.

Reformed Protestant: Grace Alone

Carl Trueman begins his work on *Grace Alone: Salvation as a Gift of God* by stating that grace alone point’s humanity inevitably to matters of history and practice, but above all it points to the Scriptures. Trueman commits himself not only to the principle of grace alone but also to Scripture alone. All theology must be normed or regulated by the teaching of Scripture.²⁷ For Trueman, grace is the unmerited favor of God. In this way grace speaks of God’s *attitude* towards his creation and towards his people. There is common grace being God’s unmerited but non-salvific favor toward fallen creation that retains evil, and there is special grace referring to God’s unmerited salvific favor exhibited in and through the work of Jesus Christ. Trueman argues that unmerited salvific grace is the work of God in those to whom God has an *attitude* of ‘saving favor’ who become ‘true believers’.[emphasis mine]²⁸ Trueman claims that the reformers were in no way innovators to the doctrine of grace and its connection to predestination. The reformers stood as heirs of Augustine (354-430), Thomas Aquinas (1225-1274), and alongside Martin Luther (1483-1546). The reformers did not regard it possible to believe in justification without being predestined. Trueman acknowledges that Philip Melanchthon (1497-1560) is a curious member of the reformers since Melanchthon diverts from Luther’s position on the ‘bondage of the will’, and is vigorously opposed because of his loose understanding of the will by those reformers centered first and foremost on the total depravity of Augustine.²⁹ Melanchthon is affirmed by Barclay in his writing concerning the

²⁶ *ibid*, 262

²⁷ Trueman, Carl. *Grace Alone: Salvation as a Gift of God*, 2017, 23.

²⁸ *ibid*, 24

²⁹ *ibid*, 152, see also p. 133 on Melanchthon’s resistance to the bondage of the will and p. 143 its correlation with predestination

exercise of human will.³⁰ Barclay and the Orthodox acknowledge Grace as lived new covenant relationship with God, more than intellectual acknowledgement of Christ's work. A 'theologian' pure and simple, for both Quaker and Orthodox is someone who knows God.

Reformed Protestant: Christ Alone

Stephen Wellum claims that *Sola Christus* stands at the center of the five solas connecting them into a coherent whole by which the reformers of Roman Catholic Christianity could then declare the glory of God.³¹ The salvation of humanity depending on the person and work of Christ is also dependent on the sacred Scriptures without which there is no salvation.³²

Wellum argues that by reading of *Christ alone* from the Scripture text one can proceed to the triune Creator-Covenant Lord in the Scripture text. In this, Wellum is adamant that the immanent Lordship does not entail pantheism, which undercuts the Creator-creature distinction as revealed in Scripture. Wellum states 'Even though God is deeply involved with his world, He is not part of it or developing with it'.³³ As Creator and Covenant Lord, God sovereignly rules over his creation perfectly and personally. He rules with perfect power, knowledge, and righteousness as the only being that is truly independent and self-sufficient. God loves, hates, commands, comforts, punishes, rewards, destroys, and strengthens all according to the personal, covenantal relationship that he establishes with his creation. God acts in, with, and through his creatures to accomplish all he desires in the way he desires to accomplish it.³⁴ Wellum concludes that the reformers did not deny

³⁰ Barclay, Robert. Works I, *William Mitchell Unmasked*, 1672/1831, 277-8. Barclay quotes Philip Melancthon, in his Apology of the *Augustine Confession*: 'to be justified in Scripture not only signifies to be pronounced just, but to be made just, or regenerate'.

³¹ Wellum, Stephen. *Christ Alone: The Uniqueness of Jesus as Savior*, 2017, 19.

³² *ibid*, 32

³³ *ibid*, 36

³⁴ *ibid*, 36-7

the importance of the church but argued from Scripture. The all sufficient work of Christ is applied directly as the Spirit applies the word of the gospel.³⁵

Traditionally, the biblical text in its final form has served as the warrant for Christological constructions. Christian orthodoxy has been established by a ‘Christology from above’, from the vantage point of divine revelation through the inerrant Word. The Scriptures provide the raw data for understanding Jesus’s identity. Since the rise of the Enlightenment, ‘orthodoxy and its methodology’ are no longer viewed as credible and coherent through the Scriptures.³⁶ Wellum concludes that the way forward is not by knowledge from below, but is to do ‘Christology from above’ in establishing *Christ alone* by starting with *Scripture alone*. A biblical Christology is one that constructs the identity of Jesus from the Bible on the Bible’s own terms.³⁷ Wellum combines the Scriptures with the Word of God when he says ‘Scripture is able to confirm or correct our views as needed because Scripture itself is not the interpretation of the church but the *written* Word of God *himself* that interprets his own acts in history and their significance for his church in the world’.³⁸ [emphasis mine] What Wellum does is combine ‘Creator God’ with ‘creation in book’ at the expense of new covenant Christianity. Both Barclay and the Orthodox recognize the fullness of the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit in the Incarnation event and in the sending of the Spirit at Pentecost to restore reality lost in the Garden of Eden.

In summary, this section of key ideas reveals the similarities and affinities between Barclay’s soteriology of ‘humanity becomes by “Grace indwelling” what God is by nature’ as precursor to the following chapters. The Eastern Orthodox ideas of Theosis, deification, the person of the Holy Spirit, feeding on the risen body and blood of Christ and the conciliar nature of decision making has

³⁵ *ibid*, 275

³⁶ *ibid*, 279

³⁷ *ibid*, 307-9

³⁸ *ibid*, 309-10

greater uniformity with Barclay than the same ideas expressed by the Roman West. In addition, Quaker Christianity is handicapped by the limitations of the Protestant West in their core ideas of Scripture alone, Faith alone, Grace alone, and Christ alone. It is the affirmation of the Orthodox and Barclay alike of apophatic knowledge and kataphatic knowledge to lead humanity in hitting the mark of God's original righteous intent.

Eastern Theosis in the West

To support the claim that Barclay's soteriology aligns with East, it is necessary to track where there are instances of Theosis in the West which Barclay claims is distorted by scholasticism from the 8th to the 16th centuries, having been dealt with previously by the early Church in the examples of Origen (c.185-254) and Arius (256-336).³⁹ This section will consider the outlook of Timothy Ware on the division of East from West and where the germs of difference are found. It will continue with the work of Aleksei Khomiakov and Ivan Kireevsky of the Slavophil circle in restoring Orthodoxy from Western captivity. It will continue through a

³⁹ Robert Barclay, *An Apology for True Christian Divinity: The Work of the Early Church, and the protesters was to Testify and Discover Abuses while the Work of Quakers is to reestablish Truth in Purity*, 1676, 129-30. Propositions V-VI, section X. It falls out then, that as **darkness and the great apostasy, came not upon the Christian world all at once, but by several degrees, one thing making way for another; until that thick and gross vail came to be overspread, wherewith the nations were so blindly covered from the 7th and 8th, until the 16th century**; even as the darkness of the night comes not upon the outward creation at once, but by degrees, according as the sun declines in each horizon; so neither did that full and clear light and knowledge of the glorious dispensation of the gospel of Christ appear all at once; **the work of the first witnesses [Protestants] being more to testify against and discover the abuses of the apostasy, than to establish the truth in purity**. He that comes to build a new city, **must first remove the old rubbish, before he can see to lay a new foundation**; and he that comes to a house greatly polluted and full of dirt, will first sweep away and remove the filth, before he put up his own good and new furniture. **The dawning of the day dispels the darkness, and makes us see the things that are most conspicuous: but the distinct discovering and discerning of things, so as to make a certain and perfect observation, is reserved for the arising of the sun, and its shining in full brightness. And we [Quakers] can, from a certain experience, boldly affirm, that the not waiting for this full new dawning**, but building among, yea, and with, the **old Popish rubbish**, and setting up, before a full purgation of the old **Popish** rubbish, has been to most **Protestants** the foundation of many a mistake, and an occasion of unspeakable hurt. *Apology* pp.295-6. Proposition X, section XXI. ...indeed those that give themselves most to **it [school divinity]**, are most capable to **fall into error**, as appears by the example of **Origen [185-253], who by his learning was one of the first, that falling into this way of interpreting the scriptures, wrote so many volumes, and in these volumes so many errors, as very much troubled the church**. Also, **Arius [256-336]**, led by this curiosity and human scrutiny, despising the simplicity of the gospel, fell into error, which was the cause of that horrible **heresy [Arianism]** which so much troubled the church. **Me-thinks the simplicity, plainness, and brevity of the scriptures themselves**, should be a sufficient reproof for such a **science; and the apostles, being honest, plain, illiterate men**, may be better understood by such kind of men now, than all that **mass of scholastic stuff**, which neither Peter, nor Paul, nor John, ever thought of. [emphasis mine]

case study on The Orthodox Church in Lutheran Finland using a 2022 journal publication by Laura Kokkonen entitled 'The Dichotomy of Branding: Discourses in the Orthodox Church of Finland' and Pentti Mikael Leiman's article 'The Mission of a Monastery in Present-day Finland'. A critical assessment of the East through the Roman Catholic lens of David Fagerberg, and the argument by the Finnish Lutheran school of Mannermaa on a rereading of Martin Luther through the lens of Veli-Matti Karkkainen will conclude where Theosis is found in the West.

Timothy Ware in his book *The Orthodox Church* states that the fundamental cause of the schism between East and West is theological. He suggests that the matters producing separation are the papal claim of final authority, and the *Filioque* addition to the Nicene Creed in which the Holy Spirit proceeds from the Father 'and the Son'.⁴⁰ Ware claims that because the West no longer draws from the same sources i.e. the Fathers, coupled with the Western move to scholasticism that the West has separated from the East. He argues that the East retained its relationship with the consubstantial Father, Son and Holy Spirit and its Patriarchal Ecumenism under the Spirit.⁴¹ It would be Emperor Charlemagne (800-814) of the Carolingian West who would retaliate against the Byzantine Emperor of the East with the charge of heresy for not including the *Filioque clause* in the Nicene Creed and recognizing Papal primacy.⁴²

⁴⁰ Ware, Timothy. *The Orthodox Church*. Penguin Books, UK, 2015, 42 The primacy of the Father in the addition *and of the Son* in the Constantinople Creed (381) reduces the role of the Spirit in the economy of salvation to a subordinate position to the Son rather than an equal position with the Son and the Father. The Spirit's economy is further subverted with the advent of Papal primacy as superior to the Ecumenical Council of leaders. Quaker economy is centered on the eternal Word throughout time and the eternal Spirit throughout time. According to Barclay, Quakers return to apostolic order informally in like manner as the decision of those 'full of the Holy Spirit' in feeding the Hellenist widows (Acts 6:1-10) and formally in Ecumenical decision making like those in whom 'it seemed good to the Holy Spirit and to us' (Acts 15:28) to not require bodily circumcision of those given 'the Holy Spirit' in purification of the heart by faith (Acts 15:5-9). It is the informal and formal leading of the Spirit in all times which Barclay affirms. *Robert Barclay's Book of Government* (1674, 1676) reinstitutes the ancient apostolic order under the Spirit's leadership (Acts 15:8, 28) according to Gospel order under the eternal Word made flesh as light to every person coming into the world. (John 1:1-9).

⁴¹ *ibid.* 44 The East emphasized the consubstantiality of the three Hypostases over the Tri-Personality of God in the West. This contrast was furthered by the addition to the Constantinople Creed (381) that the Spirit proceeds from the Father 'and the Son' and disrupted the consubstantiality of the three Persons by subordinating in language, the Spirit to both the Father *and the Son*. The East considers that this change to the salvation economy of the Triune God was initiated by the scholastic tendencies of Augustine (354-430) and furthered at the Council of Toledo, Spain in 598. The innovation was rejected some 290 years later as blasphemous due to it providing the basis for theological error according to Photius (c 820-891), Patriarch of Constantinople in his written compilation on *The Mystagogy of the Holy Spirit* (c 867-889). How one 'experienced God' and 'salvation' was jeopardized through the *filioque*. Barclay quotes Jesus when he says 'God is Spirit, and those who worship Him must worship in spirit and in truth' KJV John 4:23-24

⁴² *ibid.* 44-5 The building of the *filioque* clause and the move toward scholasticism developed with points of emphasis from the 4th to the 8th century. Barclay educated in the West, affirms the church of the first three centuries, rejects the scholasticism of the 8th – 16th centuries and considers that the Quakers were cleaning up what the first reformers got

Ware continues that the East's foundation goes back to the original Apostles, maintaining the equality of all bishops with the western Pope as the first apostle among equals. Instead, the West claimed that the apostolic foundation resided in Rome, with the Church under the monarchy of the Pope rather than under the college of bishops. The Roman West moved forward under a Monarchy while the East remained collegial and ecumenical (Acts 15:28).⁴³

In the East, laymen taking existential interest in theology were accepted as normal. In the West, scholastic education of the clergy with theology reserved for the priests was normal. The East was never known for an educated division of the clergy from the laity.⁴⁴ From the beginning the Greeks and the Latins approached the Christian mystery differently with the Latins being practical and rational, and the Greeks mystical and participational. The Latins were influenced by Roman law and the Greeks by Divine Liturgy. Concerning the Trinity, the Latins emphasized the unity of the Godhead while the Greeks the three-ness of Persons (*Hypostases*). Reflecting on the Crucifixion the Latins viewed Christ as ransom Victim and the Greeks as priestly Victor. In salvation, the Latins spoke of juridical redemption while the Greeks spoke of healing deification. These trajectories reveal sharp differences between East and West.⁴⁵

The Byzantines were in support of the papal monarchy of Rome but not over the Eastern jurisdictions. The Pope came to believe his jurisdiction encompassed the East as well as the West. The Pope exercised his Monarchy in religion and politics, while the East remained conciliar and collegial.⁴⁶ Concerning the addition

started before being derailed by the later rigid reformers. The rigid reformers are the Calvinists and Westminster divines who subscribe to a God who predetermines.

⁴³ *ibid.* 45 Conflict over the rock of confession and the rock of Peter (Matthew 16:15-19) remains a point of division to this today.

⁴⁴ *ibid.* 46 Quakers maintained the elimination of the laity and that all were clergy. Barclay argues in his *Apology* Proposition 10 that the gifts of Prophet, Apostle, and Evangelist (Ephesians 4:11-12) are intended for all Christians, and realized in increasing measure.

⁴⁵ *ibid.* 46 The liturgical flow of scripture is consistent with Quaker hermeneutics with authoritative proof texts (law) falling under the meta-narrative. Quakers emphasized the eternal Word 'Christ is present in our midst. He is and ever shall be' (Hebrews 9:28) with worshiping in spirit and truth. Silence as *Hesychia* was the means of being attentive to Christ, present in the midst of two or three (Matthew 18:20) and within (Revelation 3:20). In his *Apology* (1675) *Vindicated* (1679) Barclay both claims that the word Trinity is not in the Bible and that a principle of the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit is in every person. The rigid Calvinist, John Brown acknowledges that Quakers believe in the 'Trinity' and this PhD argues that Barclay aligns with the 'mystery' of the East with the consubstantial Threeness of Persons. Underdeveloped in Barclay's Propositions 14 and 15 is becoming as light but his emphasis on coming together while we are in the flesh in Proposition 11 on worship is uniform with becoming glorified-light as in the East.

⁴⁶ *ibid.* 47 Quaker Gospel order followed the path of Jesus Christ with his disciples. Barclay says the disciples understanding came slowly. Quakers were equally long-suffering with people such as the incident with William Rogers

of the *Filioque*, the Spanish Church of Spain interpolated it at the third Council of Toledo (598). The addition spread to France, and then to Germany where it was championed by Emperor Charlemagne and adopted at the Council of Frankfurt, Germany (794). In 808 Pope Leo III, Bishop of Rome wrote to Charlemagne, the first crowned Holy Emperor of Rome in 800 saying that while he believed the *filioque* to be doctrinally sound, it was a mistake to tamper with the Nicene-Constantinopolitan Creed.⁴⁷ The East rejected the *filioque* because of the lack of conciliar process which would have proven that it was not true. In Christianity the Son was begotten of the Father and the Spirit proceeded from the Father. The Father was originator of both Son and Spirit before time with all three retaining their Persons and oneness in Essence.⁴⁸

Besides Papal supremacy and the *filioque* addition, the Greeks allowed for married clergy. The Latins required priestly celibacy. The two sides held different rules on fasting. The Greeks used leavened bread which was the resurrected Body. The Latins used unleavened bread as in the Jewish last supper.⁴⁹ The East first rejected the West to receive the Eucharist in 1190 when Patriarch Theodore Balsamon of Antioch stated “For many years the Western church has been divided in spiritual communion with the four patriarchs and has become alien to the Orthodox. So no Latin should be given communion unless he first declares he will abstain from the doctrines and customs that separate him from the Orthodox.”⁵⁰ This statement of 1090 was preceded by the 1054 Norman invasion from Italy forcing the Greeks to conform to Latin usages. Michael Cerularius, Patriarch of Constantinople, in reaction demanded that the Latins residing in Constantinople adopt

in which the 2nd Day Meeting heard carefully the concern and acted judiciously as in the Council at Jerusalem in Acts 15.

⁴⁷ *ibid.* 48-9 Ware’s depiction of new Roman Emperor Charlemagne who became dominate during the Carolingian period concurs with Jaroslav Pelikan in *The Spirit of Christendom* Volume II, 1974, page 174 that Charlemagne rejected the actions of the Seventh Ecumenical Council because of not being included as see of Rome to confirm or deny the norm of orthodoxy by virtue of position.

⁴⁸ *ibid.* 49 The flow of salvation unto deification through theosis was at stake. Joseph Farrell, in his introduction to *The Mystagogy of the Holy Spirit* by Saint Photius, 1987, page 42-46, claims that the *filioque* imbalance paved the way for Neo-Platonism: the One, the Nous, and the World soul and the return to Sabellianism understood also as Modalism.

⁴⁹ *ibid.* 49 The Latin Roman law would approach the Eucharist with greater literalness to the Bible in reenacting the Jewish Passover, while the Greeks liturgical expression would see the resurrected body of the Passover Lamb of Jesus Christ in the Eucharist. The Presence of Jesus in the Midst of the Quaker two or three corresponds with the leavened bread of Christ’s resurrected body in Orthodox Divine Liturgy and the body temperature wine as Jesus’ blood. Christ is risen!

⁵⁰ *ibid.* 50.

Greek practices, in particular, the use of leavened bread. The Latins refused so Cerularius closed their churches. While this provided formal separation, it was the Crusades (1095-1291) which created bitterness.⁵¹

In time, East and West grew further apart in theology and in understanding of Christian life. Byzantium used the language of the Fathers of the first four centuries. In Western Europe the tradition of the Fathers was replaced by scholasticism; a synthesis of philosophy and theology worked out in the 12th and 13th centuries.⁵² Byzantium during the 12th and 13th centuries grew in hesychasm (inner prayer through stillness) centering on the immediacy of God's presence through the Jesus Prayer. This produced the hesychastic controversy of the 14th century. Ware claims that hesychastic theology was first worked out by Clement of Alexandria (d. 215) and Origen of Alexandria (d. 254) whose ideas were developed by the fourth century Fathers Gregory of Nyssa (d. 395) and Evagrius of Pontus (d. 399).⁵³ The hesychastic tradition is marked by use of apophatic language. Since God as Trinity cannot be comprehended by the human mind, all language is inexact. It was less misleading to use negative language than positive; to state simply what God was not. As Gregory of Nyssa states, "True knowledge and vision of God consists in saying that He is invisible, because what we seek lies beyond all knowledge, being wholly separated by incomprehensibility."⁵⁴

Apophatic theology reached its classic expression in pseudo Dionysius (fifth century). Maximus the Confessor (d. 662) composed commentaries on Dionysius' writings. John of Damascus (d. 749) quoted Dionysius, "God is infinite and incomprehensible, and all that is comprehensible about Him is His infinity and incomprehensibility." And, "God does not belong to the class of existing things: he is above all existing things, even existence itself."⁵⁵ Rather than Divine unknowability excluding direct experience of God, the

⁵¹ *ibid.* 55-6 Barclay claims the Church of the first 300 years in which there was no affirmation of violence. It was not the nature of lambs to draw the earthly sword.

⁵² *ibid.* 59-60

⁵³ *ibid.* 60 Hesychasm of the East is different from the Quietism of the West. The telling subtitle of *Unseen Warfare* by Lorenzo Scupoli (SVS Press, 2000) edited by Saint Nicodemus of the Holy Mountain and revised by Theophan the Recluse is *The Spiritual Combat and the Path to Paradise*. This work became a staple for Eastern Monks on Mount Athos and by its very title emphasizes the warfare of the prince of this world (Ephesians 2:1-3) and a return to the Paradise relationship (Genesis 2:8) as referred to by Barclay.

⁵⁴ *ibid.* 60

⁵⁵ *ibid.* 60-1 Charles Rolt in his compilation of Dionysius the Areopagite on *The Divine Names*, Cosmo Publishing, 2007, page 152 states that the following quote is experience and not mere theory: 'And yet the Divinest Knowledge of God, the which is received through Unknowing, is obtained in that communion which transcends the mind, when the mind, turning away from all things and leaving even itself behind, is united to the Dazzling Rays, being from them and

East embraced apophatic language as the catalyst for attaining union with God as deification. Negations were a springboard whereby the Christian leapt up with the fullness of his being into the living mystery of God.⁵⁶

Ware notes that Western theologian Thomas Aquinas (1225-1274) quoted Dionysius 1760 times in his *Summa Theologica* which reveals apophatic theology in a key theologian in the West.⁵⁷

It was the answers to the questions of how one can attain a face-to-face meeting with God who is utterly transcendent, and how God can be both knowable and unknowable at the same time that *hesychia* articulated. The hesychast was devoted to the way of inner-stillness; to unceasing prayer stripped of images, words, and discursive thinking.⁵⁸ Macarius of Egypt (300-390) instructed that prayer is arrived at through the soul and body as a whole, more than only the mind. Macarius used the Hebrew idea of the heart. It was through the heart that prayer emerged which included the intellect, will, emotions, and body.⁵⁹ The prayer of the heart begins with the lips in verbal inculcation of the meaning of words, followed by repetition and continuity, uniting recollection and intellect. Finding its way to the heart, prayer remains in the heart, becoming the expression of one's being – lips, intellect, emotions, will, and body. Prayer fills the consciousness, and eventually prays itself. Unceasing prayer is attained through asceticism and is gift from God through Grace.⁶⁰

in them, illumined by the unsearchable depth of Wisdom.' This in the East is defended as energy by Gregory Palamas (1296-1359) canonized a Father, Doctor, and Saint in 1368.

⁵⁶ Ibid. 60

⁵⁷ Ibid. 61 Divine unknowability as essence fits with the mystery which Quakers embrace in practicing the Presence of God at all times. Western author Daniel Clendenin in his work *Eastern Orthodox Christianity: A Western Perspective* Baker Academic, 2003, pages 48-9, notes that in the West, all truth claims must pass the test of rational intelligibility that is administered at the bar of reason. Many trace this to the Christian philosopher Rene Descartes (1569-1650) and his works *Discourse on Method* (1637) and *Meditations on First Philosophy* (1641) which attempt to ground all thinking in a new and solid starting point. Descartes claimed he would accept nothing as true unless he perceived it as clear, distinct and certain. His conclusions would be more certain than geometrical proofs. Truth claims that cannot be justified by reason are false or considered meaningless. I've borrowed the terms of apophatic and kataphatic in their use in Barclay's metaphysical and physical reality, as well as epistemology in knowing within and without. It is this researcher's belief that to read Barclay through Descartes rationalism is not to read Barclay. This is why Isaac Crewdson and the Beaconites as researched by Brayshaw, A. Neave, *The Quakers, Their Story and Message*, Macmillan Co., NY, 1927, 200-1, and Jones, Rufus, *The Later Periods of Quakerism*, Greenwood Press, CT, 1970, 488-492 considered Barclay the core problem in Quakerism and dismissed Quakers as having anything to do with Biblical Christianity. Crewdson was the first person this researcher knows of to name Quakers, Evangelical Friends (c. 1835-1840). The Lonergan PhD method was chosen to get at exegetical Barclay over eisegesis Barclay in proving Eastern theosis over western Protestantism.

⁵⁸ Ibid. 61

⁵⁹ Ibid. 62 Barclay quotes Paul, 'For we are member of His **body**, of His **flesh** and of His **bones**.' Ephesians 5:30 The Spirit and the physical meet as one, non-dualistically in Paul in Galatians 1:14-18 and II Corinthians 12:1-4.

⁶⁰ Ibid. 62 Ascetical Christianity is opposed by those who reject works in faith. Barclay affirms the place of deeds within faith while rejecting the outward sacraments. Jansenism is a fit for Barclay who was taught at the secular Scots College of Paris (1659-1663).

The culmination of mystical experience was vision of the Divine and uncreated Light. Symeon the New Theologian (949-1022) was full of 'Light mysticism'. He spoke of the Divine Light: fire truly divine, fire uncreated, fire invisible, without beginning, and immaterial. This light is the uncreated Light which the disciples saw surrounding Jesus on the Mount of Transfiguration.⁶¹ The vision of Divine Light is reconciled with the apophatic experience of God who is transcendent, unapproachable, immanent, and encountered simultaneously.

Barlaam of Calabria (c. 1290-1348), who had learned Greek from Italy in the West, understood the doctrine of God's otherness and unknowability in an impersonal form. Barlaam argued that God cannot be known directly. It is wrong to speak of direct experience of God because such is impossible in this life. He asked how anyone can see God's essence with their bodily eyes. He concluded that the light, which the hesychast beheld, was not the eternal Light of Divinity but a temporary created light.⁶² It would be Gregory Palamas (1296-1359) who defended that the human person experiences God through the body in opposition to Barlaam. Palamas articulated the human experience of the Divine and Uncreated Light of Tabor by clarifying the distinction between the essence and energies of God. This distinction was confirmed by the Eastern Councils held in Constantinople in 1341 and 1351 which the West never recognized.⁶³

Palamas joined the doctrine of the human person with the Incarnation. The human being is a single united whole; a whole person, body, soul, and spirit created in the image of God. The body is not the enemy, but a partner with the soul. The eternal Word by taking on human flesh is the inexhaustible source of sanctification. Palamas' articulation of the human body was then united with the hesychast method of prayer. By Christ taking human flesh and saving the person - body, soul and spirit, it is now the human person that communes with God.⁶⁴ The Incarnation and the *hesychast* are joined in prayer through the essence and energy of God.

⁶¹ *ibid.* 63 Walking as children of the light according to Paul in Ephesians 5:8-14 is a fit for Orthodox and Quakers.

⁶² *ibid.* 63-4 The experiential nature of the Divine Light in the body deifies the body. See *The Orthodox understanding of Salvation* by Christopher Veniamin, Mount Tabor Publishing, 2013, pp. 27-36 Holy Relics: The Deification of the Human Body in the Christian Tradition. Barclay affirmed a bodily Christianity over a strictly juridical Salvation.

⁶³ *ibid.* 64 This PhD argues that the lack of an Eastern theology plagued Quakers as it did the Byzantine Orthodox trained in the West.

⁶⁴ *ibid.* 64-5 Gregory Palamas argued against Barlaam of Calabria, an Orthodox person trained in Italy of the West.

Palamas embraced the antinomy that humans know God and that God is unknowable. Humans know the energies of God but not God's essence. With Basil (c. 330-379), he states "We know God from his energies, but do not claim that we can draw near His essence. His energies come down to us, but his essence remains unapproachable." "God is not nature, for He is above nature; He is not a being, for is above all beings. No single thing of all that is created has or ever will have communion with the supreme nature or nearness to it." Yet, however remote God's essence, God through his energies reveals Himself. God's energies are not apart from God but are God Himself in His grace and revelation to the world.⁶⁵ Christianity acknowledges God's essence as Trinity, and God's energies through experience. God remains ever the same.

The result of the Incarnation is that the world is charged with the grandeur of God. All creation is the burning Bush of Exodus 3 permeated by the ineffable and wondrous fire of God's energies, but is not consumed. God enters into contact with all humanity through His energies. Divine energy is the unmediated Grace of God. Grace is gift of direct manifestation of God; personal encounter between creature and Creator.⁶⁶

Ware affirms Vladimir Lossky (1903-1958) who states that Grace signifies Divine nature communicated to humans. The Saints (the holy) are transformed and deified by the Grace of God through direct experience. They know God in His energies, and speak of His essence.⁶⁷ God is Light and therefore the experience of God's energies takes the form of Light. The vision the hesychast experiences is the Light of the Godhead.

⁶⁵ *ibid.* 65 Barclay in Proposition 2 on Revelation quotes such Fathers and saints as Augustine, Clement of Alexandria, Jerome, Athanasius, Gregory the Great, Cyril of Alexandria, Bernard of Clairvaux, Martin Luther, Philipp Melancthon, Origen, and John Smith of Cambridge in affirming the intellectual touch of Christ in the soul as being as the sun's beams. While Barclay does quote Plotinus as used by John Smith, this PhD argues that exegetical Barclay resists the One, the nous or mind, and the world Soul of Neo-Platonism and Plotinus as well as Sabellius or modalism which understands the one God to present himself in consecutive modes. Barclay rejects by name Apollinarius who claimed Jesus did not have a human mind but was a divine spirit roaming the earth, Eutychus who claimed that Jesus was not fully divine and fully human while on earth but only before being born of the *Theotokos*, Arias who claimed Jesus to be only a created being and not eternally God, and Pelagius who denied participation with super-natural Grace and instead affirmed human works in salvation. Barclay also rejects the 'original' sin of Augustine who created the dichotomy of sovereign pre-determinism through total depravity. Barclay fits within the Orthodox teaching of ancestral sin combined with the seed of the 2nd Adam as priestly Victor in salvation. This is new covenant Christianity inwardly revealed as primordial being restored.

⁶⁶ *ibid.* 65-6 The experiential encounter first by George Fox in 1635, 1647, and 1652 are all aspects of experimental faith. The same is true of Robert Barclay in his four year search of true Christian divinity from 1663-1667. The experience in salvation is confirmed by Metropolitan of Nafpaktos Hierotheos in his work *The Person in the Orthodox Tradition*, Birth of the Theotokos Monastery, Greece, 2021, pp. 152-156 in this section 'God is experience'. It is only the person who experiences God that can be called a theologian. This is more than 'enthusiasm' placed on Quakers. It is deification in becoming by Grace indwelling what God is by nature. John 17:1-26

⁶⁷ *ibid.* 66 Vladimir Lossky, *The Mystical Theology of the Eastern Church*, p. 162 Grace is uncreated in Body and Spirit.

The Spirit is Light which surrounded Christ on Mount Tabor (Mt. 17:5). The Light of the Godhead is not fallen material light but is realized physical Life, as the body is transformed by the Light of Christ.⁶⁸ Becoming ‘all flame’ is the path and *telios* of Christianity.

Palamas preserves God’s transcendence as immaterial and God’s imminence as material while rejecting pantheism. He claimed God’s imminence was quantified through the Incarnation, while at the same remaining the transcendent Holy Other. God is the ‘I AM’ of the Jewish Scriptures, the pre-incarnate Christ, and Christ who became incarnate (John 8:58). Barlaam of Calabria rejected direct experience of God, and in asserting that ‘the Light’ is created retained the gulf between God and humanity. Palamas, like Athanasius (296-373), safeguarded humanities direct encounter with the Godhead through divine redemption coming through heart transformation and deification. Ware concludes that the doctrine of salvation defended by Palamas underlies the Seven Ecumenical Councils on the Trinity, the person of the Father, the person and two natures of Christ, and the person of the Spirit, and the person of the *Theotokos*.⁶⁹ Palamas reveals Eastern Christianity’s continuity with the Councils.⁷⁰

Nicolas Cabasilas (c. 1320-1390), a contemporary of Palamas, wrote a treatise on the sacraments entitled *The Life in Christ*. His writings reveal that the person of Christ is closer than our own soul. For Cabasilas the mystical life is Christ in the sacraments (mysteries). Mysticism becomes speculative and individualistic when divorced from the Incarnation, the mysteries, and Christ’s Body. Cabasilas saw hesychastic prayer as central to the ecclesial life of the Church.⁷¹

⁶⁸ *ibid.* 66 Quakers being children of the light finds uniformity with Paul (Ephesians 5:8-14) and with the Kingdom come on Mt Tabor

⁶⁹ *ibid.* 66 Christ has come, and is coming is preceded by Christ being the pre-incarnate ‘I AM’ as referred to by Himself in John 8:58.

⁷⁰ *ibid.* 67 Quakers meeting for business under the guidance of the Spirit is under the same Spirit as the ecumenical councils.

⁷¹ *ibid.* 67 A criticism of Quaker Christianity is commensurate with Cabasilas’ claim. The sacramental life of Quakers without the Mysteries has contributed to Quakerism becoming speculative as Christ’s Body. Barclay’s Proposition 5 on the Redemptive 2nd Adam and Proposition 13 on the necessity of Communion with the body and blood of Christ alleviate concern with Barclay concerning his position on the incarnation or God in flesh. This is also confirmed in Proposition 2 on Christian Revelation. The Lonergan PhD method was chosen to get at exegetical Barclay over eisegesis Barclay in proving Eastern theosis over western Protestantism. Most acknowledge a divide with Roman Catholicism under the protest of the Church of England who rejected the Pope.

The second East-West reunion Council of Florence in 1438-9 followed the first reunion Council of Lyons in 1274 attempted to unite East and West from its 1054 division. The Greeks, motivated by invading Muslim Turks considered their line of defense to be uniting with Rome. Rome, in response, drew up an agreement to include acceptance of the *Filioque* clause, Papal authority, unleavened bread, and purgatory. Papal primacy, the double procession of the Holy Spirit-through the Father *and the Son*, and Rome's teaching on purgatory were of most importance. Rome later amended the agreement to allow the Greeks to use leavened bread. Fourteen years later the Turks broke into Constantinople (7 April 1453) and turned the Orthodox Cathedral, *Hagia Sophia* into a Muslim mosque.⁷²

The Orthodox recanted the unionist agreement with Rome and instead survived the Muslim occupation of Constantinople through intense conservatism brought on by Western thinking. The Greeks clung to Christian origins by reciting traditional formulae, entrenching themselves in past positions, and underwent ossification. They retained Tradition through Western rationalism.⁷³ Coinciding with the survivalist period, Western thinking was strengthened in the 17th and 18th centuries. Greeks wishing for higher education traveled to Western countries like Italy, Germany, Paris, and Oxford for training under Catholic and Protestant instructors. They would read only the Fathers held in esteem by their Western counterparts. Gregory Palamas was unknown, and remained unpublished until as late as 1959.⁷⁴ Whether consciously or unconsciously, the Greeks used terminology and arguments derived from the Latins and Protestants. This was only for Greeks under Turkish rule as the Russian Church underwent neither Protestant Reformation nor Catholic Counter-Reformation.⁷⁵ As a result those under Turkish rule divided under the Latins and the Protestants.

⁷² *ibid.* 67-9

⁷³ *ibid.* 88-9 A criticism of the 'Evangelical Friends' movement of Isaac Crewdson (c.1835-1840) and in the 20th century is that they adopted a Rene Descartes Western rationalism through the *sola scriptura* doctrine which was the epistemology of the Puritans. The Spirit's leadership as consistent with the Scriptures is dissolved as man's reason takes over in systematic theology (John 5:39-40) producing endless splits. The East maintains the Tradition of the Church through the prophets, apostles, and saints in history.

⁷⁴ *ibid.* 89 There are two references of the East by Barclay in all his writings. He was simply surviving the warring factions of the West Roman Catholic and Protestant which included many Quaker imprisonments and martyrs. People were put to death for their faith. The COE is mentioned once.

⁷⁵ *ibid.* 90 In all of Barclay's writings the Church of England proper is never mentioned. The conflict is between Papists & Protestants

Illustrative of this period, in 1573 a group of Lutheran scholars from Tübingen wrote Jeremias II, Patriarch of Constantinople, sending a copy of the Augsburg Confession stating “If the Orthodox wish to take thought for the eternal salvation of their souls, they must join us and embrace our teaching, or else perish eternally!”

Jeremias responded in three letters dated 1576, 1579, 1581 adhering strictly to the Orthodox position and showed no inclination to Lutheranism. His final letter brought correspondence to a close: “Go your own way, and do not write anymore on doctrinal matters; and if you do write, then write only for friendships sake.”⁷⁶

Ware brings out the limitation of Western trained Greek theologians to defend Orthodoxy. The Reformation had raised questions concerning the sacraments and the authority of the Church which the earlier Ecumenical Councils had not faced. As a result the Calvinist *Confession* (1629) of Orthodox Patriarch Cyril Lukaris (1572-1638) against the Roman position was rejected by a minimum of six Orthodox councils between 1638 and 1691.⁷⁷ In response, Dositheus, Orthodox Patriarch of Jerusalem (1699-1707) used Catholic sources in his *Confession*, ratified in 1672 by the Council of Jerusalem to answer Lukaris’ Calvinist *Confession*. Faced by the Calvinism of Lukaris, Dositheus defended Orthodoxy through Rome. Both Lukaris and Dositheus were Western trained Patriarchs void of Gregory Palamas and the Eastern Fathers.⁷⁸ Lukaris also corresponded with Archbishop Abbot of Canterbury who studied at Oxford. In 1694, his attempt to establish a Greek college at Oxford failed. The ‘Non-Jurors’, a group of Anglicans separating from the Church of England (1688) refused to swear allegiance to William of Orange had wanted to establish communion with the Orthodox. This never materialized as they could not accept the teaching of the resurrected Christ in the leavened bread.⁷⁹

It was the work of Alexis Khomiakov (1804-60), a pioneer in the field of theology in 19th century Russia that began the deeper work of differentiating the East from the West. Khomiakov belonged to the tradition of lay

⁷⁶ *ibid.* 90 The 1573-1581 correspondence initiated by Lutheran scholars reveal a sharp divide between the juridical understanding of salvation through ‘faith alone’ and the position of salvation through deification of the Orthodox. Communication ceased.

⁷⁷ *ibid.* 92-3 Conflict emerged between the Western trained Orthodox who used Catholic and Calvinist logic in defense of Orthodoxy

⁷⁸ *ibid.* 93 The Eastern Fathers, especially Gregory Palamas were simply not used in Western scholastic training.

⁷⁹ *ibid.* 95 Quaker communion aligns with the reality of the resurrected Jesus Christ present amongst two or three and the reality of the resurrected Jesus Christ represented in the Orthodox leavened bread. ‘Christ is in our midst! He is and ever shall be.’

theologians and argued that all Western Christianity, whether Roman or Protestant, shared the same assumptions and betrayed the same fundamental views. It was not effective for the Orthodox to borrow theology from the Protestants against Rome, or from Rome against the Protestants. The Orthodox needed to return to their sources and rediscover their tradition. Khomiakov, a practicing Orthodox theologian, and Ivan Kireevsky (1806-1856) a practicing Orthodox philosopher would define Orthodoxy apart from Rome and the Protestants.⁸⁰ Before continuing with Khomiakov and Kireevsky, I will assess the relationship between the Orthodox Church of Finland with the Evangelical Lutheran Church of Finland.

THE ORTHODOX CHURCH OF FINLAND AND THE EVANGELICAL LUTHERAN CHURCH OF FINLAND

Ware states that there is one aspect of Orthodoxy which calls for special mention: the existence of Orthodoxy of the Western rite equivalent to Eastern rite Catholicism. In the first millennium before the 1054 schism, the West used its own liturgy, different from the Byzantine rite, yet fully Orthodox. The ancient Roman, Gallican, Celtic and Mozarabic Liturgies date back to the pre-schism era. Western-rite Orthodox parishes existed within the Antiochian archdiocese in the USA and France. The origins of the Catholic-Orthodox Church of France extend back to 1937, when the former Catholic priest, Louis-Charles Winnaert (1880-1937) who received episcopal consecration in the Liberal Catholic Church, was received at Paris with his followers into the Moscow Patriarchate. By special concession they were allowed to use the Western rite. Currently, under present leader Bishop Germain, the French movement has ceased communion with the Orthodox.⁸¹ While acknowledging the Western rite Orthodox the focus in this section will be on The Orthodox Church of Finland which exists in a predominately Protestant culture.

According to Timothy Ware the Orthodox Church of Finland owes its origin to monks from the Russian monastery of Valamo at Heinavesi in central Finland who preached among the Finnish tribes during the Middle Ages. The Finnish Orthodox were dependent on the Russian Church until the Russian Revolution of 1917, but once the war ended in 1923 switched their allegiance back to the Patriarch of Constantinople. The Orthodox comprised 1.5% of the Finnish population. While its roots are Russian, Ware claims that they

⁸⁰ *ibid.* 119-120

⁸¹ Ware, Timothy. *The Orthodox Church*. Penguin Books, UK, 2015, 180

turned toward the West through their youth movement, being much involved in ecumenical projects.⁸² To put the Finnish Orthodox and the Finnish Lutherans in its historical context, it is necessary to acknowledge the Bolshevik Revolution of the Soviet Union in 1917 with its closure of theological schools and monasteries, and the eradication of the church's legal status until the fall of Communism on 29 November 1988.

To determine the degree to which the Orthodox Church of Finland (OCF) has adopted Western Christianity I will begin by accessing a 2022 journal publication by Laura Kokkonen entitled 'The Dichotomy of Branding: Discourses in the Orthodox Church of Finland'. Kokkonen argues that the Valamo Monastery should be marketed and is the strength of the Orthodox Church in its constancy.⁸³ While the Evangelical Lutheran Church of Finland (ELCF) has weakened in Finnish society and life, the membership of the OCF has remained static with minimal marketing while maintaining a good public image.⁸⁴ At the time of the article the ELCF comprised 66.5% of Finns while the OCF maintained 1%. The OCF was considered an exception amongst Orthodox Churches at large with its minority embedded in a dominant Lutheran society.⁸⁵

Kokkonen considers the advancement of the OCF within the context of neoliberalism and consumerism, a joint process in which economics replace politics. Consumerism drives culture and logic, and affects the church internally and externally. She claims that marketing is the driving characteristic of consumerism.⁸⁶ Sociologists claim that churches and non-profit organizations become market driven in a consumer culture. The term branding is used to position the Church in its culture. Branding is the means of acquiring membership through communicating a positive image. Branding is marketing.⁸⁷

Branding has to do with language. The focus becomes how the church through 'branding' is constructed in language. How does the OCF speak, convey its public image, and reflect its 'Brand'. Kokkonen's interviews

⁸² *ibid.* 128 That Ware claims the Western rite Orthodox ceased union with the East points to the fundamental incongruence between East and West. The incongruence at face value cannot be understood through a terse and superficial analysis. Orthodoxy by its very nature is experiential in practice and experimental by faith. It simply, at some point, defies logic.

⁸³ Kokkonen, Laura. *Nordic Journal of Comparative Religion, Temenos Vol. 58 No. 1 (2022), 91-117*. The Dichotomy of Branding: Discourses in the Orthodox Church of Finland, 2022, 91

⁸⁴ *ibid.* 92

⁸⁵ *ibid.* 93

⁸⁶ *ibid.* 93-4

⁸⁷ *ibid.* 94-5

took place with 10 people employed by the OCF between 2010 and 2020.⁸⁸ The first question had to do with strengthening the OCF through a communication strategy to create a positive public image. The strategy is to be visible in the media at the right time and in the right way to ensure positivity. The OCF should be known as a community having mentors and advanced Father confessors.⁸⁹ The second strategy is how the OCF's image could be strengthened as an alternative to a busy and demanding life. Communication should ensure that church members, partners, and society have a correct image of the OCF and its services.⁹⁰ And finally, that staff enhance the public image as part of the OCF. This includes why the church exists, what it strives for, and what means and values guide its operations. The conclusion of Kokkonen's interviews was that the interviewees had a different outlook than what is normal marketing strategy.⁹¹

According to the interviewees the OCF does not deliberately brand itself or construct its image. The church's core mission isn't hanging around the media but is worship. Five of six interviewees averred that marketing was inappropriate. The center of the OCF's mission is Christ, not media. Marketing is unsuitable because something essential is lost, namely, the church's message.⁹² The interviewees stated that the OCF already had an image, a distinct quality, a strong feature, and a 'pre-existing brand'. The OCFs' brand is face-centered, visible, always exotic, good-scented, beautiful, and mystical. It is timeless, a positive disconnect from the present, including dogmatic unity and originality.⁹³ The OCF is not attached to the current day in the same way as today's world. Its strength is dogmatic unity from its inception. As a praying Church the OCF retains the original message of Christ for 2000 years. There is *an* Evangelical Lutheran church, and there is *the* Orthodox Church.⁹⁴ [emphasis Laura Kokkonen]

A further perspective is that the Church exists according to its nature which is God's nature. A brand is not required because the OCF is constructed by God. This construction is universal. The Orthodox understanding of mission does not involve converting others, as God does the converting. Rather than walking from door to

⁸⁸ *ibid.* 97-8

⁸⁹ *ibid.* 99

⁹⁰ *ibid.* 100

⁹¹ *ibid.* 101

⁹² *ibid.* 101-2

⁹³ *ibid.* 102

⁹⁴ *ibid.* 103

door, anyone who comes through the door is welcomed. The interviewees did recognize there was a conflict between the communication professionals and the theological employees. The tension was one they recognized as normal to the operation of the church. The theological leaders' idea of visibility differed from the communication employees' perspective. Exacting statements rubbed against the dialogical nature of communication by theological leaders.⁹⁵ By comparison, the ELCF promotes a visible image in social media. Communication workers communicate professionally while theological leaders are reluctant to verbalize specific messages. ELCF specifics are determined by circumstance.⁹⁶ The ELCF's nature and social construction has been established through time and remains constant with time. Structure is influenced by both theological leaders and communication professionals.⁹⁷

A second reason the OCF does not brand is to protect its nature. Actions carried out in a manner compatible with its nature are embraced. This does not rule out an advertising campaign if it fits its historic identity. The interviewees recognized that though the OCF is a special case, it is connected to modern life and is not opposed to contemporary communication methods. The OCF throughout history and in its contemporary setting is proactive by nature more than reactive.⁹⁸ Coming up with an image that seems new would suggest a distinction between the sacred and common. The sacredness of the church in history, and modern practice place the OCF at constant crossroads.⁹⁹

Kokkonen suggested that the original church and modern practices could construct different visibilities and strengthen the churches image. This would affirm that public image was a vital part of church operations. Yet market-based ideas as public messages were not seen as positives by the interviewees. The interviewees did not accept that the OCFs' image should be normalized. They held that a brand based image is incompatible with its nature and structure.¹⁰⁰ The interviewees saw need to construct a future with strategies that already

⁹⁵ *ibid.* 104-5

⁹⁶ *ibid.* 105-6

⁹⁷ *ibid.* 106

⁹⁸ *ibid.* 107-8

⁹⁹ *ibid.* 109

¹⁰⁰ *ibid.* 109

prevailed with methods that were uniform with its nature and character. The OCF remains a special case as part of Finnish society.¹⁰¹

The OCF in the contemporary world is both eternal and static. The consumer world serves as the setting the OCF encounters. Kokkonen acknowledges that the Orthodox have difficulty assimilating products of modernity that Western Christianity has embraced.¹⁰² Innovation has negative connotations, and the Orthodox prefer renewal or renovation of tradition. As Orthodox communities living in the diaspora of Western countries, their presence and interaction in a multicultural context render them different in many respects. The Finnish Orthodox Church represents a community seamlessly connected with the ‘finished sphere’ and is not comparable with other churches.¹⁰³ According to the consumerist market society, churches ‘must’ change their communication methods. The OCF does not know how to address this ‘must’. It may be that the Valamo Monastery is the exception, since its marketing strategy for income is tourism.¹⁰⁴ Examining church communication through branding leads to the conclusion that the OCF has a relationship with branding already. Secondly, practices were identified within the OCF that the communication professionals believe could be brought to light through marketing.¹⁰⁵ The next phase in looking at the Orthodox Church of Finland is to consider the western tourist attraction to the Valamo Monastery.

Pentti Mikael Leiman is a lay psychologist who is now a member of the Orthodox Church in Finland. He writes on how his visit to the Valamo Monastery provided a spiritual alternative to the 90% Protestant culture.¹⁰⁶ He describes the monastery as a self-sufficient peasant monastery relying on farming, fishing, and various handcrafts. Its spiritual life reflects the hesychast tradition.¹⁰⁷ Leiman states that when Finland became independent from Russia in 1917, the Valamo Monastery remained within the Finnish border even though Finland remained over 90% Protestant with the OCF making up 1% of the population. The monastery

¹⁰¹ *ibid.* 110

¹⁰² *ibid.* 110-11

¹⁰³ *ibid.* 111

¹⁰⁴ *ibid.* 111 Let your life speak... coincides with Quaker Christianity and Orthodox deification. Becoming a saint (whole) is the path.

¹⁰⁵ *ibid.* 112

¹⁰⁶ Leiman, Pentti Mikael. *The Ecumenical Review*, 38 No. 1 Jan 1986, 17-22. The Mission of a Monastery in Present-day Finland, 1986, 17.

¹⁰⁷ *ibid.* 17

moved to Heinavesi during the time of the Second World War (1940) where it maintained its monastic life into the 70s.¹⁰⁸

During the 70s a number of young postulants of Finnish origin joined the brotherhood bringing about reform through use of Finnish language in Divine Liturgy. During the 80s there were a number of visitors and pilgrims which produced innovative services including seminars and retreats on meditation, science and religion, icon painting, and ecological farming.¹⁰⁹ However, Leiman states that daily Liturgy retained its central position ensuring continuity within change, preserving the tradition. It was a mixture of ancient and contemporary which gave Valamo its special flavor and made it popular with people from Finland and abroad. Leiman considers that Valamo has retained its historic tradition while realizing innovative services.¹¹⁰

In his initial visit, the first thing Leiman noticed was the Russian church structure within a dominant Protestant culture. This began to break the stereotypes of his long-held views and convictions about religion. His disorientation increased when attending his first service in not understanding his own mother tongue. Leiman states that the service was recited and sung in modern Finnish, like a strange drama, beautiful, but impossible to comprehend.¹¹¹ At the conscious level, Leiman began to address his fear of being affected by the irrationality of a religion he had abandoned 15 years ago. On an unconscious level he feared the disappointment of facing again images of Christian faith which had led him to abandon all religion. His pride and the fear of rejection he had experienced previously, made him not want to embrace the spirituality.¹¹² Leiman states that it was a relief to experience the services and not be called on to believe or join. The second positive was that difficulty in understanding evoked growing curiosity. How was it possible that Christianity had this form of expression which seemed totally foreign to Protestant expressions?¹¹³

Leiman states that in all this, most importantly, nobody tried to convert him. Having experienced aggressive expressions of Protestantism had closed his chapter of Christianity. To his surprise he found an open-minded community where convincing others was not a way to fortify belief. He was allowed to face his

¹⁰⁸ *ibid.* 17

¹⁰⁹ *ibid.* 17-18

¹¹⁰ *ibid.* 18

¹¹¹ *ibid.* 18

¹¹² *ibid.* 18

¹¹³ *ibid.* 18-19

preoccupations freely and was respected for his views. Religious disputes in the past had been rife with language. Here he was faced with something that surpassed language. ‘We were invited to partake in something that is best described metaphorically or in no “verbal” expression at all’ states Leiman.¹¹⁴

Leiman continues that it would be later that there was time for doctrinal discussion concerning what he had experienced. It was experience that transcended rational thought which unsettled his prior entrenched thinking. As a human being we are confined to words to make sense of experience. His past had left him with the fear that spirituality necessitates intellectual compromises that become a means to sacrifice scientific concepts and impose voluntarily restrictions on thought. Fundamentalism in many churches had provided frightening evidence of such consequences.¹¹⁵ It was at this stage that the text of the Greek Fathers proved helpful which the Valamo library made available. A whole new world of Christian thinking emerged which was intellectually satisfying and transformed his previous concepts. Leiman states ‘I was not asked to indulge totally the Orthodox spirituality. Understanding develops only in the context of practice’.¹¹⁶ ‘Orthodox Christianity did not lead to Protestant conversion’.¹¹⁷

Leiman critiques Western society as secularized, and the state church as in crisis. The crisis is partly due to doctrinal factors because the church cannot provide Christianity that appeal to people with a scientific outlook.¹¹⁸ The most important factor is a lack of spiritual development and growth in an institutionalized church. The tragedy of the unquestioned established church is that it obscures the basic premise of spirituality. Outer forms of worship bury internal aspects of faith which are not fixed habits or convictions. The institutionalized church obscures the nature of choice.¹¹⁹

Leiman considers choice to be fundamental to spiritual formation. ‘Freewill is an existential attribute given by God in being created in God’s image. We turn away from union with God, and search our way back into

¹¹⁴ *ibid.* 19 It is the wholeness of persons gathered into the eternal which leaves the lasting impact. Holiness comes only through those who are as Christ in their humility (Philippians 2:4-5), who serve without expecting return (Luke 17:10), whose lives are rebirthed in Christ (John 12:20-26), and who have reduced this life to the eternal (Hebrews 12:25-29).

¹¹⁵ *ibid.* 19

¹¹⁶ *ibid.* 19

¹¹⁷ *ibid.* 19

¹¹⁸ *ibid.* 19

¹¹⁹ *ibid.* 19

union. Choice is evident in the story of the Fall and the parable of the prodigal son'.¹²⁰ The paradox of the state church is that people grow into a doctrine and form of worship without facing the need for choice. By adopting Christian faith unquestioningly we regard infantile images of faith as constituting the mature form.¹²¹ Leiman claims, 'We are neurotics, attempting to impose child representations on adult life. This leads to living and acting according to cherished beliefs while denying reality. The most common solution is to abandon faith and adopt a secular view of life'.¹²² In the end the state church has an inbuilt mechanism to foster decay and secularization. At the same time there exists an opposite force which tries to preserve a living spirituality within the church. This is represented by various revivalist movements in the Protestant tradition. Leiman concludes that in the early church and in the Orthodox Church, monasticism provided atmosphere for a dialectical maturation.¹²³

As it may be overly simplistic to blame the institutional church for spiritual estrangement, Leiman concedes that movement away from God as well as return to God is perennial tendencies in the lives of all. However, he claims that the way faith is presented by the church can force people to abandon religious life altogether, and equally provide way back. If turning back implies a return to the once broken internal representations, it will not be adequate for the long-term. Leiman raises the query on how the Lutheran mother church on the one hand and the Orthodox monastery on the other go about this task.¹²⁴

Leiman criticizes the Lutheran Church for the present spiritual crisis by its constant search for new forms to address society's quest. The attempts to modernize the church by changing liturgical forms and employing modern theories of marketing have proven unsuccessful. To adopt modern and secularized ways affect the external aspects of church and present basic doctrines in a way that does not conflict with society. Heated discussions on Christ's virginal birth and resurrection have met with anger and resentment by those who embark on a fundamentalist faith, and sadness by those who refuse to limit truth to logic.¹²⁵ In renewing the

¹²⁰ *ibid.* 19

¹²¹ *ibid.* 20

¹²² *ibid.* 20

¹²³ *ibid.* 20

¹²⁴ *ibid.* 20

¹²⁵ *ibid.* 20

external aspects of life, the basic elements of spirituality should be preserved. The ELCF presents belief in a simplistic and exaggerated fashion as a ‘once for all’ resolution that is simply not sustainable.¹²⁶

The ELCF strategy is questionable because it provides only temporary relief amidst life’s anxieties. It does not help the person realize an adequate conversion amongst complexities. The Christian path does remain the narrow path which Christ proclaimed. Yet, such an outlook obscures the notion that faith is developmental by nature and constant in overcoming limited internal images of truth.¹²⁷ Yes, the person is not alone in their spiritual pursuit. Yet, too much reliance upon the Spirit can lead to regressive passivity where life stagnates and new crises emerge for which faith is unprepared.¹²⁸

In response to the Lutheran Church and its present crisis, the Valamo Monastery has found an alternative way to meet peoples’ needs. It has retained its tradition while developing new forms to encounter current Finland. It has not modernized tradition to represent modern notions of Christian faith. It employs a variety of new means for the people to taste and smell its heritage. Choice is left to the person. It is a paradox that the monastery functions as a Christian agent, presenting its ancient way through withdrawing from society. It shows that there is an alternative based on freedom.¹²⁹

Leiman concludes that there is little need to advertise when spiritual development is lived as the alternative. All difficulties of spiritual growth are revealed. Everyday vicissitudes of monastic life may dismay those who seek a lost Paradise, and many criticize Valamo for not being pious enough. There are those who wish to confirm fantasies of monks who live in caves as examples of the truly spiritual.¹³⁰ Visitors with such expectations are perplexed, but the embarrassment can be a fruitful starting point down an alternative path. Rather than confirming one’s internal images by venerating a golden calf, some venture on the unknowable path with a broken spirit which according to the psalmist is the acceptable sacrifice.¹³¹ That the monastery is a place of spiritual search is validated by many who find it liberating when no longer faced with a static faith.

¹²⁶ *ibid.* 21

¹²⁷ *ibid.* 21

¹²⁸ *ibid.* 21

¹²⁹ *ibid.* 21 Barclay’s Proposition 14 centers on human freedom rather than Augustinian depravity. It is freedom Leiman embraces.

¹³⁰ *ibid.* 21

¹³¹ *ibid.* 21

Freedom is found in not being pressured to convert. The table is laid and any may eat. Questions emerge but answers are left to come along the way.¹³²

The life of a monastic is a powerful expression that faith means practice, and practice is more than static beliefs. This is the outreach task of Valamo. While the monastery cannot avoid the pressures of the world, and giving up worldly passions is difficult to realize, yet it is the thousands of guests who bring their unrest into the hesychastic community that prove its value.¹³³ The next section returns to the Slavophile work in recovering Orthodox roots following years of westernization.

THE EAST RECOVERS ITS ROOTS FOLLOWING YEARS OF WESTERNIZATION

Timothy Ware contends that in the field of theology, 19th-century Russia broke away from dependence on the West. This was done by Alexis Khomiakov (1804-60) leader of the Slavophil circle, and perhaps the first original theologian on the history of the Russian Church in some time. Khomiakov belonged to the tradition of lay theologians and argued that Western Christianity, whether Roman or Protestant, shared the same assumptions and betrayed the same views while Orthodoxy was Christianity altogether different. The Orthodox needed to return to their sources and engage the Church in history which was neither Roman nor Reformed. As Khomiakov's friend put it, before Khomiakov Orthodox theology was not positioned to define either Latinism or Protestantism. In departing from Orthodoxy the West had become divided, each positioned against the other and not unique to the other. Khomiakov would look to the Church from the beginning, and therefore to the Orthodox Church.¹³⁴

Robert Bird, a specialist in the Silver Age of Russia puts this in context by defining the word *Slavophilism* as referring to the original group of six landowners, considered Russian thinkers who put together the 'marvelous decade' of the 1840s. Following the deaths of Khomiakov and Kireevsky in the 1860s, the Slavophiles would become religious nationalists and statist conservatives surrounding Orthodox-Russian

¹³² *ibid.* 21-22

¹³³ *ibid.* 22

¹³⁴ Ware, Timothy. *The Orthodox Church*. Penguin Books, UK, 2015, 119-120. Ware gives strength to the Slavophile movement to return the Orthodox Church in Russia to its roots.

culture and thought.¹³⁵ At its root its practitioners forsook traditional literature for philosophy, theology, and politics. It was a process of word creation, expressing entire worlds of compact energy and unfathomable depth, demanding intuitive comprehension, and rewarded generously for such effort. All the particulars were again unfolded from the living center like growth from a life-bearing seed.¹³⁶

By 1830, after a century and a half of intense westernization, Russian culture had begun to fight for its own distinct identity. Initially the identity was manifest through poetry.¹³⁷ Poetry accomplished a spiritual upsurge beyond scholasticism to accelerate a sense of national self-consciousness. Poetry manifested the power and beauty of the Russian language, and cultivated it in flexibility and transparency capable of expressing the subtlest shades of thought and feeling.¹³⁸ In the 1830's one might think the Russians would turn to German idealists, yet the Slavophiles discovered their unique source, allowing them to articulate their original vision apart from idealism. This thought, called by one historian as the 'third heart', maintained sensitivity to intuition and non-rational knowledge as revealed in poetry.¹³⁹

Kireevsky's first articles appeared to originate from German idealism, yet his poetry turned toward the realism of Russian life, with life being the synthesis. The power in Kireevsky's poetry did not come from

¹³⁵ Khomiakov, Aleksei and Kireevsky, Ivan. *On Spiritual Unity: A Slavophile Reader*. Translated and edited by Boris Jakim and Robert Bird. Lindisfarne Books, NY, 1998, 7

¹³⁶ Ibid. 8 'The living center like growth from a life bearing seed' is complimentary to Barclay's view from Clement of Alexandria that the living center is the Incarnation, and growth from the incarnation comes by the seed of the 2nd Adam received in fertile soil.

¹³⁷ Ibid. 8 In parallel Quaker Christians have been confused by the five solas of Protestant Christianity. Through logic what started as faith alone eliminated works and deeds. Through logic scripture alone covered the work of the Spirit. Through logic grace alone became a formula confined to history without the immediate Grace of the resurrected Son and Spirit of Pentecost. The doctrine of Christ alone put out of balance the persons of the Father and the Spirit. The glory of God alone misses the synergistic glorification of the person returning to the glorified state as temple of the Holy Spirit. Rene Descartes logic is antithetical to Quaker and Orthodox Christianity.

¹³⁸ Ibid. 9 Poetry and the nature of Divine Liturgy sung in the East has similarities with the living sense of God's Presence with Quakers

¹³⁹ Ibid. 9 Howard Brinton in his *The Religious Philosophy of Quakerism*, Pendle Hill Publications, 1973, 52-3. Brinton asserts that confusion has been created by asserting that Quakerism is a form of Protestantism. This has led to the abandonment of characteristic Quaker beliefs and practices in the adopting of Protestant beliefs and practices. While Brinton acknowledges that no doubt all non-Catholic Christians can be called Protestants, yet neither the early Quakers nor their Puritan opponents considered Quakerism a form of Protestantism. Instead, the rise of Quakerism was to be a second Reformation as a protest against Protestantism, a new dawning of the Day of the Lord, an attempt to return to early Christianity. Robert Barclay speaks of Catholicism, Protestantism, and Quakerism as three forms of Christianity. This PhD argues that Barclay's soteriology aligns with Orthodox theosis not mentioned in Brinton's list.

theoretical rationalism but from engagement with life. It was Russian language and Russian life, and not scholastic prowess that restored originality.¹⁴⁰

As the rise of an original school awakened the mind, Kireevsky noted, we need philosophy. The entire development of our mindset requires it. By philosophy poetry lives and breathes. It grants soul and wholeness to learning. Where is philosophy to be found? Initially Kireevsky looked toward the West. Yet retreading Western paths was not the answer. Instead the Slavophiles determined to answer their own questions in a way that affirmed their own identity.¹⁴¹ The Slavophiles' took German idealism at its point of departure and rediscovered Russian realism.¹⁴²

Khomiakov hints that the Russian skill with words stemmed from the Greek belief in 'Word'. What began as a historical quest for Russian culture resulted in rediscovery of Orthodoxy. While progress emerged from naïve idealism, it was Orthodoxy which comprised Slavophile thought. Russia re-inherited its origins from the spiritual freedom of the 1820s. Slavophile wisdom culminated in an affirmation of 'Orthodoxy, Autocracy, and Nationality'. In the end their conclusions became ideologically suspect to the very Russian state itself!¹⁴³

In addition to life in agriculture, culminating in a patent for a steam engine and playing a role in the emancipation of the serfs, Khomiakov was a founding member of the Society of Wisdom-Lovers in an atmosphere of pantheistic idealism and poetic romanticism.¹⁴⁴ Different from his contemporaries, Khomiakov was distinguished by profound Christian faith and piety. He was an advocate of traditional Orthodoxy and Old Russian culture. Some considered him to be a disguised Roman, for nobody supposed Russian civilization and Orthodoxy could be united. Khomiakov's beliefs allowed him to combine national pride with even love for Western civilization. Khomiakov did express the need for Russia to turn to the West to develop

¹⁴⁰ *ibid.* 9-10 Philosophy could be seen as giving the mind opportunity to breath. It is the give and take of breathing that allows for dynamic growth beyond the static. God is a living God as Father, Son and Holy Spirit. In God's oneness of Persons we are given the space to breathe and mature as primordial and Christian beings. Metaphysics, Epistemology, and Axiology can be wrestled with.

¹⁴¹ *ibid.* 10

¹⁴² *ibid.* 11

¹⁴³ *ibid.* 12

¹⁴⁴ *ibid.* 12-13

the ‘means’ of achieving its spiritual potential while at the same time rejecting a future for the West without spiritual guidance from the East.¹⁴⁵

Khomiakov held that Russia’s role in the world was tied to universal Christianity. His instinct that Russian culture had something to say to the West led him to seek this in the Christianity they shared but which also divided. Khomiakov found in traditional culture a sense of community buttressed by love. Seeking the roots of this feeling, he discovered the Orthodox understanding of the Church as the unity of Christians in the Holy Spirit.¹⁴⁶

For Khomiakov, the Church shared characteristics with Old Russia. Its universal nature dissolved spatial borders. Free and open Eucharistic communities, permeated by mutual trust, came from shared faith. Christ and the Holy Spirit illuminated the believing community with love, reason, and freedom which were partially attained in the world.¹⁴⁷ Individuals achieved freedom and knowledge of faith through direct connection to Truth. The vertical relationship between the individual and God, and the horizontal relationship between individual and individual were interdependent and unattainable without the other.¹⁴⁸ Scripture, as God’s word to humanity flowed within Tradition, the history of God seamlessly within His Church. The Church was ‘unity par excellence’.¹⁴⁹

Khomiakov affirmed the use of the word catholic in relation to unity of all. *Sobornyi* came from the word *sobor* meaning gathering, counsel, or cathedral, implying that Church was based in the universal gathering of its members. Khomiakov insisted on the abstract noun *sobornost* meaning the quality of being in unity; of the unity of humanity in God. *Sobornost* best described the living and historical Church. In contrast, his

¹⁴⁵ *ibid.* 13-14 With truth being by nature universal, Khomiakov could draw from the West as a person can draw from other religions. But the fullness of truth was for Khomiakov, in the East. This researcher argues that Quakerism best coincides with the Orthodox.

¹⁴⁶ *ibid.* 14 Christianity is universal, and is to be encountered wherever. This is the nature of God, and the genius of Orthodoxy and Quakerism. The only place absent of God is the unresponsive human heart with its eternal effects.

¹⁴⁷ *ibid.* 14 The universal nature of Truth in the world, and available to the world is core teaching in Barclay and is the Christian covenant in fulfillment of the Jewish Covenant

¹⁴⁸ *ibid.* 14-15 Quaker mission is centered in the new covenant witness of God in every person. Quakers joined synergistically with the present work of God in every person. Barclay speaks of a principle of the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit in every person

¹⁴⁹ *ibid.* 15 Quakers were informed by scripture more than followed scripture. In this sense, tradition throughout the whole of scripture and the whole life of the Church, with the exception of scholasticism, is affirmed in exegetical Barclay.

interpretation of ‘catholic’ disagreed with the Roman understanding of ‘the universal gathered under the Pope’. Romanism was a contrived unity, foreign to the Church universal which abides in the unity of its members, unity of soul and mind.¹⁵⁰ By making unity a formal union under the Pope, the Western Church had moved from living unity under God. The West also lost unity through doctrinal innovations made to confirm the authority of the Pope. Khomiakov concluded that the true Church was the Eastern Church precisely because she remained *Sobornyi*, timelessly unified in Tradition.¹⁵¹

Khomiakov’s Church involved a complex dialectic between the transcendent and the immanent.

Transcendently, the Church is one, untouched by human conflict and discord. While there had been conflict in the Church, yet believers, so long as they remained *sobornyi* were identical with the transcended Church. The immanent Church was considered to be representative of the virtues of Russian national identity. His ecclesial writings played an important role in restoring the Church to a believing community in its heritage, responsibility, freedom, and obligation.¹⁵²

Khomiakov extended his considerations into the realm of philosophy. His essays included descriptions of human consciousness and cognition within the church. He elaborated on the role of the will, and overcoming the subject/object dichotomy of German idealism. The will is the bearer of life, directing reason toward its goal. The cognition of will means that all knowledge is faith since reason assumes an ‘as-yet-not-known’ object before it knows it. Knowledge is communication of will to the object. Khomiakov ends with a vision of people joined by an energy field, exchanging parcels of being through will, and gaining knowledge through faith. Energy communicates not only the representation of the object, but the full image of the object.¹⁵³

¹⁵⁰ *ibid.* 15 The transcendent and immanent mystery of God is core in Barclay’s Christology and is uniform with the Apostle Paul.

¹⁵¹ *ibid.* 15 Jesus Christ as Head, always present, was the unifying factor of Christ’s Body. Barclay rejects the Pope as center.

¹⁵² *ibid.* 16 The Quaker historiographical series *Piety Promoted* is a sign of the thin line between the Church present and the Church ascended. The Church was present wherever ‘the Church’ was. Worship was first of all at large in the world and then in meeting.

¹⁵³ *ibid.* 17 We see the knowable energy of God and the unknowable essence of God in Khomiakov’s thought. Faith is the expression of the will towards its object. This coincides with Grace being God in immanent energy as well as transcendent essence.

Khomiakov continues that the extension of one's knowledge augments one's being, bringing it into communion with the object. Individuals are called to enter into sympathy and compassion. Relations are to be ruled by love in giving of self. Khomiakov's ideas were that of the energy of the hesychasts found in the writings of Gregory Palamas (1296-1359). *Sobornost* was the foundation of Orthodox ecclesiology; synergy through unceasing hesychasm.¹⁵⁴

Khomiakov's companion Ivan Kireevsky (1806-1856) became a member of the same Society of Wisdom-Lovers in 1824. Instead of following a civil-service career, he gave his life to the culture of Russia.¹⁵⁵

Kireevsky's first work displayed an original view of Western philosophy and Russian culture, elucidating Russia's particular role in the progress of universal civilization. In 1834 Kireevsky underwent a conversion through contact with monastic elder Philaret of Moscow (1782-1867). This began the influence of Russian spirituality on his philosophical outlook. He also became acquainted with the Fathers of the Church, notably, Isaac the Syrian and Maximus the Confessor. By the 1840s it was Kireevsky's goal to restore the Eastern Church Fathers to the center of Russian culture.¹⁵⁶

While beginning as an outsider to the church in the 1820s, by the final decade of his life, he was speaking from within the church. His goal was to establish a philosophical expression of the Orthodox experience for the Russian people.¹⁵⁷ Kireevsky considered that the culture of every nation is measured by its participation in the culture of all nations by the place it occupies in human development.¹⁵⁸ His approach allowed Russia to both join itself to the world process and achieve an independent culture. By the late 30s Kireevsky discovered that the idea of unity dear to the German Romantics had been realized in traditional Russia. This was exclusive Christian doctrine without pagan remnants.¹⁵⁹ Kireevsky considered that Russia's lack of pagan heritage allowed Russia to accept Christianity in pure form and build its social relations on Christian truth

¹⁵⁴ *ibid.* 17 Hesychasm as unceasing prayer through the heart maintains synergy with God and attentiveness to others.

¹⁵⁵ *ibid.* 18 Like George Fox and Robert Barclay, Kireevsky lived experimentally until arriving at the heart of truth.

¹⁵⁶ *ibid.* 18-19 Kireevsky's discovery represents this researcher's discovery in finding the Eastern Fathers as consistent with Barclay's true Christian divinity. Divinization is the soteriological heart of Isaac the Syrian and Maximus the Confessor.

¹⁵⁷ *ibid.* 19 Kireevsky's heart to establish the Orthodox Church at the heart of Russian culture represents the heart of this researcher to establish the understanding of theosis at the heart of Quaker Christianity through Robert Barclay's work.

¹⁵⁸ *ibid.* 20 The test of a nation is how it treats its people and the people of the world.

¹⁵⁹ *ibid.* 20 Salvation through Jesus Christ, pure and simple, is intended for the whole world. This was Orthodoxy.

without compromise. Instead of European culture and Western civilization influencing Russia, he claimed the pure form of Byzantine Christianity free from rationalist developments undergone in the West.¹⁶⁰

In 1845, Kireevsky wrote that, instead of universities spreading doubt and scholasticism, Russian monasteries spread enlightenment and culture in original spiritual wholeness. Kireevsky had progressed from a European centered universalism, to a universalism based on Christianity. It was a philosophy of integral being arrived at through metaphysics of unity and integral knowledge.¹⁶¹ Kireevsky's intuition was that humanity must strive to develop all its inherent capacities in a harmonious way, so that a hierarchical subordination of powers might be attained. He claimed that harmonious being results from the concentration, gathering, and wholeness of inner powers.¹⁶² The place of concentration is the heart where one is conscious of God and achieves light that illumines all lower spheres. Severed from the heart, Western philosophy had restricted itself to the lower, subordinate powers, resulting in blind understanding and distorted reason.¹⁶³

Anthropological knowledge originates in the heart. Integral reason unites the heart and mind. By contrast the German idealists used fallen reason. It was the logical faculty separated from the soul.¹⁶⁴ In response, since 'being' is attained through the integration of society, knowledge is then inherently social and interpersonal. The fragments of integration, Kireevsky contended, emerged from Khomiakov's understanding of the Church. Universal knowledge is ecclesial. Kireevsky's epistemology included the unity of the church, the unity of society, and unity within the individual. Unity was the basis of all.¹⁶⁵ Kireevsky furthered that the heart is the source of moral knowledge and the domain of religion. Unity is the moral imperative causing humanity to struggle against the dividedness of the world. Moral victory, hidden in the Christian soul, is a

¹⁶⁰ *ibid.* 20 Barclay rejected scholasticism over pure unadulterated Christianity.

¹⁶¹ *ibid.* 21 Universalism through scholastic reason is altogether different than universalism through Christ. Universalism through Christ comes only by knowing Christ.

¹⁶² *ibid.* 21 Christianity flows from within the person outward. The place of the monastery in Christian formation attests to this.

¹⁶³ *ibid.* 21 Barclay guarded (and warned) against outward intrusive forces coming into the heart. Reason by itself was fallen.

¹⁶⁴ *ibid.* 22 New covenant anthropological knowledge resides in the heart as prophesied by Jeremiah (31:33). This was to be universal (31:34). The anthropological universal nature of the new covenant was to the Jew (Hebrews 8:10) and the Gentile (Hebrews 10:16).

¹⁶⁵ *ibid.* 22 Theosis heals from fragmentation to wholeness. Christ intends wholeness for all aspects of creation

victory for the world. Each lifts and attracts to itself all that is similar in human hearts and each breathes the life of all.¹⁶⁶

Kireevsky's privileging of feeling, will, and the individual psyche is traced to the moral character of the heart. Reason is reinvigorated from the immediacy of the heart. At the same time the non-rational mind has consequences. As long as thought is clear to reason, it does not affect the soul and will. Thought reaches maturity when it develops into an inexpressible state. The meaning of philosophy lies not in logic or metaphysics but in where it places humanity in respect to Truth.¹⁶⁷ For Kireevsky, Augustine (354-430) was wrong not because of his opinions, but because his rational method was incompatible with Truth.¹⁶⁸

Robert Bird states that Kireevsky's argument is a biting critique of the West to produce an ideal of lasting and universal significance. The history of the West reveals contradictions and compromises between Christian ideals and life which call into question Europe's original commitment to Christianity, and its ability to serve as bearer of Christian truth. On the basis of experience, Kireevsky describes Christian civilization as governed by the Spirit. Khomiakov and Kireevsky reveal universal wholeness through the Orthodox lens of *Sobornost* and integral knowledge.¹⁶⁹

In conclusion, Kallistos Ware claims that Khomiakov exercised little influence on the theology taught in the seminaries which were growing independent from the West. By 1900 there were a number of Russian theologians, historians, and liturgists trained in Western academic disciplines that refused Western influence to distort Orthodoxy. Since the time of Emperor Peter the Great (1721) who abolished the Patriarchate and established the Holy Synod, unbelief had become common among Russian intellectuals, but in the 1900s a number of thinkers like Sergius Bulgakov, a former Marxist, and Nicholas Berdyaev found their way back to the Orthodox Church where the Emperor had been the 'Supreme Judge of the Holy Synod'. In 1917 an all-Russian Church Council abolished the Synodical form of government and restored the Patriarchate under

¹⁶⁶ *ibid.* 22-23 The nature of Christ and God, is for His Body universal. This is the meaning of Jesus' high priestly prayer in John 17.

¹⁶⁷ *ibid.* 23 Philosophy points to apophatic knowing as communicated by Dionysius the Areopagite and Gregory of Nyssa

¹⁶⁸ *ibid.* 23 While canonized as a saint by the East, St Augustine is criticized by the East for turning noetic knowing into reason

¹⁶⁹ *ibid.* 24 At some point the rational must bow to the numinous, or it remains just that, rational. Christ came to make righteous.

Saint Tikhon (1866-1925). In January 1918, St Vladimir, Metropolitan of Kiev, was murdered by the Bolsheviks as the beginning of the Communist Revolution.¹⁷⁰

Ware acknowledges that there is a Western rite Orthodoxy equivalent to Eastern rite Catholicism. The Western rite existed in the first millennium before the schism between East and West (1054). They used their own liturgy, different from the Byzantine rite, yet fully Orthodox. These parishes currently exist within the Antiochian archdiocese in the USA and France. Their origin extends back to 1937 where Roman Catholic priest, Louis-Charles Winnaert (1880-1937) who received consecration in the Liberal Catholic Church was received at Paris with his followers into the Moscow patriarchate. By special concession, they were allowed to use the Western rite. Under the recent leadership of Bishop Germain, the French movement has ceased communion with the Eastern Churches.¹⁷¹

Ware continues that Orthodoxy in the West has struggled to survive. He challenges, if the Western-rite believes Orthodoxy to be the true faith, they should not cut themselves off from the West but share Orthodoxy with them. Ware concludes that the issues confronting the 'Great and Holy Council' are the problem of Orthodox disunity with non-Orthodox churches, and application of Orthodox moral teaching in the modern world.¹⁷²

Ware quotes Vladimir Lossky when he says it is not easy to recognize victory underneath the appearance of failure, to discern the power of God fulfilling itself in weakness and the true church in history. In spite of the instability following the fall of communism (1988), there are reasons for hope. Orthodox monasticism on Mount Athos has increased. The treasures of the *Philokalia* and the Jesus Prayer are used and appreciated in increasing measure. Orthodox theologians are discovering forgotten yet vital elements of their theological heritage.¹⁷³ This leads to the next section in which the Western Roman Catholic theologian, Doctor David Fagerberg (1952-), Associate Professor in the Department of Theology, University of Notre Dame, discovers the strength of the East to influence the West through the work of Alexander Schmemmann (1921-1983).

¹⁷⁰ Ware, Timothy. *The Orthodox Church*. Penguin Books, UK, 2015, 120.

¹⁷¹ *ibid.* 180

¹⁷² *ibid.* 181-2

¹⁷³ *ibid.* 185-6

THE INFLUENCE OF THE EAST ON THE WEST FROM A ROMAN CATHOLIC

David Fagerberg, a student of Father Aidan Kavanagh was introduced to Father Alexander Schmemmann during his years at Yale. He claims that Kavanagh introduced him to a thinker for whom liturgy was life. Instead of approaching Schmemmann as a systematician with scalpel in hand to dissect a liturgical cadaver to see the makeup of his internal organs, he was directed to read everything Schmemmann had produced.¹⁷⁴ In his article *The Cost of Understanding Schmemmann in the West*, he addresses the Western captivity of Orthodoxy where Orthodoxy's ecclesiastical identity has been altered into something other than Orthodox. Fagerberg is most interested in seeing why the West missed what the East had to offer.¹⁷⁵

In the first of Fagerberg's seven propositions, the East sees theology as 'a vision' whereas the West thinks of theology as a mental construct. People in the West give the name theologian to people living in the Academy. Theology is practiced in the halls of science, and even if a theologian is urged to make a commitment from the heart, or be active in service to the poor, the only reason to call them a theologian is because of what he thinks. Worship in the West is an abstraction or a dissemination of belief. Theology's origin is the text, and its outcome is more texts.¹⁷⁶ Schmemmann considers it the original sin of Western ideology to make the text the authority, disconnecting theology from the Spirit its source through the liturgy in particular, and in life in everything.¹⁷⁷

Fagerberg affirms that while Eastern, Schmemmann was capable of understanding theology in a cognitive way. Theology is an explanation, a search for 'words' appropriate to the nature of God. Schmemmann started out using language but after a dozen years was convinced that if people participated in Holy Week, Pascha, the Resurrection, Pentecost, the Dormition, etc. there would be no need for 'words'. Theology flows into the heart through the liturgy.¹⁷⁸ This Schmemmann identified as theologies native habitat. Theology is vision of God more than cognition. Christ's Paschal mystery is united with the Trinity in action. Liturgy is the Trinity

¹⁷⁴ St Vladimir's Theological Quarterly 53 2-3 (2009) 179-207. The Cost of understanding Schmemmann in the West. by David W Fagerberg. Let your life speak is the Quaker phrase in response to systematic theology in the West.

¹⁷⁵ *ibid.* 179-80

¹⁷⁶ *ibid.* 181

¹⁷⁷ *ibid.* 181 The liturgical flow of life is the Quaker path of living sacramentally.

¹⁷⁸ *ibid.* 182

in action kenotically inviting synergistic ascent in deification.¹⁷⁹ In Holy Week, God descends into Hades and those in Hades are raised to eternal life. What is absolute is the vision and experience of God in the world for humanity. This vision also includes the earth's transfiguration.

The second absolute is connecting theology with Theosis. Theology includes doing battle against the disordered passions. The purification of the passions coincides with the image in man restored through man growing ever more into the likeness of God. Becoming a Saint is realized through asceticism.¹⁸⁰ In contrast Western scholasticism is a system in which theories swirl around like academic dust bunnies but do not lead to deification. In the East theology is knowledge of God leading to union with God. Schmemmann concludes that the scholastic is cut off from the experience of Theosis through mentalism.¹⁸¹

Fagerberg's second proposition includes individual versus ecclesial theology. In unifying theology, liturgy, and asceticism Schmemmann is not talking about subjective feelings, reason, or worship. He considers the Church to be the mother and unifier of all believers. Belief 'as a word' does not give the notion of experience. Instead, experience is possessed by the Church through Tradition. It is the universal experience of the risen Christ through the Spirit by which we are transformed.¹⁸² Schmemmann writes that theology is transmission in words the experience of the eternal Church, revealed, and communicated now. Theology in the West is science about God, science about Christ, and science about eternal life, while in the East, theology is knowledge imprinted in the mind by God so that the person pursues God in union with the eternal Church.¹⁸³

The apophatic God is found in hypostatic union of the three Persons and in the kataphatic kenosis of the Incarnation. Liturgy is participation in the New Adam as the Spirit passes everything through the hypostatic union.¹⁸⁴ Theology is thinking of all things heavenly and earthly with the mind of Christ. Schmemmann raises the question of why Western arguments are so weak and ineffective. He answers because Western proofs operate in dark knowledge, in the logic of this world. Dark knowledge consists in directing the fallen intellect

¹⁷⁹ *ibid.* 182

¹⁸⁰ *ibid.* 182-3

¹⁸¹ *ibid.* 183

¹⁸² *ibid.* 184-5

¹⁸³ *ibid.* 185

¹⁸⁴ *ibid.* 185

outward. Dark knowledge has no union with God as it exists for itself. In the East words comes through bright knowledge, from Christ, the Spirit, and the hypostatic union of Persons.¹⁸⁵

The way to bright knowledge is to turn the human spirit in and towards itself, and then to God. The mind turns from the endless plurality of the world, and with all its strength addresses itself to God. Through unceasing prayer one is incorporated into the very act of divine life in which one sees themselves and the world.¹⁸⁶ Theology is seeing the world in the Light of Mount Tabor. To possess bright knowledge requires conversion of mind through asceticism. Liturgical theology nurtures the way to the restored mind, the *meta-nous*.¹⁸⁷

According to Maximus the Confessor, there is attraction between the purified *nous* and knowledge. The Holy Spirit initiates the *nous* into the mysteries of the age to come. In this the person becomes a theologian. The *nous* becomes for the soul, a sky full of glorious thoughts with the Sun of Righteousness shining within, sending rays of theology into the world. Theology is the manifestation of the Spirit. When the *nous* is purified, it is illumined, and has capacity for wisdom. One's life, including the body becomes theology. The purified person is wholly theology.¹⁸⁸ Theologizing results from the pure mind by which a person ascetically orders life. Theology is living, changing, and realized through Theosis: becoming by Grace what God is by nature. Understood this way, theology is humanities universal vocation.¹⁸⁹

The third proposition is that Tradition is ever living more than history. Bright knowledge is thinking with the mind of Christ in union with the mind of the Church. Thinking traditionally is what the Church Fathers did. The Western approach teaches to look at texts but stops short of thinking in union with the saints at one with the mind Christ.¹⁹⁰ The East sees tradition as the gravitational pull on theology through asceticism. Tradition is the capacity of the mind of Christ. Tradition is the early Church's hermeneutical principle and method to the mind of Christ. Tradition is the action of the Spirit as living breath making the Word heard through

¹⁸⁵ *ibid.* 185-6

¹⁸⁶ *ibid.* 186

¹⁸⁷ *ibid.* 186

¹⁸⁸ *ibid.* 187

¹⁸⁹ *ibid.* 187

¹⁹⁰ *ibid.* 187-8

silence. The Spirit communicates to the faculty of hearing, the faculty of receiving, and the faculty of knowing within Christ's Body throughout history.¹⁹¹

The fourth proposition is *Ordo* (order) or *Ortho* (glory)? History is not enough. The essential is that humanity be in continuity with the impulse of history. In the approach which Schmemmann advocates, the question is not about liturgy but about theology. It is the faith of the Church that is expressed, communicated, and preserved through the liturgy. While the West searches for an *ordo* (order), Schmemmann searches for an *ortho* (straight doctrine) which makes *doxia* (straight glory), *ortho* (orderly); for what makes worship more than order (west) but glorification (east).¹⁹²

The fifth proposition is development. The West defines life as growth, and growth as development, and development as change. This chain of logic is not followed in the East and may be the most fundamental difference. For Irenaeus of Lyons tradition is not alive in the sense that it cannot change, grow, or develop.¹⁹³ If there is a trace of delusion it is called heresy. Development is scholastic innovations by heresiarchs. The Orthodox response is that eternal Truth is unchanging. The church's hypothesis of Truth is ever eternal and unchanging.¹⁹⁴ Theological inquiry does not think up another God or another Christ, but reflects on prophecies and parables, bringing out meaning from obscure passages by placing them in the clear truth of the Incarnation. The changing context of the unchanging gospel addresses contemporary needs. While the context changes, the gospel does not.¹⁹⁵

Schmemmann instructs, living water never changes but one can dig many wells to it. The study of tradition is finding the manifestations of the eternal content whereby we are transformed by the same truth. If we believe in the church, Schmemmann writes, the study of her past has only one goal: to find and make ours that which in her teaching is eternal, that which transcends past, present, and future, that with power to transform lives in

¹⁹¹ *ibid.* 189-90

¹⁹² *ibid.* 192

¹⁹³ *ibid.* 192

¹⁹⁴ *ibid.* 193

¹⁹⁵ *ibid.* 193

all ages. Deification is the hypothesis of the theologian who ascetically deliberates on how deification is achieved.¹⁹⁶

The liturgy is the Churches faith; the manifestation, communication, and fulfillment of that faith. *Lex orandi* is theological vision radiating from the Paschal mystery; the Tradition by which the Church lives as hermeneutical principle in which one hears, receives, and knows by the Holy Spirit.¹⁹⁷ *Lex orandi* is the code by which the Church reads Scripture, worships, and believes in concord with the experience of the Church throughout history. The *ordo* behind the rubrics is an unchanging *ortho* as living norm, the *logos* of eschatological worship.¹⁹⁸

The sixth proposition is eschatology, the foundational antinomy. Schmemmann assumes that liturgical theology is Christianity's unchanging eschatology. *Lex orandi* as prayer is eschatological. The kingdom of God is goal. The kingdom of God is amongst and within. Christianity is historical event, and the Presence of that event is completion of all things. Christianity is historical, existential, and eternal all at once.¹⁹⁹ Schmemmann argues that to read life by the right hypothesis requires eschatological light from the sanctuary. Instead of eschatology being immediate presence of supernatural joy the West makes eschatology the final judgment. Whether Roman or Calvin the West has turned toward the world through law, judgment, redemption, recompense, and is futuristic more than present.²⁰⁰

The loss of eschatology comes through scholasticism. In the West theology became a science dependent on the world.²⁰¹ In the East the pillar and ground of truth arises from the conviction that life is infinitely fuller than rational formulations. No formula can encompass fullness, and liturgy is fuller than definitions.²⁰²

The Church is a *leitourgia*, a mystery, a call to act after the fashion of Christ, to bear witness and testimony to Him. The Church as *leitourgia* is the presence of the kingdom in the midst of history so that history finds its

¹⁹⁶ *ibid.* 194

¹⁹⁷ *ibid.* 194-5

¹⁹⁸ *ibid.* 195

¹⁹⁹ *ibid.* 196

²⁰⁰ *ibid.* 196-7

²⁰¹ *ibid.* 197

²⁰² *ibid.* 197

meaning.²⁰³ Protestants build a comfortable earthly life but in none of its aspects does it remind one of Paradise. The Protestant lives in the fallen world not referring to the primordial, joyous, divine world. He is bound to the world of reason.²⁰⁴ The Catholic remembers in a gilded, tasteless, and decorated church where there is a longing for paradise, and provides a dull social message of service to the world. Protestants, in their attempt to save Christianity from the Romanists, paid the price of denying eschatology and replaced it with individual salvation essentially denying the Christ's Body throughout history.²⁰⁵ Liturgical theology is a vision of the world from the light of Mount Tabor. Fagerberg concludes that Liturgy occurs as an arc of electricity between the pole of the world and the pole of God's kingdom. The antinomy of liturgical theology is holding tension between these two poles, one sacred and the other profane in creative tension.²⁰⁶

Fagerberg's seventh proposition is what the Church offers the world. What enables Christianity and Orthodoxy to remain alive in the world is a vision of life coming from the vision of light, transparency, and the referring of everything to the Other. The source of light is the Presence of Christ apart from and within the mysteries.²⁰⁷ In the Church and in the Eucharist the kingdom of God spiritualizes matter, reveals the meaning of history, and deifies. *Lex orandi* as prayer yields a doctrine of creation that asserts that all matter was made to be sacrament; an eschatology that asserts everything is destined for glory; and an anthropology that asserts that man made in the image of God can attain the likeness of God. It yields a Christology that asserts that the reign of God brings with it obligations to the poor, the prisoner, and the outcast. It yields an eschatology that asserts that the church reveal potency in the world.²⁰⁸

When Schmemmann considers Liturgy he thinks of it as the world on the course of Transfiguration. The Church is the Presence of a saved world. In the church God lifts the world to its spiritual fulfillment. What Christianity offers is joy on God's terms.²⁰⁹ Christianity tears life apart, disturbing the heart in the tearing. It is eschatological otherworldliness. Joy comes with the price of asceticism which pries open closed hearts. For

²⁰³ *ibid.* 198

²⁰⁴ *ibid.* 199

²⁰⁵ *ibid.* 199

²⁰⁶ *ibid.* 200

²⁰⁷ *ibid.* 200

²⁰⁸ *ibid.* 200-1

²⁰⁹ *ibid.* 201

the West to understand, its theology will have to receive its vision from an epiphany which looks at the world through the eyes of the heart. History is seen through eternity, and matter is seen in process of deification in likeness to God.²¹⁰ All theology is Eucharistic through the real Presence. As this happens, theology becomes clear, organized, precise, and articulate in lived 'Presence'.²¹¹ We now conclude with the work of the University of Helsinki, Finland on their reading on Martin Luther of the West.

A RE-READING OF MARTIN LUTHER (1483-1546) AS EASTERN

Veli-Matti Karkkainen in his 2004 work '*One with God*' claims that Martin Luther has been misread by the West in his reading of Luther's *justification* as Eastern *deification*. He claims that the desire of all religions is union with the living God. Christian theology in particular offers an answer to the world in deification or union with God. Though the Eastern Church has been the carrier of deification throughout the patristic era never has it been the sole treasure of one part of Christendom. Instead, Karkkainen claims the Western church has approached union with God using a different vocabulary.²¹² Karkkainen quotes Orthodox Giorgios Mantzaridis who said that the idea of deification, oneness with God, God likeness, is that which from the beginning has constituted the innermost longing of man. Unfortunately, the first humans in attempting to appropriate it transgressed God's command, failed, and in place of deification met with corruption and death.²¹³ The thesis of Karkkainen's study is that amidst the differences between the East and West the common motif is union with God. Both the East through *Theosis* and the West through *justification* have union with God as ultimate goal.²¹⁴ [emphasis mine continued throughout the remainder of this section]

Karkkainen considers that the challenge to Christian theology is that the Church on earth is hopelessly divided in doctrines, polities, and leadership patterns. All Christians want their distinct testimony. He considers that all Christians are on the way to the same salvation provided by Almighty God. He sees the richness of Christian theology as a symphony, a cacophony of voices concerning the saving work of God.

²¹⁰ *ibid.* 202

²¹¹ *ibid.* 202-3

²¹² Karkkainen, Veli-Matti. *One with God: Salvation as Deification and Justification*. MN: Liturgical Press, 2004, 1

²¹³ *ibid.* 2

²¹⁴ *ibid.* 4

While no homogenous testimony is expected, a common salvation could be realistic.²¹⁵ This is where this researcher argues that Theosis is experientially the way of salvation and is at the heart of Barclay's soteriology.

Karkkainen recognizes that in history *Theosis* and *justification* have been diametrically opposed. For most Lutherans, the East entertained problematic notions of a free will which were too positive and too anthropological and, worst of all, confused the idea of divine-human *energeia* in salvation.²¹⁶ Poorly read Protestants insist that the East idolatrously made us little gods or think of participation in the divine only in physical terms. Adolf von Harnack was convinced that Irenaeus of Lyons and Gregory Palamas were uniform with Gnostic texts and Manichaeian texts placing them with Far East mysticism.²¹⁷

Karkkainen does acknowledge that for Lutherans *justification* is the doctrine on which Christianity stands or falls and in the history of Orthodox theology there is nearly total absence of *justification by faith*. John of Damascus never mentioned *justification* in his manual of *The Orthodox Faith*.²¹⁸ Karkkainen considers that it is highly significant that none of the first seven ecumenical councils, binding for all Christians, defined the doctrine of salvation in a fixed way.²¹⁹ While the West has been slow to characterize salvation in terms of deification, the East while not acknowledging *justification* and *sanctification* has always acknowledged the problem of sin and the need for the sacrifice of the Lamb of God. Here we find the difference between Western Christ as Victim and Eastern Christ as Victor in atonement.²²⁰ Karkkainen concludes with the Protestant F. W. Norris in his article 'Deification: Consensual and Cogent', in the *Scottish Journal of Theology* 43, no. 4 (1996, pp. 413-428) that "deification should be viewed by Protestants not as an oddity of Orthodox theology but as an ecumenical consensus; a Catholic teaching of the Church, best preserved and developed by the Orthodox." This coincides with Hans Urs von Balthazar in his work *Theologik*, vol. 3 (1987, 169 ff.), who offers a contemporary re-appropriation of deification in Roman Catholicism.²²¹

²¹⁵ *ibid.* 5

²¹⁶ *ibid.* 5-6

²¹⁷ *ibid.* 6

²¹⁸ *ibid.* 6

²¹⁹ *ibid.* 7

²²⁰ *ibid.* 7

²²¹ *ibid.* 9

Karkkainen affirms the writing of western Daniel Clendenin who states that the West lacks any developed notion of Theosis and expresses salvation in juridical categories in contrast with the East who neglects *justification* altogether in favor of *deification*, a theme it discovers throughout the Bible and repeats down through the centuries.²²² Clendenin considers that in recent New Testament scholarship *justification* can be summarized as one of the images of salvation but cannot be made the hermeneutical key. In the Old Testament *justification* is not legal imputation, and *justification* and *sanctification* cannot be distinguished from each other but mean setting a person in right relationship with God and others. *Justification* includes the in-breaking of God's kingdom in one's person with the covenant requirements met in Christ's cross which opens the faith response. Finally, *justification* is the new status and relationship to God by faith and requires individual response be more than individualistic but be in relation to both God and humanity.²²³

Karkkainen agrees with Clendenin that the Bible speaks extensively about *Theosis* according to Orthodox theologians, and so must the Protestants. This is in line with the Protestant Norris who says that the Protestant weakness is they seem totally unaware of the most radical reorientation concerning the doctrine of Theosis, and the growing Reformation-Lutheran appreciation of deification.²²⁴ Orthodoxy is lived theology rather than analytical speculation. Limits are established in human inquiry into things divine by apophatic theology. What theology is able to say about God and God's dealings are mainly what they are not. *Theosis* permeates the liturgy and prayer of the Eastern church.²²⁵ The cross of Christ is envisaged not as punishment satisfying transcendent justice, rather, the death on the cross was effective not as the death of the Innocent One but as the death of the Incarnate Lord, the second Adam in vanquishing death through resurrection in his assumption of fallen human nature. Jesus Christ was the primordial Adam a second time. This is what Gregory of Nazianzus meant when he said what is not assumed is not healed, and what is united to God is saved. In being united with God we pick up our cross as God picked up his cross.²²⁶ God's primordial plan has not changed. His desire is that man be united with Him, and lead in the transfiguration of the earth. This is accomplished through repentance as an expression of finite man's free love of God. Salvation is the return to primordial life

²²² *ibid.* 8

²²³ *ibid.* 16

²²⁴ *ibid.* 18

²²⁵ *ibid.* 19

²²⁶ *ibid.* 22

immortal and the shaping of the human into the image of her creator.²²⁷ While Vladimir Lossky says that *Theosis* is echoed by fathers and theologians of every age, another term used is Christification. Christification is humanity's destination found in Christ. *Theosis* is the mystery of eternal life in communion with God through the divine Logos.²²⁸ Maximus the Confessor states that deification is participation of the whole person in the whole God.²²⁹ Gregory Palamas's view is that salvation builds on the Incarnation by the Spirit. The love of God flows into the hearts of the faithful through the Holy Spirit and not through rational thought. Christ could not have entered His Body after his ascension had not the Spirit deified Christ's human nature in the incarnation.²³⁰ *Kenosis* in the descent of Christ makes humanity capable of assent in *Theosis* through Grace invading creation. *Deification* is not a metaphor but is union with God. Orthodox theology leaves in mystery the incompatibility of the Divine as essence and the partaking of humanity in Divine energy. *Deification* is participation in the divine energies.²³¹ Maximus the Confessor says that all that God is, except for essence, one becomes by grace as energy. This includes divine-human synergy as cooperation of persons with God. Prayer, asceticism, contemplation, and service are cooperation. Human freedom remains ever a part of *deification*.²³²

John Meyendorff affirms that the work of creation is inseparable from the Spirit. Athanasius states that the work of the Spirit is inseparable from that of the Son. God bore human flesh and Christians bear the Spirit. The Son has given us the first fruits of the Spirit so we can be transformed into the sons of God. The likeness of God realized comes by humanity being created in the image of God.²³³ The Spirit brings participation through *lex orandi* as human communion with God affecting *lex credendi* as belief in God. For Athanasius the Spirit shares the same divinity as the Father and the Son. *Deification* requires it. If the Spirit is not consubstantial with the Father and the Son, the Spirit cannot bring us to conform to the Son and therefore

²²⁷ *ibid.* 23

²²⁸ *ibid.* 25

²²⁹ *ibid.* 27

²³⁰ *ibid.* 29

²³¹ *ibid.* 30

²³² *ibid.* 31

²³³ *ibid.* 32-3

cannot save. For Athanasius and Basil, the Spirit has relationship with the Son in a consubstantial manner as the Son has relationship with the Father, and the Spirit with the Father.²³⁴

Karkkainen now turns to the search for a new interpretation of Luther. In Europe, since the 1970s a new reading of Luther's theology has emerged mainly at the University of Helsinki. Professor of theology Tuomo Mannermaa (1937-2015) claims that Luther's view of *justification* differs significantly from official Lutheran doctrines. The confessional documents were drafted by Melancthon in response to Catholicism. The Mannermaa School rejects the distinction between *justification* and *sanctification* as foreign to Luther's thought. They claim that Luther's *justification* is not forensic but Christ abiding in the heart of the believer in a real-ontic way.²³⁵ The way forward is through rejecting the neo-Protestant, neo-Kantian rational distinction between God's essence and God's effects. The transcendental effect blurs the real Presence of Christ in Luther's teaching. The Mannermaa School views Luther's theology through the lens of love, the cross, Christ's Presence in the believer, and *justification* (deification) in love of neighbor through the Spirit.²³⁶ Christ's Presence in the believer is identical with righteousness of faith. Lutheran tradition holds to God living in the believer which Mannermaa argues is analogous with the doctrine of *Theosis*. With *justification* aligning with this view then *Theosis* aligns with Luther. *Justification* and *deification* are participation of the believer in Christ because Christ as God participates in God. Christ's Presence is real-ontic and not the neo-Protestant effect.²³⁷ Mannermaa looks at Luther's doctrine from the side of *Theosis*. Luther claims God gives himself as Trinity to humanity as the essence of God which include the names of God as Word, justice, truth, wisdom, love, goodness, eternal life, etc. *Theosis* of the believer is initiated when God bestows on the believer these properties. A Christian is saved when the names of God are given to her.²³⁸ Christ is present in faith. Faith *justifies* because it takes hold of and possesses the present Christ.²³⁹

Further, Karkkainen joins Christ in faith with the Spirit in believing. The Spirit of Christ is the mediator of salvatory gifts. Participation is possible through the Spirit of Christ, the Spirit of adoption. There is no

²³⁴ *ibid.* 35

²³⁵ *ibid.* 37

²³⁶ *ibid.* 39

²³⁷ *ibid.* 46

²³⁸ *ibid.* 48

²³⁹ *ibid.* 48

justification by faith without the Spirit. Justifying faith is the love of God poured into the heart by the Spirit.²⁴⁰ Spirit is faith. Luther's theology of grace is distinguished from the scholastic and nominalist doctrine of Augustine's pneumatological understanding of grace. Luther places free will against the gracious effects of the Spirit. Luther strongly opposes the scholastic rule that to those who do what they can God gives grace.²⁴¹ Luther refutes all the synergistic tendencies of the nominalists by affirming God's monergism as Spirit. Either God's Spirit vilifies the human being, or she lives in enslavement to the enemy. No other entity can substitute for the third person of the Trinity. For Luther grace is personal encounter with the presence of Christ or the Holy Spirit in the inmost secrecy of the human being.²⁴² The connection between Spirit and experience is gaining ground in Luther's theology. It is Luther that says that no one can understand God or his Word unless he receives understanding immediately from the Holy Spirit. No one receives from the Spirit without experience.²⁴³ Robert Barclay draws a quote from Luther toward this idea.

For conservative evangelicals what makes eastern soteriology problematic is emphasis on the process of spiritual growth and its lack of declaring a person righteous at confession of faith. This is essential to evangelical thought.²⁴⁴ Donald Fairbairn argues that for Westerners, the person's status before God is the most critical of questions. This question hardly surfaces for Easterners given the doctrine of *Theosis*. By eliminating the dividing line between *justification* and *sanctification* Eastern *Theosis* is unacceptable to evangelicals. For evangelicals, *justification* as God's declaration of a sinner as righteous is Biblical. Eastern theologians are accused with Catholics of not accepting salvation as free gift.²⁴⁵ The Evangelical position of free gift conflicts with Melanchthon's view of works in righteousness as inclusive of salvation.²⁴⁶ Barclay affirmed Philip Melanchthon and his position in his *Apology*.

Karkkainen also highlights Clark Pinnock's pneumatological view of the Spirit as central rather than peripheral in Evangelical salvation. He contends that when we look at salvation from the standpoint of the

²⁴⁰ *ibid.* 62

²⁴¹ *ibid.* 63

²⁴² *ibid.* 64

²⁴³ *ibid.* 66

²⁴⁴ *ibid.* 82

²⁴⁵ *ibid.* 83

²⁴⁶ *ibid.* 83

Spirit, we view it in relational and effective terms. Rather than standard Protestant guilt and sin categories, Pinnock understands salvation as transformation, personal relationship, and union. The goal is glorification and union with God by the Spirit. The biblical imagery of the Christian life is the sexual imagery used by Paul in love between husband and wife (Ephesians 5:21-31) as uniform with Christ's love for humanity. Relationship with God through the Spirit is affirmed through synergism of grace and assent, through God working in us and our reciprocation (Philippians 2:12-13; Ephesians 2:8-10).²⁴⁷ Pinnock argues that access to salvation is less problematic in pneumatological theology than an exclusive Christological theology. Where the incarnation of the Son was confined to specific place and time, the effect of the Spirit is transmitted to the ends of the earth.²⁴⁸

While Karkkainen considers the Lutheran and Orthodox churches as pioneers in the ecumenical movement going back to correspondence between patriarch Jeremiah II of Constantinople between 1573 and 1581 yet it has been since the late 1950s that a bilateral Lutheran-Orthodox dialogue has taken place.²⁴⁹ Lutheran reservation on *deification* as a false metaphysic contradicting *justification* of the cross has weakened. The *faith* approach of the Lutheran and the *holiness* approach of the Orthodox may find a way forward. Including Christ in the Lutheran faith 'alone' emphasis and Eastern participation in divine life may find convergence.²⁵⁰ The Lutheran delegation affirms there is no one, undifferentiated Protestant theology and that Luther's insistence on Christ present through faith, finds congruency with Eastern participation in Divine life. The person in Christ participates in God.²⁵¹ Orthodox soteriology is imbued with pneumatology, deification, and loaded with the work of the Spirit in salvation. The road leading to *deification* is growth in God who is holy. In Orthodox soteriology it is 'becoming all flame' by the Spirit.²⁵²

Reformation theologians accused the Orthodox of the cardinal sins of free will and *synergia*. But Lutheran scholars acknowledge that the synergistic-pneumatological and anthropological position is based on belief

²⁴⁷ *ibid.* 83-5

²⁴⁸ *ibid.* 86

²⁴⁹ *ibid.* 87

²⁵⁰ *ibid.* 89

²⁵¹ *ibid.* 90

²⁵² *ibid.* 96-7

that the Holy Spirit is sovereignly free to interact with the believer on an individual basis.²⁵³ The Eastern doctrine of salvation is balanced in pneumatological-Christological terms. While the Reformation doctrine of salvation is open to pneumatological perspectives it stands primarily in Christological categories. The rediscovery of Luther's own theology with the idea of Christ's Presence in the believer through the Holy Spirit as *justification* opens a new appreciation for the Spirit in salvation. Salvation cannot be expressed in purely Christological terms without pneumatological grounding. A concluding Scripture also quoted by Barclay refers to the role of the Spirit in the "washing of regeneration and renewal in the Holy Spirit, which he poured out upon us richly." (Titus 3:5-7)

In summary, this section reveals that scholasticism of the West is dissonant with theosis in the East. Timothy Ware reveals the history of separation of the West from the East through papal supremacy and more importantly, the *filioque* clause which affects the economy of salvation. Thomas Aquinas is said to have quoted Dionysius the Areopagite 1,760 times in Ware's affirmation of the apophatic in Thomas literature. The case study on the incongruence of branding in the Orthodox Church of Finland reveals that the Tradition of the saints and Church throughout history is its brand. This coupled with the organic nature of faith in Pentti Mikael Leiman's experience at the Valamo Monastery, revealing a path of conversion that doesn't avoid the complexities of life, including science, is comparable to what Quaker Howard Brinton calls tender. The Slavophil leaders Khomiakov and Kireevsky reveal that return to Orthodoxy is not through use of Western idealism or scholasticism but is faith in the universal designs of God. Roman Catholic David Fagerberg assesses what the West is missing from the East through his analysis of Orthodox theologian Alexander Schmemmann. While emphasizing the role of Divine Liturgy in deification, deification must have its completion in the antinomy of the sacred and the secular in life. The Church is the Kingdom in the present and the hope of the world. Veli-Matti Karkkainen of the Lutheran school of Mannermaa represents work begun in the 1950's to evaluate Martin Luther's justification through faith 'alone' with the Presence of Jesus in the believer. He raises questions concerning conventional Lutheran positions on free will, works, and the economy of salvation in opposition to theosis. Karkkainen brings forth important thinkers in his analysis such

²⁵³ *ibid.* 127

as Protestants Daniel Clendenin and Donald Fairbairn, Catholic Hans Urs von Balthasar, and Orthodox John Meyendorff. Most importantly to this research is the difference of Christ as Victor versus Christ as Victim in atonement. Theosis emphasizes Christ as Victor over human sin and bodily death that comes to live within as healer and high priest. The juridical approach to salvation this PhD argues is antithetical to exegetical Barclay, and further argues that the germs of theosis can be seen in Barclay's defense of 'True Christian Divinity' to be demonstrated in Chapters 2-7.

Literature Review

Elton Trueblood (1990-1994), scholar and professor at Earlham School of Religion, considered the theology of Robert Barclay an underpinning of Quakers through the first three centuries.²⁵⁴ In his account, he details Robert Barclay's history in general and his life in the various roles that he played. The foundation and background of his life contributed to Barclay's life vocation as an apologist for the 'true Christian divinity' and statesman governor of East Jersey beginning in 1682.²⁵⁵

A historic theme that Trueblood emphasizes is the role of Scripture. Trueblood contends that Barclay and early Friends loved the Scriptures though Barclay maintained that the Bible is of secondary authority. Trueblood states that, 'Barclay valued the Bible because it enabled Christians to extend the Fellowship of verification to past ages, and to see how direct experiences of God's power compare with the reported experiences of God's power in other times'. Barclay said the Bible had the value of a mirror, 'God has seen meet that herein they should, as in a looking-glass, see the conditions and experiences of the saints of old; that finding experience answers to theirs, Christians

²⁵⁴ Trueblood, Elton. *Robert Barclay*, Harper & Row Publishers, New York, 1968, 19-20. Barclay's place in history is that he, more than any other person, saved Quakerism from extinction. Other movements of the same period soon died. Movements cannot long survive on mere enthusiasm. No movement can continue for centuries unless it wins the ascent of some of the best minds and, through them, achieves an intellectual form which is capable of rational defense. Barclay's crucial contribution was the ministry of intelligence.

²⁵⁵ *ibid*, 100

might thereby be the more confirmed and comforted, in the hope of obtaining the same end, strengthened'.²⁵⁶ Trueblood highlights his final chapter on 'The Meaning of the Sacraments' with the following quote from Barclay, '*Our communion with Christ is and ought to be our greatest and chiefest work*'²⁵⁷ which this researcher claims remains at the heart of 'true Christian divinity'.

Alan P.F. Sell (1935-2016) in his 'Robert Barclay, The Fathers and the Inward, Universal Saving Light: A Tercentenary Reappraisal' concludes that while Barclay 'misused' the Fathers to advance Quaker Christianity, he advocates that the Fathers could have been further used to solidify Quakers as decidedly Christian. Notably, while raised a puritan Presbyterian, George Keith did not return to Protestantism as usually defined when he defected Quakerism in 1700, but joined the COE-Anglican communion which remains God centered at its foundation over 'Bible-centered'. The Protestant bias in the Anglican Church is rejection of papal authority. Sell argues that Barclay is clearly Trinitarian, Biblically informed and could have made further use of the Fathers in the fine nuances of Barclay's 'True Christian Divinity'.

Sell states of Barclay's theology 'this suggests a somewhat cheekier way of posing the question: How happy are contemporary Quakers to be endorsed, on doctrinal points, by a distinguished Unitarian?' May it be that Friends and others need to return to the heritage of Christian testimony in order to recover emphases which Barclay did not dwell upon because they were common currency? If so, the reason for doing so will be that the currency has subsequently been devalued'.²⁵⁸ Sell raises the necessary question and point related to the universal nature of Christ's redeeming work and the place of the Fathers in communicating that work.

²⁵⁶ *ibid*, 136

²⁵⁷ Trueblood, Elton. *Robert Barclay*, 1968, p. 219.

²⁵⁸ Sell, Alan P. F. Robert Barclay (1648-1690), *The Fathers and the Inward, Universal Saving Light: A Tercentenary Reappraisal*. School of Advanced Study, University of London, *The Journal of the Friends' Historical Society*, Vol 56 No 3 1992, 222.

‘Outside the church, there is no salvation’ quotes Hugh Pyper, concerning the Roman Catholic Church in his *‘Resisting the Inevitable Universal and Particular Salvation in the Thought of Robert Barclay’*. Pyper draws from Barclay’s 10th proposition ‘Of the Ministry’ and points out that Barclay holds the same position concerning salvation and the church.²⁵⁹

Pyper uses the Familist (Hendrik Niclaes) quote used by Barclay as the centerpiece of his writing on the universal nature of salvation anchored in the particular act. Pyper points to Barclay’s statement that the church becomes those who have responded to the secret work of God whatever their profession. He contends that Barclay’s universalism is driven as much by epistemological considerations as by soteriology. What is essential is to know the Divine in the right way.²⁶⁰ Pyper raises the question ‘Does Barclay’s epistemological commitment to the universality of “truth” undermine the particularity of the revelation in Jesus?’ and he asserts that Barclay defends his views against critics in proving that his approach is more ancient and authentic than the Protestants.²⁶¹ Quakerism is a pure manifestation of the original apostolic church.²⁶² For Barclay, Jesus is the particular Christ, the son of God manifest experientially in the world eternally.

Consideration in Pyper’s work is the style of argument Barclay is forced to use to answer the Cartesian reformers. Pyper says this scholastic style of argument is outside of the way of conviction and communication of the Quaker discovery. Pyper draws on Barclay’s illustration of the incidental detail and the true substance. Barclay uses the illustration of a body without limbs to

²⁵⁹ Pyper, Hugh S. *Resisting the Inevitable Universal and Particular Salvation in the Thought of Robert Barclay* (Quaker Religious Thought, 1998), 6-18

²⁶⁰ *ibid*, 6-7. The constant claim of early Quaker writers was that they represent ‘Primitive Christianity Revived.’

²⁶¹ *ibid*, 7

²⁶² Barclay, Robert. *An Apology for the True Christian Divinity*, 1678, ‘There may be members therefore of this Catholic Church both among heathens, Turks, Jews, and all the several sorts of Christians, men and women of integrity and simplicity of heart, who though blinded in some things in their understanding, and perhaps burdened with the superstitions and formalities of the several sects in which they are engrossed, yet being upright in their hearts before the Lord, chiefly aiming and laboring to be delivered from iniquity, and loving to follow righteousness, are by the secret touches of this holy light in their souls by the end quickened, thereby secretly united to God, and there-through become true members of this Catholic Church.’ *Proposition X*, 2.

describe the handicapped nature of those who would be unaware of the historic knowledge of Christ.²⁶³

Pyper contends that ‘logical categories’ are stretched beyond the breaking point in making ‘contingent truths’ eternal truths. This causes Christians to see Barclay as contradicting himself in the importance of the external knowledge of ‘facts’. Barclay says that ‘the facts’ of Jesus are integral but not essential.²⁶⁴ Pyper’s criticism of Barclay is that there is little development between the understandings of the Son and the Spirit. Pyper points out undeveloped areas in Barclay’s theology related to the historical understanding of the Son and Holy Spirit, and the role of the Holy Spirit related to contingent and eternal truth.²⁶⁵ He concludes by saying that Barclay leads to a polarizing conflict in later Quaker history and that ‘caricatures of Barclay would emerge as either liberal humanist or narrow evangelical’.²⁶⁶

Hugh Pyper reviews an edited [Quaker] *Catechism and Confession of Faith* (2001) initially completed by 24-year-old Robert Barclay, written in 1673, in order to outdo the Westminster divines whose *Westminster Confession* had been adopted by Parliament in 1648.

The *Westminster Confession* provided Presbyterian doctrine set out with an array of scriptural texts cited as proofs. Barclay, 25 years later demonstrates the Quaker principles directly from Scripture unadorned by commentary or interpretation.²⁶⁷ At first this would seem to contradict Pyper’s prior analysis of Barclay as a Quaker centered in a pure experience encounter with God. But in reality,

²⁶³ Hugh Pyper, *Resisting The Inevitable: Universal and Particular Salvation in the Thought of Robert Barclay* (QRT 1998), 12-13.

²⁶⁴ *ibid.*

²⁶⁵ *ibid.*, 18

²⁶⁶ *ibid.*, 17

²⁶⁷ Hugh Pyper, *Book Review: Robert Barclay a Catechism and Confession of Faith: a New Edition Edited in Modern English* by: Dean Frieday and Arthur Roberts, Barclay Press, (2001). *Quaker Religious Thought*, 2003, 98.

Pyper picks up on the danger and ineffectiveness of isolated proof-texts as means of Christian ‘true Christian divinity’.²⁶⁸

While Pyper questions the benefits of the proof-text approach, Pyper feeds into the core concept of soteriology realized by 17th century Barclay. The placement of Scripture in *Barclay’s Apology* follows his first two theses of the ‘True Foundation of Knowledge’ and ‘Immediate Revelation’. Former Puritan, now Quaker, Barclay has discovered that the ‘true foundation’ and ‘immediate revelation’ are realities in ‘new covenant’ Christianity to which the scriptures point.

While Pyper provides only a short analysis of the edited edition, his criticisms uncover the same criticisms of the East of the West, as it relates to minimizing God to scripture proof text through Cartesian rationalism and scholasticism.²⁶⁹

The third article by Hugh Pyper is ‘Robert Barclay: The Art of Apologetics’ published in the 2015 Cambridge edition of *Early Quakers and their Theological Thought, 1647-1723*.²⁷⁰ Pyper concludes his analysis with ‘It was inevitable that this mismatch between Barclay’s *theological presuppositions* and the *very experience* which he thought to defend would widen as those less theologically informed began to look on his apologetic work as a definitive statement until caricatures of Barclay as either a liberal humanist or narrow evangelical were produced. As a *theologian*, Barclay showed great ingenuity and learning in trying to account of *the experiences* of early Friends in the most current philosophical and theological systems of his day’. [emphasis mine]

Pyper claims that in an age of pamphleteers, Robert Barclay’s work *An Apology for the True Christian Divinity* remains the single most influential and original theological work by a member of

²⁶⁸ *ibid*, 99

²⁶⁹ Clendenin, Daniel. *Eastern Orthodox Christianity*, Baker, 2003, 50. Eastern thinkers begin their thinking about God with a very different mindset. Eastern thinkers typically exhibit skepticism toward Western rationalism. Conversely, Orthodoxy fosters a positive appreciation for mystery. Biblical faith and philosophic reliance on logic were two very different and incompatible vantage points.

²⁷⁰ Pyper, Hugh S., ‘Robert Barclay: The Art of Apologetics’, in Stephen W. Angell, and Pink Dandelion (eds.) *Early Quakers and their Theological Thought, 1647-1723* (Cambridge, 2015), 207-223.

the Society of Friends. This particular work remains the centerpiece to all his writings. Pyper continues his earlier conclusions that Barclay is responding to the philosopher rationalist René Descartes and the equally rationalist theology in his day of John Calvin. While Barclay addresses hierarchical issues regarding the Pope in the Roman Catholic Church, the antagonistic rejection of Quakers is coming from the *Protestant* world. [emphasis mine]

Pyper points out the controversial term of ‘certainty’ by exploring the Quaker concept of ‘infallibility’. Barclay defends the idea of Quaker infallibility outside of *Western* constructs of church tradition and Scripture. This is Barclay’s task as an apologist. Pyper concludes in his 2015 writing the same as in his 1998 writing that *logical* categories are being stretched beyond ‘categories’ by the contingent truth becoming eternal. The nature of this transition is Barclay’s articulation of soteriology. [emphasis mine]

Drawing from the experiential *vehiculum dei*, the ‘Seed’ in the soul, and the ‘Day of Visitation’, Barclay addresses the contingent that becomes eternal through the experiential. Pyper argues that Barclay articulates this controversial discovery in a Cartesian manner.

Pyper concludes by stating that Barclay’s solution to the rational problem of the West is that everyone is given the opportunity to respond to the Divine. Everyone receives sufficient grace, but not everyone receives the same grace.²⁷¹ For Barclay, everyone is capable of falling away from grace, concluding that even if they do experience the benefits, they subsequently forfeit the benefits. Barclay can give an unequivocal endorsement to the need for discipline and outward works, which, for Calvin, always remains outside of salvation.²⁷²

²⁷¹ Hugh Pyper, Robert Barclay: The Art of Apologetics, 12.

²⁷² *ibid*, 14

While Pyper academically defends Barclay's style he astutely concludes with the dichotomy of the emergent portrayal of Barclay as either liberal humanist or narrow evangelical. For Pyper this is a clear dichotomy.

Yasuharu Nakano, in his 2011 PhD dissertation²⁷³ details an approach to Barclay that centers on the Self and ultimately, the 'Self's' relationship to the 'Other' fulfilled in pacifism. Nakano begins his analysis with Barclay exposing the selfish nature of voluntarism on both sides of the Arminian/Calvinistic debate. The elect still work selfishly to assure their assurance.²⁷⁴ Both Calvin and Arminius theology are self-oriented. According to Nakano, Barclay counters with three concepts of God-centeredness: 'Inward Light', 'Day of Visitation', and 'Passiveness'. Passiveness is presented as the self-renouncing of 'all will to faith' arriving at silent listening to God on 'Self's' end.

Faith, sin, and redemption are past realities that Barclay would consider to have been covered by the cross of Christ. Nakano contends that Liberal Quakers no longer see these as necessary teachings. Instead, Barclay insists on the necessity of self-denial by bringing one's thoughts, feelings, and imaginations to 'nothingness' for the purpose of hearing God's initial words through the 'inward light' during one's 'day of visitation'. Barclay's theology is the total renunciation of 'Self' to such an extent that even the human-will to have faith or to fulfill the will of God is forsaken. When the human soul stops its own workings and is brought to nothingness (death on the Cross with Christ), the door of the heart, which otherwise is filled with voices of the 'Self' would be open to the working of God. This ushers in the inward light of Christ into the heart as spiritual birth. Humans respond to the light, and the new 'self' is constituted in response to God ('The Other').²⁷⁵ According

²⁷³ Nakano, Yasuharu. 'Self and Other in the Theology of Robert Barclay.' PhD dissertation submitted to the University of Birmingham, April 2011.

²⁷⁴ *ibid*, 299-300 Calvinists and Arminians both include different versions of voluntarism.

²⁷⁵ *ibid*, 300

to Nakano, Barclay clearly separates himself from the Arminian versus Calvinism dilemma brought on by Bible proof text through self-renunciation to the Christ of experience.

Secondly, Nakano states that during the 20th century, Liberal Quakerism held to passiveness which believes in God's self-expansion in the process of truth, and the completion of the human 'Self' through auto-regression to the 'Self' as origin, basing its belief on human intimate conjunction. God, through human mental faculties such as reason, consciousness, and conscience brought Quakerism into a religion of human 'Self'-realization. This led to eliminating the historic beliefs of 'Original Sin' and 'redemption'.²⁷⁶ Nakano considers the old dualistic tension of self-denial and passiveness to have been eliminated with this change. In Liberal historiography, the entire Quaker history was re-described from the perspective of Liberal Self-affirmative theology based upon the value of intimacy and proximity between the Self and God. The new ideology motivated by political and religious values ruled the day by marginalizing and even eliminating historic voices through the guise of academic study [scholasticism/rationalism].²⁷⁷

Thirdly, criticism from Reinhold Niebuhr arose in the twentieth century over Liberal Quaker optimism in the 'Sacred' nature of Human reason and conscience. Niebuhr's criticism was confirmed by Nakano in that dealing with otherness through the phenomena of love or the 'Sacredness' in each person didn't result in unifying 'Self' to the outside world. Liberal Quakers were short sighted in giving miniscule attention to the overlooked effect of human sin and divine providence. The tension between God and humans was ignored, while making God's love identifiable with one's own desire through politics. Pacifism was projected from a deficient set of criteria and found unsatisfying.

²⁷⁶ *ibid*, 302

²⁷⁷ *ibid*, 303

Nakano's fourth section is a return to perfectionism and God's Kingdom. The four elements in the tradition of perfection were outlined as the possibility of relative perfection, the impossibility of absolute perfection, the principle of [self] growth, and the social application of God's love as the realization of the Kingdom, its connection with human perfection, and the imminence of the Kingdom.²⁷⁸

Barclay modified the radical view of ultimate restored Christian victory over sin by describing perfection as realized 'here and now' in the birth and formation of Christ within human hearts through their response to inward light and perfection. This did not include movement into God's pure state yet did include movement in that direction. The encounter with the *vehiculum Dei* gives the chance for salvation, justification, and sanctification which leads to the fulfillment of Jesus' supreme command to 'love one's enemies'. The co-existence or communality in 'self-other' relations was the very truth of Christianity, and the loving activity of the church was the very possibility of the Kingdom.

The bifocal 'now' and 'here after' ideals of perfection and the Kingdom conclude Nakano's work. The double authorities of God's revelation and church judgment are to be the locus of embodying truth. Without a common goal the community cannot move forward. With an open attitude extended to people outside the community who are capable of hearing God's voice and participating in God's work through the inward light, the ethical fruit becomes the ultimate expression of the peace testimony. This fruit was revealed in Jesus' life in the Gospels which represents his command to love. Barclay's pacifism took the first step toward the realization of the peaceful Kingdom by appealing to others, especially civil kings and magistrates, to mind the inner working of the light, which invites them to find their Selfness, and recognize the communal nature of 'God-human' and 'Self-others'. In Barclay's theology, religious pacifism was not to work on others in a political or

²⁷⁸ *ibid*, 305

practical way, but rather as a counter-testimony against human conscious or unconscious self-centeredness.²⁷⁹ Barclay's pacifism invites people to see the communal nature of human existence in the framework of inward light, and to think of reconciliation with others.

Madeleine Ward's 2017 dissertation²⁸⁰ considers the scholarly neglect of theology as a driving factor in the development of Quakerism from the period of 1647 to 1700. Ward's goal is to demonstrate Quaker theological respectability by considering Quaker interaction with non-Quakers. She acknowledges that a level of doctrinal credibility and coherence was necessary if the Quakers were to answer the questions of the Protestants who were also reforming Roman Catholic Christianity. While Ward recognizes the place of Quaker origins being affected by the social and political context, she examines the neglected theological/enlightenment elements in the Quakers desire for 'respectability' amongst broader Protestant Christians.

In her theological examination she affirms that theology cannot be divorced from larger social and political realities, but states that pragmatic realities cannot fully articulate theological development. Ward affirms theological analysis of Christianity between 1647 and 1700, Quaker theological agency within the Protestant/COE/Roman Catholic context, places the Quakers amongst the Protestant dissenting traditions in the wider intellectual landscape of 17th-century England, and presents a sustained consideration of the Quakers contribution to the early Enlightenment (1685-1715). Ward analyzes Barclay's relationship with George Keith and his connection with the Cambridge Platonists. In so doing, Ward argues for a radically spiritualized worldview of early Quakerism centered in untethered silence and a subsequent failure to identify a positive role for the bodily Incarnate Christ.²⁸¹

²⁷⁹ *ibid*, 308

²⁸⁰ Ward, Madeleine. *The Intellectual Context for the Development of Quakerism, 1647-1700*, The University of Oxford, 2017.

²⁸¹ *ibid*, 43

Madeleine Ward, in her 2018 article on Robert Barclay's Christology,²⁸² highlights the earliest Quaker belief that the Light within *was* Christ. Ward contends that Barclay's Christological concerns were largely in continuation with the rest of the early Quaker movement.²⁸³ Ward acknowledges Barclay's convincement to the Quaker movement in 1666-67 and his first published work in 1670, around 21 years of age (b. 1648, December 23). During this second decade, Friends had already established the immanent return of Christ within, but were being questioned concerning the intellectual knowing of Jesus Christ's physical crucifixion and atoning bodily resurrection from death as integral to salvation. Quakers affirmed that the intellectual reciting of Christ's humanity was not integral to empirically knowing, in reality, Christ's crucifixion which atoned for human sin. Detractors were questioning whether Quakers were including the body of Jesus in the full humanity of 'Christ'. She uses quotes from George Whitehead who denied that 'Christ consists of human "Flesh and Bone"' and questions the "hypostatic union", the union of all humanity and divinity in the single person of Christ' as outlined at Chalcedon in 431²⁸⁴ Ward contrasts Whitehead's words with William Penn's words, 'Christians do not say that the Light in every Man is Christ, but of Christ...Such an Absurdy never fell from us, nor our Doctrine'.²⁸⁵

Ward claims that Barclay never distinguished exactly how the distinction between the Light and Christ might be conceived. Barclay clearly understood Christ to be the historical figure that commanded his disciples but also argued forcefully for the presence of Christ within all individuals as the particular agent of conversion. This for Barclay was Christ himself.²⁸⁶ Christ was the risen and literal heavenly bread to be experienced in communion. Barclay distinguished between the

²⁸² Ward, Madeleine (2018) 'Robert Barclay's Christology'. *Quaker Religious Thought*: Vol. 131 , Article 3. Available at: <https://digitalcommons.georgefox.edu/qrt/vol131/iss1/3>

²⁸³ *ibid*, 25

²⁸⁴ *ibid*, 25-6

²⁸⁵ *ibid*, 26

²⁸⁶ *ibid*.

inward resurrected and ascended Christ, and the outward bodily Christ crucified in Jerusalem.²⁸⁷

Christ was both the 'Light' from God above, and the 'Light' as 'Jesus Christ' spoken of in Scripture.²⁸⁸

Ward argues for a more sophisticated understanding of Christ in Barclay than that of the apostle Paul on the spiritual resurrection of the body and the heavenly man in I Corinthians 15 (45-49). She combines in Barclay a reduced Cartesian 'rational' metaphysic, a Jewish Kabbalistic notion of a Primordial Man as 'middle substance' between the ineffable Godhead and the created world, and that reality was divided into three categories: the immutable God, mutable creatures, and Christ as mediator between the two concluding that every 'body' may be turned into a 'spirit'.²⁸⁹

Ward maintains that for Barclay, the inward supernatural senses of humanity were not a sanitized version of the Light within. They were part of the human individual, able to receive the stirrings of the *vehiculum Dei*. It was a consolidation of the distinction between spiritual and carnal. This was an investing of humanity with its own spiritual resources as a 'faculty' that could receive grace.²⁹⁰

Ward concludes that Barclay's emphasis on the inward supernatural ability to receive the supernatural, that it was the Supernatural Father, Son, and Holy Spirit who was being received as *vehiculum Dei* with the resurrected Jesus Christ at the heart.²⁹¹ In saying that Barclay got it wrong, or missed the point, Ward affirms that Barclay was 'wildly popular' with the Oxford divines of 1692, and with George Fox in his letter of 1675. She claims that Barclay's main event was the function [absence] of Christ's body at the heart of the *Vehiculum dei*, and the esoteric notion of the 'middle substance' which reflected Barclay's desire to engage constructively with those outside the Quaker movement. Barclay did not abandon the immanent Christ in the individual but aimed to

²⁸⁷ *ibid*, 27

²⁸⁸ *ibid*.

²⁸⁹ *ibid*, 28-9

²⁹⁰ *ibid*, 30

²⁹¹ *ibid*, 30-31

preserve its tenability in uniformity with Paul's reflection in Colossians 1:27 'the riches of the glory of the mystery, God would make known among (and in) the Gentiles: "Christ within, the hope of glory"',²⁹²

Michael Birkel, in his 2018 chapter entitled Robert Barclay and John Cassian,²⁹³ develops his argument that Barclay, educated at the 'Jesuit' Scots College of Paris, was influenced by John Cassian's writings, and claims that Barclay's identification with Cassian comes from how they both talk about the Bible contributing to interior prayer.²⁹⁴ Birkel emphasizes that Barclay sees the Saints in the Scriptures as a looking-glass into the experience of would-be modern day Saints. It is the experience which Birkel emphasizes.²⁹⁵ Drawing from George Fox, Birkel maintains that fulfillment in experience is for the instant, and not the apex of all time. Christians participate in the larger drama described in the words of Scripture rather than the Scripture finding its purpose only in Christians.²⁹⁶ While Birkel acknowledges that Barclay never sources Cassian, he argues that both use the Bible as a mirror for the soul.²⁹⁷ Birkel continues with the emphasis of utter silence in the heart while at the same time rejecting anthropomorphic notions of God. Prayer is without form and transcends into the love with which God loved Jesus.²⁹⁸ Birkel emphasizes that Barclay and Cassian both affirm a pure and spiritual worship which is acceptable to God, and guided by the Spirit as opposed to formal and empty formalities. Birkel concludes that both arrived at imagelessness and complete receptivity to a presence beyond imagination.²⁹⁹ This prayer is apophatic in nature, coming from inward watchfulness and retiredness of mind in which the worshiper watches and waits, while

²⁹² *ibid*, 31

²⁹³ Birkel, Michael. *Quakers Reading Mystics*. Brill Publishing, Leiden, Netherlands, Issue 1.2, 2018.

²⁹⁴ *ibid*, 9

²⁹⁵ *ibid*, 10

²⁹⁶ *ibid*, 11

²⁹⁷ *ibid*, 12

²⁹⁸ *ibid*, 14

²⁹⁹ *ibid*, 16

being gathered from all visibles.³⁰⁰ Birkel affirms the affective experience of Cassian who he identifies with Evagrius of Pontus, and Barclay who acknowledges the source of the name ‘Quaker’ being placed upon them because of their affectivity.³⁰¹

Birkel concludes by drawing a comparison with the shutting out of the demonic, through imageless inward prayer. This he draws from Cassian’s emphasis on the psychology of the soul, in which the mind as the upper part of the soul includes fantasy, which works at the level of images; the discursive faculty, which works at the level of reasoning; and finally the highest intellect, or the *nous*, which was capable of direct apprehension of divine reality by immediate experience. He surmises that Barclay would have appreciated the notion of the *nous* as a human capacity to receive immediate Revelation by the Spirit. Demons had no access to the *nous*, but only worked through images and tempting thoughts. The soul which practices apophatic prayer was saved from diabolical attack.³⁰²

Birkel in his 2019 chapter on Robert Barclay and the Jewish concept of Kabbalah³⁰³ writes that one reads texts with assumptions bearing witness to the background harmonies. He concludes his introduction with the question of what happens when the music changes?³⁰⁴ Birkel emphasizes the relationship of Barclay and George Keith and its effect on Barclay’s *Apology for the True Christian Divinity* which affected Quaker theology for over 200 years. Keith was remembered as an apostate during that same 200 years while Barclay was revered. Birkel proposes that Barclay would have

³⁰⁰ *ibid*, 17-18

³⁰¹ *ibid*, 19-20

³⁰² *ibid*, 20-1

³⁰³ Kershner, Jon, editor. *Quakers and Mysticism: Comparative and Syncretic Approaches to Spirituality*. Michael Birkel: Robert Barclay and Kabbalah. Palgrave Macmillan, 2019, 85.

³⁰⁴ *ibid*, 85

been exposed to Keith's concepts of Jewish mysticism in his early writings and invites readers of Barclay to consider Kabbalistic thought in Robert Barclay.³⁰⁵

Birkel goes on to emphasize a passage in Barclay's *Apology* combined as Propositions V and VI, 'Concerning the Universal Redemption by Christ, and also the Saving and Spiritual Light, wherewith every Man is enlightened'. Barclay combines Seed, Grace, Word of God, and Light with the concept of *vehiculum dei* in Jesus's bread of life discourse in John chapter 6. Birkel concludes as well such proof texts from the apostle Paul as Galatians 4:19, Colossians 1:27, Ephesians 4:24 and Colossians 3:10 referring to putting on the 'new man'.³⁰⁶ These are linked with the Quaker doctrine of perfection, Protestant, and even orthodox. He acknowledges Barclay's apologetical defense against the harmonic accompaniment of Protestant Scholasticism while acknowledging the nonbiblical sounding phrase 'vehicle of God'.³⁰⁷

Birkel opens up George Keith and Kabbalah with Keith's time at Ragley Manor where he met Anne Conway, Henry More and other Cambridge Platonists. Here Birkel exposes Keith's writing on the Kabbalistic concept of recycling human souls drawn from Hermetic and Neoplatonic texts. The Kabbalist texts resonate with Jakob Boehme, a pietist, and a distinguished religious mystical writer. From reading the Kabbalist texts Keith saw the primordial Adam of the Kabbalists as Jesus Christ, whom the apostle Paul referred to as Adam: 'The first man Adam was made a living soul; the last Adam was made a quickening spirit'. (I Corinthians 15:45)³⁰⁸

Birkel explains Kabbalah as emanations of divinity in Jewish history culminating with the divine Presence symbolizing the figure Moses during the Israelite period of exile. The human quest being sent through the emanations was reintegrating scattered dimensions of the Godhead, restoring God,

³⁰⁵ *ibid*, 85

³⁰⁶ *ibid*, 86

³⁰⁷ *ibid*, 87

³⁰⁸ *ibid*.

the world, the Jewish community, and the individual soul.³⁰⁹ The word Adam, in Hebrew, meant not only the first human, but also the primordial Adam, who dwelt in the heavenly sphere, also called ‘the Heavenly Man’ or *Adam Kadmon*, the primordial human who displays the original light of *Ein Sof* or the divine.³¹⁰ *Adam Kadmon* is light without vessel, is understood by some as the soul of the Messiah and/or the Ancient of Days, and resides in the highest of the four worlds, the world of emanation and divinity.³¹¹ This belief provided the Jewish rationale for restoring the world to its idyllic state before the garden of Eden Fall.³¹² George Keith quotes Kabbalist thought in his treatise *The Way Cast Up*, in affirming that Christ ‘is extended to us by way of emanation’. This is viewed by Birkel as an addition to the Friends view on the prologue to the gospel of John.³¹³

Birkel affirms that after Barclay’s death, and Keith’s apostasy that Keith claimed that Robert Barclay had obtained both the ‘term’ and ‘notion’ of *vehiculum Dei* from Keith in Barclay’s reciting of Canticles 3:9-10.³¹⁴ Barclay’s words concerning the light that extends to all people, ‘*vehiculum Dei*’, the spiritual flesh of Christ that feeds the believers, and the ‘new man’ which Birkel identifies with the Kabbalist ‘heavenly man’ suggests to Birkel that Barclay not be seen simply as a Jesuit-trained ex-Calvinist Quaker.³¹⁵

Research Originality

³⁰⁹ *ibid*, 88

³¹⁰ *ibid*.

³¹¹ *ibid*, 89

³¹² *ibid*.

³¹³ *ibid*, 90

³¹⁴ *ibid*, 92

³¹⁵ *ibid*, 93

While many consider Robert Barclay's 'true Christian divinity' to be the end of the Protestant reformation of Roman Catholic Christianity,³¹⁶ no theologian has considered that what Barclay

³¹⁶ Mariah Webb, *The Penns and Peningtons of the Seventeenth Century, in their Domestic and Religious Life*, Philadelphia: Henry Longstreth, 1881, 70-72. Mary Penington recounts first hearing of the Quakers, the 'Friends of Truth', 'who spoke of the light and grace of God that had appeared to all men', who in hearing George Fox was struck by his principles and the scriptures he shared which exposed the vanity of many of her practices, and who demonstrated the power and authority of the Lord in their visit; Neave Braysshaw, *The Quakers: Their Story and Message*, NY: The Macmillan Company, 1927, 116, 125. Under the Restoration of Charles II to the throne of England (1660) the Anglican Church demanded the suppression of Dissent by passing the Quaker Act of 1662, with a follow up Act for all Dissenters in 1664. No denomination so amazed and perplexed the authorities by their obstinacy as the Quakers. It was their boast that their worship, from its very nature could not be stopped 'by men or devils'. The Quakers were beyond the Lutherans, Episcopalians, Presbyterians, Independents, Baptists and Socinians in their resolve and practice; Elizabeth Emmott, *The Story of Quakerism*, London: Headley Brothers, 1916, 23. George Fox is recounted as saying 'God dwells not in temples made with hands', and 'that all their preaching, baptism and sacrifices would never sanctify...', and bid them look unto Christ in them and not unto men; for it is Christ that sanctifies'. In their dispute Fox says 'I told them they were not to dispute of God and Christ, but to obey Him'. At the close of the Puritan service was given a chance to speak. Emmott notes that it was not the actual fact of speaking in church that got the Quakers imprisoned, but what they said; Rufus Jones, *Spiritual Reformers in the 16th and 17th Centuries*, MS: Peter Smith, 1914. Jones follows the 'Protestant Reformation' into a new type of spiritual religion that mutated throughout the whole of the entire reformation era, which this author argues begins with Martin Luther in 1517 and concludes with to the implementation of the Toleration Act of 1689, resulting in the Mystical, Humanist/Rational, or Faith incorporation of the whole life (xiv-xv). Jones exploits the negative [apophatic] and concrete [kataphatic] ways of knowing through the lens of Meister Eckhart and Dionysius the Areopagite (xxv-xxix). Jones considers one of the greatest tragedies in Christian history to be the division of forces that occurred in the sixteenth century beginning in 1517-1523 (p. 1). Jones opens with Martin Luther's response to Saint Augustine, Saint Bernard and Jean Gerson, notably, of the West (p. 6), moves on to Hans Denck the Anabaptist (p. 17), the prophets Johann Bunderlin and Christian Entfelder of the Inward Word also called 'Enthusiasts', or 'Spirituals' with whom Jones joins the Quakers (p. 31). Next is Sebastian Franck, a German Reformer (p.46), Caspar Schwenckfeld of Silesia - Germany/Poland (p. 64), Sebastian Castellio of France, a student of John Calvin (p. 89), Dirck Coornhert of Holland (p. 105) who positively influenced Jacobus Arminius, and paved the way for the Collegiants Rene Descartes, Baruch Spinoza, and Valentine Weigel of Germany (p. 139), Jacob Boehme of Poland (p. 151) whom Jones argues significantly influenced George Fox's thinking, John Everard (p. 239) and Giles Randall (p. 253) of England, Francis Rous of England a student of the Church Fathers with Western sympathies (p. 267), Henry Vane a supporter of Cromwell's Commonwealth (p. 271), and Peter Sterry connected to the Cambridge Platonists (p. 280), Benjamin Whichcote an off shoot of the Cambridge Platonists called the Latitude Men with Puritan sensibilities, John Smith mentioned by Robert Barclay, the Cambridge Platonist (p. 305), and lastly, Thomas Traherne of England aligned with the Ranters (p. 323). Jones concludes that each of these prophets of old challenged the theological systems of the Reformers who aligned with form and letter, and replaced it with an interior depth of experience to include scholarship. Challenging the formulated doctrines of the Reformation, *the type of church being substituted for the Roman Catholic Church* [emphasis mine], these spiritual reformers pressed on for a new type of Church altogether (p. 336-7). In his conclusion, Jones includes the core definition of what this author contends is theosis from Barclay's first work entitled '*Truth Cleared of Calumnies*', Volume I, 1670, 164-5 (p.344-6). Germaine to my PhD argument is Jones' identity with religious figures from the West, and from the western perspective. The Orthodox East claims immunity from the Reformation, it being a product of the Roman West.; T. Edmund Harvey, *The Rise of the Quakers*, London: Geo. S. Hirst, 1905. The Friends Historical Society of London gathered in volume form what *The First Publishers of Truth* had gathered from 1676-1720, records of the introduction of Quakers from England and Wales (Preface to the Sixth Impression, 1921). What early Friends preached was 'Primitive Christianity Revived'. The professional ministry of their day appeared unreal. There had been great apostasy from the ideals and methods of the early Church because there had been apostasy from the Spirit of Christ. These apostasies resembled the apostasies down through the ages to include Montanism, Cartharism, and Waldensians, to also include, in recent years, Wyclif and Luther. Quakers did not take their faith from others but were led by the Spirit of God. The organized Church had rebuked those living the Christian faith, like they did the Quakers, as misguided fanatics, and even 'heretics', to later recognize them as saints. (p. 54-55); Edward Grubb M. A., *What is Quakerism?* London: Headley Brothers, preface 1917. William Penn gave to one of his books on the Quaker movement (published 1696) the title 'Primitive Christianity Revived' and this title expresses what this movement really was. They had no thought of setting up a new sect from the various Christian bodies of their

day: Episcopalians (Roman and Anglican), Presbyterians, Independents, Baptists. Quakers wanted to bring back the whole Christian Church from error to truth: from the 'long night of apostasy' into the new day which had dawned afresh in their souls (p. 15-16). The organization of the 'Catholic' Church from the second to the sixth centuries obscured the bright ideal from which the first Christians started. The intense religious experience of the first Apostles and converts was not maintained as the generations went by, with the spring of personal inspiration drying up (p. 20). The second danger confronting the Church was 'heresy'. The Greek mind, even when it embraced Christianity, did not lose its fondness for unbridled intellectual speculation. In Asia Minor, Christians capable of philosophic thought attempted to solve the mystery of Christ's nature starting with Paul's thought of Christ as a Divine and heavenly being who only *in appearance* became man [emphasis Grubb]. This heresy became known as 'Gnosticism', a system of ideas rather than a life to be lived; the remedy of 'heresy' being vigorous Christian life which will accept ideas that nourish it and reject ideas that don't (p. 21). In an attempt to rectify the Church, the bishops spent their energy on the heretics, building up a system of ideas changing Christianity from a religion into a theology; substituting expanding life in the Spirit for rigid walls of dogma (p. 22). The Reformation of Catholicism by Luther and others was to recover direct and personal relations with God, through Jesus Christ, and to shake off ecclesiastical authority with their corruptions. What was instead set up was another movement, 'the Reformation', which would fall under the term 'Anabaptism' (p. 24). Faced with the double conflict of Rome, and now Anabaptism the later successors of Luther's reformation were confronted with the authority of the infallible Bible. Gradually Protestantism left its true foundation in personal Christian experience and became a religion of a Book, just as Catholicism remained the religion of a Church (p. 24-25). This moved the Reformers to the position of Protestant scholasticism, diverting from the original intent of 'Primitive Christianity Revived' which was the foundation of Quakerism. Grubbs' progression effectively details the progress of the West into Puritanism from which Fox and Barclay departed, and which this PhD argues, they unknowingly find their new center in Eastern Orthodox Theosis: 'Humanity becomes by "Grace indwelling" what God is by nature'. This they would claim to be the conclusion of the Protestant reformation of the Roman Catholic Church, 'true Christian divinity', or 'the best way to become a Christian'. Quakerism was the recovery of the root and spring of primitive Christianity with the voice of the new covenant Spirit uniformly held in check with the new covenant light of the risen and ascended Jesus Christ, and vice versa, for both the errant Romanist and the errant Ranter. (p. 28-29); Rosemary Moore, *The Light in Their Consciences: The Early Quakers in Britain 1646-1666*, The Pennsylvania State University, 2000. In her preface Rosemary writes, 'Early Quakers have been variously described, at different times and by different scholars, as founders of a fundamentally new form of spiritual religion, as discoverers of original Christianity, as the radical end of the Protestant Reformation primarily related to spiritual movements on the continent of Europe during the previous century, as the radical end of the Protestant Reformation related to English Puritanism, and as political revolutionaries. Any or all of these theories can be documented from the enormous quantity of source material, which, in the period covered by this book, 1646-1666, includes some fifteen hundred mostly ephemeral publications together with large quantities of manuscripts, comprising letters, reports, epistles, and memoranda.' On her title page, she uses a quote from George Fox, 1652, 'To the light in all your consciences I do speak; which cometh from the Lord Jesus Christ, who enlighteneth every man that cometh into the world'. While this dissertation demonstrates that Barclay's 'true Christian divinity' is antithetical to pharisaical and heretical ideas, original in Moore's statement would be reading Robert Barclay through the lens of Eastern Orthodox theosis which is a fundamentally different spirituality than that of Roman Catholic or Reformation Christianity. William Braithwaite, *The Beginnings of Quakerism*, Cambridge University Press, 1955. In the second edition, Rufus Jones' linking Quakerism to the mystical movements has been omitted on the ground that recent studies have, in the minds of a number of scholars, put his interpretive chapters in a different light. Besides Braithwaite, and Henry J. Cadbury, the second edition editor, Geoffrey F. Nuttall contributed significant suggestions to the 1955 edition (vii). Braithwaite makes note of a scripture from II Corinthians 3:3 where the statement is 'clearly, you are an epistle of Christ' referring to the far reaching Christianity of the Quakers (p. 177); The opposition between the Puritan and the Quaker was irreconcilable. To the Puritan, the 'Children of the Light' [Quaker] seemed 'poor, deluded, fanatical, silly souls,' 'un-catechized ignorance set off with great confidence', 'unlearned and unstable...', the Quakers to be looked down upon, like the Athenians looked down upon Paul, or the Jewish Pharisee looked down upon the Gentile. Toward the Puritan, the Quakers laid exclusive stress on the Light within, despised the Puritan's human learning, saw no good in their hireling priests who spoke a divination of their own brain, using their knowledge of tongues [Hebrew, Greek, and Latin], and stealing words. There was no first person knowledge in the Puritans only theft. Instead, Fox claimed that Peter and John preached the Word, Christ Jesus, which was before Babel (p. 294); Friends carried the Inward Light of Christ over the whole earth, and regarded themselves as the Church of God gathered out of the world (p. 308); In 1658 William Caton writes that they spent time spreading the Quaker message among persons of all nations-Turks, Jews, Indians, Papists, and Protestants (p. 427). Notably absent is the Orthodox East; Like the early Christians described in the Epistle to Diognetus (sect. 5), 'they [Quakers] find themselves in the flesh, and yet they live not after the flesh. Their existence is on earth, but their citizen is in heaven. They obey the established laws, and they *surpass* the laws in their own lives' [emphasis mine] (p. 465). In response to the Restoration in 1661 Quaker John Audland writes

argued is misaligned with Protestant Christianity. This dissertation demonstrates through the Lonergan Method in Theology that Barclay's 'true Christian divinity' comports with Eastern Orthodox Christianity. Barclay's 'true Christian divinity' aligns with the salvation concept of theosis in which 'humanity becomes by "Grace indwelling" what God is by nature', that the path of deification is the path God originally intended in the Garden of Eden, that both the uniformity and the individuality in the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit provide the way to restored prelapsarian communion with God, that the Body of Christ functioning under God's headship becomes the Bodily presence of Christ in the world, that new covenant Christian Revelation is immediate and more than scripture text, that faith in God includes behavior more than belief, that Grace is synonymous with realized relationship with the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit, and that the Incarnate Word is eternally distinct from the many words of sacred scripture. It is Christ himself, and his words which are meat and drink to those under the yoke and burden of Christ (John 6:51-53).

Reception of Barclay's epistemology in the Quaker Tradition

In this section I will look at the history of Robert Barclay's epistemology (way of knowing) in the Quaker tradition and how and why it has waxed and waned. I will look at Edward Grubb, Neave Brayshaw, Rufus Jones, and Howard Brinton in particular with quotes from Herbert G Wood. These reflect a summary of the 18th through the early 21st century outlook on 17th century Robert Barclay and his contribution to the Quaker tradition.

'Force may make men conform outwardly... but makes them more hypocrites than before.... For it is God alone by His powerful word of life operating in the heart that changes.... Come forth then with spiritual weapons, mighty ones, in the power of the gospel of Jesus Christ... let us see... your love to enemies, your self-denial, your subjection to the cross of our Lord Jesus... this is the way to bring people to be of one mind in the Truth, this is God's way, this is the way the saints walked in, this is the way we love and desire' (p. 484). In the age of the first apostles, the only authority of the church was Christ, its one Head, and Christ's will, uttered through the apostle or prophet was absolute. The authority of the apostle was dependent entirely on their intercourse with Christ. This is the direct parallel between the first century apostles and the seventeenth century Quakers. (527-8);

EDWARD GRUBB VIEWS QUAKER CHRISTIANITY AS COMPRISING THE WHOLE OF LIFE

Edward Grubb looks to Rufus Jones concerning the nature of the Quaker movement who claims that it was moral effort which differentiated the Quakers from other sects during the Commonwealth Period (1649-1660). Quaker views were not novel or original having already been proclaimed. What Grubb considers new was the fusing of Christianity into lived truth in every facet. Quakers weaved mysticism and morality into an organic whole. It was a true experiment in religion, one full of lessons for their age and for all ages.³¹⁷

Grubb considered that the Ranters or libertarian position afforded no test by which the individual could distinguish between the voice of the Spirit and the voice of the will. Quakers, on the other hand, were “Children of the Light,” and insisted that there could be no guidance of the Spirit apart from walking in the light. The Quaker message was an antidote to Ranterism and provided stable experience to the libertines.³¹⁸ Grubb made clear that Faith in the Inward Light did not mean that everyone would do that which was right in their own eyes, and that there was no common standard. The Light was the Light of Jesus Christ, who was reproducing His own Spirit and life in His followers. Quoting Herbert G Wood, Grubb continues “Fox did not stand merely or chiefly for the

³¹⁷ Grubb, Edward. *What is Quakerism*, London: Headley Brothers, 1917, 15. The fusing of unmediated life with God (mysticism) and life is the heart of theosis in which ‘humanity becomes by Grace indwelling what God is by nature’. This is the path of deification in which ‘God became man so that man might become G[g]od’ Irenaeus of Lyon, Athanasius of Alexandria, etc. The Commonwealth Period following the beheading of King Charles I (1649) was led by Puritan sympathizers Oliver and Richard Cromwell (1653-1659).

³¹⁸ *ibid.* 29 The Light of Jesus Christ (Barclay’s *Apology*, Proposition 6) coincides with the Baptism of Jesus being by the Spirit (Proposition 12) to coincide with Partaking of the Body and Blood of Jesus Christ (Proposition 13). The Light of Christ and the Holy Spirit are uniform with the redemptive seed of the 2nd Adam (Proposition 5) taking root in fertile soil unto ongoing inward justification (Proposition 7). This results in the Perfection of the Father (Proposition 8) being manifest in those who Persevere (Proposition 9). The morality referred to by Grubb is the effects of salvation through theosis in Ministry (Proposition 10) and Worship (Proposition 11) which ushers in God’s Kingdom (Proposition 15) through respecting the conscience of all in a God-like manner (Proposition 14); the conscience of all being liberated from ‘Original Sin’ to ancestral sin (Proposition 4) through Christian Revelation (Proposition 2) is the foundation of New Covenant Knowledge (Proposition 1) as reveal in sacred scripture (Proposition 3).

general principle of the Inner Light; he bore witness to the Inner Light as expressed in clear moral judgments and in developing moral experience.”³¹⁹

Concerning the universality of the Light of Christ, Friends maintained that it was given “in measure” to all men. This was why they were persecuted by the “orthodox” Christians of their time who subscribed to eternal pre-determinism. Barclay sums up early Quaker teaching: Glory to God forever! Who has sent us forth to preach his everlasting gospel: Christ nigh to all, the light in all, the seed sown in the hearts of all, that men may come and apply their minds to it.³²⁰

In 1673 an epistle was sent out, signed by prominent Quaker leaders dealing with the need for wisdom in the exercise of church discipline. “That none join to such a singular spirit as would lead them to be sole judge in his own case, but in the restoring and healing spirit of Christ, both the offended and the offender may for truths sake submit to the power of God in His people... And if any will not give up his matter to the judgment in his people, he renders himself and his cause suspicious...”³²¹ Those in opposition to Gospel order were John Wilkinson, John Story, and William Rogers who opposed disciplinary action taken against Friends who walked disorderly. They spoke of Fox as a would-be Pope. While schism was averted for a time, Wilkinson and Story in 1676 recanting their errors, a succession took place and parts of the country were divided. The ablest refutation of disorder came in 1676 by Robert Barclay, under the title *The Anarchy of the Ranters* (1674) renamed *Robert Barclay’s Book of Government* (1676) which showed that the seed of Divine authority is not exclusive in the individual but is also in the church which has the power to declare what it is that the Body stands for, and what the pleadings of the individuals are and are not in

³¹⁹ ibid. 41 The Light of Christ, as Jesus Christ, produced morality by reproducing His Spirit and way of life in His followers. Barclay makes clear that His righteousness becomes our righteousness, His death and suffering our death and suffering, etc. Phil. 3:8-11

³²⁰ ibid. 41 Core to Quaker Christianity is *Christus Victor*, or Christ removing “Original Sin” for ancestral sin with the seed universal placed in all. Barclay’s Works III, *R. B.’s Apology Vindicated*, 1679, 328-350. SECTION V. *Wherein Brown’s Fifth and Sixth Chapters, entitled by him, of Man’s Natural State, and of Original Sin, are considered*. Barclay rejects the Augustinian/Westminster Confession “conclusion” on sin.

³²¹ ibid. 93-4 Following this 1673 epistle Barclay would in 1674 write his work on the Anarchy of the Ranters and the Hierarchy of the Romanists opposed and the Gospel order and the ancient apostolic order reestablished by the Quakers.

accordance with the principles which brought the Body together in unity.³²² Grubb concludes with a statement on the opinion of the colonies concerning Quakers in the New World. Evidence of the feeling of many against the Quakers comes through in the 1699 census that there are 832 Freeholders in West Jersey 266 being Quakers and the rest described as “Christians.”³²³ Robert Barclay was governor of East Jersey from 1682-1688 before his death in 1690. This coincides with this PhD argument that Quaker Christianity does not align with Protestant Christianity but maintains integrity with the Gospel and apostolic order of the first eight centuries.

NEAVE BRAYSHAW CLAIMS CHRISTIAN EXPERIENCE IS INCONGRUENT WITH BIBLICISM

Neave Brayshaw in his work *The Quakers, Their Story and Message* states that Friends protested against the Calvinistic doctrine of predestination, of predetermined hell for infants and those not of the elect, and reluctantly accepted the near universal belief in the total depravity of man, that each was in the sin of first Adam. Total depravity and pre-determinism was irreconcilable with the Light of Christ in all humanity. Barclay argued that the Quaker belief was that while man was depraved, God had given to all a “super added” Divine Seed not part of human nature and distinct from the soul. The Light of Christ in man was like a candle in a lantern, illuminating it for a time but leaving its essential nature unchanged. The Light of Christ was in man but not of man. These were the words Barclay used when explaining the experience of God come within.³²⁴

³²² *ibid.* 94-5 This is the ancient apostolic order in which the seven Ecumenical Councils gathered beginning with the council in Jerusalem (Acts 15) followed by the councils of 325, 381, 431, 451, 553, 680-1, and 787. This is the ancient apostolic order of the first eight centuries. Barclay claims that the church fell under the cloud of scholasticism in the 8th century until the 16th century reformers from which the Quakers emerged. Barclay distinguishes between the early and later reformers, and is opposed to the later reformers.

³²³ *ibid.* 143 Madeleine Ward's comment in her thesis that in 1700 an opposer to Quakers acknowledged that all the Quakers had become ‘Christian’. The census report in 1699 West Jersey and the 1700 England quote coincide with the argument that Quaker Christianity is incongruent with Protestant Christianity according to the general population in West Jersey and England.

³²⁴ Brayshaw, A. Neave, *The Quakers, Their Story and Message*, Macmillan Co., NY, 1927, 39-40. Christ indwelling the person is core to Christianity as revealed throughout Barclay's works. Christ's indwelling was a precursor to Christ's

Brayshaw looks to Rufus Jones in his introduction to William Braithwaite's *Second Period of Quakerism* in stating that man, with all his faults and failures, with all his blunders and sins, is a being who lives by ideas which come from beyond himself, who organizes all the facts of his experience into universal forms of thought which lie within him as deeper spiritual realities. He lives by values and visions that raise him out of being "mere man." This is not of matter, space, or time but is from the realm of Spirit and woven into the structure of his soul and makes him akin to God.³²⁵

Brayshaw continues that an essential difference between early Quakers and organized Christians of the 17th century lay in the fact that while Quakers did not regard correctness of belief as unimportant, they did set belief as secondary to experience. Quoting Edward Grubb, "The essence of Christianity is found in a saving experience of the life of God in the soul, transforming the character into the character of Jesus Christ." Intellectual definitions concerning the nature of His person and His saving work were relegated to second place. Salvation is the work of Christ wrought within man and not merely wrought for man from without.³²⁶ This was the difference between Quaker Christianity and Puritan Christianity. The inward Divine Principle found expression as that of God in every man. Fox again and again exhorted Friends to bear themselves so as to answer God's witness in every human soul. "*Be patterns, be examples in all countries, places, islands, nations wherever you come; that your carriage in life may preach among all sorts of people and to them; then they will come to walk cheerfully over the world, answering that of God in everyone.*" Again,

inhabitation, necessary to salvation. Christ's indwelling was universal. Christ's inhabitation was for the receptive who entered into union with God.

³²⁵ *ibid.* 40 It is this researchers opinion that Jones introduces the concepts of Neoplatonism as the Emanating One communicating to the Human Mind or Nous, which is joined with the World Soul. The goal is that the universal ideas from the Emanating One become one with all humanity. In philosophy there is a distinction between universals (ideas, forms) and reality.

³²⁶ *ibid.* 40-1 Salvation being worked in man through experience produces the theologian. God became man so that man might become G[g]od. Humanity becomes by Grace [God indwelling] what God is by nature. This is Eastern Christianity which embraces the language of apophaticism and kataphaticism beyond mere rationalism or scholasticism which Barclay opposed. Theosis is the path of becoming 'Christian'.

*“Having your house established a top all mountains and hills, that ye may answer that of God in every man.”*³²⁷

Brayshaw continues that the Quaker while disclaiming any power to write a book equal to the Bible insisted that understanding the Scriptures came only by the [S]pirit which the writers possessed. Barclay asserted that Friends did not have “a revelation of a new gospel and new doctrines,” but “a new revelation of the good old gospel and doctrines.” Like Barclay, Isaac Penington affirmed “the immediate Word of the Lord” spoken by any whom the Lord should choose, is with as much authority as those through whom the Scriptures were given.³²⁸ Fox maintained integrity with the God of the Scriptures under the Christian covenant as those under the Jewish covenant. When asked to justify the position of women in the Church, Fox went through the Bible and after exploiting all texts, stated ‘And if there was no Scripture for our men and women’s meetings, Christ is sufficient’.³²⁹ Instead of Protestants seeing the Bible as an outward ‘rule’ to the *rule* of Jesus Christ and the Spirit within, the Bible was used as a mathematical table, and its teachings had authority merely from its being a book. In this sense the Puritans were not theologians but legalists. John Owen in accord with the Westminster Confession insisted on the need for the illumination of the Holy Spirit to understand Scripture. Penn claims while this inclines toward the inward Light it was not understood this way by the Westminster divines. Barclay considers that the Westminster divines

³²⁷ Ibid. 41 This is none other than new covenant Christianity as prophesied by Jeremiah (31:33) and realized in the writing to the Hebrews, to the Jew (8:7-13) and to the Gentile (10:14-18). *"None of them shall teach his neighbor, and none his brother, saying, 'Know the LORD,' for all shall know Me, from the least of them to the greatest of them."* Jeremiah 31:34, Hebrews 8:11

³²⁸ Ibid. 42-3 Christianity centers on Jesus Christ who is present where two are gathered. Jesus claimed that his disciples would do even greater things than He had done, by the Spirit living within..., and because He goes to the Father. John 14:11-13

³²⁹ Ibid. 43 The Scriptures were a source given through Moses and the Prophets, and are now given through the Church for guidance in Faith. Jesus Christ is Head of his Body the Church, and the Holy Spirit is sent of the Father as Guide within. This is Christianity.

could not get to the person of the Spirit in their doctrine but guarded against the Spirit because of fear of where it would lead. They returned control to the intellect.³³⁰

Brayshaw affirms that the Quakers held that the Scriptures were to be received as a testimony of what the Saints knew in their experience and one could not appropriate their words until they came into a measure of the same experience. Experience gave the assurance of truth. Fox's experience, apart from the Scriptures of his youth, opened the way to the meaning in the Scriptures. He states after knowing experimentally, that the truth was there all the time. By searching experimentally Fox broke through into living by the Spirit from which the Scriptures came.³³¹ Barclay asserts that Divine revelations necessary to building up faith remain always uniform with the Scripture narrative. Scripture can be an outward judge of controversies among Christians. Barclay says like Fox that Friends are willing to have all doctrines and practices tried by Scripture. Actions contrary to the narrative of Scripture are a delusion of the devil. It is the Spirit which led Fox to the meaning he experienced, and it is the Spirit who leads beyond the Scriptures as a shadow rule.³³² The Quakers were not Puritan or subscribers of the Westminster Confession but encountered Jesus Christ through experience.

Brayshaw continues that more important than academic formulations was the lived experience of Christianity. Barclay articulates that the great work of the Scriptures is their fulfillment in us by

³³⁰ *ibid.* 43-4 Bible legalism and Christianity by formula was the mainstay of Puritan Christianity and paved the way for the doctrine of cessationism in which the Holy Spirit is no longer active except in the reading of Scripture. This author argues that this returns the way of Christianity to the way of Judaism. Protestant Christianity has endlessly split over its use of the Bible as sole authority. 'Enthusiasm' became the derogatory term used against those led by the Spirit. Ronald Know speaks of this in his work '*Enthusiasm*'

³³¹ *ibid.* 45 By Brayshaw's definition, Fox would have become a saint experientially by moving beyond the Puritan and Westminster approach to Scripture. Scripture as final authority places an obstacle to knowing God experimentally, being the path of the Saint.

³³² A helpful view of the role of Scripture is *Lectio Divina*. *Lectio* is reading the narrative of Scripture. *Oratio* is praying the narrative of Scripture. *Meditatio* is exegesis of Scripture within its context brought about through reading and prayer. *Contemplatio* is hearing the voice of the Spirit concerning meaning arrived at through reading, prayer, and exegesis. *Actio* is walking by the Spirit in application of the Spirit's revelation. Walking by the Spirit involves change understood through the lens of repentance producing prelapsarian and Christian righteousness. The Scriptures are a shadow pointing to the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit, and life in Christ. The scriptures are an aid in theosis as given by the Church under the leadership of the Holy Spirit by Athanasius in 367 A.D.

discerning the Spirit. The Spirit's ways come by acquaintance with the Spirit in the heart.³³³ Early Quakers found relief in the Quaker meeting from artificial sermons with quotations and tags of learning which seemed like conned and gathered stuff. Worship consisted in the children of God sharing from Christ inhabiting them, more than from "words" or "silence." This was the experience of Barclay when he discovered Quakerism as the best way *to become a Christian* having already experienced Puritan (1648-1659) and Roman Catholic Christianity (1659-1663), and having searched amongst the Protestant sects available (1663-1667). [emphasis mine]³³⁴

Brayshaw points out that Barclay considered those who participated in bodily violence through war as being like the Jews participating in ceremonies, the spirit not yet raised in them to be delivered from rudiments. It was Christ working within that brought alignment of [S]pirit that it became no longer necessary to use military weapons when one recognized defense from the Lord.³³⁵ William Sewell, a Dutch historian records that the Nonconformists, afraid to meet openly, would pray in their night meetings to keep the Quakers steadfast. Barclay, addressing King Charles II in 1675, claimed that the Quakers stood by their testimony for God without hiding. They kept to meeting in public, testifying of God and His truth which did not necessitate governmental spies.³³⁶ When meeting houses were destroyed, Friends cleared the rubble and met where the house once stood. No

³³³ ibid. 48 Barclay would coincide with Jeremiah (15:16), Ezekiel (2:8-3:3) and John the theologian (Revelation 10:8-10) who all were instructed to eat the scroll or the book. By absorbing or digesting the narrative of Scripture one walks with the God of the Scriptures. This is altogether different from Bible legalism.

³³⁴ ibid. 83-85. Barclay experienced the power of Christians who communed with the body and blood of Jesus Christ in life and worship. These were those who had experienced the baptism of Jesus being by the Holy Spirit and with fire. God's power, the power of the resurrected Lord was raised in him.

³³⁵ ibid. 107 Barclay aligns with the apostle Paul in saying that though we walk according to the flesh we do not war according to the flesh but are mighty in God in pulling down all strongholds which exalt itself against the knowledge of God, bringing every thought into captivity to the obedience of Christ. (II Corinthians 10:1-6)

³³⁶ ibid. 119 Quakers had moved to place of not swearing by heaven, earth, or anything else but their yes was yes, and there no no. Matthew 5:33-37 They lived according to the unshakable kingdom which was to remain after being shaken. Hebrews 12:25-29

Christians so perplexed the authorities by their obstinacy than the Quakers. Their worship would not be stopped by men or Devils.³³⁷

Brayshaw recounts that in 1666-7 Robert Barclay at the age of 18, possessing academic learning and knowing a deep spiritual life began to exercise on the Church a profound and lasting influence.

Barclay brought scholarly defense to a people suffering governmental imprisonment for their faith.³³⁸ Herbert G Wood states that the Light led first Friends out from the world into testimonies which were the expression of the experience they enjoyed, and from the first years fellowship meant a common witness to a common body of truth. The society witnessed to the principles and practices for which it stood, calling for loyalty from its members. Wood notes that an outsider observed a weakness in Friends. The doctrine of the Inner Light sometimes issued an amiably and hospitable frame of mind which presumed 'a measure of truth' in a view sincerely held, and which was content to give equal place to its incompleteness. Friends were inclined to allow for theological haziness over novelties, and sometimes lacked intellectual thoroughness in favor of breadth of mind. In its stand as a united Body, which individuals may injure, in practice it found no strain between corporate authority and individual freedom amongst its fellowship.³³⁹ Theological haziness and the truth in measure is no stranger to the Church throughout history and to Quakers.

³³⁷ *ibid.* 124-5 Quakers lived by the power of God which took away the occasion for bodily violence through war (Revelation 12:11)

³³⁸ *ibid.* 139-40

³³⁹ *ibid.* 145 Brayshaw's quote is taken from Herbert G Wood, *George Fox*, page 114. Wood points out the complexity of life as a Christian community where individuals are given space to mature while also maintaining the integrity of the community. Barclay's written apologetic in 1670 began in response to a 1662 document written in criticism of Quakers in their freedom. Barclay's 1674 work '*The Anarchy of the Ranters, Hierarchy of the Romanists, and other Pretended Churches Refuted in defense of the Quakers restoring Gospel order according to the ancient apostolic order of the church of Christ*' was renamed *Robert Barclay's Book of Government* and adopted by the 2nd Day Meeting in 1676. It was a guide for Quakers to remain true to Gospel and ancient order. Barclay maintains both intellectual thoroughness and breadth of mind through his identifying Quakerism with Gospel order and the ancient church. The ancient church of the East centers Christianity on the living tradition-experience of the dead Fathers to include the place and flow of Scripture within tradition. The ancient church walked within the tradition of the Holy Spirit from its infancy and resolved differences born upon it through the centuries. Barclay claims that Quakers reestablished the ancient tradition derailed by scholasticism from the 8th-16th centuries. Scholasticism replaced the tradition of the Fathers with philosophy and reason. In the outsider's observation according to H G Wood, the ancient Church would have addressed the variant thought of the individual at some point through the ecumenical council of its leaders which the 2nd Day

Brayshaw considers Barclay's wealthy and aristocratic standing, his learned and deep spiritual life a mark for leadership. Of a long-lived powerful race Robert's father David Barclay was advisor to King Charles I and a military leader. His mother Katherine Gordon was a descendent of King James I. Had his death at 41 (October 3, 1690) been averted, his personal influence may have shaped the Society in the years following the Edict of Religious Tolerance administered by Protestant King William of Orange in 1689. The Toleration Act applied only to orthodox dissenters in a time when Quaker orthodoxy was being challenged.³⁴⁰ Margaret Fell Fox in her old age saw the danger of narrowness and strictness entering the Society. Minutes relating to Margaret Fox, all written in the decade following Barclay's death in 1693, 1698 and 1700 are telling. We are coming into Judaism which Christ cried against. We must not look at colors... this is a silly, poor gospel. It is dangerous to lead Friends into the observation of outward things as not to make them Christians. It is the Spirit that gives life.³⁴¹

In 1816, some 125 years after Barclay's death, Joseph John Gurney emphasized the need to place Scripture in students' hands that were sheltered from evil but not instructed in good. Gurney's belief was that Scripture in student hands, and stored in memory, would draw to the root of experience and satisfy them with Christian truth. This opened the way to later years when devotional use of the Bible became prominent. In response, Friends became alarmed that human learning would replace

Meeting did with Quaker William Rogers. Barclay's Works I, *Vindication & Postscript: Anarchy of the Ranters*, 1679, 556-580.

³⁴⁰ *ibid.* 149-50 Barclay recounts being an advisor to King James II (1685-1688) who was returning to Catholicism. James converted to Roman Catholicism in 1688. James II would discuss the coming threat of his brother-in-law William of Orange and sister Mary who would assume the throne. The edict of Religious Tolerance was written in 1688 and enacted by William of Orange in 1689. Barclay's 'True Christian Divinity' found space for King James II to convert to Roman Catholicism. This is indication of Barclay's breadth of maturity. This writer only wonders what Barclay would've done if he realized his Christian compatibility with the Orthodox East. Theosis being humanity becoming by Grace indwelling what God is by nature was the ethos of Barclay's conversion and his argument. His argument was centered on Gospel order and the apostolic order of the early church which remains in the East.

³⁴¹ *ibid.* 152-3 Outward rules at the expense of the transformed life were what Fox and Barclay rejected in Puritan Christianity. Transfiguration into the light of Christ is the life of the East. Realizing such Fathers as Irenaeus of Lyons (130-202), Athanasius of Alexandria (296-373), and Basil of Caesarea (330-379) would have aided the Quaker movement in their 'true Christian divinity'. Robert Barclay would not have been an advocate of what transpired, and would have reassessed the trajectory thoughtfully.

Divine leading. In 1858 Ackworth Meeting was concerned that obscure and difficult passages would become a slight to the Holy Spirit who would reveal to the reader the meaning as He saw fit. Scripture was affirmed for edification but not for critical study. Coming together for Scripture study was unknown to the Quaker fathers and was seen as meddling in Divine things.³⁴² Brayshaw continues that the concept of the work of the Spirit when limited to inward guidance affected the training of children. Guidance was reserved for God alone since human effort interfered with God. Mary Howitt, 1799, says that her parents did not allow their children to receive religious instruction from anyone. They did not teach the Lord's Prayer but required them to learn Barclay's Catechism and Confession, being a compilation of Scripture meant to refute the Puritan-Westminster divines who claimed the Quakers were not "scriptural." Here we find the futility of using scripture against scripture resulting in ego against ego amongst the ego-centric.³⁴³

Brayshaw says that evangelicalism was the most living religious influence in England. Many Friends breaking away from Quakerism embraced the "evangelical" view of the work of Jesus Christ and the written word of Scripture as itself the final authority.³⁴⁴ Isaac Crewdson regarded the Scriptures as the only authority on religion, counting the Inward Light a delusive "notion" and denying its universality. Crewdson and 300 others left the Society (c. 1835) maintaining a separate existence as "Evangelical Friends". While the Bevan Brayshaw (1818-1906) contemplated leaving the Society, he reaffirmed Christian Quakerism by stating "I could not sacrifice the doctrine of the

³⁴² *ibid.* 193-5 Friends lost the congruency between the place of the shadow Scriptures and the new covenant revelation of God. The same exists in the difference between Evangelical Friends who place Scripture first in their belief structure, and Christian Quakers who place "God, Jesus, and the Spirit" first. This is complemented by those who have embraced Sabellianism or modalism, Neoplatonism, or non-theism. Buddhism, the Baha'i movement, Reincarnation, and Paganism have all entered the scene as well. Sources multiple. What this author argues is that Quakerism has become a form of affirming our common anthropology, which has its center in Christianity.

³⁴³ *ibid.* 196 Legalism to a select group of Scriptures can be as deadly as legalism to a select group of religious laws. In both cases God remains peripheral and the result unbalanced. What is necessary is full immersion in/into the Father, Son, and Holy Spirit understood through the lens of Tradition which includes the Fathers and the sacred Scriptures old and new. The living tradition of the dead Fathers remains ever the path of the Saint, the Spirit residing in the heart.

³⁴⁴ *ibid.* 198 The 'Great Awakening' Protestant preaching of the 18th century has slowly lost its effect in contemporary Europe.

immediate and perceptible guidance of the Spirit as I think they have done practically.”³⁴⁵ The Yearly Meeting Epistle of 1835 emphasized the teaching of Friends from the beginning: Friends called away their fellow-men from dependence on outward forms to invite attention to the witness of God in their bosoms and to set forth the immediate and perceptible operations of the Holy Spirit. It was given to testify that divine influence was to be experienced in connection with the outward means of religious instruction, and in the striving of the Spirit with a dark and unregenerate world; and in keeping with the visitations to the mind of man independent of external circumstances. In times following Joseph John Gurney, London Yearly Meeting put forth the evangelical view of the total depravity of man, the work of Jesus Christ for man’s salvation, and the Scriptures as final authority. The Christian Disciplines of 1861 and 1883 composed quotations from this time.³⁴⁶

As a result Brayshaw surmises that the Society turned its back on spiritual intercourse with one another through which God had made Himself known amongst Quakers. No longer was there a group of persons who lived their religion, who shared their gains with the group to which they belonged. Independence from vocal ministry was regarded as high spiritual attainment. The Divine Spirit working through passive instruments had no need for human words. The quietest attitude towards human words and Divine words considered the Divine and human as separate, having nothing in common. The human intellect only differed from animals. Isaac Penington had regarded the intellect as a hindrance to Divine working. Brayshaw claims that Barclay held that the glory of God left no room for man to work. Barclay’s conception of the divine Light or Seed inserted in the

³⁴⁵ *ibid.* 200-1 Crewdson represents the move back to square one of Puritanism. Rigid adherence to the Bible results in mathematical Christianity centered in the brain. It is a distortion of the full nature of human creation. At best it mimics again the Jewish framework with the Mosaic Law, the Prophets, and the Psalms (Luke 24:44) as final authority. This correlates with Jesus’s statement to the Jews concerning their allegiance to the Scriptures in rejection of him (John 5:39-40). “*You search the Scriptures for in them you think you have eternal life, but you fail to come to Me.*” Instead, it is the Bereans Jews who were open to Christ Jesus (Acts 17:10-15) who “searched the Scriptures daily” and become one with Jesus Christ of which the Scriptures point (II Corinthians 13:5).

³⁴⁶ 201-2 Robert Barclay rejects the doctrine of “Original Sin” for Ancestral Sin. The difference is near night and day as the prior is profoundly negative while the later leads to Theosis. Penal substitutionary atonement through Christ as victim of the Father’s wrath is replaced with Christ as Victor through living the life God intended for humanity who destroyed death and the grave through resurrection. Christ is the G[g]race of Christianity and is resurrection and life by coming to live within the believer through F[f]aith.

human soul left man with no relation to the Gift as like that of a stone. In Divine operation Barclay found man incapable to do anything other than not resist.³⁴⁷

Weary of speaking which profited little, early Friends found holy silence as refreshing to the soul. Though there was not a word spoken, spiritual worship performed by the body edified. Meetings passed without one word spoken and yet souls were refreshed. Hearts were overcome with a sense of God's power and Spirit which was ministered to one another. The divine word came to the individual directly from the Holy Spirit and was mediated through fellowship.³⁴⁸ Barclay spoke of his experience in the "silent assemblies of God's people" as he experienced meetings held in silence. Though God principally leads by His Spirit yet He conveys His comfort through His children whom he raises and inspires. The Saints are instruments in the hand of the Lord to strengthen and encourage. Barclay had affirmed silence and commended ministry. On Barclay's outlook Herbert G Wood in his pamphlet *Friends and the Scriptures*, says "Inward guidance is given to reveal the *meaning of experience*, not to give worldly knowledge to that which comes through outward channels. We must not disassociate inward guidance from outward influences which form the material of the Spirit's ministry."³⁴⁹

³⁴⁷ Barclay's view of True Knowledge (John 17:3), Christian Revelation, Shadow Scripture old and new, and the condition of man in the Fall was restored through the redemptive seed of the second Adam and the universal light of Jesus Christ. God, being more than a giant sperm donor for the universe, opened the way for inward ongoing justification through the seed being received in fertile soil unto the perfection of the Father. The perfection of the Father is prior to purification in Barclay's economy of salvation, ministry is before worship which includes that of works flowing from faith; the baptism of Jesus being of the Holy Spirit and with fire is before communion with the body and blood of Jesus Christ, and liberty of conscience before Christ and his Kingdom, being that of the new covenant witness in man. The two-sided nature of Barclay's propositions five and six concerning the Redemptive Seed of the second Adam and the Universal light of Jesus Christ is the hinge between propositions 1-4 and 7-15 in application of Christianity. The one name Jesus, and the Lord in the heart was sadly reduced to passive quietism as a result of restoring mechanical Puritan Bible reason.

³⁴⁸ *ibid.* 210-11 Silence has been part of the monastic world since its beginning. Silence without preaching preceded Quakers.

³⁴⁹ *ibid.* 213 The Scriptures are a shadow by which apophatic and kataphatic knowledge are revealed. The Scriptures are not a substitute for God but point to God who is to be experienced in the fullness of Father, Son, and Holy Spirit. The experience of God happens through the essence and energy of God. The essence is unattainable while the energy is experienced. All this is revealed in the sacred Scriptures of which George Fox found that it pointed to his experience after he experienced Christ Jesus experimentally.

Brayshaw considers the depressing effect placed on the ministry of Quakers came from an unbalanced stress upon the “Inward Teacher,” resulting in, contrary to Robert Barclay, an untroubled acceptance of meetings held in silence. While there was encouragement to wait upon God, the spoken word was not needed, nor was counsel given to seek the ability to minister.³⁵⁰ Brayshaw concludes that the Friend going to meeting to meet with God at times was rewarded, but he met alone with little thought of others. Barclay in the 17th century met the challenge in a satisfactory way saying that as long as men were in the body “God sees meet to make use of the outward senses as a means to convey spiritual life as by speaking, praying, praising etc. which cannot be mutually edifying but as he hears and sees the other.” Barclay spoke of fellowship known through the attentiveness of Christ’s Body to their Lord. In the 18th and 19th centuries Barclay’s reasons for gathering no longer appealed. Ministry was impossible and communion of the soul with God lost. The only reason to meet was from Hebrews 10:24 “not forsaking the assembling of ourselves together as is the custom of some.” Quakerism was reduced to mere ritual.³⁵¹ For Barclay, meeting together for worship was secondary to life lived foremost with God. The best way *to become a Christian* was learning and submitting to God’s voice.

RUFUS JONES CLAIMS A SHIFT RESULTS DIRECTLY FROM BARCLAY’S EPISTEMOLOGY

The next person who articulates the history of Quakerism is Rufus Jones in his work *The Later Periods of Quakerism*. Jones claims that the person reading Quaker writings during the period of

³⁵⁰ Meetings void of ministry would be contrary to Barclay who advocated for the prophet-the one who heard God, the apostle-the one sent into the world, and the evangelist-the one who spoke the word of God received. What Brayshaw describes is a far cry from the outlook of Barclay concerning ministry whether in meeting or outside of meeting. It didn't matter where one was. Prophecy was intended for all, apostleship was intended for all, and evangelism was intended for all resulting from knowing God.

³⁵¹ *ibid.* 216-7 Brayshaw essentially says that the Heart of Christ’s Body gathered for mutual edification from its Head was subverted by ritualism, individualism, and nominalism. Rufus Jones argues that Christian nominalism resulted from the Continental Quietists of the western Roman Catholic Counter-Reformation (1545-1648) as the alternative to the Protestant Reformation (1517-1648). This researcher argues that while 1648 marked the end of the 30 Year War, Protestants formally gained liberty by the 1689 Edict of Religious Tolerance by Protestant Queen Mary and William. The Restoration under Charles II and James II was from 1660-1688.

1648-1725 will find a change in the intellectual climate and an altered look to Quakers of 1725-1825. This he claims is common as environments shift, are modified, and altered. Change of habit appears in all human undertakings even in those with fixity and permanency. New principles work themselves out over time. Old words mean new things with new generations.³⁵² Habit and custom became dominant in the 1725-1825 stage while freshness and surprise marked the 1648-1725 movement. A vast difference emerged from the illuminating experience of divine Light as it burst into the consciousness of George Fox in 1648. A theory of the inward Light replaced it in 1748. Jones argues that while leaders in both periods were mystics, the first stressed the immediacy of the human soul with God while the second emphasized the immeasurable depth and worth of man. Jones considers the first as emerging from the depraved condition and the second as emerging from the enlightened condition. The first was peculiar and separatist and the second holistic and embrative.³⁵³

For Jones the original outlook on human depravity and its negative view on humanity are placed squarely on the shoulders of Robert Barclay. The fearless exposition of the inward Light in the thought terms of the 17th century carried Barclay into the barren regions of negation. Jones concludes that Barclay was foredoomed to the conclusion that the Seed of God was from another world and immutable, in contrast with humans beings as mutable and in process. Jones is adamant that the negative view of the human condition and the consequent need for the divine Light came

³⁵² Jones, Rufus. *The Later Periods of Quakerism*, Greenwood Press, CT, 1970, 32-3. This author argues that the intellectual climate of Quaker Christianity was altered by the 1689 Edict of Religious Tolerance initially. It was further derailed by the 1835 Puritan effects of Isaac Crewdson in his negation of the immanence of the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit for the primacy of Scripture. This would lead to the alterations brought on by the late 19th century advances in science affecting the 1895 Manchester Conference.

³⁵³ *ibid.* 33 In these two extremes we find the shift from the doctrine of "Original Sin" originating with Augustine, and "Ancestral Sin" maintained by the Orthodox East. Original sin claims extreme depravity from the fall of man in the garden (Gen 15:16; Ex 20:5; Deut 5:9). Ancestral sin recognizes the defeat of sin and death by Jesus Christ, the second Adam (Is. 53:6; Ez 18:1-20; Jer 31:26-30)

from the theological culture of Quietism.³⁵⁴ Quietest individuals were luminous examples of a religious tendency enveloping the Western world in the 17th and early 18th century, flooding the consciousness of all religious leaders. Quietism seemed as invasive as Pentecost (Acts 2).³⁵⁵

For Jones quietism was the intense and glowing faith in the direct invasion of God into the sphere of human personality, rising to the level of experience while at the same time bound by humanity's total depravity and spiritual bankruptcy. Quietism was the right way to initiate action. For the quietist all acts motivated by human consciousness bore the mark of the fallen creature and were below the Spirit. All thoughts and strivings in natural man were barren and unfruitful. There were two stories in the universe, one of fallen nature and the other of a supernatural realm where God was enthroned in power and splendor as sovereign Ruler. Given man's fallen condition, nothing good originated on man's nature. Light and spirituality came supernaturally from God above, and Quietism bridged the chasm between the two realms.³⁵⁶ Jones continues that Quietism, having its birth and nurture in the absolute despair of the human nature was intensified by Protestantism. Calvinism made extreme the doctrine of the ruin and fall of man. The old Adam governs everything man does and thinks. The fallenness of man spoils all that springs from the "Fountain." Nothing divine originates in man totally *depraved*. The only course for ministry is death of all one's power, effort, straining, striving, and confidence in self. Out of complete silence, calm, and contemplation

³⁵⁴ *ibid.* 33-4 Jones considers Robert Barclay, and George Fox for that matter, to be victims of a culture and time period beyond their control as with any time period. Both Barclay (1648-1690) and Fox lived their lives within the years of 1624-1691.

³⁵⁵ *ibid.* 34-5 The climax of the Quietist Movement would have emerged with the emergence of Quaker Christianity in the second half of the 17th century.

³⁵⁶ *ibid.* 35 A strong sense of the fallen condition of man nurtured through Augustine and John Calvin's view of Original Sin was categorically rejected by Robert Barclay and the Quakers. The alternative to the realities of "sin" and "bodily death" are difficult to explain away when evil and death are so obvious. Barclay provides an alternative, and this PhD affirms it. The move is from sin affecting the children from the 3rd & 4th generations (Ex. 20:5; Deut. 5:9) to the new covenant effect of innocence prophesied by Isaiah (53:6), Ezekiel (18:1-32), and Jeremiah (31:15-30). The younger Rachel is equivalent to Mary the 2nd Eve and the younger Ephraim is equivalent to Jesus Christ the 2nd Adam. The fall of 1st Adam debilitates (death) and the resurrection of 2nd Adam resuscitates (life).

grace bursts forth in revelation. Through passivity and death the quietist becomes capable of extraordinary activity.³⁵⁷

Jones instructs that in the passivity of inner life in which all powers and functions of the conscience are brought into unity, the fallen self-vanishes, and the soul is made ready to receive. The mind is so focused that it goes beyond its own processes and rejects its own content. This includes crucifixion of self and death of the creature until arriving at pure contemplation of God, who takes the place of the crucified, becoming inward reality, inaugurates action according to His will.³⁵⁸ The pure state of the quietist is purged of mental content and loves nothing finite. All selfishness is purged, and man loves for the sake of love alone. Faith becomes the assent of the soul to God without expectation. Prayer is the unitive state with God in which selfishness, thought, and desire are banished. God's Presence bathes the soul with fountains of life.³⁵⁹

Extreme forms of quietism came from the French and Italian community of Catholic priest Miguel Molinos (1627-1697), Madame Jeanne Guyon (1648-1717), and her convert Archbishop Francois Fenelon (1651-1715). Jeremy Taylor describes quietism in *Life of Christ*, published in 1649 as contemplation begins when sense and intellect are left behind, resulting in union and adherence to God through prayer, quietness, silence, agitation, discourse, vision, entry into light, and the resolution of faculties into sweetness, affection, and staring into divine beauty. In mortification one

³⁵⁷ *ibid.* 35-6 Jones claims that human despair was intensified by Protestantism. This researcher agrees that Protestantism by design centers on the believers use of proof text as final authority. Pure rationalism always causes ego differences. Extreme quietism would need to be counterbalanced by Barclay's beginning place of True Knowledge and Christian Revelation before the Scriptures which Barclay emphasizes are shadow to the Reality. Barclay's beginning place is John 17:3 rather than II Timothy 3:16.

³⁵⁸ *ibid.* 36-7 Passivity is the posture of listening in Barclay's true Christian divinity. Deification, more than a static profession of "Christianity" is central to the early Fathers. Irenaeus of Lyons, Athanasius of Alexandria: God became man so that man might become God. This comes by God eliminating the nature of depravity first articulated by Augustine (354-430) in the West.

³⁵⁹ *ibid.* 37 In Jesus's words, the humble and submissive soul realizes and is ravished by God's Presence. Death produces life. "If anyone serves Me, let him follow Me; and where I am, there My servant will be also." (John 12:23-26)

flames into assent. Prayer transcends words. Its sighs and groaning cannot be expressed, requiring not the voice but the mind, not the hands but the heart, not the body but the understanding.³⁶⁰

Jones notices that quietism was not only in the Catholic Counter-Reformation (1545-1648) but in Christian mysticism which showed a neo-Platonic strain. It is found in Augustine where his doctrine of grace and view of man's total depravity 'Original Sin' are the basis for fully developed quietism. Jones affirms that Thomas a Kempis (c.1380-1471) in his *Imitation of Christ* was a direct source of English quietism. Thomas Aquinas (1225-1274) says much about the unitive concentrated consciousness of inner quiet and perfect love which clings to God with no thought of any good accruing from it. This movement constitutes the human spirit in its most steep and difficult pilgrimage, it's most dizzy and daring assent; braving darkness and loneliness in silence and crucifixion on its descending way to God.³⁶¹ In Miguel Molinos' *Spiritual Guide* (1675) there is the

³⁶⁰ *ibid.* 38-9 Barclay emphasizes I Corinthians 14 concerning that all be prophets who speak in tongues. I Corinthians 14 is intriguingly sandwiched between I Corinthians 13 on the flowering of love and I Corinthians 15 on mortality being swallowed up by immortality.

³⁶¹ *ibid.* 39-40 Original Sin coupled with Quietism provided a dour outlook of life in this world. H. A. Hodges in his introduction to *Unseen Warfare: The Spiritual Combat and Path to Paradise*, SVS, 2000, pp. 14-17, 23-24, written by Italian Roman Catholic priest Lorenzo Scupoli (1530-1610) published in 1589 during the Counter Reformation period, edited by Orthodox monks Nicodemus of the Holy Mountain (1749-1809) and revised by Theophan the Recluse (1815-1894) as Orthodox response to the Catholic Counter Reformation is a more ancient expression in prayer. The eastern tradition takes its cue from Paul who tells us that the Christian life is an athletic contest for which one trains. The Bible is full of doctrine concerning the gospel of God's free grace, the new law, the law of liberty and love, by which God's people govern themselves. It tells of the work wrought for us once for all by Christ on the Cross, it tells of the work wrought in us every day by the Holy Ghost who summons us to be 'fellow-workers with God.' The goal of the ascetic struggle is union with God by loving contemplation. This is the Kingdom of God, and this is eternal life for which we were created. Hodges claims that Orthodox hesychasm has little in common with quietism in the 17th century West. It is the ancient form of spiritual discipline meant to bring the soul to a state of repose in God by repetition of 'Lord Jesus Christ, Son of God have mercy'. In repetition of the Jesus Prayer it moves from the lips inwardly to the mind and eventually dominates the whole personality in action. It brings the soul to a place of quiet in which there are no sensible images or discursive movements of the intellect but only an intuitive apprehension of the soul itself and God. Then the 'flame of grace' is kindled, bringing 'warmth' and the 'light of Mount Tabor' manifesting peace and joy. It is genuine perceptual experience, of that which eye has not seen nor ear heard in which one becomes a 'partaker of the divine nature'. The Jesus Prayer dominates will, character, and prepares for 'Unseen Warfare'. In Barclay's *Apology*, Proposition 11 on Worship, pp. 330-1, 336-7 he states "...so watching in a holy dependence upon the Lord, and meeting together not only outwardly in one place, but thus inwardly in one Spirit, and in one name of Jesus, which is his power and virtue, they come thereby to enjoy and feel the arisings of this life, which, as this life prevails in each particular, becomes as a flood of refreshment, and over spreads the whole meeting: for man, and man's part and wisdom, being denied and chained down in every individual, and God exalted, and his grace in dominion in the heart, thus Jesus's name comes to be one in all, and his glory breaks forth and covers all; and there is such a holy awe and reverence upon every soul, that if the natural part should arise in any, or the wise part, or what is not one with the life, it would presently be chained down, and judged out." This is the Barclay's equivalent of the Jesus Prayer, with the one name of Jesus taking precedence with the Holy Spirit within in *unseen warfare*. [emphasis mine]

prayer of a child: tender, delightful, joy-bringing, full of sensuous comfort, and the prayer of men: obscure, dry, desolate, without joy. The silence of a child is one of words and requests while the silence of men are thoughts of self-denial where the Holy Spirit operates unhindered. Nakedness of self and death of self-activity allows the divine Presence to work undisturbed. God will have all things done by operation of his own activity, therefore the quieter I become the better things succeed. As love mounts, self falls, so perfect love is the annihilation of self which is the miracle of sainthood.³⁶² Interestingly, the question is raised that if God could be met in the silence of the interior, what function is left of the priest? If salvation is a matter of self-annihilation, what is the purpose of the Church?³⁶³ Fenelon claimed that pure contemplation was negative in that it did not occupy any sensible image or idea of God. Sanctification was the attainment of holy indifference, of absolute non-desire. The highest state of prayer was absolute passivity, complete repose, in which thinking, feeling, and willing were obliterated. The apex of human life was reached in simplicity, when the mind is focused upon no object, when the will aims at no goal, and the soul does not favor one thing over another. All selfishness is washed out and life flows with the current of His life.³⁶⁴ A *Guide to True Peace* was first published in 1813 by British Quakers William Backhouse and James Janson being a compilation of passages from three continental Quietists Molinos, Guyon, and Fenelon. All three were interrogated by the Inquisition for heresy. Molinos died in prison, Guyon was imprisoned four times, and Fenelon was exiled from Paris and lived out his life in Cambrai. Their exile allowed the Protestants to draw from them without themselves becoming Catholic. Quietist writings had wide influence amongst Lutheran Pietists in Germany, and Protestants in England such as John Wesley. Quakers in England also found the teachings of Quietism to be in

³⁶² *ibid.* 45 The path of a Saint is becoming holy. This is done by self-mortification and renunciation through repentance.

³⁶³ *ibid.* 46 Quakers eliminated the laity by all becoming clergy. Church took place wherever two were gathered in Jesus' name.

³⁶⁴ *ibid.* 51 The life of negation was a major part of Theresa of Avila and St. John of the Cross's writings. Gregory of Nyssa in his *Life of Moses* and Dionysius the Areopagite in his *Mystical Theology* wrote on the apophatic way of life as the path to union with God.

sympathy with their own Faith and Practice. Quakers became a significant conduit for the spread of continental Quietism into Protestant lands. Backhouse and Janson also placed into the writings copious biblical quotations; over 100 references are found in the roughly 90 pages. *The Guide* has been in continuous print and many editions available since its publication in 1813. Jones states that the writings of Molinos had been in circulation in England since 1688 along with Thomas a Kempis's *Imitation of Christ* a favorite of Quaker ministers in England and America.³⁶⁵

Jones claims that the strand of Quietism most profoundly felt was held by Robert Barclay who accepted the doctrine of the depravity and ruin of "fallen man" with as little reservation as John Calvin. Barclay's problem was to discover how salvation is affected for the fallen man, and how spiritual processes can operate in a creature that is by nature fleshly and carnal. Barclay's answer is that God Himself operates in man, and everything of a spiritual quality comes to be in man through God working His miracle of Grace and Light in man and through man. The vehicle of divine operation is the Seed of God or supernatural Light, super-added to man's nature as [G]race purchased by Christ's sacrifice for man. This Seed or Light does not belong to man, as man is fallen. It is a supernatural contribution divinely given to effect man's escape from his fallen condition. Man's part is to receive the Seed by giving the Seed opportunity to operate unhindered. Human passivity is the first step in salvation, in man not working contrarily to the Seed. To keep still, to wait, to suppress all human processes and creaturely activity is the preparatory stage for spiritual operation. Man who is powerless to bring the visitation or to accomplish any spiritual work must stand and wait. Revelation when given is pure naked Truth without mixture from beneath.³⁶⁶

³⁶⁵ *ibid.* 58 *A Guide to True Peace* has a similar feel as what George Fox discovered experimentally and then found the same in the Bible he was raised with in his Church of England and Puritan childhood. Scripture verses were placed in the text after its initial reception from Molinos, Guyon, and Fenelon. This points to the experimental and experiential nature of Christian faith.

³⁶⁶ *ibid.* 59-60 Jones rightly describes Barclay's view of salvation as coming purely from God. The undeveloped understanding in Barclay's theology is that the Original Sin which incapacitates man is updated to ancestral sin through the second Adam. As II Corinthians 5:14-21 reveals the second Adam became sin who knew no sin so that man might become the righteousness of God. Jesus Christ is more than a giant sperm donor for the universe but became the source

Jones goes on to confirm his argument again that Barclay's *Apology* is beyond question the primary influence which made Friends quietists. He claims it is not easy to trace the influences which carried Barclay himself toward Quietism. Barclay was born the same year as Madame Guyon (1648), received his education in Paris, France at the Scots Theological College (1659-1663), and "having a certain felicity of understanding, successful beyond many of my equals in age," he absorbed from his intellectual climate ideas and sentiments most suited to his temperament and propensity. And when at a later time he came to formulate his position and his experience, he revealed a fundamental sympathy with the widespread movement of his age, which bound the way out of the *impasse* of human depravity through an act of faith in supernatural divine actions, operating in those who suppress all human activity – which Jones confirms is Quietism.³⁶⁷

Jones follows that the influence of Barclay's writings (1670-1679) upon Friends was all the time being supplemented by influences outside the Society, which slowly filtered through the avenues of

of eternal salvation once perfected (Hebrews 4:14-5:11) in His restoring man to the prelapsarian state He conquered the sin issue Himself (Isaiah 53:6; Jeremiah 31:29-30, Ezekiel 18:1-31). The sin issue is a precursor to the death issue which is conquered through the Son through sleep but not eternal death (John 11-12). The major shift between East and West is the position on Original Sin (Augustine 354-430) which is ancestral sin in the East, and Grace being the incarnation and Spirit to be experienced (East) more than rationalized (West). Grace realized through the Seed of the second Adam is the seed landing on fertile soil leading to becoming by Grace indwelling what God is by nature. Uncreated Grace is the God-man Jesus Christ and the Holy Spirit. Barclay was more opposed to John Calvin and his teachings than anything else. A clear look on Barclay's position on Original Sin can be found in Barclay's Works III, *R. B.'s Apology Vindicated*, 1679, 328. SECTION V. *Wherein Brown's Fifth and Sixth Chapters, entitled by him, of Man's Natural State, and of Original Sin, are considered.* Barclay's Works III, *Apology Vindicated: Natural State and Sin*, 1679, pp 328-350.

³⁶⁷ *ibid.* 60 While Madame Guyon was born in 1648, the same year as Robert Barclay, her thought would not have been developed. As a Puritan, Barclay claims to be raised on the doctrines of Calvinist John Knox and Philip Melancthon. It would be in 1659 that he would leave for the secular Scot's college of Paris established by his Uncle Robert Barclay for the sole purpose of re-converting Scotland back to Roman Catholicism. The dominant theme that others have held is that the Scots College Paris was affected by Jansenism in which the sacraments are viewed spiritually. Being a secular Catholic College, the Scots College remained pure from the Benedictine, Jesuit, Franciscan, and Dominican branches. Barclay was equally critical of Original Sin and scholasticism. In being critical of scholasticism we find his rejection of grace as a scholastic formula. He categorically rejected the doctrine of substitutionary atonement, and aligned with Philip Melancthon's view on the faith and works dilemma. Barclay's return to Scotland in 1663 lead him to search amongst the variant expressions of Christianity until he walked into the Quaker meeting and discovered its expression to be "*the best way to become a Christian.*" Quakerism was '*True CHRISTIAN Divinity*' beyond Roman Catholicism, the later Protestants, and as the final Protestant expression. [Emphasis Barclay] Barclay takes issue equally with Calvinism and Arminianism as incomplete in his defense of Quakerism.

reading and travel, so that every decade the traces of Quietism deepened and were more clearly marked.³⁶⁸

Jones argues that no Friend of genius undertook the task in the 18th century of interpreting the Quaker ideals and message in like manner as Robert Barclay. A mild attempt was made in 1725 by Benjamin Holm in a little book entitled *A Serious Call*. This book was republished many times during the next 100 years, circulated widely, containing the central ideas of evangelical Christianity colored with the Quaker emphasis on the inner Light and the absence of outward rites. Points were made of man's inability to know God or the things of God except through direct revelation by the inward Teacher and that ministry proceeds only from the Holy Spirit. Preceding this work was Hugh Turford's book entitled "*The Grounds of a Holy Life: or the Way by which many who were Heathens, came to be Renowned Christians; and such as are now Sinners, may come to be numbered with saints, by Little Preaching. To which is added, Paul's Speech to the Bishop of Cretia, as also, A True Touchstone or Trial of Christianity.*" (1702) Emphasis is put on "the inner witness wrought in man himself," on the practice of a pure and holy life, on "righteousness in one's heart," and the exercise of the practice of the presence of God. While making little use of "words and notions," Turford places emphasis on obedience to the Light, and "self-denial of everything proceeding from an evil root" as the path to peace. Practical holiness is the narrow way coming from the deeply centered life. The government of the Holy Spirit is realized through self-denial and strict obedience to the Light which God has placed in the hidden center of the soul.³⁶⁹

³⁶⁸ *ibid.* 60 Many have held that Jacob Boehme (1575-1624) had primary influence upon Friends. While this has been an argument, there is no mention of Boehme in Barclay's writings. What is mentioned are the Fathers of the Church and variant Protestants. There are centuries of evidence that the continental Quietists Miguel Molinos (1627-1697), Madame Jeanne Guyon (1648-1717), and her convert Archbishop Francois Fenelon (1651-1715) influenced the Quakers. Robert Barclay's dates were 1648-1690.

³⁶⁹ *ibid.* 60-1 Jones recognizes continuity of belief from Benjamin Holm's *A Serious Call* from 1725-1825 amongst the general population of Quaker (evangelical) Christians, and Hugh Turford's work published in 1702 and underwent 28 editions in English, French, Spanish, Italian, German, and Danish. Becoming a Saint with little preaching coincides with Barclay's apologetic.

Jones considers that Turford's work led the Society into a quietist religion as interpreted by the leading Ministers of the body in their sermons and Journals in which they revealed the processes and stages of their spiritual life. With the exception of John Woolman, they reveal slender literary skill and meager self-revelation. They do not compare with the autobiographies of the mystical prophets of the 14th through 16th centuries. They are oases in barren wastelands where one can find occasional fountains of living water. These commonplace men and women raised to a high level strict obedience to the inner Guide, and penetrated the entire area of Quakerism with their ideals.³⁷⁰

Jones considers that Quakers of the 18th century exhibited Quietism that was corporate rather than individual. The habits of Quaker groups, even more than autobiographical revelations feared anything "man-made," and maintained methods to suppress one's "own self" and to "crucify the creature." Corporate silence, prolonged for hours became the loftiest of worship. Silence, suppression, slowing down of action, and hushing the thought were urged as preparation for receiving the divine Word.³⁷¹ Meetings often maintained long successive periods of silence with rare vocal utterances. Visiting itinerant ministers were moved to remain mute so as to "starve the people from words," and turn them from trust in the creature.³⁷² Mary Dudley in 1750 expresses a view consistent of her time, "*when the creature is so reduced as to know indeed that it can do nothing, then He who is strength and weakness shows Himself strong.*" William Burke in 1752 writes, "*Had I kept to my first love, and not suffered the wisdom of the fallen nature to blind and deafen, and, in appearance, almost totally quench, in me the second Adam, which is a quickening spirit, I should not now be without true wisdom, in a captious, deceitful world.*"³⁷³

³⁷⁰ *ibid.* 62 Saints function most out of humility and holiness; being made whole through faithfulness to God and humanity.

³⁷¹ *ibid.* 62-3 Corporate action included first of all listening. This moves towards the monastic community which centers in prayer when gathered, and prayer while one works separately.

³⁷² *ibid.* 63 Emphasis was directed toward every person hearing the voice of God within. This would be consistent with the apostle Paul's emphasis in Colossians 1:27-29 which is "Christ in you, the hope of glory."

³⁷³ *ibid.* 63-4 A recognition of the human condition and the mortification of self, produced the space for divine work as human powers were humbled and laid low. In the historic church East, repentance remains ever the path to holiness

Jones considers the most extraordinary and unique document concerning fear of the “creature” and the life-long battle with “self” is John Rutty’s *Spiritual Diary* (London, 1796). He was a physician of distinction, a man of learning and widely read. He had an “uncommon tenderness of conscience,” and he experienced an “irradiation of spiritual light” in 1754 which affected him the rest of his life. One irradiation of Light showed him that “it is criminal not to hate this life,” and henceforth the battle of the two worlds was on. His *Spiritual Diary* of 420 pages revealed the following reoccurring phrases: “Old Adam yet slain; sticks like birdlime.” “Not yet delivered from captivity to the world’s spirit” “No devil like that in my own bosom.” “Still snappish.” “Very brittle.” “Feasted beyond the holy bounds.” “Sinned in smoking for mere pleasure, not for health.” “Patience over-exercised in the detention of medical fees.” “I am still only a spiritual embryo.” “Sinfully choleric on a slight provocation.” “Do less in medicine and nature, says the Lord, and more in spirituals.” “Suspected myself of rottenness of heart in robbing God of devotion for temporal converse.” “Must resign my studies which deal only with the body.” “Attended a feast and not a word about Christ spoken.” “O my groveling tendency to the study of terrestrial matters.” “Wean me, O Lord, from the world and from the specious glitterings of natural science.” “Much in arrears to my soul, not to my body.” “A lively sense of death at hand, and so visited my gravedigger.” As a result of self-renunciation Rutty admits he is gaining success in restraining flesh and appetite, and in gaining heavenly mindedness. He writes at the end of his life, “Neither men nor angels, shall persuade me that I’m not growing in grace.”³⁷⁴

Jones points to Peter Bohler the Moravian whom the Quaker, then Methodist, and then again Quaker William Law (1686-1761) experienced in his sojourn to Georgia in 1735-37. Bohler was convinced that the faith that justified is a faith of absolute assurance found not on logic or exegesis, but on

³⁷⁴ *ibid.* 65-6 Becoming Christian by Grace indwelling is long obedience in the ways of Christ. Rutty reveals the humble path to holiness as God's original righteous intent in the garden of Eden realized through the incarnation of God in Jesus Christ.

direct inner insight of experience as immediate gift of God. John Wesley (1703-1791) felt his heart strangely moved on 24, May, 1738 when reading Luther's preface to the Epistle to the Romans.³⁷⁵ Wesley's second experience of sanctification from sin (1738-9) was a milder feature of Luther's teaching, and George Fox and Robert Barclay who had called 17th century Christians to a sanctified life. 18th century Wesley was considered influential in practical religion more than any person in the 16th century. Against Barclay's *Apology* Wesley was vigorously militant. In 1738 he wrote a letter to a person lately joined to the Quakers, 20 pages in length, in which he takes up his account with Barclay giving 10 points on why Quakers differ from Christianity. Wesley declared he would as soon be a Deist as a Quaker and that a silent meeting was never heard of in the church of Christ for 1600 years. Wesley did speak in glowing terms of Quakers William Edmondson and John Ruttly.³⁷⁶

The decisive person Jones considers to be the catalyst for change in Quakerism is the American born Quaker Minister Hannah Barnard (1754-1825) who converted to Friends from her Baptist upbringing at age 18 (1772). She opposed the Old Testament where the Almighty commanded the Israelites to make war upon other nations. She claimed that her belief on the miraculous conception of Jesus in the virgin Mary had not been revealed to her. She claimed her views remained in complete accord with William Penn, Isaac Penington, Robert Barclay, Thomas Ellwood, and Job Scott that religious experience was different from "belief in historical facts." Barnard shares a straightforward perspective as a forerunner of belief in Rufus Jones time (1921). She was given to understand that she must believe the beliefs essential to Christianity or be named a Deist, infidel, or atheist. She was none of these but only an honest soul seeking to find her way from belief which her (Baptist) spirit had outgrown, to faith which satisfied her nature. She stressed putting on Christ experimentally after the nature of mystics. She could not believe in the infallibility of Scripture but

³⁷⁵ *ibid.* 267 Experience begins in the heart through the Spirit resulting in Christ's indwelling unto inhabitation.

³⁷⁶ *ibid.* 268-70 Monastic spirituality, centered in silence has been a key aspect of Christianity since Antony of the Desert. Barclay advocates for the Christianity experienced by monks and nuns, only in common life. Monasticism remains central in East and West.

had unbounded confidence in inward illumination. She readily granted the Scriptures to be an outward declaration containing every doctrine or precept necessary to be believed and reduced to practice, yet nothing is revealed truth to me, as doctrine, until it is sealed in my mind, through illumination of the uncreated word of God, or divine light, and intelligence, to which the Scriptures and writings of other enlightened authors, of different ages bear testimony. I do not attach the idea of divine infallibility to any Society or book in the world but only to the source of eternal truth. Hudson Meeting decided that Hannah Barnard should be silent as a Minister (1802).³⁷⁷

In response to the Hannah Barnard incident, Joseph Gurney Bevan made an examination of the writings of early Friends in order to show that they were not Unitarians (1805). His litmus test was that orthodoxy stands or falls as we receive or reject the divine sanction of the Jewish wars. John Alsop declared that the miraculous conception and the miracles of Christ were the foundation of Christianity. Luke Howard (1772-1864) centered on literalism and ultra-orthodoxy in hard opposition to mysticism, Hannah Barnard, and the doctrine of the inward Light as articulated by Robert Barclay. He was inclined to a literal interpretation of Scripture and was more theological

³⁷⁷ *ibid.* 299-305 Hannah Barnard (1754-1825) represents the René Descartes (1596-1650) perspective of "I think, therefore I am." Her upbringing as a Baptist would galvanize this position and mirror both Fox and Barclay's experience as Puritans. It would be in 1689 that the London Baptist Confession of Faith would have been enacted following the Edict of Religious Tolerance given by King William of Orange (1689). This was a statement commensurate with the Westminster Confession. Barnard articulates the primacy of experience from the limitation of facts which Dionysius the Areopagite, Gregory of Nyssa, and other Church Fathers illuminate. She affirms the core Eastern and Quaker belief of "*putting on Christ*" (Galatians 3:26-28; Romans 13:10-14) after the manner of Eastern Christianity (metaphysics). Her affirmation of Robert Barclay would coincide with true knowledge being John 17:3, Christ indwelling all humanity as seed of the second Adam unto inhabitation, being led by the Spirit of Pentecost, and the kingdom of God being within; the fruit of God's kingdom being hitting the mark of God's righteous intent in the Garden of Eden now revealed through the Incarnation and Spirit. Hannah Barnard's reaction to the miraculous conception of Jesus Christ in the *Theotokos*-Mother of God (1802) would maintain similarities with Quaker William Rogers' reaction to the quaint baby born in the manger as the center of faith (1676). It was Rogers affirmation of Quaker freedom which contributed to the "*Anarchy of the Ranters and Hierarchy of the Romanists refuted and Gospel order and the ancient apostolic Church reestablished through the Quakers*" (1674) being affirmed as "*Robert Barclay's Book of Government*" by the Second Day Meeting in 1676-7. The similarity in Hannah Barnard and William Rogers reflects the ancient apostolic Churches response to issues related to the Incarnation, the Holy Spirit, the *Theotokos*, Sabellianism, etc. The Ecumenical Councils of the ancient apostolic Church would have functioned in a similar manner as the Second Day Meeting in continuity with the living tradition [*paradosis*] of the dead Fathers (II Thessalonians 2:15). The Eastern Church reflects the living tradition of Christianity coming down from the Fathers within which we find the sacred yet shadow Scriptures as part of that tradition. This is different from the conflated Tradition and Scripture of the Roman West and the divisive Faith Alone and Scripture Alone of the Protestant West. In the East, reason submits to experience and the true theologian is the one who knows God (John 17:3). Apophatic and kataphatic knowledge differentiated by Dionysius the Areopagite and Gregory of Nyssa are embraced in contrast with Western scholastic knowledge introduced in the 8th-16th centuries.

defined than most Friends. He wrote a *Letter containing Observations upon a Treatise written by Job Scott, entitled Salvation by Christ* (1825). By his argumentative skill and exegesis of Scripture, Howard missed the inner meaning of Christian life, the real nature of the religion Job Scott was interpreting-the mystical experience of salvation as the inward birth by which God brings forth His Son in the soul. Howard writes like Nicodemus (John 3:1-8) who understands nothing of Jesus, takes rebirth literally, and is unfamiliar with the Kingdom of God. Jones concludes that in America the divergence following the Barnard controversy produced a deep chasm between evangelicals and Quakers during the period of 1800-1827.³⁷⁸

The separation throughout 1835-1855 galvanized the prior Hicksite-Orthodox separation of 1827-8. In 1835 Isaac Crewdson wrote “*A Beacon to the Society of Friends*,” taking a forceful evangelical position. He exposed passages in the writings of Elias Hicks, and used them to show the dangers of the inward Light as the basis of religion. The inward Light as articulated by Barclay and interpreted by Crewdson was the weak spot in Quakerism and its central “error.” Crewdson had earlier been a believer in the inward Light as expounded in Barclay’s *Apology*. Jones surmises that probably because of the influence of a powerful Calvinistic preacher that Crewdson’s youthful faith swung to an evangelical interpretation of Christianity (1870) [cessationism?]. Crewdson says that the great deception and heresy of Hicksism and Deism originates in the assumption that we are authorized to expect to be taught true knowledge of God and his salvation-our duty to Him and to our fellow-man-immediately by the Spirit, independent of revelation through Scripture-an assumption unsupported

³⁷⁸ *ibid.* 309-11 René Descartes rationalism and Eastern Christian experience unto Theosis are disjointed. Bevan places orthodoxy on the affirmation of the Bible. Alsup declares allegiance to the miraculous conception and miracles of Christ alone. Howard centers on hard literalism and ultra-orthodoxy as opposed to the inward Light of Jesus Christ as articulated by Barclay. Nothing of Job Scott's experience of the inward birth of the Spirit by which God brings forth his Son in the soul is recognized. The Baptist born Hannah Barnard controversy exploits the problems inherent in Western Christianity. Theology is not complex enough to usher in *becoming Christian* through experience of God as Grace indwelling unto what God is by nature (Theosis). There is a lack of teaching on John 17:3, the new covenant fulfilled law (Jeremiah 31:33), the universal witness (Jeremiah 31:34; Revelation 14:6-7), the seed of the second Adam taking root in fertile soil (Matthew 13:9); and the path of deification (I Corinthians 13:8-12; II John 3:2; II: Peter 1:4). Salvation in the East sees Christ as the priestly Victor (Hebrews 4:14-5:11) while in the West as the ransom Victim (Matthew 20:28; I Timothy 2:6). It is Christ's resurrected body and blood one partakes of as Christ has conquered sin and death (John 6:63; Hebrews 9:27-28; Revelation 3:20).

by Scripture, contradicted by fact, and one that renders its votaries a prey to fatal delusions. The fixed basis of truth was the revealed word of God in Scripture. By Scripture all experience is to be tried and tested. He claimed the Scriptures and rejected the inward Light as a delusive notion. It is error to imagine that silence and stillness are essential to worship. He sweeps away the teaching that man must be prepared to pray or worship by an inward operation of the Spirit. He rejects creaturely exertions [works?], sinking down, centering down, digging deep, dwelling deep, turning inward as not the language of Jesus Christ and His Apostles. Crewdson repudiates the root, branch, and whole of Quaker Christianity as spurious. It is mysticism unlike the religion of Jesus Christ founded on the Spirit of God transmitted in Holy Scripture. Only the religion transmitted in holy Scripture can save.³⁷⁹

BRINTON RECENTERS QUAKERISM IN THE GOSPEL OF JESUS CHRIST ACCORDING TO JOHN

Howard Brinton in his book *The Religious Philosophy of Quakerism* writes in the preface of his book subtitled *The Beliefs of Fox, Barclay, and Penn as based on the Gospel of John* that he hopes to offer to Christianity a theology which can be accepted by intellectual persons in line with recent changes in science and art and to remind Friends that it has a body of belief that both conservative and liberal can share.³⁸⁰ Brinton will emphasize the Gospel of Jesus Christ according to John and its centrality on the Inward Light or the Inward Christ as the fulfillment of the blood of Christ in

³⁷⁹ *ibid.* 488-92 Crewdson at best returns Christianity to the path of Old Covenant Judaism and at worst sucks the very life out of Christianity. Revelation is reduced to written text with legalistic adherence to the content of the text. René Descartes rationalism and Western scholasticism find their way into Christianity dismissive of the Church born through the descent (*kenosis*) and ascent of Jesus Christ, the eternal Word and incarnation, and the reception of the Holy Spirit by which a person cries ‘*Abba, Father*’. Christianity becomes what Jesus spoke of in John 5:39-40 in that ‘you search the Scriptures thinking that in them that you have eternal life, and fail to come to me’. Christ’s Body becomes what Jesus chastised the scribes and Pharisees of in Matthew 23 and 24. Rather than the living tradition of the dead Fathers (Hebrews 11:1-12:2), self-righteousness and presumption resumes. Deification ‘God became man so that man might become G[g]od’ through theosis ‘becoming by Grace indwelling what God is by nature’ is replaced by entitled formulas of belief void of Christianity where the ego reigns supreme over humility (Luke 17:10; Philippians 2:4-5).

³⁸⁰ Brinton, Howard. *The Religious Philosophy of Quakerism*, Pendle Hill Publications, PA, 1973, vii. Brinton looks to arguably the three most public figures in Quaker origin that have affected the movement throughout its history. This he will look at theologically through the lens of the Gospel of John as not being confined to either modern-day Christian conservatism or liberalism.

Hebrews. Brinton considers that the gospel according to John is concerned mainly with the Eternal Christ [Word], “a spirit in all men past and present,” while the synoptic Gospels concern themselves with Jesus Christ in history (0-33 A.D.). He considers confusion to be inevitable because Jesus Christ exhibits in his life and teaching all the functions and character of the Eternal Christ. As Creator he reconciled the parts of life [Jewish and Gentile] so that the parts become unified. Brinton considers Hebrews which emphasizes the blood of Jesus to be accurate but less mature. Hebrews emphasizes a transcendent God that lacks immanence. In response, Brinton presents a theology based on the Gospel of Jesus Christ according to John as organic rather than mechanistic; concerned more with the Eternal Christ [Word] than the historic Jesus (0-33 A.D.), the Inward Light, the Way, the Truth, and the Life. Brinton considers salvation in Hebrews to take place outside “saved” persons with Jesus sitting at the *right hand* of the Majesty on high (Hebrews 1:3). In John we find Christ saying, “I am *in* My Father and you *in* Me, and I *in* you” (John 14:20).³⁸¹

Brinton states that the life of an organism is shared by all its parts in such a way that the whole is greater than the sum of its parts. He quotes John 17:3 in the RSV “And this is eternal life, that they know thee the only true God, and Jesus [Christ] whom thou hast sent.” Brinton continues, to know God and [Jesus] Christ means that we have an organic relationship with Him; we share in His life. Brinton endeavors to bring Quakerism to its original faith in the universal saving light as Barclay described it. Brinton considers that this doctrine is neither Trinitarian nor Unitarian but both, being based on the nature of personality both human and divine. God the Son according to the *Logos*

³⁸¹ *ibid.* ix-xi While the Gospel according to John begins with the eternal Word who created the world and then enters the world “in the fullness of time” for the purpose of redeeming the world (Galatians 4:4-5), Hebrews introduces Jesus Christ as being more than an Angel or spirit who now sits at the right hand of the Majesty on high (Hebrews 1:3). The emphasis on the eternality of the Word who becomes flesh is emphasized in both John and Hebrews with the incarnation of the Word and Son revealing hitting the mark of God's righteousness in John. Hebrews poignantly reveals the inward fulfillment of the new covenant (Jeremiah 31:20-40) in Jew (Hebrews 8:10-12) and Gentile (Hebrews 10:15-17) by quoting Jeremiah 31:33-34. The eternal Word claiming to be the ‘I AM’, one with the Father is emphasized throughout John and becomes the central reason for His crucifixion - 1:18, 5:18, 8:54-58, 10:30-33, 12:44-45, 14:20, 17:3, 17:20-21, 19:7, 19:9, 20:27-28. Hebrews emphasizes that those who eagerly wait for the Son, He will appear a second time only without sin, having already appeared once at the end of the age to take away sin by the sacrifice of Himself (9:26-28).

[eternal Word] in John is God revealed as Creator. God the Father is God as he is in himself, to be known by us only through mystical intuition. In the same way every human is duality, being one person revealed to others physically and another person known to self.³⁸²

Brinton emphasizes that though his book is historical, it bears on the present. He argues that Quaker thought and experience has contain three misconceptions: (1) that the Quakers are not mystics; (2) that the Quakers were radical Protestants; and (3) that 18th-century Quietism was different from the activism of 17th-century Quakerism, and of subsequent centuries. Brinton also debunks the idea that in saying that Quakers have no fixed Creeds that Quakers had no primary beliefs. He goes on to say that Quakers have many beliefs, but the Spirit of T[t]ruth in the heart reveals further truth. The Spirit of T[t]ruth works through historical research into the origins of Christianity as well as inward experience. As Jesus said to his disciples in John 16:13 (RSV) “When the Spirit of T[t]ruth comes he will guide you into all the truth.”³⁸³

Brinton considers that Quakers should not abandon waiting in silence for the leadings of the [S]pirit. Persons should be treated as if they had, or could have the same awareness of divine truth. It is not correct to say that Quakers depend solely on their own *experience* [Emphasis Brinton]. Quakers should rely on past and present leaders. Early Quakers depended on the New Testament. George Fox, the founder, declared that he eventually found New Testament truths by direct revelation. Though first Quakers made effort to resemble early Christianity, it could not revive

³⁸² *ibid.* xi An organism shared by all parts becoming greater than the sum of its parts is restored through the Gospel incarnation as eternal Word and second Adam, by eliminating the eternal effects of first Adam. Becoming fully human through Christ indwelling is the path of redemption understood as Theosis. God became man so that man might become G[g]od. This is intended for all humanity.

³⁸³ *ibid.* xi-xii This study argues with Brinton that Quakers were mystics and experienced unmediated life with God as opposed to René Descartes rationalism; that Quakers, while identified with the radical Protestants, were other than ‘Protestant’ in their life with God and adhered to Gospel order and ancient tradition in parallel with the Eastern Orthodox. However the Quietism of the 18th century was different than the activism of the 17th century being subverted by the rationalism of Evangelical Christianity. Hesychasm, with the Jesus Prayer as center, coincides with Barclay’s *Apology* in Proposition 11 on Quakers joining together in the Spirit and in the one name of Jesus to be taught by the Lord. This is consistent with the monastic and Christian expression of the Orthodox East throughout history. Robert Barclay’s ‘*True Christian Divinity*’ finds congruency with theosis: becoming by Grace indwelling what God is by nature, and deification as God became man so that man might become G[g]od, aligning with Eastern Christianity in its collegiality and mystical Tradition over Protestant scripture and Catholic Papal supremacy.

primitive Christianity any more than Quakers today can revive primitive Quakerism. But, Brinton continues, we can revive the intention of early Quakers by aiming at their original goal, allowing their methods to mold patterns of our day as such patterns are not in opposition with today's goal.³⁸⁴

In chapter 1 on the *Light and Life in the Fourth Gospel* Brinton considers the three Pathfinders of Quakerism to be George Fox (1624-1691), Robert Barclay (1648-1690), and William Penn (1644-1718). All three base their theology on the Gospel of Jesus Christ according to John. Fox was the personality who held the movement together without governing leadership and with minimal organization. Barclay furnished the movement with a profound theology. Penn founded a colony with an advanced form of government. Penn [along with Barclay] was both a governor and a theologian. All three depended on the Fourth Gospel.³⁸⁵

Since Quaker theology is based on the Gospel of John, it is necessary to consider what is meant by the words 'eternal life'. 'Life' occurs 36 times and 'living' occurs frequently. Brinton asks what do these terms mean. The Inward Light as the means of salvation is the Inward Life. "*In him was life, and the life was the light of men*" John 1:4 RSV. The Eternal Word and Christ is Life. All living creatures possess the Inward Light. It is clear from John's gospel that Inward Life reaches its highest quality in "Eternal Life," "Life Abundant," and "Life Everlasting." John's gospel designates that

³⁸⁴ *ibid.* xii The goal of the patriarchs, matriarchs, prophets, apostles, and Saints throughout time has been experiencing God experimentally. Living in the eternal now of God's kingdom Barclay claims that true Christian divinity is arrived at through learning to listen so as to experience the God of Faith by faith. Faith is not empty but experienced by Grace uncreated, and fullness of Hope.

³⁸⁵ *ibid.* 1 The Gospel of Jesus Christ according to John begins with the Word being eternal, being Creator of the universe, and coming in flesh as Light for salvation. As well as being a theologian, Barclay was appointed governor of East Jersey (1682-1688) under King Charles II (1660-1685) and was an advisor to King James II (1685-1688). While Charles II was Church of England and James II became Catholic, neither Charles II or James II was *sola Scriptura* Protestant. Their relationship with Robert Barclay reveals mutual affirmation. Barclay gives comfort to King James II as he anticipates the arrival of his daughter Queen Mary (1689- d.1694) and King William of Orange (1689- d.1702). King James II was deposed for trying to enforce Catholic tolerance in England.

eternal life cannot be understood intellectually. Brinton considers that Life is known more by feeling and not by intellectual process. Empirical Life remains outside scientific understanding.³⁸⁶

Brinton continues that Jesus uses the analogy of vine and branches to describe the relationship between Christ and his followers. The relationship is not mechanistic. The vine does not force the branches unwillingly to produce fruit. The branches are dependent on the vine as the vine on the branches. As the vine dwells in the branches and the branches in the vine, we dwell in God and God dwells in us. (John 15:4)³⁸⁷ Brinton considers that if the relationship between Christ and man is organic then we can say that Christ was both human and Divine. The vine and the branches are distinctly separate and at the same time united. It is neither separate nor united but both separate and united. If the relationship between God, Christ, and man is organic, theological impasse can be solved based on feeling [mysticism] and not reason. Reason rejects the mystery of the branches remaining in the [V]vine.³⁸⁸

Brinton considers that for Barclay, John 1:9 KJV was the Quaker text “That was the true *Light*, which lighteth every man that comes into the world.” The RSV states: “The true *light* that enlightens every man was coming into the world.” The Greek permits either interpretation though the RSV is considered by Brinton as less consistent. If the Light enlightens every man, it was not just then coming into the world. It existed at creation and has been shining into the darkness ever since. “He was in the world, and the world was made through him, and the world knew him not” (John 1:10).

³⁸⁶ *ibid.* 1-2 Jesus exhorts his disciples to walk while it is day, while they can see the light of the world. Jesus claims that whoever lives and believes in me will never die. Death for Lazarus is sleep. (John 11:8-13, 23-27) Jesus further instructs that unless a grain falls into the ground and dies, it remains alone. If it dies, it produces grain. He who hates his life in this world will keep it for eternal life. He who loves it in this world will lose it. (John 12:23-25) Jesus comes to give life while the thief comes to steal life. (John 10:10) This life in Christ is realized experimentally through faith which pleases God (Hebrews 11:1-6). This is experimental Fox and Barclay.

³⁸⁷ *ibid.* 4-5 Different translations use dwell, abide, and remain concerning the relationship of the branches in the vine. In John 15:1-8 the vine-dresser is the Father who prunes the branches remaining in the vine for the purpose of bearing fruit. This brings reminders of Luke 2:52 and Hebrews 5:5, 7-10 with the branches remaining in the [V]vine - [I]ncarnation, as High Priest revealing the [W]ay.

³⁸⁸ The essence and energy distinction made real in Maximus the Confessor, Symeon the New Theologian, and Gregory Palamas is the means of experiencing God as energy but not as essence. In response to Barlaam of Calabria calling the hesychasts Messalians, Palamas distinguishes between the uncreated and the created by using the essence and energy distinctions.

Barclay titles his sixth proposition “the Saving and Spiritual Light, wherewith every man is enlightened.” Barclay indicates that every human, regardless of race or religion, possesses a sufficient measure of Light for his salvation. This doctrine was called “Gentile Divinity” by early Quakers. Such universalism was condemned by Calvinist Puritans. Barclay, Penn, Whittier, and Fox all expressed the universal Light.³⁸⁹

Brinton continues that in Quakerism the positive return to the world after withdrawal is emphasized. Barclay in his *Apology* compares the Quakers to such mystics as St. Bernard of Clairvaux and Benedictine Augustine Baker (+ 1641), author of *Sancta Sophia*. Barclay speaks of “Jesus brought forth in the heart that we are made one with him as the branches with the vine... Christ’s obedience becomes our obedience, Christ’s righteousness our righteousness, Christ’s death and sufferings our death and sufferings (Proposition VII, Section II; Philippians 3:8-11). Barclay makes the strong distinction that Quaker practice is not retreating into a cell but returning to the world. This is ethical mysticism because it retreats to the creative Source of Unity and returns to create that unity in the world.³⁹⁰ This is hitting of the mark of Garden of Eden and incarnational righteousness.

Quakers met in silence to realize the Divine Presence [Jesus] in their Midst. Unity with others could be called group mysticism along with being individual. Barclay claimed the Inward Life was “the cement by which we are joined to the Lord and to one another.” (Proposition XI, Section VII) Waiting upon the Presence is mystical, with the Lord alone as master of the assembled. Since Light

³⁸⁹ *ibid.* 9-10 In Barclay's *Apology* Proposition 5 The Redemptive Seed of the Second Adam is joined with Proposition 6 The Saving and Spiritual Light of Jesus Christ. This PhD argues that the light of Jesus Christ is universal in the world coming from the redemptive seed of the second Adam to include all past, present and future humanity; to include the deceased. (I Peter 4:6)

³⁹⁰ *ibid.* 48-9 Learning the way of communion with the body and blood of Christ was Barclay's Proposition 13. Restored communion with God is the means by which Christians live in the world with the Source of Unity and create unity. This comes by purification of the heart by the Holy Spirit which is Barclay's proposition 12. The baptism of Jesus is with the Holy Spirit and with fire in purging the heart and making light the life.

was the symbol of the Divine Presence within, the light sometimes seemed without. Illumination was concluded to be more subjective than objective.³⁹¹

Brinton asserts that confusion has been created by asserting that Quakerism is Protestantism. This has led to the abandonment of characteristic Quaker beliefs and practices in adopting Protestant beliefs and practices. While Brinton acknowledges that no doubt all non-Catholic Christians can be called Protestant, yet neither the early Quakers nor their Puritan opponents considered Quakerism a form of Protestantism. Instead, the rise of Quakerism was a second Reformation as a protest against Protestantism, a new dawning of the Day of the Lord, and an attempt to return to original Christianity. Brinton asserts that Robert Barclay speaks of Catholicism, Protestantism, and Quakerism as three forms of Christianity. Catholicism depends on the authority of the Church, Protestantism depends on the authority of the Bible, and Quakerism depends on the authority of the Spirit. Catholics considered the church as potentially the Kingdom of God and Protestants thought that in this evil world, the perfection of the Kingdom was impossible except beyond the grave. Quakers believed that any person acting according to “the measure” given them belonged to the Kingdom of God now. This included living according to the Sermon on the Mount and its impractical standard of pacifism. The words of Jesus presented fulfillment to the Catholic Saint and the Quaker in the world but not of it. In practice Quakers were like the Catholics in that Deity was felt Presence.³⁹²

³⁹¹ *ibid.* 49-50 The Light of Christ is Christ, in Barclay's portrayal of the sun and the rays. The transcendent essence and immanent energy is core to Orthodox Christianity. The New Covenant includes Christ's presence within (Revelation 3:20) and without (Hebrews 1:3). In apostolic order the Jerusalem Council was led by the Holy Spirit (Acts 15:28) which is uniform through the 7 Ecumenical Councils concluding in 787 CE. Barclay claims that the church was derailed by scholasticism from the seventh or eighth century to the 16th century until the Quakers restored gospel order and the ancient apostolic order. Jesus as the second Adam (Romans 5:18) and light of the world (John 1:9) is manifest through the Gospel being taken to the end of the age (Matthew 20:20) and earth (Romans 10:14-18; Revelation 14:6). The law is put into the Jews mind and written on their hearts (Hebrews 8:10) and the Holy Spirit witnesses to the Gentiles "*I will put My laws into their hearts, and in their minds I will write them.*" (Hebrews 10:15-16).

³⁹² *ibid.* 52-3 Brinton affirms that Barclay understood Quakerism as not Catholic or Protestant but aligns with the felt Presence in Catholicism. Brinton also maintains that Quakers and the Catholic saint realized the teachings of Jesus in this life. Protestants are non-mystical by limiting the life of the Spirit to Scripture text. Protestants are non-authoritarian by rejecting the Pope as sole apostle in apostolic succession. Quakers identified with the Head of the Body to be the

Protestantism until recently was a thoroughly masculine religion while Catholicism and Quakerism are both masculine and feminine. Calvinist creeds condemned a person for no crime other than being a reprobate descendent of Adam. Catholics included veneration of Mary. Nuns were important in the church. In the Society of Friends men and women were equal in ministry. Barclay in joining Propositions V and VI on the redemptive seed of the second Adam and the universal and saving Light of Jesus Christ maintains that every human before and after Christ has received a measure of the Spirit sufficient for salvation.³⁹³

Brinton affirms that Quakers were quietists in their origin and in the 18th century. Quietism however does not mean being quiet. It means that the “natural man” becomes quiet to permit the Divine Light to enter the soul uncontaminated by human element. Rufus Jones used the word pure as a sign of quietism, but “pure” means the Divine unmixed with the human. John Woolman never uses the term “Inward Light” but that which is pure or pure wisdom (James 3:17). Fox’s quietism had much in common with Barclay’s writing regarding the ruinous state of “natural man” who, if unaided finds himself incapable of knowing divine truth. Jones attributes Quaker Quietism to Barclay’s hard distinction between the Divine and human. The dualism between the Divine and human creates a choice between “the natural” and “the spiritual.” Hopelessness of depraved man brings on Calvinistic predestination, while good in man brings choice. The gulf between flesh and spirit is bridged by choosing the good. According to Barclay, rebirth is the means by which “we are made

Lord Jesus Christ, and the Spirit to provide guidance in prayer, counsel in decisions, and comfort through trials. The essence and energy distinction of God and the Spirit leading through the Fathers and Ecumenical Councils is core to Eastern Christianity and is uniform with Quakerism. Also, critical to this PhD argument is that justification through Quaker Christianity comes by Christ indwelling, over the infusion of the Catholic sacraments, and the imputed Protestant believe-ism (if you are of the elect). Quakers join with Eastern Christians in proclaiming ‘Christ is in our Midst!’ with response ‘He is and ever shall be!’ Jesus Christ indwells all through his Seed for the purpose of inhabitation by faith unto theosis

³⁹³ *ibid.* 54 By Scripture proof-text the Protestant affirms women to be a secondary Christian (I Corinthians 14:34-35; I Timothy 2:12-15). From the words of Jesus Mary is to be honored as his mother (John 19:25-27). According to Paul’s words to the Galatian population, those baptized into Christ have put on Christ and no longer separate male from female (Galatians 3:25-29). Christ restores the original creation of “*male and female created He them*” (Genesis 1:27). The Ark of the New Covenant being Mary (Revelation 12:1-6) brings together the place of God, woman, and man (Luke 1:26-38) in overcoming the evil one and reestablishing God’s eternal Kingdom. *Christos Victor* is the path of Orthodox Christianity and Quakerism and *Christos Victim* is the path of the Catholic and Calvinist expressions.

partakers of the divine nature” (II Peter 1:4). This is a long way from the fatalism of Barclay’s Calvinist upbringing and the Original Sin of his Catholic education. Union with God is not an achievement of Christian identity but is organic union between branch and [V]ine. Barclay affirms with Paul that we are saved by Christ as brought forth in the heart.³⁹⁴

Brinton claims that there is an increase of intellectualism in modern Quakerism, but reason and spiritual intuition function better together than separate. He points to Barclay who says that reason like conscience can be inspired as well as uninspired.³⁹⁵ Britain continues that George Fox speaks of Christ as possessing the Spirit without limit. This was Fox creating a rational Christology as explanation of Christ’s being both God and man. This does not detract from the uniqueness of Christ. Jesus is unique in that in him was the full measure of Light. Jesus was the firstborn of many brethren (Romans 8:29). When Jesus says “I am the light of the World,” he speaks as one in whom the Light has reached its climax. He is the prototype of man [as second Adam], the highest form of

³⁹⁴ *ibid.* 56-7 Christos Victor opens the way for the restoration of humanity, including women and creation (Romans 8:19-23; Jeremiah 31:26-28). Confession and repentance in quietism coincides with the baptism of the Spirit (Matthew 3:11; 12:30-32). The place of the Spirit of Pentecost is one in which the restoration of all things can materialize (Acts 2:14-39; I Corinthians 15:28). Barclay coincides with the Apostle Paul in that Christ indwells all for the purpose of inhabitation (Colossians 1:27-29, Galatians 2:20, 4:19; II Corinthians 13:5). Quietism in the East is pronouncedly different from the West according to the writing of Lorenzo Scupoli (1530-1610) as edited by Nicodemus of the Holy Mountain (1749-1809) in his work *Unseen Warfare*, SVS Press, 2000, page 23. Hesychasm is quietism but has little in common with the 17th century West. It is a form of spiritual discipline based on the Fathers meant to bring the soul to a state of repose in God. The Jesus prayer is the essential part and eventually dominates the whole personality through the heart. Its final stage is spiritual action where the flame of grace brings forth the ‘light’ of Mount Tabor in and through the person. Eastern quietism is the end for which I argue Barclay’s ‘True Christian Divinity’ corresponds. Barclay emphasizes the word ‘JESUS’ in Proposition 11 on worship and the Kingdom of the Father (Matthew 13:43) to be realized in Propositions 14 and 15.

³⁹⁵ *ibid.* 62 The conflict between science and spirituality is made real through the prince of the power of the air and Jesus Christ come in the flesh. The conflict is resolved by Grace through faith unto the works God prepared beforehand that we should walk in (Ephesians 2:1-10). We are brought near God’s kingdom by the blood of Christ to be the dwelling place of God in the Spirit. (Ephesians 2:11-22) Barclay claims that scholasticism plagued the church from the 8th through the 16th centuries until the Quakers broke free from Scholastic trappings. Reason, more than the conscience, restricted the movement of the Spirit when man acted solely according to Rene Descartes limits. This simply was but a shadow of what God intended through the coming of the Incarnation and the sending of the Spirit. Christianity needed shaken from the restrictions of the Puritans, the regimentation of the State Church Anglican - Catholic, and the Quakers shook Christianity into the life God intended. The use of apophatic-negative and kataphatic-positive language is necessary to make way for the indescribable essence and ‘describable energy’ in theosis.

created life [the incarnation] that has yet appeared. Brinton considers that even the most rational friend should have no difficulty accepting his Christology.³⁹⁶

Brinton continues that in the Gospel according to John all persons share in the *Logos* of God from within our person. Brinton considers Light to be a symbol more than reality in quoting “The Light which enlightens every man” (John 1:9) is one Light, the same in all persons though having different “measures”. The Light is community-creating and seeks to bring all into community though, so far unsuccessfully. This means that creation is not yet complete but does indicate the goal of creation. Brinton affirms that it is the Inward Light that unites us with God and one another. Brinton affirms again that Barclay says “this is the cement by which we are joined as to the Lord, so to one another” (Proposition XI, Section VII). The two commandments which Jesus says sums up the Law and the Prophets “Thou shalt love the Lord thy God” and “Thou shalt love thy neighbor as thyself,” are sides of the same coin. The love Paul speaks in I Corinthians 13:5, as “seeking not our own,” includes agape love between brother and sister.³⁹⁷

Brinton looks to Josiah Royce, an idealist surrounding the Absolute Community of Communities of the Kingdom of Heaven. Royce’s religion is a loyalty of loyalties within a community in which one identifies a cause representing the self to which one aspires. This is the Kingdom of God, “a city out of sight” which can never be realized in history. While the atonement theory that Christ’s death was an offering to appease an angry Father is too harsh, so also is the theory that Christ’s death did not reconcile man fully to himself. Royce held that man must be reconciled both to God and to self. Christ death did usher in the Kingdom and was the beginning of a community animated by his

³⁹⁶ *ibid.* 65. Proposition V The Redemptive Seed of the second Adam is joined with Proposition VI The Universal and Saving Light of Jesus Christ. This bridges the eternal Word of God become incarnate in taking on the fallen condition of man so as to save man through Christianity. The oneness of the Father and the Son, and the oneness of the Son and the Spirit become the oneness of the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit in whom the Christian is baptized and lives. This is healing Grace more than vicarious grace.

³⁹⁷ *ibid.* 70-1 The New Covenant through the initiative of the Incarnation, light, and Spirit find uniformity with the prelapsarian life of Adam and Eve as they walked with the LORD God in the garden (Genesis 3:8). The purifying nature remedies the inherited condition of fallen Adam by which we are restored to the original relationship between God and man. This reverses 70 times 7 retribution (Genesis 4:23-24) to 70 times 7 forgiveness (Matthew 18:21-35; 5:38-48).

Spirit. The Creeds of the Church leave the incarnation and atonement a mystery, and miracle beyond comprehension. Jesus Christ is declared to be fully God and fully man. However early Greek Fathers Clement and Origen, like Meister Eckhart and the early Quakers held with Royce that the incarnation and the atonement were not irrational, and had roots in human experience. Robert Barclay, versed in the history of Christianity believed that the “celestial city” could be felt, mystically experienced, and entered ‘in measure’ by those who live in accordance with the commands of Jesus.³⁹⁸

To be “perfect” in the Quaker sense meant to live up to one’s “measure” of Light. As one lived up to their measure, more was given. As long as anyone lived up to their measure, however small, one obeyed the command of Jesus “*Be ye perfect as the Heavenly Father is perfect*” (Matthew 5:48). Living as if you were in the kingdom would not bring it about, but would cause its advance. The crucifixion and resurrection was reenacted by the crucifixion of fleshly desires and the resurrection of the new creation, a rebirth through the Spirit.³⁹⁹ Brinton continues that fighting any war is contrary to the teachings of Jesus and the teaching of early Christians, especially the Greek Fathers. The Latin Fathers departed from this teaching. Brinton contends that the Greek mystical philosophy

³⁹⁸ *ibid.* 75-6 Royce brings together the Incarnation, his death, his resurrection, and God's kingdom ushered in through the Spirit. The Spirit inhabits Christ's body, the Church and is the hope of the World. This is broader than the Jewish expectation and is inclusive of the Gentile population. Theology rightly understood comes by experience. The teachings and commands of Jesus reveal the heart of God. If the gospel isn't social, it's not the gospel. Theology is experience is the core teaching of Eastern Christianity.

³⁹⁹ *ibid.* 77. Barclay does not back down from the topic of perfection. The critical flow of perfection comes through proposition seven on indwelling ongoing justification, proposition eight on perfection, and proposition nine on perseverance. The perfection brought on by restoration from Original Sin to ancestral sin (proposition four); by propositions five & six on the redemptive seed of the second Adam and the universal light of Jesus Christ ushers in proposition seven on the seed in fertile soil leading to the perfection of the Father in proposition eight by perseverance in the measure received in proposition nine. This flows into a life of ministry (proposition 10) coinciding with joint worship with the assembled (proposition 11). The baptism of Jesus with the Spirit in the heart (proposition 12) makes room for communion with the body and blood of Jesus Christ in the heart (proposition 13). This coincides with the universal new covenant witness of Jesus Christ indwelling all humanity as light with liberty of conscience (proposition 14) concluding with Jesus Christ and his kingdom being established according to the perfection and mercy of the Father (proposition 15).

and the Latin pragmatic philosophy are still at odds. This remains the difference between the Greek Orthodox and the Roman Catholics today.⁴⁰⁰

Brinton concludes that early Quakers did not use the word sensitivity, as it referred only to the senses. They used the word tender. A person who joined the Quaker movement was described as becoming tender, not “converted.” “Conversion” meant a long process, with backward steps as well as forward steps, but becoming “tender” meant acquiring the ability to mature spiritually and to increase one’s measure of light.⁴⁰¹

In summary Robert Barclay’s theology has been influential and controversial throughout the whole of Quakerism. His epistemology concerning the Light of Jesus Christ as incarnate Word in relation to sacred scripture has been a problem with Reformation Protestants. His position on total depravity has been confused with Augustine and John Calvin’s ‘Original Sin’ which he rejected. The result being a view of God’s sovereignty contrary to God as Father, Son and Holy Spirit, and the Person of the incarnation. This PhD argues that had Barclay not been born in the Western conflict of war, regicide, imprisonments, and martyrdom he would have looked further than the West Roman Catholic, Church of England, and the variant Protestant expressions in his development of ‘True Christian Divinity’. In his short 42 years his collective defense of Quaker ‘True Christian Divinity’ was publically affirmed by Quakers and was a problem to the variant Protestant expressions, his

⁴⁰⁰ *ibid.* 92-3 Quaker Christianity does not align with Protestant Puritanism due to their exclusive adherence to the Word of God written, nor do they align with the scholasticism of the Latin pragmatic West. Salvation life centers in the mystical Greek East with its emphasis on hesychast prayer and Theosis: God became man so that man might become G[g]od. This is humanity becoming the perfection of the Father by Grace. This Grace is indwelling through Jesus Christ who became incarnate, living the will of God through suffering, and once made perfect became the source of eternal salvation as priest in the order of Melchizedek (Hebrews 5:5-11). Seeing the Kingdom is becoming as light as on Mount Tabor. (Matthew 17:1-5; Mark 9:1-7; Luke 9:27-35)

⁴⁰¹ *ibid.* 93 Tender is the opposite of hardened. Reception to the light within made Christians children of the light (Ephesians 5:8-14), no longer walking in darkness (Ephesians 4:17-24). Tender represents a posture of receptivity whereby God is received and God’s gift of faith exercised to the measure received. Faith is the means of pleasing God through relationship restored (Hebrews 11). Senses are subjective and focus on the outward while tender respects the Presence of Christ within by opening the door for communion Rev 3:20. (Revelation 3:20). Brinton resists the overemphasis on the outward incarnation of Jesus Christ at the minimizing of the Presence of the glorified Jesus Christ within (Hebrews 9:28). This is why he argues for Christianity coming from the Gospel according to John as primary to a scholastic interpretation of the Gospel to the Hebrews. This reader of Howard Brinton appreciates his emphasis as it culminates in the life of a saint (Hebrews 11:1-12:29).

six years as governor of East Jersey speak of his leadership, and his advisory status with Kings Charles II and James II reveal a statesman valued for his wisdom.

Grubb maintains that the Quakers were an antidote to the libertines of their time because of being children of the light. The Light grounding Quakers was one with the resurrected and glorified Jesus Christ within. The Orthodox throughout history have understood this in terms of the essence and energy of God. The apostle Paul referred to this as '*Christ within, the hope of glory*'. George Fox bore witness to the Inner Light in clear moral judgments and developing moral experiences, and Barclay affirmed Quakerism as '*the best way to become a Christian*'. This is Orthodox deification. Fox and Barclay held that the resurrected Light of Christ was given in measure to all. In answer to the libertines in 1776 Barclay's prior work of 1774 '*the Anarchy of the Ranters the hierarchy of the Romanists refuted*' concluding with '*the Gospel and ancient apostolic order restored through the Quakers*' was renamed '*Robert Barclay's Book of Government*'. This is affirmation that Barclay was proactive rather than reactive, an indirect affirmation of the Gospel and Tradition as maintained by the East, and an affirmation of Robert Barclay in his understanding of Christian governance between Protestant license and Papal authority. Grubb concludes that the Protestant element in the Jersey Colonies recognized the Quakers as a different type of Christian, naming them Quakers and themselves Christian.

Neave Brayshaw affirmed the inward rule of Jesus Christ and the Spirit of Pentecost while the Protestant affirms the outward rule of scripture. Herbert G Wood notes a criticism of an outsider who says that individuals coming to truth in Quakerism are allowed theological haziness in measure. The individual is free to navigate their position in measure while the Body accommodates their progress. Quaker Christianity begins with the anthropology of Jesus Christ '*as you do it to the least of these my brothers, you do it unto me*' which allows for one to formalize their faith or non-faith, and another to mature in theosis in mutual respect and full trust in God. Brayshaw recounts Isaac

Crewdson (c.1835) as the first ‘Evangelical Friend’ to dismiss the Inward Light for the work of Jesus Christ (0-33 A.D.) as defined by Scripture Rule. The result was movement away from Jesus Christ meeting with his Body, and movement toward Puritan believe-ism and an arbitrary sovereignty of God.

Rufus Jones claimed that Christian nominalism came into Quaker meeting thorough Catholic Counter-Reformation works of Molinos, Guyon and Fenelon. He presents the editorial work of William Backhouse and James Janson in 1813 with multiple republishing as fueling Quakers as Quietists in diminishment of the Light of Jesus Christ. Backhouse and Janson added over 100 scripture references to the Quietists quotes. Counter-reformation Quietism and scripture quotes are different from Eastern Christianity proper and monasticism. With the sacramental life of Catholic Jansenism being the mainstay of Quakers, and the Augustinian view of Original Sin, Quakers were ripe to move toward Neo-Platonism as more hopeful. Jones places the predicament of Friends squarely on the shoulders of Robert Barclay. Barclay’s doctrine of total depravity and his epistemology of inner revelation coupled with the Jansenist position on the sacraments raised questions of Barclay’s ‘True Christian Divinity’. This ushered in Hannah Barnard’s joining Quaker on her 18th birthday day (1772) from her Baptist background. Her Puritan experience must have mirrored George Fox and Robert Barclay. Her conversion from Baptist beginnings reveals someone uninformed in Christian other than by proof-text. Barnard’s censure at meeting thirty years later (1802) reveals the need for the ‘come and see’ living tradition of the dead Church Father’s to reveal Christian life. The only training mentioned was memorization of Barclay’s Catechism. Scripture study was feared to usurp Divine guidance rather than finding its place within Tradition with the lives of Saints leading the way. John Wesley (1738) stated he would rather be a Deist than a Quaker. Joseph Gurney Bevan (1805) made the litmus test of orthodox Christianity was the truths of the Bible and whether one received the divine sanction of the Jewish wars. The Person of the

incarnation revealing the way and life of the Father was absent. Luke Howard, Isaac Crewdson and Rufus Jones all in their words rejected Robert Barclay and his epistemology. Hannah Barnard maintained the doctrine of the inward Light as articulated by Robert Barclay. The Barnard controversy produced a deep chasm between evangelicals and Quakers. Different epistemologies with different outcomes conflicted. This PhD argues that an incomplete economy of salvation contributed to well-meaning people being at odds.

Howard Brinton claims the Quakers are mystics, are not Protestant, and remained activists rather than quietists. He re-centers Quakerism within the Gospel of Jesus Christ according to John. While he doesn't disagree with the blood and transcendence of Hebrews, John's Gospel reveals maturity. Fox, Barclay, and Penn were all proponents of John's gospel. The relationship between the vine and the branches; the inward and the outward are affirmed. John 1:9 represents the eternal *Logos*, the eternal Word become flesh as Light of the world as the Quaker text. Calvinist Puritans rejected the 'Gentile Gospel' embraced by Quakers. Brinton points to Bernard of Clairvaux and the Catholic Jansenist leaning Augustine Baker as sympathetic and comparable to Quaker practice. Rather than returning to the monastic cell, Quakers reengaged the world. Living according to the measure realized the Kingdom of God in the now. Catholics and Quakers were alike in the felt Presence. Catholics venerated Mary and affirmed nuns. Quakers affirmed male-female egalitarian with being clothed with Christ. Jesus as Light was born an infant and grew in favor with God and man. In suffering and resurrecting he became the source of eternal salvation for everyone. Living according to the commands of Jesus ushers in the Kingdom. Becoming tender was the Quaker means of 'conversion'. For this researcher, becoming tender is the path of humility leading to theosis. Brinton maintains that the Quakers identified with the position of the Greek Fathers and the early Christians in relation to military violence.

Methodological approach

Bernard Lonergan (1904-1984) who argued for a 14th through 16th century clarification in the 13th century writing of Thomas Aquinas⁴⁰² provides a way forward in a research method for Barclay's theology. In the introduction to his dissertation Lonergan reveals Aquinas working into a synthesis the speculative theorems discovered by his predecessors of the previous eight centuries. It is looking backward rather than forward which revealed the development of Aquinas' mind. It suggests that research of Aquinas be systematic of the whole and not incidental of the individual if one is to move beyond the impasse three centuries had produced.⁴⁰³

For Lonergan, it was necessary that a study of Aquinas (1225-1274) be systematic, centered on Aquinas' prior interests in order to discover a scientific conclusion in which an inductive search could terminate. Without the integral unity of Aquinas' comprehensive thought postulated, an inquiry into Aquinas' central argument could not be realized.⁴⁰⁴ Lonergan puts the confusion of Aquinas' thought in the minds of later readers in context by saying that the Molinist conclusion and the Bannezian conclusion of the 14th – 16th centuries had ruled out the central point for which Aquinas had been arguing, creating an impasse for later readers.⁴⁰⁵

While the Lonergan method solves the interpretation problem, its use makes extreme demands on the reader. It involves the exposition and use of the theory of the history of theological speculation. It postulates a capacity to see in several hundred pages a single argument with a major in the theory of development, and a minor in the number of facts. Lonergan, while apologizing for the use of so complicated a procedure, saw no other alternative. A study of Aquinas cannot be but historical. A

⁴⁰² Lonergan, Bernard. *Collected Words of Bernard Lonergan: Grace and Freedom: Operative Grace in the Thought of St Thomas Aquinas*, University of Toronto Press, 2013 edition.

⁴⁰³ *ibid.*, 155

⁴⁰⁴ *ibid.*

⁴⁰⁵ *ibid.*

historical study cannot be but inductive. An inductive conclusion, though it may be certain when negative, can for the most part be no more than probable when positive. If the probability is to be, not an opinion, but a scientific conclusion, no other method than the speculative method adopted by Lonergan appeared possible.⁴⁰⁶

A chronological exegesis of Robert Barclay's collective Works using the Lonergan Method in Theology⁴⁰⁷ will demonstrate that Barclay's 'true Christian divinity' aligns with the salvation concept of Theosis in Eastern Orthodoxy that 'humanity becomes by "Grace indwelling" what God is by nature' more than with the imputed righteousness of the later Protestants or the infused righteousness of the Roman Catholic West. Lonergan claimed that without the integral unity of Aquinas' comprehensive thought postulated, inquiry into Aquinas' central argument could not be realized. Lonergan was not concerned with the implications of his position, the ulterior development of his position, or even the defense of his position. Lonergan analyzed what Aquinas said, why Aquinas said it, and what Aquinas meant in saying it. It was a conclusion of what was foremost in Aquinas' mind.

Lonergan defines 'method' as a normative pattern of recurrent and related operations yielding cumulative and progressive results. This is a method of distinct operations, each operation related to

⁴⁰⁶ *ibid*, 155-6

⁴⁰⁷ Lonergan, Bernard. *Method in Theology*, University of Toronto Press, 1971, 2013 edition. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.' 2016, ii. Dales' thesis explores the thought of John William Graham (1859-1932) in the context of changes that took place in the Society of Friends in Britain during the late nineteenth century and early twentieth centuries. It considers the ways in which some of the challenges to religious faith in general and to Quakerism in particular arising at that time were reflected in the sensibility of one highly intelligent Quaker who gave largely of his time and energy to grappling with the problems and grasping at the opportunities for renewed vision. The best methodological comparison, to the waxing and waning of Barclay's outdated works, is the PhD work of Joanna Clare Dales. Dales demonstrates that Graham rejects Evangelicalism (Protestantism) in Quaker Practice. The nature of Dales' work with Graham (1859-1932) has similarities with my work with Barclay (1648-1690). Graham's rejection of Evangelical Protestantism is commensurate with Barclay's rejection of Puritan Protestantism two centuries earlier. Though not uniform, there are similarities in Dales' method with Graham with my use of the Lonergan method with Barclay, in which both Barclay and Graham reject the praxis of Protestantism. Dales' depiction of Graham's faith and practice will follow Barclay's faith and practice throughout the dissertation where relevant to the argument.

the other operations, the set of relations forming a pattern, the pattern described as the right way of doing the job, and the operations in accord with the pattern are repeated indefinitely of which the fruit of such repetition are not repetitious, but cumulative, and progressive.

This argument will be written so as to demonstrate the sequential nature of Barclay's thought through the dating of his writing in the footnotes to coincide with the development of his thought in the text. Repetition of thought, both in Barclay's writing over his period of time (1670-1679) along with exegesis of his thought over the course of his life, is intentional to demonstrate that Barclay's apologetic rejects what becomes reformed Protestantism and instead aligns with the concept of Theosis in Eastern Orthodoxy. At the beginning of each of the Barclay chapters will be a discussion of what Barclay scholars have drawn from Barclay with the conclusion comprising perspective from Orthodox scholars, the intent being to demonstrate through the Lonergan method that Barclay's theological center is the 'indwelling Grace' of the Orthodox East rather than the 'imputed or infused righteousness' of the Reformed Protestant (Roman Catholic) West.

To achieve this it has been my sole intent over the last nine years (2012-2021) to read and dictate Barclay's three volumes of works, rewrite all three volumes in a chronological and exegetical manner, break the three volumes into sequential quotes, summarize every quote, footnote every quote, and provide headings to every quote using the Lonergan method. Once this was completed the compilation of each 'quote' was put into one or more of 21 categories: Barclay, Quaker, Theosis; Revelation, Tradition, Scripture; Saints/Fathers, Reformers, Commentary; Essence, Energy, Communion; Perfection, Purification, Baptism; Condition, Witness, Call; Kingdom, Ministry, and Testimony. To manage the final writing, the 21 categories were limited to 5 core chapters as the focus of the thesis. The five chapters are: The Saints and Fathers, The Essence and Energy of God, The Purification of the Christian, The Universal Call of God, and The Testimony of the Saint. The nature of the research and writing has been comprehensive of the whole rather than

distinctive of the individual throughout the whole of the dissertation by using the Lonergan method to accomplish the researcher's objective. It was in years 10 and 11 (2021-2) that Barclay scholarship was given detailed consideration. The final draft includes the Barclay and Orthodox scholarship to coincide with the holistic writing of the individual in Barclay.

Concerning the transcendental aspect of the Lonergan method, research began well before my 2012 acceptance into the PhD program. My heart sense was that the Christianity of my Quaker youth had never been fully expressed in the various institutions of study and professional positions I had held (b. 1963). Lonergan states that the transcendental method heightens one's consciousness by objectifying one's conscience. The objectification of the conscience consists of experiencing, understanding, judging, and deciding. These operations are conscious and intentional. Their application is (1) experiencing one's experiencing, understanding, judging, and deciding, (2) understanding the unity and relation of one's experienced experiencing, understanding, judging, and deciding, (3) affirming the reality of one's experienced and understood experiencing, understanding, judging, and deciding and (4) deciding to operate in accord with the norms in the relatedness of one's experienced, understood, and affirmed experiencing, understanding, judging, and deciding.

The transcendental journey with Robert Barclay over the past ten years (2012-2022) has proven to me that what Barclay was in fact proving was the salvation concept of Theosis at the heart of Eastern Orthodox Christianity. To a great degree I am not interpreting what Barclay is saying as much as demonstrating through a chronological and exegetical reading of Barclay's collective thought that what Barclay was proving was in direct opposition to Barclay's conclusion that his '*True CHRISTIAN Divinity*' [emphasis Barclay] was the end of reformed Western Roman Catholic Christianity. Instead Barclay demonstrates Eastern Orthodox Theosis.

The transcendental and empirical research, coinciding with the analytical research included numerous visits to Divine Liturgy at the St George Orthodox Cathedral in Wichita, Kansas, US and at the Serbian Orthodox Church in Birmingham, UK. It included a 10 day visit to the St John the Baptist Orthodox Monastery in Essex, UK. It included an expanding library of over 100 books on Orthodoxy purchased sequentially over that period of time. It included attendance at every Orthodox session possible at the American Academy of Religion during my 7 years of attendance.

The introductory chapter raises the question of why Robert Barclay's 'true Christian divinity' is incongruent with Quakers who identify as Protestant Christians. It has defined the key ideas related to Eastern Orthodox Christianity and Reformed Protestant Christianity, it has summarized the conclusions of recent Barclay scholarship, it has summarized the speculative, exegetical, empirical, and transcendental nature of the Bernard Lonergan Method in Theology as preparation for the historical context in chapter two in which Barclay defines 'true Christian divinity' from the perspective of a childhood Puritan, a young adult trained Roman Catholic apologist, and now Quaker.

CHAPTER 2: Historical Context in which Barclay defines ‘True Christianity Divinity’

INTRODUCTION: Carole Spencer, in her groundbreaking work *Holiness: the Soul of Quakerism*, argues that ‘The Christian church took *eight centuries* to *work out* basic formulations of humanity and divinity of Christ and ideas of Theosis, so it is hardly surprising that Quakers, unsophisticated as they were theologically, would have difficulties in expressing what is essentially the paradoxical “Christian mystery”’.¹ The question to be explored in this chapter is to assess the *working out* of Theosis in Barclay’s experience. [emphasis mine]

To demonstrate the *long term* nature of Theosis, Norman Russell, in his Oxford doctoral dissertation submitted in 1988, the fruit of *twenty years* of study and research, describes the topic of theosis for the Eastern church: ‘No formal definition occurs until the *sixth century*, when Dionysius the Areopagite declares: “Deification is the attaining of likeness to God and union with him so far as possible”’.² It was in the *seventh century* that Maximus the Confessor (c. 580-662) dealt with Theosis as a theological topic. In like manner with Russell and Maximus this dissertation explores the late Robert Barclay’s 17th century soteriology as a theological topic for the 21st century. To date, no other theologian has named early Quaker theology as ‘theosis’ other than Spencer and no one has explored Robert Barclay’s theology in light of this claim. [emphasis mine]

¹ Spencer, Carole Dale. *Holiness: The Soul of Quakerism*, Paternoster-Wipf & Stock Press, Eugene, OR, 2008, 50-51. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.’ 2016, 85. Graham remained to the end of his days the ‘Quaker Apostle of Progress’ by virtue of clinging to a Victorian world-view. The reason for this tendency in Graham may be connected with the fact that he developed his Quaker theology in reaction against evangelicalism. He seized on the tools that came readily at hand during the 1880s to construct a system of belief robust enough to stand as a viable alternative to evangelicalism, and then clung to these tools. Two centuries earlier Robert Barclay stood opposed to a Puritan Christianity which had developed into a scientific predeterminism and election on one hand, and a Christianity of infusion on the other hand. The Quaker path of the Christian faith provided the best way to become a Christian that Barclay found amongst all alternatives of his time. This PhD argues that what Barclay discovered was Eastern Orthodox Christianity centered in the experience of Christ indwelling leading to theosis.

² Russell, Norman. *The Doctrine of Deification*, 2004, 1.

Robert Barclay encounters Quakerism as a Christian sect 1663-1667

To consider the theme of theosis, amongst the Quakers, this thesis will demonstrate that its earliest systematic theologian, Robert Barclay (1648-1690), offers a definition of and theology of theosis consistent with the Eastern Orthodox Church. Barclay's conversion to Quakerism comes in the year 1667 following his father, David Barclay's public acknowledgment in 1666.³ The first writing Barclay completes is on 2nd Month, 19th Day, Year 1670,⁴ a response to a minister in Aberdeen named William Mitchell and his brethren who have been both writing, and preaching against the people called Quakers from the pulpit.

Barclay picks up on a conversation begun in 1663 between the Bishop of Aberdeen and a Quaker, Alexander Jaffray, in a paper entitled *The State of the Controversy between the Protestants and the*

³ Trueblood, Elton. *Robert Barclay*, 1968, 25. Robert Barclay's father David Barclay encountered Quaker Christianity while in prison in 1665 and publically communicated his conversion in 1666. Barclay's rejection of Puritan Christianity and defense of Quaker Christianity would be picked up in 1670 from an argument initiated in 1662. Robert Barclay's conversion to Quaker Christianity in 1667 followed his search for true Christian divinity begun in 1663. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.' 2016, 87-8. D.W. Bebbington, in *Evangelicalism in Modern Britain: a History from the 1730s to the 1980s* and *The Dominance of Evangelicalism: the Age of Spurgeon and Moody*, defines evangelicalism in terms of four characteristic and persistent emphases: they are 'Bible, Cross, Conversion, Activism'. In distancing themselves from evangelicals, modernising Quakers dwelt most on the Cross, or rather, theories of atonement, and the Bible: the nature and extent of its authority. I show how Graham's active campaigning against the acceptance of the Richmond Declaration, or 'creed', by London Yearly Meeting, and his visits to American Friends, especially that of 1896, were stages in a campaign to establish a form of Quakerism free from the 'errors' introduced notably by Joseph John Gurney (1788-1847). I show how Graham's enduring opposition to evangelicalism coloured his theology, as expressed particularly in *The Faith of a Quaker* (1920) and *The Divinity in Man* (1927). In all this I emphasise his position as 'Apostle of progress': evangelicalism was, for Graham, on many counts an obstacle to progress, a demon to be exorcised before either the Society of Friends or the wider society could move forward to its divinely appointed goal. In like manner, Barclay's argument for 'the true Christian Divinity' beginning with his continued dialogue with the writing of the 1662 paper *The State of the Controversy between the Protestants and the Quakers*, published in 1663 is consistent with Graham's rejection of a Western framework centered in theological intellectualism, nominalism, and limited Christian experience. Barclay deals with the nature of God, the reality of the cross, the nature of becoming Christian through Christ indwelling, the nature of living as a Christian by the Spirit, and places scripture in its proper context.

⁴ Barclay's Works I, 'Truth cleared of Calumnies: wherein a book, entitled "A dialogue between a Quaker and a stable Christian," (printed at Aberdeen, and, upon good ground, judged to be writ by William Mitchell, a preacher near it,) is examined, and the disingenuity of the author, in his representing the Quakers, is discovered, their case truly stated, cleared, demonstrated, and the objections of their opposers answered, according to truth, Scripture, and right reason'. (Ury, 2nd Month, 19th Day, Year 1670), 1692, 1831 edition, 121-2.

Quakers.⁵ An exchange had taken place between George Mildrum, William Mitchell and the brethren of the Aberdeen Presbyterian episcopacy⁶ with Quakers Alexander Jaffray and George Keith (1638-1716). The conversation did little to keep the Presbyterians and Episcopalians from preaching against the Quakers in 1666.⁷ The exchange had grown stagnant for two years prior to William Mitchell⁸ and his brethren putting forth a document referred to by Mitchell as ‘a Dialogue’. The problem was that the ‘Dialogue’ had become one-sided and much of what had been communicated by Quakers Alexander Jaffray, George Keith, and Patrick Livingston in previous communications was superficially represented in Mitchell’s response. The omission of the substance of Jaffray, Keith and Livingston’s communications, coupled with the persecution and imprisonment of the Quakers due in part to Mitchell and his brethren’s preaching provides the context for Barclay’s 1670 response.⁹

⁵ Barclay’s Works I, *Truth Cleared of Calumnies*, 123-5. Preaching against the Quakers had begun in Aberdeen up until the year 1663 when 30 queries were sent by the Bishop of Aberdeen to the Quakers and answered by Quakers Alexander Jaffray and George Keith. Barclay’s 1670 writing is a response beginning with the 1662 paper by antagonist George Mildrum entitled *The State of the Controversy between the Protestants and the Quakers*, published in 1663.

⁶ www.electricscotland.com/history/aberdeen/chapter11.htm accessed September, 2015. The Privy Council, for which Christians may read Archbishop Sharp, passed an Act in 1667 for the suppression of ‘Popery and Quakerism’. which began to be coupled together in political and ecclesiastical proceedings; and during the next few years the Synod of Aberdeen, with the approval of the bishop, excommunicated Jaffray and other ‘apostates’. appointed a fast on account of ‘the desertion of the truth’ by so many in this part of the land, and represented to the sheriff the propriety of putting in force against the Quakers the Act anent conventicles. In Aberdeen, Quakers were repeatedly attacked by the populace, their burial of their dead was interfered with by the authorities, such of them as were burgesses were deprived of their burgess-ship; and the Barclays and other visitors, as well as Quakers resident in the town, were thrown into prison and otherwise ill-treated. No persons were so active in stirring up the authorities against the Quakers as Menzies and Meldrum, whose Presbyterian consciences, after an Independent phase, had been strained by the enforcement of Episcopacy; and when the influence of Robert Barclay and William Penn obtained a relaxation of the repressive measures against their co-religionists, the Presbyterian party reproached the Privy Council and prelates with neglect of duty in not putting in force the laws for the repression of Quakerism.

⁷ Dobson, David. *Scottish Quakers and Early America*, Baltimore, MA: Clearfield Publishing Company, 2006, iv. The Episcopal and Presbyterian branches of the Scottish church were antagonistic toward each other, and both groups viewed the Quakers as their common enemy.

⁸ www.electricscotland.com/history/aberdeen/chapter11.htm accessed September, 2015. William Mitchell, translated to Dundee was parson of Futtie 1667-1682.

⁹ Barclay, Robert. Works I, *Truth Cleared of Calumnies*, 1670, 124-5. Barclay’s defense of Quaker Christianity is in part, response to preaching against the Quakers, persecution, and imprisonment motivated by the Protestant contingency. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.’ 2016, 89. Graham’s most succinct account of evangelicalism is given in his 1925 Swarthmore Lecture, *The Quaker Ministry*. Here he says, ‘The Evangelicals held that mankind had fallen, in Adam & Eve, into a state of ruin, that each of us was born in sin, and had, unless rescued, no prospect, after a lamentable life on earth, but everlasting torment in the undying fires of Hell; that to the rescue God in his mercy came in Jesus Christ, born of the Virgin Mary, on whose atoning merits, won by his shed

This sets up Robert Barclay's initial defense of the people called Quakers in his apologetic entitled *Truth Cleared of Calumnies*.¹⁰ It is this author's argument that the definition of theosis that follows in Robert Barclay's subsequent writings manifests itself first in this 2nd Month, Year 1670 document.

The setting for the Quakers and William Mitchell is Aberdeen, Scotland as Barclay records, 'The Lord has raised witnesses of this day of the Lord and opened in them, and unto them the light and glory thereof, and many were moved of the Lord to come into the territory of Aberdeen. This was brought about in response to the love of the seed'.¹¹ Barclay's defense is an attempt to clear the Quakers of the derogatory reputation of being unstable. The 'seed' he defends has been rejected by the Presbyterian/Episcopalian constituency in Aberdeen, 'and yet in recent times since 1663 has

blood and legally credited to the believer, he could be sure of everlasting bliss in a Heaven, exactly described in the apocalypse of John. The Trinity was central to the system. All this was miraculously revealed in the Bible, written by the finger of God, entirely free from error and above moral criticism. All of it had to be believed as a condition of salvation; and after that the rest was easy, too easy indeed under the doctrine of imputed righteousness.' This was an Aunt Sally erected by Graham to be knocked down rather than a sufficient or accurate account of evangelicalism. Graham indeed grants, in *The Faith of a Quaker*, that evangelicalism has moved away from the positions he attacks over the course of the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, to the extent that the term has lost any precise meaning. The cruel nature of the old belief system has been softened: a change that Graham attributes to 'the spirit of divine love, aided by the growth of literary and scientific knowledge'. Barclay encountered this level of zealotry from the Protestant contingency of his day. This researcher contends that what Barclay argues for is the heart of Eastern Orthodox Christianity understood through the lens of theosis.

¹⁰ Barclay, Robert. Works I, *Truth Cleared of Calumnies: wherein a book, entitled A Dialogue between a Quaker and a Stable Christian*, (Printed at Aberdeen, and upon good ground judged to be written by William Mitchell, a preacher near by it, or at least that he had the chief hand in it,) *Is Examined, and the Disingenuity of the Author in His Representing the Quakers Is Discovered. Here is also their case truly stated, cleared, demonstrated, and the objections of their oppressors answered, according to Truth, Scripture, and Right Reason*. By Robert Barclay. 'Who has believed our report, and to whom is the arm of the Lord revealed?' Isaiah 53:1; 'Ye search the Scriptures, because in them ye think to have eternal life: and they are they which testify of me; and ye will not come unto me, that ye may have life.' John 5:39-40; 'Blessed are ye, when men shall revile you and say all manner of evil against you falsely for my sake.' Matthew 5:11; 'After the way which they call heresy, so worship I the God of my fathers.' Acts 24:14; 'Prove all things, hold fast that which is good.' I Thessalonians 5:21 Philadelphia: Benjamin C Stanton, (Ury, 2nd Month, 19th Day, Year 1670), 1692, 1831 edition, 121-221. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.' 2016, ii. As a young man Graham found his faith threatened by new ideas about the natural world and the place of humankind within it, about the status and authority of the Bible, about the real existence of a spiritual world. With other Quakers of his generation he sought to renew what they saw as the essence of the teachings of George Fox and other early Friends. This meant promotion of a faith free alike of dogma and of ritual, and relying on the 'free ministry' of immediate inspiration, a faith open to new scientific thinking, and new approaches to the Bible. Graham found among early Friends assurance that true Quakerism, and therefore true Christianity, was a religion of experience; that any teaching which did not accord with experience could be discarded. Experience meant primarily what the individual found within, but it included the empirical findings of science.

¹¹ *ibid*, 123

been embraced by ‘certain professors’ who have looked beyond the interpretations of Mitchell and his brethren’.¹² The Protestants had been leaving the Presbyterians and joining the Quakers.

The concept of the ‘divine seed’ is seen by Mitchell and his brethren as difficult and dangerous. In turn Barclay sees those who oppose the Quakers by contributing to their imprisonment, as being influenced by ‘the enemy’.

For the enemy that had wrought, and was exalted in the mystery of iniquity, to darken the appearance of this day, had appeared and stirred up his ministers [Mitchell and his brethren] to resist them [the Quakers] and their testimony, by aspersing them with many gross calumnies, lies, and reproaches, as demented, distracted, bodily possessed of the devil, practicing abominations under color of being led to them by the spirit; and as to their principles: blasphemous deniers of the true Christ, of heaven, hell, angels, the resurrection of the body and day of judgment, inconsistent with magistracy [Episcopacy], nothing better than John of Leyden and his complices.¹³

To consider this level of rejection by the episcopacy, it is helpful to look at John of Leyden (1509-1536) whom Barclay references, an Anabaptist minister in Munster who, as a result of an insurrection whereby he claimed to be the ‘King of Munster’, turning the town into an Anabaptist millenarian theocracy, was captured, tortured, and executed.¹⁴ John of Leyden’s mutilated body and those of his accomplices hung from the steeple of St Lambert’s church in iron baskets for nearly 50 years until their bones were finally removed. The sentiment preached from the Protestant pulpits

¹² *ibid*, 124-5 Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.’ 2016, ii-iii. Graham came to think that the evangelicalism of some Quakers of the previous generation who had been his mentors had distorted the original Quaker message. With other young Quakers, he reacted particularly against the doctrine of salvation by the atoning sacrifice of Jesus, finding it incredible and ethically unacceptable. This researcher argues that this corresponds with the division of east from west. Western atonement in satisfying the Father’s wrath is opposite of Eastern at-one-ment in realizing the Father’s love.

¹³ *ibid*, 123 While opposed to one another, the independent preachers (later Presbytery) and the Episcopacy (COE) were united against the Quakers. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.’ 2016, 86. For John William Graham the Calvinism of Fox’s day and the evangelicalism of his own were equivalent: both strait-jackets from which essential Quakerism had to break free. He and his peers were at one with George Fox in throwing off their bonds, as Graham recites ‘[Fox’s] Journal does not tell us much of the exact nature of his spiritual and intellectual difficulties, but knowing how he went into the experience and how he came out, we shall not be far wrong in believing that he felt the whole edifice of Calvinistic belief crumbling within him. The claims of the literal Bible and the claims of the authoritative Church and its horrible Hereafter were being torn from his sensitive soul in a way, and with a suffering, which many of us do not need to have explained to us’. Like Fox and Graham, Barclay reacts to a scientific Biblical literalism that produced Calvin’s predeterminism, later adopted by the Presbytery at Westminster. He also reacts to the authoritative Church of England and their required rituals as counter-productive to Christian becoming.

¹⁴ Latourette, Kenneth S., *A History of Christianity*, Harper One, 1977, 783-4

appeared to Barclay to be placing the Quakers of Aberdeen alongside the Leyden military rebellion. The Quaker practice, Barclay challenges in a later query addressed to the inhabitants of Aberdeen sent in the 11th month of 1670, is nothing like the military invasion of Munster by John of Leyden which precipitated magisterial response but instead, is in keeping with sobriety, Godly fear, and waiting on God in edification of one another.¹⁵

Robert Barclay joins the Quaker path of the Christian faith 1667

It had been about the year 1663, the same year that Barclay had returned from the Scots College of Paris, to be with this dying mother, Katherine Gordon Barclay (1621-1663), that some sober minded professors in Aberdeen began to weigh the credibility of the Quaker message. It would have been this same year that Robert Barclay, himself, would have given consideration of the legitimacy of the people called Quakers ‘in keeping with sobriety, Godly fear, and waiting on God in edification of one another’.¹⁶ Following four years of search, Barclay would not only join the Quakers in 1667, but become their leading apologist.¹⁷ Those amongst the dissenting crowd began to see that what had

¹⁵ Barclay, Robert. Works I, *Queries to the Inhabitants of Aberdeen*, 1671/1831, 225-6.

¹⁶ Trueblood, Elton. *Robert Barclay*, vii-xi, 261-2. The recovery of and translation of ‘Barclay of Ury, Old Note Book, Robert Barclay, The Apologist’ in April, 1967 reveals the young Barclay’s ideas in his youth, the earliest being following his return from the Scots College of Paris in 1663 to attend to his dying mother. The notebook reveals his visits south of the Scottish border where he would have been exposed to the Quaker ideas. As Barclay records, ‘Many more things did pass betwixt us in our discourse as of the principle of these people viz. as concerning the light which that people bear testimony to, mainly as to its operation in the soul of humanity and what validity it is of as to man’s salvation’. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.’ 2016, iii. Graham found a ‘scientific’ justification for the old type of Quaker worship in the teachings of the Society for Psychical Research, and especially in those of Frederic Myers. Myers’ idea of the subliminal consciousness explained for Graham how the individual might receive intimations from a spirit world, denied to the conscious, waking self. This was the ground for ‘prophetic ministry’, and also for the consecrated life. Thus he developed a theology centred on the Inward Light, or Inward Voice, identified with a God active within the human personality, inspiring the individual to work for a better world. Graham’s search for an original Quaker worship this researcher argues corresponds with Barclay’s discovery of the eastern Christian apophatic knowing through the nous. The new covenant essence and energy distinction is at the heart of the inward light and voice in all humanity.

¹⁷ *ibid*, 19-20 Trueblood claims that Barclay saved the Quakers from extinction through his intellectual work that required a response from priests like William Mitchell.

been preached from the pulpits was exaggerated and scaremongering, and had left the protestant professions of Aberdeen to join the Quaker movement.

In response to the recently published *Dialogue* by William Mitchell, Robert Barclay was more than ready to defend the faith he had uncovered. One can see his spirit and intent in how he concludes the preface of *Truth Cleared of Calumnies*,

I leave thee to the perusing of the following papers, omitting those needless apologies, and flattering insinuations, usual in epistles of this kind; my end being to answer *the good in all*, and to starve, and not to feed the evil in any. And I refer myself to *that innocent and pure principle, the light of Christ Jesus in thee, which bears testimony* against all evil: that whereby thou mayst try and examine, what is here written and who are the owners of Scripture, and who are the wresters of it; which thou canst only truly discover and discern by *the Spirit*, from which the Scriptures came, even that *inward light and word of grace*, that is able to build thee up, and establish thee in the truth, unto which I recommend thee. Robert Barclay. Ury, 19th of the 2nd month, 1670.¹⁸ [emphasis mine]

Theosis is ultimately defined through Barclay's experience with the inward grace, light, and word of Christ Jesus within, and the Spirit of the scriptures.

Theosis as a soteriological concept begins with the concept of the light which reaches and invades the person. Vladimir Lossky (1903-1958) in his seminal work, *The Mystical Theology of the Eastern Church*, states "'mystical theology" denotes no more than a spirituality which expresses a doctrinal attitude. In a certain sense all theology is mystical, inasmuch as it shows forth the divine mystery: the data of revelation'.¹⁹ The sense of the divine reaching into the person was the witness of many

¹⁸ Barclay, Robert. Works I, *Truth Cleared of Calumnies*, 1670/1831, 126-7. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.' 2016, 1. 'Quaker Renaissance' is the name commonly given to the process whereby British Quakers moved from the evangelicalism which had become dominant among them during the nineteenth century towards the progressivism which has characterized them ever since. Graham's journey corresponds with Barclay's path of theosis in that the progressivism of Graham is realized through Barclay's theosis in which humanity becomes by Grace indwelling what God is by nature, uniform with prelapsarian relationship with God restored and Christian realization.

¹⁹ Lossky, Vladimir. *The Mystical Theology of the Eastern Church*, SVS Press, 1976, pg. 7. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.' 2016, 12-13. When Graham became Principal of Dalton Hall he wanted to recreate the ambience of free discussion he had enjoyed at King's. Indeed, he considered that Dalton Hall 'is Cambridge on a small scale plus Quakerism'. One of the things Graham's young charges had to do was 'to learn how they stand towards religion'. This had been a pre-occupation of Graham's during those tumultuous university years, when he underwent a crisis of faith. Curiously, it was during this time of inner conflict that Graham conceived and put into effect the project of reviving the dormant Quaker meeting at Jesus Lane, Cambridge. In Graham's sons view it was

early Friends. George Fox (1624-1691) in his breakthrough moment in 1647 discovered this when he recounts,

Now after I had received that opening from the Lord that to be bred at Oxford or Cambridge was not sufficient to fit a man to be a minister of Christ, I regarded the priests less, and looked more after the dissenting people. And among them I saw there was some tenderness, and many of them came afterwards to be convinced, for they had some openings. But as I had forsaken all the priests, so I left the separate preachers also, and those called the most experienced people; for I saw there was none among them that could speak to my condition. And when all my hopes in them and in all men were gone, so that I had nothing outwardly to help me, nor could tell what to do, then, *I heard a voice* which said, ‘There is one, even Christ Jesus, that can speak to thy condition’, and *when I heard it* my heart did leap for joy. Then the Lord let me see why there was none upon the earth that could speak to my condition, namely, that I might give him all the glory; for all are concluded under sin, and shut up in unbelief as I had been, that Jesus Christ might have the preeminence, who enlightened, and gives grace, and faith, and power. Thus, when God doth work who shall let it? And this I knew *experimentally*.²⁰ [emphasis mine]

It is significant to note that this ‘*heard a voice*’, ‘*experimentally*’ is during Fox’s 24th year of life and has been precipitated by two prior accounts. The first is recorded in his journal dated in his 11th year, 1635

When I came to 11 years of age I knew pureness and righteousness; for while a child I was taught how to walk to be kept pure. *The Lord taught me* to be faithful in all things, and to act faithfully two ways, *inwardly*, to God, and outwardly, to man; and to keep to yea and nay in all things. I never wronged man or woman in all that time; for the Lord’s power was with me and over me, to preserve me. But people had generally a love to me for my innocence and honesty (1635).²¹ [emphasis mine]

The second account is recorded as coming in his 19th year, July 9, 1643

When I came towards 19 years of age, being upon business at a fair, one of my cousins, having another professor with him, came and asked me to drink part of a jug of beer. I, being thirsty, went in with them, for I loved any who had a sense of good, or that sought after the Lord. When Christians had drunk a glass apiece, they began to drink healths, and called for more drink, agreeing together that he that would not drink should pay all. I was grieved that any who made profession of religion should offer to do so. They grieved me very much,

this project that saved his faith. Quakerism, Graham found, was a form of Christianity that could accommodate new thinking. In his student years the Religious Society of Friends in Britain was already becoming something very different from the enclosed, inward-looking body that it had been earlier in the century. Graham’s Dalton Hall years, 1886-1924, provided the academic environment in which he was able to work out his Christianity. This corresponds with Barclay working out his Christianity amongst the Quakers from the time of his exposure from 1663 to 1690.

²⁰ Nickalls, John L. *The Journal of George Fox*, Religious Society of Friends, 1975, 11.

²¹ *ibid*, 1-2

having never had such a thing put to me before by any sort of people. Wherefore I rose up, and, putting my hand in my pocket, took out a grout and laid it down upon the table before them, saying, 'If it be so, I will leave you'. So I went away; and when I had done my business returned home; but did not go to bed that night, nor could I sleep, but sometimes walked up and down, and sometimes prayed and *cried to the Lord, who said unto me*: 'Thou seest how young people go together into vanity, and old people into the earth; thou must forsake all, young and old, keep out of all, and be as a stranger unto all (1643).²² [emphasis mine]

These encounters of '*the Lord taught me*' at age 11 (1635) and '*...cried to the Lord, who said unto me*' at age 19 (1643) concluding with '*heard a voice*' in his 24th year (1647) creates the Quaker context which Robert Barclay will encounter in his 19th year (1667) at Quaker meeting,

For when I came into the *silent* assemblies of God's people, *I felt a secret power among them, which touched my heart*, and as *I gave way unto it*, I found the evil weakening in me, and the good raised up, and so I became thus knit and united unto them, *hungering more and more after the increase of this power and life*, whereby I might feel myself perfectly redeemed. *And indeed this is the surest way to become a Christian*, to whom afterwards the knowledge and understanding of principles will not be wanting, but will grow up so much as is needful, as the natural fruit of this good root, and such a knowledge will not be barren nor unfruitful (1667).²³ [emphasis mine]

Two things are significant in this account. First, Barclay's arrival at Quaker conviction is preceded by a lengthy life as a professed Christian. Barclay was raised a strict Calvinist from birth to age 11 (1648-1659), was trained by his Uncle Robert Barclay at the secular Scots College of Paris as an apologist for the Roman Catholic Church from ages 11-15 (1659-1663), for the purpose of reconverting Scotland to Roman Catholicism,²⁴ and upon his return to Scotland in 1663 to be with his dying mother, visited many dissenting protestant communities over the course of four years including the Quakers (1663-1667) prior to his moment of conversion in Quaker Meeting to the Quaker path as being '*the surest way to become a Christian*' (1667).

Tom McNally writes that The Scots College of Paris, France, established in 1603 had the prior political motivation of the previous century of returning Scotland, Ireland, and England to Roman

²² *ibid*, 2-3

²³ Barclay, Robert. *An Apology for the True Christian Divinity*, 1675/1831, 333-334.

²⁴ Barclay, Robert. Works I, *An Account of the Life and Writings of Robert Barclay*, 12-13.

Catholicism through military intervention if necessary.²⁵ It was a college for secular priests carefully guarded from the Jesuit line of Catholicism while being influenced by the Jansenist expression of experiencing the sacraments mystically and unmediated. Robert Barclay had an academic and apologetic form of education under his Uncle Robert's administration (1652-1681). As a child, Barclay not only had had the freshest teaching and affirmation of John Calvin with the Scottish adoption of the *Westminster Confession of Faith* (1647) but as a teenager also had the freshest untainted 'secular' Roman Catholic apologetic against Protestantism. For Barclay, the conclusion of his life experience to date (1648-1667) was that the purest and 'surest way to *become* a Christian' was the Quaker way. [emphasis mine]

The second significant fact in Barclay's conversion and conviction, is the timing of his testimony that 'indeed this is the surest way to become a Christian' in his apologetic work. His conversion narrative appears in year 1675, eight years following his conviction and more than five years following his first 1670 apologetic work, and is included in the most published document of his writing, '*An APOLOGY for the True CHRISTIAN Divinity*', one third of the way through proposition 11 'Concerning Worship'. Ten other propositions have been covered prior to Barclay's personal witness. The significance of this placement reflects the progress of Barclay's life coinciding with Theosis. 'Indeed this is the surest way *to become* a Christian' [emphasis mine] opens the way to prelapsarian communion with God, deification through new covenant Christianity, and growth in theosis as 'humanity becomes by "Grace indwelling" what God is by nature'.

Related to the themes of communion and scripture, theosis as described by Vladimir Lossky contains the idea that 'mysticism is frequently opposed to theology as a realm inaccessible to

²⁵ Accessed: 2015, September. The Scots College Paris, '1652 – 81: A Centre for Scottish Networks Tom McNally Journal of Irish Scottish Studies' Volume 2 Issue 1, September 2008, 13-14.

understanding, as an unutterable mystery, a hidden depth, to be lived rather than known'.²⁶ The concept of lived more than known is consistent with one-time Puritans Fox²⁷ and Barclay. The 'seed' referred to by Barclay in his opening address to William Mitchell and his brethren represents the mystery of knowing. It is not a derivative Platonist or Neo-Platonist knowing, however, as in the same preface Barclay concludes,

And I refer myself to *that innocent and pure principle, the light of Christ Jesus in thee*, which bears testimony against all evil: that whereby thou mayst try and examine, what is here written and who are the owners of Scripture, and who are the wresters of it; which thou *canst only truly discover and discern by the Spirit*, from which the Scriptures came, even that inward light and word of grace, that is able to build thee up, and establish thee in the truth, unto which I recommend thee.²⁸ [emphasis mine]

The question becomes why would one look to the Eastern Orthodox Church to aid in bringing out Barclay's soteriology? Orthodox apologist, Vladimir Lossky, draws on the work of French philosopher Henri Bergson (1849-1941) when he says, 'Quite apart from this attitude of Bergson, one frequently hears expressed the view which would see in mysticism a realm reserved for the few, an exception to the common rule, a privilege vouchsafed to a few souls who enjoy direct experience of the truth, others, meanwhile, having to rest content with a more or less blind submission to dogmas imposed from without, as to a coercive authority'.²⁹ The 'seed' which Barclay discovered

²⁶ Lossky, Vladimir. *The Mystical Theology of the Eastern Church*, 7.

²⁷ Nickalls, John. *The Journal of George Fox*, 11. Significant in Foxes testimony is the words 'and this I knew experimentally' which comprised the conclusion of his search for Reality.

²⁸ Barclay, Robert. Works I, *Truth Cleared of Calumnies*, 1670/1831, 127.

²⁹ Lossky, Vladimir. *The Mystical Theology of the Eastern Church*, 8. Henri-Louis Bergson (1859 – 1941) was a French philosopher influential especially in the first half of the 20th century. Bergson convinced many thinkers that the processes of immediate experience and intuition are more significant than abstract rationalism and science for understanding reality though not void of reason. Reality was to be accessed by all. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.' 2016, 14. Graham himself told his parents that he had been to see Tennyson's play, 'The Cup', and declared his intention to go again occasionally to see 'some first-rate play'. Many years later Graham spoke to his Quaker Meeting in Manchester 'on the chaotic multitudinous experiences of London & Cambridge, as experience of the Divine Spirit, struggling against passion, pride and ignorance'. While he was at King's Graham did not think that there should be a 'Quaker hall' at Cambridge, because he did not feel that young men should be sheltered from such experiences. As Principal of Dalton Hall, however, he took the view that a Quaker authority was needed. If his Quaker students were 'to learn how they stand towards religion' it was better to do this in a place where some Quaker influence remained. Graham's realization of the need for order corresponds with Lossky's quoting of Bergson in that truth is accessible to all, and Barclay's 1674 work: Barclay's Works I, *The Anarchy of the Ranters*, 1674, 457. *The Anarchy of the Ranters, and Other Libertines, the Hierarchy of the Romanists, and Other Pretended Churches, Equally Refused and Refuted, in a Twofold Apology, for the Church and People of God, Called, in Derision,*

and defends is universal and available to all, not only mystically to the few as Bergson states is the tendency. Instead, as Lossky quotes Metropolitan Philaret of Moscow (1553-1633), ‘None of the mysteries of the most secret wisdom of God ought to appear alien or altogether transcendent to us, but in all humility Christians must apply their spirit to the contemplation of divine things’.³⁰ It is the realization of the universal gospel ‘seed’ that Barclay proclaims.

As Lossky draws out his criticism of the West, mysticism is the working out of the common faith that is ‘a seed’ available to all instead of a few. With Lossky, the demonstration of this dissertation recognizes the debilitating nature of the West on Barclay’s soteriology. It is an emphasis on the predestined elect that drives William Mitchell and his brethren to advocate against the universal ‘seed’.³¹

Mitchell’s use of Matthew 24:24 and II Peter 3:17 in his title ‘*For there shall arise **false** Christs, and **false** prophets and shall show great signs and wonders; insomuch that, if it were possible, they shall **deceive the very elect***’ (Matthew 24:24), and ‘*Ye therefore, beloved, seeing ye know these things before, beware lest ye also, being led away with the **error of the wicked**, fall from your own steadfastness*’. (II Peter 3:17) [emphasis mine] indicate Mitchell’s concern that the elect not lose their stability by listening to false Christs or deceptive prophets. The Quakers emphasizing that ‘the seed’ is in all is unnerving to Mitchell and his brethren because it challenges their hard line of the elect being differentiated from the non-elect. The Presbyterian contingency, who oppose the

Quakers: Wherein the Quakers are Vindicated from those that accuse them of disorder and confusion on the one hand, and from such as calumniate them with tyranny and imposition on the other: showing, that as the true and pure principles of the Gospel are restored by their testimony; so is also the ancient apostolic order of the church of Christ reestablished among the Quakers, and settled upon its right basis and foundation. By Robert Barclay. Philippians 2:3 “*Let nothing be done through strife or vainglory; but in lowliness of mind let each esteem another better than themselves.*” Hebrews 13:7 “*Remember them that have the rule over you, who spoke unto you the word of God, whose faith follow.*” &c. (17th of 8th month, 1674) 457-555.

³⁰ *ibid*, 8

³¹ William Mitchell. *A Sober Answer to An Angry Pamphlete: Or, Adminadversions*, by way of reply to Robert Barclay’s late book (entitled *Truth Cleared of Calumnies*) in answer to a *Dialogue between a Quaker and a Stable Christian* by William Mitchell. Matthew 24:24, II Peter 3:17 [Quoted] *Aberdene*, printed by John Forbes, 1671; *University of Aberdeen*. Mitchell finds Quaker Christianity unstable and dangerous to the advance of Christianity.

Quakers of Aberdeen, are diametrically opposed to the Quakers, who see the inherent value of the image and likeness of God restored through the new covenant ‘seed’.

Lossky concludes that there is, therefore, no Christian mysticism without theology; but, above all, there is no theology without mysticism. Mysticism is ‘a form of religious practice which seeks direct knowledge of God’³² beyond a discursive or intellectual knowledge of God. Christian theology is always in the last resort a means: a unity of knowledge observing an end which transcends all knowledge. This ultimate end is union with God, deification, and the Theosis of the Greek Fathers.³³ For Robert Barclay and Vladimir Lossky, discovery of theosis is not inconsistent to where the scriptures point but is the Reality to which they point.

Robert Barclay defends Quakerism as Prelapsarian Life and Christianity

Similar to the Eastern Orthodox, Barclay considered the Quaker path of the Christian faith to be prelapsarian and new covenant Christianity as fulfillment of and replacing old covenant Judaism. This section will coincide with the previous two sections in developing the context of Barclay’s True Christian Divinity in his letter to King Charles II of the Restoration, and development of his thought in his *Theses Theologicae* which preceded his *Apology for the True Christian Divinity*. This introductory section will be an entrée to Chapters 3-7 where the Lonergan Method in Theology is used to further expose parallels between the Eastern Orthodox and the Quakerism Barclay defends.

In his letter addressed to King Charles II (1630-1685) of England he refers to himself as ‘a servant of Jesus Christ, called of God to the Dispensation of the Gospel, now being revealed, and, after a

³² Erickson, Millard J. *Concise Dictionary of Christian Theology*, Baker, 1986, 110. Erickson’s definition of mysticism

³³ Lossky, Vladimir. *The Mystical Theology of the Eastern Church*, 1976, 9. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.’ 2016, 19. In 1910 Graham spent many hours organizing a picture collection. As well as lecturing on paintings, he ran, or proposed to run, a Bible study class ‘for Men who, with all kinds of views on religious and social matters, are yet anxious to take not Authority as truth, but Truth as their authority, and are wishful to help others and to be themselves helped to live a life of goodwill to men’. Graham corresponds with Barclay’s argument for the place of the Spirit in relationship to the scriptures. With Lossky, the Truth gains authority through life, as the scriptures find their place under Truth, and their use validated through life.

long and dark night of apostasy, commanded to be preached to all nations'.³⁴ The universal nature of the Gospel is core to Orthodoxy and to Quakers. Both claim it is true to the Scriptures old covenant and new covenant as well. God is inclusive of all people through the chosen seed of Abraham, fulfilled through the seed of David (II Samuel 7:1-17).

The GREAT KING who has made known the wondrous steps of his unsearchable providence to the kings of the world: Cyrus, Augustus Caesar, Constantine, Charles V, now makes them known to King Charles II of the Restoration (1660).³⁵ Barclay considers the works of Charles II to be the Lord's doing without stroke of sword, assistance from foreign states, or manipulation of human policy.³⁶ Barclay claims that the Quakers have been gathered out from society like the prophets who were beaten and imprisoned. Like the prophets, the Quakers have beaten their 'swords into plowshares, and their spears into pruning hooks' (Isaiah 2:4), being raised and armed with spiritual weapons, even with God's own Spirit and power.³⁷ This is in spite of sending epistles of warning, to no avail, concerning the immanent condition of a prideful and hypocritical humanity, delivered to Puritan trained Oliver and Richard Cromwell, Protectorates of the Commonwealth of England, Scotland, and Ireland from 1653 to 1659.³⁸ Orthodox Christianity is centered in the 'come and see' of humility and asceticism. Emphases on icons of the scripture narrative rather than the words of scripture represent the prophetic and lived nature of faith Quakers are about. It is lived faith as experience that represents Quaker Christianity. A complementary Quaker icon is Jesus as shepherd leading his sheep, and the Presence of Christ in the Midst.

³⁴ Barclay's Works II, *Title and Letters to King Charles II, Readers and Clergy i-xii*, 1675 Original Latin manuscript, 1678 English translation, i. The dark night of apostasy has been the Gospel being taken over by scholasticism by the Romanists and the later Reformers i.e. those in union with the Westminster Confession

³⁵ *ibid.* iii Charles II, aligning with the Church of England has miraculously assumed the throne following the 11 years period (1649-1659) of Puritan sympathizers Oliver and Richard Cromwell

³⁶ *ibid.* iv The Lord is Charles II's defense and Guide in his being restored to the throne without war and through clear political channels

³⁷ *ibid.* iv The Quakers function under the same governance as the prophets and King Charles II. The Lord is their Guide and protector.

³⁸ *ibid.* iv Barclay considers Puritan Christianity to be ego-centric surrounding proof-text formulas of salvation. Pride, rather than turning into humility through conversion of the heart, is accelerated through theoretical presumption and entitlement.

Barclay calls on the experience of Charles II to validate the Quakers, who are agreeable to both divine truth and human policy in allowing every person to serve God according to their conscience. He contends that others, out of jealousy, unjustly misconstrue Quaker doctrine and words as if they were inconsistent both with Christianity and civil society. Some have even commended the invidious Socinians against the Quakers.³⁹ Instead, Quaker practice has proven that they are more consistent with Christianity and civil society than those who accuse them. It is Charles II's conscience which bears witness to this reality in the face of the nations.⁴⁰ This has led Barclay to put together an account of the Quaker principles in short theological propositions so as to communicate to the public, and to the nations where Quakerism is spreading. Barclay concludes that the Quakers being spoken of as evil, is consistent with the devil's rule in the children of disobedience. He will defend the Quakers as practicing New Covenant Christianity.⁴¹ Orthodox and Quakers emphasize the faith with their accompanying fruit. The faith versus works dilemma is equally rejected by Barclay and the Orthodox as an incomplete understanding of faith and grace. Both are part of participational synergistic life with God.

Barclay affirms that if Charles II reads the *Apology* he will know for himself how consonant the Quaker principles are to Scripture, truth, and right reason.⁴² The simplicity of Quaker behavior, their generally poor and illiterate condition, and manner of procedure without the wisdom of the world has made outsiders conclude them fools and madmen, and neglect them as incapable of reason. Yet, while some account them fools for Christ's sake, others see them as more agreeable to Scripture,

³⁹ *ibid.* vi The Quaker path of 'true Christian divinity' is so foreign to the Westminster adherents that they don't recognize it as Christian. The humility of our Lord (Philippians 2:4-5) is foreign to a theology of justification through blood sacrifice to be believed alone. Grace alone, by Faith alone, through Scripture alone, through Christ alone for the Glory of God alone is on full display.

⁴⁰ *ibid.* vi Quaker life reveals the way of Christ, the Victor, as evidenced in the conscience of King Charles II.

⁴¹ *ibid.* vi Where pride and ego reign supreme, there remains the darkness of the Fall and its instigator.

⁴² *ibid.* vi The Quaker path is centered in God to which scripture, truth, and reason point

reason, and true learning.⁴³ Barclay concludes that he is not using the epistle to flatter Charles II to gain his patronage. It is God alone who brings forth the work in Barclay, who needs no patronage of world princes. It is God's arm and power alone that propagates, establishes, and confirms the truth to be presented. The nations will judge for themselves that the truth the Quakers profess is not a work of darkness nor propagated by stealth. The Quakers are not ashamed of the gospel of Christ for they know it to be the power of God unto salvation.⁴⁴ Being a fool for Christ is part of Orthodox practice and Barclay doesn't back down from it as a Quaker. The path of theosis is becoming one in our person with what God intended. This is prelapsarian life and Christianity. The path is becoming fully human in the face of unrighteousness through healing.

In this, Barclay considers that just as by Divine Providence Charles II was restored to the throne (1660) without bloodshed, so is increase of truth established without bloodshed. There is no King in the world, who can experimentally testify of God's Providence and goodness as Charles II. Neither is there any who rules so many free people, so many true Christians.⁴⁵ Barclay warns that if after these warnings Charles II does not turn to the Lord with his whole heart, who remembered him in his distress, great will be his condemnation. It is against every snare of those who prompt him to do evil that Charles II may apply himself to the Light of Christ shining in his conscience, which will neither flatter nor suffer him to be at ease in his sins, but which will deal plainly with him as with all faithful followers of Christ.⁴⁶ The path of purgation and deification is true for King Charles and

⁴³ *ibid.* vi-vii Like Paul who considers Christians fools for Christ's sake (I Corinthians 2:5, 3:19), Barclay claims Quakers are considered fools by those of the world. The Eastern Orthodox embrace those clothed with Christ to become 'Fools for Christ' in the worlds' eyes.

⁴⁴ *ibid.* vii God works within the heart. Barclay's view of the baptism of Jesus to by the Holy Spirit in the heart is core with the purging of the disordered passions of the heart in Orthodox. The fire purifies where received and becomes the fire of 'hell' where rejected. Barclay affirms the necessity of communing with the resurrected body and blood of Christ come within. This shares parallel with the leavened bread being mixed with the body temperature wine in the Eastern Eucharist being Christ's resurrected Body.

⁴⁵ *ibid.* vii-viii Charles II represents new covenant Christianity as being immediate. Christ has come and is Present (metaphysically).

⁴⁶ *ibid.* viii Charles II must continue to live up to his measure. The Light of Christ shines in his conscience. As he continues to live up to the integrity of 'yes and no' (Matthew 5:33-37) he will experience the life of the 'Just One' and prophets (James 5:6-12).

every person. There are no inequalities in new covenant Christianity. Different from Roman Catholicism, the Orthodox recognize the membership of Christ's Body in similar ways as the Quakers. Every member is valued.

Barclay, actuated by the same Divine Spirit as the prophets and apostles, will explain the propositions he has written. His method of writing is contrary to the men called divines or the school men whom Barclay considers to have destroyed the Christian religion.⁴⁷ Barclay has no desire to accommodate those who desire to comprehend the truth in their heads rather than their hearts. What Barclay writes comes from the ears of his soul, what is seen with his inward eyes, and what his hands have handled of the Word of Life, being manifested inwardly concerning the things of God.⁴⁸ He writes not as a grammarian, but as one following the certain rule of the Divine Light, and of the Holy Scriptures. He does not write to feed the wisdom, knowledge, or vain pride of this world, but to starve and oppose it.⁴⁹ Barclay and the Orthodox are both against scholasticism. Scholasticism for both has been destructive toward Christianity. Barclay and the Orthodox are opposed to the Scholasticism of the West including the incongruence of scripture and tradition amongst Roman Catholics and systematic theology of Protestants. Christianity is centered in the Light of Christ, the Spirit of Pentecost and the fullness of the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit as revealed in the saints.

Barclay's desire is for unfeigned repentance from his readers in acknowledging the Truth. It is the simple, naked truth which man by his wisdom has rendered obscure and mysterious, making it 100 fold darker and complex in their commentaries than it is. School divinity does not bring one nearer

⁴⁷ *ibid.* ix The Divine Spirit is the 'Spirit of the Lord' which came upon the prophets, the Spirit of truth spoken of Jesus to the woman at the well (John 4:9-14, 21-26), prophesied of on the last and greatest day of the Feast of Tabernacles (7:37-39), which Jesus breathed on his disciples in the upper room following his resurrection (20:19-23), and received universally on the Day of Pentecost Acts 2:1-4.

⁴⁸ *ibid.* ix-x Barclay is experiencing Christ inwardly as John claims the apostles experience Christ (I John 1:1-3). This is hesychasm.

⁴⁹ *ibid.* x Logic surrenders to the Divine Light and to where the scriptures point. The world must be starved of ego-centric reason which produces hardness of heart. Christianity is to be experienced and Faith 'the measure' comes by living experimentally which is faith.

to God; or make one less wicked or more righteous than they already are.⁵⁰ It is the despicable and unlearned Quakers, like the fisherman of old, who articulate God's pure and naked truth, declaring the true ground of knowledge, which knowledge leads to Life Eternal being the Light of Christ in every conscience.⁵¹ 'Christ is in our midst! He is and ever shall be!' is proclaimed by Quaker and Orthodox alike. The energy of God and the Light of Christ is the witness joined by the Quaker and Orthodox.

The first and vital proposition pertains to the true Foundation of Knowledge. In this Barclay quotes John 17:3 "This is eternal life, to know thee the only true God, and Jesus Christ whom thou has sent," concluding that knowing the true God, and Jesus Christ is that which must be known and believed in the first place.⁵² Finding a way forward in the true Foundation of Knowledge, this researcher argues that the kataphatic new covenant resurrected Jesus Christ within, understood as Christianity, is to be blended with the apophatic Trinitarian mystery. The incarnation of the eternal Word, Jesus Christ, multiplies life with God, as available in every conscience through the resurrection. Prelapsarian life and new covenant Christianity, which Barclay defends, provides answers to the LORD God who walked with Adam and Eve in the Garden of Eden; God's original intent for humanity consistent with the Eastern Orthodox. The incarnation is application of LORD God in the pre-incarnation in the Old Testament, in the fullness of time in the Gospels, and present in the midst of humanity as Light.

⁵⁰ Barclay's Works II, *Theses Theologicae I-XV* 13-23, 1675 Original Latin manuscript, 1678 English translation, 1675 Original Latin manuscript, 1678 English translation, 11 While reason is part of being created in God's image according to 'God's kind' (Gen 1:26-27). This is different than the beasts being created of the earth according the earth's kind (1:24-25). Logic without the new covenant Spirit of truth remains logic.

⁵¹ *ibid.* 11-12 The seed of man and beasts as prophesied by Jeremiah (31:26-30) is revealed in all creation and humanity as new Covenant fulfilled (31:31-34) through Jesus Christ, the 2nd Adam (31:15-25) who remains sinless and conquers bodily death and the Spirit of Pentecost by which we return to prelapsarian likeness of 1st Adam (31:35-40). The Quakers identify with the uneducated apostles.

⁵² *ibid.* 13 Barclay centers Christianity in the knowledge of God of John 17:3 (Proposition I). The East takes this as the starting point.

Secondly, Barclay centers immediate revelation in “No person knows the Father but the Son, and he to whom the Son reveals him.” Barclay joins the revealing of the Father and the Son with the testimony of the Spirit.⁵³ Here we find the meld of kataphatic Christian reality with apophatic Trinitarian mystery. Barclay bookends the work of the Spirit in the ordering of the chaos of the world (Genesis 1:2) with the quantifying post-resurrection Spirit of Pentecost sent of Jesus, proceeding from the Father (John 15:26). This in no ways discriminates against the eternal Word made flesh in John 1, but compliments the apophatic Trinitarian mystery of “In the beginning God created the heavens and the earth” Genesis 1:1. Barclay, like Paul, blends the Old Covenant revealing of God’s Spirit to the patriarchs and prophets with the New Covenant apophatic Trinitarian mystery in all humanity receiving the Spirit of Christ and Spirit of God (Romans 8:9-11). Barclay concludes that the inward objective manifestation of the Spirit in the heart as the formal object of the Jewish faith, now quantifies through the Son and the Father in New Covenant Christianity. The kataphatic Spirit - is God, superior to Scripture, and sound and right reason.⁵⁴ The Ecumenical Councils were a form of right and sound reason according to the apostles gathered under the guidance of the Spirit. They made decisions of dogma, “*it seemed good to the Holy Spirit and to us...*” Acts 15:28. God is also consistent, through the narrative flow of scripture, to reveal God’s nature in restoring prelapsarian union with humanity, created in God’s image and likeness, through the incarnation and Spirit as New Covenant orthopraxis.

Thirdly, Barclay considers the Scriptures to be revelations from the Spirit of God to the Saints which contain historical accounts of the acting of God’s people in diverse ages. They include a prophetic

⁵³ *ibid.* 13 In Garden life, Adam and his wife walked with the LORD, God in the cool of the day. (Gen 3:8) The Lonergan Method by design is experiential in the same manner as for the Eastern Orthodox and Quaker, theology is experience. The unpardonable sin is rejection of the Spirit of God (Matthew 12:30-33). It is by the Spirit of God that one names Jesus as Lord (I Corinthians 12:3).

⁵⁴ *ibid.* 13 The fullness of the apophatic and the kataphatic is expressed in Jesus’ high priestly prayer in John 17. Its practicality comes in Jesus’s statement recorded by Mark ‘...do not worry beforehand, or premeditate what you will speak. Whatever is given you in that hour speak that; for it is not you who speak, but the Holy Spirit.’ (13:11) Father... sanctify them in the truth. Your word is truth. (John 17:17). The voice of rest in Hebrews 3-4 is the voice to be heard. This is the eighth day of Sabbath rest as revealed by the Fathers.

account of things to come, and the chief principles of the doctrine of Christ. They are a declaration of the fountain who is God, and not the fountain itself. As a testimony of God they are a secondary rule, subordinate to the Spirit, who is God. It is by the inward testimony of the Spirit that one knows the Scriptures, which reveal that it is by the Spirit that one is lead into all truth.⁵⁵ Barclay affirms that as the Spirit of God spoke to the saints, so the Spirit leads the saints in all truth. In the narrative of Scripture, the incarnation of God affirms the Spirit. While one is being made holy through the indwelling Spirit, the Saint is led into all truth through the counsel and guidance of the Spirit. This path coincides with the narrative of Scripture. The Saints, collectively, realize holiness in internalizing Scripture by the Spirit. The Scriptures are an outward aid toward internalizing the life God intended in the Garden of Eden. The Orthodox portrayal of typological in the shadow scripture narrative will be exploited in the footnotes of Chapters 3-7.

Fourthly, Barclay's view of the condition of humanity since Adam's fall and removal from the garden of Eden, is that all Adam's posterity, both Jew and Gentile, are degenerate of mind, and bodily corrupt, deprived of the inward testimony and seed of God. Being subject to the nature, and seed of the serpent sewn in the heart, humanities words, deeds, and imaginations are evil perpetually in the sight of God. Man cannot conceive of God until disjoined from the evil seed and united to the divine Light. The evil seed is not imputed to infants but is sewn by the serpent, contributing to humanities corruptibility.⁵⁶ The two realities which humanity needs saved from is the seed of the

⁵⁵ *ibid.* 14-15 Like the Berean Jews and a few Greeks (Acts 17:10-12) George Fox searched experimentally to realize the truth of his Puritan upbringing which was in the scriptures all the time. The Bereans moved beyond Judaism through openness to the Light of the World (John 1:8-13). They and a few Greeks discovered in like manner as Fox and Robert Barclay. There is 'One' who speaks to thy condition, and this I knew experimentally.

⁵⁶ *ibid.* 15 The seed of the Kingdom is universal. The seed of the 2nd Adam is universal in its effect where embraced. The seed in Matthew 13 is the seed of the Kingdom sewed universally in all soil types. This seed is metaphysical in Matthew 13:12 and 25:29 as 'that which one has, can be multiplied' and 'even that which one has, can be taken away'. The seed when applied in fertile soil is as mustard seed-without and leaven-within (Mt 13:31-33). Application is discovered through happen stance and through search (Mt 13:44-45). It is in the old treasure-covenant and in the new treasure-covenant (Mt 13:51-52). Its sewing and accountability is as the dragnet gathering of all kinds to be sorted (Mt 13:47-50). A counterfeit seed is equally sewn by an enemy (Mt 13:24-30). The counterfeit seed distorts the seed of the kingdom to the extent of parable (Mt 13:13-17, 34-35; Acts 28:24-29). The seed sewn by the Son of Man (Mt 13:36-43) which grows all by itself (Mark 4:26-29) results in the righteous shining as the sun (13:43) and the tares cast into fire (13:42).

serpent, being that which leads humanity into evil thoughts and actions, and the corruption of our bodies leading to bodily death. On the negative side, it is saving humanity from evil passions, and bodily death, that God, through the divine Light of the Incarnation, and Spirit, joins positively with humanity toward realizing the perfection and being God intended. The Orthodox portrayal of perfection in response to disordered passions, and transfiguration in response to bodily corruption will be exploited in the footnotes of Chapters 3-7.

Fifthly and sixthly, Barclay melds as one the universal redemption by Jesus Christ and the saving and spiritual Light whereby every person is enlightened. It is out of God's infinite love who delights not in humanities bodily death as a consequence of eating from the tree, missing the mark of God's original intent that God sent his only Son that whosoever believes in the Son should be saved. The Son enlightens every person, illuminating all things reprobable, and teaches temperance, righteousness, and godliness. The Son enlightens every person in order for their salvation from the seed of sin, having tasted their death, and being their resurrection.⁵⁷ The kataphatic reality of the Son enlightening every person as Light of Christ is melded with apophatic mystery. God, who is infinite love, redeems all humanity from sin and death, by revealing his righteousness and resurrection within. This Barclay defends as the New Covenant.

With the fifth proposition being one with the sixth, Barclay considers that the saving and spiritual Light of Jesus Christ enlightening every person takes away all objections to Jesus universally tasting every person's bodily death. The universal divine Light is the uncreated Grace of God by which humanity in the past and present partake of the divine mystery. This evangelical saving light resulting from the Son, the Lord Jesus Christ reveals God's love and mercy to all. Christ has tasted

Isaiah is to preach until there is nothing left but a stump. The holy seed is the stump. (13:8-13) The Orthodox and Barclay emphasize 'Shining like the sun in the kingdom of their Father.' They both emphasize the fire of God that purges the heart as the same fire that destroys the resistant. God remains eternally the same as fire and light. (I Cor. 15:28, 45-49; Heb. 12:25-29)

⁵⁷ *ibid.* 16 Barclay stands with original sin moving to ancestral innocence which becomes sin through concupiscence i.e. Ancestral Sin

every person's bodily death empirically, and provides the way for every person to be made partakers of the mystery of his death by suffering his seed as it enlightens their heart. Through the divine Light, communion with the Father and Son is enjoyed. This is the means by which the wicked and the uninformed might become whole, lovers of the power by whose inward touches they feel themselves turned from evil to good, and learn to do to others as they would be done by.⁵⁸

Kataphatic new covenant Christian reality is bodily through the incarnation of Jesus Christ.

Kataphatic new covenant communion is union with the Son and the Father. This knowledge comes noetically through the Orthodox teaching on the *nous*, or mind in the heart. *Phronema*, according to Orthodox teacher Eugenia Constantinou, in her work *Thinking Orthodox* is acquiring the mind of Christ uniform with the early Church and saints.⁵⁹

Seventhly, Barclay contends that as many as receive the divine light, in them is produced a holy, pure, and spiritual birth bringing forth holiness, righteousness, purity, and fruits acceptable to God. By this birth Jesus Christ is formed within, working his works unto sanctification in our being justified in the sight of God. These works are the works of our Head, Jesus Christ, and not of the Body in isolation, but are of Jesus Christ who is resurrecting gift within and the producer of righteous works. As God has reconciled us while we were enemies, so does God justify us through the washing of regeneration and renewing of the Holy Spirit.⁶⁰ The divine light of Jesus Christ indwelling the heart opens the way for the resurrection of Jesus Christ to justify. As Christ rose bodily from the dead, so Christ rises kataphatically in the person receiving the seed. This rebirth brings forth holiness, righteousness, purity, and fruit in keeping with God's intent in the Garden of

⁵⁸ *ibid.* 17 Becoming children of light in which goodness, righteousness, and truth prevail come by receiving light from Christ (Ephesians 5:8-14). The Law came through Moses, grace for grace comes through Jesus Christ who reveals the Father (John 1:15-18).

⁵⁹ Constantinou, Eugenia Scarvelis. *Thinking Orthodox: Understanding and Acquiring the Orthodox Christian Mind*, AFP, 2020.

⁶⁰ *ibid.* 18 Becoming partakers of the divine nature (II Peter 1:4) is becoming members of His body, of His flesh and of his bones (Ephesians 5:30). This cleansing and renewal of the Holy Spirit occurs through Christ in realizing God's likeness restored (Titus 3:5).

Eden. The path of theosis is the path of healing. The Orthodox teaching is the healing nature of a medical doctor to justify or mend something broken in contrast with the judge of a courtroom administering judgement.

Eighthly, in whom the holy and pure birth is brought to fullness, the body of death and sin is crucified and removed, and the heart is united to truth so as not to obey the suggestions of the evil one. In this sense one is free to hit the mark of God's original righteous intent, growing in freedom to fulfill God's original design. Yet, in not being God, this perfection always admits of growth. There always remains the possibility of sinning where the mind does not diligently and watchfully attend to the Lord.⁶¹ This is the path of deification or glorification whereby one becomes a partaker of the divine nature revealed through the Light of Christ. The Orthodox teaching on the likeness of God being restored and progressive through the Light of Christ and consequent indwelling of Christ. Orthodox and Barclay both recognize evil spirits and the evil one. Evil spirits are behind disordered passions.

Ninthly, though the inward grace of God is sufficient to work out salvation, yet, in those in whom the divine light is resisted it becomes their condemnation. Also, in those in whom Grace is wrought in part to purify and sanctify, if they fall away, turning from the Light of Christ and apostatize, they making shipwreck of the faith, having tasted of the heavenly gift and being made partakers of the Holy Ghost. Yet there can be an increase in perfection from which there is no apostasy.⁶²

Deification in God's original intent is the process of one's total life. Theosis as becoming by grace indwelling what God is by nature requires constant participation. The Orthodox teaching on human

⁶¹ *ibid.* 18 There is no law against the fruit of the Spirit (Gal 5:22-23). Stand fast in the freedom for which Christ set us free. Do not entangle yourself again in the yoke of bondage (Gal 5:1). Yet Jesus is our High Priest who for the joy set before him endured the cross and is the author, perfecter, finisher and pioneer of our faith (Hebrews 12:2) as with everyone's faith as 2nd Adam (Romans 5:12-18).

⁶² *ibid.* 19 Maturation beyond the elementary milk principles of perfection, repentance, faith, baptisms, resurrection of the dead, and eternal judgement is where the writer of Hebrews points (5:12-6-3). Meat is experiencing God in the eternal through persisting (6:4-8). We either become like God through repentance and asceticism or return to the world of which there is no solution. Ascetical Christianity is uniform with the Orthodox and with Barclay. Ascetical Christianity is inconsistent with Westminster Christianity.

freedom and Christian asceticism is complementary with Barclay's economy. Barclay and the Orthodox both say we have been saved, we are being saved, and we hope to be saved. This is different from presumption and entitlement claims around being saved.

Tenthly, by the Light of God all true knowledge is received and revealed, so by the same Light, as it is received in the heart, by the strength and power thereof, every true minister of the gospel is ordained, prepared, and supplied in the work of ministry. The Light of Christ leads the Christian to the persons to whom, and to the times in which they are to minister. Those with the authority of the unspotted gift of the Spirit preach the gospel without human commission or literature. Freely they have received, freely they give, knowing that it is God who provides.⁶³ The Orthodox teaching on ministry and the laity in relation to hierarchical views of authority find greater congruency with Barclay than the Roman Catholic west.

Eleventhly, all true and acceptable worship is offered in the inward and immediate moving and drawing of his Spirit, not limited to places, times, or persons. For though we worship him always, in that we fear always before him, yet as to outward prayers, praises, or preaching we do not worship in our own will but when moved by his Spirit, which God hears and accepts and is never lacking to move when needed. In this, God alone is the proper Judge. All other worship set about in one's own will, by one's own strength and mind, are but superstition, will-worship, and idolatry in the sight of God which are denied, rejected, and separated from in this day of God's spiritual arising. This does not discredit those with whom God was pleased, who out of the integrity of their heart were the good soil, the innocent seed lying buried under superstitions. God blew upon their dead and dry

⁶³ *ibid.* 19-20 Those learning the Light of Christ become like Christ in this world; living organically in the kingdom of God expressed from within. These having crucified their passions and desires are become like Christ. While prophesy reveals 'the life to be' prophesy becomes obsolete with those full of light. John the theologian writes 'Love has been perfected among us in this: that we may have boldness in the day of judgment, because as He is, so are we in this world' 4:17. A theologian in Orthodoxy is one filled with God.

bones and raised their breath, and answered them, until his spiritual day dawned and broke forth.⁶⁴

The Orthodox teaching on Divine Liturgy and icons are to be realized experientially and mystically. While in all appearance, Quaker worship and Divine Liturgy appear polar opposites but they are in actuality mystically the same. The person going to Quaker Meeting and the person going to Divine Liturgy go with the same posture of listening and receptivity. Whether anyone attends or not, the Orthodox Priest performs the Liturgy.

Twelfthly, Barclay goes on to emphasize the baptism of Jesus Christ. He begins with there is one Lord, one faith, and one baptism which is no longer the purification of the outward flesh. Instead it is the answer of a good conscience before God by the resurrection of Jesus Christ within. This baptism is pure, spiritual, of spirit, and by fire in which one is buried with Christ; that being washed and purged from one's sins, one walks in newness of life. John the Baptist's baptism was an outward shadow commanded for a time but not to continue. With Christ's bodily resurrection, Christian baptism is Christ resurrecting within the believer. Infant baptism was a human gesture, born of good intentions, but like John's water misses the point of Christ resurrecting within.⁶⁵ The Orthodox teaching on the necessity of the rebirth and Chrismation by the Spirit of Pentecost is parallel with Barclay.

⁶⁴ *ibid.* 20-1 The Divine Liturgy of the Orthodox is not the end of Christianity. Divine Liturgy is the window through which one experiences God leading to deification. For Barclay Quaker gathering for worship is not the end. It is only the means through which pilgrims find their way. Ministry very tellingly precedes Worship in Barclay's Propositions. It is *For the Life of the World* for which Christ came says Alexander Schmemmann. 'Before Christ came, God promised Him. He who is the truth about both God and man, gives foretastes of His incarnation in all more fragmentary truths, and Christ is present in every seeker after truth. The person running fast away from Christ, if it is toward what he considers true, he runs in fact straight into the arms of Christ.' SVS Press, 1973, pg. 19

⁶⁵ *ibid.* 21 The one Baptism according to Paul (Eph. 4:5) is considered by Barclay to be that of Jesus which is by the Holy Spirit and with fire (Mt. 3:11-12). In this the old self is joined with Christ in death so as to resurrect with Christ in life (Rom. 6:3-11). Water signified entering the tomb in burial so as to arise in Easter life. Nicodemus understood water as reentering the amniotic fluid of his mother's womb (Jn. 3:3-8). Baptism is referenced by Jesus in his final commission of immersion in/into the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit which is why Orthodox immerse three times (Mt 28:19). This PhD argues that Jesus being baptized with water fulfilled the Old Covenant rites with the Holy Spirit descending and the voice of the Father being heard (Mt 3:13-17). Equally importantly is the Orthodox rejection of Augustinian 'Original Sin' necessitating baptism of infants. While viewing all of life as sacramental, rebirth is signified by water and Chrismation is the receiving of the Spirit of Pentecost. Barclay is opposed to infant baptism in his rejecting original sin and aligns with the Orthodox in the necessity of rebirth and receiving the Spirit in putting on Christ (Gal 3:27). Barclay affirms immersion in/into the teaching of the Father, the Son and the Holy Spirit as emphasized by the Orthodox.

Thirteenthly, communion with the Body and Blood of Christ is inward, spiritual and living in whom Christ dwells. By communing with Christ in the heart, the Christian is nourished by Christ's Body and Blood daily. Like John the Baptist's baptism, the breaking of bread, abstaining from eating strangled animals, drinking blood, washing one another's feet, and anointing the sick all fade when one feeds on Christ's resurrected body and blood within. Barclay takes his cue on communion from Jesus' words 'I am the bread of life. Unless you eat my flesh you have no part of me.' (Jn 6:35, 48, 51, 53-58) 'It is the Spirit that gives life; the flesh profits nothing.' (6:63). Barclay's climax will be the Lord's supper in Revelation 3:19-21 where Jesus stands at the door of the heart for the purpose of communion and refinement. Jesus is the super-substantial bread of life.⁶⁶

Fourteenthly, God has assumed to himself the power and dominion of the conscience. It is God alone who can rightly instruct and govern the conscience. Therefore, it is not lawful for any government or individual to force the conscience of another against their will in things relating to worship or opinion. The government may intervene where one, under the pretense of conscience, would prejudice their neighbor adversely, or be destructive toward society in general in which case the law is written for the transgressor, and justice is to be administered without respect of persons.⁶⁷

⁶⁶ *ibid.* 21 The Eucharist of the Orthodox is with the resurrected Body and Blood of Jesus Christ as leavened bread and body temperature wine. The Orthodox teaching of *hesychia* is communion with God as super-substantial bread through the Jesus Prayer. This is the difference between the quietism of the Catholic Counter-Reformation and the Orthodox and aligns with Barclay.

⁶⁷ *ibid.* 22 Liberty of conscience and being made in the image and likeness of God go hand in hand. Man is created of God, and the beasts of the earth (Gen 1:24-25). Liberty of choice existed in the garden with the tree of knowledge of good and evil (Gen 2:16-17). It was never God's will that Adam eat of the tree and experience the consequence of death. It was God's will to create man in 'Our' image and likeness (Gen 1:26-27). In God breathing into man, the 'breath of life' according to Irenaeus of Lyon (130-202), man is made 'body, soul, and Holy Spirit'. Sin or missing the mark of God's original righteousness resulted from eating of the tree, and knowing good from evil as God. Sin and evil is simply that which is not God, and for which God never intended. Taking on skins of flesh accompanied being placed out of the garden before man could eat from the tree of life (Gen 3:21-24). It is this flesh that Christ will inhabit as incarnation in providing the way back to relationship with God. We choose, and God chooses to identify fully with our fleshly condition in defeating 'missing the mark' by 'hitting the mark' of God's prelapsarian righteousness. By our choosing to receive the body and blood of Christ we through the 2nd Adam are restored into the righteousness God intended. The choice involves faith which believes in spite of bodily death as sleep (John 11:12; Hebrews 11:17-19), and that our choices in this life reflect our faith in God in becoming as Christ. All humanities actions whether in Christ or outside of Christ will be revealed in the final judgment when the books are opened (Rev 20:11-15) and deeds done in life, in their full complexity, are revealed (Gal 6:6-10). Barclay affirms that the field is level between Jew and Gentile in that God is no respecter of persons but meets every person in their individual situation (Romans 2:4-5, 11; John 10:14-16; I Peter

The Orthodox teaching on liberty of conscience, respects the individual conscience. Monks have gone to Mount Athos as atheists and become Christians. Atheists attend Quaker Meeting where the Light of Christ is present whether recognized or not.

And lastly, the end of all religion is to redeem man from the spirit and vanity of this world, and to be lead into communion with God before whom, if we fear always, we are accounted happy. Therefore all vain customs and habits of this world, both in word and deed, are to be rejected and forsaken by those who come to this fear. These include things which go against equal respect for all humanity, things which inflate pride and ego, and things which divert the mind from the witness of God in the heart. It is from a living sense of his fear that the evangelical Spirit, wherewith Christians are to be leavened, leads into sobriety, gravity, and godly fear. The Lord attends to those actions for which we are necessarily engaged in taking care of the outer person.⁶⁸

In summary we have looked at Barclays communication to King Charles II and his resistance to the scholastic thinking of his day. He opens his thought from his previous writings through writing Theses statements from the eye of his soul and the Light of Christ which will guides his writing in the chapters ahead. The Orthodox teaching on the Light of Christ as the will of God leading into the Kingdom of God, and unceasing prayer as Hesychastic stillness in the Jesus Prayer will be considered in the footnotes of Chapters 3-7 using the Lonergan Method in Theology.

3:9-10). Liberty of conscience responsibly respected humanity in like manner as God respects the liberty in which we were created. The question is whether we will let the 'breath of the Holy Spirit' through the Father and the Son bring about rebirth (John 16:5-11; Ezekiel 36:26-28). We participate in our return to the likeness of God through repentance and keeping Christ's commandments.

⁶⁸ Ibid. 22-3 Rather than the predetermined election of the Protestant contingency the Father's mercy and perfection reaches all humanity to include those who are enemies of God. God's desire is that the saving work of Christ would lead all to be fully human in the way God originally intended. The transfiguration of the outer appearance into light comes through the purification of the heart by the Spirit. God as Father, Son, and Holy Spirit is longsuffering toward all desiring that they would turn to him who has made a way out of our perdicament through righteousness and rest. This is available to all humanity with their being no longer male nor female, slave nor free, Jew nor Greek but that all would be one in Christ Jesus. Glory to the Father, and to the Son, and to the Holy Spirit, Glory to Jesus Christ!

CONCLUSION: One can see in Barclay's Puritan beginnings that he became disillusioned with Puritan shortcomings as did Fox. One can also see the mystical and unmediated nature in which God spoke to Fox (1624-1647), concurring with Barclay's experience at Quaker meeting near age 19 (1648-1667). One can see for both Fox and Barclay the salvation concept of Theosis as providing a way forward beyond a human-sided Puritan Bible Christianity, which included the insufficient elect, non-elect view of the sovereign God (1647 *Westminster Confession*). One can also see that it took eight centuries for the East to work out the topic of theosis, and Russell Norman twenty years to distill his treatise on deification. The third section of chapter two opens the way for Barclay to defend Quakerism as prelapsarian life with God and Christianity through acknowledging the stark difference between eastern and western Christianity. What Barclay argues as 'true Christian divinity' will be reflected in chapters three through seven as evidence that Barclay defends Eastern Orthodox theosis.

The contrast of Quaker Christianity with that of their Protestant counterparts is that as the Quakers entered into oneness with the Divine, the Protestants rejected the lived experience of this oneness for bible formulas of salvation centered on a sovereign God who elects whom he will save, and rejects whom he makes reprobate. This human-sided trajectory was the impetus for both Fox and Barclay to search for a truer expression of faith until they arrived at the immediacy of restored prelapsarian communion realized in its final form as Christianity. Chapter two has demonstrated the length of Barclay's arrival at 'true Christian divinity' through Puritanism, a 'secular' Roman Catholic education, and the nature of deification through Orthodox apologist Vladimir Lossky.

Chapter three will explore Barclay's identification with the Saints of both the Old and New Testaments, and his reference to the Church Fathers. Barclay will defend Quakerism by acknowledging the Saints throughout history who experience unmediated communion with God. This unmediated communion through 'the seed' of the second Adam is what Fox and Barclay argue is the Christianity of the ascended Lord, the Spirit of Pentecost; and the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit who principally resides in the human heart.

CHAPTER 3: Barclay and the Saints and Fathers

INTRODUCTION: Chapter 3 opens with what recent scholarship has said about Barclay and his use of the Saints and Fathers, demonstrates Barclay's use of the Saints and Fathers using the Lonergan method in theology, and concludes with the Orthodox perspective on the Saints and Fathers. This chapter will highlight Barclay's rejection of the later Protestants who argue for imputed and infused righteousness through scholastic adherence to scripture proof-text, and legal adherence to the sacraments. It will reveal that Barclay argues for the uncreated Grace of God revealed as the gospel Incarnation and the Spirit sent of the Father indwelling all humanity as seed of the Father, Son, and Holy Spirit. It will demonstrate that it is the Fathers who confirm Barclay's claim that the Quaker path is the 'the best way to become a Christian'. In the Saints and Fathers Barclay finds the universal old and new covenant triune principle as superior to the derivative Platonism and Neo-Platonism. In particular it is Justin Martyr (c. 100-165), Clement of Alexandria (150-215), Athanasius of Alexandria (296-373), and Cyril of Alexandria (376-444) who Barclay identifies as communicating the true nature of Christianity being centered supernaturally in the universal seed of the second Adam, the light of Christ, and the Spirit of Pentecost. This original Christianity was uncovered by the first reformers, which Barclay argues was brought to completion by the Quakers. In this Barclay embraces the synergy of Augustine (350-430) in the faith and works dilemma which was later confused during the indulgence era of Roman Catholicism resulting in the imputed believe-ism of later Protestants. The chapter concludes with the use of the Fathers in becoming a Saint in Eastern Orthodoxy.

BARCLAY SCHOLARSHIP RELATED TO THE SAINTS AND THE FATHERS

Michael Birkel opens his chapter on ‘Robert Barclay and John Cassian’¹ by exploring connections with Barclay’s ‘Jesuit’ education by comparing Barclay’s use of Scripture leading to interior prayer with that of John Cassian (c. 365-435), listed amongst the classics of Western spirituality.² While Cassian is recognized by both West and East as is Augustine (354-430), so also is the Scots College of Paris, according to Tom McNally, a decidedly secular Catholic school for training secular priests rather than a school that identifies with any one expression of Catholicism.³ This chapter will demonstrate that Barclay arrives at the uncreated Grace of Eastern Christianity through a comprehensive look at the Fathers. Birkel acknowledges that Barclay never references John Cassian in any of his writings but sees great similarities in the unmediated prayer of Cassian in particular.⁴ In actuality, Barclay references Augustine Baker OSB in his ‘Jansenist’ leaning 1657 work entitled ‘*Sancta Sophia: Mystics, among the Papists their Inward Exercise*’. Carole Spencer gives a helpful appendix to the Jansenist movement and acknowledges that the Jansenists are identified with the Quakers in Ronald Knox’s book ‘*Enthusiasm*’.⁵

¹ Birkel, Michael. *Quakers Reading Mystics*. Brill Publishing, Leiden, Netherlands, Issue 1.2, 2018, 9.

² *ibid*, 9. While Birkel acknowledges that Barclay never references Cassian, he writes from the premise that Barclay’s education was Jesuit Catholic and influenced by Western Christianity: *The Classics of Western Spirituality: John Cassian Conferences*. Paulist Press, 1985.

³ The Scots College Paris, ‘1652 – 81: A Centre for Scottish Networks Tom McNally *Journal of Irish Scottish Studies*’ Volume 2 Issue 1, September 2008. Robert Barclay’s Uncle Robert Barclay’s (1612-1681) appointed to the Scots College in Paris in 1650 grew a number of secular priests opposed to the Jesuit and Franciscan missions. When appointed principal in 1652, Uncle Robert maintained his commitment to training secular priests in opposition to the Jesuits who wished to gain control (p.20-2) which eventually resulted in a Jansenist element sweeping the College following Uncle Robert Barclay’s death in 1681. Nephew Robert’s time at the Scots College was 1659-1663.

⁴ Birkel, Michael. *Quakers Reading Mystics*. Brill Publishing, Leiden, Netherlands, Issue 1.2, 2018, 12. Birkel argues that there are similarities between Barclay and Cassian as mystics reading scripture.

⁵ Spencer, Carole Dale. *Holiness: The Soul of Quakerism*, Paternoster Press, Eugene, OR, 2008, 268-9.

Birkel in his 2019 chapter on Robert Barclay and Kabbalah in *Quakers and Mysticism*⁶ looks not to the Fathers but to George Keith and references Barclay's Calvinist upbringing. Here Birkel argues for Keith's influence on Barclay's metaphysical understanding representing more of the Jewish Kabbalah expression than the Christian understanding of the second Adam.⁷ Birkel's reference to the Saints would include the apostle Paul in his epistles concerning Christ within, and the new person (Galatians 4:19; Colossians 1:27; Ephesians 4:24; Colossians 3:10).⁸ Birkel combines George Keith's words in Daniel 7:9-10 in his writing *The Way Cast Up* with reference to Jesus Christ as another Adam (I Corinthians 15:45) by Paul.⁹ This chapter will demonstrate Barclay's argument for the completion of new covenant Christianity as the fulfillment of old covenant Judaism as expressed by the saints, and Fathers of early Christianity.

Madeleine Ward in her 2017 thesis on the '*The Intellectual Context for the Development of Quakerism, 1647-1700*' states that the Quaker emphasis on a direct relationship with God through the 'Light in the conscience', or the 'Light within' appear to lead to a diminution of the bodily work of Christ.¹⁰ Further, Quakers' Christological understanding had implications for their Trinitarian theology, which Ward argues was modalism as three distinct modes of God's one presence at the rejection of consubstantiality.¹¹ Modalism finds its origin with Sabellius, who was excommunicated by Pope Calixtus I as a heretic in c. 220 AD for denying the distinction between the three divine persons.¹² Modalism in early Quaker theology Ward argues questions the hypostatic union of the second Person's humanity (body) and the eternal divinity of the Word made flesh through the virgin Mary

⁶ Kershner, Jon, editor. *Quakers and Mysticism: Comparative and Syncretic Approaches to Spirituality*. Michael Birkel: Robert Barclay and Kabbalah. Palgrave Macmillan, 2019.

⁷ *ibid*, 87

⁸ *ibid*, 86

⁹ *ibid*, 90, 87

¹⁰ Ward, Madeleine. '*The Intellectual Context for the Development of Quakerism, 1647-1700*'. PhD dissertation submitted to Wolfson College, University of Oxford, July 2017, 36.

¹¹ *ibid*, 38 Modalism is a later expression of Sabellius (fl. ca. 215) who taught that God reveals Godself in three distinct modes and never as three hypostases at the same time. John Behr, *Formation of Christian Theology*, Vol. 1. 2006, 202-3

¹² L'Huillier, Peter. *The Church of the Ancient Councils: The Disciplinary Work of the First Four Councils*. SVS Press, NY, 1996, 113-14. further explanation of Sabellius and his position

(*Theotokos*) being at the same time one with the consubstantial Father and the consubstantial Spirit.¹³ Ward argues that the Quakers' constant rhetorical contrasts of spirit and flesh reflected the first Quakers understanding of the 'Light within' to be the essentially complete, yet entirely spiritual presence of Christ.¹⁴ Ward concludes that Quaker theology through Robert Barclay focused on his notion of the *Vehiculum Dei* as the 'Spiritual body of Christ', which was neither fully human nor God, flesh nor spirit.¹⁵ This chapter will demonstrate Barclay's use of the Church Fathers in his understanding of the divinity and humanity of Jesus Christ and Christ's Body, the Church physical.

Yasuharu Nakano in his 2011 dissertation 'Self and Other in the Theology of Robert Barclay', Nakano centers his concept of perfection on the early Church fathers such as Augustine, Martin Luther (1483-1546), the outlier Philip Melanchthon (1497-1560), and John Calvin (1509-1564) until he skips to John Wesley (1703-91) the founder of Methodism.¹⁶ This listing represents both a Western Christian bias and the progression of the Protestant movement with Wesley, whom Carole Spencer provides a helpful comparison of Wesley, who draws from Barclay's propositions in his 18th century theology.¹⁷ What is germane to this thesis is that Wesleyan-Arminianism is common in Protestant circles, but not Wesleyan-Quaker, which serves to distance Quaker Christianity from its Protestant counterparts. Nakano claims that Augustine of Hippo was the first theologian to present the concept of the Kingdom from which perfection emerges.¹⁸ From this context Nakano argues that in Barclay one can find justification for 'fathers' in the faith which can instruct the weak members

¹³ *ibid*, 195 The text of the Council of Chalcedon (451)

¹⁴ Robert Barclay, *An Apology for the True Christian Divinity*, 1676, 137. Barclay claims Quakers reject both Apollinarius (310-390) and Eutyches (380-456) who questioned the full humanity and divinity of Jesus Christ

¹⁵ Ward, Madeleine. 'The Intellectual Context for the Development of Quakerism, 1647-1700'. PhD dissertation submitted to Wolfson College, University of Oxford, July 2017, 4-5 The *Vehiculum Dei* or resurrected physical and glorified body of Jesus Christ is the Christ of Revelation

¹⁶ Nakano, Yasuharu. 'Self and Other in the Theology of Robert Barclay'. PhD dissertation submitted to the University of Birmingham, April 2011, 193.

¹⁷ Spencer, Carole Dale. *Holiness: The Soul of Quakerism*, Paternoster Press, Eugene, OR, 2008, 271-279. Spencer contrasts what Wesley took from Barclay's propositions and what he left behind.

¹⁸ Nakano, Yasuharu. 'Self and Other in the Theology of Robert Barclay'. PhD dissertation submitted to the University of Birmingham, April 2011, 201

of the body.¹⁹ This chapter will demonstrate the place of the Fathers in Barclay's soteriology being representative of the Orthodox East.

Alan P. F. Sell (1935-2016) quotes George Keith (1638-1716), *The Standard of the Quakers examined, or An Answer to the Apology of Robert Barclay*, (1702), 240²⁰ that the Quakers should cease to claim St Augustine (354-430) or any other of the Latin or Greek Fathers. This chapter will demonstrate through Barclay's comprehensive use of the Church Fathers pre and post Augustine, and conclude with Sell that Barclay could have used the heritage of the Church Fathers further to solidify the Quaker 'true Christian divinity' against Keith's claim that Barclay abused the Fathers.²¹ Sell affirms that Barclay didn't always attend to the full context of the passages used but this doesn't mean that Barclay was guilty of misrepresentation.²² In his letter to King Charles II as preface to the *Apology*, Sell notes that Barclay declares that he offers 'A full explanation and vindication of Quaker principles and doctrines, by many arguments deduced from Scripture and right reason, and the testimonies of *famous authors, both ancient and modern*'.²³ [emphasis mine] This reveals Barclay's conviction that the Quakers represented the final expression of Christianity, Papist, Protestant, and otherwise to include the Fathers.

Elton Trueblood, in his 1968 book entitled *Robert Barclay*, asks the question of what does Robert Barclay have to say to searching men and women today. What is his contemporary significance for

¹⁹ *ibid*, 245

²⁰ Sell, Alan P. F. Robert Barclay (1648-1690), *The Fathers and the Inward*, Universal Saving Light: A Tercentenary Reappraisal. School of Advanced Study, University of London, *The Journal of the Friends' Historical Society*, Vol 56 No 3 1992, 210. George Keith claims to be the main contributor to Barclay's use of the church Fathers rather than the decorated history of Barclay's scholarship at the secular Scots College of Paris. Barclay represents the Jansenist influence of his era which advocated for communion with the meta-physical body and blood of Christ.

²¹ *ibid*, 222 Sell intimates that Barclay's Christian testimony was devalued because Barclay wrote from the assumption that everyone reading his works would assume a Christian baseline.

²² *ibid*, 210-11 Sell concludes that because Barclay made an appeal to the Church Fathers is a major statement in itself given the Quaker need to differentiate from 'Popery' and their claim to be the final expression of Protestantism.

²³ *ibid*, 212

all who seek to be honest and profound about the spiritual life?²⁴ This is a question concerning what Barclay offers to one becoming ‘a saint’ today. Trueblood concludes that what Barclay offers is a third way,²⁵ when the alternatives of Protestantism and Catholicism are found to be inadequate.²⁶ This third way is a worship to be performed ‘in spirit and in truth’ as revealed to the Samaritan woman (John 4:1-42) from Jesus the Savior who spoke that God is Spirit. This worship according to Barclay cannot be hindered by the Devil as worshipers are stayed upon the Lord in their inward part, nor disrupted by loss of Temple Building or burning Book. This work cannot be stopped by loss of Lutheran or Episcopalian prayer book, or by Calvinist or Presbyterian Bible and commentary. This worship is beyond communion with outward bread and wine or baptism by water. It is spiritual and in the Spirit.²⁷ This chapter will demonstrate that restored communion with God is reentering prelapsarian life with God.

²⁴ Trueblood, Elton. *Robert Barclay*, Harper & Row Publishers, New York, 1968, 236. Details the spirit of Robert Barclay’s search for the True Christian Divinity during the 1663-1667 period following his bout with Puritanism (1648-1659) and Roman Catholicism (1659-1663). Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 83-4. The ascetical search in its most perfect form, knowledge through prayer of the Divine will is a rare phenomenon conceivable only after much effort, the long experience of struggle against the passions, frequent and painful tempting from demons, and Divine intervention. Ardent prayer for help is a good thing, and essential for superiors and subordinates, the young and the old, teachers and learners, fathers and children. Silouan insisted that everyone without exception, independent of his position, circumstances, or age should always and in all things pray to God, each in so far as he knew how, for enlightenment, so that he might conform his path to God’s holy will, until he attains perfection.

²⁵ *ibid*. The ‘third way’ being beyond Roman Catholicism and Protestantism Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 82-3. When someone lacking experience sets out on the quest for the Divine Will through prayer – who cannot ‘by the taste’ distinguish with any certainty between the action of grace and the manifestation of the passions (of pride, in particular), then it is absolutely vital to have recourse to a spiritual father, and when confronted with each and any spiritual phenomenon or insinuation to adhere strictly to the ascetic precept to ‘neither accept nor reject’ until one’s spiritual father pronounces his ruling. This reveals Barclay’s careful consideration.

²⁶ *ibid*, 263-4 In a notebook discovered in Robert Barclay’s effects, his shorthand notes of 1663-1667 being prior to his conversion to Quaker Christianity, and only transcribed in the 20th century, reveal Barclay’s recording of a dream in which he concludes that the Quaker path of the Christian faith provides a way forward beyond Catholicism and Protestantism. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 83. By ‘not accepting’, the Christian guards against the danger of mistaking demonic machinations for Divine inspiration, and thus ‘giving heed to seducing spirits, and doctrines of devils’, and rendering divine homage demons. By ‘not rejecting’ when employees attributing divine action to demons and so falling into the sin of ‘blasphemy against the Holy Spirit’, like the Pharisees declared that Christ ‘is not cast out devils, but by the elves of the friends of the devils’.

²⁷ *ibid*, 262-3 Trueblood maintains that his pre-conversion shorthand notes are revealed in Barclay’s 11th proposition chapter on worship which is significant in that Barclay reveals his conversion to the Quaker path of the Christian faith in his writings on ‘Worship.’ Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 83. The second peril of dismissing the guidance of a spiritual father is that the soul may become accustomed to rejecting grace, to detesting grace, and grow so used to resisting God that she will thus define herself on the eternal question, so that her sin ‘shall

1 The Church Fathers give the Foundation to Barclay's arrival at Theosis

Barclay contends that the later reformers of Christianity are blind guides rejecting new covenant light and grace to the heathen nations. His premise is that owning the new covenant light of Christ will make the heathen nations and all professors of Christianity overflow with the true and saving knowledge of God and Christ. He is convinced that so long as the nations follow such blind guides as the reformer William Mitchell and his brethren who oppose the grace of the Spirit and the light of Christ, darkness will cover them. At the same time most 'professors' of Christianity are denying Christ in their works, and remain estranged from His new covenant light within.²⁸ This sets the agenda for what Barclay articulates through the Church Fathers, which this author argues is at the heart of the Saints' arrival at Theosis: becoming by Grace indwelling what God is by nature.

When one speaks of the Church Fathers, Barclay contends that one speaks of the patriarchs, prophets, and holy people in history. The saints know from the Lord immediately and kataphatically.²⁹ God is the only help for the person suffering from the spirit of delusion and the things of Satan. The patriarchs, prophets, and the holy people rely upon the Spirit, and in the certain

not be forgiven... Neither in this world, nor in the world to come'. Whereas the soul that promptly recognizes her wrong-doing, through repentance attains salvation, for no sin is unforgivable except the sin that is not repented of.

²⁸ Barclay's Works I, *Truth Cleared of Calumnies*, 148. The light of Christ in the heathen nations provides the true and saving knowledge of God and Christ. Irenaeus of Lyon. *The Scandal of the Incarnation: Irenaeus against the Heresies*, Ignatius Press, 1990, 53. The prophetic appearance of the eternal Word in the incarnation points to the mystery of union between God and man. All the threads of God's saving plan are intertwined in the incarnation (John 1:6-9). The exchange takes place in God becoming 'nothing', so that 'nothings' might become God. The second Adam is the recapitulation of the first Adam who turned away from God. The second Adam reveals the development of man at the highest level of divine will. Sinful, lost, wandering man is put back on course through freely choosing companionship with God, and reenters divine will.

²⁹ *ibid*, 160 The only person that can help a person deluded by Satan is God. Kataphatic is the nature of God and the positive understanding of God. Barclay claims that prophets and holy humans were in touch with the kataphatic spirit of God. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 132. The first and initial form of prayer imprisons man in constant fear in an imaginary world, in a world of dreams, and of poetic creation. The divine, and in general all that is spiritual presents itself in various fantastical aspects, following which, actual human life is gradually diffused by elements from the sphere of fantasy.

knowledge-noetic to counteract delusion.³⁰ The Spirit leads the saints both within and without the Scriptures. The more sure word of prophecy is the new covenant word of the Spirit by which the Scriptures came, by which the Scriptures are to be interpreted, and by which the saints are to be led.³¹

For Barclay, the Spirit is the teacher and living copy of the law unto the saints to which the Scriptures point. The Scriptures gain their assurance from the Spirit as teacher and as author.

Barclay asks ‘Has not the Scriptures their sureness from the inward testimony of the Spirit? Is it not blindness and darkness to say the Scriptures are surer than the light, life, and Spirit from which the Scriptures came’? Barclay argues that the Spirit is the teacher and living copy unto the saints. The Spirit writes the saints a living copy in their hearts and engraves it on fleshly tables so that the saint will come to full knowledge of truth.³²

2 The Saint Becomes Pure through the Spirit of Christ who Indwells

William Mitchell excludes the idea of Christ working in the saints, and the saints’ work in Christ.

Instead, Barclay argues that those who are in Christ Jesus witness the righteousness of the new covenant law fulfilled in them who walk according to the Spirit and not according to the flesh, or the

³⁰ *ibid.* As the Prophets relied upon the Spirit for assurance & knowledge noetic, so the Saints now rely upon the Lord in watchfulness & faithfulness. Irenaeus of Lyon. *The Scandal of the Incarnation: Irenaeus against the Heresies*, Ignatius Press, 1990, 16. If the gnostic-Christ was not supposed to suffer as did Jesus, what right did Jesus have to exhort his disciples to take up their cross and follow Him (Matthew 16:24)? According to the Gnostics, Jesus Himself did not take up the Cross, and abandoned the plan of suffering. Jesus was not talking about ‘knowledge of the cross above’, but about the suffering which He was to endure, and which awaited His disciples. If he did not really suffer, no gratitude is due Him. And when He tells us to endure the blows and to turn the other cheek, it looks like deception if He Himself has not suffered in bodily life first.

³¹ *ibid.*, 161 The more sure Word is the prophetic word of the Spirit in the heart from which the scriptures came and by which they are to be interpreted. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 383. The Holy Spirit reveals to us the mysteries of God. The Holy Spirit teaches the soul ineffable love for mankind. The Holy Spirit so adorns soul and body that man becomes like unto the Lord in the flesh, and in heaven will live forever with the Lord, and behold His glory. In the life eternal all men will be like unto the Lord. And no man could know of this mystery, were is not revealed by the Holy Spirit. The Lord is joyful and radiant, and men shall shine forth like Him, as the Lord Himself said, then shall The righteous shine forth as the sun, and Saint John the Divine says that we shall be like Him.

³² *ibid.*, 161-2 The Spirit is the teacher who has written a living copy of the law on fleshly tablets within the heart and mind. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 383. The souls of the Saints, O Lord, has Thou drawn unto Thyself, and they flow toward Thee like gentle streams. The minds of the Saints attached themselves to Thee, O Lord, and are drawn toward Thee, our Light and joy. The hearts of Thy Saints are confirmed in Thy love, O Lord, and cannot forget Thee for a moment, even when they sleep, for sweet is the grace of the Holy Spirit.

law of the flesh.³³ This distinction is between outward writings and new covenant reality. The end result is that as subordinate workers with Christ, the works of Christ in the saints are not defiled. Barclay writes that the Lord can bring a clean thing out of an unclean thing. Those in whom the work of sanctification is begun, there may be an unclean part in them for a time, but also a clean part. The saint who works with the Spirit of Christ, works with Christ according to the clean part, and it is the clean in the saint which Christ makes use of as his instrument.³⁴ This outlook articulates the progressive nature of deification.

Barclay recognizes that through the Spirit in the apostles, the apostles were made clean, Christ was preached, the church gathered, and ‘the Scriptures’ realized. To be received of the Lord, is to be justified of the Lord out of evil and uncleanness, and into the righteousness of the Incarnation. Barclay asks, ‘Was it the unclean in the apostles that brought forth the Scriptures, preached Christ, and gathered the churches... or was it the cleansing waters of the Spirit in the apostles making them clean through which they brought forth the Scriptures, preached Christ, and gathered the churches’?³⁵ The epistemology of the apostles and the saints come together in the actualization of the righteous being of Christ.

³³ *ibid*, 169 Those who walk according to the Spirit witness the righteousness of the new covenant fulfilled in them. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 356. Many holy martyrs came to know the Lord and His help in the time of their sufferings. Many monks strive much and endure valiantly for the Lord's sake; they, too, have come to know the Lord, and contend against the passions, and pray for the whole universe. The grace of God teaches them to love their enemies, since the man who has no love for his enemies cannot come to know the Lord who died on the cross for them.

³⁴ *ibid*, 175 The Lord brings clean things out of those previously unclean parts now sanctified; those parts being sanctified. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 421. The obedient man who has given himself over to the will of God has no fear of death, for his soul is accustomed to live with God, and loves God. He has excised his own will and so neither in soul nor body is he troubled by the conflict which torments the rebellious and self-willed.

³⁵ *ibid*, 177 God's righteousness comes through knowing Christ's resurrection, sufferings and death by the Spirit of Christ working within. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 138. Saint Silouan said, ‘If you are a theologian, your prayer is pure. If your prayer is pure, then you are a theologian.’ A theologian is one who knows God; who knows Christ's sufferings, death, and resurrected life within. A theologian is not one who knows God in an academic sense but in a righteous sense through God indwelling and making righteous the human heart.

Barclay is convinced that the saints' actions are as pure as the apostles' prophecy which became the Scriptures. Barclay argues that the Quakers say the Scriptures were words pure as gold, without any tincture of uncleanness or corruption, as the Scriptures came forth from the Spirit of God through the glorified [deified] penmen. This is in contrast with the reformers who say that the Scriptures were defiled with the uncleanness of the patriarchs, prophets, and apostles through which they came.³⁶

3 The Lord's Teaching through the *Nous* brings forth the Righteous Life

Immediate attentiveness to the Spirit of the Lord who cleanses from sin, and teaches is advocated by the saints. The fear of the Lord, and the Lord's teaching through the *nous* which is the highest level of the mind beyond images or thoughts brings forth the righteous life in the saint. Barclay sees that advocating for continuance in sin and denying immediate revelation is a sign that the fear of the Lord is absent in the heart, and that the Lord's teaching is resisted in the mind. Instead, the saints maintain immediate access to the Spirit to which Jesus Christ as way, truth, and life points.³⁷ The ministry of apostle, prophet, and evangelist coincides with every saint ministering as moved, alongside pastors and teachers. Barclay argues that the continuance of prophets, evangelists, and apostles coincides equally with the continuance of pastors and teachers. Any saint may speak at any time when the Church is gathered as the Lord moves by his Spirit. Barclay quotes Paul's instruction to the Corinthians '*For ye may all prophesy one by one, that all may learn and all be comforted*' (I Corinthians 14:31).³⁸

³⁶ *ibid*, 179-80 The purity of the penman and council has direct correlation with the purity of the Scriptures.

³⁷ *ibid*, 182-3 Quakers are with the Saints in advocating for Immediate Fellowship & the Righteous life that comes from Communion with the Lord. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 354. We do not require wealth or learning in order to know the Lord. We must simply be obedient and sober, have a humble spirit and love our fellow man. The Lord will love such a soul as this, of His own accord may make Himself manifest to her and instruct her in love and humility, and give her all things necessary for her to find rest in God.

³⁸ *ibid*, 198 Any Saint can and should speak when moved by the Spirit when gathered with other Saints. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 92. Silouan held theology and theologians in great respect but the merits of scientific theology and its positive role related in his mind mainly to the historical aspect of Church life and not to the real, eternal life of the Spirit.

4 The Life and Teaching of Christ in the Lives of the Saints are Priority

The life and teaching of Christ in the Gospels, and the lives of the saints since Christ are priority for Barclay. Rather than embracing the practice of the saints and the teaching of Christ, William Mitchell dotes on questions, and fixates on words claiming that it is pride to do otherwise.³⁹ For Barclay, in order to be of God, the all-encompassing new covenant ‘Spirit of truth’ is the ground of knowledge greater than the Scriptures old and new. The certainty of the Spirit of truth is acknowledged by the saints now, and by the prophets who received the prophecies. The apostle John writes that by being of God one knows the Spirit of truth from the spirit of error (I John 4:6).⁴⁰ The Lord directs by putting words into the saint’s mouth according to new covenant design. Mitchell maintains that God putting words into people’s mouths is ceased. Instead, Barclay counters that the reader of Isaiah (59:21) will observe that the Lord promises his Spirit, and new covenant word to be put into the mouth, directing his people forever.⁴¹

Barclay contends that the later reformers digress from Christ’s indwelling, which the first Protestants and Fathers of the church embraced. Knowing Christ’s indwelling brings righteousness through mortification, which is more than righteousness through imputation. Instead, the later reformers’ earthly life does not lead to the righteous [deified] life. Barclay claims that amongst the

³⁹ Barclay’s Works I, *William Mitchell Unmasked*, 243-4. Mitchell embraces scripture words & rejects assimilation of the practices of Christ and the saints, considering it Pride. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 82. According to Silouan, the one who prays fervently may suffer many vicissitudes – struggle against the enemy, battle with self, with the passions, with people, against the imagination; and in these cases the mind is not pure and nothing is clear. But when pure prayer comes, when the mine united with the heart silently stands before God, when the soul is conscious of grace within herself and is given over to the Divine will, unhindered by the action of the passions and the imagination – then prayer heeds the inspiration of grace.

⁴⁰ *ibid*, 271-2 By the Spirit of truth the Christian knows the spirit of error. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 78. In practice, the process of every Christian when faced with the necessity of finding a solution consonant with the will of God, makes an inner rejection of all his own knowledge, his preconceived ideas, desires, plans. Freed from everything of his own, he then turns his heart to God in prayer and attention, and the first thought born in his soul after such prayer he accepts as a sign from on high.

⁴¹ *ibid*, 272 The Spirit putting Words in Men’s Mouth will continue to direct the people of the Lord forever. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 78. Such search for knowledge of God’s will through direct invocation prayer leads man, especially in need and distress, to hear God answering him in his heart, and he learns to interpret God’s guidance. Thus must we all learn to discern the Divine Will. And if we fail, we shall never find the way.

first Protestants there were several of heavenly and spiritual conversations who knew God, and were mortified unto righteousness through their knowing. Mitchell's laying claim to the first Protestants, for Barclay, is the same as the Jews boasting of Abraham as their father. The later reformers' mental identification with Christ does not lead to the righteous life brought forth through communion with Christ indwelling.⁴²

For Barclay any saint may prophesy when met together. The extraordinary ministry of the saint is not limited to 'ordinary' rules. In the ordinary office of the church, all have a calling while the extraordinary calling exists at the same time as those 'ordinarily' called.⁴³ Barclay argues that the saint called to the extraordinary goes beyond the ministry of the ordinary. Persecution came to the Fathers who believed 'extraordinary' truth, which truth was equally confirmed in Scripture.⁴⁴ There is a comparison with the persecution of the saints due to extraordinary service, and the Quakers being persecuted. Barclay states that the Quakers are vilified because they live in accordance with the very Scriptures which the Protestants claim. The Quakers are persecuted by the Protestants, in the same way as the Church Fathers were persecuted.⁴⁵

⁴² *ibid*, 287-8 Barclay finds Mitchell, laying claim to the first Protestants, having the same effect as the Jews boasting of Abraham as their father. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 78-9. The process of hearing God's voice in its more perfected form is preceded by the practice of constant prayer in which the mind is stayed in the heart. But in order to hear the Divine voice more surely in himself, man must cast off his own will and be prepared for every sacrifice, like Abraham, and even like Christ Himself, who, in the words of St. Paul 'became obedient unto death, even the death of the cross'. The man who adopts this course will succeed only after he has learned by experience how the grace of the Holy Spirit operates; and when fierce self-denial has taken root in his heart – that is, if he has resolutely determined to deny his own petty individual will in order to acquire and fulfill the holy and divine will. Then the significance of Silouan's query 'How do the perfect speak?' will be disclosed. Then will the words of the Apostles and Holy fathers, 'It seemed good to the Holy Ghost, and to us' (Acts 15:28) sound natural.

⁴³ *ibid*, 300 The Saint is Equipped & Sent in Extraordinary ways while worshipping & serving amongst the 'ordinary'. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 79. Man is created in God's image and likeness, and is called to fullness of direct communing with God. All men, therefore, without exception, should be treading this way, but experience shows that such is by no means a path for everyone. This is because some people neither hear, nor understand God speaking in their hearts: they listen to the urging of passion, which inhabits the soul and with its clamors drowns out the still small voice of God.

⁴⁴ Barclay's Works I, *Catechism and Confession of Faith*, 340. The Fathers were persecuted by the Church.

⁴⁵ *ibid*, 341 The Quakers are vilified because they live according to the scriptures which the Protestants claim. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 79. When he hereby is perfected, and the voice of God realized, the person will better understand the passages in the Old and New Testaments which tell of similar direct

5 Saints experience oneness with God like the Father and the Son experience Oneness

Barclay maintains that the oneness of the saints with the Father and the Son involves partaking of the divine nature (II Peter 1:4). Christ who sanctifies, and the saint being sanctified are all one; being made partakers of the divine nature of the Father and the Son. Christ prayed that his disciples would be one with the Father and the Son, as Christ was one with the Father (John 17:19-23).⁴⁶

6 Saints become ‘Fools for Christ’ in the eyes of the Christian Professor and the Worldly Profane

For Barclay the way of all saints is entering the straight path of uncreated Grace without falling to Roman hierarchy or Libertine anarchy. Barclay instructs that those having experienced the work of God in their hearts have obtained entrance into the straight and even way of truth without falling to the extremes of hierarchy or anarchy which is the path of the saints in all ages. Their movement forward, like those in Nehemiah’s day, is with one eye to the work, and one eye to the adversary.⁴⁷

‘Fools for Christ’ preach the gospel by evidence and demonstration of the Spirit; their testimony and words piercing through to the inner man of the heart (I Peter 3:4), reaching that of God in the

conversations between the soul and God, and he will have a truer conception of the manner in which the Apostles and Prophets spoke.

⁴⁶ *ibid*, 427 ‘Article IX’. *Concerning the Unity of the Saints with Christ*. As the Son is one with the Father, so don’t the saints experience oneness with the Father and the Son, and with one another Irenaeus of Lyon. *The Scandal of the Incarnation: Irenaeus against the Heresies*, Ignatius Press, 1990, 22. The Word exists in the Father, He knows the One in whom He exists; in other words, He is not ignorant of Himself. The oneness of Father and Son is a relationship of knowing to include all saints throughout time and eternity.

⁴⁷ Barclay’s Works I, *The Anarchy of the Ranters and Hierarchy of the Romanists Refuted*, 459. Navigating the straight and narrow vision in becoming a saint includes avoiding the extremes of hierarchy and anarchy. Nehemiah 4:11-23; 6:16 Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 81-2. To speak of the way of faith, discerned and confirmed in the millennial reign of the church which constitutes the unconcealed mystery of Christian life, surpasses the bounds of indolent everyday existence and generally limited spiritual experience. This is never without risk because many may misunderstand and wrongly apply the message. Then, instead of good, harm may result, especially if the ascetic life is entered upon with prideful self-confidence. When Silouan was approached for spiritual counsel he was unwilling and would refuse to provide any answer of his own. He maintained Saint Seraphim of Sarov’s words ‘When I spoke my own idea, I make mistakes,’ adding that the mistakes might be slight but could be grave. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.’ 2016, 92-3. Graham himself understood the call to perfection. At the Swarthmore Conference of 1896, the climactic point of his first visit to America, he recorded, ‘I was under a sweet compulsion driving me towards sainthood’, ‘I am called to sainthood’. And he prayed: ‘Sainthood & selflessness always, Lord, may that compulsion be near me’. Religious emotion was fine, even necessary, but Graham distrusted external aids to religion, music, stained glass, outward sacraments, that, while stirring the emotions, might come between the sincere worshipper and the object of devotion. For Barclay sainthood included humility and perseverance through the Incarnation event without and within. The saint is made holy through Christ resurrected within. This process included the purifying baptism of the heart by the Spirit with fire.

conscience. Those receiving the testimony feel their souls eased and the day of the Lord dawn within.⁴⁸ Rather than preaching liberty to the flesh, the testimony of the ‘fools’ are as thunderbolts pouring down the judgment of God upon the Christian ‘professor’ and the worldly ‘profane’, reaching the tender seed and plant of God within.⁴⁹ ‘Fools for Christ’ knock down empty forms, shallow fellowship, false worship, and foolish fashion held by the wise, and invite all to come to the dawning day of the Lord within.⁵⁰ As with the Fathers in ancient times, some turn back who cannot carry the reproach of the cross of Christ, the seed sown in them being scorched, and they become innovators, introducing new doctrines, despising the apostles and elders.⁵¹

7 Fathers’ Exhort, Instruct, Reprove, Condemn, and Judge those Begotten in Christ Jesus

As in the history of the Church, God assigned fathers, instructors, and elders to identify those begotten in Christ Jesus. God, who watched over his children in old covenant times, Barclay claims, has brought forth the truth in new covenant integrity by delivering the Quakers from the false

⁴⁸ *ibid*, 469-70 The Lord God sends forth his instruments fashioned with heavenly wisdom and counsel appearing as ‘fools’ in the judgment of men. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 79-80. In the Church another course lies open – to seek out a spiritual father. This is what Silouan did, considering the humble path of obedience to be the most trustworthy path of all. He believed that because of the faith of the one turned to him, the spiritual father's counsel would always be right, beneficial, pleasing to God. This materialized when he saw the spiritual father, staretz Abraham transfigured in the image of Christ and ineffably radiant. Filled with blessed faith, he lived the mysteries of the Church in reality while at the same time living on the psychological plane, too. When a father-confessor answers a question in the performance of his ministry he is at the same time unaffected by the passion influencing his inquirer so that he can see more clearly, and is more easily accessible to the action of God's grace.

⁴⁹ *ibid*, 470 The tender seed and plant of God was reached in those receiving the judgment of God. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 80. A spiritual confessor's reply will usually bear the imprint of imperfection but this is not because he lacks the grace of knowledge but because perfection is beyond the strength and grasp of the one inquiring of him. Notwithstanding its inadequacy, spiritual instruction, accepted with faith and effectively heeded, will always lead to an increase of good. This process is often subverted because the inquirer, seeing before him an ‘ordinary’ man, hesitates, loses his faith a little, and so does not accept the first word of his spiritual father and raises objections, putting forth his own opinions and doubt.

⁵⁰ *ibid*. Resisting the reasoning of humanity and the deceitfulness of the serpent, these ministers minister according to the inerrant Spirit. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 421. Our manner of living is simple but requires wisdom. Wisdom is learned by long experience. Wisdom is given of God for obedience. The Lord loves the obedient soul, and where the Lord loves He gives whatsoever the soul may ask of God.

⁵¹ *ibid*, 472-3 As with the Israelites leaving Egypt, some return to the lusts and riotousness of which they had been purified disregarding God's new covenant design. Barclay speaks of the extreme of being Christ's disciple. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 422. Feats of spiritual endeavor without obedience foster vainglory. The obedient man has excised self-will completely, and only heeds his spiritual father, wherefore he is free from every care, and prays with an undistracted mind. When a man lives in obedience, his mind is entirely taken up by God whereas the man who does not know obedience is concerned with all sorts of things and so cannot contemplate God.

doctrines which prevailed in the [scholastic] apostasy of the 8th through the 16th centuries. Now that the government of God's Son, the Lord Jesus Christ is established, there ought to be fathers who beget people in Christ Jesus, instructors, and elders in the faith who exhort, instruct, reprove, condemn, and judge, that the body of Christ be edified.⁵²

Barclay contends that it is not contradictory to follow new covenant Grace in one's heart and to follow the example of a saint led by the Spirit. In response to the high-minded Corinthians (I Corinthians 4:8), it is no contradiction to follow Grace in oneself, to be persuaded in one's heart, and also to be a follower of Paul, for Paul's way and example was none other than the Spirit of God within, which would lead the Corinthians to follow, if they were obedient.⁵³ Barclay affirms that there is room for 'fathers' in the faith. Though there are fathers, the Lord does reveal his will to all who sink down into the seed. Though there are fathers, none are to exercise dominion over their brethren, or force them to do contrary to what the Lord leads by his Spirit, knowing that the enemy lies near to betray under false pretense. The Lord has, does, and will reveal his will to his people, and has and does raise members to whom he gives discerning, power, and authority to instruct, reprove, and command in certain cases. The person of humility, keeping to their calling in the good of truth, shuts out the murmurer, the Spirit leading the saint to maintain unity, and to concur with

⁵² *ibid*, 473-4 Fathers in the faith are needed today as in the past. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 422. Obedience preserves a man from pride. For obedience he receives the gift of prayer and the grace of the Holy Spirit. Had the angels observed obedience, they would have continued in heaven, and had Adam not disobeyed, he and his seed would have remained in Paradise. But even now it is possible to regain Paradise through repentance. The Lord loves us dearly, despite our sins, only we will humble ourselves and love our enemies. He who loves not his enemies will never find peace, though he were set down in paradise.

⁵³ *ibid*, 483 The unerring Spirit in Paul is the same unerring Spirit in the Christian. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 80. Staretz Silouan discussed the role of the spiritual father with Archimandrite Missail, a spiritual man favored and manifestly blessed by God. 'How can a monk find out the Divine will?' He answered, 'He must accept my first word as the will of God. Divine grace rests on him who does so but if he resists me, then I, as a mere mortal, will back down'.

their sojourners. The high-minded do not sink down into the seed, to be of no reputation for Adam's sake. Instead they are a scorn to the world, strengthening the world's hardness of heart.⁵⁴

Barclay looks to Paul who defines those called to be sanctified in Christ Jesus, who are the saints or Church of God (I Corinthians 1:2).⁵⁵ As new covenant temples of the Holy Spirit, Christ appears in 10,000 of his saints to establish truth, mercy, and justice on earth. They are the temples of the Holy Spirit in whom the Spirit of God dwells to display the work of God, to reach the fatherless through their tender love and care, putting them into employment, and giving them education.⁵⁶ Virtue comes by abiding in the infallible judgment of the Spirit 'in the particular' which strengthens one's standing amongst the body. Barclay warns that negligence of the Spirit 'in the particulars' hurts one's standing.⁵⁷

⁵⁴ *ibid*, 484-5 Humility in surrendering to the seed of the second Adam quiets the murmurer and dissenter. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 80. When asked for counsel a spiritual father prays to God for understanding but he answers in his capacity as man, according to the measure of his faith. 'I believe, and therefore have I spoken', wrote the apostle Paul 'but we know in part, and we prophesy in part'. When the spiritual father gives advice, or tells a man what to do, he himself is anxious not to sin and is on trial before God. The moment, then, that he meets with objection, or even inner resistance on the part of his inquirer, he does not insist or presume that what he was saying was the expression of God's will. In his position as man, he withdraws.

⁵⁵ *ibid*, 493 The principles and grounds by which the church is gathered, and the hierarchy and order they maintain contributes to sanctification and holiness (Theosis) as their chief end. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 82. Silouan made a clear distinction between the 'world of experience' and direct inspiration from on High – the word of the Spirit. The word of experience was precious but the word from on High, loftier and more trustworthy. Sometimes Silouan would voice the will of God definitely and with confidence, telling his inquirer what the will of God was that he should do thus and thus. Other times he would answer that he did not know God's will for him. You would say that sometimes the Lord does not disclose His will even to the Saints, because the one who approached did so with a false and deceitful heart.

⁵⁶ *ibid*, 500-1 Temples of God display the fruit of God in the world, through the Spirit of God dwelling in them. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 81. When someone objected, even if only mildly, to some commission or instruction from the Higoumen Missail, the generally strong-minded ascetic personnel, in spite of his administrative post, would usually reply, 'Well, all right, do as you like', and did not repeat his injunction. Likewise, when Silouan met with resistance, he would fall silent. Why is this so? On the one hand because the Spirit of God suffers neither violence or argument. On the other, because the will of God is too great a matter to be contained or received perfect expression in the words of a spiritual father. Only the man who accepts these words of the spiritual father with faith as being pleasing to God, who does not submit them to his own judgment, or argue about them, has found the true path, for he genuinely believes that 'with God all things are possible'. This is the way of faith, discerned and confirmed in the millennial experience of the Church.

⁵⁷ *ibid*, 554. Infallible judgment is seated in the Spirit and in the power of God more than in 'the particulars' of any one person. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 82. Silouan's position that 'The perfect never say anything of themselves... They only say what the Spirit inspires them to say' is not always accorded even to those approaching perfection, just as the Apostles and other Saints did not always work miracles, and the Spirit of prophecy did not operate in equal measure in the Prophets, speaking out powerfully at times, and others silent.

8 The 'True Seed' of God's Love' is communicated unanimously by the Fathers

Barclay contends that the true seed of God's love in the ancient Fathers of Christianity is embraced by the Quakers. The Fathers have concluded with one voice that there is no true knowledge but that which is revealed noetically and kataphatically by God's own Spirit inwardly.⁵⁸ To illustrate Quakerism being affirmed by the Fathers Barclay quotes the Fathers.

Augustine (354-430) taught that the inward master teaches, Christ teaches, inspiration teaches; the image that created redeems, who calls humanity by faith indwelling by his Spirit. Unless He speaks inwardly it is needless to cry out.⁵⁹ Clement of Alexandria (150-215) taught that there is a difference between what the truth says and what someone says of the truth. The truth is nigh unto us, even in our houses.⁶⁰ Tertullian (160-220) taught that the Holy Spirit brought knowledge to bear upon all things, little by little, until one is formed and brought to perfection. The devil works and stirs the mind to iniquity, little by little, until one is deformed and brought to destruction.⁶¹ Jerome (347-420)

⁵⁸ Robert Barclay, *An Apology for the True Christian Divinity*, 1676, 30. The Fathers conclude with one voice that the seed of the Eternal Knowledge of God is revealed in the heart by God's Spirit. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 133. The third form of prayer, or when the mind is conjoined with the heart is the normal religious state for the human spirit, desired, sought after, and bestowed from on high. Every believer experiences this union of mind and heart when he prays attentively, 'from the bottom of his heart'. He knows it to an even greater degree when his heart is softened and he feels the sweet sense of Divine love. Tears of compunction during prayer are a sure sign that the mind is united with the heart, and that prayer has found its pure place in its initial step in assent to God. The mind is prayerfully attentive, being stationed in the heart.

⁵⁹ *ibid*. Christ the Word himself who created humanity teaches, who dwells within by his Spirit. Irenaeus of Lyon. *The Scandal of the Incarnation: Irenaeus against the Heresies*, Ignatius Press, 1990, 21. The name 'Christ' implies the Anointer, the Anointed, and the Unction with which He is anointed. The Father is the Anointer, the Son is the Anointed, and the Spirit in whom He is anointed is the Unction. The Father is assisted in everything by His Offspring and Figuration, that is, the Son and the Spirit, the Word and Wisdom, who all the angels serve, and to whom they are subject. It was through His tireless Word that the Father made all that He created.

⁶⁰ *ibid*, 31. Truth dwelling within is different from truth said without or speculated in the brain. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 132-3. A second form of prayer different from fantastical imagination is when the heart and mind are wide open to all that is extraneous and one is left continually vulnerable to the most heterogeneous influences from without, unable to discern what exactly is happening objectively. Alien thoughts and conflicts arise in man, impotent by the onslaught of the passions. Grace sometimes comes with this sort of prayer, putting man in a good frame of mind, but because his inner disposition is not right, he is unable to continue in this grace. Having accumulated a measure of religious knowledge and achieved decorous behavior, and being content with matters, he gradually takes to speculative theology, and in step with success in this, his inner battle against the subtle passions of vanity and pride decreases, and loss of grace in the soul intensifies. As it develops, this form of prayer characterized by concentration of attention in the brain, leads to rational, philosophical intuition which opens the way to an abstract world of the imagination. This, like the first fantastical prayer, is no more than conceptual imaginative prayer.

⁶¹ *ibid*. The Holy Spirit brings knowledge little by little bringing one to perfection. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 380-1. And elder asked Saint Antony, Why does the Lord not love me with

taught that the law is inward and spiritual and needs the revelation of the Spirit to understand both the law, and the Scriptures as dictated to the apostles.⁶² Athanasius (296-373) taught that the Savior daily reveals the knowledge of the Father, draws unto piety, persuades unto virtue, teaches immortality, excites the desire of heavenly things, inspires power against death, and shows himself unto everyone.⁶³ Gregory the Great (540-604) taught that unless the Spirit that teaches is within, the doctor without labors in vain.⁶⁴ Cyril of Alexandria (378-444) taught that people know that Jesus is Lord by the Holy Spirit in the same way that people taste honey and know that honey is sweet by its proper quality.⁶⁵

sweetness, and give me grace beyond comprehension? Why is it that you labor less than I did, yet, your glory is greater than mine? Antony replied, because I love God more than you do. The man who loves God loves his brother also, as Saint John the disciple said, and when anyone offends us, we must pray to God for him as for ourselves; and this will then become a habit. We ourselves are infirmed and weak, but the Lord is our help here, for He loves us greatly. The Lord loves us so greatly that we cannot apprehend such love. We see the cross, we know that He was crucified for us and suffered death, but still the soul is unable to understand the nature of this love, which is made known only through the Holy Spirit.

⁶² *ibid.* The New Covenant law and the New Testament scriptures require the Spirit for understanding. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.' 2016, 61-2. Serious thinkers found it necessary to consider how a place for the spirit, or the soul, or, for Quakers, the Inward Light, could be found in a science of humanity which could no longer accept any separation between the material body and the mind which animates it. Darwinism exacerbated the problem. Darwin himself, according to D.C. Dennett, was regrettably led into a materialist view of the human mind when he concluded from the fact that mental characteristics were inherited that the mind must have a material basis. Janet Oppenheim has a long chapter on attempts to combat suggestions that the mind is identical with the brain and that there is no such thing as 'spirit' or 'soul'. Quakers responded to such challenges as did other religious people of the time. One resource was the belief in 'vitalism', or the idea that life itself, or the 'vital force', has a real existence not to be accounted for in strictly physical terms. The belief could be used to combat the determinism which seemed to inhere in a materialist view of nature. Barclay lists several Fathers, and would list more Fathers who with one voice center on the Spirit to guide noetically, kataphatically, and apophatically. It is by the Spirit of Pentecost that one understands the new covenant fulfilled law through Christ within and the shadow Scriptures.

⁶³ *ibid.* Piety, Virtue, Immortality, Knowledge & Power are revealed by the Savior. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 382. Let us consider how each day we eat bread and drink water, yet on the morrow our bodies need drink and food again. In like manner the recollection of God's bounties never wearies the soul but disposes her still more to think on God. Or again: the more wood you pile on a fire, the more heat you get, and thus it is with God – the more you think on Him, the more are you fired with love and fervor towards Him. If people only knew what the Lord's love was, they were flock to Christ, and He would warm all men with His grace. His passion is beyond words. From love of God the soul forgets the earth.

⁶⁴ *ibid.*, 31-2. The Spirit within both teacher and student must be acknowledged for effective learning. Irenaeus of Lyon. *The Scandal of the Incarnation: Irenaeus against the Heresies*, Ignatius Press, 1990, 44. How can God be unknown if He is known by the Gnostics? Whatever is known, even by a few, is not unknown. The Lord did not say that the Father and the Son could not be known, for in that case His coming would have been pointless. He did not come to tell us to not seek God because He is unknowable and you will never find Him. What the Lord taught is no one can know God unless God teaches them, in other words, without God, God cannot be known. What is more, it is the Father's will that God be known.

⁶⁵ *ibid.*, 32. The Quality of the Honey is in its Sweetness. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 355. Some ask, how is it possible to know God? I would reply, the Holy Spirit is witness. The Holy Spirit

Bernard of Clairvaux (1090-1153) taught that people should walk in the ways of the heart and that their souls always be in their hands, that they might hear what the Lord says. Religious people, who do not attend to what the Spirit speaks inwardly, flatter none.⁶⁶ Martin Luther (1483-1546) taught that no person can know God or understand the word of God unless they immediately receive it from the Holy Spirit. Outside of the Holy Spirit school, nothing is taught but mere talk.⁶⁷ Barclay quotes the reformer Philipp Melanchthon (1497-1560) who taught that God is a Spirit and is neither perceived, nor known, nor heard but by the Spirit. No knowledge prevails to the producing of redemption from sin but that which proceeds from the warm influence of God's Spirit upon the heart, and from the comfortable shining of God's light upon the understanding.⁶⁸ Doctor John Smith (1618-1652) of Cambridge taught that Christ gives his Spirit to humanity, and the Spirit searches the deep things of God. The best and truest knowledge of God is not wrought by labor of the brain, but by that which is kindled within, by heavenly warmth in the heart. Smith quotes Plotinus (204-270) 'Seek God within the soul. He is described by an intellectual touch of him'. Since the soul has its sense as does the body: the Disciple John (I John 1:1) and King David (Psalm 34:8; 36:9; 110:1)

knows, and He instructs. But can anyone see the Spirit? The disciples saw the Spirit descending in tongues of fire, and we feel His presence within us, sweeter far than all earthly things. The prophets tasted Him, and spoke to the people, and the people hearken unto them. The holy Apostles were filled with the Holy Ghost, and preached salvation to mankind, fearing not, for the Spirit of God was their strength.

⁶⁶ *ibid.* Walk in the ways of the Heart with your Soul in your hands, attending the Ears of the Heart to the Spirit of Truth. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 381. What shall I render unto Thee, O Lord, for that Thou hast poured such great mercy on my soul? Grant, I beg Thee, that I may see my iniquities, and ever weep before Thee, for Thou art filled with love for humble souls, and dost give them the grace of the Holy Spirit. O merciful God, forgive me. Thou seest how my soul is drawn to thee, her Creator. Thou hast wounded my soul with Thy love, and she thirsts for Thee, and wearies without end, and day and night, insatiable, reaches toward Thee, and has no wish to look upon this world, though I love it, but above all I love Thee, my Creator and my soul longs after Thee. Oh my Creator, why have I, Thy little creature, grieved Thee so often? Yet Thou hast not remembered my sins.

⁶⁷ *ibid.* The Primitive Reformers were built on the Holy Spirit alone being the only teacher of holy Scripture.

⁶⁸ *ibid.*, 32-3. Inward, Immediate, Objective New Covenant Understanding comes from God's Spirit-Noetic in the Heart. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 133. The virtue of the movement and installation of the mind in the heart is that the imagination is curtailed and the mind released from all mental images that have invaded it. In the heart, the mind becomes all ears and eyes, and sees and hears every thought approaching from without, before it can enter the heart. Praying the while, the mind not only refuses to admit extraneous thoughts but positively thrusts them aside and preserves itself from association with them thereby cutting off the action of every disordered passion in its initial state.

affirm it is kataphatic sensation more than speculation.⁶⁹ Smith also states truth is known in Jesus, in a Christ like nature; in that sweet, mild, and humble spirit of Jesus which spreads like the morning sun upon the souls of humanity, full of light and life. Smith quotes Origen (182-254) who taught that the Spirit brings a divine light in the soul which is clearer and more convincing than speculation or demonstration.⁷⁰ Barclay brings the thought of the Fathers from the beginning of the Christian movement up to his present. The living tradition of the departed saints is continued through the lives of the saints in present time.

Barclay affirms that ‘the object’ of the patriarchs’ faith is the promise, word, or testimony of God speaking in the mind noetically. The patriarchs’ lives were found upon the revelation of God’s will within. A key example is Noah as described in Hebrews 11:1-7.⁷¹ The patriarchs were aware that the devil might form a sound of words, convey it to the outward ear, and deceive the senses by making things appear that were not. The secret testimony of God’s Spirit in the heart [*nous*] assured the patriarchs that the voice, dream, or vision was from God.⁷²

⁶⁹ *ibid*, 33. The Truth of God is too often enshrined in Books more than in the Heart.

⁷⁰ Robert Barclay, *An Apology for the True Christian Divinity*, 33-4. God gives his Spirit to humanity like the sun that searches the deep things of God and brings clarity through divine light. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 93. Silouan mostly spoke of God as ‘the Lord’. By this title he would mean the Holy Trinity, sometimes God-the-Father or God-the-Son, and rarely the Holy Spirit, whom he invoked very often indeed, and where he could have used a pronoun, again and again he would repeat in full the designation, the Holy Spirit. There is no doubt that he did this because the name, Holy Spirit, like the name, Lord and other Divine appellations, evoked a lively response in his soul, a feeling of joy and love.

⁷¹ *ibid*, 42-3. The saints of Hebrews 11 have the revelation of God revealed in them. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 92. Silouan believed that the way to apprehend the Word of God was only in fulfilling Christ's commandments. ‘And the Jews marvelled, saying, How knows this man letters, having never learned? Jesus answered them, ‘My doctrine is not mine, but his that sent me. If any man will do his will, he shall know of the doctrine, whether it be of God, or whether I speak of myself’. The Lord summed up the whole of Holy Scripture in one saying: ‘Love God and thy neighbor’. Yet the meaning of Christ's word *love* will remain a mystery for the philologist to the end of time. The word *love* is the very name of God Himself, and its true sense is only revealed by the action of God Himself.

⁷² *ibid*, 44. The testimony of the Spirit in the heart assured the Saints that the testimony was of God and not the devil. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 93. The phenomenon of joy and feeling of life and love in the heart at the invocation of God was the cause of prolonged theological argument as to the nature of the Divine Name. The debate engrossed Russian theological thinking and the church's hierarchy from 1912 to 1916 which led to happy results. The argument about the Divine Name coincided with the period in Silouan's spiritual life which found him waging a vigorous war against every manifestation in himself of the passions of vainglory and pride, the main causes of his heavy sufferings. Carrying constantly in his heart the most sweet Name of Christ – the Jesus Prayer never ceased its action in him – he notwithstanding distanced himself from all argument concerning the nature of this Name.

In old covenant history, Barclay states that Abraham knew the three men were ‘angels’ (Genesis 18) by the persuasion of God’s Spirit in his heart. For the patriarchs, it is only mentioned ‘and God said’ and ‘the word of the Lord came unto such and such saying’.⁷³ Barclay concludes that the ancients’ one faith, one God, one revelation is consistent with the one past, one present, and one future rock who is Christ.⁷⁴

9 GOD is superior to the Scriptures in Communicating to the Saints

Barclay looks to Augustine who says that the new covenant law implanted in the heart is available without need of priest. Augustine distinguishes between the Jewish Law given through Moses, and the gospel. The Mosaic Law was written without, while the new covenant law fulfilled is written upon the heart.⁷⁵ Since God has promised his Spirit to lead his children, every child ought to be led by the Spirit. If any depart from the certain Guide in deeds, and yet inwardly pretends to be led into things that are not of the Guide, the fault is in the organ of humanity (ears, eyes, mouth) and is not the Guide.⁷⁶

He knew that through the Jesus Prayer the grace of the Holy Spirit comes into the heart; that invoking the Divine Name of Jesus hallows the whole man, consuming the passions in him, but he avoided any dogmatic interpretation of the experience they brought, fearing to err in his reasoning. The debates saddened Silouan whose nights were filled with ‘Adam’s Lament’.

⁷³ *ibid*, 44-5. Abraham knew the three men were angels by God’s Spirit in his heart.

⁷⁴ *ibid*, 45-6. The faith of the Ancients coincides with the one eternal Rock who is Christ. I Corinthians 10:4

⁷⁵ *ibid*, 57-8. New Covenant Law is implanted in the Heart. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.’ 2016, 105-6. Even so fair-minded and reasonable a Quaker as Edward Grubb took a negative view of the nineteenth-century evangelical movement among Quakers. In 1896 he wrote a paper on the Yearly Meeting of 1836, a meeting in which evangelicals came head to head with conservatives on the vital question of the authority of the Bible as opposed to that of the Light Within. The meeting took place in the midst of the ‘Beacon’ controversy that arose with the publication in January 1835 of Isaac Crewdson’s *Beacon to the Society of Friends*. This book attacked Robert Barclay for elevating the authority of the Inward Light above that of Scripture, and blamed him for continuing ‘error’ among Friends, especially among the Hicksites in America: it focused on the issue of scriptural authority. Grubb’s sympathies are clear: he grants that the new, evangelical, party among Friends had the zeal necessary to a religious movement. Yet ‘the deeper truth, in spite of all their narrowness and formalism, lay with the older party.’ Unfortunately the ‘older party’ was not sufficiently sure of their ground. In a later essay Grubb blames them for confusing the authority of the Inward Light with that of ‘practices handed down by tradition’. Graham joins Grubb in defending Robert Barclay in his distinguishing between the outward Jewish Law and the new covenant law written in the mind and heart. The Inward Light is Christ, the light of the world. Barclay draws on Augustine (354-430) in his emphasis on the implanted law being available without priest. The conservatives stand with Robert Barclay against the evangelicals.

⁷⁶ *ibid*, 60. False Leadings result from the organ of Humanity and not from the Spirit as guide. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 88. It is well-known that all heresiarchs have always based themselves

Barclay concludes that God is teacher of his people himself. Such as are under the new covenant, need no person to teach them. Yet it was the fruit of Christ's Ascension to send teachers for the perfecting of the saints. The same work ascribed to teachers is ascribed to the Scriptures in making the person of God complete. The Scripture is not to go before the teaching of the Spirit, nor to rob any of the Spirit.⁷⁷

10 The Righteous in Scripture and the Saints in History are a Telios to the Christian

Barclay contends that the saints in history and the righteous in Scripture are the *telios* of the saint's looking glass. Barclay argues that one should view the conditions and grievances of the saints and find their experience of snares and deliverance answerable to one's own experience; being wise unto salvation, seasonably reproofed, and instructed in righteousness. This is complementary to the work of the Scriptures that people may witness them fulfilled in them, as was the stamp of the Spirit in the saints. It is only the person baptized in the Spirit who makes use of the Scriptures in becoming a saint.

The unstable and unlearned wrestle the Scriptures to their own destruction. The unlearned fishermen drew from the Spirit, and not from Aristotle's logic.⁷⁸ Barclay illustrates an instance where logic has taken root in the predestination and predetermination doctrine. Predestination and pre-determinism were not mentioned in the first 400 years after Christ. All ancient writers, teachers, and doctors pass

on the Holy Scriptures, only their interpretations differing. The Apostle Peter spoke of this perversion of the meaning of the Scriptures when they are construed personally, by the individual reader. (II Peter 3:6)

⁷⁷ *ibid*, 87-8. The same work is ascribed to the Saints, as to the Scriptures in making the People of God Perfect. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 89. By studying the Holy Scriptures, the works of the Holy Fathers and the inexhaustible dogmatic and prayerful treasures contained in liturgical books, the monk meets with ineffable great riches, and so he is not disposed himself to write on the same things without introducing some basically new material. But when a real need arises in the life of the Church, then new books are written.

⁷⁸ *ibid*, 88. Christians look unto the Saints and the Patriarchs in Scripture as a looking glass to their future. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 89. Each new book with claims to inclusion and teaching of the Church is considered from every aspect and especially with regard to the influence it may have on the lives of men. This last criterion – its influence – is extremely important because of the close connection between dogmatic consciousness and life. The church accepts nothing contrary to, or inconsistent with, the spirit of Christ-like love which she feeds.

on it with profound silence.⁷⁹ This is an example where the logic of human intellect as understood through scholasticism is detrimental and an injustice toward God.

Barclay affirms that Christ prays through the saint as his hands and feet in the world, and for the world to whom salvation is given. Barclay assures that ‘the all’ for whom the Christian is to pray is ‘the all’ for whom salvation is intended. The prayer for the world is to be prayed with the faith and works that comes by Christ being in his Body. This is very different than absolute predestination and predestined damnation.⁸⁰ Barclay affirms that the Fathers of the first four centuries believed and preached the doctrine of universal redemption, or Christ dying for all humanity, and are in

⁷⁹ *ibid*, 112-13. Pre-determinism was not mentioned in the first 400 years after Christ. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 89. Individual sons and members of the Church on the path to this love stumble, fall, and are guilty of violations, but the Church in her depths knows, through the Holy Spirit, the truth of Christ-like love, and whenever even the word love crops up but with another content she will not be seduced by any philosophy, any splendor of doctrine. Christ is not mocked. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.’ 2016, 62-3. The idea of vitalism still had currency among Quakers well into the twentieth century. A paper of 1932 by A.J. Clark on ‘The Controversy between Determinism and Vitalism in Biology’ drew an analogy between support for vitalism in biology and early Quakers’ opposition to Calvinist predestination. Vitalism provided a reason to believe that mind and thought had a real existence and could make things happen. It also gave a reason to believe in survival after death. Grubb, in his 1931 essay on Graham’s theology, grants that vitalism may be ‘rather out of fashion now’, but questions ‘whether belief in survival does not necessitate something of the sort’. As for John William Graham, one of the last things he wrote embodies a message given in Jesus Lane Meeting on the day of his death, in which he speaks of the ongoing ‘struggle in scientific thought between Mechanists and Vitalists’, and especially of the fear that scientists may one day create life. That would refute any belief that life was a spiritual entity. Barclay categorically rejected Calvin’s view of God and predestination as fatalistic and of the greatest mark against the true nature of God and Christianity. Vitality was at the center of Barclay’s true Christian divinity which is expressed most radically in a soteriology of Theosis beginning in this life and continuing in the next.

⁸⁰ *ibid*, 121-2. Christ prays through the Christian for the World for whom salvation is intended. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 89-90. Sophrony believes that in his writings Blessed Silouan, a faithful son of the Church, has provided us with the latest and most trustworthy criterion of truth in the Church – Christ-like love for our enemies and Christ-like humility. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.’ 2016, 66. For Graham sin, though real and serious, was not difficult to understand: it was essentially the residue of instincts from humankind’s animal past. After writing in *The Divinity in Man* of some of the more disturbing elements of the natural world he continues: ‘There is within us, in some suppressed form, a background of lowly, simple instincts, dealing with food and drink, reproduction, heat and cold, health and survival, which need discipline, and whose permitted manifestation in greed, passion and lawless power we recognize as sin.’ Earlier in the same book he has stated unequivocally, ‘We are not born in sin – the race never fell’; if we sin it is a ‘wilful’ regression to ‘the lower instead of the higher, a step back on the path’. Barclay addresses the topic of ancestral sin versus original sin, categorically rejecting the original sin of Augustine. Through the Incarnation, the prophecy comes true in that each person will sin of their own accord rather than inheriting the effects of their father to the 3rd and 4th generations (Exodus 20:5). Sixth century prophets Jeremiah (31:29) and Ezekiel (18:20) prophecy of the coming reality that humanity will be returned to the state of innocence. Salvation is intended for the world coming by restoration of innocence through the Incarnation.

agreement that humanity, of its own malignity, and of its own will, shuts the mind's eye [the *nous*] to the beams of divine light.⁸¹

Barclay quotes the Church Fathers concerning the universal intent of Christ. Augustine says that the value of Christ's blood is intended for the world.⁸² Prosper of Aquitaine (390-455) says that the dark reject the light by delighting in their own capacity, and remain in their servitude of the world.⁸³

Prosper continues that all are not brought out of worldly captivity because all will not drink of the cup of immortality that heals.⁸⁴ John Chrysostom (349-407) on John 6 says that humanity of his own malignity, and of his own will, shuts his mind's eye to the beams of divine Light.⁸⁵ Ambrose of Milan (340-397) says that the mystical sun of righteousness is arisen on all, came to all, suffered for all, rose again for all that the Son might take away the blindness of sin. If anyone does not believe in Christ, they rob themselves of this benefit, even as if one, by closing the window, should hold out

⁸¹ *ibid*, 124-6. The Fathers agree that Christ died for all and that Humanity shuts the eyes of his own will to the Divine Light. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 382. The Lord dearly loves the sinner that repents, and tenderly presses him to His breast, and says, 'Where wert thou, My child? Long have I awaited thee.' The Lord calls all men to Himself in the words of the Gospels, and His voice is heard throughout the universe: 'Come unto me, all ye that labor, and I will give you rest. Come and drink of the waters of life. Come unto me and know that I love you. Were it not so I would not call you. I cannot suffer that a single one of my sheep should perish.' And for one sheep the Shepherd goes into the mountains to seek him. Come unto me, my sheep. I created you and loved You. My love for you brought me down, and I suffered all things for your salvation, and my desire is that you would know my love and say, with the Apostles on Mount Tabor: "Lord, it is good for us to be with thee."

⁸² *ibid*, 125. Augustine claims the Blood of Christ is valuable for the whole World. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 382. Glory be to the Lord God that He gave us His Only-begotten Son for the sake of our salvation. Glory be to the Only-begotten Son that he deigned to be born of the Most Holy Virgin, and suffered for our salvation, and gave us His Most Pure Body and Blood to eternal life, and sent us His Holy Spirit on earth.

⁸³ *ibid*. The World would not be redeemed by Christ's blood because darkness rejects light. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 134. The first stage of sin or the rejection of the light of Christ is when some spiritual influence approaches from without, which may, to begin with, be quite vague and shapeless. This initial stage in formation is the appearance in the field of man's inner vision of an image – and as this does not depend on man's will, it is not regarded as a sin. Images in some cases appear to take on visible form, while others are mainly products of the mind, but more often are a combination of the outward and inward. Just as visible images generate thought so these shapeless images join with outward images to produce intrusive thoughts of sin.

⁸⁴ *ibid*. The cup of immortality has in it to profit everyone but if it be not drunk, it does not heal. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991 355-6. When Saint Andrew the disciple was threatened with death upon the cross if he did not cease preaching, he replied if I fear the cross, I shall not be preaching the cross. In this manner all the other apostles, and after then the martyrs and holy men who wrestled against evil, went forward with joy to meet pain-and-suffering. And all because the Holy Spirit, sweet and gracious, draws the soul to love the Lord, and in the sweetness of the Holy Spirit the soul loses her fear of suffering and death.

⁸⁵ *ibid*, 126. John Chrysostom: The Sun of Righteousness has risen on all as in Jesus dividing the bread without (John 6:1-14) and then coming within as Bread from Heaven (John 6:22-63).

the sun's beams.⁸⁶ Ambrose concludes that the one who perishes does so of their own choosing, who refuses the remedy.⁸⁷

11 The Augustinians, Pelagians, and Semi-Pelagians have not arrived at the Nature of Christ's universal evangelical Principle as have the Church Father's and the Quakers

Barclay argues that the universality of Christ's death has not been rightly understood. The semi-Pelagians make 'grace' a gift following upon human merit or the improving of one's nature according to humanities own principle. The Augustinians in response react to the Pelagian, and semi-Pelagian exultation of human nature as being opposed to total human depravity.⁸⁸

An adequate answer to Augustine and John Calvin's (1509-1564) sovereign God, and Pelagius (354-430) and Jacobus Arminius' (1560-1609) fallen nature has not been answered by Martin Luther or the reformers according to the new covenant. Barclay argues that Augustine reacted to Pelagius's error by projecting God an 'unjust sovereign' complicit in Adam's sin. Luther and the other reformers failed to articulate an adequate answer concerning the universal redemption, and nature of Christ and God, when reacting to Roman scholasticism (rationalism). Calvin affirmed God's 'sovereign complicity' with sin which was rejected by Arminius. Humanities inherited condition

⁸⁶ *ibid.* Ambrose of Milan: The Sun of Righteousness has risen on all to take away the blindness of sin. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 134. The man who is not in thrall to the passions can recognize the force of an intrusive thought and yet remain completely free from its power. But there is some 'place' in one – some suitable soil for the development of the intrusive thoughts – the thought will strive to take possession of one's psychic being– of the heart, the soul. It achieves this because it prompts a feeling of the delight to be afforded by one or another passion. The delight figures 'temptation' But even the fleeting pleasure, though it testifies to man's imperfections, is not yet to be reckoned as sin. It is only a 'proposal for sin.

⁸⁷ *ibid.* The person is the cause of his death who rejects the means of escape. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 134. The development of a simple intrusive thought can be portrayed as follows: the mind is attracted by the delectation to be afforded by the passion, and this is an important and crucial moment because the union of mind with tempting ideas provides fertile soil for passion. If the mind does not by an exercise of the will tear itself away from the suggested delights but continues to dwell on them, it will find itself pleasantly attracted, then involved and finally positively acquiescent. After that, the ever-increasing delight with the passion may take possession of it – make captive – mind and will. Lastly, the whole strength of the one enslaved by passion is directed to a determined actualization of sin, if there are no outside impediments – or, where there are, is seeking ways of getting around them. Such captivity may happen once only and never recur if it came about because of the inexperience of someone engaged in the ascetic struggle. But if the enchantment repeats itself, passion becomes second nature, and then all man's natural forces are at its service.

⁸⁸ *ibid.*, 127. The Universality of Christ's death agreeable to scripture & antiquity is not yet understood. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 90. Silouan writes, 'No one can know of himself what is Divine love unless the Holy Spirit instructs him, and so we may speak of this love.'

from the first Adam, and God's sovereign action has not been reconciled or understood under God's new covenant dispensation.⁸⁹

12 The Saints and Quakers communicate the Full Extent of God's Uncreated Grace to all Humanity

Barclay contends that the reformer's inability to express the universal effect of Christ's death has left the field open for the Arminians to be strengthened in their error.⁹⁰ Instead the Lord has communicated and made known the full, evident, and perfect knowledge of his everlasting truth through the Quakers. For the discovery of His glorious and evangelical dispensation, God has raised a despicable and illiterate people to be the dispensers of His dispensation by which all the scruples, doubts, and objections are answered, the justice as well as the mercy of God, according to their divine and heavenly harmony, exhibited, established, and confirmed. This knowledge being manifest to the saints in history, and to the Quakers by the revelation of Jesus Christ within, is fortified by sensible experience, and sealed by the Spirit in the heart. The Quakers confidently affirm and clearly evince, even according to the Scriptures, the full effect of Christ's death.⁹¹

Barclay acknowledges that every person has antichrist in them in being set up as the temple of God; as god 'sovereign' over all. The fallen seed of scholastic rationalism must give way to Christ's seed, the seed of the second Adam, to rule in the human temple. Barclay contends that the holy seed of

⁸⁹ *ibid.* Those holding to God's complicity with Sin and Depravity react to those holding up humanity's Fallen Nature. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 90. The Lord is good and merciful but we could say nothing of this love save what the Scriptures tell, unless the Holy Spirit so instructed us. We can deliberate only in so far as we had experienced the grace of the Holy Spirit.

⁹⁰ *ibid.* By the inability of the Lutherans, Calvinists and Arminians to communicate God's universal redemption, the perfection of the Gospel dispensation is yet to be declared Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 90. The Saints speak of that which they have indeed seen and know. They do not speak of what they have not seen. The Saints say nothing of their own devising. The inspired Scriptures are the 'more sure word' 'profitable for doctrine and for instruction in righteousness' but knowledge of God from the Scriptures does not attain the sought-after perfection unless the Lord Himself instructs one through the Holy Spirit.

⁹¹ *ibid.*, 130-1. Christ who tasted Death for all, justly Manifests himself in all & is willing that all Partake of his Sufferings & Life unto Eternal Life; The More Full, Evident & Perfect Knowledge-Noetic communicated by Jesus Christ within & Sealed by the Holy Spirit in their Hearts is in accordance with sensible Experience & holy Scripture. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 354. Glory be the Lord and His deep compassion in that He endows sinful men with the grace of the Holy Spirit. Rich people and kings may be ignorant of the Lord, yet we poor monks and shepherds know the Lord through the Holy Spirit.

God is bruised by the rational principle in humanity ruling as antichrist. Fallen reason is capable of ruling in the natural person whom is passing away, but the spiritual divine Light is necessary to rule which gives birth to the 'new person' unto eternal life.⁹² The seed is physical through the *Theotokos*, being Jesus Christ, and metaphysical through the resurrected, and glorified Jesus Christ through whom the Spirit is sent of the Father.

13 Cyril of Alexandria (367-444) and Clement of Alexandria (150-215) articulate the New Covenant Light of the Son shining in All

Cyril of Alexandria articulates the Quaker light of Christ shining in all. The light shines on all, but some refuse the light though no fault of the sun. The true Son, who came to enlighten those that sat in darkness and in the region of the shadow of death (Matthew 4:16), visited the earth for this cause: that He might communicate unto all the gift of knowledge and grace, and illumine the inward eye of all by a spiritual splendor. It is not through defect of the sun that humanity is blinded, but through humanities own iniquity and sin.⁹³

One finds Barclay's knowledge of the Church Fathers instrumental in Barclay's argument for humanity becoming by Grace indwelling what God is by nature. Cyril of Alexandria articulates the Quaker principle that the universal illumination and grace spoken of by Paul as supernaturally given by Christ, is given to take away the blurriness of the mind which detained humanity in ignorance so

⁹² *ibid*, 142. The Holy Seed of the Kingdom & Light Noetic is bruised by the fallen seed of Rationalism. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, There is a certain inevitable inconstancy and lack of precision inherent in human language, which persists even in Holy Scripture, so that the expression of Divine truth in words is only possible within set limits. Silouan believed that the way to apprehend the Word of God lay in the fulfillment of Christ's commandments. This was the Lord's own teaching.

⁹³ *ibid*, 155. Illumination of the Inward Eyes and Consequent Blindness through sin occurs from the same sun according to Cyril of Alexandria (376-444 A.D.). Irenaeus of Lyon. *The Scandal of the Incarnation: Irenaeus against the Heresies*, Ignatius Press, 1990, 29. It is one and the same Lord who inflicts blindness on those who do not believe but set the Lord at naught. The same bestows a fuller and greater illumination on the mind of those who follow. The universal sun has much the same effect through some seeing while others not seeing through defect of eye. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 131. For Silouan, prayer is creation, the loftiest form of creation which makes prayer infinitely diverse. Prayer corresponds with the normal development of the human spirit. The first impulse of the mind is outward-bound, the second, a return into itself, and the third, an ascent towards God through the inner man. According with this progression the Fathers instituted three forms of prayer. The first, because the mind is as yet incapable of attaining pure vision of God, is marked by the imagination. The second is marked by meditation, and the third by rapt concentration of the pure mind standing before God.

as to bring humanity to fruitfulness.⁹⁴ Barclay concludes that the light and seed of the second Adam sown in all, is the seed of the kingdom, the word of faith, the implanted, and grafted word able to save the soul which in the good ground fructifies abundantly.⁹⁵ Barclay references Victor of Antioch, a presbyter of Antioch (c.430-450), who says that Christ has liberally sown the divine seed of the word, and proposed the seed to all without respect of persons. Christ who sows distinguishes not between ground and ground but casts the seed without discrimination. There is given to all that which is sufficient to enter the kingdom. Unto whomsoever much is given, much is required.⁹⁶

Barclay references Clement of Alexandria who states that the grace of God is the new song which now shows itself in humanity which was in the beginning, and was first of all. The new covenant word is far off, and near, hid from none, common to all, and shines to all. The innate witness is worthy to be received according to each person's strength, and especially in those trained up in righteousness.⁹⁷ Barclay considers Clement to have quoted Moses and the apostle Paul in saying there is an innate witness worthy to be believed. A divine witness and influence is in people's hands, mouths, and hearts according to Deuteronomy 30:14 and Romans 10:8, 18.⁹⁸ Barclay recognizes that Clement, prior to the canonization of the New Testament invited unbelievers as partakers of inspiration, to receive Christ, the Word, the heavenly Spirit, the inbreathing of God, light, and water in themselves, their own distinct light, the light in their own house, truth concerning what had been

⁹⁴ *ibid*, 159-161. Cyril of Alexandria communicates the Quaker principle of the Supernatural Light given unto clarity of mind & fruitfulness. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 131-2. Prayer of rapt concentration is considered to be the only sound, proper and full mode of prayer but taking into account the possibility of such prayer for men at the outset of his pilgrimage towards God, they accept the first two forms of imagination and meditation as normal and profitable. However, they do point out that if one is content with the first form of imagination, and cultivate it in spiritual life, not only unfruitfulness but deep-rooted spiritual ill-health may result. Concerning meditation, though in many ways superior to imagination, it still bears little fruit and does not rescue from the constant battle against wrong thoughts, does not free from the passions or, lead to pure contemplation. The third form of contemplation is when the mind is stationed in the heart and the person prays from the depth of his being without images, with a pure mind standing before God.

⁹⁵ *ibid*, 161. The seed is the word of the Kingdom, the word of faith or the implanted engrafted word able to save the soul.

⁹⁶ *ibid*, 162-3. The Divine Seed of the Word, sown indiscriminately, is sufficient for all to enter the Kingdom.

⁹⁷ *ibid*, 166. Christ's New Covenant Witness is an Innate Song common to all, both Near & Far, per Clement of Alexandria (AD 150-215).

⁹⁸ *ibid*, 167. A Divine Influence is in the hands, mouth & heart to be believed.

written; to receive the light that they may be scholars of the Lord. It is the Spirit who helps one resist and flee sinful gratification. The inbreathing of God directs to light and water in the person who has the eye of the soul darkened or dimmed through evil education.⁹⁹ Barclay identifies Clement's contribution in bringing forward the witness and call of God in 'true Christian divinity'.

In Barclay's context, Christ, as seed of the second Adam, was rejected inwardly by the later reformers in the same way as Christ the incarnation was rejected outwardly by the Jews. The new covenant seed of the second Adam is despised by the Calvinists who preach an unjust Sovereign.¹⁰⁰ The Papists, Arminians, and Socinians emphasize 'an increase' of the fallen nature without acknowledging the uncreated seed of the second Adam in every person. As Christ met with opposition in his incarnation, so Christ meets with opposition in his new covenant indwelling.¹⁰¹

Formative in Barclay's Puritan childhood (1648-1659) was the teaching of early reformers George Buchanan (1506-1582) and John Knox (1514-1572).¹⁰² Buchanan said that in forming humanity God set before his mind a light that is divine to discern the vile from the honest. God has given a compend of the law within which comprehends the whole of the law.¹⁰³

⁹⁹ *ibid*, 167-8. Clement (A.D. 150-215) called Unbelievers to Receive Christ, Light & Sight to rightly know God & humanity.

¹⁰⁰ *ibid*, 171. Because Calvinists reject human participation, they categorically reject the universal gospel seed

¹⁰¹ *ibid*, 171-2. As Christ was rejected outwardly as the Incarnation, so Christ is rejected inwardly as the seed of the 2nd Adam.

¹⁰² Barclay's Works III, *Universal Love*, 1677, 186-7. Robert Barclay (1648-1690) refers to being instructed as a child in the strictest of the Reformation-Calvinist theology of John Knox, George Buchanan, and others (1648-1659), followed by a formal Papist education in his formative years (1659-1663), until his mature search over four years (1663-1667) led him to join the 'true Christian divinity' of the Quakers as a 19 year old in 1667.

¹⁰³ Robert Barclay, *An Apology for the True Christian Divinity*, 187-8. George Buchanan claims that in forming humanity, God set before his mind a light to discern the vile from the honest. Irenaeus of Lyon. *The Scandal of the Incarnation: Irenaeus against the Heresies*, Ignatius Press, 1990, 22. God is all Intellect and all Word, and so what He 'thinks', He also speaks, and what He 'speaks', He also thinks. For His thinking is His Word, and the Word is Mind, and the all-comprehending Mind is the Father.

Barclay's sense is that the Papists place justification in the sacramental works and not in the power, virtue, and grace of Christ indwelling, and renewing the mind unto good works.¹⁰⁴ This is a Western Roman Catholic, and later Protestant view of 'works' in opposition to the prelapsarian work that results from the light of Christ within. Through apostolic succession, Rome 'infuses' the merits of Christ through its sacraments unto the justification of the person. The Papists place justification not in 'work of holiness' brought forth in the person through Christ indwelling or through real forsaking of iniquity, but through performing of sacramental rites.¹⁰⁵ This researcher argues that Barclay builds his 'true Christianity divinity' on the early reformer George Buchanan of his Puritan childhood, and his reading of the Fathers during his Roman Catholic training at the secular Scots College of Paris (1659-1663). Barclay joins with the Quaker position of the bodily risen Jesus Christ as second Adam meta-physically indwelling all humanity, and savingly inhabiting the Christian as opposed to the 'infused righteousness' brought on through the Roman Catholic sacraments, and the 'imputed righteousness' brought on by the later reformers rejection of 'works' for 'faith alone'.

Barclay contends that the Papists and later reformers, in the end, meet at the same place in neglecting mortification, holiness, and works resulting from new covenant Christianity. Out of the rigid practice of the Papists, and the rigid writings of the later Protestants, justification has been defamed, hindered, and many souls ensnared. The Papists and rigid Protestants meet as one in neglecting good works, being enemies of mortification, while remaining in sin.¹⁰⁶

For Barclay, neither Papist nor Protestant recognizes the place of the mind being noetically renewed (I Corinthians 2:16) by virtue of a spiritual birth, and the formation of Christ within. The Papists are justified by the merits of Christ, as Christ's merits are applied through the sacraments of grace,

¹⁰⁴ Robert Barclay, *An Apology for the True Christian Divinity*, 189-191. Rather than Justification coming through Christ renewing & indwelling the Heart & Mind, the Roman Sacraments make up the 'lack' in humanity.

¹⁰⁵ *ibid*, 191-2. In performing the ceremonies of the church, Rome administers the justifying merits of Christ.

¹⁰⁶ *ibid*, 192-3. Rigid Papists & carnal Protestants miss justification by neglecting mortification, holiness and good works through Christ's indwelling.

though there is not any inward renewing of the mind, nor knowing of Christ inwardly. The rigid Protestants stand justified in the sight of God by the merits and sufferings of Christ without, and not by Christ making righteous from within. Rigid Protestants rest on Christ's righteousness by faith 'alone', which the act of believing is *not* imputed unto them as righteousness. Neither Papist nor rigid Protestant place any renewing of the mind by virtue of the spiritual rebirth and formation of the second Adam within, but claim justification by application of the death and sufferings of Christ outwardly performed. Neither Papist nor rigid Protestant recognizes the *telios* of inward holiness in justification.¹⁰⁷

In contrast, Barclay contends that Jesus Christ, being formed in humanity in works of righteousness, is the formal cause of remission of sin, and being made righteous. Peoples' remission of sin comes by the righteousness and obedience of Jesus Christ performed in the flesh as the outward procuring cause of Jesus Christ being formed metaphysically in humanity in works of righteousness whereby the 'new person' hits the mark of God's original righteous intent.¹⁰⁸

14 Operative Faith and Cooperative Works were embraced by the Fathers, First Reformers, and now by the Quakers

Distinct for Barclay is that the remission of sins is by the operative mercy and goodness of God whereby humanity cooperates in repentance, confession, prayers, and tears. This brings together

¹⁰⁷ *ibid*, 193. Papist & Protestant both claim justification by the application of the death and sufferings of Christ outwardly performed.

¹⁰⁸ *ibid*, 198. Hitting the mark comes by Jesus Christ in the flesh being formally formed within in [through] works of righteousness. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.' 2016, 39-40. In his social, political and theological concerns, Graham believed he was engaged in the cause of progress, which was the cause of God. There are few signs of doubt whether progress will indeed continue indefinitely. The odd conditional clause, however, suggests that faith in progress was an act of will as much as of conviction. In the Faith of a Quaker, he posits a God who is 'to all appearances, far from all-powerful'; this may be only an appearance, but human beings have to help God. He takes, and bids his readers and hearers take, a kind of Pascal's wager that there is teleology, that progress is real; though it remains the case that humankind must strive mightily to make it real. Quakerism was for him a light for the times, showing the way towards a better future. At the heart of Barclay's Christianity was humanity becomes by Grace indwelling what God is by nature. The cause of progress is the cause of God. God's restoration is inclusive of humanity, and requires humanities participation. Faith includes our participation in like manner as God participated in humanities condition through the Incarnation. As Christ picked up his cross, so don't we pick up our cross and follow.

operative faith and cooperative works. The Fathers held that the works of justification whereby humanity cooperates with the operative works of God are good works, and inclusive in salvation. Amandus Polanus (1561-1610), a German theologian of early Reformed orthodoxy, places the common opinion of the Protestants as most agreeable to the Fathers: ‘Christians obtain the remission of sins by repentance, confession, prayers, and tears but do not merit the remission of sins; Christians obtain remission of sins not by merit but by the mercy and goodness of God’.¹⁰⁹ The Protestant Innocentius Gentileus (c.1532-1588) on the Papist Council of Trent (1545-1563) continues the faith and works motif by saying ‘But seeing the one (faith) cannot be without the other (works), Christians call them both conjunctive causes’.¹¹⁰

God purposes that his saints would witness for him by *participating* in his divine nature being one spirit with the Lord separated from sin in seeing God’s face. Barclay proposes that in participating in the divine nature (II Peter 1:4, I Peter 3:4) and being one spirit with the Lord (I Corinthians 6:17), God separates the saints from their iniquities and transgressions (Isaiah 59:1-2), sanctifying and purifying a people to himself (Habakkuk 1:13, I Peter 2:9-10) through their seeing the face of God (I Corinthians 13:9-12, I John 3:2; II Corinthians 3:18).¹¹¹

¹⁰⁹ *ibid*, 226. Remission of sins comes by the operative mercy and goodness of God in cooperation with humanities repentance. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 135. The initial appearance of the delights offered by disordered passion should start off the struggle which can continue through every stage in the development of a sinful thought. At each of the stages the wrong thought can be mastered and so not transformed into deed. Nevertheless, the instant the will waivers, an element of sin enters, which must be repented of lest we forfeit grace.

¹¹⁰ *ibid*. Faith & Works are conjunctive instrumental causes in Justification. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 135. The spiritually inexperienced man generally encounters sinful thoughts only after they have progressed, unnoticed, through the first stages of development – that is, after they have acquired a measure of strength – when the danger approaches of actually sinning. In order to not let this happen, it is essential to stay the mind in prayer in the heart. This is an urgent necessity for every ascetic striver desirous, through repentance, of consolidating himself in the spiritual life, because where the heart is so stablished sin is cut off at the very moment of conception.

¹¹¹ *ibid*, 232. Perfection is through God separating the saints from Iniquities through their seeing the face of God. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 135. Saint Silouan claims that seeing the face of God includes dashing the temptations of sin against stones, being the repeated name of Jesus Christ. He cites the words of the Prophet, ‘O daughter of Babylon, who art to be destroyed: happy shall he be, that takes and dashes the little ones against the stones (Psalm 137:8-9). Shutting the door of his heart, stationing his mind on guard like a sentinel, unfettered by imagination and cognition but armed with contemplative prayer and the Name of Jesus Christ, the ascetic embarks on the struggle against all external influence, all thoughts from without.

15 The *Telios* of the Saints is ‘Hitting the Mark’ of God’s Prelapsarian and Christian Righteousness

For Barclay, the *telios* of the saints is virtue, purity of mind, and power over sin unto the works of God. Doctrine that says God will not give power to overcome that which God calls to overcome is highly injurious to Jesus Christ, greatly derogates from the power and virtue of his sacrifice, and makes the end for which Christ came ineffectual. Christ came for the removing of sin, the gathering of the righteous to serve the Lord in clarity of mind, and to walk in fear before the Lord bringing an everlasting righteousness, and an evangelical perfection which the Jewish law could not do. Christ is said ‘*to have given himself for us, that he might redeem us from all iniquity and purify unto himself a peculiar people, zealous of good works*’ (Titus 2:4). This is spoken of the saints to be their way of life.¹¹²

Being on the earth in this way, today's Christian communes with God and the saints in history through the Spirit of Pentecost and Incarnation received, and the new covenant Spirit perfects in the saint's becoming a temple pillar. Barclay sees that Enoch, Noah, and Job attained perfection or freedom from sin before the giving of the Law. Zacharias and Elizabeth, John the Baptist's parent's attained perfection or freedom from sin while under the Law and through the gospel. The saints attain perfection or freedom from sin from the Law of Moses fulfilled, and the gospel received. Barclay quotes from John's Revelation 14:1-5 ‘*God has quickened us together with Christ and has raised us up together and made us to sit together in heavenly places. Saints sitting in heavenly*

¹¹² *ibid*, 234-5. Power over sin, Virtue, and Purity of mind is the *Telios* of Christ and the Way of the saints. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 135-6. The essence of mental vigilance is to contend against the passions unto seeing the face of Christ. In a wider and all comprehensive sense, victory over the passions is achieved by keeping Christ's commandments. This begins by ascetic awareness, after the ascetic, having gone through the stages of spiritual development, abandons the prayer of the imagination, then abandons the prayer of meditation, and finally arrives at the pure mind of contemplation standing before God.

*places are not sinning, nor are their works filthy rags: the spirits of just men made perfect; without fault; redeemed from among men with no guile found in their mouth’.*¹¹³

Barclay suggests that the Fathers and Quakers are in agreement that freedom from sin being ‘hitting the mark’ of God’s righteous intent and the effects of the fall come only by the uncreated grace of God. Barclay assures that humanity by their fallen strength without the help of God’s grace cannot attain to the redeemed state. Only by living within the grace of God’s Spirit and Son, as such Fathers Jerome and Augustine advocate, in opposition to Pelagius, does humanity attain freedom from sin.¹¹⁴ Barclay, relating to God’s *telios*, states that blessed are those who believe in Him who is able and willing to deliver through repentance from sin; forgetting those things that are behind, and pressing toward the mark of the high calling of God in Christ Jesus (Philippians 3:14). These are made conquerors through being overcomers, and shall be established as pillars in the house of God, who go no more out (Revelation 3:12).¹¹⁵

Philipp Melanchthon, the *Augsburg Confession*, and the Fathers reject ‘once justified one never loses the Spirit’. Barclay rejects the doctrine of cessationism. The Papists by sacramental infusion and the rigid Protestants by their unconditional ‘believing’ come to the same center in accommodating false security, false reality, detached grace, and no communion with God for Bible

¹¹³ *ibid*, 242. Perfection & Freedom from Sin is to be experienced with the community of saints.

¹¹⁴ *ibid*, 248. Life within the grace of the Spirit and Son brings one beyond the effects of the Fall and Sin. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 136. Preserving the mind and heart from all extraneous thoughts means prolonged struggle of an extraordinary difficult and subtle kind. Subject to a multitude of the most varied influences and impressions with their perpetually shifting values, the ordinary man fails to grasp either their origin or their power. But the hesychast, one with the Spirit and the Son, detached from all external influences, in his efforts, day and night, to reduce all outside impressions to the lowest possible minimum, shunning the outside world, deaf to all irrelevant discussions, reading no books, concentrates his whole attention on his inner being, and there engages in single combat with intrusive thoughts. The man who is not sufficiently attentive within himself falls under the influence of an intrusive thought and becomes enslaved. By heeding the intrusive idea man comes to resemble-even identifies with-the spirit of the intrusive thought, and the energy contained in it. When the soul accepts a passionate thought – very often the consequence of demonic influence – he thereby becomes a tool for demonic actions.

¹¹⁵ *ibid*, 248-9. The Pillar in God’s House has achieved Freedom from Sin, and goes no more out. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 136. The hesychast mind deeply engrossed in prayer is sometimes aware of the approach of some spirit from without but if his prayerful attention is not disturbed, the intrusive thought departs without having been received, so that afterwards the one who is praying cannot say who, why, or what had approached.

certitudes centered in fallen reason.¹¹⁶ Cessationism, which is the rejection of the Spirit's inspiration and illumination outside of Scripture, leads to presumption, nominalism, and non-theism.

16 The Quakers join with the Saints in rejecting the Scholastic Apostasy from the 8th through the 16th Centuries

Barclay affirms that the true principles and doctrines of the Christian faith are expressed by the true church universal coming through the saints. Quakers gather to wait upon God, worship him, and bear testimony for truth against error, the church having been interrupted by apostasy [scholasticism] since the eighth century. Barclay affirms that the church signifies a certain number of people gathered by God's Spirit, and by the testimony of his servants raised unto the true principles and doctrines of the Christian faith, who through their hearts being united by the same love and their understandings being informed, gather to wait upon God. They worship Him, bearing joint testimony for truth against error, suffering for truth, and becoming through fellowship one family and household, watching over, teaching, instructing, and caring for one another according to each person's attainment.¹¹⁷

17 Saints being translated from the Kingdom of this World into the Kingdom of God was lost in the Apostasy

Barclay intimates that what was lost in the apostasy was the kingdom of the Son of God into which the saints are translated, being delivered from the power of darkness. The church called Christ's body, being knit together, should increase with the increase of God. No person is to be called the temple of God or of the Holy Spirit but as their vessel is purified, and they are made fit and prepared

¹¹⁶ *ibid*, 251. Detached Infused Justification and Rational Imputed Justification are void of the Spirit. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.' 2016, 100. Graham continued to think in 1925, as he had done in 1881, that 'Quakerism, rightly understood' was a faith able to withstand the intellectual challenges of the time, the 'dark things' suggested by the new sciences. But such a Quakerism was not of the evangelical variety. Bible literalism and the doctrine of salvation by imputed righteousness or 'substitution' could no longer appeal to the educated young. Barclay rejected the Protestant hermeneutic of a self-righteous proof-text which brought on the Protestant view of imputed righteousness. The shadow Scriptures were useful and a sacred aid toward God and life, and righteousness was the focal point of salvation through the seed of the 2nd Adam and the Spirit of Pentecost with the saints pointing the way. This was righteousness in reality rather than theory as understood through theosis.

¹¹⁷ *ibid*, 259-60. The Church consists of those gathered to wait upon God & bear testimony for truth against error.

for God to walk in. Those fitted by Christ become his Body in whom he dwells. In becoming the temple of God people come out of the unclean in them, and out from the unclean in the world. This is more than Christian nominalism. This is the historic reality of those who went into the desert at the legalization of Christianity by Constantine (313).¹¹⁸ The church is intended to be the kingdom of the Son of God, and not the kingdom and power of darkness. The saints are translated out of the kingdom of this world and into the kingdom of God. Membership is in reality and not in word only. Saints increase with the increase of God and receive spiritual nourishment from Christ the head, being endowed with God's power.¹¹⁹ The spouse of Christ is raised and gathered by the power of God into the principles of truth, and into the life, spirit, and power of Christ whereby they are taught to deny errors and heresies. By the inward operation of God's own Spirit, and being sealed for apostleship, they seek proof through Christ speaking within. The Quakers bid those who 'minister' by 'ape-ish' imitation, to both see and walk.¹²⁰

Barclay references that a person skilled in antiquity said at the onset of the Reformation 'whoever is not called by the Spirit of God, and has not entered in by the door who is Christ, is not a Vicar of Christ, but a thief and robber. Barclay mentions Dionysius the Areopagite (d. 268) who calls those called to oversee the Body as having the sacrament of 'nomination by the Spirit', of an entire life, powerful in sound doctrine, to give reason for all things, and this reason from the Lord comes not by tongues of learning [scholasticism].¹²¹

Barclay points to the error in scholasticism by using the examples of Origen and Arius (256-336). A person of pure heart will learn more in a short time by waiting on the Lord than the most certain in

¹¹⁸ *ibid*, 274-5. The Saints are translated into the Kingdom of the Son, being delivered from Darkness into the Increase of God's Fitting and Filling.

¹¹⁹ *ibid*, 275-6. Separate from the Vain in their evil Succession who take on the form of godliness while denying the power of God.

¹²⁰ *ibid*, 281. The spouse is raised up by an extraordinary call of God whereby they are preserved by the inward operation of God's Spirit in the most holy faith & sealed for apostleship.

¹²¹ *ibid*, 286. The reformation began with the wisdom from antiquity concerning bishops and apostles in the church.

their learning. The simplicity, plainness, and brevity of the Scriptures are reproof against scholastic science. Origen, who because of his scholasticism and philosophy, wrote erroneous teaching, Arius led by curiosity and human scrutiny despised the simplicity of the gospel and fell into heresy.

Instead of Origen or Arius, Barclay suggests that Christians look to apostles Peter, Paul, and John.¹²²

Concerning life expression, Barclay points to the saints who concur with their bodies as well as their spirits in worship. The saints represent God's image in humanity through Christ restored. This hitting the mark of God's righteousness as worship is to be in all of life (Romans 12:1) and is not limited to times, places, or persons. Yet worship also includes assembling as Christ's Body at certain times and places. Barclay rejects 'Platonic dualism' for Christian reality in saying that as long as one is clothed with the outward tabernacle, there is necessity of joint and visible fellowship, a bearing of an outward testimony to God, and a seeing of the faces of one another, concurring in body and spirit. This assembly is accomplished by inward love and unity of spirit which encourages and refreshes the assembled. Barclay recognizes the 'Church' in which Christ dwells as being beyond the scholastic concepts of imputed or infused righteousness.¹²³

18 Silence, Waiting, and Listening followed by Obedience is the Heart of Monastic Life throughout History

Barclay points to new covenant communion as having been practiced by the saints throughout the ages, through inward introversion, and the abstraction of the mind from all images, thoughts, and prayers. Barclay references Benedictine Augustine Baker's OSB (1575-1641) writing '*Sancta Sophia: Mystics, among the Papists their Inward Exercise*' (1657) in his affirmation of the saints.¹²⁴

¹²² *ibid*, 295-6. Peter, Paul & John reveal the path of Divine Learning.

¹²³ *ibid*, 325. The Outer Body & Inner Person Gathers at set times with others for Worship that is Timeless in unity of spirit unto Restored Likeness through Christ indwelling.

¹²⁴ *ibid*, 354. Introversion & Abstraction from the Mind was practiced historically by saints per Benedictine Augustine Baker (A.D. 1575-1641). Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 75. Although Saint Silouan never set out to teach, when I turned to him with questions or simply to listen to him, I recognized that he spoke out of experience granted from on high, and I looked upon his words to a certain extent as the Christian world looks upon the Holy Scriptures which impart truth as acknowledged and sure facts.

Baker maintained that the ‘mystics’ pursuing perfection put aside scheduled confessions, prayers, masses, devotions, exercises to saints, prayers to the dead, indulgences, vows, and promises so as to receive the Spirit to work in the soul.¹²⁵ Barclay is confirmed by Baker and Balthasar Alvares SJ (1533-1580) concerning the saints in history to affirm mystical worship to excel all forms of worship, even dismissing the practices adopted by the Papists.¹²⁶

Barclay argues that spiritual worship is to be retained and sought after in spite of the Papists’ ceremonies. Bernard of Clairvaux affirmed that the rule of God and the kingdom within take precedence to the rule of St. Benedict of Nursia (c.480-547).¹²⁷ Barclay concludes that silent waiting resulting in communion with Christ is new covenant worship. He reports that many in his day are laying aside voluntary acts performed in their own will. Those, who had worshipped in their own human strength and power, without retiring out of vain imaginations and thoughts, are now experiencing the pure Spirit of God to stir and move. These modern saints without the outward ceremonies are coming to practice communion in Spirit and truth, the same worship practiced by God fearers throughout history.¹²⁸

¹²⁵ *ibid.* Perfection comes by the Spirit working in the Soul. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 75. What Saint Silouan said was not the fruit of the workings of his own brain – it expressed actual experience and the knowledge of experience, and was therefore a positive testimony to the realities of spiritual being.

¹²⁶ *ibid.*, 354-5. Mystical Worship beyond preliminary practices is affirmed by the Jesuits & Benedictines. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 76. Contact with Saint Silouan was of an exceptional character. In his conversations, simple as was their form, Silouan was able, by the strength of his prayer, to transport his interlocutor into an especial world. The one talking with him was introduced into that world not theoretically but actually, through an inner experience transmitted to him. Hardly anyone afterwards was able to retain or live out in his life the state which had been made known to him in conversation.

¹²⁷ *ibid.*, 355. The Rule of God within is to be sought supremely in the rule of Bernard of Clairvaux OSB. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 75. Searching for logical truths was alien and superfluous in Saint Silouan's eyes. He would say with the disciple John ‘We know that the greater the love, the greater the sufferings of the soul. The fuller the love, the fuller the knowledge of God. The more ardent the love, the more fervent the prayer. The more perfect the love, the holier the life.’ (I John 3:14)

¹²⁸ *ibid.*, 355-6. Silent Waiting Communion Worship in Spirit & in Truth is preferred by God Seekers throughout History. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 76. Ascetics who knew Saint Silouan were grateful for the revelation they received, and sorrowful at the same time because they recognized their inability to preserve what they had experienced. Many who had run to Silouan for guidance afterwards fell away because they found themselves unable to live in accordance with what he said. His counsel was simple, quiet, kind; but to follow it one has to be as unsparing of oneself as was Silouan. That firmness of purpose is required which the Lord commands from his followers - the resolution amounting to self-hatred.

Instead of the daily office providing direction, actions and words are brought forth simultaneously, and at one time. Barclay paraphrases Bernard of Clairvaux who maintained that prayer and ministry follow the supernatural influence and motion of the Spirit. Quakers present themselves to the Lord by retirement of mind who sees meet to exercise them in the silent place for the trial of their patience, that the Lord may teach them not to rely upon outward performances or audible prayers, but that their dependence be firm and constant in Him. They wait for the Lord to ‘hold out his scepter’ as Queen Esther did with Persian husband, King Ahasuerus (Esther 5:2, 8:4), for His allowance to draw near with freedom and the enlargement of his Spirit upon the heart. The result being that the Lord gives power and liberty to bring forth words and actions, simultaneously, and at one time.¹²⁹ Communion with God and worship of God is beyond the scholastic apostasy of the previous eight centuries, and the monastic practices which accrued over time.

Baptizing in the gospel Incarnation is sometimes prescribed to be the work of the apostle or ‘father’ as Christ’s instrument, cooperating with the uncreated Spirit of Pentecost. Barclay argues that baptism in the Spirit, though not wrought without Christ is instrumentally done by people fitted for that purpose. It is the baptism of Christ by which spiritual gifts are given, yet Paul says *‘For I long to see you that I might impart to you some spiritual gift. For though you might have 10,000 instructors, yet you do not have many fathers; for in Christ Jesus I have begotten you in the gospel’* Romans 1:11. Though Paul speaks of fathers, yet, Barclay affirms that to convert the heart is properly the work of Christ and not humanity, yet the Scriptures sometimes prescribe this work to people as God’s instruments. Paul’s commission was to turn people from darkness to light, though it was not done without cooperating with Christ, so also may baptizing with the Spirit be performed by

¹²⁹ *ibid*, 367. Prayer & Ministry is Response to turning the Mind to the Lord in Noetic Communion. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 77. Silouan would say, ‘Is good at all times and in all things ask God for understanding of what to do or say, and in what manner’. On every occasion without exception we should seek to discover God’s will, and the way to perform it. What to think, what to say, how to speak.

persons as God's instrument. Barclay recognizes that this is part of the work of an apostle as 'sent one' co-working with God. (Acts 19:1-6)¹³⁰

19 Saints jointly Partake of the One Son of Man; the Incarnation of God

Union with God and communion with the saints result from partaking of the seed of the Son of man. Barclay contends that they that eat the Son of man shall live by Him. It is the inward participation of the spiritual body of the Son by which humanity is united to God and has communion with God (John 6:51-58). As the saints partake of the one body and the one blood of the Son of man, the saints also have joint communion with one another.¹³¹ Barclay concludes that there is no uniform practice amongst the ancients concerning the observances and traditions of the fathers. Therefore to obtrude a practice, not uniformly kept, is unreasonable.¹³²

Concerning application of the sword of the Spirit, Barclay contends that in the church there remains a place for censure against such as fall into error, and who commit open evil. Barclay maintains that it is lawful for the church, if she find any fallen into error, that after due admonition and instruction, according to gospel order, if she still find them pertinacious, to cut them off from fellowship by the sword of the Spirit, and deprive them of the privileges they have as fellow members. This does not mean to cut them off by the earthly sword, or to withdraw support as fellow citizens of creation.

Barclay quotes John Chrysostom 'Christians must condemn and reprove the evil doctrines that proceed from heretics; but spare the person and pray for their salvation'.¹³³

¹³⁰ *ibid*, 404-5. Baptism in the Spirit to include the Apostles as Fathers is Christ's means of turning from Darkness to Light. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 421. The truly obedient man detests his own will and loves his spiritual father, and for this he receives freedom to pray to God with undistracted mind, and his soul is free without let or hindrance to contemplate God, and to rest in Him. On account of the humility and the prayers of his spiritual father he soon arrives at the love of God.

¹³¹ *ibid*, 419-20. The New Birth unto Jesus the Seed & Bread of Life brings Union with God and joint communion with the Saints.

¹³² *ibid*, 448. Communion with Christ is beyond any one-uniform Christian practice. Theosis remains ever dynamic.

¹³³ *ibid*, 452. Censure in the Church is to be used with those who Fall into Error, or openly Commit Evil; The Sword of the Spirit & Prayer is to be used in place of the earthly Temporal Sword. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.' 2016, 116-7. Howard Jenkins was editor of the *Friends Intelligencer*, the

This brings into perspective Barclay's position on persuasion and liberty of conscience being the grounds of gospel expansion in the first 300 years. Barclay recognizes that forcing another's conscience is contrary to Christ, his apostles, and inconsistent with the nature of new covenant Christianity. Persuasion and not persecution was the nature of the gospel for the first 300 years say the Fathers.¹³⁴ According to Athanasius of Alexandria, the Savior constrains none, but is meek in declaring truth with persuasion and counsel, knocking and saying 'open the door to me'. Here one finds instruction from Barclay on the first 300 years, the use of the earthly sword, and the way of the Lord being opposite the earthly sword.¹³⁵

Barclay looks to Athanasius who claims that it is from the devil that one learns to persecute. For Athanasius, it was the Arians and not the saints that introduced persecution for noncompliance.¹³⁶

organ of the Hicksites, a paper to which Graham contributed frequently over the coming years. From a safe distance he could believe that the Hicksites were at one with him and the British progressives, especially with respect to the Evangelicals. In response to a communication from Jenkins, Graham writes of 'a welcome revelation of a great company of unknown but like-minded Friends', equally 'devastated by Evangelicalism'. Graham did not find the Hicksites to be uniformly the great company of like-minded hammers of evangelicals that he apparently hoped for. For one thing, he heard, 'from certain Hicksite ministers' 'the characteristic "Evangelical" doctrines in a more extreme form than has ever been my lot in England', including 'a fierce sermon on the uselessness and pride of righteousness without conversion, based on such glaring Biblical misinterpretation as I hoped we had got past'. Like Barclay, Graham was accosted by the same mentality of Bible-only puritanism amongst the Hicksites even more so than from his evangelical counterparts in England. Theosis was confused with misappropriated self-righteous proof texts on conversion that missed 'becoming by Grace indwelling what God is by nature'. The Bible was used amongst the evangelicals as primary source rather than secondary source replacing God as The Source. The same zeal bringing disconnects with the New Covenant law, and Christ present within appeared alive and well amongst some Hicksites, much to Graham's dismay.

¹³⁴ *ibid*, 464. Use of Force in matters of Conscience was rejected by the church in the 1ST three centuries. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.' 2016, 118. The people he had been warned against as a 'slightly Sadducean body, with rather destructive Rationalism here and there among them' can on occasion be heard denouncing 'in thunder' 'that hated intellect'. 'All this is tolerated, patiently borne with, in the "Hicksite" fold, though it is not sympathized with'. Tolerance of diversity in doctrine was more important than agreement on theology. Ignorance, especially ignorance of the Bible, comes under fire in Graham's account of American Quakers as seen among the Hicksites as well as among the other branches: 'The Hicksites know but little of the Bible ... This is a great source of weakness to them. Only a few of them have found out that the Bible is not an "Evangelical" book'. Barclay and Graham could tolerate youthful zealotry and immaturity to a certain degree. What they both worked toward is persuading the "scholastically inclined" to not see the Bible through the lens of the Evangelicals. Persuasion takes time, and the test of any argument is revealed in the life. The same humility and perseverance in Christ, in the apostles and Fathers of Christianity over the first 300 years, was exemplified in the leadership of Barclay and Graham. Barclay in particular experienced attack from the non-Quaker world and was respectful and clear in his response without backing down from anything for which the Quakers were persecuted, imprisoned, and martyred. Respecting liberty of conscience without persecution is the way of Christ, the way of the Father, and the way of theosis. The Protestant view of scripture has been a long source of division.

¹³⁵ *ibid*. Athanasius looks to the Savior for Direction on declaring Gospel to the other.

¹³⁶ *ibid*. 464-5. Persecution for Non-Compliance began with the Arians who persecuted.

Looking to Pope Hilarius (d.468) Christ is found naked of his virtue, by the violent giving credit to God.¹³⁷ Jerome said that the church was founded on the shedding of its own blood and martyrdom rather than the blood of outsiders. Ambrose of Milan would not communicate with bishops who required that heretics be put to death. Emperor Martian (396-457) who assembled the Council of Chalcedon (451) said that none should be forced to subscribe to the Council against their will.¹³⁸ Barclay joins with the Fathers in opposing violence within the church.

Liberty of conscience was affirmed by the Fathers through the Incarnation humbly coming into the world through the *Theotokos* (Luke 1:38). Barclay points to the Fathers in saying that God forces none against their will to confess Him as God of the universe. Christ sent his apostles to sow and teach by extolling the doctrine of humility (Philippians 2:5-8). The new covenant exercises the sword of the Spirit and not the earthly sword. Worship and sacrifice must come from willing hearts.¹³⁹ Though Papist and Protestant boast of antiquity, the Fathers testimony is one of liberty of conscience, and denial of forced coercion. Barclay maintains that the Quakers represent the Fathers' testimony.¹⁴⁰

In Barclay's day, Barclay maintains that the Papists bind themselves by oath to interpret the Scriptures as the holy Fathers, yet have twisted the Holy Fathers' words to the opposite. It is clear that the modern 'Fathers' and priests have departed from the church of the first three centuries on the points of oath taking and violence.¹⁴¹ Basil of Caesarea (330-379) states that swearing is the effect of sin or 'missing the mark'. Ambrose of Milan says '*oaths are only a condescendence for defect* (inward disorder)'. John Chrysostom says 'oaths' entered when evil grew: 'oaths' took their

¹³⁷ *ibid*, 465. The church that once believed through being banished, now banishes those who don't believe.

¹³⁸ *ibid*. Martyrdom & Bloodshed by others comprised the founding of the church, and is not to be the means of the church.

¹³⁹ *ibid*, 466. Hosius, Hilarius, Cyprian, Ambrose & Tertullian extol God's intent of Liberty of Conscience by incarnating into the world.

¹⁴⁰ *ibid*, 467. The Fathers and Quakers are uniform in liberty of conscience, and against forced coercion.

¹⁴¹ *ibid*, 503. Modern Fathers are in opposition to the Fathers in the 1st 300 years concerning swearing and violence.

beginning from ‘the want’ of truth. Barclay concludes that one’s healing and restoration through Christ’s baptism eliminates the need for oaths, as well as Jewish customs as prelapsarian righteousness is restored.¹⁴²

Barclay affirms that authenticity is an expression of godliness. Barclay affirms with Athanasius that the Lord in swearing by himself does not ‘repent’ (Psalm 110:4; Genesis 22:16). Words are to imitate God as they are testimonies of truth and not repentance.¹⁴³ Barclay concludes that the new covenant requires speaking and acting at all times with prelapsarian integrity, without needing to take oaths. Since Christ would have his disciples attain the highest place of godliness, Christ dismissed oaths, and established truth and righteousness. The testimonies of the holy martyrs and ancient Fathers against swearing are many. Barclay gives 29 names of Fathers with an etcetera to confirm the many testimonies against taking oaths.¹⁴⁴ Barclay reveals that the movement from the old covenant to the new covenant is understood through the Fathers.

20 Christ is compared to the Grain of Mustard Seed in the teaching of Clement of Alexandria (150-215)

In his conversation with the students of Aberdeen in 1675, Barclay argues that the promised seed of the woman (Genesis 3:15) became the metaphysical seed of the second Adam in the soul of all humanity. Drawing from Clement of Alexandria who says ‘Christ compared himself to a grain of mustard seed in his inward appearance in humanities heart’ Barclay articulates that God manifests himself kataphatically in creation as the promised seed, the seed of the *Theotokos* come in the fullness of time (Galatians 4:4-5), and is now the new covenant uncreated seed of the second Adam in the soul.¹⁴⁵ In addition, concerning the Spirit being more certain or the Scripture being more

¹⁴² *ibid*, 506-7. Godliness coming from Theosis results in Transparency without Oaths.

¹⁴³ *ibid*, 507. Words of truth are not words of repentance, but are words which imitate God in redeemed Humanity.

¹⁴⁴ *ibid*, 512. Christ established Truth Lived and Truth Spoken as New Covenant Expectation unto Perfection for all Christians past, present & to be.

¹⁴⁵ Barclay’s Works III, *An Account of a Dispute at Aberdeen*, 17-18. Christ appears in the mustard seed of the 2nd Adam in the hearts of all humanity per Clement of Alexandria (150-215).

certain, one finds people misrepresenting the Spirit, and people misusing the Scriptures. The new covenant question is whether the Spirit of Pentecost is the principal rule being the *telios* of the old covenant scriptures.¹⁴⁶

In response to Barclay and his traveling companion George Keith (1638-1716), the Aberdeen students claim that because Francis of Assisi (1181-1226) and Ignatius of Loyola (1491-1556) ‘pretended’ to the inward teaching of the Spirit to produce godliness, so the Quakers also ‘pretend’ to the Spirit, making Quakers more ‘heretical’ Catholics than Protestants.¹⁴⁷

Barclay states that the Quakers ‘pretending’ to the Spirit is no different than the students ‘rigid’ Protestant professor John Menzies pretending to the Scriptures. Barclay prioritizes the Spirit of God come at Pentecost as the ground of new covenant knowledge from whom the writing and canonization of Scripture proceed.

Reformer John Brown (1610-1679), Barclay charges, functions from his fallen brain when he questions Brown’s rational commentary on Scripture by which truth is darkened more than clarified. Barclay is for commentary from the Spirit from which the Scriptures came.¹⁴⁸ Brown claims Barclay believes the naked truth of God was never unfolded or declared until the Quakers arose. Barclay acknowledges that the primitive Christians, the saints throughout history, and the first reformers maintain new covenant truth coming from the Spirit of God abiding within.¹⁴⁹

In defense against Brown, Barclay argues that the Fathers and Quakers hold to the inward and immediate teaching of God as necessary to faith. The Father’s citations hold out an inward and immediate teaching of the Spirit in the soul as the firm foundation of knowledge without which all

¹⁴⁶ *ibid*, 39. The Spirit provides the thesis of truth over the hypothesis of truth under the new covenant.

¹⁴⁷ Barclay’s Works III, *Quakerism Confirmed*, 74. The inward teaching of the Spirit to produce godliness makes Quakers more like the Franciscans and Jesuits.

¹⁴⁸ Barclay’s Works III, *Apology Vindicated*, Brown remarks upon Barclay’s Preface, 275. Barclay maintains the Spirit is the Ground of New Covenant Knowledge from which all Scripture & Commentary proceed.

¹⁴⁹ *ibid*, 276. Truth doesn’t originate with Quakers. Truth resides with God who is the new covenant Spirit, Incarnation, and Father within the Saints & Quakers.

teaching is in vain. The Father's citations are the opposite of Brown's claim that the Fathers write against imposters led by the spirit of the devil, pretending to revelation. Barclay asks Brown 'Cannot the Fathers write against false revelation without denying the necessity of inward and immediate teaching from God'? Barclay emphasizes that the Quakers are against pretenders and false prophets as much as the Fathers.¹⁵⁰

Barclay continues that the oneness of the faith of Abraham with the saints' faith today is God speaking divine revelation in Abraham and the saints. The material message to Abraham was to sacrifice Isaac (Genesis 22:1-3) which is different than the material message to the saints today, yet Abraham and the saint stand in the same object of faith being God.¹⁵¹ The prophecies of the prophets are a continuation of the Law of God given through Moses which is part of the Old Testament. Barclay affirms that the Lord has not bound up his hand in the new covenant scriptures that his servants cannot still write or prophesy. There has been prophesying after the disciple John on the Isle of Patmos, but in whom Christ is revealed prophesy ceases.¹⁵² For the one who sees the Lord face-to-face (I Corinthians 13:9-12), Barclay states prophecy is no longer necessary. The saint receives from the Lord until the Lord is fully revealed and formed in the saint (I John 3:1-3). Thus, Barclay maintains that the Quaker Canon will be complete when it pleases the Lord in whose power

¹⁵⁰ Barclay's Works III, *Apology Vindicated*, 291-2. Immediate Revelation in the Soul, as Primary, is in the Fathers' writings along with acknowledging at the same time that some are subject to False Revelations. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 137-8. Preserving the heart of every outside, irrelevant thought by concentrating the inner attention and eliminating every alien influence is to stand before God. Prayer is silence of the mind. It is bequeathed in the lives and writings of the Holy Fathers from the first centuries of Christianity to the present-day. Saint Silouan's ascetic way is personal application of what has been Orthodox understanding from the beginning.

¹⁵¹ *ibid*, 299. God speaking Formal Revelations to Abraham is the same as God speaking Formal Revelations to the Saints under the new covenant today.

¹⁵² *ibid*, 309. Prophecy makes up the Scripture but in whom Christ is revealed, prophesy ceases, though a Christian remains a prophet. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 354. We may study as much as we will but we shall still not come to know the Lord unless we live according to His commandments, for the Lord is not made known through learning but by the Holy Spirit.

it is to reveal himself, when, how, and as long as the Lord pleases. The Lord has not bound his own hand in revealing himself within the saint, as within all saints.¹⁵³

New covenant communion with God emerging from within, according to Barclay, is continuous according to the Lord's designs with no predetermined end. Humanity is dependent on God for his life both in this life and in the next. Barclay draws on the doctrine of Athanasius and Cyril of Alexandria. The first Adam fell and was degenerated in both soul and body (Genesis 3:22-23). That part in first Adam which could not be degenerated by the fall was reduced to a seed (Genesis 6:3) and could never have been raised in first Adam but by a new visitation from Christ the second Adam administered from the promise under first Adam (Genesis 3:15), and is now raised to all people by Christ the second Adam in a day. The breath of life (Genesis 2:7) as *Spiraculum vitarum* is the doctrine of Athanasius and Cyril and is not a Quaker doctrine. Quakers are uniform with the Fathers.¹⁵⁴

Coinciding with the mercy of God is the justice of God. Barclay confirms that the Fathers confess that the cause of God's decrees is God's own glory which is exerted in God's divine attributes, justice being an attribute of God with mercy. Barclay maintains that justice is a cause before sin had place with first Adam. Justice being an attribute of God, Brown claims, is written at length by the Orthodox East whom Barclay feels no need to read, being already understood by the Quakers. The mercy and justice of God affirmed by the Eastern Orthodox coincides with the Quaker view of

¹⁵³ *ibid*, 309-10. The Lord reveals Godself from faith to faith, from first to last within the saint and throughout the saint's life. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 137. The substance of Saint Silouan's aesthetic path can be expressed in a few words – preserving the heart from every outside, irrelevant thought by concentrating the inner attention, by eliminating every alien influence, to stand before God in pure prayer.

¹⁵⁴ *ibid*, 329-30. The Seed remained in Adam as Breath until Raised by Christ as new covenant Seed promised to all in a day.

justice coming to innocent Adam before the fall, and coming now in Christianity through the new covenant.¹⁵⁵

21 Quakers are uniform with the Fathers in Christ's indwelling being more than Scholastic Election

Barclay opposes Brown that God withholds his mercy making reprobation to be of God, which is affirmed by Brown and his brethren through their *Westminster Confession*. Brown acknowledges that the Fathers say little of reprobation before Augustine (d. 430) and claims that Barclay disregards the Fathers' positions because 'the Fathers have little ground in Scripture'.¹⁵⁶ In response, Barclay claims that reformers, like Brown, reject first reformers like Martin Luther and the Lutherans because 'the Lutherans have little ground in Scripture'. Instead Barclay reveals that the ancient Fathers coincide with the Quakers through their quotes. The Quakers, like the ancient Fathers concur in justification coming by the indwelling of Jesus Christ and the Spirit of Christ which is different than the later reformers who subscribe to imputed election. The 'novelty' Brown places on the Quakers, is the 'novelty' Rome placed on the reformers.¹⁵⁷ Barclay summarizes that the Quakers like the Church Fathers have a full and clear understanding of the truth of Christ's indwelling more than Brown and his Reformed brethren in their imputation.

¹⁵⁵ *ibid*, 353. That the justice of God preceded the sin and Fall of humanity is what the Orthodox East believes.

¹⁵⁶ *ibid*, 354-5. God decrees that the reprobate should not obey per the Reformed Confessions and doctors. These scholastic deductions lead to fatal conclusions. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.' 2016, 59-60. 1.4.1. For Christians the fear was not so much that the new science might disprove the existence of a Creator God: new kinds of natural theology, like that of Henry Drummond, might be devised to fit with evolution. It was more that science might be seen to exclude any non-material reality at all: thought itself might be a mere product of the physical brain. Hence momentous issues hung on the science of the brain: the possibility of survival after death, the question of free will as against determinism, the existence of a spiritual world, and hence of God. For Barclay, the light of Christ was universal because the incarnation of God had tasted every person's bodily death and consequently was within every person through Christ's bodily resurrection. The light of Christ conflicts with the light of darkness. Nihilism's telos is that belief in God is counter-productive to scientific advancement. Scholasticism provided the opportunity for nihilism.

¹⁵⁷ *ibid*, 373-4. The Church Fathers would resist the reformed Protestants as much as the Quakers resist the reformed Protestants. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 77. The quest to know God's will is the more important thing in a man's life, since when he happens on the path of the will of God he becomes incorporate with divine, eternal life. Acquiring this knowledge comes through the Commandments of Christ. By virtue of their perfection they express the will of God in their over-all, ultimate sense, whereas man in his everyday life is confronted with an endless complexity of situations, and often does not see what to do to comply with God's will.

Barclay maintains that the indwelling of the Spirit of Christ is able to bring momentary and progressive freedom from sin in this life. This argument is both in the Fathers as well as in the Scriptures. The Fathers believe that humanity might be free from sin by the Spirit of Christ indwelling, though none were free from sin all their life, which is different than the willful Pelagians.¹⁵⁸ Barclay reiterates that it is through Christ indwelling that humanity is restored. Brown rejects that the grace of God which teaches to deny ungodliness is uncreated new covenant Grace. Brown contends that those who fall from ‘grace’ fall from a mental doctrine of ‘faith’ never rightly believed. In response to the ‘mental’ doctrine, Brown claims that Gerardus Vossius (1577-1649) got wrong the opinion of the Fathers in grace being the ‘real’ tasting of the heavenly gift and the ‘real’ partaking of the uncreated Spirit from which one falls. Yet Brown quotes Vossius against Pelagius.¹⁵⁹ Barclay reveals that Brown’s scholasticism can lead to nominalism, presumption, and non-theism.

In response to Brown’s resistance to the Quaker position on oath taking, Barclay asserts that the teaching of the Fathers, the primitive church, and the ancient philosophers were one in saying that swearing was contrary to the Christian call to prelapsarian ‘righteousness’ though Brown charges that the Quakers are pagan.¹⁶⁰ Brown argues that what the devil could not effect through the

¹⁵⁸ *ibid*, 434. Quakers with the Fathers reject freedom from sin by man’s natural strength. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 77. For our actions and our deeds, it is not enough to have a general idea of the divine will as expressed in the Commandments. We need God to show us how to give effect to these Commandments in life. Even more – strength from on high for their fulfillment.

¹⁵⁹ *ibid*, 445-6. Grace and Faith are uncreated New Covenant realities in the Saint’s Perseverance which the reformed reject. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 77. The man who has love of God in his heart, prompted by God’s love, acts in accordance with the dictates which approximate the will of God. But they only approximate-they are not perfect. The unattainableness of perfection obliges us continually to turn to God in prayer for understanding and help. Not only perfect love but complete knowledge is beyond our reach. An act performed, it would seem, with the very best intention often has undesirable even evil consequences, because the means employed were bad, or simply mistaken. We often hear people justifying themselves by saying their intentions were good, but good intentions are not enough. Life abounds in mistakes of this kind. That is why the man who loves God never ceases to beseech Him for understanding, and keeps a constant ear for the sound of His voice in him.

¹⁶⁰ *ibid*, 527. The Fathers and philosophers affirmed non-swearing through new covenant justification.

Heracleonites AD 175,¹⁶¹ *Carpocratians* AD 100-200,¹⁶² and *Gnosimachians*,¹⁶³ the devil is accomplishing through the Quakers. Barclay returns that Brown is more aware of the devil's counsel than the Lord's. Brown concludes that God has given Quakers to the unmaning of themselves who have renounced all Christianity and everything that looks like serious religion. Barclay's response is to vindicate the 'True Christian Divinity' of the Quakers as being uniform with the Church Fathers.

164

ORTHODOX SCHOLARSHIP AND CONCLUSION

The Lonergan method reveals that Robert Barclay gives attention to the Fathers of the church in his first writing, *Truth Cleared of Calumnies*. Barclay uses the words of Paul related to the 'fathers' in his introduction, '*After the way which they call heresy, so worship I the God of my **fathers**.*' (Acts 24:14) [emphasis mine] This chapter demonstrates that it is the Fathers which give foundation to Barclay's arrival at Theosis. The Fathers argue that the saint becomes pure through the Spirit who indwells. Throughout their writing one discovers that it is the Lord's teaching through the *nous* (mind in the heart beyond image and thought) which brings forth the righteous life. It is the life and teachings of Christ in the saints which are priority. Through these teachings the saint experiences oneness with God, like the Father and the Son experience oneness (John 17:19-22).

Ward's middle substance, Birkel's apophatic knowing and Jewish Adam Kadmon, Pyper's narrow evangelical and liberal humanist, Nakano's new covenant self-and-other, Sell's the Fathers, and

¹⁶¹ Kurtz, Johann Heinrich. *Church History: Volume I.*, Frankfurt, Germany, Outlook Publishing, 1890, reprint 2020, 126. A follower of Heracleon of Alexandria, who offered mystical and allegorical interpretations of Scripture. Heracleon was described by Clement of Alexandria in *Strom.* iv. 9.

¹⁶² *ibid*, 139. Carpocrates of Alexandria (d. 138) was the founder of a gnostic sect in the first half of the 2nd century who believed that matter was evil and the spirit good and that salvation was gained through esoteric knowledge. Christians know that he existed and was resisted through the writings of Irenaeus of Lyons and Clement of Alexandria.

¹⁶³ *ibid*, 470. The Gnosimachians depreciated dogmas, by withdrawing from dogmatics, and occupying themselves exclusively with morals.

¹⁶⁴ *ibid*, 528-9. The nature of Theoria is becoming captive of all that God is while amongst humanity.

Trueblood's third way find their locus in the Fathers Justin Martyr, Clement of Alexandria, Athanasius of Alexandria, and Cyril of Alexandria, and the Saints in history.

Orthodox scholar Norman Russell takes note that Justin Martyr (100-165) surmised that if the soul were immortal it would also be unbegotten, but because it is mortal it is also begotten of some 'thing' that is unbegotten, being a seed.¹⁶⁵ To counter the pagan Emperor Antonius Pius', Justin argued for the universal significance of Christ through the operation of the divine *logos*. The fullness of the divine *logos* is Christ whom people have shared in part throughout history by the operation of the *logos spermatikos*, the 'sowing *logos*' who disseminates the 'seeds of truth'. This enabled those like Socrates and Heraclitus to be honorary Christians, 'for each person spoke well, according to the part present in him of the divine '*logos*'.¹⁶⁶ In Justin Martyr one finds confronting of the Greek world in his *Apologies* concerning supernatural reality, and the Jewish world in his *Dialogue* concerning the Jewish Scriptures by arriving at the seed sown who is Christ.¹⁶⁷ The seed at the center of Barclay's arrival at Quaker Christianity finds it home in Justin Martyr.

Building on Justin Martyr, and Irenaeus of Lyons who centered Christianity on the full reality of Jesus Christ in full complement with the universal seed of the second Adam, Russell goes on to analyze Clement of Alexandria. Russell acknowledges that some of Clement's expressions are startling to Western ears, such as **the Christian is deified by a heavenly teaching; and when fully perfected after the likeness of his teacher, humanity becomes a god while still moving about in the flesh;** and at the end of his life is enthroned with the other gods in the heavenly places.¹⁶⁸ **Clement teaches a supremely transcendent God, in whom participation is not a natural relation, yet his doctrine of humanity has divinity as its *telios*.** This necessitates an apophatic

¹⁶⁵ Russell, Norman. *The Doctrine of Deification in the Greek Patristic Tradition*, 97

¹⁶⁶ *ibid*, 97

¹⁶⁷ Behr, John. *The Formation of Christian Theology Volume I: The Way to Nicaea*. SVS Press, NY, 2006, 107.

¹⁶⁸ Russell, Norman. *The Doctrine of Deification in the Greek Patristic Tradition*, 121.

theology of intellectual negation embracing the wisdom that comes through ignorance resulting in becoming one in communion with the divine.¹⁶⁹

Cyril of Alexandria, considered the seal of the Fathers, is known for the Christological controversy surrounding the **bodily humanity of Jesus Christ** beginning with the question of Mary as *Theotokos* or Mother of God.¹⁷⁰ John McGuckin states that for the Eastern Church, Cyril is the father of Orthodox Christology; a great exegete as well as spiritual guide, a saint in the full range of his doctrine, with his life's energy and focus being inseparable in understanding of theology and sanctity.¹⁷¹ Today, Cyril is regarded as a major theologian of the Person of Christ because of his involvement in the conflict with Nestorius (386-451).¹⁷² Cyril's writings that predate 429 are full of references to his fight against the classic heresies of the Sabellians (modalists), Arians, Manicheans, and Adoptionists up until the Nestorian controversy in which he then includes the Pelagians and the Apollinarians.¹⁷³ **Barclay specifically addresses the Pelagian and Apollinarian heresies.**

In Cyril's battle against the demonic forces of paganism administered through Isis, he drew from the deep well of Christian piety, communicating a sense of the immediacy of the presence and power of his divine Lord, whose presence in the Eucharist and in the healing virtues of sacred relics depends first and foremost on the immediacy and validity of the divine presence of the Incarnate One.¹⁷⁴

Nestorius who was named Archbishop of Constantinople in 428¹⁷⁵ immediately proclaimed that the earlier patristic tradition did not support or validate the title *Theotokos* [God bearer] for Mary.¹⁷⁶

¹⁶⁹ *ibid.*

¹⁷⁰ McGuckin, John. *Saint Cyril of Alexandria and the Christological Controversy: Its History, Theology and Texts*. SVS Press, NY. 2004, 22

¹⁷¹ *ibid.*, 1

¹⁷² *ibid.*, 4

¹⁷³ *ibid.*, 8

¹⁷⁴ *ibid.*, 19

¹⁷⁵ *ibid.*, 21

¹⁷⁶ *ibid.*, 22

Nestorius preferred to refer to Mary as Anthropotokos (Mother of the Man).¹⁷⁷ Mary was not the mother of God but rather the mother of the man whom Christian faith recognizes as divine and thus calls God.¹⁷⁸ In the end Nestorius adopted the biblical notion of Mary as the Christ-mother, claiming that to describe Mary as the mother of the Christ (Christotokos) was entirely accurate, incapable of any radical misinterpretation.¹⁷⁹ He claimed that Mary was neither Mother of God nor merely Mother of the man but was mother of Christ.¹⁸⁰ To the Christian community this sounded like the ancient heresy of Paul of Samosata (200-275) being a form of Adoptionism whereby the Logos visited a human person, Jesus, to 'indwell him' with divine inspiration. The deity was distinct from the human person, the man Jesus, a doctrine condemned at the Synod of Antioch in 268.¹⁸¹ Barclay spells out his resistance to Adoptionism through his resistance to Apollinarianism.

The 'Mother of God' was seen as an absolute marker of faith in not only defending the honor of the Virgin Mother, but in fulfilling belief in the personal deity of the Savior. The *Theotokos* title served as the bulwark of Cyril's Christological confession.¹⁸² In Cyril's encyclical letter to Egypt in 429 he affirms the reality of the manhood of Christ and insists on the singleness of his Divine personality.¹⁸³ Cyril was accused by the supporters of Nestorius of reviving the heresy of Apollinaris (d. 382)¹⁸⁴ which Cyril defined as the manhood of the Savior devoid of a soul, being mindless, without *Nous*, or any rational life-principle and thus was merely automation. In other words, Christ was 'heavenly' as to his flesh, not having an earthly body like the rest of humanity.¹⁸⁵ A proof text

¹⁷⁷ *ibid*, 27

¹⁷⁸ *ibid*, 28

¹⁷⁹ *ibid*.

¹⁸⁰ *ibid*.

¹⁸¹ *ibid*, 28-9

¹⁸² *ibid*, 29

¹⁸³ *ibid*.

¹⁸⁴ *ibid*, 38

¹⁸⁵ *ibid*, 49

for Apollinaris had been I Corinthians 15:47 referring to Christ's 'heavenly flesh'.¹⁸⁶ Nestorius rejects a human man or even more, a human baby to be God.¹⁸⁷ His conclusion had been that 'If God the Word became flesh then all the Trinity must have become flesh since the Trinity is bound together as one nature'. Following this logic Nestorius concludes that the one who became incarnate was not the Word of God, and therefore could only be a man.¹⁸⁸

In Nestorius's appeal of the decision of the Council of Ephesus (431), it is revealing to McGuckin that his theological method is one of scholastic innovation. Instead of the traditional view of a general council that recognized the abiding reality of the ancient faith and acclaiming it, Nestorius envisaged a Council of Royal polity as a version of the Senate where royal policy was discussed and scholastically tuned by wordsmithing.¹⁸⁹ This counsel would be an aristocratic and elite body where the unlettered would have no legitimate voice.¹⁹⁰ This aligns with Barclay's argument that decisions be made through a consensus of the Body of Christ (Acts 15:28) and not administered by the scholarly elite.

Roman emperor Theodosius (347-395) would find such scholastic proceedings unacceptable if not blasphemous. His own appeal to the saints around him, even as far as Syria to consult Saint Simeon Stylites (390-459) demonstrates his allegiance to those trained in righteousness through asceticism. Thus, the saints stood as arbiters of doctrine not debarred from theological acumen because of their lack of formal education, but were elevated to decisive spiritual understanding by God's inspiration in their lives. At the end of the day, the opinions of the recluses, ascetics, and pillar dwellers carried more weight with Emperor Theodosius than the scholastic arguments of Nestorius.¹⁹¹

¹⁸⁶ *ibid.*

¹⁸⁷ *ibid.*, 64

¹⁸⁸ *ibid.*, 63

¹⁸⁹ *ibid.*, 92

¹⁹⁰ *ibid.*

¹⁹¹ *ibid.*, 92-3

A hermit monk who had remained confined to his cell for 46 years, archimandrite Dalmatius left his cell to lead the public procession in support of Cyril in condemnation of Nestorius. Theodosius received the delegation, asked for prayers from the old man and dismissed them politely.¹⁹² Barclay mentions the old man at the Council of Ephesus who outside of the inside proceedings was guided in uniformity with the council's decision to stand with the full humanity and the full divinity of the Incarnation. It is this level of righteousness resulting from communion with God that Barclay finds in the saints and the Quakers. Barclay names Apollinarius and Eutyches as deviating from the Quaker position on the humanity and divinity of Jesus Christ.

Barclay claims that the breath of life (Genesis 2:7) as *Spiraculum vitarum* is the doctrine of Athanasius of Alexandria and Cyril of Alexandria. It was Athanasius who stated that 'he who desires to see God Who by nature is invisible and not to be beheld, may yet perceive and know Him through His works, so to let him who does not see Christ with his understanding at least consider Him in His works and test whether they be of man or God... That through the Incarnation of the Word the Mind whence all things proceed has been declared, and its Agent and Ordainer, is the Word of God Himself. He, indeed, assumed humanity, that humanity might become God. He manifested Himself by means of a body in order that humanity might perceive the Mind of the unseen Father. He endured shame from humanity that humanity might inherit immortality'.¹⁹³

This chapter has acknowledged what recent scholarship has argued about Robert Barclay, what Barclay revealed using the Lonergan method, and what Orthodox practitioners reveal concerning the Fathers. It places Barclay at the center of the Fathers with full acknowledgment of the de-emphasis on the sacraments as influenced by the Jansenist leaning Augustine Baker's OSB writing *Sancta Sophia: Mystics, among the Papists their Inward Exercise*, with the fulfillment of new covenant

¹⁹² *ibid*, 97

¹⁹³ Athanasius of Alexandria. *On the Incarnation*. Fig-Books, KY, 2016, 68-9.

Christianity being life in the Spirit of Pentecost proceeding from the Father following the resurrection and ascension of the incarnate Son. This joins the Church Fathers and the saints with the Quakers. This also signals a clear demarcation from the *sola scriptura* doctrine of Reformed Protestant Christianity. Chapter four will consider the central distinction between the Orthodox East and the Roman/Protestant West related to the essence of God being wholly and mysteriously other than creation, and the energy of God being the means by which God is revealed within all of humanity as new covenant Grace.

CHAPTER 4: Barclay and the Essence and Energy of God

INTRODUCTION: Chapter 4 opens with what Barclay scholarship has said about the essence and energy of God, demonstrates the place of the essence and energy of God in Barclay using the Lonergan method in theology, and concludes with scholarship related to the essence and energy of God in Eastern Orthodoxy. This chapter is important in that for Barclay, the essence of God is revealed kataphatically in time through the gospel Incarnation and the new covenant Spirit of Pentecost producing restored prelapsarian communion with God. Jesus Christ is begotten of the Father by the Spirit in the *Theotokos*. The Spirit of Pentecost proceeds from the Father in the name of the Son ten days following the Son's ascension establishing Christ's Body the church. The Son reveals the Father, and the Spirit makes manifest the fulfilled law through Christ in the heart of all humanity, providing the way toward hitting the mark of God's original righteous intent. The essence and energy of God in chapter 4 is communicated in continuation of the saints and Fathers in chapter 3 and is further demonstration that Barclay's 'true Christian divinity' aligns with Orthodox theosis.

BARCLAY SCHOLARSHIP ON THE ESSENCE & ENERGY OF GOD

Michael Birkel in his 2018 *Quakers Reading Mystics* publication contrasts Robert Barclay with fifth-century monastic author John Cassian on the subject of prayer.¹ Birkel contrasts Barclay's identification with the Saints of old with that of Cassian through viewing Scripture as a looking glass.² Here he concludes that humanity participate in the larger drama described in the words of

¹ Birkel, Michael. *Quakers Reading Mystics*. Brill Publishing, Leiden, Netherlands, Issue 1.2, 2018, pgs.9-22

² *ibid*, 10 Barclay 2002, p. 76

Scripture rather than Scripture finding its ultimate purpose only in us.³ Birkel claims that Cassian's interlocutor at the time, Abba Isaac moves prayer into a more mystical direction. Rejecting anthropomorphic notions of God, he promotes what he calls pure prayer, which refuses not only any representation of the divine, but all concepts and words.⁴ This chapter demonstrates the kataphatic reality of Jesus Christ in the flesh and the Spirit of Christ praying through the Christian.

In Birkel's 2019 chapter in *Quakers and Mysticism*, edited by John Kershner, he claims that Barclay's *Apology for the True Christian Divinity* became the canonical expression of a Quaker theology for over 200 years.⁵ Birkel draws on Barclay's use of a phrase from Canticles 3:9 'vehicle of God' as a nonbiblical sounding phrase which links Barclay with George Keith, and Keith's relationships with the Cambridge Platonists.⁶ In this Birkel makes the association with some of Barclay's writing with what Keith saw as the Jewish Kabbalist primordial Adam being Jesus Christ.⁷ Birkel exposes the Lurianic universe of the Kabbalah as richly complex, consisting of multiple worlds mediating between God, in God's utter mystery and humanities mundane cosmos.⁸ In Kabbalistic thought, Keith would have pictured Christ as Adam Kadmon, the divine light, the soul of the Messiah that extends to all souls and feeds the souls of believers with his celestial flesh and blood. This understanding Birkel assumes would have been shared between George Keith and Robert Barclay as intimate friends.⁹ This chapter will demonstrate Barclay's own tension between the essence and energy of God which finds its place as normal and central in Eastern incarnational and Trinitarian thought.

³ *ibid*, 11

⁴ *ibid*, 14

⁵ Kershner, Jon, editor. *Quakers and Mysticism: Comparative and Syncretic Approaches to Spirituality*. Michael Birkel, Robert Barclay and Kabbalah. Palgrave Macmillan, 2019, 85

⁶ The Old Testament book referenced by Barclay as Canticle of Canticles (Roman Catholic) is listed as Song of Songs (Eastern Orthodox) and Song of Solomon (Protestant) in the various Old Testament canons.

⁷ Birkel, Robert Barclay and Kabbalah. 2019, 87

⁸ *ibid*, 89

⁹ *ibid*, 91

Madeleine Ward in her 2017 thesis on the ‘*The Intellectual Context for the Development of Quakerism, 1647-1700*’ states that the Christological criticisms leveled at the Quakers produced the attempt by the Quakers to include Christ’s humanity in his divinity.¹⁰ Ward cites that a distinction can be made between an ‘enhypostasis’ in which the human nature of Christ consists of a complete and personal man, and ‘anhypostasis’ in which the human nature is generalized and has no distinct personal identity of its own. Ward resources that before Chalcedon (451) the human nature of Christ was referred to as anhypostatic (generalized), and enhypostatic (complete) afterwards.¹¹ Ward continues that while Barclay was keen to place Christ at the heart of revelation, Barclay also asserted that the Christian was led to Christ by the Spirit. His distinction between Christ and Spirit in the process of revelation is often fluid as evidenced by his citation of I Corinthians 12:3, 7.¹² Ward concludes that Barclay is insistent that it is the Spirit which draws the Christian into communion with Christ evidenced by his pneumatology in his first three propositions.¹³ This chapter will demonstrate the new covenant place of the proceeding Spirit of the Father following the Son’s ascension comprising the Orthodox rejection of the addition of the *filioque* clause in the Nicene-Constantinopolitan Creed (325, 381). Barclay’s stance on the Spirit is uniform with the Easts rejection of the diminution of the Spirit by the West. In reformed Protestantism the cessation of the Spirit coincides with the canonization of scripture.

Yasuharu Nakano in his 2011 dissertation ‘Self and Other in the Theology of Robert Barclay’, acknowledges the incomprehensibility of the God-man relationship comprised in the Incarnation of God in human flesh, and the equally challenging understanding of the Christian God as formulated

¹⁰ Ward, Madeleine. ‘The Intellectual Context for the Development of Quakerism, 1647-1700’. PhD dissertation submitted to Wolfson College, University of Oxford, July 2017, 38

¹¹ *ibid*, 38

¹² *ibid*, 163

¹³ *ibid*, 161

in the Trinity.¹⁴ Nakano contrasts the inward birth of Christ according to Job Scott (1824) with that of Henry Tuke (1805) balancing the inward light with the Bible.¹⁵ Nakano reveals Job Scott's salvation as first of all emerging from within through an act of God meant not only for each individual but for all of humanity.¹⁶ No matter how much perfection a person may experience from God there always remains some means of subjectivity between God and God's work in humanity.¹⁷ It is this 'subjectivity' which this chapter will demonstrate eternally exists between the object God and the subject humanity understood through the East as apophatic knowledge.

In Alan Sell's analysis of acquiring Truth, he claims that for the 'friendly reader' Barclay's method may appear deficient and even contrary to the people called 'divines'. He explains that instead of admiring school-men, Barclay despises them for they destroy the Christian religion. What Barclay has written comes more from his heart than from his head revealing the locus of Christian revelation. He has followed the certain rule of the Divine Light, the consequent Holy Scriptures, and will distinguish between saving heart-knowledge, and airy head-knowledge.¹⁸ Divine revelation in the end is self-authenticating. True knowledge is revealed inwardly by God's own Spirit.¹⁹ This chapter will demonstrate the essence and energy distinction in Barclay's writing, as Sell concludes that for Barclay the light, the seed, is, or contains, 'Christ'. It is not the proper essence and nature of God precisely taken but is a more pure, simple being, void of all composition or division, a spiritual,

¹⁴ Nakano, Yasuharu. 'Self and Other in the Theology of Robert Barclay'. PhD dissertation submitted to the University of Birmingham, April 2011, 256.

¹⁵ *ibid*, 76

¹⁶ *ibid*, 77-9

¹⁷ *ibid*, 83-4

¹⁸ Sell, Alan P. F. Robert Barclay (1648-1690), *The Fathers and the Inward, Universal Saving Light: A Tercentenary Reappraisal*. School of Advanced Study, University of London, *The Journal of the Friends' Historical Society*, Vol 56 No 3 1992, 212.

¹⁹ *ibid*, 213

heavenly, and invisible principle in which God as Father, Son, and Spirit dwells in all humanity as seed.²⁰

Elton Trueblood points out in Barclay's pre-Quaker Notebook, where numerous visits to England south of the Scottish border have been transcribed, that Barclay writes an entry which follows him throughout his life: 'Many more things that pass betwixt us in our discourse as of the principal of these people viz: as concerning the light which that people bear testimony to, mainly as to its operation in the soul of man and what validity it is of as to man's salvation'.²¹ This note is evidence of the 'uncreated Grace' of God indwelling. It is 'uncreated Grace' bringing about Theosis through the essence and energy of God that this chapter will demonstrate brought searching Barclay into the Quaker path of 'true Christian divinity' beyond his Puritan and Catholic backgrounds.

BARCLAY AND THE ESSENCE & ENERGY OF GOD [LONERGAN METHOD]

1 The incarnation of God has experienced Deicide at the hands of Fallen Humanity so as to be resurrected within Humanity

This seed and light of Christ is not inconsistent with the preaching of the gospel, and the benefit of the Scriptures toward a person being united with Christ, and believing in Christ. Barclay stands in the conviction that the person who is truly Christian is one that is united to Christ and believes in Christ; the gospel including the light of Christ drawing one to salvation.²² The hidden and humble appearance of Christ is in the suffering seed in which God was crucified (deicide) for all humanity through the incarnation, and now Christ is being crucified inwardly as Paul said was in the

²⁰ *ibid*, 219

²¹ Trueblood, Elton. *Robert Barclay*, Harper & Row Publishers, New York, 1968, 262.

²² Barclay's Works I, *Truth Cleared of Calumnies*, 140. While gospel preaching and the Scriptures do not hinder, Gospel Light draws to Life and Salvation

Corinthians (I Corinthians 2:2). The seed of the second Adam in every person results from Christ's physical resurrection both as essence outwardly and as metaphysical energy inwardly.²³

Barclay intimates that Jesus Christ was crucified in the Galatians' eyes (Galatians 3:1) and the grace given Paul to preach is the new covenant unsearchable riches of Christ (Colossians 1:27-29) within. Christ lay hid in the Gentiles, in the seed, which was the least of all seeds; even as the riches and fruitfulness of a tree lies hid in the seed of the tree (Matthew 13:31) which is brought forth, as the seed takes root and gives liberty to grow unto due stature. Paul labored that people might know Christ in them, might embrace Christ in their hearts, so that Christ might be formed in them (Galatians 4:19), and they might know Christ to live in them, his light to rule in them which is more than to know Christ outwardly crucified.²⁴ Infants, the deaf, and the uninformed have the witness of God in them as seed for the purpose of being united with Christ.²⁵

2 Christ as Sunbeam cannot be Separated from Christ the Sun who shines in All

Barclay contends that Christ is the light and is in the enlightening as the sun is the sun (essence) and the rays are the sun (energy). The Light and Light giver cannot be divided or separated who came as the true Light and now shines as uncreated Light.²⁶ The free gift and grace of God is come upon the created image of God, unto justification, so that all may be justified if they close with 'the Lamb' of God who is the fountain of light and life in humanity.²⁷

Barclay states that all are justified by Christ Jesus both as he appeared and was made manifest in the flesh during his earthly days, and as he is now made manifest and revealed indwelling. Barclay

²³ *ibid*, 144-5. The receiving of the seed of Christ inwardly brings outward knowledge into focus. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 356. The soul that has come to know the Holy Spirit does not understand how it is possible to love one's enemies, and will not accept this command; but the Lord has pity on all, and he who would be with the Lord must love his enemy. The man to whom the Lord is known through the Holy Spirit becomes like unto the Lord, as "*We shall be like him; for we shall see him as he is.*" I John 3:2

²⁴ *ibid*, 140. While gospel preaching & the Scriptures hinders not, Gospel Light draws to Life and Salvation

²⁵ *ibid*, 147. Infants & the Geographically disadvantaged have the seed of Christ in them intended for their salvation

²⁶ *ibid*, 149. The Light and light Giver is as inseparable as the sun and the rays

²⁷ *ibid*, 149-151. The free gift, grace, and Lamb of God come upon all to justify is the resurrected Fountain of light and life

assures that the Quakers do not divide Christ's righteousness without (physical incarnation) from Christ's righteousness within (metaphysical return), but do receive and embrace Christ wholly and undivided. Christ, being the means by which humanity is made and accounted righteous in the sight of God cannot be divided.²⁸

3 The Incarnation, Jesus Christ, being the Worker in humanity is the ground of Justification

To this end Barclay explains that it is not the works of Christ wrought in humanity, nor the works which humanity works in Christ, but it is Jesus Christ himself, the Worker revealed, indwelling, his life and power covering them which is the ground of justification (Galatians 2:20; John 14:16-18; Romans 8:9-14). And humanity feeling themselves in Him, feeling Him in them, and his Spirit, His life covering them, they feel their justification and peace with God in Him and through Him; He alone the mediator between God and humanity. This justification by Christ indwelling the saints is not held by the Papist's infusion. Christ Jesus Himself is both first and last justification, and the foundation of justification. Justification by works according to the Scripture is according to the sense and mind of the Spirit of Christ (I Corinthians 2:14-16) as one is taught of him through the *nous* kataphatically. One is justified in their works which one works in Him, and because the Lord God justifies humanity in Him, therefore God accepts and justifies works wrought in Him and accepts and justifies humanity in relation to these works (Ephesians 2:10).²⁹

4 The Spirit of Pentecost is undefilable as Fire is undefilable in what it touches, being the New Covenant fulfillment of the Incarnation and the Father

In justification, the Spirit of Pentecost cannot be defiled by uncleanness of body as the Spirit purifies the body as his temple, like fire and light cannot be defiled by what it touches. The Spirit whom

²⁸ *ibid*, 164. Righteousness results from Christ revealed without and receiving Christ revealed within

²⁹ *ibid*, 165-6. The Spirit of Christ is the worker within who brings forth righteous works unto justification

Jesus said the Father would send in his name is undefilable (John 7:37-39, 14:26, 15:26, 16:13).³⁰

Barclay affirms that Christ is in the saints, and fulfills the righteousness of the law in the saints (Romans 8:4). Jesus Christ, who knew no sin, was made to be sin for humanity, suffering for sins that those who deserved wrath, might partake of love and grace by Him indwelling, restoring the righteousness of God (II Corinthians 6:17-18).³¹ With the coming of the substance, which is Christ, the Jewish types, figures, and shadows imposed until the new covenant had come, ends (Ephesians 4:5, Hebrews 9:8-10).³² The uncreated grace of God given to all is saving in nature, and is given to save according to the Scriptures. The grace of God is uncreated by virtue of the eternal Word become incarnate, dying, and rising for the salvation of all, to be united with all. (John 15:5)³³

Barclay affirms that he that believes in the light believes in Christ. Where the light of Christ is, there is Jesus Christ himself. The light of Christ and the gospel of Christ are one. The gospel of which Paul was minister, is the new covenant light of Christ noetically preached in every creature (Galatians 1:15-16; Colossians 1:23, 27-29; Romans 10:20).³⁴

5 The Light of Christ and Day of the Lord is as Darkness in those who reject Christ's coming within

The light is as darkness in the same way as the day of the Lord is called darkness in those who reject the day of the Lord.³⁵ The crucifixion of Jesus Christ, who tasted death for everyone, is now within every person. Barclay points out that the Corinthians had become sensible that Christ had been

³⁰ *ibid*, 176. The pure Spirit purifies its Temple through baptism

³¹ *ibid*, 178-9. Restoring humanity to the righteousness of God comes through Christ fulfilling the righteousness of the law in the Saints

³² *ibid*, 190-1. The coming of the Substance who is Christ ended the Types, Figures & Shadows

³³ Barclay's Works I, *William Mitchell Unmasked*, 247. The grace of God is universal in nature who become incarnate to save all

³⁴ *ibid*, 249-50. The light of Christ kataphatic and gospel of Christ in the flesh apophatic are the same to be believed in

³⁵ *ibid*, 252. The light of Christ is only as darkness in those who reject Christ's appearing. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 355. With the mere mind we can only come to know the things of this earth, and then only in part, while God and all that is of heaven are known through the Holy Spirit. If we take pains to explore the human heart, we shall see the Kingdom of heaven in the soul of the Saint but in the soul of the sinner-darkness and torment. We shall dwell eternally in the Kingdom or in torment.

crucified ‘in’ them as preferred to ‘amongst’ them. The Corinthians had recognized that their healing would come from Christ within (I Corinthians 2:2).³⁶ This inward blood of Christ is the hidden man of the heart (I Peter 3:3-4) to be put on as new person (Ephesians 4:24; Colossians 3:10) which is the Lord Jesus Christ who died and rose in Jerusalem.

As many as are baptized into Christ (Galatians 3:27), have put on Christ (Romans 8:14, 13:12-14) so that Christ might be formed in them (Galatians 4:19). Paul admonishes the Corinthians that they should know Jesus Christ in them, else they be reprobate (II Corinthians 13:5). Barclay states that these are the express words of Scripture.³⁷

Barclay affirms that the Light giver is not confounded with the Light or the enlightening given. The Light giver is the fullness of God wherewith all are enlightened and is as inseparable as the sun is with the sunbeams. Instead, William Mitchell and his reformed brethren make fallen reason one with Christ.³⁸ Barclay concludes that he that believes in the Son of God has the witness in himself (I John 5:10). It is the voice of the Father at Christ’s baptism (Matthew 3:17) and the voice of the Father at Christ’s Transfiguration (Matthew 17:5; II Peter 1:17-18) which is the greater witness. The Father’s voice in the Jews (John 5:37) was a witness more than Jesus’s miracles, and was a witness greater than John the Baptist’s testimony.³⁹ Barclay assures that a person is not only made one with

³⁶ *ibid*, 253. *EV* in I Corinthians 2:2 is translated ‘In’ rather than ‘Among’

³⁷ *ibid*, 254. For want of a spiritual understanding concerning what I mean by the inward blood of Christ being the Hidden Man of the Heart, Mitchell brings forth his own malicious guessing.

³⁸ *ibid*, 256. Jesus Christ is separate from the light of Christ and noetic wisdom as the sun is separated from the sun beams. Robert Barclay, *An Apology for True Christian Divinity: Immediate Inward Objective Revelation*, 1676, 33-34. Dr. John Smith (1618-1652) of Cambridge states: “*There is a knowing of the truth as it is in Jesus, as it is in a Christ-like nature; as it is in that sweet, mild, humble, and loving Spirit of Jesus, which spreads itself, like a morning sun, upon the souls of good men, full of light and life. It profits little to know Christ himself after the flesh; but Christ gives his Spirit to good men, that searches the deep things of God.*” And again: It is but a thin airy knowledge that is got by mere speculation, which is ushered in by syllogisms and demonstrations; but that which springs forth from true goodness, [as in the Greek], as Origen (182-254) speaks: “*The Spirit brings such a divine light into the soul, as is more clear and convincing than any demonstration.*”

³⁹ *ibid*, 266-7. The Father’s voice at Jesus’s Baptism and Transfiguration was also the voice in the Jews. Irenaeus of Lyon. *The Scandal of the Incarnation: Irenaeus against the Heresies*, Ignatius Press, 1990, 32. How could the Gnostics’ have been ignorant of the supreme God ‘Maker of the World seeing they were His property and His creatures, and were contained by Him? He may have been invisible to them because of His supereminence, but because of His providence,

the Father and the Son by the Spirit, but that the Spirit of Christ (Romans 8:9) is the means by which every spirit is tested (I Thessalonians 5:19-24).⁴⁰

6 The One Bread of which the Body uniformly partakes is the Resurrected Jesus Christ (John 6:53)

The one bread spoken of in I Corinthians 10:15-16 intended for Gentile and Jew alike is Jesus Christ in reality (John 6:51-53). The inward and outward bread cannot be called one, because the shadow under the old covenant only signified, and the reality who is Christ in the new covenant is realized. There is now one reality who is Jesus Christ and no shadow (Hebrews 10:11-14; 9:28).⁴¹ As Christ had the Father and the Spirit above measure as ready access to the Father, so one has the light of Christ and the Spirit of Christ sent of the Father (Romans 8:1-5, 9-11) to assist in words both audible and inaudible in the heart (*nous*).⁴²

In Barclay's 1673 *Catechism and Confession of Faith*, he uses Scripture texts to convince the Protestants who question the Quaker understanding of the True and Saving Knowledge of God.⁴³ Barclay's *Confession of Faith* begins with God who is light and the true and saving knowledge of God through the Spirit. Barclay affirms that God is three: the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit who are one God. The Father is in the Son and the Son is in the Father. No person knows the Son but the Father, and those whom the Son reveals the Father. The Spirit who searches all things, even the deep things of God makes known that which can be known of God by the Spirit. The Spirit sent by the Father in Christ's name teaches all things, and brings what Christ taught to remembrance in

by no means could He had been unknown to them. Since His sovereignty extended over all, they ought to have known their Sovereign, and this they should have seen: that He who created them is Lord of all. For God, invisible by nature, is mighty, and confirms on all the great mental intuition and perception of His almighty greatness. Therefore, though no one knows the Father except the Son, nor the Son except the Father, and those to whom the Son has revealed Him (Matthew 11:27), yet all beings know this fact at least, because reason, implanted in their minds, moves them, and reveals to them that there is one God, the Lord of all.

⁴⁰ *ibid*, 267-8. The Spirit is the means by which Christians test every spirit and are made one with the Father & the Son.

⁴¹ *ibid*, 298-9. The One Bread replacing the sign which once signified is now the Reality who now realizes, being Jesus Christ.

⁴² *ibid*, 319. The Spirit proceeding from the Father provides words of blessing both audible & inaudible from the heart.

⁴³ Barclay's Works I, *A Catechism and Confession of Faith*, 344-5. Chapter I. Of God, and the True and Saving Knowledge of him.

those who know the Father through the Son. The saints receive the Holy Spirit rather than the spirit of this world so that they might know things given by God.⁴⁴ The Guide and rule for the saints is the Comforter, the Spirit of truth, whom Christ prayed that the Father would send. Only those having the Spirit are known by God as his children. The Spirit of Christ lives within, his laws are written in their hearts, and they are taught by God through the anointing (I John 2:27) which teaches all things and is truth.⁴⁵ God said He will dwell and walk in the contrite and humble of spirit (II Corinthians 6:16), as Christ stands at the door of the heart knocking, waiting to enter and commune (Revelation 3:20). Examining ourselves opens the way to determine whether Christ is indwelling as hope of glory (Colossians 1:27-29) or whether one is reprobate (II Corinthians 13:5).⁴⁶

Barclay claims that Christ who sanctifies and the saint being sanctified are one, being made partakers of the divine nature of the Father and the Son (II Peter 1:4). Christ prayed that his disciples would be one with the Father and the Son, as Christ was one with the Father (John 17:19-23).⁴⁷

7 Jesus seals the Gospel dispensation by his Blood in defeating Death, and appears to his disciples Post-resurrection giving Life through the pouring forth of the Spirit

In the *Anarchy of the Ranters and the Hierarchy of the Romanists refuted* (1674) in what would become the *Book of Government* for Quakers (1679), Barclay begins with the Jewish Law being dispensed with through God sending his Son, the Lord Jesus Christ in the fullness of time to fulfill the Law (Galatians 4:4), and then moves on to new covenant reality. Jesus Christ, having approved himself and the excellency of the gospel through signs and miracles, sealed the gospel with his blood, triumphing over bodily death, and witnessed to his disciples many times bodily after his rising, comforting them with the hope and assurance of the pouring forth of the Spirit by which they

⁴⁴ Barclay's Works I, *Confession of Faith*, 422. *Concerning God, and the True and Saving Knowledge of him*-addresses the Filioque clause added to the Nicene Creed.

⁴⁵ *ibid*, 423. 'Article II'. *Concerning the Guide and Rule of Christians* being the new covenant Spirit sent of the Father upon Christ's Ascension.

⁴⁶ *ibid*, 426. 'Article VII'. *Concerning the Inward Manifestation of Christ* in those in who restored communion with God is taking place.

⁴⁷ *ibid*, 427. 'Article IX'. *Concerning the Unity of the Saints with Christ*.

would to be led and ordered in all things (John 14:16-18; John 20:21-23). It is in and by the Spirit that He would be with them to the end of time (Matthew 28:20, Romans 8:8-10). It was by the Spirit that they were filled and emboldened to preach the good news of Christ's coming without fear (John 20:19 ff.), which those who believed were to be of one heart, and of one soul, and great love, and zeal prevailed as there was nothing lacking for a season (Acts 1-2).⁴⁸

8 Jesus as Head, and the Spirit who fills, Guides the 'Church' today as in the Garden

Order for Barclay begins with Jesus Christ, the king and head of his Body, who did appoint and ordain that there should be order and government in the church (John 20:21-23; Matthew 28:19-20).

Secondly, that the apostles and primitive Christians, when filled with the Holy Spirit, were led immediately by the Spirit to practice order and government (I Corinthians 14). Thirdly, that the Body has the same power today as in the beginning, being led by the same Spirit (Acts 15:28).⁴⁹

Barclay builds on this order in his *Apology* (1675) by acknowledging the foundation of true knowledge being God the Father through the incarnation Jesus Christ, and the ground of true knowledge being the Spirit of Pentecost, and the fulfilled new covenant law through Christ written in the heart and mind noetically. This is to be known and believed in the first place in the right way

⁴⁸ Barclay's Works I, *The Anarchy of the Ranters and the Hierarchy of the Romanists Refuted*, 465-6. The Introduction and Method of This Treatise on Order under the Gospel dispensation. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.' 2016, 36. Although evolutionary theory could be used to promote an optimistic outlook on life it was so challenging to faith that some people spoke in terms of a 'war' between science and religion. Graham's wife Margaret wrote of how, as a student, Graham was 'assailed ... by the doubts and questionings which the new light on Evolution engendered'. The eminent Quaker physicist Silvanus P. Thompson (1851-1916) devoted his Swarthmore lecture of 1915 to expounding the sacred duty of unprejudiced pursuit of truth. After explaining the scientific method of testing theory by experiment, he dealt with the Inward Light as a valid pathway to truth in its own domain. Truth was one, though the approaches to it were various. Graham's particular way of reconciling science and religion was to apply the resources of psychical research, especially Frederick Myers' ideas about telepathy and the subliminal self, to his understanding of Quaker access to truth. For Barclay, order under Jesus Christ, head of his Body brought solutions to the Body and to humanity as a whole. The light of Christ and Spirit of Pentecost led in returning the children of the light to their original pre-fallen design. Barclay was wary of counterfeit light which would be counter-productive to God's designs. The Body was led as the early Church was lead to realize the Kingdom intended beyond the fallen condition of humankind.

⁴⁹ *ibid*, 476-7. Order and government for the body of Christ as established by Jesus Christ and the Spirit of Pentecost.

kataphatically (John 17:3).⁵⁰ Barclay continues that vain secular knowledge hinders true inward knowledge kataphatic and noetic from God. Inward knowledge from the Spirit also leads in understanding the shadow scriptures kataphatically and apophatically.⁵¹

9 The unknowable Essence and the knowable Energy are two metaphysical Realities in ‘knowing’ God

In Barclay’s defense of his 1675 ‘true Christian divinity’, he opens that the new covenant precreation understanding of God’s essence as ‘incarnation’ and Trinity (John 17:1-5) is assumed so as to proceed with how the ground of new covenant revelation being of the Spirit, and the law of Christ (Romans 8:1-4) written in the heart (Hebrews 8:9-13; 10:14-18) is known. This for Barclay is God’s ‘unknowable’ essence extending through God’s ‘knowable’ energy in a similar way as the ‘unapproachable’ sun in its manifestation extends through the ‘knowable’ rays producing righteousness (divinization or deification).⁵² Barclay quotes Epictetus (55-135 A.D.) who says that the foundation of piety and eternal life is to have right and true opinions and apprehensions of God.⁵³

⁵⁰ Robert Barclay, *An Apology for the True Christian Divinity*, 25. The Foundation of True Knowledge being God the Father through Jesus Christ and the Ground of True Knowledge being the Spirit of Pentecost & the New Covenant law of the Spirit in the heart is necessary to be known first.

⁵¹ *ibid*, 26. Inward knowledge kataphatic & noetic leads one to embrace Outward knowledge discursive & apophatic Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.’ 2016, 37. In the field of biblical studies, David W. Bebbington insists that evangelicals in general were not opposed to the new approach to the Bible even while continuing to regard the holy book as fundamental to their Christian faith. Some, however, continued to believe in its verbal infallibility. My research shows how important for Quakers, including Graham was the new thinking about the Bible. Barclay always held that the sacred scriptures were the shadow pointing to reality. To take the Bible as a scientific text book was simply to misrepresent the Bibles intended use. Verbal infallibility was at the heart of the divisions in the Protestant movement and a source of contention in scientific work. Barclay returned the Bible to its accurate place in its relation to faith and science.

⁵² *ibid*, 27. The True Foundation of the Son, the Father-John 17:3 & the Spirit of Pentecost are generally believed & accepted, yet are apophatically received. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 360. The Lord loves us so dearly that it passes description. Through the Holy Spirit alone can the soul know His love, of which she is inexpressibly aware. The Lord is all goodness and mercy. He is meek and gentle, and we have no words to tell of His goodness; but the soul without words senses this love, and would remain wrapped in its soft tranquility forever.

⁵³ *ibid*. Right and True Opinion and Apprehension of God are the foundation of Piety and Life Eternal. *Sophrony, (Sakharov). Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 136-7. Sometimes something occurs in the hesychast’s prayer that is difficult to explain. Lights appear around the mind, trying to attract attention to themselves, and if the mind refuses to pay attention, they, as it were, say to the mind, ‘We bring you wisdom and understanding, and if you refuse us

10 Heart Knowledge coming by the New Covenant Spirit transcends Fallen Head Knowledge

For Barclay, the revelation of and from the eternal Spirit, who is of the Son, and sent of the Father is the formal object of faith in all ages and under all administrations. The testimony of the Spirit kataphatic, is that alone by which true knowledge of God apophatic as eternal Spirit, Son, and Father has been, is, and can only be known (Matthew 11:25-27; 12:30-32). This knowing is revealed by the Spirit in the shadow Scriptures old and new kataphatically, and in the person apophatically.⁵⁴

The knowing of immediate revelation from the new covenant Spirit in the heart (*nous*) is considered unnecessary by carnal natural Christians (the rigid Protestants) who function through fallen brain reason.⁵⁵ For Barclay, knowledge from the Spirit of God through the *nous* is necessary to airy head knowledge from the brain. Barclay affirms that in history none were judged ‘Christian’ unless they were possessed by the Spirit of Christ. The children of God were led kataphatically by the Spirit of God (Romans 8:9, 14).⁵⁶ Barclay teaches that the certain, saving heart knowledge coming from

now, maybe you will never see us again.’ But the experienced mind pays no attention whatever and they depart, not only unaccepted but even unacknowledged. The mind does not know for sure is if it was an evil enemy or a good angel; but does know by experience that if it stops to consider the brilliant thought, it loses prayer, and with great pains must seek it again. Experience shows that in the hour of prayer we must not listen even to good thoughts because if you do, other ideas will occur and you will not continue undistracted. Nothing can compensate for the loss of pure hesychastic prayer.

⁵⁴ *ibid*, 28. The formal object of revelation is of the Spirit of Christ in the Saints and is true of All Ages. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 353. The love of the Lord the soul knows full well; but it cannot be conveyed in words. Only those whom the Lord bestows the Holy Spirit can know of it, by the Holy Spirit. The soul suddenly sees the Lord and knows that it is He.

⁵⁵ *ibid*, 29. The moving & acting of God’s Spirit in the heart is judged unnecessary by fallen natural Christians. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 137. In the struggle for freedom the hesychast’s battle against intrusive thoughts is so intense as to be unimaginable without personal experience. In his inner battle against intrusive thoughts, in his downright opposition, the novice will often suffer partial defeat. But he may come off victorious and thus be able to analyze the nature of the thought so acutely that although he did not commit the sin suggested, he can recognize the action (energy) of the passion more profoundly, more compellingly, than anyone actually possessed by the sin. The latter, the unaware, may observe in himself and in others the energy manifested by one or other passion but to arrive at more basic knowledge it is essential to plumb the spiritual region who prays according to the contemplation of the pure mind before God. When the mine is pure before God, the heart sees every passion at the moment of conception.

⁵⁶ *ibid*. Later Reformers reject the Spirit of God as necessary while Barclay affirms the necessity of the Spirit. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 137. The wondrous procedure of the Spirit in the heart, unimaginable to the idle majority, can only be adopted with great effort by very few. It is not at all simple, not at all easy. And I (Silouan), in my efforts to express it briefly but clearly shall be obliged, more than once, to approach it helplessly, from various angles, without hope, however, of capturing and presenting it satisfactorily.

God's Spirit shining upon the heart (*nous*) is new covenant reality, and transcends fallen head knowledge centered in humanities ego.⁵⁷

Barclay concludes that knowledge revealed by the eternal Spirit who is one with the Son and the Father (John 14:16-18) is full and necessary to obtaining salvation. The new covenant Spirit which indwells being one with the Son and the Father, Barclay claims, is both the universal seed and noble principle.⁵⁸

11 There is no knowledge of the Father but by the Son who is Bodily Mediator, Revelation of God, and Son of Man

Barclay continues that there being no knowledge of the Father but by the Son, Jesus, is fitly called the mediator between God and humanity being with God and himself God for all eternity. By partaking of the nature of humanity in time, the goodness and love of God is conveyed to humankind so that humanity receives and partakes of the Father's mercies through the Incarnation. There is no knowledge of the heavenly Father but by the eternal Son made flesh in human likeness, in bringing forth the kingdom of God amongst humanity as God originally intended.⁵⁹

⁵⁷ *ibid*, 30. The knowledge of God that is eternal comes from the Spirit of Christ shining in upon the Heart. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 360. The Holy Spirit invisibly instructs the soul. In the Holy Spirit the soul acquires peace. The Holy Spirit gladdens the soul and brings her joy on earth. How much greater joy shall we know in heaven? We are taught of the Holy Spirit to know the love of God, but in heaven it will be complete.

⁵⁸ *ibid*, 35. The Spirit reveals the Knowledge of the Son and the Father formally, objectively & inwardly. Irenaeus of Lyon. *The Scandal of the Incarnation: Irenaeus against the Heresies*, Ignatius Press, 1990, 19. Creatures must have the origin of their existence from some great cause. The origin of all things is God. He was not created by anyone, but everything was created by Him. The first thing to believe, therefore, is that there is one God, the Father, who created and order all things, calling into existence what did not exist. He contains all things, yet cannot Himself be contained. 'All things' includes this world, with man in it. So, then, there is one God, the Father, uncreated, invisible, creator of all things. There is no other God above Him and no other God beneath Him. God is rational, and therefore produced creatures by His Reason-Word. God is also spirit, and so He ordered all things through the Spirit, as the prophet says: 'By the word of the Lord the heavens were established, and all the power of them by His Spirit' (Psalm 32:6)

⁵⁹ *ibid*, 36-7. The Son Jesus is fitly called the Mediator between God and humanity being with God and Himself God for all Eternity who took on himself man's nature in revealing the Father. Irenaeus of Lyon. *The Scandal of the Incarnation: Irenaeus against the Heresies*, Ignatius Press, 1990, 19-20. The Word 'establishes', that is, produces bodies and bestows permanence of what has come into existence while the Spirit exposes and shapes the various 'powers'. The Word is rightly called the Son, and the Spirit God's Wisdom. His apostle Paul puts it well: 'One God and Father of all, who is above all with all in all' (cf Eph 4:6). The Father is 'above all', but the Word is 'with all', since it is through Him that everything was made by the Father. And 'in us all' is the Spirit, who cries 'Abba, Father' (cf Gal 4:6), and forms man into the likeness of God. Irenaeus of Lyon. *The Scandal of the Incarnation: Irenaeus against the Heresies*, Ignatius Press, 1990, 45. No one knows the Father without the Word of God, that is to say, unless the Son reveals Him, nor can

Since the advent of the new covenant, there is no knowledge of the Son but by the Spirit; the revelation of the Son being by the Spirit in the heart (*nous*). The saving, certain, and necessary knowledge of God was only by the Spirit revealing the Son *in* Paul (Galatians 1:16). Jesus Christ, by whom the Father is revealed, reveals himself *in* his disciples by his Spirit. Jesus Christ now having ascended does now teach inwardly by his own Spirit (Romans 8:1-4, 5-7, 8-14). Paul preaches ‘Christ in the Gentiles’ as Paul’s ministry and calling (Colossians 1:26-29). Christ expresses his inward and spiritual presence to his disciples as being *in* and *with* his disciples kataphatically to the end of the age (Matthew 18:20, 28:19-20; John 14:16-18; Revelation 3:20).⁶⁰

Spiritual truth concerning Jesus as Lord and the apophatic witness of the Scripture are as lies to the unspiritual. If ‘*no person says that Jesus is Lord but by the Holy Spirit*’, then no person can affirm Jesus to be Lord but by the Holy Spirit (I Corinthians 12:3). The epistle to the Corinthians answers the enlightened understanding of the spiritual and real Christian. The apostle Paul insinuates that spiritual truths are as lies in the mouth of the carnal and unspiritual, treating the things recorded in (shadow) Scripture as an actor treats the script of a play. This is the product of scholasticism leading to nominalism, presumption, and non-theism.⁶¹

12 The Quaker prelapsarian faith Present, and the Ancient faith Past is in One and the Same Rock

Barclay confirms that in the Old Testament canon, the Spirit of God moved upon the face of the waters (Genesis 1:2) and spoke to the patriarchs from Adam to Moses. From Moses to Malachi, God

one know the Son without the good pleasure of the Father (Matthew 11:26). The Son leads men to the Father, but the Father reveals to them the Son.

⁶⁰ *ibid*, 37-8. There is no Knowledge of God the Father and the Son but by the Eternal Spirit of God kataphatically & noetically within. Irenaeus of Lyon. *The Scandal of the Incarnation: Irenaeus against the Heresies*, Ignatius Press, 1990, 20. The Spirit manifests the Word, and so the prophets proclaimed the Son of God. But the Word lets the Spirit blow, and so it is He who speaks in the prophets and leads men back to the Father.

⁶¹ *ibid*, 39-40. The Enlightened receives both the Spirit and the nature of God as revealed in the Scriptures.

revealed himself to his children by his Spirit, and through the Law given through Moses.⁶² The ancients one faith, one God, and one revelation is consistent with the one past, one present, and one future rock who is Christ (I Corinthians 10:1-4, Hebrews 13:8, Ephesians 4:4-6).⁶³ The ancients' faith is one and the same as the Quaker faith agreeing in substance and in definition as defined by the ancients in Hebrews 11. The ancients believed in Christ, with respect to Christ's appearance incarnationally (in human flesh), as future, Christ being present with the ancients and near through their drinking from '*that spiritual rock which followed them, which rock was Christ*' (I Corinthians 10:1-4). To feed upon Christ's appearance past, and to feed upon Christ's appearance present, is to feed upon '*Christ in you*' (Colossians 1:27), '*except you be reprobate*'. (II Corinthians 13:5) The ancients' faith and the Quaker faith are terminated in one and the same Rock. (John 6:51-58)⁶⁴

Barclay contends that Christ was revealed in Paul and to Paul (Galatians 1:15-16). Barclay claims that the Quakers know epistemologically, the same eternal Son (Hebrews 13:7-9) revealed by the same eternal Spirit in all people. In the same object of the Son and in the same object of the Spirit there is no alteration, no matter the diversity of administrations, whether it be pre-covenant, old covenant, or new covenant.⁶⁵ There is one Spirit, one Lord, one God (I Corinthians 12:4-7). They are to know epistemologically the same God through the same Spirit. Every act is specified from its

⁶² *ibid*, 41. The Spirit of God who hovered over the waters of creation spoke from Adam to Moses & from Moses to Malachi.

⁶³ *ibid*, 45-6. The faith of the Ancients coincides with the one eternal Rock who is Christ. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 358. Even the souls of the heathen sense that God is, though they were ignorant how to worship God. But the Holy Spirit instructed the prophets of old, and after them the Apostles and then our holy Fathers, and in this great faith came down to us. And we knew the Lord by the Holy Spirit, and when we knew Him our souls were confirmed in Him.

⁶⁴ *ibid*, 46. The Ancients of Hebrews 11 drink from the Same Rock as the Quakers which is Christ.

⁶⁵ *ibid*, 46-7. God is eternally unchanging as one Spirit, one Lord, and one God without alteration. Irenaeus of Lyon. *The Scandal of the Incarnation: Irenaeus against the Heresies*, Ignatius Press, 1990, 21. The Father is Lord, and the Son is Lord, and the Father is God, and the Son is God, for He who is begotten of God is God. And in this way God is shown in His being and in the power of His nature to be one God, but in the administration and accomplishment of our redemption, He is Father and Son. For the Father is invisible and inaccessible all creatures, and so it needed the Son to lead those who are to reach God into submission to the Father. David speaks of Father and Son: 'Your throne, O God, is forever and ever; you have loved justice, and hated iniquity, therefore God has provided you with the oil of gladness above your fellows' (cf Ps 44:7f). This means that the Son, being God, receives the throne of the everlasting kingdom from the Father, and the oil of anointing above His fellows. The oil of anointing is the Spirit, with whom He is anointed. And His fellows are the prophets, the just, the apostles, and all who share in His Kingdom, His disciples.

object. The same eternal Spirit reveals the same eternal Son and the same eternal Father by which one can know the mind of God and be led in all things.⁶⁶

13 The Spirit, sent of the Father in the name of Christ, indwells the Body of the Saint as New Covenant Temple

Barclay develops this thought by saying that first, Christians now are to be led inwardly and immediately by the Spirit of God according to the promise of Jesus Christ: ‘*The Comforter, Spirit of truth, Holy Ghost, the “Sent” of the Father in the name of Christ... Teaching you all things and dwelling in you*’ John 14:16-18, 26; 16:13.⁶⁷ The Spirit dwells with you, and shall be in you. The Spirit dwelling in the saint is a thing most necessary to be known and believed. The body of the saint is the new covenant temple of the Holy Spirit. Without the Spirit, Paul considers no person a Christian. You are not in the flesh, but in the spirit, if the Spirit of God dwells in you. Take away the Spirit and a person is no more a Christian than the body of a person, is a person when the soul and spirit has departed, no matter how actuated the body was prior to the soul’s departure.⁶⁸

Barclay affirms that whatever is excellent, noble, worthy, and desirable in a person is ascribed to the new covenant Spirit, without which the Christian faith would no more subsist than the world would subsist without the sun. It is by the Spirit that Christians in all ages reference themselves to have been converted to God, redeemed from the world, strengthened in weakness, comforted in affliction, confirmed in temptation, emboldened in suffering, and triumphed in persecutions. The Spirit quickens, gives utterance, and cannot be resisted (though rejected). It is such as walk after the Spirit who receives no condemnation. The law of the Spirit brings freedom. By the Spirit indwelling, one is redeemed from the flesh and carnal mind. The Spirit quickens the mortal body, and through the Spirit, the deeds of the body are mortified and eternal life obtained. By the Spirit one cries *Abba*

⁶⁶ *ibid.* In the new covenant revelation of the Son and the Father by the Spirit now within all people, Christians have the unalterable mind of God.

⁶⁷ *ibid.*, 48. According to the promise of Jesus Christ, Christians are now to be led Inwardly & Immediately by the Spirit of God.

⁶⁸ *ibid.*, 49-50. The Spirit dwelling in the Saint brings Life Eternal regardless of the natural Body.

Father, and the Spirit intercedes in infirmities. By the Spirit, glorious things which eye, ear, nor heart can know are laid up, and it is the Spirit by which the Body of Christ becomes one in wisdom, knowledge, faith, miracles, tongues, and prophecies.⁶⁹ Whoever is the temple of the Holy Spirit, in him the Spirit of God dwells and abides. In whom the Spirit inhabits, the Spirit is not lazy, dumb, or useless. The Spirit moves, actuates, governs, and instructs in all things whatsoever is needful to know, and brings all things to remembrance.⁷⁰

The revelations of the Spirit are certain when one distinguishes between the thesis and hypothesis. It is one thing to affirm that the revelation of God is certain and infallible and another thing for any person to claim to be infallibly led by the Spirit. Quakers affirm that the Spirit is certain and infallibly present to lead people collectively, and do not affirm that any one person is infallibly led.⁷¹

Barclay continues that because the Spirit of God is the fountain of truth and reason (tradition), therefore one can say that the Spirit does not contradict the testimony of Scripture or historic reason. The Spirit of God remains the nobler provider of truth being divine, and reveals, illumines, and actuates the well-disposed understanding, irresistibly moving the understanding to assent by its own evidence and clearness, even as a common principle of 'natural' truth bends the mind 'naturally' to assent.⁷²

⁶⁹ *ibid*, 50-1. Crying *Abba Father* comes only by the New Covenant Spirit.

⁷⁰ *ibid*, 55. New Covenant Revelation is an instructive encounter with the Spirit of Jesus Christ sent of the Father.

⁷¹ *ibid*, 60. The Spirit is Certain & Infallible to lead Saints but not all People are infallibly led. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 361. The Lord so loved His creature that He gave man the Holy Spirit, and man knew his Creator and loves his Lord. The Holy Spirit is love and sweetness to the soul, the mind and the body; but when the soul loses grace, or grace is diminished, once again the soul will seek the Holy Spirit in tears, and yearn for God, and cry: My soul yearns for the Lord, and I seek Him in tears. How could I not seek thee, O Lord? For Thou Thyself didst seek me aforehand, and gave thee to delight in Thy Holy Spirit; and now my soul yearns for Thee. My heart fell to loving Thee, and I pray Thee: Give me to the end to abide in Thy love. Empower me for the sake of Thy love to endure all sickness and affliction.'

⁷² *ibid*, 68. New Covenant spiritual understanding noetic and apophatic from the Spirit kataphatic comes in an exaggerated way to the Old Covenant understanding which came rationally by the Natural senses. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 362. There is no end to God's love. I know a man whom the Lord in His mercy visited with His grace. And The Lord asked him, Wouldst thou have Me give thee more?, From weakness of the flesh his soul would have made answer: Thou seest, Lord, that I cannot bear more and would die, for

The person, who denies that the uncreated Spirit is the fountain, elevates created nature. Elevating shadow Scripture and human reason over the transcendent and immanent uncreated God creates an idol. With the patriarchs and prophets, the manifestation and revelation of God by his Spirit was immediate and objective. With the apostles, the Incarnation was bodily present. For the new covenant Christian, the Spirit of Pentecost is immediate, and objective.⁷³ That the Spirit is more evident to the mind noetically than natural principles agrees with King David (Psalm 34:8, 36:9), the apostle Paul (Romans 8:38-9; I Corinthians 2:14-16), and the disciple John (I John 4:13, 5:6).⁷⁴

14 The Eternal Word and Spirit supersede the canonized Scriptures

Barclay affirms that the Quakers acknowledge the Scriptures to be heavenly and divine writings necessary to the Church of Christ. The Quakers give praise to the Lord for his preserving the writings as pure and uncorrupt in being a testimony of Christ and Christ's truth against wickedness and abomination, even amongst those preserving the Scriptures. The preservers of truth have found the Scriptures to be a witness against themselves, yet the principal fountain of truth remains the eternal Word and Spirit.⁷⁵ Barclay continues that the eternal Word, the fountain from which everything proceeds, is to be revered first and always in all things. This Word always proceeded,

man is compassed about and cannot carry the fullness of grace. Thus on mount Tabor the disciples fell on their face before the glory of the Lord. And no man can conceive how the Lord gives grace to the soul.

⁷³ *ibid.* The person who denies the immanent creator God, elevates created natural order over uncreated supernatural reality. Instead, God is real the soul. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, Good and gracious are Thou, O Lord. Thou hast poured down Thy Holy Spirit on me and given me to taste of Thy love for me, grievous sinner that I am, and my soul is drawn to Thee, O Light unapproachable. What man could have knowledge of Thee, didst Thou not graciously deign to reveal Thyself to the soul? And the soul beheld Thee, and knew her Creator and her God, and ever longs insatiable for Thee, for Thou, O gracious Lord, didst draw the soul to Thee with love, and the soul knew Thy love.

⁷⁴ *ibid.* King David, the Apostle Paul & the Disciple John each experienced the Spirit's affirmation noetically. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 362. When grace dwells within us, the spirit glows and reaches day and night towards the Lord, or grace impels the soul to love God; and now that she has come to love Him she cannot tear herself from Him – never can she have enough of the tenderness of the Holy Spirit. And there is no end to God's love.

⁷⁵ *ibid.*, 76. Scripture is a record of the Fountain of Truth being the Word Incarnate and promised Holy Spirit sent of the Father to guide the Church. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 91. The Holy Scriptures are the word that 'holy men of God spake as they were moved by the Holy Ghost'. But the words of the Saints are not completely unaffected by the intellectual level and spiritual state of those to whom they were directed. They were a lively message addressed to real people, and so scientific interpretations of the gospel, which would include historical, archaeological, philological interpretations will inevitably be unsound.

and does eternally proceed from God, in and by whom the unsearchable wisdom of God, and the unsearchable counsel conceived in the heart of God is revealed to his sheep.⁷⁶

The Holy Spirit reveals the true knowledge of God as Son, as Father, leads into all truth, teaches all things, and is the ground of all truth and knowledge, being the rule of faith and manners above the shadow Scriptures. Blasphemy of the new covenant Spirit kataphatic and the law of the Spirit noetic is the sin unpardonable.⁷⁷ The Aramaic Hebrew and the Greek Septuagint of the Canon of Scripture old and new submit to Jesus Christ and his promise to lead his children into all truth, as the immovable Rock, through his Spirit as principal guide (John 20:21-22). Neither rust nor moth can wear out, nor do transcribers corrupt the Incarnation whose new covenant Spirit sent of the Father is accessible to the infant, illiterate, and geographically remote.⁷⁸

Barclay affirms that the new covenant consequence maintains that the fulfilled law is written in the heart. The old and new Scriptures Barclay draws from are Jeremiah 31:29-34; Isaiah 59:21; Deuteronomy 30:11-14; Ezekiel 36:25-27; Romans 2:14-15, 10:4-8; Hebrews 8:9-13, 10:14-18 and James 1:25. The spiritual and regenerated nature proceeds from the seed of God in humanity. As one

⁷⁶ *ibid.* The Eternal Word as 2nd Adam is the Fountain from which the Unsearchable Wisdom & Counsel of God is revealed. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 90. Knowledge of God drawn from the Scriptures does not attain sought-after perfection unless the Lord Himself instructs through the Holy Spirit. For all of Silouan's humility and gentleness, he would say with unshakable conviction and inner certainty that man cannot 'of himself' apprehend Divine matters, which are made known 'only through the Holy Spirit', and so the Holy Scriptures, too, 'written by the Holy Spirit' cannot be understood through scientific research which can only provide surface aspects and details, and never the substance.

⁷⁷ *ibid.*, 77. The Spirit reveals the true knowledge of God, leads into all truth, teaches all things & is the primary rule of faith & manners. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 90-1. Until a man is granted from on high to 'understand the Scriptures' and 'know the mysteries of the kingdom of heaven', until through long struggle against the passions he humbles himself and experiences the resurrection of his soul and knows all that lies on this grand and mysterious path, it is vital that he should cling to the tradition and teaching of the Church and not teach of himself, however erudite he may be 'as a man', because even the most brilliant conjectures on the part of a human being fall short of authentic life in the Spirit.

⁷⁸ *ibid.*, 85-6. Scripture & Canon submit to the leadership of the Spirit of Jesus Christ in calling all, including prophets, apostles, and teachers.. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 91-2. The Holy Scriptures have one definite final object but Prophets, Apostles, and Teachers adapt themselves to the level and understanding of the people around them. Paul is an example of never retreating from his unique vision of God, from his personal knowledge of God, yet he made himself 'all things to all men, that he might save some'. Paul spoke differently to different people; and if we approach his epistles analytically only, the essential point of his 'theological system' will inevitably remain unintelligible.

receives the seed, rebirth takes place, and one is joined with the fulfilled law of Christ written within. This new covenant reality was intended for first Adam in creation. The law written in the heart is the new covenant dispensation, and restores the kingdom for which humanity was created.⁷⁹

Barclay concludes that Christ as second Adam tasted death for every person ontologically, including those with no outward knowledge of his death in a similar way as some have no outward knowledge of first Adam's fall. Yet every person may enjoy uncreated 'Light' communion with the Father and the Son, being turned from evil to good, doing to others as they would have done by suffering the uncreated Grace of the light and seed of the Incarnation to enlighten their hearts.⁸⁰

15 The Incarnation, in his Death and Resurrection, provides the evangelical principle of Light and Life in all People

A major difference between the Protestants and the Quakers is that rather than affirming the universality of Christ's death, and the divine and evangelical principle of light and life wherewith Christ has enlightened every person coming into the world, the Arminians and Calvinists require outward knowledge as necessary to salvation.⁸¹ Instead, redemption from humanity's fallen, lost, corrupt, and degenerated condition by Jesus Christ, the incarnation of God, is the reason for, and

⁷⁹ *ibid*, 102. The Visitation of God through the Kingdom seed is part of New Covenant Reality. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 91. The Holy Spirit, the Spirit of Truth, to a certain extent lives within every person, and still more in the Christian, but we must not over-estimate this life experience of grace and audaciously advance further. The Holy Spirit, always positively abiding in the Church, patiently and gently seeks and awaits every soul but man himself does not allow Him freedom to operate in himself, and therefore remains outside the Light and the knowledge of the mysteries of the spiritual life.

⁸⁰ *ibid*, 111. Christ's death affects all as does Adam's fall; light communion with the Father and the Son is enjoyed by those who suffer the seed of the 2nd Adam in themselves. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 91. It often happens that after experiencing a certain measure of grace man does not grow in grace but loses it. And then his religious life concentrates in his brain, as an abstract conception. In this state he frequently imagines himself possessed of spiritual knowledge, not perceiving that this sort of abstract understanding, though it may follow a certain experience of grace is a peculiar perversion of the Divine word, and the Holy Scriptures in essence remain for him 'a book sealed with seven seals'.

⁸¹ *ibid*. The inward Seed and New Covenant Witness through Christ's death for all is uniform in Salvation. This is the reason Barclay joins Proposition V and Proposition VI together in his *Apology*, revealing the humanity and divinity of Jesus Christ as one. Irenaeus of Lyon. *The Scandal of the Incarnation: Irenaeus against the Heresies*, Ignatius Press, 1990, 33-4. All those who hoped in Him believed in Him, that is, all those who had foretold His coming and served His saving plans. To believe in Him is to do His will. Through the Word made visible and palpable, the Father was revealed. Though all did not in the same way believe, they nonetheless saw the Father in the Son. All see and speak of the Son and the Father, but not all believe. Not only in works, but also in faith, God has safeguarded the freedom and self-determination of man.

explanation of the universal redemption wrought by Christ, and the saving light and seed of God in the human heart.⁸²

In response, the Calvinists say rationally that God predestined before time humanity to evil and sin, making God the author of evil and sin. This Barclay says is injurious to Christ the mediator, and makes God the cruel agent of injustice. Faith and repentance is useless if, by an irrevocable decree, humanity is predetermined elect or reprobate. The preaching of the gospel, including the promises and threats of Jesus, is insane, if by an irrevocable decree, humanity's destiny is predetermined.⁸³

Barclay is emphatic that the doctrine that the incarnation by eternal immutable decree is sent as wrath against the reprobate to demonstrate God's justice towards the reprobate, makes God the hater of the greater part of humankind, and the hater of his Son whom God brutally crucified by eternal immutable decree.⁸⁴ Evil is not part of the sovereign nature of God.

16 The Energy of God is the uncreated Spiritual, Heavenly, and Invisible principle in which God as Father, Son, and Spirit dwell, a measure of which is the seed of the 2nd Adam

Barclay contends that humanities quenching, bruising, wounding, pressing down, slaying, and crucifying the new covenant uncreated seed, grace, word of God, and light by the stubbornness and wickedness of will is not representative of God's self. The essence of the nature of God is an uncreated, spiritual, heavenly, and invisible principle in which God as Father, Son, and Holy Spirit dwell indivisibly; a measure of which is in all as seed of the second Adam which inclines to God as

⁸² *ibid*, 111-2. Physical Redemption and Saving Light is fashioned universally by Jesus Christ (God) in the heart in response to Man's Corrupt & Degenerated Condition. Irenaeus of Lyon. *The Scandal of the Incarnation: Irenaeus against the Heresies*, Ignatius Press, 1990, 42. God is above all earthly names, and therefore inexpressible. He can rightly be called an all-comprehending, but He is not like the intellect of men. He is most accurately described as light, but He is nothing like the light that men know. In every respect the Father of all is unlike the littleness of men. Although, because of His love, we can use these words to speak of Him, we know, because of His greatness, that He is above words. As regards His grandeur, we cannot know God, for it is impossible to measure the Father, but as regards His love (that is what leads us through the Word of God), those who obey Him are evermore learning that there is such a great God.

⁸³ *ibid*, 116. Pre-determinism to those considered Reprobate is the Highest Form of Injustice.

⁸⁴ *ibid*. God sending Jesus to demonstrate his just wrath against the predestined makes God the author of Wrath more than Love

the body of Christ; the flesh and blood of the incarnation on which the saints feed.⁸⁵ The new covenant light and seed are never separated from God or Christ, and where resisted and borne down is like a cart under sheaves (Amos 2:13-16), the light and seed of the second Adam again 'slain and crucified' (I Timothy 4:11, 16; Hebrews 6:6).⁸⁶

Christ dwells in humanity mediately but not immediately as Christ the promised seed. The incarnation is the eternal Word which was with God and was God, the Head to his Body; the Vine to his branches. God dwells otherwise in the man Jesus Christ than in humanity being fully God and fully human.⁸⁷

17 The Atonement and Sacrifice of Jesus Christ without coincides as one with the New Covenant Evangelical Dispensation within

Barclay confirms that the new covenant evangelical dispensation of the full, evident, and everlasting truth magnifies and exalts the atonement and sacrifice of Jesus Christ, believing all things to have been transacted as recorded in Scripture concerning the birth, life, miracles, sufferings, death, resurrection, and ascension of Christ; that not resisting the holy seed will lead everyone to believe

⁸⁵ *ibid*, 136. The Seed is a spiritual, heavenly & invisible principle in which the Father, the Son & the Spirit indivisibly dwell as *vehiculum Dei* on which the Saints feed and are nourished unto life eternal. Irenaeus of Lyon. *The Scandal of the Incarnation: Irenaeus against the Heresies*, Ignatius Press, 1990, 33. What is God like? How great is He? Since He who 'works all in all' (I Corinthians 12:6) is God, He is invisible and inaccessible to all He has made, but by no means unknown. For all creatures learn from His Word that there is one God and Father, who contains all things in Himself and grants existence to all, as it says: 'No one has ever seen God; the only Son, who is in the bosom of the Father, he has made Him known' (John 1:18).

⁸⁶ *ibid*. Being one with Christ, the new covenant Light & Seed can be borne down & pressed under.

⁸⁷ *ibid*, 137. Christ as the Head and Branch (Isaiah 11:1) and Christians the Members; He the Vine, Christians the Branches, and the Father as Vine-dresser are connected unto Theosis. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.' 2016, 107, Footnote 97. John William Graham stated, 'No complete and harmonious philosophy of Divine Guidance and its limits exists among all who bear the name of Friends with general agreement' (FQ, 32), which rather understates the case. Is the idea to be taken to mean, as William Lecky, author of *The History of European Morals* (1869), suggested, 'the deification of a strong internal persuasion'? (Quoted by J.W. Rowntree in his paper, 'Religious Thought in the Society of Friends', FQE, 1905, 109-122, 117.) This PhD argues that the deification for which Barclay argues is continuous life with God beginning on earth through the seed of the 2nd Adam and the Spirit of Pentecost. This life is continuous throughout eternity whereby humanity realizes the likeness of God in whose image humanity is created. What Graham is pointing to, and what Dale uncovers is theosis being theology through experience. Theology is experiential and faith is experimental. This theology and faith in the final analysis is in the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit, a principle of which resides in all humanity.

the atoning work of Jesus Christ.⁸⁸ It was necessary that Christ should come, that by Christ's bodily death and sufferings Christ might offer up a sacrifice to God for sins. The remission of sins which any partake of is only in and by virtue of Christ's satisfactory sacrifice for humanity. It is by the obedience of the one Jesus Christ that the gift is given for justification. All participate in the 'fruit' of first Adam's fall by the evil seed which first Adam communicated to all, though some are ignorant of his history. So also all feel the influence of the new covenant seed and light of Christ, the second Adam, to turn them from evil to good; from missing the mark to hitting the mark of God's original righteous intent which is the seed of justification purchased for all.⁸⁹

18 The Light of the World is never separate from Jesus Christ, who has his Habitation in his Light Forever, being separate from Fallen Brain Knowledge

Barclay instructs that the new covenant light of Christ, seed of the kingdom, or uncreated grace of the Spirit is no natural faculty of the fallen human mind. While humanity is the master of the soul's faculties, humanity cannot move and stir up the light of Christ when they please. The new covenant light of Christ and seed moves, blows, and strives in humanity as the Lord sees meet.⁹⁰

Barclay drives home the distinction between the essence and energy of Jesus Christ when he says that the true light is both in Jesus and is Jesus that enlightens every person coming into the world.

As He is the light and as one walks in the light one has fellowship with the Father, the Son, and the

⁸⁸ *ibid*, 139. The Atonement & Sacrifice of Jesus Christ is exalted by the Holy Seed of the Kingdom.

⁸⁹ *ibid*. Jesus Christ came died & suffered that the evil seed of 1st Adam be addressed and all justified who are receptive to the Light & Seed of Christ, the 2nd Adam and his Kingdom. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.' 2016, 105. For Graham, his God is so united with his human creation that the idea of his demanding appeasement for sin simply did not make sense. We have to fight with the lower nature we have inherited from the beasts, but we have a 'Divine Indweller' to help us in the battle: We are dual, it appears; the outward, conscious personality, above the threshold, supraliminal, is subject to temptations of various kinds; and needs reinforcement from an immensely powerful ally who can be called up, the power of the Indwelling God, from below, subliminal. No outward sacrifice can be called for, nor could it be effective. Eastern Christianity sees Christ's at-one-ment with humanities bodily death as the humble depth that God takes to unite with humanity to affect humanities resurrection. It is through loud cries and tears that God was perfected in the Incarnation by which humanity finds strength from God to rise from our inherited condition. God appeases mans' sin by becoming what man is so that man might become what God is. This is salvation pure and simple. The divine Indwelling God enters the heart of man metaphysically through having endured man's condition physically. This coincides with man being both soul and body.

⁹⁰ *ibid*, 144. The Light of Christ, Seed of the Kingdom or Grace manifest is no part of man's nature but moves, blows & strives with humanity as the Lord sees Meet.

Holy Spirit begetting kingdom life.⁹¹ John the Baptist bore witness to the supernatural, saving, sufficient light given through the incarnation by which humanity comes to believe and receive eternal life. The disciple John holds Christ as mediator whose benefits result in those who receive him without measure.⁹² The light to believe in is Jesus Christ the Messiah and the resurrected light of Christ which works profitably to order salvation. With the incarnation of God ascended, one walks with the presence of His light in the heart, being the way of Theosis in becoming the prelapsarian righteousness of God through Christ.⁹³

19 Christ lies humbly in the seed of the 2nd Adam in same way as Christ came as incarnation to lay down his Life for All

The kingdom of God is in the seed of the second Adam, lying in barren ground, not bringing forth the kingdom 30 or 100 fold because it needs nourishment, but is as a body of a tree is wrapped in the seed, or is as a human embryo is wrapped in the body of a woman. So the kingdom of God, Jesus Christ himself, Christ within, who is the hope of glory, becomes wisdom, righteousness, sanctification, and redemption in the human heart as the humble incorruptible seed (I Peter 3:4) to be brought forth. The kingdom God emerges as the seed is cherished and received in the love of the seed. Because the seed is so little regarded and overlooked, few come to know Christ brought forth in them.⁹⁴

Barclay assures that knowing Jesus in the heart noetically is the necessary experiential knowledge to save from iniquity and sin. Instead, many know Jesus in name only, in barren head knowledge. Yet as people know first Adam's fall without historical information, so people know Christ the second

⁹¹ *ibid*, 156-7. Communion with the Light of Jesus Christ begets Kingdom Life & Light.

⁹² *ibid*, 157-8. John the Baptist & the evangelist John bore witness to Jesus Christ, the supernatural saving light come to enlighten the world.

⁹³ *ibid*, 159. The uncreated Light of the bodily Messiah is to be believed in and followed as the way of Theosis.

⁹⁴ *ibid*, 171. Christ's Kingdom is brought Forth through giving way to the incorruptible Seed, Light of Christ or Manifestation of the Spirit in the heart. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 353. The Lord is made known in the Holy Spirit, and the Holy Spirit pervades the entire man – soul, mind and body. This is the means by which God is known in heaven and on earth.

Adam crucified, tasting their bodily death, risen from bodily death for their salvation, revealed in their heart kataphatically. There is no other name by which one can be saved but Jesus.⁹⁵

20 The Soul gives witness to the Light per Augustine, but the Light is not ‘the Light’ as taught by the Platonists

Augustine said that the soul gives testimony concerning the new covenant light yet the soul is not the Light of John 1:14 who came into the world as flesh, enlightening every person that comes into the world. The Light which shines is unlike humanity and yet is like humanity in dispelling cloud and darkness. Like Augustine, Barclay distinguishes himself from the Platonists.⁹⁶

Barclay confirms that development of new covenant reality is the effect of Christ’s physical first death and resurrection which provides for Christ’s metaphysical death and resurrection in fallen humanity by which humanity is reborn, and Christ is brought forth in the heart from which justifying works proceed from the Spirit of Christ being in dominion. Christ’s justifying works are the means by which one becomes a ‘*partaker of the divine nature*’ (II Peter 1:4) and are made one with Jesus, as ‘*branches engrafted in the vine*’ (John 15:1-8). Those who come to know Christ formed in them, enjoy Christ wholly and undivided as ‘*the Lord our righteousness*’ (Jeremiah 23:6).⁹⁷

⁹⁵ *ibid*, 178. Knowing Jesus in the Heart kataphatically is the same as knowing the Fall of Adam kataphatically. JESUS is the only name by which one is saved.

⁹⁶ *ibid*, 186. Augustine claims that the soul gives testimony to the Light which came into the world which was the Word of John 1:14 become flesh. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 358. The soul that has come to know the Lord is instinctively sensible of the presence of her Creator, and dwells in Him in great peace and joy. It is like the joy that abounds when a beloved son returns to his father's house after long years in a far country, and can talk with his dear ones-his father and mother, brothers and sisters-to his heart's content. Irenaeus of Lyon. *The Scandal of the Incarnation: Irenaeus against the Heresies*, Ignatius Press, 1990, 24-26. Irenaeus raises the question, if things can be improved then there must be error in the making and the Maker. This, Irenaeus, challenges the Demiurge concept of the gnostics related to the perfection in which humanity was created. The gnostics teach that the ‘Groundless One’ took pity on his imperfect creation and conferred goodness upon them. Irenaeus counters that there must be a hole or darkness in the Father of Light. It is impossible to think of someone’s thought or silence having a separate existence, produced outside himself with a form all its own. Instead, God is not as men nor his thoughts as men’s thoughts. Irenaeus’ answer is that the eternal Word became flesh and revealed the eternal perfection of the Father in a fleshly manner which is material perfection in response to the ‘Groundless One’.

⁹⁷ *ibid*, 196-7. The physical Death of Jesus Christ is the Effect, and the death & resurrection of Jesus Christ as Seed in the heart is the Cause of man’s Justification.

It is the inward birth through the seed of the second Adam and Christ formed within by which one is formally justified in the sight of God. In Christ's bodily sufferings and death justification is made with God, remission of sins obtained, and the new covenant seed of the second Adam purchased. By and from this Grace the birth of the new person proceeds. Through Jesus Christ formed within one is both justified and made just in an ongoing dynamic fashion.⁹⁸

The hope of glory constitutes the environment by which one is made just through the love of God manifested bodily in the appearing of Jesus Christ. Through Christ's sacrifice the seed from which the new birth arises was purchased. In the rebirth Jesus Christ is received inwardly, formed, and brought forth in his own pure and holy image of righteousness by which souls live unto God. Souls are clothed with Christ, and put him on (Ephesians 4:22-24; Galatians 3:27; Romans 13:12-14).⁹⁹

The rigid (later reformed) Protestants claim that the Quakers immediate call to righteousness is to be confirmed by miracles. However Barclay argues that the gospel preached by the Quakers and the primitive Protestants is already confirmed by the miracles of Christ and his apostles. The Old Testament prophets, John the Baptist as forerunner of Christ, the primitive church, the first Protestants, and the Quakers are extraordinarily sent by the Spirit of Christ. This is the supernatural reality of the new covenant.¹⁰⁰

No person should limit the Spirit of God by bringing forth his own conduct and contrived stuff. Each should put forth what the Lord puts in their heart in evidence of the Spirit's leading and in demonstration of the Spirit's power that the Body of Christ may be edified. Many Quaker meetings have passed without one audible word and yet souls were greatly edified and refreshed. Hearts were overcome with God's Spirit and power without words, ministry flowing organically from one vessel to another. This is strange to the natural carnal person who will judge all time lost where there is not

⁹⁸ *ibid*, 205-6. By Jesus Christ born & formed within the soul humanity is made just.

⁹⁹ *ibid*, 215. Justification comes by becoming one with Christ in the Soul.

¹⁰⁰ *ibid*, 279. The miracle of the Gospel is the means of being sent by the New Covenant Spirit of Christ.

words spoken discursively obvious to the outward senses. This is God's new covenant administration contrary to humanities fallen spirit, will, and wisdom.¹⁰¹

21 The Name of Jesus comes to be in All where the Nature and Fallen part, not One with Christ is Judged Out

Barclay instructs that the principle of Quakers being silent and not acting in the things of God until actuated by God's light and grace within emerged from sitting silently and waiting expectantly upon the Lord. Meeting together in the pure fear of the Lord, each did not speak, pray, or minister, being afraid to be found acting forwardly in their will. Each person made it their work to retire inwardly to the measure of Grace in them, watching in holy dependence upon the Lord, waiting together in one Spirit, and in one name of Jesus which is his power and virtue. In so doing, they came to enjoy and feel the risings of His life, which as His life prevailed, became a flood of refreshment overspreading the gathered. As humanities part and wisdom was denied and chained down, uncreated Grace gained dominion in the heart, Jesus's name came to be in all, and his glory spread forth and covered all, the natural or wise part, not one with Christ, being judged out. And when any were constrained to utter a word of exhortation, or to breathe to the Lord in prayer, all were sensible of it as the life in them answered the same life in the other (Proverbs 27:19). This worship the world cannot understand nor can the vulture see (Matthew 24:28; Luke 17:37).¹⁰²

When people are gathered not merely to hear or depend upon preachers, all are taught to stay their minds upon the Lord, and wait for his appearance in their hearts. It comes to pass as they depend

¹⁰¹ *ibid*, 329. Worship under the noetic sense of God's power & Spirit ministering from one Vessel to another is the 'more Full Dispensation'. This would find uniformity with I Corinthians 14 which finds its message neglected and discredited between I Corinthians 13 and I Corinthians 15.

¹⁰² *ibid*, 330-1. Quaker worship as communion with Christ began with retiring inwardly as one people, and watching as one people for the Lord's power and virtue to be raised. The resurrected body of Jesus Christ becomes food for the eagle and saint, as well as affecting adversely the vulture and denier.

upon the Lord in fullness of trust; they come to rely upon no other. As the prophet Isaiah says, ‘*He keeps him in perfect peace, whose mind is stayed on Thee because he trusts in Thee*’ (26:3).¹⁰³

22 According to Jesus, the Author of the Christian Religion, Worship is performed in the Spirit, and accompanied by occasional Gatherings of Christ’s Body

The time appointed by God is come wherein by Jesus Christ the Father has restored true worship, replacing the outward performance of the Jews. One finds that Jesus Christ, the author of the Christian religion prescribes no set form of worship under the administration of the new covenant, except that Jesus only tells his children that the worship now to be performed is spiritual and in the Spirit (John 4:24; 6:31-69, 14:16-18). The only order given throughout the whole New Testament is to follow the revelation of the Spirit (John 16:12-15, 20:19-23; Acts 1:1-8, 15:28; I Thessalonians 5:19) and to assemble together as Christ’s body (Hebrews 10:24-25).¹⁰⁴

Releasing his people from the temple of Jerusalem and outward ceremonies, God takes the heart of every person as the temple to dwell in, and there appears in the contrite of heart.¹⁰⁵ Humanity is incapable of praying alone. The Spirit is given to assist in unutterable sighs and groans. God receives graciously, prayers presented and offered through the Spirit according to God’s new covenant design.¹⁰⁶

23 Jesus’ Final Call is Baptism in-into the Father, the Son, and Holy Spirit by the one Spirit

There is one baptism, as there is one Lord, one faith, and one God and Father of all. The one baptism of Christ is the baptism of the Spirit, which the baptism of John the Baptist was of water which gives way to the baptism of Christ. Jesus’s final call is a baptism in and into the name of the

¹⁰³ ibid, 331. Trust filled waiting in full heart Dependence opens the way to hear the Lord.

¹⁰⁴ ibid, 340-1. New Covenant Worship in the Spirit-Noetic commanded by Jesus is Now Come in which there is no Set Order or Command but for Christ’s Body to meet together occasionally.

¹⁰⁵ ibid, 353. God dwells by his Spirit in the new covenant Temple of the Heart.

¹⁰⁶ ibid, 369-70. Prayer comes initially by the groaning of the Spirit within humanity. Galatians 4:4-6; Romans 8:14-17

Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit by the one Spirit.¹⁰⁷ There are not two baptisms, one outward and elementary, and the other inward and spiritual. There is one baptism which is Christ's baptism of the Spirit with fire into the one Body, one Spirit, one hope, one Lord, one faith, 'one baptism', one God and Father above all, through all and in all (Ephesians 4:4-6).¹⁰⁸

According to Christ, prior to his Ascension, the baptism of his disciples was to be with the Holy Ghost and with fire. Christ's baptism was to be received by going and waiting in Jerusalem. The disciples receiving the new covenant Spirit of righteousness (Acts 1:4-5), is parallel with Jesus being baptized with water to fulfill all old covenant righteousness (Matthew 3:11).¹⁰⁹ The power of the new covenant Spirit, and the substance of the Spirit's baptism to make the new person holy, makes the old covenant form, shadow, figure, or type obsolete, irrelevant, to cease, and to disappear.¹¹⁰ The new baptism expressed by Jesus in Matthew 28:19 is full immersion into the name of the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit with no reference to water as the means of entering new covenant (prelapsarian) righteousness.¹¹¹

In opposition, John Calvin argues that being baptized into the triadic nature of God is 'one' with John's water baptism for repentance. Calvin misses the point of being immersed into the spiritual fullness of God as Christ's Body (Acts 15:28; Ephesians 4:15-16; John 14:16-18).¹¹² In addition, the name of the Lord in Scripture is more than bare words (Psalm 54:1, Canticles 1:3, Proverbs 18:10). To be baptized into the name of Christ includes into the virtue and power of Christ by '*putting on Christ*' (Galatians 3:27, Romans 6:3-4, Colossians 2:12) which does not follow as a

¹⁰⁷ *ibid*, 384-5. Christ's one Baptism is with the Spirit into the one Lord, faith, spirit, body, God and Father of all.

¹⁰⁸ *ibid*, 385. The One Baptism of the Spirit is into the Fullness of the one God.

¹⁰⁹ *ibid*, 387-8. Christ's Baptism of his disciples in Jerusalem was to be with the Holy Spirit.

¹¹⁰ *ibid*, 389-90. Baptism as the Seal, Pledge, Power & Virtue of the Spirit makes the Shadow Old Covenant Baptism Obsolete and to Cease

¹¹¹ *ibid*, 401. Baptism into the Triadic nature of God is Christ's means of humanity entering final New Covenant Righteousness.

¹¹² *ibid*, 402. Christ's call to immerse Disciples into the Triadic nature of God the Father, the Son & the Holy Spirit by the Spirit is more than John's call to repent.

consequence of water and words. ‘*Putting on Christ*’ through immersion in the power, virtue, and life of the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit, being at the same time in the name of Christ, is built upon the testimony of God’s Spirit and the Scriptures of truth (Matthew 28:19).¹¹³

24 Jesus is the Bread from Heaven by which the New Creation is Nourished

The body of Jesus Christ which believers partake of is spiritual, and the blood believers drink of is heavenly. This agrees with Augustine. The body, flesh, and blood of Christ is the heavenly seed of the second Adam, the divine, spiritual, celestial substance through which Christ communicates life to all humanity, and salvation to as many as believe in him, and receive him, whereby they come to have fellowship with God.¹¹⁴ Christ speaks of the Father who gives the true bread from heaven, ‘*It was my Father who gives you the true bread from heaven...*’ (John 6:32-71) which to the end of his discourse, Jesus speaks nowhere of a ceremony.¹¹⁵ The meat to be labored for is the bread given by the Father from heaven. This bread, Jesus calls himself (John 6:53), which is his flesh (body and blood), necessary to be partaken of as the means of destroying death. Whoever lives by Christ conquers the world.¹¹⁶ The flesh to be partaken of is not the material flesh of Jesus Christ while

¹¹³ *ibid*, 402-3. Faith built on the Testimony of the Spirit & the Scriptures of Truth include baptism into the Power and Virtue of God as well as the Name.

¹¹⁴ *ibid*, 414. Communion is to be with the Heavenly Seed, Divine, Celestial Substance, Spiritual Body & Heavenly Blood of Christ which agrees with Augustine. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.’ 2016, 110. This essay ‘The Mind of the Son of Man’, published in *The Interpreter*, April 1912, illustrates several aspects of Graham’s approach to the New Testament. One is that he has no inhibitions about ascribing human feelings, even weaknesses, to the Son of Man. Graham believed that God and Man are one. To ascribe full humanity to Jesus could not reduce his divinity: There needs to be no compound of human and Divine, and there can be no antithesis; for they are of the same stuff – the human has a share of the Divine: and the larger and more perfect a man’s humanity, the larger and more perfect his share in divinity too. Here Graham does the deep theological work in exposing the Christian mystery of Jesus being fully God and fully Man. This is a mystery held by the church which Graham and Barclay attempt to express in human words; the full expression being impossible being that Jesus is fully God. This was the topic of Athanasius ‘*On the Incarnation*’ along with Barclay’s reference to Augustine (354-430).

¹¹⁵ *ibid*, 414-5. Communion is with the Body and Blood of Christ of John 6. Irenaeus of Lyon. *The Scandal of the Incarnation: Irenaeus against the Heresies*, Ignatius Press, 1990, 46. Read the prophets and you will find that all the actions, all the teachings, all the sufferings of the Lord have been foretold. It may be that the question will come to your mind: did the Lord bring anything new by His coming? The answer is He brought all newness by bringing Himself who had been foretold.

¹¹⁶ *ibid*, 415. The one who Communes with the Body & Blood of Christ dies not, lives forever, dwells in Christ, Christ in him, and lives by Christ. Irenaeus of Lyon. *The Scandal of the Incarnation: Irenaeus against the Heresies*, Ignatius Press, 1990, 46. The Lord promised to give very much to those who now bear fruit, but through the gift of His grace, not by the changing of our knowledge. For the Lord remains the same, and the same Father is revealed. Thus, by His

Christ walked incarnationally upon earth but is his spiritual flesh. As the body cannot partake of Spirit, so the spirit cannot partake of Flesh. Though the body dies, the body that feeds on the Flesh of Christ, supernaturally, will never die. That the body of Christ and the metaphysical Flesh and Blood of the second Adam is to be understood of that divine and heavenly seed appears by the nature and fruit of Christ's bodily flesh through Mary the *Theotokos*.¹¹⁷

The nature and fruit of the heavenly flesh which came down from heaven and gives life unto the world is the new covenant Light of Jesus Christ. The Light of Christ in humanities hearts is Bread to the hungry and fainting soul. None can have the heavenly Bread but by coming to Jesus and believing in the appearance of his Light in their heart as the eternal seed promised through the woman (*Theotokos*, Genesis 3:15).¹¹⁸ Jesus Christ speaks of his own body, flesh, and blood when he says he is the *true light* (John 1:9) and *I am the bread of life* (John 6:35, 48). They that receive the Light and Life of Jesus Christ obtain power to become the children of God by believing in his name. The one who comes to Jesus the Bread of life and believes in him will never thirst (John 4:9-14).¹¹⁹

Barclay contends that they that receive the new covenant light and life of Christ obtain power to become children of God by believing in his name. He that comes to this Bread shall not hunger; he who believes in Him who is this bread will never thirst. As the outward and material body and temple of Jesus Christ revealed himself, so did the Word in the beginning who was and is God, who did reveal himself to humanity in all ages whereby all may be made partakers of eternal life and

coming, one and the same Lord has bestowed on those who lived later a greater gift of grace than the one He granted in the old dispensation.

¹¹⁷ *ibid*, 416. The Spiritual Body and Heavenly Flesh & Blood of Christ is the divine & heavenly Seed with which the new person is reborn. Irenaeus of Lyon. *The Scandal of the Incarnation: Irenaeus against the Heresies*, Ignatius Press, 1990, 46. Everything became new when the Word, in a new dispensation, came in the flesh to win back to God man who had gone off from God. Thus men were taught to worship, not a different God, but the same God in a new way.

¹¹⁸ *ibid*, 416-7. Communion is with the Spiritual Body and Heavenly Flesh & Blood of Jesus Christ as promised seed of the Second Adam.

¹¹⁹ *ibid*, 417. The one who Communes with the Spiritual Body and Heavenly Flesh & Blood of Jesus Christ never has reason to Hunger or Thirst again.

have communion with God and Christ.¹²⁰ The incarnational body and temple of Jesus Christ, who took his earthly origin in time from the Virgin Mary, and the body of Christ who is the precreation ‘*Word in the beginning with God*’, and was God, revealed himself to children in all ages whereby they came to be partakers of eternal life, and had fellowship with God through Christ, of whose Body, if the patriarchs had not eaten would not have life in them, nor could their persons be nourished. (I Corinthians 10:1-4)¹²¹

The incarnation was Christ, as was the spiritual body called Christ before the person of Jesus was recognized as Christ. During the period of the Law given through Moses, the body of Christ was veiled and shadowed by types, ceremonies, and observations, and later hid in some respects under the outward temple of Jesus Christ during the continuance of the Mosaic Law. The pre-incarnate Fathers did all eat the spiritual meat, and drink the spiritual drink which followed them which was Christ. (I Corinthians 10:3-4) The Jews could not understand Christ’s preaching about eating his Body during the period of His incarnation causing many of his disciples to walk away from Him (John 6:66).¹²²

25 The humble seed of Christ within provides the Rebirth necessary to Fellowship with the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit

For as Jesus Christ in obedience to the will of the Father, did by the eternal Spirit offer up his physical body for a propitiation for humanities sins, so has Jesus Christ poured into the hearts of all

¹²⁰ *ibid.* God revealed himself as light & life in all ages as the Spiritual Body, Heavenly Blood and Word, being Christ. Irenaeus of Lyon. *The Scandal of the Incarnation: Irenaeus against the Heresies*, Ignatius Press, 1990, 43. The prophets, receiving the prophetic charism from the Word of the Father, foretold His coming in the flesh, which, by the Father’s good pleasure, has accomplished this blending and communion of God and man. From the beginning, the Word of God foretold that God would be seen by men and hold converse with them on earth. He would speak with them and be present to His own creation, thus saving it.

¹²¹ *ibid.* The Body of Jesus Christ originating with the Virgin Mary, and the Body of Jesus Christ that was the eternal Word from the beginning and is GOD now, communes with the Patriarchs and Saints in all ages. Irenaeus of Lyon. *The Scandal of the Incarnation: Irenaeus against the Heresies*, Ignatius Press, 1990, 43. The eternal Word will become perceptible by men, thus ‘freeing us from the hands of all who hate us’(Luke 1:71-75), that is, every spirit of wickedness, causing us to ‘serve Him in holiness and justice all the days of our life’, in order that man, having embraced the Spirit of God, might pass into the Father’s glory.

¹²² *ibid.*, 417-8. Both the Word from the beginning & Jesus Christ come in the flesh are properly called Christ whom the Israelites ate of, some Jews reject, and Disciples eat of today.

a measure of the divine light and seed wherewith the Son of Man is clothed, and thereby reaches into the consciences of all, that the Son of Man may raise humanity out of death and darkness by his light and life, and there through humanity become partakers of his body resulting in fellowship with the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit.¹²³

As one suffers the small seed of righteousness to arise and form into birth, the birth of the new person being brought forth in the soul, eating upon and being nourished by the ‘supernatural’ body of Christ becomes ‘natural’. As the outward birth cannot survive unless it is fed by outward food, so the inward birth cannot survive unless fed by inward food.¹²⁴ It is through the soul and spirit that one becomes a partaker of Christ’s flesh and body as the soul is nourished by Christ’s supernatural flesh and body. To partake of Christ’s supernatural flesh and body in all ages was indispensably necessary to salvation. Consequently, all live by Christ today, who partake of his flesh and body supernaturally without the use of old covenant ceremonies as did the patriarchs and the prophets in their day (I Corinthians 10:1-4).¹²⁵

Jesus Christ used ‘natural’ things to raise the minds of his disciples and hearers to ‘supernatural’ things as in the difference between well water and the living water of his blood (John 4:14).¹²⁶ If one takes breaking bread as it lies, it would import no more than that Jesus Christ at that time signified to his disciples that his body and blood was to be offered for them, and desired that whenever they

¹²³ ibid, 418. The Son of Man Is Poured in Measure into the Hearts of all Humanity whereby the Son of Man may raise Humanity out of Death & Darkness by his Life & light into fellowship with the Father & the Son.

¹²⁴ ibid, 419. Birth as New Person & Maturation in Jesus the Seed & Bread of Life matures through continuous Communion.

¹²⁵ ibid, 425-6. Communion with the Flesh & Blood of Christ in the Soul joins Quakers with the Patriarchs, Prophets and Saints of every age in that which is indispensably necessary to Salvation. Irenaeus of Lyon. *The Scandal of the Incarnation: Irenaeus against the Heresies*, Ignatius Press, 1990, 32-3. All beings know God, invisible by nature, and are subject to the name of Him who is the Most High and Almighty. By calling upon Him, even before the coming of Our Lord, men were saved from evil spirits, from the demons, and from every apostate power. I do not mean that these earthly spirits or demons had seen Him, but they knew of the existence of Him who was God overall, at whose invocation they trembled, as does all creation. Creation knows its Creator, what is made suggests its Maker.

¹²⁶ ibid, 427. Jesus used Natural Water to point to the Living Water of his Blood.

did eat or drink, they might eat and drink in remembrance of him, or with regard to him whose blood would be physically shed, but ultimately revealed in them.¹²⁷

The primitive church did gather immediately after Jesus's ascension and did break bread together. This was ordinary eating. For they had everything in common, and in so doing, physically ate bread and meat together, as they remembered the Lord whose physical body was broken for them, and to physically follow him to whom they were aligned.¹²⁸ The apostles, having received the money and goods of the believers, became burdened, and appointed deacons to distribute the money and goods to those in need while the apostles gave themselves to prayer and the ministry of the word. Eating bread and drinking wine was not a sacramental act of worship, but was a physical remembrance of the Christ's physical obedience which was to become their act of worship (Romans 12:1).¹²⁹

Paul argued with the Jews about their making worship a shadow and figure rather than being in reality, physical worship of the risen Christ. Barclay asks, why replace the Jewish shadow and figure for a Christian shadow and figure?¹³⁰ If any in tenderness of spirit and with a real conscience towards God do practice the ceremony of bread and wine, the Lord might indulge them for a season. But the day has dawned in which God has arisen and dismissed all old covenant ceremonies, and is to be worshiped in Spirit and in truth. God appears to them who wait on him. Those who seek God in ceremonies and rites are like Mary Magdalene at the sepulcher who sought the living amongst the

¹²⁷ *ibid*, 438-9. The Last Supper physical reenactment is to be for remembering the necessity of communing with Christ's Body & Blood metaphysically.

¹²⁸ *ibid*, 439. Breaking Bread is for the purpose of Christ's Physical remembrance, for Physical fellowship as Christ's Body & Physical obedience.

¹²⁹ *ibid*. Deacons physically distributed Money & Goods to the Needy as physical acts of worship.

¹³⁰ *ibid*, 446-7. Worship is to be of the eternal New Covenant Resurrected Christ rather than of the Jewish Covenant Type of Christ. Irenaeus of Lyon. *The Scandal of the Incarnation: Irenaeus against the Heresies*, Ignatius Press, 1990, 45. The Jews strayed from God because they did not accept His Word, imagining they could know God through the Father Himself without the Word, that is to say, without the Son. The precepts given the Jews by Moses for slavery and as a sign have been abolished through the new covenant of freedom. But the laws which are natural and common to all, the laws befitting freemen, He has increased. Lavishly, unbegrudgingly, He has granted men to know God the Father through adoption and to love Him wholeheartedly. But He has also increased fear, for sons should have more fear and more love for the Father than slaves.

dead. Instead, one is to know Jesus raised and revealed in Spirit, leading out of the old covenant rudiments (Galatians 4:9), that they may walk in newness of life.¹³¹

26 Created Humanity and Fallen nature are comforted through God becoming Incarnate through the *Theotokos*

Barclay is adamant that to obey God and commend ourselves to God in faith and patience does not destroy nature but exalts and perfects nature. To elevate nature from mortal to immortal, Christ came and lived through the *Theotokos*, that created human nature may be all things and rendered more than a conqueror.¹³²

In Barclay's third volume of works, in the conflict with the reformed students of Aberdeen, Barclay's partner George Keith stated that no heretic can claim inward evidence of the Spirit of God in the heart and the outward Scriptures as evidence of 'heresy'. The Quakers claimed a measure of the inspiration of the Spirit of God according to Scripture testimony, that Christ the true light enlightens every person, and that a manifestation of the Spirit is given to all from the Spirit.¹³³ Concerning the Scriptures, they were inanimate as a static testimony received from the church to be an outward rule, and are not confusing in themselves. Their fulfillment comes through the manifestation of the Spirit to be received jointly with the inhabitation of Christ who leads Christ's Body noetically in fulfilling the shadow message.¹³⁴

¹³¹ *ibid*, 449. Communion as Walking with Christ in his resurrected light and Spirit leads one out of dead Old Covenant rudiments.

¹³² *ibid*, 520. Christ Elevates Nature to Supernatural Status by entering into the *Theotokos* making Nature more than conqueror.

¹³³ Barclay's Works III, *An Account of a Dispute at Aberdeen*, 11-12. The light of Christ and manifestation of the Spirit in the heart provide the final proof positive against individual Heresy.

¹³⁴ *ibid*, 14. The Spirit of God kataphatic inhabits his church (temple) giving understanding through the *nous* unto wisdom

27 God became incarnate through the *Theotokos*, and is the Resurrected Seed in the Human heart

God manifests himself concretely in creation as the promised seed, the second Adam of the *Theotokos* in the fullness of time, and is now the uncreated seed of the resurrected second Adam in the soul. As Clement of Alexandria (150-215) says ‘Christ compared himself to a grain of mustard seed in his inward appearance in humanities heart.’¹³⁵

The spirit of antichrist is seen in the division of one root from another root, and in the continuous dividing of Christian expressions. Concerning the temple of God, there are diversities of operations but one Spirit and one body (I Corinthians 12). The head who is Christ, by his Spirit remains undivided amongst his body.¹³⁶ In Barclay’s conversation with the Aberdeen students, the students claim the Spirit of Pentecost is not evidence ‘enough’ within to bring one to become a Christian. The Papists and the Jesuits in particular claim the Protestant use of Scripture is not evidence ‘enough’ to bring a person to become Christian. Barclay uses the shadow Scriptures, Jewish and Christian to articulate the kataphatic seed of the second Adam, the necessity of the Spirit of Pentecost, and the fulfilled Law through Christ to point the students to God’s final evidence. While the Scriptures old and new point to God’s evidence, it is the new covenant Spirit who is the ‘Evidencer’ that a person is a child of God and a recipient of God’s kingdom.¹³⁷

¹³⁵ *ibid*, 17-18. Christ appears in the mustard seed of the 2nd Adam in the hearts of all per Clement of Alexandria (150-215 A.D.).

¹³⁶ *ibid*, 40. Christ by his Spirit remains undivided amongst his Body.

¹³⁷ *ibid*, 41-2. The New Covenant Spirit indwelling and the Spirit’s reliability are according to the Scriptures old & new. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.’ 2016, 107-8. Graham also attributed to Gurney ‘a very great influence in the Evangelical direction for a long generation’. He is not bitter about this: in fact he praises the evangelicals, and Gurney in particular, for refamiliarising Friends with the Bible, which had been too much neglected, and Gurney receives particular praise for making sure that children at Ackworth School were given Bibles. Graham might war against Bible literalism, but Bible ignorance was no answer. Here we find the balance of Graham that Barclay maintains. The shadow scriptures are helpful toward perfection (deification) and are not the Spirit. The Biblical literalism of the Protestant doctrine of ‘*sola scriptura*’ undercuts the Spirit of Pentecost (John 4:10-14; 7:37-39).

28 The Illumination of Jesus Christ in the heart is the Spirit's uncreated inspiration

Barclay points out that the Quakers have a measure of the inspiration of the Spirit of God and Christ in them according to the Scriptures. Christ's illumination is the Spirit's inspiration. The Scripture testimony proves 'that an illumination, manifestation, and inspiration of the Spirit of God is given to every person and is in every person; so as to prove that Christ, who according to the flesh was born of the Virgin Mary, was the promised Messiah'.¹³⁸

The seed of the second Adam as gospel recovery from spiritual death is in every person in a more obscure way than in *not* being rooted or formed. The seed of the second Adam sewn is as the seed of the mustard tree, which takes root and grows into fullness in the heart. This person has an open face to behold the glory of God (II Corinthians 3:18). The seed of the second Adam is a supernatural principle to be received while the inherited seed of the first Adam is a natural principle. Quaker adversaries exalt the natural principle of Pelagian fallen reason while Quakers exalt the supernatural seed of God's uncreated light and grace.¹³⁹

29 The Kataphatic and Noetic seed of the 2nd Adam received is at the same time the Heavenly and Metaphysical Jesus Christ, and the Earthly and Physical Jesus Christ

The heavenly and spiritual nature of Jesus Christ is of one essence with the earthly and physical nature of Jesus Christ. The uniformity of Christ is realized through the nature and essence of faith which is the receiving of Jesus Christ, laying hold of Him according to the measure received.¹⁴⁰ The inward revelation of the light of Christ the second Adam, the uncreated Spirit of grace, and the fulfilled Law through Christ is the new covenant post Ascension Object, while the Scriptures are a shadow object. The shadow Scriptures are but commentary on the new covenant Object of

¹³⁸ *ibid*, 43. The Spirit of Christ was given as light to the world to prove that Jesus born of Mary was the promised Messiah.

¹³⁹ Barclay's Works III, *Quakerism Confirmed*, 55-6. The seed of the 2nd Adam is the supernatural gospel promise in every heart that beholds the glory of God.

¹⁴⁰ *ibid*, 56-7. The heavenly & earthly nature of Christ is undivided in their reception inwardly.

revelation.¹⁴¹ Scripture has inward evidence kataphatic by the Spirit according to its own testimony. Quakers stand with the Scriptures given by the church, the ancients, and the primitive Protestants in saying that the Spirit's influence is Objective more than merely effective.¹⁴²

Christ's words as testimony were to be believed by the Jews. Yet Christ also refers to the Jewish Scriptures, as George Keith refers to the Scriptures Jewish and Christian to point to the Object of Christ to be received and believed. The Jews refused to believe because the Scriptures referred to came from Christ, just as the students refuse to believe because the Scriptures referred to come from the Quakers. The shadow and apophatic scriptures are illuminated by the Objective and Kataphatic Spirit.¹⁴³ Barclay argues that if the work of uncreated Grace in the soul can be felt by the person, then the Spirit is objective to the soul who receives the Spirit's work. That which can be perceived by the senses is Object. The Spirit of Christ, Jesus Christ, and God's kingdom are Objective realities to be realized in the soul (Psalm 34:8, 36:9; John 1:9, 6:53).¹⁴⁴

Reformer John Menzies states that true religion conforms to the Scripture while the Jesuit Thomas Dempster cites that heretics also claim 'conformity' to the Scripture. The Aberdeen students claim that the light in the Quaker conscience has been eclipsed by a 'newfound' objective light. The Quakers claim that the new covenant Light of Christ in the conscience is the supernatural seed of the second Adam which eclipses the shadow Scriptures.¹⁴⁵ Quakers possessing the Spirit as kataphatic rule is not the same as heretics claiming to possess the Spirit. The students of Aberdeen plead that their having the Scriptures is different than heretics having the Scripture. Barclay's possessing the

¹⁴¹ *ibid*, 57-8. Scripture is material and Commentaries are comments on the material while God is Light and Spirit as formal object of Revelation.

¹⁴² *ibid*, 65-6. Immediate Revelation by the Spirit is objective according to the Head and the Body.

¹⁴³ *ibid*, 66-7. New Covenant Revelation came objectively by Jesus Christ & then by the Spirit of Pentecost which is according to the Scriptures of the church old and new.

¹⁴⁴ *ibid*, 68. Immediate Revelation comes by the new covenant Holy Spirit of Jesus Christ to be objectively received in the Soul.

¹⁴⁵ *ibid*, 72-3. The Spirit of Christ as 2nd Adam is the New Covenant Rule in the Conscience

Spirit and claiming to have the Spirit are two different things which proof is beyond rational claim but is evidenced through one's life being hidden with Christ in God. (Colossians 3:3)¹⁴⁶

Revelation from the Spirit of the shadow Scriptures comes more by a *Lectio Divina* encounter¹⁴⁷ than by fallen discursive reason. Revelation from God comes in the same way to Christians today as revelation came to the patriarchs, prophets, and apostles in the Scripture text. Per John Calvin: 'All objective evidences and motives of credibility are not sufficient to establish the conscience in the belief of Scriptures certainty. What is needed is the Spirit of the prophets and apostles to enter the heart'. Calvin and the Protestant confessions claim that it is the secret and inward testimony of the Spirit that entered the hearts of the prophets and apostles who also confirms the Scriptures 'inspiration'.¹⁴⁸

Christ's second coming as kataphatic seed in the human heart abolishes the ordinance of outward bread and wine. The Spirit of Christ in the heart provides restored communion with humanity. The new covenant seed of the second Adam and the Spirit of Pentecost replace bread and wine, being uncreated Grace more than a remembrancer of Christ's teachings and sacrifice.¹⁴⁹

Barclay argues that nature and Scripture can reveal that there is a God, but cannot give the sense, sight, or taste of him, his love, and spiritual judgment. Sight, taste, and the experience of his love and judgment come directly from God in the soul. Nature cannot refresh or comfort the soul wounded by sin. Nature cannot discover the spiritual judgments of God in the soul whereby the soul is cleansed by fire. While the shadow Scripture is a full declaration of the doctrines and principles of

¹⁴⁶ *ibid*, 73-4. The Spirit of Christ as rule is kataphatic & noetic while the Scripture as rule is outward & rational.

¹⁴⁷ *Lectio* - reading, or listening to the text being read; comprehending the overall narrative

Oratio - praying the text meditatively; interacting with the text internally

Meditatio - exegesis of the text within its context

Contemplatio - hearing from God the particular meaning of the text; insights received internally

Actio - life application of the wisdom received

¹⁴⁸ Barclay's Works III, *Quakerism Confirmed*, 75-6. The Spirit that entered the Hearts of the Prophets and Apostles is the New Covenant Spirit for the Christian; The Spirit is the objective witness to the scriptures inspiration, canonization and interpretation.

¹⁴⁹ *ibid*, 78-9. Lost Communion with God is restored through Christ coming as light & seed in the Heart.

the Christian faith, they are but a map or a picture. Barclay affirms that the soul needs immediate discovery of God, and that the soul is to be feed and nourished by divine manifestation.¹⁵⁰

Quakers do not deny that the Scriptures were received from God. If the testimony of the Spirit is not received, it does not matter what one believes about the Scriptures. Faith is begotten solely from the Divine of which the Scriptures point.¹⁵¹

The Aberdeen students confess that the Old and New Testament Scriptures are not sufficient in every way so as to exclude the Spirit in divine inspiration. The Spirit working inwardly is the Objective revelation necessary and effective to the soul beyond the shadow Scriptures. The Spirit is the Object of immediate revelation as fire is the object of light.¹⁵² The first reformers had immediate calls from the new covenant Spirit in contrast to the later Protestants who claim to have immediate calls from Scripture. The Quakers hold to the new covenant Spirit of Pentecost leading the Christian through the seed of the second Adam in gospel vision of God, producing God's reign flowing from within.¹⁵³

Barclay instructs that the new covenant Spirit who called the apostles and primitive Christians is that for which the Quakers plead. Instead, the Aberdeen students call the Quakers enthusiastic imposters

¹⁵⁰ *ibid*, 106-7. Immediate Revelation by God in cleansing the Soul from Sin is more than Nature and more than the Scripture which is the map or card description.

¹⁵¹ *ibid*, 107. Saving faith comes by the divine Spirit of the scriptures

¹⁵² *ibid*, 108-9. The Spirit is object to the soul as fire is object to the flesh

¹⁵³ *ibid*, 155. The first reformers had immediate calls, and preached God's kingdom here of the seed of the 2nd Adam, as revealed in the mediate scriptures. Irenaeus of Lyon. *The Scandal of the Incarnation: Irenaeus against the Heresies*, Ignatius Press, 1990, 44. 'No one has ever seen God. The only-begotten Son, who is in the bosom of the Father, He has made Him known' (John 1:18). From the beginning, the Son is the revealer of the Father, since from the beginning He is with the Father. At the same time, and for our profit, He has shown the human race, in a rational and harmonious way, the prophetic visions, the diversity of grace, His own ministrations, and the glorification of the Father. For where there is rationality, there is harmony, and where there is harmony, there is a fitting time, and where there is a fitting time, there is profit. That is why the Word became the dispenser of His Father's grace for the profit of men. It was for them that He accomplished great dispositions, showing God to men, presenting man to God. He safeguarded the invisibility of the Father, lest man become the despiser of God, and so that he might always have something for which he could advance. At the same time He made God visible to men through many dispensations, lest man, bereft of God, should cease to exist. For the glory of God is the living man, and the life of man is the vision of God.

while maintaining Scripture ‘alone’.¹⁵⁴ Being different from the Aberdeen students, the first reformers claimed that the extraordinary call of God accompanied with sound of doctrine, holiness of life, and the good effect of ministry are the means by which souls are converted. This, Barclay claims, is simply according to the Scriptures.¹⁵⁵

Barclay claims that Jesus Christ, by the grace of God, tasting every person’s bodily death is more emphatic than Christ dying for all people (Hebrews 2:9).¹⁵⁶ It is according to the light of Christ, the seed of the second Adam, and the Spirit of grace, and not by the natural person claiming anything without Jesus Christ, that the love of God is exhibited and salvation by Christ through reconciliation is put into the capacity of all, even those ignorant of the name of Jesus resulting from lack of education or remote habitation.¹⁵⁷

30 Barclay writes to the Christian world concerning things in which He Disagrees rather than things for which He Agrees such as God being ‘Trinity’

Barclay addresses his theses only to the Christian world and mainly writes of things in which he disagrees and not of things in which he agrees. Though Barclay doesn’t write distinctly about the Trinity, Brown acknowledges Barclay is orthodox concerning the Trinity.¹⁵⁸ Barclay pleads for the necessity of the revelation of the new covenant Spirit to the building up of true faith, as opposed to using Scripture alone for the building up of false doctrines like the Arminians, and the Socinians in

¹⁵⁴ *ibid*, 154. The apostles & first Christians sought the inspiration of the new covenant Spirit.

¹⁵⁵ *ibid*, 156-7. The Quakers claim what the first reformers claim and it is all equally according to the mediate scriptures.

¹⁵⁶ Barclay’s Works III, *Apology Vindicated*, 163. Christ Tasting Death for all humanity is more emphatic than Christ Dying for all men.

¹⁵⁷ Barclay’s Works III, *Universal Love*, 224-5. God’s love through Jesus Christ and the Spirit is manifest so that all are put into the capacity of salvation and reconciliation unto God.

¹⁵⁸ Barclay’s Works III, *Apology Vindicated*, 279. True Knowledge (John 17:3) revealed in and by the Trinity is affirmed in the Scripture

becoming rational nominalists, which is the same epistemology of Brown with his reformed doctrines.¹⁵⁹

Reformers of Brown's kind in pretending to the Scripture and rejecting the Spirit (cessationism) have done no less vile things than those of Munster in following false revelation. Brown rejects Barclay's conclusion that a Christian epistemology of following Scripture as the primary rule is of greater danger than following the Spirit of Pentecost as the necessary revealer of God's new covenant.¹⁶⁰ Brown rejects such biblical texts as Romans 8:9, 14; I John 2:27; John 6:45; John 14:16-17, and 16:12-15 which reveal how Christians are to be led from the time of Pentecost onwards. Brown erroneously proposes that Christians are only to be led by the Spirit illuminating Scripture.¹⁶¹

Brown groundlessly charges the Quakers with denying the Trinity by combining the Quaker's kataphatic and noetic knowing with the fallen rational Socinians (nominalists) while Brown comes from the heresy of cessationism.¹⁶² In Barclay's writing on the Son revealing the Father, Brown takes exception to the eternal Spirit moving across the waters of creation (Genesis 1:2), God creating all things through Jesus Christ the Word (John 1:1-18), and God manifesting himself in the soul before and during the Jewish covenant. Brown takes exception to the new covenant Spirit of Sabbath rest (Hebrews 3-4) and prefers the first day of the week as the 'Christian Sabbath'.¹⁶³

In response, Barclay argues that the humanity were instructed by the patriarchs such as Enoch, Noah, and Abram before the time of the Law given through Moses, and then by the prophets during

¹⁵⁹ *ibid*, 280-1. Barclay speaks of the necessary Revelation of the New Covenant Spirit for all True Christians living in New Covenant reality.

¹⁶⁰ *ibid*, 281-2. The Inward Revelation of the Spirit is Primary to Scripture in following God's will and less Dangerous than Scripture proof text.

¹⁶¹ *ibid*, 285-6. Brown rejects that the Spirit will now lead all Christians extraordinarily and objectively according to the scriptures.

¹⁶² *ibid*, 289. Inward Immediate New Covenant Revelation from the Triune God is Primary to Socinian Rationalism

¹⁶³ *ibid*, 292. Immanent Revelation by the Eternal Spirit & Word begins with the hovering over the waters in Creation, the begetting & baptism of the Incarnation, & the indwelling Spirit of Sabbath Rest.

the time of the Law which was the old covenant letter. Barclay contends that it is absurd that Brown and his brethren say that inward, objective revelations are now ceased under the gospel which is said to be the new and final administration; the pouring forth of the Spirit being more abundant, universal, and personal.¹⁶⁴

Concerning divine revelation, Barclay instructs there are two things to be considered: the Revealer and the thing being revealed. The Revealer is God, the eternal Word incarnate, the Spirit of Pentecost, and the Spirit of Christ as fulfiller of the Law given through Moses in the soul. The thing being revealed is the old covenant Law fulfilled by Christ written in the heart and mind, and the message, counsel and guidance of the Spirit who proceeds from the Father in the name of the Son. Christ says, *‘My sheep hear my voice, and will not hear that of a stranger’* (John 10:5).¹⁶⁵ The formal object of faith for the patriarchs and prophets who said, *‘Thus says the Lord’* was the inward testimony of the Spirit in them assuring that the things spoken were of the Lord and not their brains. That which wrought the assurance in the patriarchs and prophets was the formal Object of faith being the *‘Spirit of the Lord’*. The message spoken was the material word even as Light serves by way of Formal Object to make plain what is proposed.¹⁶⁶

God, as formal object, manifests his will materially in and to the saints, patriarchs, and prophets and even at times to the unregenerate as with Balaam (Numbers 22-24) forcing an assent. The formal object of the saints’ faith of old remains God manifesting himself and his will in them and to them. The material object remains the message. The formal object was God, by the inward testimony of

¹⁶⁴ *ibid*, 293. The Pouring forth of the Spirit of Pentecost and the Gospel Incarnation as Shepherd is more immanent in the New Covenant administration than the letter & preaching of the Old Covenant administration.

¹⁶⁵ *ibid*, 294-5. Divine revelation includes God himself as Word and Spirit and the law written and direction given in the soul.

¹⁶⁶ *ibid*, 295. Inward Immediate Revelation is received in the Heart-Noetic as Kataphatic Certainty

his Spirit, persuading the saints that the material word was really his command and then inclining their mind to assent and obey naturally.¹⁶⁷

31The Formal Object before the Fall was the LORD God, and the Formal Object since the Resurrection is the LORD God

The formal object of Adam before the fall was '*the Lord God*' which is true of the faithful under the new covenant. It is absurd to say that the object given by God noetically to the patriarchs and prophets under the Law is now ceased under the new covenant gospel.¹⁶⁸ '*Christians all with open face beholding as in a glass the glory of the Lord*' (II Corinthians 3:18) speaks against Brown's 'imputed' understanding of God and salvation. Barclay freely acknowledges that 'The Spirit of God proceeds from the Father and the Son, and is God' while acknowledging that the word 'Trinity' is not spoken directly in Scripture which neither can Brown prove. New covenant reality stands in '*Christians with open face beholding as in a glass the glory of the Lord*' which speaks to the Lord dwelling noetically (I Corinthians 13:12, I Peter 3:4). It is Brown's salvation formula of a detached 'imputation' which leads to nominalism, presumption, and non-theism.¹⁶⁹

Quakers affirm that the Scriptures are the words of God, being many words and not one word.

Christ, however, is the one Word which eternally distinguishes Christ from the many words of Scripture.¹⁷⁰ The words of the prophets were in continuation of the Law given through Moses which makes up the Jewish canon. The Lord has not bound his hands in the new covenant that his servants cannot still prophecy. There has been prophesying after the disciple John, but in whom Christ is

¹⁶⁷ *ibid*, 297-8. Material Revelation in the Saint comes from God as Formal Object to the Saint

¹⁶⁸ *ibid*, 299-300. The inward material Revelation of God to the Patriarchs under the Old Covenant Law now is for those under the Gospel-New Covenant law.

¹⁶⁹ *ibid*, 300. The Inward Immediate Revelation of the Spirit who proceeds from the Father and the Son, and is God, Christians behold '*as in a glass*', as the glory of the Lord. Irenaeus of Lyon. *The Scandal of the Incarnation: Irenaeus against the Heresies*, Ignatius Press, 1990, 32. Irenaeus quotes 'From the rising of the sun to the going down of the same, my name will be glorified among the Gentiles' (Malachi 1:10). What other name is glorified among the Gentiles then that of Our Lord, by whom the Father is glorified, and man is glorified? He calls it His own name, because it is His own Son's name, and man was made by Him. If a king painted a picture of his son, he would be right to call it his own because it is a picture of his son, and because he himself painted it.

¹⁷⁰ *ibid*, 303. Jesus Christ being one Word is eternally distinct from the many words of Scripture.

revealed, prophesy ceases (I Corinthians 13:8).¹⁷¹ The immediate word the apostles received, commanding them to go came by the Spirit. Barclay doesn't make the Scripture and the Spirit one, but says God is a Light and is in every person, and asks is not this Light the 'in-created' new covenant Spirit of Christ?¹⁷² Whether revelation comes by shadow Scripture or within the mind (*nous*), the infallible Spirit remains the necessary and principal guide and ruler. Revelation received within is primary to revelation received without.¹⁷³

Barclay believes the testimony of Scripture to be true because the Spirit and Light of Christ open the Scriptures. The canon of Scripture is a weighty secondary authority to the Light of Christ, and the Spirit.¹⁷⁴

32 Jesus the incarnation, being begotten of the Father through the seed of the Spirit in the *Theotokos* did not exercise the same seed of sin as did the Descendants of 1st Adam

Barclay challenges that it is against the justice and mercy of God to account one guilty for a sin committed by first Adam thousands of years earlier. Punishment for first Adam's sin alone is against God's justice, and inconsistent with God's mercy. Barclay considers that Brown's opinion of absolute reprobation proceeds from Brown's self-love as one who claims to be elected.¹⁷⁵ Jesus Christ as second Adam, begotten of the Father, and born of the Spirit's impregnation of the Virgin Mary (*Theotokos*), had no seed of sin in him as other infants, and nothing of the weakness and

¹⁷¹ *ibid*, 309. Prophesy makes up the Scripture but in whom Christ is revealed, prophesy ceases, though a Christian remains a prophet

¹⁷² *ibid*, 314. The light of Christ is the new covenant indwelling Spirit directing the Christian

¹⁷³ *ibid*, 314-15. New covenant Revelation by the Spirit in oneself is primary to Second-Hand Revelation from another Source

¹⁷⁴ *ibid*, 328. The New Covenant law of the Spirit & Gospel light of Christ confirms the canon of scripture

¹⁷⁵ *ibid*, 337-8. God's Justice & Mercy does not Punish for Adam's Sin Solely, Doctrines of Election & Reprobation comes from Man's Self-love.

propensity to yield to the influence of sin. Jesus being eternally God was in greater strength, glory, and dominion over the seed of sin (and the serpent) than Adam, even before Adam fell.¹⁷⁶

33 The uncreated nature of God and light of Christ, being unintelligible to the rational senses, causes the later Reformers to make ‘God’ to align with Satan and his bottomless pit than with the fullness of God as Trinity

Brown acknowledges that universal grace and light are nonsensical and unintelligible. The unintelligible nature of God cannot be answered intelligibly. In response to the Quaker doctrine that ‘the light of Christ will not consent to abomination, but takes away blindness, opens understanding, and directs judgment and conscience’, Brown says that the Quaker Guide to eternal life is the greatest enemy to the grace of God and the gospel of Christ. Instead, Brown claims Quakers are a company of pagans driving its adherents to the bottomless pit rather than into the righteous life of Christ in hitting the mark of God’s righteous intent.¹⁷⁷

Quakers understand ‘by the Light or Seed, a spiritual and heavenly principle in which God as Father, Son, and Spirit, dwells’ coinciding with the Trinity, that it is Christ’s flesh and blood, the living Bread come down from heaven as the incarnation of God, which Brown questions whether Quakers believe is Christ’s literal flesh and blood. Quakers believe Christ is the living bread, come down from heaven, which by his flesh and blood Christians are fed and made new (John 6:51). Barclay questions whether Brown believes in the Trinity, and rejects Brown’s insinuation that the Quakers reject the incarnation being Jesus Christ.¹⁷⁸ Confessing Jesus to be a holy man is not denying Jesus to be God. Jesus Christ is true God and true man. The saints receiving sap as branches grafted into the Vine (John 15:5) neither disqualifying the deity of Christ in his incarnation nor the

¹⁷⁶ *ibid*, 350. Christ as second Adam, born of the Virgin Mary had not the same seed of Sin being of the Seed of the Spirit, as other Infants. Restored innocence at birth is the fulfillment of the prophecies of Jeremiah (31:21-30), Ezekiel (18:1-20), and is consistent with Isaiah (53:6).

¹⁷⁷ *ibid*, 381-2. Uncreated universal Grace and the Light of Christ being unintelligible, will not consent to Abomination and directs Judgment and Conscience.

¹⁷⁸ *ibid*, 385-6. As the Seed is of the Father, the Son, & the Spirit, so is Christ’s flesh & blood the Living Bread literally come down from Heaven as Light of which to be partaken.

humanity of Christ in his Incarnation. The saints receiving sap are wholly other than Christ the seed, root, and stock of the tree while benefitting through being branches grafted into Jesus the Vine.¹⁷⁹

Barclay believes that the body of the Lord Jesus Christ which was crucified near Jerusalem was again raised by the power of God in which the glorified body of Jesus Christ now dwells. This does not disqualify the living and active Word of God from being a ‘discerner of the thoughts of the heart’ (Hebrews 4:12). While Christ knows all things, the believer does not know all things and is in need of instruction.¹⁸⁰ The extension of the glorified soul of the risen Jesus Christ is no denying of the man Jesus. The light of Christ within is the same as the man Jesus is God. By reason of personal union i.e. ‘the man Christ is God’, the actions of the bodily Jesus born of the *Theotokos*, being combined with the bodily nature of all humanity, is now denominated by the nature of the Incarnation, being begotten of the Father by the Spirit through Mary (II Corinthians 5:14-16).¹⁸¹

34 Rebirth through the uncreated Spirit of God results in Regeneration unto Prelapsarian Being

The grace of the uncreated Spirit, received synergistically softens the heart and brings forth softening and regeneration (Theosis). Where the Spirit is resisted, the heart becomes hardened to

¹⁷⁹ *ibid*, 386-7. The Holy Man Jesus Christ is both True God & True Man as the Vine through which the Saints are grafted in as branches.

¹⁸⁰ *ibid*, 387-8. The Risen Glorified Jesus Christ as the Eternal Word is a Discerner of all Thoughts of Every Human Heart, and the Teacher in the Believer. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.’ 2016, 106-7. The meeting of 1836, as Grubb relates in another essay, ‘debated a request from Westmorland Quarterly Meeting for a final declaration as to the place and authority of the Bible as “the rule of faith and guidance”’. Among those upholding the authority of scripture was Joseph John Gurney (1788-1847). He was recorded as saying that ‘if ever we countenanced the idea that impressions on our own minds could be superior to scripture, we should cease to be a Christian body’. How to distinguish ‘impressions on our own minds’ from genuine promptings of the Spirit is a question that has perplexed Quakers from the very earliest days. The paragraph which Gurney wrote for the Yearly Meeting Epistle,* which was later included in the Book of Discipline* had, in Grubb’s view, momentous consequences: ‘In the opinion of many of us [it] changed the basis of the Society from an inward to an outward authority’. **Christian Discipline of the Religious Society of Friends in Great Britain and Australia*, Vol. 1, ‘Doctrine and Practice, approved and adopted by the Yearly Meeting of 1883’, London: Headley, 1906, 13-14. It says, for instance, ‘Whatsoever any man says or does which is contrary to the Scriptures, though under profession of the immediate guidance of the Spirit, must be reckoned and accounted a mere delusion’. Barclay would respond to Gurney by saying that where impressions of selfishness of the 1st Adam remain, they produce conflict in the hearer. Being a branch of Christ is the cleansing path to hearing Christ’s voice. Hearing comes by mortification of the heart brought on by the Spirit’s baptism. The path of deification and hearing the voice of the Teacher begins within the heart. Barclay stands with Grubb and Graham.

¹⁸¹ *ibid*, 388-9. The Soul of Christ is one with the Man Jesus being One Person with both Divine & Human Natures extended to humanity through the woman.

that which approaches it resulting in spiritual death. Through the Spirit, the God of grace softens the heart as fire softens wax. By fire, the nature of metal is changed. The Sun's hardening clay and softening wax shows that the Sun does not lose its proper effect though the operation of the Sun produces different effects in the recipients. For some, the heart is hardened resulting in spiritual death while for others the heart is begotten and reborn unto eternal life.¹⁸² The baptism required by Jesus in Matthew 28:19 is to immerse humanity in or into the name of the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit, teaching them to obey everything Jesus commanded as the means of entering the Kingdom which the LORD God intended in the Garden of Eden.¹⁸³

Captives freed from captivity are free. Persons hurt by Adam's fall who knew nothing of Adam's fall can benefit through Christ who know nothing of Christ's death and resurrection. The light and seed of the second Adam who conquered bodily death, by bodily death and resurrection, is available to all affected by the death consequence of Adam's fall (Genesis 2:16-17). As the apostle Paul writes, '*Death is the last enemy*' and '*Death and Hades is swallowed up into victory*' (I Corinthians 15:26, 55).¹⁸⁴ This is through Jesus Christ who in becoming mortal, swallowed up mortality by remaining one with the Father in gaining, for humanity, immortality.

35 The Christ of eternity is the Christ of history to be begotten of and brought forth in all Humanity

Paul says that Christ who suffered and died is Christ to be begotten of and formed by. This Christ is the hope of glory. This is the teaching of the apostle Paul much to Brown's chagrin: '*I travail in birth again, until Christ is formed in you*' (Galatians 4:19); '*Christ within, the hope of glory*'

¹⁸² *ibid*, 400. The same Spirit of Christ Softens the Heart producing Regeneration unto Eternal Life or effects Hardening unto spiritual death.

¹⁸³ Robert Barclay, *An Apology for the True Christian Divinity*, 401. Baptism into the Triadic nature of God is Christ's means of humanity entering final New Covenant Transfiguration.

¹⁸⁴ Barclay's Works III, *Apology Vindicated*, 405-6. Adam's Fall and Christ's Death & Resurrection are both Realities historic & contemporary to be realized.

(Colossians 1:27); ‘*But I labored more abundantly than they all; yet not I, but the grace of God which was with me*’ (I Corinthians 15:10).¹⁸⁵

The life of a Christian is an inward and spiritual thing. The life of Christ supported and carried the persecuted apostles through miseries and deaths. Barclay declares that one is saved in this life by regeneration through Christ supporting and carrying from within. The marks and evidences of justification are not always taken from the immediate, nearest, and formal causes but are from having Christ revealed in the soul as the secure sign.¹⁸⁶

36 Uncreated Light or Grace that is Christ, is the holiness of God in Humanity

The new covenant gospel teaches more than mere morality. While Brown presses that Barclay stresses a natural, dead, and anti-evangelical morality, Barclay affirms, that in truth, it is the uncreated light of Christ or grace of God, which is Christ, which presses the holiness of God in humanity. This is far from a pagan gospel detached, disconnected, and imputed as reasoned by ‘John Brown’.¹⁸⁷ The word *fermentum*, signifying leaven, is used to describe the kingdom as being permeable like leaven. Leaven is used more than 30 times in Scripture while sacrament is never used. While neither sacrament nor Trinity is found in Scripture, that the Quakers deny the thing imported by the Trinity or the thing promoted by the sacraments is false.¹⁸⁸ Entering the Kingdom is the reason for which Christ came.

37 The Eternal Body of Jesus and the Physical Incarnation are the two Bodies of Christ as One to be partaken of unto Glorification and Life Eternal

Brown concludes that Barclay’s ‘asserting of a spiritual body and flesh of Christ is a denying the incarnation of God and an overturning of Christianity’. Brown asks ‘had Christ two bodies?’

¹⁸⁵ *ibid*, 413-14. Justification comes by Jesus Christ who fully identifies with humanity, begetting and being Formed within

¹⁸⁶ *ibid*, 427. Justification & Regeneration is through Christ being revealed & received in the Soul kataphatic & formed through the Mind noetic.

¹⁸⁷ *ibid*, 450-1. The true Gospel presses the Holiness of God by the Spirit of Christ which is more than mere morality.

¹⁸⁸ *ibid*, 495. Baptism is Kingdom Leavening in the Triune God of Theosis

Barclay answers, yes! Jesus Christ speaks of his flesh that came down from heaven (John 6:58) which is different from the flesh born of the Virgin Mary (Luke 2:10-17). Christ had a supernatural body in which his soul existed eternally before he had a natural body taken from the Virgin Mary (*Theotokos*) through whom humanity receives the glorified seed of the second Adam (Genesis 3:15). Jesus in his glorified body, following the resurrection ascends to heaven (John 14:16-18, Hebrews 9:28).¹⁸⁹ To say that ‘Christians have two bodies too’ is a ridiculous fiction of Brown’s brain. Quakers call nobody of Christ carnal, but believe that the body which Christ took of the Virgin Mary which was of the seed of Abraham and David, in which Christ walked upon the Earth, and was crucified, did arise the third day, was glorified, and remains in heaven wherein the body of Christ’s most glorious soul remains forever, drawing his children by his glorified seed to be glorified with Him.¹⁹⁰

Barclay claims that the historical knowledge of the birth, life, death, resurrection, and Ascension of Christ are an integral part of the Christian faith as affirmed by the Arminians, Calvinists, and Socinians but is not essential knowledge. The history of the Incarnation is integral as the hands and feet are integral to the completion of the body but not essential to the body having life in the head and the heart. *Becoming a Christian* begins with Christ’s seed taking root in rebirth as inhabitation (Genesis 3:15; John 3:3; Colossians 1:27; Galatians 1:16; Galatians 4:19; Amos 2:13; Hebrews 6:6; II Corinthians 13:5; Galatians 2:20). [emphasis mine] It is through the second Adam that one is reborn unto life eternal.¹⁹¹ Contingent truths of fact are known by supernatural means. God supplies

¹⁸⁹ *ibid*, 505. Christ’s uncreated Spiritual Body existed eternally before Christ’s Physical Body begotten of the Virgin Mary and is now the metaphysical Bread of Life.

¹⁹⁰ *ibid*, 505-6. In Christ assuming the physical Body by the Theotokos and Holy Spirit, the physical Body becomes glorified through the risen seed of Christ’s glorified Body.

¹⁹¹ Barclay’s Works III, *The Possibility and Necessity of the Inward & Immediate Revelation*, 566. The Body can still have some semblance of Life with Heart & Brain while at the same time being without the completion of Hands & Feet.

the person of his Son as the outward relator, being that God remains the fountain of truth, and is to be believed and experienced within (I Thessalonians 5:19-24).¹⁹²

The revealing of God in the incarnation is not known in detail without a person relaying the knowledge. In Protestantism, the physical person or the sacred scriptures of Christianity objectify the information producing the sight. The Quaker and Orthodox positions predate the Protestant idea by saying that the supernatural Rays of the Sun point to the object of the Sun.¹⁹³ God manifested the historical truths to the prophets of old who knew of Christ's coming, being told of the virgin birth (Isaiah 7:13-14), to suffer and die (Isaiah 53:1-9; Psalm 22), the facts being given by inspiration of the Spirit of Christ (I Peter 1:10-11).¹⁹⁴ This truth realized by the prophets of Israel is exponentially universalized since the birth, life, death, resurrection, and ascension of Jesus Christ. (Luke 7:18-28)

ORTHODOX SCHOLARSHIP AND CONCLUSION

David Bradshaw, in his work entitled *Aristotle East and West: Metaphysics and the Division of Christendom* states that the attempt to bring Athens, Greece [metaphysical philosophy] and Jerusalem, the center of Judaism [Hebrew praxis] into harmony has for the most part ended in shipwreck. Bradshaw's attempt is to bring to light the differences between the two halves of Christendom, the Greek-speaking East and the Latin-speaking West. From Bradshaw's vantage Christians of the East were widely regarded as heretics by the West.¹⁹⁵ Bradshaw maintains that the more Eastern Christianity takes on legitimacy, the more the East reacts against the West. Eastern Christendom has from the beginning a fundamentally different way of understanding the

¹⁹² *ibid*, 567-8. It is by the revelation of the super natural other, the new covenant Person and Spirit of Christ that Christians know truth.

¹⁹³ *ibid*, 566. A Person or the Scripture convey as Material Object the Formal History of the Son.

¹⁹⁴ *ibid*, 567. Like the prophets were told inwardly, so doesn't God reveal inwardly today.

¹⁹⁵ Bradshaw, David. *Aristotle East and West: Metaphysics and the Division of Christendom*. Cambridge University Press, 2004, x.

relationship between faith and reason.¹⁹⁶ The distinction of *ousia* (essence) and *energeia* (energy) in relation to God has been the most important separation.¹⁹⁷ Bradshaw confirms that in the West the term most comparable to *energeia* is *esse* meaning ‘to be’. Aquinas’ use of *esse* was the ‘act of being’ as connected with *energeia*.¹⁹⁸ Bradshaw acknowledges that the usage of *esse* is derived from *energeia* which as it appears within Neoplatonism developed into two branches, energies in the East and *esse* in the West. What has been neglected is the non-philosophical usage of *energeia* important in the development of Eastern thought. Bradshaw concludes that in the East its usage is found in the New Testament and the early Church Fathers which this chapter demonstrates as central to Barclay’s theology.¹⁹⁹

Concerning the *energeia* of God in the West, Bradshaw argues that it is considered of *no* religious importance. It is of philosophical importance because the existence and character of the world are to be understood in light of *energeia*, yet it plays *no role* in the religious quest to know God [emphasis mine]. The nearest exception is Aristotle in his statement ‘make ourselves immortal so far as humanity can’ by sharing in the divine activity of contemplation.²⁰⁰ Aristotle did not see this as a way of coming into communion with God but as the way of achieving well-being by living in accordance with the best element *in* ourselves [emphasis mine].²⁰¹ In continuation with Aristotle, contemplation is important to the Neo-Platonists, who associate the divine *energeia* with the highest sense of the non-intellect.²⁰²

Orthodox theologian Vladimir Lossky’s criticism of Neoplatonism is that as the Neoplatonist God proceeds through the series of negations it culminates in the suicide of philosophy, and the

¹⁹⁶ *ibid.*, x

¹⁹⁷ *ibid.*, xi

¹⁹⁸ *ibid.*, xi

¹⁹⁹ *ibid.*, xii

²⁰⁰ *ibid.*, 119

²⁰¹ *ibid.*

²⁰² *ibid.*

metamorphosis of the philosopher into a mystic. The *telios* of Neoplatonic mysticism ends in the depersonalization of God, and the human who seeks God. Within Christianity, apophatic theology through negation and the wisdom that comes through that ignorance arrives at the personal presence of the hidden God. The human person is not dissolved, but has access to a face-to-face encounter with God, as Lossky posits ‘a union without confusion’ according to grace.²⁰³ This is the heart of Barclay’s reference to the need for the person to move beyond fallen head knowledge into union with Christ through communion. The union within is metaphysically with Christ.

Bradshaw traces the term *energeia* into a later work of Hellenistic Judaism, the Wisdom of Solomon (7:25-27). Wisdom has the dual role of ‘making all things new’ and of ‘entering into holy souls’, making one friends with God, and prophets. *Energeia* is wisdom’s ‘unspotted mirror’ or the mirror of God’s activity through which God the Father and His Word jointly perform all their actions.²⁰⁴

This perspective is uniform with Barclay in our becoming joint heirs and co-workers with Christ.

Bradshaw continues that the early Church Fathers used *energeia* in much the same way as Paul to refer to the operations of God, or the Holy Spirit. Justin Martyr remarks that Moses lifted up the serpent in the wilderness in accord with the intention and *energeia* of God (John 3:14). Athenagoras (c. 177) states that the Holy Spirit is that which is active in prophets. Clement attributes prophecy to the *energeia* of Christ. He speaks of the *energeia* of God seen in creatures through which the receptive person comes to adore the divine will. Speaking in tongues was attributed to divine operation. The author of the *Apostolic Constitutions* states that on Pentecost ‘the Lord Jesus sent the gift of the Holy Spirit, and Christians were filled with His energy (*energeia*) and spoke with new tongues’.²⁰⁵ There is a corollary here with Barclay in one becoming a ‘Fool for Christ’.

²⁰³ Lossky, Vladimir. *Orthodox Theology: An Introduction*. SVS Press, NY, 1978, 32.

²⁰⁴ *ibid*, 120

²⁰⁵ *ibid*, 125

Bradshaw furthers that most of the Pauline texts in the New Testament, as translated by the Latin Vulgate use *operatio* and *operari*. While these Latin translations were probably the best available, they do not possess the fluidity of meaning as the original *energeia*.²⁰⁶ To think of the *operationes* as forces or active powers that can be shared by human activity would not occur to a Latin reader. *Operatio* does not share the association of *energeia* with actuality, much less the fusion of divine actuality and human activity.²⁰⁷ Because of the limitation of translation, the notion of participation in the divine *energeia* made little impression on Western thought.²⁰⁸ In the East, however, participation took on increasing importance. Participation is viewed in conjunction with direct metaphysical use of *energeia*.²⁰⁹ Thus we see the parallel in Quaker communion.

Bradshaw claims that development among Christian authors concerning participation and *energeia* began during the Trinitarian debates of the fourth century. There, one finds *energeia* [energy] coming into prominence as a key term for understanding God's activity in the world, particularly in opposition to divine *ousia* [essence].²¹⁰ During this period there was renewed and vigorous application of the Pauline teaching about human participation in the divine *energeia*. This renewal occurred during the contrast between *energeia* and *ousia* so that to participate in the divine *energeia* was understood as a kind of divinization. The union between the Trinitarian and the Pauline strands of thought became a distinguishing feature of Eastern theology.²¹¹

The emphasis on the role of *energeia* with the Christian Trinity came about during the later stages of the Arian controversy surrounding the need to clarify the divinity of the Holy Spirit.²¹² In AD 360 Serapion wrote to Athanasius alerting him to a group that conceded the divinity of the Son but

²⁰⁶ *ibid*, 153

²⁰⁷ *ibid*, 153

²⁰⁸ *ibid*, 154

²⁰⁹ *ibid*.

²¹⁰ *ibid*.

²¹¹ *ibid*.

²¹² *ibid*.

denied the divinity of the Holy Spirit.²¹³ Athanasius argued that whatever activity Scripture attributed to one person of the Trinity it attributes to the others. All three persons of the Trinity are involved in the bestowal of life, justification, sanctification, and the overshadowing of Mary which wrought the Incarnation.²¹⁴ In the *Letters to Serapion* Athanasius infers from the unity of the *energeia* of the three persons, their equal divinity as essence. Athanasius uses *energeia* in a guarded way concerning the three persons while at the same time claiming not to know the actual *ousia* of God. He affirms with confidence that the three beings who share the divine *energeia* [energy] must also share the divine *ousia* [essence], which is beyond human comprehension. This provides the place for kataphatic knowledge and apophatic knowledge in Barclay beginning with the proposition on ‘The True Foundation of Knowledge’ to include John 17:3 in its heading.

Secondly, though ‘the *energeia* of the Trinity is one’, it has an intrinsic structure. God the Father does all things ‘*through the Word in the Spirit*’. It is the *through* and *in* which represent the *energeia* of the *ousia* of the Godhead.²¹⁵ Bradshaw argues that the grace and gifts given in the Trinity, *from the Father, in the Son, through the Holy Spirit* is uniform with Paul’s use in II Corinthians 13:13 of ‘The grace of our Lord Jesus Christ and the love of God and the fellowship of the Holy Spirit be with you all’. This is consistent with the statement of Paul that no one can say Jesus is Lord except by the Holy Spirit (I Corinthians 12:3). Bradshaw concludes that the formula ‘*through the Word in the Spirit*’ would be a way of summarizing the whole structure of Christian Revelation: God the Father has acted by sending his Son, and to partake of this gift is ultimately to partake of the Fellowship of the Holy Spirit.²¹⁶ This coincides with Barclay’s emphasis on Jesus’s encounter with the woman at the well in stating ‘God is Spirit, and those who worship Him must worship in spirit and in truth’. (John 4:24)

²¹³ *ibid.*, 155

²¹⁴ *ibid.*, 154-5

²¹⁵ *ibid.*, 155

²¹⁶ *ibid.*, 155-6

Gregory of Nyssa in his work *On Not Three Gods* distinguishes the identity of works in the Trinity. To illustrate he says that while several people may work together, one can distinguish the separate parts or stages of activity performed by each person. Gregory concludes that in the case of the Trinity there is no such distinction: although Scripture teaches that life is a gift of the Father, Son, and Holy Spirit, one does not consider that they have bestowed upon them three lives, but one life from each person separately. The same life is wrought within by the Holy Spirit, prepared by the Son, and depends on the will of the Father.²¹⁷ The Cappadocians consider this the same work of the three persons of the one God as well as the same power of the three persons of the one God.²¹⁸ The life, work, and power (*energeia*) contributed by the three persons are equally completed by the three persons (hypostases) while maintaining the one essence (*ousia*).

Bradshaw uses the analogy of a single act performed by husband and wife in the name of both who give jointly one gift. The gift-giver, the husband and wife constitute a unity. This is not incompatible with action possessing a certain intrinsic structure, insofar as it might issue from one member of the couple who gives the gift and be executed by the other. Each of the persons contributes to the common activity.²¹⁹

This raises a question of how to understand the contrast between *energeia* and *ousia* if *energeia* is the realized point of human contact.²²⁰ Bradshaw argues that it is inadequate to refer to *energeia* as simply activities or operations of God which is the argument of western Thomist scholars.²²¹

Aquinas claimed that everything which is not the divine essence is a creature. If there is no room for the divine *energeia* as realities that are neither identical to the divine essence nor due to the act of God in creation then Aquinas' position is binary and fails to capture the subtlety of the

²¹⁷ *ibid*, 160

²¹⁸ *ibid*.

²¹⁹ *ibid*, 160-1

²²⁰ *ibid*, 164

²²¹ *ibid*, 164-5

Cappadocians. Gregory of Nyssa claimed that the divine names are not merely derived from the *energeia* but are names of the *energeia*. Gregory does not hesitate to identify God with the Good and the Beautiful as well as with Power and Wisdom. The *energeia* are not merely activities of God, but must be God Himself under some nameable aspect or form of God.²²² This affirms both the apophatic and the kataphatic understandings of God.

The most famous statement of the distinction between *ousia* and *energeia* is a response by Basil to the Eunomians: Christians say that Christians know the greatness of God, His power, His wisdom, His goodness, His providence over us, and the justness of His judgment, but not His very essence (*ousia*). The *energeia* of God are various, and the essence simple, but Christians say that Christians know from God's *energeia*, but do not undertake to approach His essence. His *energeia* 'comes down to us', but His essence remains beyond reach. The distinction between God as He 'comes down to us' and God as He 'remains beyond our reach' appears in many different forms throughout the writings of the Cappadocians.²²³ Gregory of Nyssa refers to the *energeia* as 'things around the divine nature'. In this the apophatic essence and the kataphatic energy find their blend.²²⁴

The *energeia* manifests the *ousia*, making it present in an active and dynamic way, but the *energeia* does not constitute the *ousia*. Gregory of Nyssa attributes to God a self-directed activity which he identifies with self-love, or love of the Beautiful.²²⁵ The Cappadocians are wary of claiming to know much about the internal life of God. They reject any attempt to understand the creation, and ordering of the world as necessary byproducts of God's internal activity.²²⁶

In conclusion, the distinction of *ousia* and *energeia* furnishes the Cappadocians with an important argument for the Trinity. It unifies their doctrine of divine names, includes apophaticism about the

²²² *ibid*, 165

²²³ *ibid*, 166

²²⁴ *ibid*, 166-7

²²⁵ *ibid*, 170

²²⁶ *ibid*, 171

divine essence, and gives a framework for understanding divine freedom. In uniformity with Barclay it leads into the heart of Christianity being unmediated restored communion and life with God understood through uncreated Grace as divine energy.²²⁷ Within the East there is greater apophatic mystery given to the nature of the Eucharist than in the West, through the East's use of leavened bread and icons more than unleavened bread and statues. On this point this chapter demonstrates Barclay's outlook beginning with the Jansenist influence in the West corresponding with apophatic mystical communion in the East. The new covenant reality of the divine essence and energy in Barclay brings us to next chapter's topic of the purification of the person in whom Christ inhabits.

²²⁷ *ibid*, 172

CHAPTER 5: Barclay and the Purification of the Christian

INTRODUCTION: Chapter 5 opens with what recent scholarship has said about Barclay in the area of purification, demonstrates the place of purification of the person in whom Christ inhabits in Barclay using the Lonergan method in theology, and concludes with scholarship on purification in Eastern Orthodoxy. This chapter is important in that for Barclay the perfection of the Lord in the incarnation, and the resurrected Lord ascended and come again within, is uniform with the baptism of the Lord by the Spirit of Pentecost in purifying the heart, resulting in hitting the mark of God's prelapsarian intent. The restoration of the heart contributes to ongoing communion with God and leads to the *telios* of human 'being'. Purification deals with regaining the original intent of God being deification in self-other relationships through union with God. It is through God's glorification of humanity beginning with the universal new covenant principle of the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit that humanity is purified. Purification begins in the heart or *nous* where the heart is purged of missing the mark of God's kingdom with the vision of God, and his kingdom 'being' realized as eternal life.

BARCLAY SCHOLARSHIP RELATED TO THE PURIFICATION OF THE CHRISTIAN

Michael Birkel in his 2018 *Quakers Reading Mystics* states that inward prayer is the secret turning of the mind towards God in which the Light of Christ in the conscience affects the iniquities, unworthiness, and misery through the Seed.¹ By this God awakens the vain imaginations and thoughts through the pure Spirit of God to move and stir within.² Through apophatic prayer, groans,

¹ Birkel, Michael. *Quakers Reading Mystics*. Brill Publishing, Leiden, Netherlands, Issue 1.2, 2018, 16.

² *ibid*, 17

sighs, and tears worshipers are raised out of their sin.³ This chapter comes alongside Birkel's description of the place of the Spirit praying through the Christian apophatically in bringing about the purification accomplished through Jesus the second Adam.

Elsewhere, Birkel in his 2019 chapter on Robert Barclay and Kabbalah in *Quakers and Mysticism*⁴ reveal Barclay's rejection of Calvin's predestination leading to damnation rendering God the author of sin. In contrast, Birkel emphasizes that the Light of Christ is salvific and provides concrete guidance for life.⁵ By the divine Light, the saints eat the heavenly flesh and are nourished unto eternal life. The metaphysical flesh of Christ is the means of humanities justification from fallen imperfection.⁶ Birkel draws on the Cambridge Platonists through which George Keith would have come to know Francis Mercurius van Helmont with whom he collaborated on a treatise on reincarnation or 'revolution', which is the Kabbalist idea of recycling souls.⁷ The Jewish Kabbalist concludes that the human quest is an ascent through emanations, thereby not only achieving personal spiritual growth but also reintegrating scattered dimensions of the Godhead, restoring God, the world, the Jewish community, and the individual soul.⁸ This chapter will demonstrate Barclays understanding of the perfecting nature of the glorified Christ having been crucified and raised within Christian purification.

Madeleine Ward in her 2017 thesis on the 'The Intellectual Context for the Development of Quakerism, 1647-1700' states that the Eucharistic debates of the Reformation in the 16th century provided fertile soil for the metaphysical disputes over communion in the 17th century.⁹ Quakers

³ *ibid*, 17-19

⁴ Kershner, Jon, editor. *Quakers and Mysticism: Comparative and Syncretic Approaches to Spirituality*. Michael Birkel: Robert Barclay and Kabbalah. Palgrave Macmillan, 2019.

⁵ *ibid*, 86

⁶ *ibid*.

⁷ *ibid*, 87

⁸ *ibid*, 88

⁹ Ward, Madeleine. 'The Intellectual Context for the Development of Quakerism, 1647-1700'. PhD dissertation submitted to Wolfson College, University of Oxford, July 2017, 3.

maintained that it was not merely Christ's teachings but it was Christ himself who was present indwelling the individual as the agent and enabler of righteous action, and the Christian could therefore assume perfection in so far as they had subsumed their own identity to Christ's.¹⁰ Ward argues against the belief of 'celestial inhabitation' brought on by transubstantiation, and for the spiritualization of the 'Eucharist'.¹¹ Ward notes the Old Testament view of prophetic utterances and performances.¹² She also notes the changing understanding of perfectionism, though not obviously linked to increased Calvinism but characterized by the strong possibility of moral blamelessness.¹³ Ward concludes that the Quakers maintained the more spiritual understanding of the 'Eucharist' while also recognizing that the Church of England's spiritualized Lord's Supper in the 1559 Prayer Book was returned to a transubstantiated Eucharist in physical reality in 1662.¹⁴ This chapter will demonstrate that Barclay's purification corresponds with the 'transubstantiated' person of Jesus Christ purifying the person in whom Christ metaphysically inhabits (Galatians 1:16-17, 4:19, 2:20; Colossians 1:27-29). The person who knows the ascended Christ risen within is the theologian.

Yasuharu Nakano in his 2011 dissertation 'Self and Other in the Theology of Robert Barclay', acknowledges that in Barclay a person's salvation, justification, and sanctification is all in response to the workings of the inward light.¹⁵ The inward light is the formal object of faith and is the guide of justification.¹⁶ While Nakano considers George Fox to assert that reprobation lives in human attitude, he claims Rosemary Moore argues that in George Whitehead (1636-1723) that human participation encourages a 'justification by works' through joining with the light of Christ within.¹⁷

¹⁰ *ibid*, 51

¹¹ *ibid*, 43

¹² *ibid*, 56

¹³ *ibid*, 93

¹⁴ *ibid*, 105

¹⁵ Nakano, Yasuharu. 'Self and Other in the Theology of Robert Barclay'. PhD dissertation submitted to the University of Birmingham, April 2011, 38.

¹⁶ *ibid*, 39

¹⁷ *ibid*, 63-4

Job Scott considers that there is something within humanity that ‘pants’ for God and that when the new birth of God is brought forth, good works is also brought forth which is part of sanctification and justification.¹⁸ Henry Tuke concurs that the single process of justification and sanctification by the Spirit is totally attributed to God’s dispensation.¹⁹

While Nakano concludes perfection through justification has been protested by Protestants, it is full sanctification initiated by God that is the goal (Matthew 5:48; II Corinthians 13:11; Ephesians 4:13).²⁰ For Barclay, sanctification is a close synonym of justification and perfection, and is graced by God through the denial and annihilation of fallen self.²¹

Alan Sell points out Barclay’s use of Clement of Alexandria in which Barclay shuns the path of Pelagianism by referring to the inward teacher being Christ in whom humanity is made righteous through ‘power and faith’.²² Sell then acknowledges Barclay’s use of Tertullian who designates the Comforter, the Spirit as the Scripture-revealing ‘Vicar of the Lord’. The new covenant law is spiritual, and the guiding Spirit is necessary.²³ The third Father, Sell says, that Barclay uses is Athanasius who leads his readers to the implications of Christ’s resurrection being only understood through Christ himself.²⁴ These Fathers along with Gregory of Nazianzus and Cyril of Alexandria affirm the place of the Spirit in reading and understanding Scripture.²⁵ Sell claims that Barclay has embraced Pelagianism in his use of the passive resistance to grace through quoting Cyril of

¹⁸ *ibid*, 78-9

¹⁹ *ibid*, 87

²⁰ *ibid*, 193

²¹ *ibid*, 257

²² Sell, Alan P. F. Robert Barclay (1648-1690), *The Fathers and the Inward, Universal Saving Light: A Tercentenary Reappraisal*. School of Advanced Study, University of London, *The Journal of the Friends’ Historical Society*, Vol 56 No 3 1992, 213.

²³ *ibid*, 214

²⁴ *ibid*.

²⁵ *ibid*, 214-5

Alexandria, Clement of Alexandria, Justin Martyr and Prosper of Aquitaine.²⁶ This chapter will demonstrate the place of uncreated Grace as the energy of God in humanities purification.

Trueblood in his 1968 work 'Robert Barclay' reveals that the Restoration of the Stuart monarchy (1660) came about because of widespread revolt against Puritan standards of conduct which produced a sharp separation between religion and morality. Trueblood asks the question of how could a person of Barclay's integrity operate successfully in such a human setting?²⁷ It would be just prior to the Restoration that Barclay would have departed Puritan England to access Catholic Christianity at the secular Scots College of Paris (1659).²⁸ Young Barclay would not settle for the separation of religion and morality and determined that if Christianity were genuine it must penetrate the whole of life.²⁹ The contrast between retirements from the world as exemplified by monasticism did not provide for integration into the world. Instead Trueblood claims that Barclay found a third way of being Christian which Trueblood calls an 'unworldly worldliness'.³⁰ Here Trueblood quotes William Penn that 'true godliness does not turn men out of the world, but enables them to live better in it, and excites their endeavors to mend it'.³¹ The third way bringing prelapsarian life is the heart of Theosis. This chapter will demonstrate that purification beginning in the heart produces deification.

BARCLAY AND THE PURIFICATION OF THE CHRISTIAN [LONERGAN METHOD]

²⁶ *ibid*, 219

²⁷ Trueblood, Elton. *Robert Barclay*, Harper & Row Publishers, New York, 1968, 237.

²⁸ *ibid*, 250

²⁹ *ibid*, 237. Puritanism nor Catholicism provided a non-dualistic or compartmentalized religion for young Barclay.

³⁰ *ibid*, 238

³¹ *ibid*.

1 For Healing to take affect Christ's Blood and Wine must be applied as Kingdom Plaster on the Wound

Barclay contends that God does not always reveal his will to his children all at once, or lead them out of things like the Episcopal form of government instantly. Instead, the Lord countenances his children in their travel the last step, as the first step.³² The Lord countenanced Cornelius (Acts 10-11) and Martin Luther in their first steps as in their last. Martin Luther still came to error in the matter of communion as consubstantiation even with the Lord's guidance.³³

Barclay instructs that Christ's blood and suffering is the plaster which must be applied for the wound to be healed. Christ's blood is known and felt within to wash and purged the conscience. For Christ, as he is within, is not without his blood which is spiritual, even the pure blood of the vine, and is the wine of the kingdom which is inwardly felt to wash and refresh which Christ gives to them who do not know the history of the outward shedding of his blood. Others know of the outward shedding of his blood but do not know his blood shed and poured forth in them to wash their conscience from dead works. This healing is a mystery sealed up from all who stand in opposition to Christ the light within.³⁴ Concerning the shadow Scriptures, they are put in their right

³² Barclay's Works I, *Truth Cleared of Calumnies*, 136-7. The Lord countenances his children concerning his will during all their travels. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 423. Everyone who would follow the Lord Jesus Christ is engaged in spiritual warfare. The Saints by long experience learned from the grace of the Holy Spirit how to wage this war. The Holy Spirit appointed their footsteps and gave them understanding and the strength to overcome the enemy; but without the Holy Spirit the soul is incapable even of embarking on the struggle, for she neither knows nor understands who her enemies are.

³³ *ibid*, 137. Even though the Lord countenanced Luther, he still came to error concerning communion. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 423. Blessed are we Orthodox Christians because we live under the protection of God's mercy. It is not difficult for us to wage this war: the Lord had pity on us and gave us the Holy Spirit, Who abides in our Church. Our only sorrow is that not everyone knows God and how greatly He loves us. The man who prays is conscious of this love, and the Spirit of God bears witness in his soul to salvation.

³⁴ *ibid*, 147-8. Christ's Blood & Sufferings available within all is Wine & Vine to be Healingly Applied yet is opposed by some who resist the light of Christ. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 424. Silouan asks why is it that man suffers on earth and is beset by affliction and adversity? We suffer because we lack humility. The Holy Spirit dwells in the soul, bringing freedom, peace, love and blessedness.

place as one waits in silence before the Lord, to speak to their being healed and redeemed while in this world.³⁵

Concerning the purified life, Barclay states that the manner and way whereby Christ's outward righteousness, obedience, death, and sufferings becomes profitable and is made manifest is by humanity receiving him and becoming one with him in their hearts, embracing and entertaining the holy seed, which as embraced and entertained, becomes a holy birth within which Scripture calls '*Christ formed within*' (Galatians 4:19); '*Christ within the hope of glory*' (Colossians 1:27).

Receiving the Seed is the means by which the body of sin and death is done away, and humanity is cleansed and washed, and purged from their sins, not imaginarily but really, and humanity is truly made righteous, and holy, and pure in the sight of God. This righteousness is properly enough said to be the righteousness of Christ [II Corinthians 5:21]. For it is immediately from him and stands in him and is as inseparable from him as the beams are from the sun. It is through union between him and humanity, his righteous life and nature being brought forth in humanity, and humanity becoming one with his nature as the branches are with the vine (John 15:1-8) that humanity has a true title and right to what Jesus Christ has done and suffered for them. For being so closely united to Christ, his righteousness becomes their righteousness, his obedience their obedience, his death and sufferings their death and sufferings. Thus one can '*know him and the power of his resurrection, and the fellowship of his sufferings, being made conformable to his death*' (Philippians 3:10). It is by the same nearness and fellowship with Christ that one comes to know a unity with Christ's suffering seed in others, and therefore travail for the seed's rising and deliverance in them. Barclay affirms that this new covenant reality in no ways deviates from the sacrifice Christ offered to God outside the gates of Jerusalem, where the incarnation of God humbled himself unto death, even

³⁵ *ibid*, 154. The Scriptures find the rightful place under the guidance of the Spirit of Christ.

death on a cross in ‘*tasting death for every person*’ (Hebrews 2:9). Barclay concludes that this is the plain, honest, true account of the Quaker belief.³⁶

One is justified by good works wrought in Christ, through Christ working within. Barclay quotes James and Paul ‘*Man is justified by works and not by faith alone*’ (James 2:24), and ‘*according to his mercy he saved us by the washing of regeneration and renewing of the Holy Spirit*’ (Titus 3:5).³⁷

2 Faith in Degrees Purifies the Heart as Combined with Works

Little faith is different from imperfect faith. Little faith is perfect as little gold is perfect. Though the disciples did doubt, yet faith was not in their doubting nor was faith made impure by their doubting. The little measure of true faith can never be defiled, or else faith would not purify the heart. Barclay concludes that faith like fire cannot be defiled by the impurity of the things that fire purifies.³⁸

Barclay argues that there is an earthly unrenewed state and a heavenly renewed state wherein ‘*a person is born of God, and sins not*’ (I John 3:9). The disciple John states ‘*Let no person deceive you, the one that does righteousness is righteous*’ (I John 3:7). ‘*Well done, good and faithful*

³⁶ *ibid*, 164-5. The new person results from becoming one with the seed and nature of Christ risen in the heart, being cleansed, washed & purged from sin and made anew. Sergius Bowyer in his *Acquiring the Mind of Christ: Embracing the Vision of the Orthodox Church*, STM Press, 2015, 30-1 states the goal is not sin-redemption (substitutionary atonement) but deification: that Christ become formed in us. Through participating in Christ’s Death and Resurrection in the ascetical and sacramental life, we become living members of Christ’s Body in the world, delivered from death, the inclination to sin, and the darkness that comes from it. Being healed in our will by following the commandments of our Lord through the empowering action of the Holy Spirit, the Christian is crucified with Christ, dying to the passions and sinful pleasures of the world (the old man), and becomes a partaker of the immortal energies of God through the Church. As Christ is formed in us, we become by grace everything that God is by nature. This statement maintains the same emphasis as Barclay other than the role of the Church with its sacraments while affirming asceticism.

³⁷ *ibid*, 171. Salvation includes good works, regeneration and renewing by the Holy Spirit Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 383. Of His compassion the Lord gave us sinners the Holy Spirit, and sought nothing of us in return, but says unto each, as He said to His apostle Peter, Love-est thou me? Thus all that the Lord asks of us is our love, and He rejoices when we turn to Him. This is God’s mercy to man: let a man cease sinning, and humble himself before God, and the Lord has mercy upon him and gives him all, and gives him the grace of the Holy Spirit and the power to overcome sin.

³⁸ *ibid*, 172. The least measure of true faith is separate from doubting and purifies like fire. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 424. We suffer because we do not love our fellow-men. The Lord said, ‘Love one another and ye shall be my disciples.’ God’s love comes with loving one’s brother. Sweet is the love of God, which is the gift of the Holy Spirit and made known in full through the Holy Spirit. But there is a lesser degree of love, to be found in the man who strives to observe Christ’s commandments and goes in fear of grieving God in any way; and this love, too, is good. Every day we must urge ourselves towards what is good, and with might and main seek after the humility of Christ.

servant’ is the word of the Lord to those who exercise their talents righteously (Matthew 25:21-23). Christ’s workings within the saints are not filthy rags. A person’s best works, a person’s best righteousness which is of and from self is filthiness and unrighteousness before God. Humanity is to cease from one’s own fallen self-righteous works.³⁹

Barclay contends that the unclean part is to be chained down, fettered, and bound from working, that it may be wrought upon and cleansed. By degrees, cleanliness increases and uncleanliness diminishes until uncleanliness is wrought out. Where the unclean part is let loose to work, the pure Spirit of Christ never joins with it but judges the unclean part and reproves it. The clean part brings forth clean things; clean works by the pure Spirit of Christ.⁴⁰

3 The Path of ‘being made Right’ with God includes Mortification

Barclay concludes that the righteousness of God comes by knowing God, the power of his resurrection, the fellowship of his sufferings, and being made conformable to his death (Philippians 3:10). This righteousness is the work of the Spirit of Christ in the saint by which the saint suffers, conforms, and is justified through mortification.⁴¹

Barclay recites that Mary, the *Theotokos* will bring forth a son and he will save his people from their sins. There is a time of deliverance from the body of sin and death even before the ‘laying down’ of

³⁹ *ibid*, 173-4. The Heavenly Renewed state comes through humanity transitioning from the Earthly Un-renewed state through Christ the righteous one. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 425. The Lord said to His disciples, ‘My peace I give unto you.’ We must entreat God for this peace of Christ’s, and the Lord will give to him who asks; and when we receive it, we must watch over it with care, and seek to multiply it. But whoever has not submitted to the will of God in times of distress cannot know God’s compassion.

⁴⁰ *ibid*, 175-6. The unclean part is to be chained down, judged, reprov’d and cleansed by degrees by the pure Spirit of Christ. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 425. If misfortune overcome you, do not lose heart but recollect that the Lord in mercy looks upon, and do not allow yourself to think, ‘Is the Lord going to look upon me when I grieve Him?’, for mercy is the nature of the Lord. Instead, turn to God in faith, and like the prodigal son say, ‘I am no more worthy to be called thy son,’ you will see how pleasing you will be the Father, and your soul will be filled with joy indescribable.

⁴¹ *ibid*, 177. God’s righteousness comes through knowing Christ’s resurrection, sufferings and death by the Spirit of Christ working within. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 420. The obedient man puts his whole trust in God, where his soul dwells continually in God, and the Lord gives him His grace; and His grace instructs him in every good thing, and gives him the strength to apply goodness. He sees evil but evil does not approach his soul, for the grace of the Holy Spirit is with him, which preserves them from all sin, and he is at peace, and prays to God unburdened.

the body. For in being united in the likeness of Christ's death, one will also be united in the likeness of Christ's resurrection. The 'old person' is crucified with Jesus that the body of sin might be done away with, and they are no longer slaves of sin and death. Yet there is reason to remain humble, unless sin, which was once crucified revive again.⁴² Barclay affirms that *He who has begun a good work in you will perfect it until the day of Christ Jesus* (Philippians 1:6) as long as the condition is performed on humanities part. *Christians are made partakers of Christ if they hold fast the principle of their establishment* (Hebrews 3:14) firm unto the end being Christ *formed in them* (Galatians 4:19), and they in Christ (Galatians 2:20).⁴³

Where the fear of God is raised and established in the heart, Quakers believe such do not depart from the Lord, but everyone has not attained to the fear of the Lord being established overall in the heart. The righteous are kept by the power of God through faith that comes by hearing the Lord.⁴⁴ Jesus said '*my sheep hear my voice*' (John 10:27-29) and '*he loved them unto the end*' (John 13:1, I John 2:19). This speaks of those who are come to a thorough regeneration, who never fall away, being begotten in the perfect nature of a lamb. Barclay argues that those who come into this relationship are neither a child of God one day, nor a child of the devil the next but are really regenerated as children born of Christ indwelling.⁴⁵

⁴² *ibid*, 210. By being united with the Son, the OLD humanity with its sin and mortality is crucified with constant attentiveness being given to the NEW humanity rising. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 425. If men but come to know the Lord and how merciful, humble and meek He is, the face of the whole world would be changed in a single hour, and great joy and love would reign in every heart. The merciful Lord has given us repentance, and through repentance are all things put right. Through repentance we receive forgiveness of sins; repentance brings the grace of the Holy Spirit, and thus we come to know God.

⁴³ *ibid*, 211. The Perfecter will perfect his work until the day of Christ Jesus in which Christ be formed within, and Christians in Christ. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 425. If one among you have lost grace and things go hard with you, let him repent, then the Lord will give him Is peace. If a people or a nation are in tribulation, all must repent, and then God will set everything right.

⁴⁴ *ibid*, 211-12. Where the fear of God be raised and established overall there is no departure from the Lord.

⁴⁵ *ibid*, 212. '*My sheep hear my voice*' and '*He loved them unto the end*' speak of regenerated children born of God Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 369-70. The man who continues in love will not be tempted by the love of a maiden like other men, for from sweetness of the love of God the soul is oblivious of all earthly things. The grace of the Holy Spirit draws the soul to love the Lord with all her being, and in wholeness of love the soul preserves no contact with this world, even though she dwells on earth. We are proud-minded, and therefore

4 Submitting to the living Word and Law of God in the Heart brings Peace

The great peace Quakers come to is by being turned to the living word and law of Christ in the heart, loving it, cleaving to it, receiving its reproofs and chastisements, and submitting to its judgments.

The living word is as a hammer, a sword, and a fire which breaks into pieces, destroying all that is false and unsound, bringing peace through tribulation.⁴⁶

Barclay contends that the end of true religion is to lead out of sin and into the righteousness of God.

The vitals of Christianity consist in keeping the commandments of God toward hitting the mark. The saint lives better without sin than with sin which is a burden, and is as death to the saint. The saint's life is in righteousness. Humanity needs pardon from sin, the cleansing blood of Christ, and repentance by which one is perfected in righteousness for the purpose of hitting the mark of God's righteous intent.⁴⁷

Inward righteousness and holiness is distinguished in Scripture as justification and sanctification which includes God mercifully 'judging' humanity unto eternal life.⁴⁸ Barclay contends that though those who are fully regenerate are saints, yet some may be called saints who are not yet fully

unable to continue in this grace, which withdraws from the soul. Then the soul yearns for the grace she has lost, and seeks it anew with tears, and weeps bitterly calling upon the Lord, saying: all merciful Lord, thou sees my souls lamented, by yearning after Thee. There is no man on earth so gentle and lowly in spirit as our Lord Jesus Christ. In Him is our joy, in Him our gladness. Let us give Him our love, and He will lead us into His Kingdom, where we shall behold His glory.

⁴⁶ *ibid*, 216-17. Secure peace comes through the tribulation and fire of submitting and cleaving to the living word and law of God in the heart. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 138. The ascetical Christian is not a theologian in the academic sense but in the heart since pure heart is worthy of receiving divine visions. Pure prayer starts with struggle against the passions. As it cleanses itself from the passions, so the mind becomes stronger in the battle with intrusive thoughts, firmer in prayer and awareness of God; while the heart, freed from the dark passions, begins to see all that is spiritual more clearly, more plainly, and convincingly.

⁴⁷ *ibid*, 217-18. Keeping the commandments comes from being led out of sin by the cleansing blood of Christ, repentance, and purification unto righteousness. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 420. Rare are those who know the mystery of obedience. The obedient man is great in the sight of God. He follows in the footsteps of Christ, Who in Himself gave us the pattern of obedience. The Lord loves the obedient soul and affords her His peace, and then all is well and the soul feels love towards all men.

⁴⁸ *ibid*, 284-5. God judges people justly unto eternal life according to inward righteousness and holiness. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 424. If you will do good unto your brother, you will gain quiet for your conscience. If you subdue your own will, your enemies will be driven off and you will receive peace in your soul. If you forgive your brother the affronts he puts upon you, and love your enemies, then you will receive forgiveness for your sins, and the Lord will give you to know the love of the Holy Spirit. And when you have entirely humbled himself, you will find perfect rest in God.

regenerated. Regeneration comes through vision or *theoria* within the saint towards God (I Corinthians 13:8-10; I John 3:1-3).⁴⁹

Barclay argues that none can come to absolute perfection but by mortification of sin. Even such as are 'perfect' while on earth do constantly use mortification to keep sin down, lest sin rise again, and to resist the temptations of the enemy wherewith even those who are 'perfect' are daily assaulted.⁵⁰

Religion consists in repentance, mortification, believing, and the application of the blood of Christ.

Barclay claims that humanity though they have attained perfection cannot too much repent of their former wickedness.⁵¹ Though William Mitchell charges that the Quaker principles forbears repentance, mortification, believing, and the application of the blood of Christ, the contrary is abundantly shown.⁵²

⁴⁹ *ibid*, 312-3. Purification is the work of regeneration in the Saints whether fully or in part. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 138. The ascetical theologian prefers this course over theological science. For him speculation, be it theological or metaphysical, leads man to the boundary where it becomes clear that our empirical notions and attainments cannot be applied to God. Speculation results in a state where the mind begins to be still. But this stillness in an academic and philosophical sense is far from contemplation of God, though it may come near it.

⁵⁰ *ibid*, 320. Mortification remains always the means of keeping sin down and resisting the temptations of the enemy. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 138. Obtaining to contemplation beyond imagination and meditation is impossible without preliminary cleansing of the heart. Only the heart purified of the passions is capable of the special feeling of awe before the inscrutability of God. The mind joyfully is silent, and powerless before the majesty of the vision of God. Cleansing of the heart and its continued cleansing is the work of repentance whereby the work of mortification is accomplished.

⁵¹ *ibid*, 320-1. Repentance which includes mortification, believing & application of the blood of Christ remains always a central part in man's regeneration and perfection. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 138-9. The ascetical theologian approaches the state of contemplation by different paths. The ascetical person never cogitates. Like a doorkeeper he is concerned to watch that nothing extraneous enters the heart. The Name of Christ and His commandments are what the heart and mind live on in the hollow silence. They left a singular life, alert to everything happening in, not analyzing logically but applying in a spiritual sense.

⁵² *ibid*, 321. The Quaker witness is one of repentance, mortification, vigilance, and application of the blood of Christ unto Theosis. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 139. The mind when joined with the heart is aware of every movement in the subconscious. Stationed within the heart, the mind observes the images and thoughts that come from the sphere of cosmic being and strive to take possession of his heart and mind. The energy of this or that spirit assumes the form of an intrusive thought – that is, a thought linked with this or that image. The pressure exerted by intrusive thoughts is extraordinarily strong, and to subdue them the person must all day long force himself to avoid every interested look, not allowing himself become attached to them. This constant battle is to reduce outside impressions to a minimum. Otherwise the impression will descend into the heart causing confusion.

5 The noble Universal principle is Jesus Christ mercifully and justly cutting away the wicked Nature and Spirit

Christ is faithful to forgive and to cleanse from all unrighteousness. A person is through Christ cleansed from the filth of sin and unrighteousness (I John 1:7-9) which is more than only removing the guilt of sin.⁵³ God's mercy and God's justice are the justifying action of the universal light of Christ and uncreated Spirit cutting away the wicked nature and spirit in those suffering to be redeemed, and overthrowing those who hate to be reformed who rebel against the light of Christ and Spirit.⁵⁴ Barclay argues that the real inward justification of the saints is the life and power of Jesus revealed in them, mercifully working justly to cut away the wicked nature and spirit. This is the noble universal principle of Christianity intended for all people.⁵⁵

6 The Inward Bond with Christ is first broken before any Outward Bond with the Body is Broken

The 'Church of Christ' includes the assemblies where the true doctrines of Christ the incarnation are flourishing, and the true life and power of God in good measure is raised (Acts 15:28).⁵⁶ Further than physical bonds which draw Christ's Body together, which bonds are the product of truth's power and virtue upon the heart, Barclay affirms the inward bond with Christ produces righteousness. Disowning due to the breaking of the outward bond results from first breaking the inward bond with Christ from which the outward bond is established.⁵⁷

⁵³ *ibid*, 322. Christ is faithful to forgive and cleanse from all unrighteousness which is more than cleansing from guilt. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 139. Through cleansing, the ascetical person acquiring continual vigilance of the mind in the heart, and when, after long years of such striving – which is the most difficult and harder than any other ascetical feat – the heart becomes more sensitive, while the mind receives strength. The slightest hint of a passionate thought, and ones polluted state continues uninterrupted, and the feeling of God, present and active is powerful and plain. This is the Christian path of restored prelapsarian life with God.

⁵⁴ Barclay's Works I, *Confession of Faith*, 442-3. Chapter XVII. *A short Expostulation with, and Appeal to, all other Professors of Christianity* concerning the light of Christ and Spirit of grace to extend mercy and justification

⁵⁵ *ibid*, 443. Real inward 'justification' through the power and life of Jesus revealed and working within is the universal principle of the Saints

⁵⁶ Barclay's Works I, *Vindication & Postscript: Anarchy of the Ranters and Hierarchy of the Romanists Refuted*, 563. It is only the new covenant life and teaching of the Incarnation who guides Christ's body the Church.

⁵⁷ *ibid*, 563-4. Any breaking with the branches (Christ's Body) results from the bond with the Vine (Christ the Head) being broken first

In the case of Westmoreland Friend, William Rogers' plea for Christian liberty 'in matters of the conscience' it was meant by Barclay to affirm 'liberty in the Spirit's gifting and administration while amongst the body' (Romans 14) and not unbridled license by any member within the body, claiming superiority to the Body. Barclay concludes that a member would first break the inward bond with Christ the Vine producing righteousness before breaking the outward bond with the Body comprised of true doctrines and principles coming from the life and power in measure felt and known.⁵⁸

Barclay acknowledges that disobedience to the 'Sense of the Meeting', coming from the Spirit of Pentecost (Acts 15:28) results from unwatchfulness to the uncreated Grace of God in oneself more than from hierarchical coercion by the Church.⁵⁹ The Spirit sent at Pentecost, as in the first day guides 'the church' today through the inward bond, being the first fruit and branch of the unbroken bond throughout history, including the saints in heaven presently. For Barclay, Quakers are a continuation of the original bond of the Spirit, being branches of the original Vine (the Incarnation of God), established in the apostolic order of the church, being aligned by the new covenant power of God. As was the order of the gospel with the first apostles, so is the order of the gospel with the Quakers.⁶⁰ The Book of Discipline, which Barclay wrote, was affirmed by the signatures of the second day meeting in London in the third month, 1677, and affirmed by William Rogers as a satisfactory expression of the words of Robert Barclay, though the wording of some sections could have been clearer.⁶¹

⁵⁸ *ibid*, 572. The Spirit's diverse gifting amongst the Body is for the building of the whole rather than for inciting disunity.

⁵⁹ Barclay's Works I, *Letter of William Rogers*, 576. The Spirit gives sound judgment to the church of Christ intended to be adhered to by its constituency – referencing the incident with Friend William Rogers (563-4).

⁶⁰ *ibid*, 576-7. Barclay's response to the misunderstanding with Quaker William Rogers includes Quaker affirmation of the unbroken bond with the original Vine and Spirit of Pentecost throughout the history of the church.

⁶¹ *ibid*, 578-80 In response to *Robert Barclay's Book of Discipline* renamed from *The Anarchy of the Ranter and the Hierarchy of the Romanists Refuted* which spoke equally against false liberty and disorder on the one hand, and

7 Though Doctrines are Accepted and Doctrines Rejected, there is No Imposition placed on Christian Liberty of Conscience

Barclay argues that the apostles and primitive Christians practiced order and government in the church. The traditions of the Church were embraced, doctrines accepted, and doctrines rejected by the church but there was no encroachment or imposition placed upon one's liberty as being inwardly and immediately led by the Spirit of God in their hearts. Those who are in the true feeling and sense of the Spirit will find their place to be one with the Body of Christ. Those having lost their feeling of their life being one with the Body, being blind and obstinate, dissent and are disobedient under a false pretense of liberty.⁶² Puffed up malignity is to be withstood and denied which would hurt the peace of the Body and hinder the prosperity of truth. Barclay recognizes that impurity of conscience demonstrated through obstinacy (obduracy or hardness of heart), wars against the truth and peace of Christ's Body.⁶³

Barclay affirms with the early church that the Spirit of God gives judgment through leadership in the church to all led by the Spirit (Acts 15:28). Those rejecting the judgment of the leadership through pretense are guilty of disobeying God.⁶⁴ The Church is made up of those who have received and hold to the truth as it is in Jesus and are sanctified or being sanctified by the power and virtue of Jesus working in their inward parts. This does not guarantee unity amongst all members but does mean that the church will prevail against the gates of hell under Christ, who leads his Body to the end of the age which 'church' is not without blasphemy or to be called into question.⁶⁵

imposition and dominion of hierarchy on the other, the second day London Meeting affirmed that Barclay, in Christian condescension, write an explanatory postscript to those who misapprehended any expression there in

⁶² Barclay's Works I, *Anarchy of the Ranters and Hierarchy of the Romanists Refuted*, 487. Order and Government was practiced in the Church with the accompanying Freedom of Conscience by the Spirit.

⁶³ *ibid*, 521. The pure Spirit of God moves amongst the body collectively inciting unity

⁶⁴ *ibid*, 535-6. God has given his Spirit to guide the church universal through saintly leadership.

⁶⁵ *ibid*, 537-8. Christ who is with his church to the ends of the earth advocates for unity against the gates of hell

8 The Spirit leads the Disciple into Pureness of Life beyond all Outward Forms

Barclay argues that the anointing Spirit never deceives, never acts nor moves to anything that is amiss but is clear and manifest in its revelation as discerned by waiting in the undefiled light of God, the proper and fit organ in which revelation is received. Because seducing spirits crept into the church of old, is no reason to reject the anointing which teaches all things, is truth, and is no lie (Ephesians 2:1-3, John 16:7-11, I John 2:26-27).⁶⁶ Regenerated Christians with refined spiritual senses know and trust revelation from the Spirit kataphatically through the *nous* without needing to apply revelation to Scripture or reason for confirmation.⁶⁷

Barclay points out that the Scripture argument is that the Spirit's revelation is necessary to live a Christian life as the Comforter has come to reprove the world of sin, righteousness, and judgment (John 16:7-11). To move from the name 'Christian' into the reality of knowing God, and being known by God begins with knowing the small beginnings of God's Spirit; the secret light which shines in the heart reproving unrighteousness. The privilege of every Christian is feeling the Spirit's

⁶⁶ Robert Barclay, *An Apology for the True Christian Divinity*, 61. The Light of God in which Christians wait is Pure, Undefiled and without Deception Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.' 2016, 111-2. "This chapter on Evangelicals [Protestants] has so far hardly touched on the fourth of Bebbington's distinguishing features of evangelicalism, activism. Brian Phillips has noted that the modernising Quakers of Graham's generation retained the 'evangelical temperament' while rejecting the evangelical [Protestant] theology. He relates this temperament to their enthusiasm for social action: 'A mission to save the soul of the individual sinner could quite easily be translated into a mission for international welfare, peace, and justice'. Graham played his own vigorous part in the Quakers' mission to improve the world, but he was also an 'activist' within the Society as he campaigned for an up-to-date Quaker theology. His first major trial of strength came with his involvement in the campaign to resist the imposition of a 'creed' on British Quakers, in the form of the 'Richmond Declaration'." Rejection of evangelical theology is rejecting the literal proof-texting of scripture brought on by the heretical view of cessationism in which the Spirit is no longer active outside of sacred Scripture. Instead, the new covenant temperament is hearing the word of God which is a double edged sword dividing soul from marrow, judging the very intent of the heart (Hebrews 4:11-13). Jesus Christ, by his very nature was social, and Christianity is social. Reductionist evangelism, confined to Bible proof-text, resembles the religion of the Jewish Pharisee. Christ's purpose was for the world, and an evangelical Christianity concurs with Christ. While there is a place for scripture, and even creedal statements as led by the Spirit (Acts 15:28), when they supplant Christian life they are a problem. Barclay and Graham would concur that Christian evangelism, coming from the Incarnate Word and the living word of the Spirit is far different than the cessationists with their shadow proof-texts. Becoming by Grace indwelling what God is by nature is Barclay's center. Protestant Christianity and its 'sola scriptura' approach do not fit Barclay's 'True Christian Divinity'. The one Protestant expression, the Pentecostals, while centering on the Spirit, center more on the word of God written by design, than the New Covenant law within (Jeremiah 31:33).

⁶⁷ *ibid*, 69. New Covenant Revelation by the uncreated Spirit stands alone for the Regenerated Christian. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 356-7. You will say that a great many people are suffering every kind of adversity, and from evil men; but I entreat you, humble yourself under the mighty hand of God, and grace will be your teacher and you yourself will long to suffer for the sake of the love of the Lord. That is what the Holy Spirit will teach you. But the man who cries out against evil men but does not pray for them will never know the grace of God.

leading in its small beginning as the secret light which shines in the heart reproving unrighteousness.⁶⁸ By forsaking iniquity, one comes to be acquainted with the heavenly voice in the heart and the natural-old person is put off that does not savor the things of God with their evil and corrupt affections and lusts. One feels the new person, or the spiritual birth and babe raised with their spiritual senses that can see, feel, taste, handle, and smell the things of the Spirit (Psalm 34:8, 36:9). Until then the knowledge of things spiritual is but an historical faith. As the description of the light of the sun or colors given to a blind man cannot be seen, so a babe or child with eyes can see the kingdom of God by having its mystery revealed inwardly and objectively by the Spirit. The child who tastes what is revealed inwardly and immediately by the Spirit is further along than the blind reasoning scholastic.⁶⁹

Concerning the gospel of Christ which exceeds the Law of Moses, Barclay states that the gospel is incarnational, inward, and is fulfilled through the indwelling of the Spirit of Christ who gives power to obey God and delivers from evil. The gospel declares that the shadow Scriptures cannot be the only and chief rule of Christians or else there would be no difference between the Jewish Law of Moses, the Scriptures, and the incarnate Word and Spirit of the new covenant. The Law of Moses and the Scriptures, being outward, have no power to save. The gospel Incarnation and new covenant Spirit being inward give life, and produce virtue. Barclay affirms that those who know the Spirit of Christ to live within feel power over their iniquities through restored communion with God.⁷⁰ The fulfilled law of Christ in the heart is holy, just, and good in contrast to humanities nature which is worldly. Barclay argues that Gentiles do works of righteousness through the spiritual nature that

⁶⁸ *ibid*, 71. Christianity begins with the secret light of God's spirit shining in the Heart reproving Unrighteousness.

⁶⁹ *ibid*, 71-2. By Forsaking the Iniquity of the Natural Person, the New Person or Babe Is Raised Sensing & Knowing the mysteries of God's Kingdom

⁷⁰ *ibid*, 77-8. The Gospel being Incarnational, Inward & Indwelling with the Infallible Spirit gives Power to hit the Mark greater than the Mosaic Law or canon of Scripture.

arises from the Law of the Spirit written in the heart (Romans 2:14-15). All good works rise from the Spirit in the heart contributing to the new creation or new person.⁷¹

Barclay continues that as the promised seed of Christ is received in the heart and brings forth its natural and proper effects, Christ comes to be formed and raised, Christ within, the light to obey and deliver from sin, the new person resulting from the kingdom seed raised as metaphysically of the holy Man, the second Adam, the Lord Jesus Christ born of the Virgin Mary indwelling.⁷²

9 Holiness is the Accident that denominates a Person holy through Cooperation with the Divine

The seed of the kingdom is a substance subsisting even in the hearts of the wicked. Holiness is the accident which denominates a person holy. As the seed of the second Adam receives place in all, as a naked grain in a hard, stony, thorny, or fertile ground, the seed is a substance and may become healthful or unhealthful. The seed as medicine may denominate some part holy though there remains a corrupt unmortified part. There are two accidents in the body, and the body receives its denomination from the accident which prevails most. Many people are called saints, good, and holy people, and when the holy seed is brought forth in the saint in good measure, and somewhat leavens the saint into the seed's nature, yet the saint is still liable to many infirmities and weaknesses.

Barclay acknowledges that the seed does not automatically make the evil person righteous, or immediately make the righteous person holy.⁷³

⁷¹ *ibid*, 102-3. Righteousness rises from the Righteous & Law of the Spirit in the Heart; all good works rise from the Holy, Just & Good law of the Spirit in the Heart.

⁷² *ibid*, 136-7. Being one with Christ, the Light & Seed can be borne down & pressed under or raised up over iniquity as New Humanity distinct from the holy man, the second Adam Jesus Christ.

⁷³ *ibid*, 138-9. God's Kingdom seed is the substance & Holiness the accident residing in all Hearts. Mortification is the means by which the New Humanity is clothed-made fit for the Kingdom. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 423. Our battle rages every day, every hour. If you have upbraided, or passed judgment, or your brother, your peace is lost. If you have been boastful, or have exalted yourself above your fellow, you have lost grace. If you did not drive away forthwith the wanton thought that came to you, your soul will lose love for God and boldness in prayer. If you are fond of power, or money, you will never know the love of God. If you have followed your own will, then you are vanquished by the enemy, and despondency will come upon your soul. If you detest your brother, it means that you have fallen away from God, and an evil spirit has taken possession of you.

From God proceeds the uncreated light of his Son, a spiritual divine light to rule in things spiritual and heavenly. Barclay instructs that the divine light comes in response to the fallen light of reason which rules in things natural and earthly. As the moon borrows from the sun, so humanity should have their fallen reason enlightened and purified by the divine pure light of Christ.⁷⁴ Humanities ‘natural’ conscience is distinguished from the light of Christ, for the conscience is to follow the judgment of the light of Christ. The conscience does not inform the light of Christ, instead the light of Christ informs the conscience. The light of Christ as it is received removes blindness through judgment, opens understanding, and rectifies both judgment and conscience. Barclay affirms that the conscience is an excellent thing where it is rightly informed and enlightened by the light of Christ. The conscience is compared to a globe, and the light of Christ to a candle. It is the light of Christ in the conscience and not humanities fallen reason that Quakers commend. The light of Christ is what Quakers direct people to as the most certain guide unto eternal life.⁷⁵

Barclay instructs that the first step in humanities salvation is not by working, but in not contrarily working. Humanity cannot move one step out of their natural condition until the uncreated grace of God lay hold of them. The grace of God works in and upon humanities nature, though of itself our nature is wholly corrupt, defiled, and prone to evil, yet is capable of being wrought upon by the grace of God. As iron or wax when removed from fire or sun returns to its former condition of coldness or hardness, so humanities heart, as it resists or retires from the grace of God, returns to its former condition. Such is the nature of God’s working in humanity.⁷⁶

⁷⁴ *ibid*, 142-3. The Light of God’s Son purifies Reason like the Sun enlightens the Moon

⁷⁵ *ibid*, 144. The Light of Christ distinguished from the Conscience reproves the Conscience Rectifying it unto Eternal Life.

⁷⁶ *ibid*, 146. The Grace of God Working in Humanity requires Passive Constancy unto Regeneration

Barclay continues that the remedy of Christ works passively in humankind toward their healing if the unregenerate of the first Adam do not resist the regenerating seed of the second Adam.⁷⁷ Barclay contends that wrath and condemnation is in those who reject new covenant grace. The nature of the sun refreshes and enlivens the living as well as causes the dead to stink. Those influenced by the sun of righteousness bring forth good fruit, and a good savor. Those hardened by the sun accent wickedness and send forth an evil savor.⁷⁸

The true light is both in Jesus and is Jesus that enlightens every person coming into the world. As He is the light, and as one walks with him in that light, one has fellowship with the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit producing and begetting kingdom life.⁷⁹ Barclay affirms that Cyril of Alexandria (376-444) articulates the Quaker principle that the universal illumination and the grace spoken of by Paul, as supernaturally given by Christ to the world, was given to take away the blurredness of the mind which detained humanity in ignorance bringing them unto fruitfulness.⁸⁰

10 Salvation comes by Knowing Jesus as Word and Light indwelling the heart, establishing His Reign

The inward word or light is quick, sharp, and discerning as it searches and tries the physical and spiritual hearts of all, and is the witness of God in all. This inward and powerful word of God is quick and sharp, piercing soul and spirit, joints and marrow, and discerns the thoughts and intents of the heart (Hebrews 4:11-13). Barclay contends that the word of God refers to both word and light. God has not left any person without a witness, just as Jesus Christ '*the Word made flesh*' (John 1) was given for a witness.⁸¹

⁷⁷ *ibid*, 146-7. The Passive Physic Work of the Spirit of Christ brings Healing where Synergy is embraced

⁷⁸ *ibid*, 148. The uncreated Light of New Covenant Grace affects Receptivity in Humanity Justly and without Frustration

⁷⁹ *ibid*, 156-7. Communion with the Light of Jesus Christ begets Kingdom Faith & Light

⁸⁰ *ibid*, 159-161. Cyril of Alexandria communicates the Quaker principle of the Supernatural Light given unto clarity of mind & fruitfulness.

⁸¹ *ibid*, 165-6. The Word that pierces both Spirit & Joints is both Word & Light

Barclay stands with *'except a person be born again, he cannot see the kingdom of God'* (John 3:3). This new birth comes not by an outward knowledge of Christ or an historical faith in Christ preached. Those who come to this new birth become in Christ a new creation, *'the old is passed and the new is come'* (II Corinthians 5:16-17). This is more than to know of Christ as the incarnation but is to possess the substance of those first precepts of knowing Christ in the mind (*nous*) (I Corinthians 2:14-16). Those who go past the outward 'rudiments' of knowing, being like the Jewish sacraments, inherit the kingdom of God (Colossians 2:8, 20).⁸²

The Quakers have been made to lay down their wisdom, learning, and carnal reasoning, to learn of Jesus, and sit down at his feet in their hearts, and hear him who in their hearts makes all things manifest, reproofing all things by His light. For many are wise and learned in the notion, in the letter of shadow Scripture, and can speak of Christ, and plead against infidels and heresies, while at the same time crucifying Christ in the small appearance of His light and seed in their heart. The Quaker admonition is to become 'fools for Christ', to know Christ to teach in the heart, so that one may witness Christ raised within, feeling the virtue of his cross in their heart and say with Paul *'I glory in nothing save the cross of Christ, whereby I am crucified to the world, and the world unto me'* (Galatians 6:14).⁸³

Barclay instructs that those confiding in an external barren faith think all is well if they firmly believe that Christ died for their sins past, sins present, and sins to come while in the meantime Christ lies crucified, slain, and is daily resisted in his appearance in their heart. The Quakers are led and moved of the Lord, now that a sense of blindness and ignorance is come over Christendom to

⁸² *ibid*, 169-70. Christ's Saving Light comes as Humanities way of Rebirth, becoming a New Creation in Christ & inheriting the Kingdom.

⁸³ *ibid*, 173. The One committed to Evil hates the Light, rejecting the Cornerstone noetic, the Gospel now revealed to the Nations through Quakers. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 141. An ascetical form of pure prayer is when the mind is enclosed in the heart, and there is stillness with no irrelevant thoughts and images, so as to 'meditate in the Divine Name'. This prayer is associated with continual ascetical striving and to a certain extent depends on man's free will, labor and austerity.

call all, invite all, and request all to turn to the new covenant light of Christ in them, to mind the uncreated light in them, to believe in Christ as Christ is within, and dwells therein. That in the name, power, and authority of the Lord to be silent and sit down as in the dust, and to mind the light of Christ in their consciences, which if minded they would find a sharp two-edged sword in their hearts; a fire and a hammer that knocks against them, burns up all the carnal fallen stuff and makes the stoutest of the wise to tremble and become Quakers indeed. Barclay warns that those who do not come to feel, and do not kiss the Son while their day of visitation lasts will feel Christ's appearance to be a certain truth when it is too late.⁸⁴

11 Justification comes by 'Becoming a Doer' of the Fulfilled Inward Law of Christ

Barclay affirms that the doers of the law will be justified. There is tribulation and anguish upon every soul of man that does evil, to the Jew first, and also to the Gentile (Romans 2:9-11). Both those who have the outward law, and those that only have the inward law, when they do well, will be justified (Romans 2:12-16). The Gentiles who had no law were justified and did partake of the honor, glory, and peace which come upon all who do well. God, who is no respecter of persons, judges those with only the inward knowledge, as those with both the inward and the outward knowledge.⁸⁵

Many, who want the outward knowledge, have a saving knowledge inwardly by virtue of the inward grace and light given to everyone. Barclay argues that it is by the inward knowledge working in

⁸⁴ ibid, 174-5. Christ's light becomes Purification, and Kingdom Instruction through Jesus Christ's indwelling Appearance in the Heart Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 141. Meditating in the Divine Name naturally enables one see intrusive thoughts before they introduce themselves into the heart. To control one's subconscious releases one from the turmoil provoked by influences that spring up from the black depths of cosmic life. Meditating in the Divine Name allows one to positively transcend human conceptions in hesychastic prayer.

⁸⁵ ibid, 182. The Light leads the Christian in being a doer of the New Covenant law. God judges fairly according to the New Covenant law written within. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 142. In their ascetic writings certain of the Holy Fathers brought a distinction between two forms of spiritual life – active and contemplative. The active life they call the way of the commandments of Christ. Silouan thought somewhat otherwise. He divided his life into the active and the contemplative with the keeping the commandments as the sole intention. For him, the foundation of hesychasm was the first commandment – 'Thou shalt love the Lord thy God with all thy heart, and with all thy soul, and with all thy mind'. (Matthew 22:37)

them that they forsake iniquity and become just and holy. While the geographically uninformed and those before Moses may not have known the history of Adam's fall, yet Barclay contends that they were sensible of the laws, the inclination to sin, and the body of sin within, leading to death. Though they did not know the coming of Christ in the flesh, yet they were sensible of the inward power and salvation which came by Christ both before and since Christ's appearance in the flesh. Moses wrote of the first Adam and his fall by revelation. The Jews crucified Jesus as a blasphemer, not able to see what David and the prophets saw concerning Christ (Psalms 34:8, 36:9). Barclay explains that the revelation concerning Jesus Christ came to his mother Mary, the *Theotokos*, and Christ's disciples slowly.⁸⁶

According to Barclay redemption is twofold on God's part. The first redemption is performed and accomplished by Christ in his crucified incarnational body outside of humanity. The second redemption is wrought by Christ in his crucified body within humanity. The first application is as humanity stands in the fall of first Adam, being put into the capacity of salvation, and God conveying unto humanity a measure of the power, virtue, spirit, life, and grace which was in Christ Jesus; which as free gift is able to counterbalance, overcome, and root out the evil seed of first Adam whereby humanity is leavened.

⁸⁶ *ibid*, 182-3. Revelation by the Spirit of Christ came to the Patriarchs, Geographically Uninformed, Mary, and Christ's disciples slowly. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 142-3. The man who has come to know the love of God will say to himself, I have not kept this commandment. Though I pray day and night, to practice every virtue, still have I failed in the commandment of love towards God. At rare moments only do I arrive at God's commandment, though at all times my soul longs to abide in it. When irrelevant thoughts intruding into the mind, the mind is then concerned with both God and with the thoughts, so the commandment to love God 'with all thy mind and all thy heart' is not fulfilled. But when the mind is entirely wrapped in God, to the exclusion of every other thought – that is fulfilling the first commandment, though, not yet completely. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.' 2016, 65. Graham believed that for everybody 'the Indwelling God is the source of ethics and the centre of religion'. Human beings are not merely products of 'blind, non-moral nature', although that has furnished the 'raw materials' out of which we have been made. Thus it is that humanity 'has been steadily growing in unselfish sympathy', 'under a beneficent spiritual influence'. Thus Quakers were able to make use of the idea of the Inward Light to devise an optimistic interpretation of evolutionary doctrine. This would seem to confirm Owen Chadwick's view that the science did not necessarily pose a difficulty for nineteenth-century Christians. For Barclay, the nature of salvation was progressive. While Barclay acknowledges the perfection, mercy and kingdom of the Father, salvation came slowly to Mary and the apostles which is the path of Theosis.

Barclay argues that the light of Christ brings forth Jesus Christ formed, working his works as the person is sanctified, justified, and washed clean by Jesus Christ who is both gift and giver; the cause producing the effects, renewing by the Spirit as new creation and temple of God.⁸⁷ God manifested his love toward humanity in the sending of his beloved Son, who by the eternal Spirit gave himself for humanity as an offering and sacrifice to God, as ‘a sweet smelling savor’ (II Corinthians 2:15) making peace through the blood of his cross that the Lord Jesus Christ might reconcile humanity unto himself, the justifying second Adam for the unjust first Adam.⁸⁸

The second application knows Christ’s pure and perfect redemption, His resurrected seed indwelling purifying, cleansing, and redeeming humanity from the power of corruption, and bringing humanity into unity, favor, and friendship with God.⁸⁹

By receiving and not resisting one’s purchase through Christ’s bodily death, the light of Christ, and the Spirit of grace revealed within, one can witness and possess a real and true inward redemption from the power and prevalence of sin, and so come to be truly and really redeemed, justified, and made righteous unto a sensible union with God. Thus Christ died for all, and one can know Christ in the power of His resurrection and the fellowship of His sufferings being made conformable to His death (Philippians 3:8-11). Being conformable to Christ’s last death within follows Christ’s first

⁸⁷ *ibid*, 188-9. The light of Jesus Christ in the heart noetic becomes a spiritual birth bringing forth holiness, righteousness, and purity. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 143. In the ascetic experience of pure prayer, the mind, divested of all images and concepts, is vouchsafed, after deep repentance and much weeping, authentic vision of God. Hesychasm has always met with antagonism, especially in the West. Lacking the necessary experience, its opponents argue in the abstract and go so far as to see in hesychasm something mechanical, some spiritual techniques leading to the contemplation of the Divine. But this is not so. The Divine is encountered.

⁸⁸ *ibid*, 194. The eternal Son by the eternal Spirit offered himself a sacrifice to God, to reconcile humanity to God, the Just One for the Unjust Many. Once the Son learned obedience through what he suffered he became our High Priest.

⁸⁹ *ibid*, 195-6. The evil seed of 1st Adam, rooted out in Christ’s body without, opens the door to the power and seed of Christ within to redeem humanity from the leavening of the evil seed of 1st Adam. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 143. Absolutely free, God is not subject to any automatic influence, any compulsion. Hesychasm requires great self-denial and is the most arduous of ascetic practices. The resolution to accept such suffering in order the better to observe the commandments attracts Divine grace if the effort is made in a spirit of humility.

death without. According to Barclay none can partake of Christ's death but as they witness the death of fallen Adam within, the formal beginning of justification.⁹⁰

The formal beginning of justification is the inward birth and gestation of the new Adam; Jesus Christ brought forth in the heart as seed of the second Adam who is the well beloved, whom the Father cannot but accept. All those who are sprinkled with the blood of Jesus, being washed with his blood in the inward birth, come to be made partakers of the divine nature (II Peter 1:4), and are made one with Christ as the branches with the vine (John 15:1-8). Christ's obedience becomes their obedience, Christ's righteousness becomes their righteousness, Christ's death and sufferings become their death and sufferings (Philippians 3:9-11). By His new covenant nearness, one comes to have a sense of Christ's sufferings, and to suffer with Christ's seed in others, and so travail with Christ's seed in them for their redemption, and for the repentance of their souls who concerning the promised seed of the woman (Genesis 3:15) are crucifying as yet the Lord of glory again (Hebrews 6:4-6).⁹¹

The obedience, sufferings and death of Christ is that by which the soul obtains remission of sins, and is the procuring cause of the Spirit of grace by whose inward workings Christ comes to be formed within, the soul made conformable to Christ, and so just and justified. It is not until the inward birth is brought forth formally that they are justified in the sight of God. Barclay confirms that

⁹⁰ *ibid*, 196. Christ's death without, procures the death of fallen Adam within in justification through rebirth. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 143. Whatever means he employs, the proud man will never attain to genuine union with God. Just by wishing it, man cannot unite the mind with the heart, and even if the mind does somehow penetrate into the heart, it will see only itself, its own creative beauty – splendid, undoubtedly, having been created in the Divine image – but God Himself will not be found. Rebirth comes only through death.

⁹¹ *ibid*, 197-8. By the inward Birth of the New Adam from the seed of the 2nd Adam Christians become Partakers of the Divine Nature & Suffer with the Seed of Christ in Others. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 143. The path of new birth through continuous humility caused blessed Silouan to embrace the phrase 'Keep thy mind in hell, and despair not.' This is the talk of a simple and ignorant man who many times was found worthy of pure contemplation of God and was the ground of his saying 'If you pray purely, you are a theologian.' This coincides with his second statement, 'There are many on earth who believe but very few who *know* God.' By this outlook he suffered with the seed of God in others.

justification is one with Christ indwelling unto sanctification, being neither imputed (Protestant) nor infused (Papist).⁹²

Though Christ bore humanities sins, suffered for humanity, was accounted a sinner and numbered amongst the transgressors yet that God reputed Christ a ‘sinner’ is nowhere proved. Instead it is said, Christ was found before Him holy, harmless, and undefiled, and no guile was found in his mouth (Hebrews 7:26, I Peter 2:22). Jesus did not die that humanity should be ‘reputed’ righteous, no more than Jesus took on flesh that Jesus should be ‘reputed’ a sinner. If humanity was made righteous, as Christ was made sin, merely by ‘imputation’ then as there was no sin in Christ, so it follows that there need no righteousness, no holiness, no sanctification than there was sin in Christ. By partaking of the grace purchased by Christ, one is made the righteousness of God in Christ.⁹³

Jesus, in suffering for sin, establishes his indwelling more than ‘imputation’ in our becoming partakers of his righteousness. By Christ’s working within, one is made the righteousness of God in him. As He suffered, in his being made sin, so Christians will suffer in becoming righteous.

(Philippians 3:10)⁹⁴ Barclay suggests that to content ourselves with an imaginary justification, while

⁹² *ibid*, 198-9. Justification & Sanctification coincide equivocally with Christ being formed within Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 143-4. By ‘*knowing God*’ Silouan met, not Gnostic theories, not theological speculations, but the experience of lively communion, of real communion with the Divine Light. Knowledge is co-existence – that is, a sharing of being.

⁹³ *ibid*, 204. Justification is being made just by the divine Seed & Grace purchased unto all in the same way as Jesus Christ took on himself the fallen Seed & Sin of the human flesh. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 144. The anthropological basis of hesychasm is portrayed in Saint Silouan's life which, while confirming the traditions of the Orthodox Church is an authentic life manifestation, and bears an original seal. Though this is not a theological tract, the dogmatic points and dogmatic consciousness is organically linked to the whole process of spiritual life. Any change in one's dogmatic consciousness means a corresponding mutation in the spiritual person and spiritual ambience generally. The slightest deviation from the truth in our inner spiritual life will alter our dogmatic perspective.

⁹⁴ *ibid*, 204-5. Jesus established the means by which Christians are made righteous through his metaphysical indwelling. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 144-5. On the silence of the intellect and its effect on the human person Silouan drew from Saint Isaac the Syrian and Saint Makarios. ‘The soul is not defined by nature and nor does it belong to the shades of evil. It is a creature endowed with reason (*noreia*), filled with great and wondrous beauty, in the likeness and image of God, and the wiles of the dark passions have penetrated into her because of her transgressions.’ ‘He who God created after His own image was created exempt from the passions, which is why the passions are not in the nature of the soul. They constitute an outside element for which the soul herself is to blame.’ ‘When the senses are contained in silence, one sees what treasures the soul contains.’ It is in the silence of renunciation that one encounters God.

God requires a real justification is of a most dangerous consequence. Humanity cannot be made just by the Law of Moses or the works of the Law (Galatians 2:15-16). Faith purifies the heart and the just live by faith (Hebrews 11:6, 11:1).⁹⁵

Barclay argues that ‘justified’ comprehends all points of ‘being made righteous’ between calling and glorification. Justification and sanctification infer one another (Romans 8:30). The saints are called ‘saints’ because in Christ they have received remission of sins. And yet ‘*Let him that is just, be just still*’ (Revelation 22:11) is understood as the fruit of inherent righteousness in and through ‘being made just’.⁹⁶ The reformer Daniel Chamierus (1564-1621) states justification and sanctification infer one another as being in Christ; the saints receive remission of sins, justification, and sanctification by Christ indwelling.⁹⁷ Philipp Melanchthon (1497-1560) concludes that ‘justification by faith’ is one with ‘being made righteous’.⁹⁸

⁹⁵ *ibid*, 208-9. Justification is the Purification of the Heart by Faith in Real Time through Theosis Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 145. When the soul is stablished in prayer, and the heart sees every thought that approaches the heart before it enters, being the energy of the evil passions that assailed the soul from that which is not inherent to its nature, the mind stationed in the heart resists and repels through prayer. The mind can more deeply penetrate the heart when by Divine impulse it unites with the heart to divest of all images and concepts while the heart remains closed to every foreign element. The soul penetrates into the ‘darkness’ of an especial nature, and is deemed worthy of standing ineffably before God with a pure mind.

⁹⁶ *ibid*, 210. Justification is one with Sanctification and Glorification in being made Just Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 145. There is a superior state where a man existentially and undisputedly partakes of eternal life and ineffably rests in God. However, he does not continue long in this state, if the Lord in His providence, which only He knows, would prolong his life on this earth. Man then returns to this world and, like Peter on Mount Tabor, says of his inner dwelling with God, ‘Master, it is good for us to be here with Thee.’

⁹⁷ *ibid*. Reformed Daniel Chamierus (1564-1621) states justification & sanctification infer one another. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 145-6. Hesychasm is such a rich and splendid life that any description sounds incoherent and contradictory. It would seem natural for any logically-minded people to be confused by the idea that man for a certain time may existentially be introduced into eternal life. It is obviously inconsistent to speak of temporarily becoming eternal. But this is the case. Justification and sanctification infer one another.

⁹⁸ *ibid*, 211. Reformer Philipp Melanchthon (1497–1560) states justification by faith includes being made righteous. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 146. Time and eternity are two different modes of being. Time is the mode of the creature, incomprehensibly created by God out of nothing, and ever quickening and evolving. Eternity is the mode of Divine being which our human conceptions of extension and succession do not apply. Eternity is a unique act of Divine being, an act of incomprehensible fullness, which, being transcendent, embraces in one point all the dimensions of the created world. Only the One God is eternal in substance. Eternity is not an abstraction, an entity existing separately, but is God Himself in His own Being. When it is God's good pleasure give man grace and make him a partaker in Divine life, man becomes, not only immortal in the sense of having life endlessly prolonged, but beginningless, for the sphere of Divine life into which he is lifted has neither beginning nor end. By beginningless I do not mean a preexistence of the soul or a transmutation of our created nature into unoriginal Divine nature – I mean sharing in God's unoriginate life consequent on the deification of the creature by act of Divine grace.

12 Works are integral in the Justification of our person through Christ's seed

Barclay quotes James who says '*You see that by works a man is justified, and not by faith alone*' (James 2:24). If no person can be justified without faith, and no faith can be living without works, then 'works' are the *telios* of justification.⁹⁹ That works are at the heart of justification is so apparent and evident in the Scriptures, Barclay surmises that humanity might transcribe most of the precepts of the gospel to works (Hebrews 12:14; Matthew 7:21; John 13:17; I Corinthians 7:19; Revelation 22:14). If only those can enter the kingdom that do the will of the Father; if only those are accounted the wise builders and happy that do the sayings of Christ; if no observation avail but the keeping of Christ's commandments; and if they be blessed that do the commandments and thereby have a right to the tree of life and enter through the gates into the city, then works are necessary to salvation through justification.¹⁰⁰

Barclay asks does not Christ throughout all the Beatitudes pronounce people blessed for their purity, meekness, peacefulness, etc. Is not that for which Christ pronounces people blessed, profitable unto all? Did not Christ pronounce the stewards '*good and faithful servants*' that improved their talents? If not improving the talent is unprofitable, then improving the talent is profitable. Improving the talent made the servants profitable, and a cause instrumental to their acceptance (Matthew 25:23; Luke 17:10).¹⁰¹

⁹⁹ *ibid*, 218. Works of Justification are necessary to Salvation in Christ according to James Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 147. The soul in a state of vision of God has no questions to ask but only freely responds. She does not bring about by her own will the indescribable act which introduces her to the divine will, because she cannot desire what she has never known. Still, this act does not take place without her participation, in that at some moment of her own free will she has ardently aspired towards God in the keeping of His commandments. The prelude to this is suffering and repentance which comes from the deep heart, tears that burn up in man the pride of flesh and spirit.

¹⁰⁰ *ibid*, 218-19. Works are necessary to Justification and entering the Kingdom of Heaven. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 147. Man while in the flesh cannot attain to perfect knowledge, but God does give him an actual, indubitable, existential experience of the Eternal kingdom. He may know 'in part' but his knowledge is *sure*.

¹⁰¹ *ibid*, 219-20. Blessing and Justification come through Living the Beatitudes and Improving one's Talent Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.' 2016, 65-6. Chadwick says, 'the Fall was the easiest of all doctrines to restate': it was simply a matter of inverting the traditional doctrine, and invoking the

Justification comes not by acknowledging Christ's death while remaining unjustified in a heart polluted with sin. Neither does justification come by one's own self-righteous works, the performance of religious ceremonies, giving of money, afflicting the body, conforming to the letter of the Law, meriting or drawing debt upon God, or any power of humankind. Barclay argues that justification comes only by cooperating with the operative, righteous offering, and resurrected seed of the second Adam kataphatically within.¹⁰²

Barclay instructs that being pricked, pursued, and condemned by God's holy new covenant witness in the heart, and having applied oneself thereunto, and by suffering God's grace to work, one is changed and renewed in their darkened mind, passing from death to life, knowing Jesus risen in them, working both the will and the deed. Those having *put on the Lord Jesus Christ* (Romans 13:12-14) are clothed with Christ, and partake of his righteous nature in whom the Father is well pleased. (Hebrews 4:16)¹⁰³

13 Hitting the Mark is a constant Battle in response to Humanities fallen Nature and the Adversary

The state of perfection means not pure, holy, and perfect as God in his divine attributes of wisdom, knowledge, and purity is perfect but is a perfection proportional and answerable to humanities own

ideology of progress. 'Christianity represented man as perfect by nature and fallen from his high estate, evolution now showed him vile and savage and rising up "towards perfection or quasi-perfection". The Inward Light gave added assurance to such belief by suggesting the agency through which the 'ascent' could take place. For Barclay, salvation is cooperative and participational with the operative work of God. Instead of progress being ideological as in old covenant Judaism and Platonism, progress is relational through Christ indwelling. It is the baptism of the heart by the Spirit by which 'perfection' comes to be realized in life. This requires agency, and is progressive.

¹⁰² *ibid*, 228-9. Justification comes only by cooperation with the operation of the risen Christ within. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 146. Man discovers his real self at the deepest roots of his nature when the mind and heart, turned towards Christ, are joined – not by his own efforts but by the action of God – in mystic union. He then, is an immortal hypostasis, his mind made in God's image, his spirit godlike, sightlessly beholds God.

¹⁰³ *ibid*, 229. By partaking of the seed of the 2nd Adam within, the darkened mind is cleansed and Christ's righteous nature put on. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 147. He who was made in the 'image' of God is made for life 'after His likeness', also. The man who has found salvation in God receives life in the likeness of God's own life. God is omnipresent and omniscient, and the Saints in the Holy Spirit received a likeness of that omnipresence and omniscience.

measure.¹⁰⁴ Barclay cautions that those having come into a season of perfection, of hitting the mark in measure may by the wiles and temptations of the enemy fall into iniquity if they do not watch and attend to that of God in their heart. Many good and holy people have had various arrivals and departures of this kind. Sin weakens a person in their spiritual condition, yet sin does not destroy a person altogether, or render a person incapable of rising again through attendance to the light and Spirit in the heart.¹⁰⁵ Doing righteousness for the person of the regenerated soul and enlightened mind comes naturally according to the seed of God in them. Barclay acknowledges that while the saint may sin for the term of life; that the saint must sin for the term of life goes against the righteous nature of the seed of the second Adam, and the kingdom come within (Luke 17:20-22).¹⁰⁶

Barclay is firm that no unclean thing can be united with the Lord. There is no communion between ‘*light and darkness*’ (II Corinthians 6:14-16). God is light, and every sin is darkness in measure. What great stain on God’s wisdom if God had wanted to prepare a means whereby his children might serve and worship him perfectly, or had not provided a way whereby his children might serve him in anything, but that God’s children must serve the devil more than Himself? ‘*He that sins is the servant of sin*’ (Romans 6:16) and every sin is an act of service and obedience to the devil.¹⁰⁷

Barclay concludes that the just nature of God provides a path for his children to abstain from

¹⁰⁴ *ibid*, 231. Perfection is distinguishable of Creator, and measurable of creation. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 147. Man does not possess eternal life in himself – that is, within the confines of his created being. He becomes eternal by the gift of grace when he communicates in Divine life, yet here below this experience of eternity does vary in might. *In so far* as we are in God, we are eternal. *In so far* applies to the nature of the gift granted by God.

¹⁰⁵ *ibid*. Seasons of Perfection coincide with periods of Reoccurrence of Sin in the Heart Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 146. Though man may experience moments of union, yet so long as he is tied to the flesh, his knowledge will not attain perfection. The will not be able to fathom what his eternal existence will be after he has traversed the last stage of this earthly life – that is, been delivered of the grossness of the earthly body and, unburdened, has entered ‘into that within the veil’, should God see fit to receive his soul.

¹⁰⁶ *ibid*, 231-2. That the Saint must sin for the term of life goes against the righteous nature of Christ’s Seed and Christ’s Kingdom come.

¹⁰⁷ *ibid*, 232-3. God provides the way to turn to the Light who is Christ and to reflect Christ’s pure Light Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 147. God is Light, and the Saints in the Holy Spirit become light. God is Love encompassing all that exists, and the Saints in the Holy Spirit embrace universe love. God is All-Holy, and the Saints in the Holy Spirit are holy. Holiness is not ethical but an ontological concept.

iniquity, ungodliness, and unrighteousness so as to participate in the righteous designs of God's kingdom.¹⁰⁸

Barclay argues that God is unjust if God requires his children to forsake sin and does not afford the means to forsake sin. The imperfection of the saints proceeds not from God but from the saints being short to improve or make use of the power given to obey. If the insufficiency is not of the saints to obey, then the insufficiency would be from God which is the height of injustice. God gives his Spirit for the perfecting of the saints and not for the saints un-perfecting.¹⁰⁹ Barclay continues that if insufficiency to obey is from God, this makes God more unrighteous than wicked Pharaoh, who required the Israelites to produce bricks without straw (Exodus 5:6-21). Faithful prayers find God's grace sufficient to overcome the evil one. The *telios* of the saint is virtue, purity of mind, and power over sin unto the works of God (I Thessalonians 5:17-24; Matthew 7:7-11).¹¹⁰

14 Christ was made Manifest to Destroy the Works of the Devil and to take away Sin through Mortification

The Son of God was manifest that he might destroy the works of the devil and take away sins. The Quaker opponents will not have the Son of God to destroy the works of the devil in God's children

¹⁰⁸ *ibid*, 233-4. A Path of Purity is provided justly by God through the New Covenant unto Glorification Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 147. The One God is Truth and Life, and those who communicate in the Holy Spirit become true and have life; whereas those who fall away from God suffer spiritual death and depart into 'outer darkness'.

¹⁰⁹ *ibid*, 234. Perfection of the Saints is justly through the Purifying Spirit of God living within Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 147. A man is not holy because his morals or conduct are good, or even because he leads a righteous life in the sense of devoting himself to spiritual endeavor and prayer. Indeed, the Pharisees kept the fast and made long prayers. But the man is holy who bears within himself the Holy Spirit.

¹¹⁰ *ibid*. Perfection does not come by Resistance from God, God responds to prayer with Grace sufficient to overcome the Evil One. In like manner, Pharaoh perceiving himself to be god pursued his own ends. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 358. The Saints speak of that which they have actually seen, of which they know. They do not speak of something they have not seen. If God were not, then there would be no intimation of Him on earth. But people want to live after their own passion and consequently they declare that God is not, and in so doing they established that He is. Jaroslav Pelikan in his *The Spirit of Eastern Christendom* Vol. 2, 1974, p. 182, states that Photius recognized the church fathers to have a two-fold anthropology, one praising human nature and the other reviling. In the East this did not lead to sin akin to death through fallen Adam but only death merited through individual sin. Thus the hardening of Pharaoh which Augustine interpreted as a secret predestination of God and an act of Pharaoh's free will was proof that God, who never does violence to the power of will knew that Pharaoh when carried away by his own deification would refuse to change his behavior on the basis of Moses' counsel. This was God respecting the way in which God had created humanity originally in God's image while also making a way of salvation through Israel.

while remaining on earth. Neither will they believe that the Son of God was given to take away sins. Instead, Barclay argues that Christ came to gather people out from sin unto righteousness; to gather a people out of the kingdom of Satan, and into the kingdom of his dear Son. Christ both gathers his children, his servants, his brethren, his sons to be as Christ was, his children, his servants, his sons to be in this world holy, pure, and undefiled. Christ watches over them, stands by them, prays for them, and preserves them by His power and Spirit, walks in them, and dwells amongst them.¹¹¹ Christ who overcame and triumphed over sin, death, hell, and the grave has given all power in heaven and earth to preserve and enable his children to serve him. Instead it is purported that the saints are daily subject more to the devil and his power than Christ and his victory through the saint.¹¹²

Barclay contends that the saints confess they ought to pray daily that God would deliver them from evil, and free them from sin by God's Spirit while in the world. The apostles also prayed that humanity attain such deliverance from missing the mark of God's intent, to hitting the mark of God's righteousness.¹¹³ Barclay instructs that by turning the mind to the light of Christ, and law of the Spirit of Christ in the heart, the unrighteous parts are confronted through Christ's judgment and are made to be crucified with Christ to the world by the power of his cross within. By partaking in the fellowship of his sufferings, and being made conformable to his death one is raised to newness of life (Philippians 3:9-10). Christ's life becomes their life.¹¹⁴ Barclay rejects the idea that God works good works in humanity by his Spirit that Christians are 'to sin daily in thought, word, and

¹¹¹ *ibid*, 235-6. The Work of Christ is Theosis: As Christ was, so his Servants to be to this world.

¹¹² *ibid*, 236. Christ gives his children victory to serve Him over sin, hell, the grave, and the devil.

¹¹³ *ibid*, 237. The Saints Pray Daily for Deliverance from Evil & Sin by God's Spirit & Grace.

¹¹⁴ *ibid*, 241. By turning the Mind toward Christ in the heart Christians experience his judgment & conformity with his Life becomes their life.

deed'. Through confession and repentance one is forgiven and cleansed of guilt and filth by the Spirit.¹¹⁵

Barclay instructs that the end of mortification is to be freed from sin through the blood of Christ. In praying for forgiveness, one is to believe that their sins are forgiven, blotted out, and they become daily preserved from sinning. Barclay asks with Paul '*Shall Christians continue in sin that grace may abound? God forbid*' (Romans 6:1-2).¹¹⁶ The gift of the uncreated grace of God sufficient for salvation becomes condemnation in those who resist. Those having tasted the heavenly gift by partaking of the Holy Spirit to purify and sanctify in order to further perfection (theosis) may by disobedience fall away and make shipwreck of the faith. Yet Barclay claims that in those who persist, an increase in stability and truth may be attained from which there is no total apostasy.¹¹⁷ A good conscience is the result of the operation of God's uncreated grace from which a person still can fall. Faith remains the byproduct of a good conscience more than a good conscience is the product of a false and hypocritical faith. The attainment of faith from which one might fall, is from real faith, having tasted and partaken rather than only 'seemed' to have tasted and partaken.¹¹⁸

¹¹⁵ *ibid*, 242-3. Guilt & Filth are cleansed by the Spirit through Confession & Repentance Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 150. The disordered passions contain ingredients of enslavement and disintegration. The slave of sin only gains godlike freedom as a child of God through confession and repentance.

¹¹⁶ *ibid*, 246-7. Perfection through Mortification brings Freedom from Sinning unto Holiness Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 150. The passions possess a power of attraction but no passionate image or thought can enter and take root in the soul without man's consent. For in all the cosmic existence there is nothing powerful enough to deprive the free man of the possibility of resisting and rejecting. But when a prurient thought or image takes root in the soul, man finds himself in one measure or another possessed. The passions signify the state of being possessed in varying degrees of intensity. Mortification of the passions is the path freedom.

¹¹⁷ *ibid*, 249. Perseverance in Uncreated Grace brings increased Stability and Theosis. Resistance to Grace brings Shipwreck through disordered passions. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 150. Passions attract by promising delights. Suffering in the sense of disintegration is the result of passionate delights. If a passionate impulse held no moment of charm but started immediately with suffering, it would not incline man's will to itself. Passion bringing on suffering and death can be identified instantly only by the spiritual person who has known the life-giving action of divine Grace that begets a repulsion in the soul, a hatred of all sinful pressures within her.

¹¹⁸ *ibid*, 251-2. A Regenerated Conscience comes through Partaking of the Divine Nature. Perseverance in Mortification is unto Stability of Truth, and Life Eternal. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 146-7. The man in the flesh will not wonder about eternal life in moments of vision when the soul is entirely in the eternal God and does not know whether he is in the body or outside, but only when the soul sees the world again and once more feels herself fettered by her corporal bonds.

Barclay emphasizes that humility is necessary so as not to foster iniquity or lay down in presumption. Watchfulness and diligence are indispensable to growth in fertile kingdom soil (Romans 8:38-39).¹¹⁹ Barclay contends that humanity would not be exhorted to such an assurance if such an assurance were not attainable: ‘*Give diligence to making your calling and election sure, for if you do these things, you will never fall*’ (II Peter 1:10). The condition of diligence is given to the attaining of assurance that takes one beyond doubt and despair.¹²⁰ The assured who are never plucked from the Father’s hand (John 10:29) are established, and confirmed beyond all doubt, through the Spirit of Christ in the heart, having obtained the assurance, being made a pillar in the temple of God, and going no more out (Revelation 3:12).¹²¹

Barclay argues that the true test of a Christian, by which the Christian has a right to the heavenly inheritance and is a true member of Jesus Christ, is inward righteousness and holiness; the mind (*nous*) redeemed from the vanities, lusts, and iniquities of this world. Where this inward righteousness is lost, the title of Christian is lost. And so the true seed, to which the promise is, and to which the inheritance is due becomes extinguished, and the person becomes dead to their inheritance. The seed of God’s kingdom purchased for them retires and dissolves itself once again into Christ. According to Barclay, Christ gives His seed to whom he pleases, to as many as are turned to his pure light in their consciences, who walk in his righteous and innocent life, and so become true members of His body.¹²²

Barclay affirms that the authority, power, and heir to Christ’s ministry are not annexed to people who claim the name, retain a form, or hold to a shell of Christianity. The promise is Christ and the seed of Christ in whom the authority is inherited and the person united unto Christ in purity and

¹¹⁹ *ibid*, 254. Fertile Kingdom Growth requires Watchfulness, Due Diligence & Humility

¹²⁰ *ibid*, 254-5. Assurance is attained through due diligence in faith.

¹²¹ *ibid*, 255. The assured beyond all doubt are so because of the Holy Spirit in their Heart.

¹²² *ibid*, 272-3. As in a lost Inheritance, the Seed of Christ would return to Christ; Where Inward Righteousness is Forsaken and Lost, the Inheritance would be received by another.

holiness by the inward renovation and regeneration of the mind (I Corinthians 2:14-16). The church being Christ's body is the house of God, the pillar, and ground of truth (I Timothy 3:15).¹²³

15 Waiting on the Light and Seed of Christ within is the heart of Justification

Barclay explains that there is nothing more opposite to the natural will and wisdom of man than silent waiting upon God. Neither can the will and wisdom of humanity be obtained, or comprehended, but as one lays down their natural wisdom so as to be content and thoroughly subject to God. Silent waiting upon God in which is found the life, power, and virtue of God is only practiced by people who view outward ceremonies infused, and the purest words of Scripture imputed unable to satisfy humanities weary and afflicted soul. Such cease from these externals to wait silently before the Lord, being directed to the inward principle of life and light in them as the most excellent teacher, having been taught to wait in the measure of life and grace received, and feel after the inward seed of the second Adam indwelling. As Christ's seed moves, they move and are actuated by Christ to pray, preach, or minister.¹²⁴

Barclay acknowledges that though the form of this worship is naked and void of all outward and worldly splendors, so there being an inward quietness and retiredness of mind, the witness of God arises in the heart, and the light of Christ shines, whereby the soul comes to see its condition. As the measure of grace is abode in, an overcoming of power and darkness is experienced where the worshiper is greatly strengthened, and renewed in the spirit of their mind without a word spoken, and enjoy, and possess the holy fellowship and communion of the new covenant body and blood of Christ by which the inward person is nourished and fed.¹²⁵

¹²³ ibid, 273. Christ's Ministry is received by 'the seed of Christ' who are the House of God, the pillar & ground of truth.

¹²⁴ ibid, 330. Worship is to be in silent Waiting upon the seed of the 2nd Adam to actuate. Silent Listening to the Inward Teacher without outward words makes Worship Effectual

¹²⁵ ibid, 331-2. Purification comes through Darkness being exposed, and then cleansed by the Body and Blood of Jesus Christ within.

16 The Work in Gathered Worship is Purification of the Soul

Barclay instructs that the work in gathered worship is for everyone to watch and wait upon God, to be gathered from all visibles unto God so as to find the good to arise over the evil, the pure over the impure in which God reveals him-self and draws near to every individual. And so the Lord is in the midst of his Body generally, whereby each partakes of the particular refreshment and strength given, to be shared for the good of the whole in which there is joint fellowship and communion. When any person afresh turns to the Lord in waiting, this causes the Lord to break forth and the seed of the kingdom to arise and work as medicine in the soul against the powers of darkness.¹²⁶

Barclay gives witness that as this worship is kept to, it becomes easy. The Lord in the natural person, as they turn to the Lord, the Lord in condescension causes the natural one's power to break, as their mind sinks down and waits for the appearance of His life, while at the same time the power of darkness in the soul wrestles and works against the seed. Then the good seed, as the seed arises, will be found to work as medicine, and through the contrary workings of the power of darkness, the seed of the second Adam will be found as an inward striving in the soul as light breaks through the darkness.¹²⁷ From this inward travail, as the darkness seeks to obscure the light, and the light breaks through there will be pain in the soul producing in the body shaking, groaning, sighs, and tears.

¹²⁶ *ibid*, 334-5. Turning to the Lord causes the Lord to break forth, and the Seed of the Kingdom to rise and work as Medicine in the Soul against the Powers of Darkness. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.' 2016, 110-11. While acknowledging its limitations, Graham accepted the Bible as a guide to faith. But he appealed to the authority of Barclay in the *Apology* in support of his claim that the authority of the Scriptures is 'subordinate to the Spirit, from which they have all their excellency and certainty'. As for Barclay's awkward statement, 'Whatsoever any do, pretending to the spirit, which is contrary to the Scripture, is to be accounted and reckoned a delusion of the devil', that could be dealt with by means of a reference to modern scholarship, of which Barclay was necessarily ignorant, and by drawing attention to the multiplicity of voices in the Bible and to the 'progressive' nature of both the morality and the faith that it contains. Graham is on common ground with Barclay in the progressive nature of hermeneutics in which one moves from second person interaction with scripture text to first person encounter with the God of the scriptures. Christianity is first person encounter as was prelapsarian life in the Garden. Coinciding with first person encounter is recognizing the immediacy of the devil in matters of life. Barclay recognizes the demonic as the real enemy over flesh and blood that will deceive those of a second person grasp of scripture only. Graham will encounter the perennial philosophy of the enemy in his travels to India. Christ leads his followers in the perfection of the Father in loving the enemy.

¹²⁷ *ibid*. Turning to the Lord causes the Lord to break forth and the Seed of the 2nd Adam to arise & work as Medicine in the Soul against the Powers of Darkness.

The enemy, as God's children assemble, will attempt to empty the comfort and propagate his dark power by drawing out the mind discursively from the life of God within. As the meeting senses the devil's work and wrestles with him by the armor of light, the power of God breaks through, and in the contrary working of these two opposing powers people are exercised as in a day of battle as the power of truth prevails moving people from groans to thanksgiving and praise.¹²⁸

17 The Conflict is between the Fallen Adam and the New Adam

Barclay instructs that waiting upon the Lord and watching before him is accompanied with many great and precious promises. Waiting is in itself a great and principal duty, as to precede all other duties. Waiting is not only an outward silence of the body but an inward silence of the mind from all imaginations and self-cognitions. Humanity is to be considered twofold: in his natural, unregenerate, and fallen state as old Adam, and in his spiritual and regenerated state as new Adam from where arises the distinction between the 'natural' man (beast) rational and the 'spiritual' man noetic.¹²⁹

Barclay contends that 'natural' worship in sacramental rites and shadow works infused is missing noetic waiting and new covenant substance. 'Natural' worship consists of the imputation of discursive rationalism which maintains old covenant shadow practice without the new covenant

¹²⁸ ibid, 335. Noetic Watching and Waiting in Worship produces a Battle against the Devil and Darkness in the Mind Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 149. By currently fixing his attention in his heart, the hesychast strives to preserve his intellect from all thought. Thoughts may be natural in everyday life but they can also be consequent on satanic influence. In prayer, the hesychast renounces for the time being, to the degree that he finds possible, the needs of his bodily nature. Thoughts of demonic origin, he excludes altogether. This means that the mind at prayer rejects all thought, both natural and demonic.

¹²⁹ ibid, 338. Waiting Worship is Unnatural to the Natural Man-Rational yet Purifying to the Spiritual Man-Noetic Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.' 2016, 94. Something of what went on at 'this Godless College' (London University) and the effect it had on innocent young Quakers can be gauged from a letter from Graham to his parents about a contemporary: Harry Rawlings ... has lost his faith in Christianity, become an Agnostic, and is intending to resign his membership at Midsummer; & of course teach in Friends Schools no more ... I am sorry for all this; and he is by no means a solitary instance. Infact [sic] the young men in our Society who think much are passing through a very serious time of conflict in religious matters; also a good many fellows have talked to me who have many more painful doubts. There can be no doubt that Graham was undergoing something of the same inner conflict as beset Harry Rawlings and others like him. Yet even at this stage he is prepared to think that Quakerism could provide a home for doubters: 'I think Quakerism [Graham's emphasis] rightly understood is the best thing for such fellows; I mean that other sects with so much dogmatism & creed formulating, only repel a broad & thoughtful man'. Barclay would have agreed with Graham that Quakerism, rightly understood, is the best thing for humanity. Quakerism provides the space to wrestle with questions under Divine guidance, and with the path of theosis, to realize guidance from the saints in becoming a saint.

Spirit of the Father and the Son incarnate indwelling. Christianity consists not in scholasticism ‘imputed’ or sacramental rites ‘infused’. Instead, Christianity rests in God as Trinity kataphatic and the Spirit of Christ indwelling unto Theosis being ‘humanity becoming by “Grace indwelling” what God is by nature’. The fruit of second Adam indwelling is different from the root of fallen, ‘natural’, and corrupt Adam scholastically imputed or infused.¹³⁰

18 Waiting in Silence upon the Lord is the singular New Covenant Imperative required in the New Testament

Barclay argues that there is no command given in the New Testament but for the disciple to follow the revelation of the Spirit and to meet together routinely. Praying, preaching, and ministry are always annexed to the assistance, leading, and motions of God’s Spirit which requires silence so as to hear God speak, and the good seed of God’s kingdom to arise. Since humanity in his natural fallen state is excluded from acting or moving in things spiritual, the only way to receive things spiritual is through silence. In being silent, God speaks, and the good seed of God’s kingdom arises.¹³¹

¹³⁰ *ibid*, 339. Rational Worship imputed or infused misses Noetic Waiting and Kataphatic Substance, as New Covenant Worship rests in God as Trinity indwelling unto Theosis. Worship through the Spirit produces fruit in keeping with the 2nd Adam rather than the fallen 1st Adam. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 149. At the moment of the vision of the Eternal Light, and from freedom from death into eternity, the world as we know it is forgotten. Time in the vision is not time for cogitation. Normal discursive thinking ceases. Intellect continues to function but quite differently. So it is surprising when this experience of a sphere void of any materiality is over, it resumes the same thoughts and feelings. The state of vision is the light of Divine love, and this love begets new feelings in the soul and new thoughts about God and the material world.

¹³¹ *ibid*, 340-1. By the Revelation of the Spirit of Christ within, the church receives the will of God in direct correspondence with the Seed of the Kingdom arising. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.’ 2016, 95. Ann Graham had expressed anxiety as to whether Graham was being quite serious enough about religion. He replied, apologising for any pain he may have caused, and adding: You cannot know the painful difficulties I have had to go thro’ to reach the faith in God & in obedience to Christ which I am thankful to say I have, it has been the most serious pursuit of my life for years, and I should feel that a really unnecessary trouble was added to the necessary ones if such a mistaken view should get hold of Mamma’s mind, that I treat serious things flippantly. I do certainly treat flippantly some “evangelicals’ ” statements which seem to me to deserve it, when said evangelicals are not present to have their feelings hurt (4 October, 1885). T.C. Kennedy refers to this letter, and suggests that Graham’s trial of faith may be related to the strongly evangelical tone of the recent Yearly Meeting (8 June, 1883). Barclay stands firm that Christianity comes by the revelation of the Spirit within. Theosis is realized through the seed of Christ arising. Union with God at the heart of Christianity is revealed through transformation. Humility begins with silence and responds to what is heard.

Barclay instructs that strength is renewed as one waits in silence; in the cessation of the natural part. God manifests himself not to the outward person or senses but to the inward soul and spirit. If the soul is thinking or working in her own will, the soul incapacitates her-self from discerning the still small voice of the Spirit and neglects her chief business of waiting upon the Lord. Barclay argues that it is the chief work of a Christian to know the natural will in its motions crucified, that God may move in the act, and in the will noetically.¹³²

Barclay asks should one seek to be terrified from sin by multiplying thoughts of death, hell and judgment, and present to their imagination the joys of heaven, multiplying prayers, and religious performances. Barclay contends that not one iniquity is removed without the secret inward power of God's Spirit and grace. Instead, the multiplying of thoughts of death, hell, and judgment is the product of the natural will, proceeding from self-love, in seeking to save, and not arising from the divine seed of righteousness sown by God as uncreated grace for salvation. Humanities natural arts, parts, and acting's are reprobate and rejected by God in their natural state.¹³³

19 New Birth springs from the Seed of the 2nd Adam as a Mustard Tree springs from a Mustard Seed

The great duty of waiting upon God is exercised by denying self inwardly and outwardly unto mere dependence upon God. Barclay instructs that in abstracting oneself from all working, imagination, and speculation of mind, and being crucified to the natural products, one is fit to receive the Lord who will have no copartner or co-rival to the Lord's glory and power. One being thus stated, the

¹³² *ibid*, 342. The New Covenant requires the Cessation & Crucifixion of the Natural Will in waiting for the Will to be Sanctified & Regenerated by the Spirit Noetically. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 150-1. It is normal for man in his fallen state to struggle against the passions throughout his life but there are two extremes where there is no struggle. The impassable man does not have to wrestle, because the delights suggested by the passion are no temptation, as only the bare idea remains. The one who is subject to the onslaught of thoughts but remains impervious to their power can be termed passion-free. On the other hand total subjection to the passions leads one to be enslaved through meeting the passions halfway.

¹³³ *ibid*, 342-3. New Covenant Righteousness comes through submission to God's regenerating Spirit, Grace, and Kingdom Seed. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 150. The starting-going of spiritual life is the struggle against the passions. If this struggle only meant renouncing worldly pleasures, it would be easy. The second stage in the struggle is when passion, unsatisfied, starts to torment one with all kinds of infirmity. Here the ascetic needs great and continuous patience, since the salutary consequences of resistance are not quick to ensue.

‘mustard’ seed of righteousness which God has sewn in the soul, and which Christ has purchased, the measure of grace and life which is burdened and crucified by the natural thoughts and imaginations, receives place to rise, and becomes a holy birth. This seed is the divine air by which the soul and spirit is leavened. By waiting therein, one comes to be accepted in the sight of God, to stand in God’s presence, to hear Christ’s voice, and to observe the motions of God’s Spirit.¹³⁴

If one acts in the power and spirit of this world in which the prince of darkness rules, one sins in all things and is not acceptable to God. If one acts and ministers in and from God’s power and Spirit, having the understanding influenced and moved by the Spirit and power of God, they are accepted in the sight of God and are ‘*blessed in their doing* (James 1:25).¹³⁵ Barclay contends that it is impossible for the devil to counterfeit silent waiting. In all other matters, the devil may mix with the natural mind, and by transforming, deceive the soul. The devil keeps the natural person from beholding the pure light of Christ, from knowing God’s duty directly, and doing it. The devil can suffer the religiously inclined to work, act, and meditate in their own will.¹³⁶

20 God who is Spirit is to be worshiped in spirit from the Heart

That God is a Spirit (John 4:23-24) and must be worshiped in spirit is so certain that Barclay argues it can suffer no contradiction. Under the Law of Moses, God condescended to dwell within the

¹³⁴ ibid, 343. The New Covenant Kingdom Seed of Righteousness purchased by Christ provides the Air of Rebirth, Leavening & Geniture of Man’s soul & spirit unto Life with God. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 357. The Lord’s love is made known in no other wise than through the Holy Spirit; but the peaceable soul that reserves a pure conscience comes to know God from His works, that He created heaven and earth. This, too, is the working of grace, though as yet in small measures; whereas without grace we cannot come to know God with our minds but are generally drawn to the things of this world—riches, honor, and glory.

¹³⁵ ibid, 344. The Prince of Darkness wars against the Spirit and Spiritual Regeneration which bring forth Godly Actions and Works in this World. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 151. Plunged deep in the heart, the mind by being absorbed in prayer Says itself every image, not only visual but mental, and in this state of purity is deemed worthy to stand before God; and the end product of this shapeless profundity is no longer a passion but authentic life in God.

¹³⁶ ibid, 345. The Devil tricks Natural Persons to work in their own Will by disregarding the Pure Light of Christ’s new covenant Presence. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 151. In his earthly existence in the flesh, man also has feelings that are not sinful – needs that left unsatisfied curtail life, food, sleep, and so on. For brief periods the ascetic may ignore the needs, and if they start threatening with illness, and the ascetic is ready to face death rather than given in, God takes even more care of him. This courageous determination is imperative. Otherwise, there is no avoiding intrusive thoughts, even briefly.

tabernacle, and afterwards to make the temple of Jerusalem his habitation. Under the new covenant, the Lord sees meet to lead his children on a path more heavenly and spiritual, and more easy and familiar; his children to have an eye to the inward glory and kingdom than to an outward glory and kingdom. God has given humanity an example of the inward glory and kingdom in the appearance of his beloved Son, the Lord Jesus Christ, who has and does deliver by suffering and dying at the hands of his enemy, thereby delivering his followers from the devil and the outward enemy.¹³⁷

God is Spirit and will now be worshiped in spirit, in the contrite heart where God reveals himself and dwells. As the Israelite temple was cleansed and purified before the Lord descended and filled the temple, so Barclay instructs that the heart is cleansed and purified of all guilt, thoughts, and imaginations to be made fit for the Lord's dwelling and habitation (Acts 7:48-53).¹³⁸

Prayer according to Barclay is the inward turning of the mind towards God, whereby being secretly touched and awakened by the light of Christ in the conscience, and bowed down under a sense of iniquity, unworthiness, and misery, the mind noetically looks up to God. By joining with the secret sightings of the pure seed of the second Adam, the mind breathes toward Christ, and is constantly breathing secret desires and aspirations towards Him.¹³⁹

Barclay argues that humanities' sin is in neglecting inward watchfulness and retiredness of mind where humanity would feel the Spirit to lead in prayer, and guide in bodily life non-dualistic (John 3:3-8).¹⁴⁰ As to general duties in worship, God is always near and wrestles with humanity by his

¹³⁷ *ibid*, 352-3. The New Covenant Kingdom of the Son is a path & deliverance more Heavenly, Spiritual, and Glorious beginning Inwardly then moving Outward. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 151. The person in authentic life in God discovers that the soul instinctively aspires to God, is like unto Him and is free from passions by nature. In the coming and going of grace man discovers that he has no life in himself, and that his life is in God. Disjunction from God means death. When the soul is deemed worthy of the coming of the divine light, she genuinely lives eternal life, that is, God Himself. And where God is, there is freedom impossible to describe in words, because man is then beyond death and fear.

¹³⁸ *ibid*, 353. Jesus Christ by his Spirit cleanses & actuates the Heart of the Temple he dwells in.

¹³⁹ *ibid*, 365-6. Prayer in silence as Communion with the fullness of God Purifies the Conscience.

¹⁴⁰ *ibid*, 367-8. Worship is to be in Body and Spirit non-dualistically Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.' 2016, 63. When dealing with the question of 'materialism', Graham always

Spirit to turn humanity to himself, so that if humanity will but stand still and cease from evil thoughts, the Lord is near to help. Outward prayer needs a measured motion and influence of the Spirit within.¹⁴¹

Barclay concludes that there is a great difference between general duties between person and person, and particular duties towards God. Worship towards God is spiritual and commanded by God to be performed by the Spirit. General duties answer their end as to humanity, as spiritual duties answer their end as to God. General duties are acceptable to God as done in the fear of God and in his blessing in which God's children do all things.¹⁴² In bodily life and prayer there is no difference between the natural acts of the beast, and the spiritual acts of the human by the Spirit. Both bodily and spiritual acts are to be accompanied by the one Spirit (non-modalistic). Humanity ought not to go about natural acts without the Spirit as humanity ought not to go about spiritual acts without the Spirit. Bodily acts are reprobate in and of themselves without the Spirit.¹⁴³

Barclay claims that humanity sins in not watching for the motion of the Spirit in their praying, in a similar way as humanity sins in not examining themselves before they receive the Eucharist. Disobedience is in not watching and waiting for the Spirit's motion in the like manner of the sacramentalist saying it is unworthy to approach the Lord's Table unworthily.¹⁴⁴

maintained a tone of certainty in favour of the unseen; but the fact that the subject recurs as it does betrays a certain nervousness. A notebook of 1886 contains lecture notes that suggest the way he was thinking: 'The Unseen Reality we crave for. [Are we akin to it?]' 'Consciousness from Physics of Brain ... To base Mind on Matter is to base a Certainty upon an Uncertainty', and again: 'Our Mind must be Noumenal. It must inhere in the Absolute – in Supreme Being ... Matter is a product of Mind.' In Barclay, the essence and energy distinction is unquestionably present but is inaccessible in a Western framework. Graham is dealing with the lack of language from a western framework to deal with the new covenant reality of the kataphatic and apophatic unseen in the nous.

¹⁴¹ *ibid*, 375. The Spirit wrestles with humanity, making humanity aware that the Lord is near to help.

¹⁴² *ibid*, 376. Worship in Body & Spirit is to be One Unified Expression.

¹⁴³ *ibid*. Natural Acts are to be governed by the Spirit; Worship in Body & Spirit is to be One Unified-Uniform Expression.

¹⁴⁴ *ibid*, 377. It is Sin to forgo Watching & Waiting for the Spirit's motion in Prayer. Waiting for the Motion of the Spirit is Learned & Perfected in Time.

21 The burning up of 1st Adam's fallenness comes by God's Purifying Judgment through the 2nd Adam

Humanities propensity in the inherited fallen state is to exalt one's inventions, and mix fallen work and product in service to God. Barclay contends that what is rejected is the seed of the second Adam by which Christ is resurrected within through rebirth of spirit, whereby the old person, the first Adam in the fallen state, passes away, and the new person, through the seed of the second Adam, is cleansed of their passions and the conscience made new through the purging fire and redeeming of the Spirit unto hitting God's mark.¹⁴⁵ That part of self yet alive and ruling loves to follow its own invention more than God's commands.¹⁴⁶

The baptism of Christ which does save is the answer of a good conscience toward God by the resurrection of Jesus Christ within. The good conscience results from God purifying the soul through God's judgment burning up the unrighteous part. Those in whom this takes place are baptized by Christ with the baptism of the Spirit and with fire in justification.¹⁴⁷

Barclay argues that the Quaker opponents stick to and cleave to the old covenant as being more suitable and agreeable to their carnal apprehensions and natural senses infused or imputed (Hebrews 9:1-10). Instead the Quakers travail to lay hold and cleave to the light of the glorious gospel revealed. In all things they follow the gospel of Christ indwelling (Hebrews 9:11-28) as contradistinguished from the carnality of the legal dispensation which, like the Jews, the Quaker adversaries will never be able to bear. Barclay concludes that the Law of Moses, the rule of the old covenant being outward, written on tablets of stone and parchment, is the rule of the Quaker

¹⁴⁵ *ibid*, 381. Man's heavenly nature is inherited through rebirth by the seed of the 2nd Adam unto the being made new by the purging & redeeming fire of the Spirit. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 421. He who bears within himself even a small measure of grace will submit joyously to all authority. He knows that God rules over heaven and earth and the nether regions, over himself and his affairs, over everything in the world, and therefore is always tranquil.

¹⁴⁶ *ibid*, 382. Baptism in the Spirit is the means by which Christians follow God's Commands & Designs unencumbered by weaknesses & preferences.

¹⁴⁷ *ibid*, 390. Baptism is the Answer of a Good Conscience toward God, by the resurrection of Jesus Christ & the Burning up of the Unrighteous Nature in the Soul through God's Judgment.

opponents (Hebrews 10:1-14). But the law of the new covenant is inward and perpetual, written in the heart (Hebrews 10:15-25), as is the Quaker law.¹⁴⁸

22 Being Turned from Darkness to Light, beginning in the Conscience, is the New Covenant *telios* of God

Barclay sees being turned from darkness to light and converted to God is to have the conscience turned towards God, to have put on Christ, being raised with Christ in newness of life, and baptized with the baptism of the Spirit (I Corinthians 3:10-22).¹⁴⁹ Baptism with the Spirit is more than teaching or informing the understanding rationally concerning the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit. The Spirit in baptism reaches to and melts the heart whereby the heart is turned and the understanding informed noetically unto the new person (Acts 15:1-31; I Corinthians 2:14-16).¹⁵⁰

Peter's baptism of Cornelius in Acts 10 did not mandate that water baptism be a standing and perpetual rite. It was not until Acts 15 that the church acted on 'bodily' circumcision as a Jewish rite. Barclay considers circumcision of the heart through purification as the new covenant way.¹⁵¹ Circumcision was used by the Jews as an old covenant rite referring to the flesh. Paul tells of the circumcision of the heart by the Spirit made without hands (Romans 2:28-29). John the Baptist,

¹⁴⁸ *ibid*, 396-7. The New Covenant includes the Law of the Spirit inwardly fulfilled and perpetual in the Mind & Heart noetic through Christ risen and indwelling unto Theosis.

¹⁴⁹ *ibid*, 400. Paul's Ministry was seeing People converted to God, putting on Christ, rising with Christ in newness of life and being baptized with the Spirit. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 357-8. Just as the love of Jesus Christ is beyond our understanding, so we cannot conceive of the depth of His sufferings, because our own love for the Lord is so infinitesimal. But with greater love comes more understanding even of the Lord's sufferings. There is love in small degrees, modest love, and perfect love; and the more perfect our love, the more perfect our knowledge.

¹⁵⁰ *ibid*, 404. Baptism is the Spirit Reaching, Melting, Turning & Informing the Heart unto the new man. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 420-1. The spirit of obedience is necessary not only in monks but everyone. Even the Lord was obedient. The proud and those who are a law unto themselves prevent the indwelling of grace and therefore never know peace of soul; whereas the grace of the Holy Spirit enters with ease into the soul of the obedient, bringing joy and quiet.

¹⁵¹ *ibid*, 407-8. Outward Jewish signs like John's Baptism & bodily Circumcision were addressed in the Council of Jerusalem in Acts 15.

Christ, and his apostles spoke of baptism with the Spirit and with fire which Christ and his apostles make the singular baptism of Christ.¹⁵²

The water of the Papist is not understood to be outward water but signifies a mystical inward cleansing and washing. Being born of water means the same inward cleansing and washing of the Spirit. When Christ spoke of being baptized with fire, it is understood of purification by *metonymy*. Purification is the effect of fire as cleansing is the effect of water. ‘*According to his mercy has he saved us by the washing of regeneration, and the renewing of the spirit*’ (I Peter 3:21).¹⁵³ In John 3:3 the necessity of water is only precept, while being born again of the Spirit is both precept and medium according to Jesus into the triadic fullness of God unto the new person (Matthew 28:18-20).¹⁵⁴ This is Theosis: becoming by Grace indwelling what God is by nature.

Barclay considers that partaking of Christ’s body, flesh, and blood is the light of Christ and seed of the second Adam come physically (incarnationally) and eternally (metaphysically) into the world is different than the Papists, Lutherans, and Calvinists. The light of Christ which reveals iniquity and shows barrenness, nakedness, and emptiness is the body of Christ more than a blessed wafer (Catholic), ‘mysterious’ presence (Lutheran), or symbol (Calvinist). The light of Christ dispels the darkness in hearts, minds, and consciences, leaving the person regenerated in heart and mind unto the new person. Barclay argues that Christ, who is the light come into the world, has no communion with darkness but instead dispels darkness (I Corinthians 10:21).¹⁵⁵

¹⁵² *ibid*, 408. Circumcision of the Flesh is replaced by the New Covenant Circumcision of the Heart as Christ’s baptism of the Spirit.

¹⁵³ *ibid*, 409-10. Inward Purification & Cleansing by Fire-*Metonymy* is the Nature of Christ’s Baptism unto Regeneration & Renewing of spirit.

¹⁵⁴ *ibid*, 410. The Spirit is both Precept & Medium in Baptism (John 3:3)

¹⁵⁵ *ibid*, 418-9. The Light of Christ has no fellowship with the Darkness of the Devil or Iniquity. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 149-50. When the hesychast succumbs to satanic influence man suffers the loss of his godlike freedom and falls away from Divine life. The ascetic label for this state is ‘passion’. The term implies, on the one hand passiveness and servitude, and, on the other, disintegration and death. Whoever committeth sin is a servant of sin. And the servant abides not in the house forever: but the Son abides ever. (John 8:34-35)

Justification being understood as ‘to be made really just’ is proven not by only the etymology of the word but by Scripture argument and experience. The justification of the saint comes under the inward sensation of the soul, for Christ is formed in the mind (the *nous*) where Christ is said to be revealed inwardly (Galatians 2:20; 4:19) and this provides the sense of justification. The Scripture that speaks specifically is Paul stating ‘But when it pleased God, who separated me from my mother’s womb and called me through his grace, *to reveal his Son in me*’ (Galatians 1:15-16).¹⁵⁶ Paul was grieved that he was forced to give the Corinthians instructions concerning outward things and to build upon such things, that the Galatians did not go forward in Christ’s life but rather were stuck in the ‘beggarly elements’ of the old covenant law-shadow (Galatians 4:9).¹⁵⁷

23 Application of Christ’s Justification results in Love, Peace, and Righteousness through the Conscience renewed

Barclay argues that ‘conscience’ is to be understood as the persuasion of mind arising from the understanding being possessed with the truth or falsity of something. If a person should go against their conscience they would sin (Matthew 5:37; James 5:12). What a person does contrary to their conscience, though their faith is wrong, is in no ways acceptable to God. God instructs and purifies the conscience noetically through the soul.¹⁵⁸ Barclay contends that the chief end of religion is to redeem humanity from the spirit and vain conversation of this world, and to lead into communion with God before whom if we fear always we are accounted happy.¹⁵⁹

Barclay argues that military war is not lawful under the new covenant gospel. Neither defense nor offense was lawful for the Israelites in their own will, who were to inquire of an oracle from the Lord before taking action. The Israelite war of the old covenant is a figure of the new covenant war

¹⁵⁶ Barclay’s Works III, *Apology Vindicated*, 425-6. Justification is Jesus Christ Indwelling & Forming the Mind-Noetic

¹⁵⁷ Robert Barclay, *An Apology for the True Christian Divinity*, 443-4. The Jewish Beggarly Elements were a stumbling block to Movement Forward in Christ’s life.

¹⁵⁸ *ibid*, 451. The Conscience & Mind is influenced by God Noetically concerning the Belief of the Falsity or Truth of anything.

¹⁵⁹ *ibid*, 474. Inward Communion & Fellowship with God is the Chief End of All Religion

within the heart. The inward war of the Christian is against the devil, the world, and the flesh.

Barclay contends that Christ in the Gospel teaches a new patience, forbidding revenge for an injury, for love. Christ's love is what the Law given through Moses did not require. Tertullian (160-220) in stating against Marcion of Pontus (110-155) says that by Christ saying 'love your enemies' (Matthew 5:44), the new covenant found more than it lost with the old covenant.¹⁶⁰ In the time of Clement of Alexandria (150-215), Christians were so far from wars that Clement testified that Christians had no sign of violence. Barclay affirms that war is expressly forbidden by Christ which was granted to the Jew in old covenant times because of hardness of heart. Israel's outward war in taking the promise land is now a figure of the inward war of the heart in returning to the kingdom of God. Outward war is not lawful under the gospel.¹⁶¹

24 Repentance leads to the Abundant Life of Productivity, and the Wisdom of God's Kingdom

Christ died to take away humanities sin, provided one does not resist the grace of the Spirit purchased by Christ's death, so that faith and repentance be fashioned in Christ's death and resurrection. By Christ's death, one dies, and by Christ's resurrection, one rises through uncreated Grace as God.¹⁶² The nature of the riches and long-suffering of God towards humanity (Romans 2:4) is to lead to repentance. Eternal life is proposed as the reward for those who by not despising the riches given are lead to repentance, and continue in well-doing. Barclay proposes that this is done through the long-suffering uncreated grace of God.¹⁶³

¹⁶⁰ *ibid*, 519-20. Loving your Enemy by winning the inward War against the Devil, World & Flesh is a New Covenant standard higher than that of the Old Covenant. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 424. When the soul is humbled, and the Spirit of God is in her, man blissfully rejoices in spirit in the love of God. The soul which she feels the Lord's mercy knows no fear of any earthly calamity – her longing is to abide forever in humility before God, and to love her fellow-men and enemy. But if a soul be puffed up, then her day of rejoicing is over, for grace forsakes her and she can no longer pray with a pure heart, and evil thoughts come to harass her.

¹⁶¹ *ibid*, 520. Carnal War was granted to the Jew in their time because of Hardness of Heart, the Law of the Spirit found more than it lost in Christ saying Love your Enemies.

¹⁶² Barclay's Works III, *Apology Vindicated*, 361-2. Faith & Repentance is fashioned within through Christ's Death and Resurrection.

¹⁶³ *ibid*, 380. The Long-Suffering Grace of God leads to Repentance & Eternal Life in those who Despise not God's Riches.

Barclay suggests that saving grace includes the kingdom talents. Christ makes use of the parable of the talents to compare the kingdom of heaven to saving grace. The same comparison includes the five virgins who had little in their lamps, but through patient endurance, improved their supply. *Well done, good and faithful servant, enter into the joy of the Lord* is heard by the two servants who wait and apply their grace given kingdom talents (Matthew 25:29; 13:12).¹⁶⁴

The improvement of the grace-talent notwithstanding, the grace-seed of the second Adam is in the ungodly noetically, but the ungodly are not denominated by the seed but by ungodliness. The grace-seed is a kataphatic substance, since no accident can be in a subject unless the subject be denominated therefrom (Acts 17:26-29). Barclay instructs that to be denominated by the grace-substance of the second Adam is to receive the accident of godliness.¹⁶⁵

The person in whom the seed of the second Adam and Spirit of uncreated grace is manifest may be denominated ‘graced’ and enlightened. But, if they do not partake of the seed, nor suffer the seed to work in them they do not receive the accident of the supernatural seed.¹⁶⁶ Many that have had a day of visitation have resisted the grace and mercy of that day. Barclay denies that people receive from Christ only what is common and natural, but affirms that people receive comprehension as apprehension supernaturally. Again, by receiving or apprehending from Christ, humanity may receive, by virtue of the power of the light of Christ, supernatural comprehension (II Corinthians 12:1-4). The light of Christ being saving and supernatural because humanity is commanded to believe in the light remains unremoved (the Quaker position).¹⁶⁷

¹⁶⁴ ibid, 380-1. Talents are Kingdom Gifts Received by Grace & applied in Grace filled anticipation of the Bridegroom.

¹⁶⁵ ibid, 389-90. Availing Ourselves of the Kataphatic Substance-Seed of the second Adam as uncreated Grace produces the Accident of Godliness; Receiving the Grace, Light & Kingdom Seed Noetic results in Theosis.

¹⁶⁶ ibid, 390. Availing ourselves of the Substance-Kingdom Seed Noetic produces the Accident-Theosis.

¹⁶⁷ ibid, 393-4. Universal Grace as the supernatural Light of Christ apprehended brings Comprehension of the Kingdom in those receiving.

Barclay instructs that grace softens the heart as fire softens wax. By fire, the nature of the metal is changed. The sun's hardening clay and softening wax shows that the sun does not lose its effect though the operation of the rays in the subject produce varied effects. Although the sun works a disposition toward the producing its effects in some creatures, which are affected by the creature's reception or non-reception; the desired accident of the sun is either enhanced or hindered. For Barclay the issue surrounds the essence of God in relation to the energy of God; reason discursive and encounter noetic leading to the conversion of the person through restored communion with God, or eternal separation through hardening towards God.¹⁶⁸

24 The Work of Justification is Cooperative and Synergistic with Christ Within

Barclay is adamant that justification does not proceed from the dim light of nature. Instead, where the seed in the soil is received, it justly grows, producing fruit by influence of the sun and rain. So it is with the spiritual seed of the second Adam which God is never wanting in giving his heavenly influence towards the seed's growth and deification.¹⁶⁹ Brown supposes that Christ's righteousness and death without, even before 'any work' the righteousness makes the person righteous. Barclay affirms that reconciliation and remission of sins is by the death of Christ without (deicide-II Corinthians 5:21; Hebrews 9:28). It is through Christ's death without (Hebrews 2:9), that the door is opened so that all may gain peace by the offer of Christ, if they do not reject Christ's offer within.

¹⁶⁸ *ibid*, 399-400. The Essence-Apophatic & Energy-Kataphatic coupled with Reception-Noetic leads to Christian Conversion as Theosis. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.' 2016, 102. In his Manchester Conference speech (1925) he declared: 'Sanctification, complete surrender to the will of God, stands out in undimmed outline, as the plain message of Christ and the scientifically reasonable thing to do'. Surrender of the will, identified with sanctification, was the appropriate procedure for modern man as well as being the message of early Friends. The difference was that for Graham this was a voluntary act, whereas there was something quasi-magical about sanctification for evangelicals of the holiness movement, as propagated by David Updegraff, John Henry Douglas, Douglas Clark and others. Edwin Bronner finds that 'the doctrine of "instant conversion and sanctification" seemed bizarre and unacceptable' to British Friends'. It remains the case that holiness and sanctification were important elements in the Quakerism of Graham and his generation of Quakers. For Barclay, justification was a progressive thing in that the unrighteousness of man was replaced by the righteousness of God through mortification. While Barclay recognizes the call to perfection in the shadow scriptures, he speaks of sanctification through the surrendered will to the spiritual seed of the second Adam. God's kingdom becomes reality in those of fertile soil while remaining a parable in those of hard, stony, and thorny soil. These of fertile soil receive the seed producing new growth through mortification.

¹⁶⁹ *ibid*, 410-11. New Covenant Justification continues indefinitely by the light, bread, and nurture of Christ.

No one can be said to be justified or appear properly just until Christ is received in the heart. Christ renews, purifies, and makes just (Galatians 2:20). Barclay's view of justification is fluid, in that justification coincides inseparably with sanctification, in that a person is being justified at the same time as being sanctified.¹⁷⁰ Humanity is justified through the inward birth working the effect as in the mustard seed finding germination (Matthew 13:31). Regeneration is the work of the Spirit in humanity by which humanity is really made just. The righteous works that proceed from the inward birth and the Spirit are the consequence of regeneration unto 'hitting the mark' of God's prelapsarian intent.¹⁷¹

Barclay asks Brown how one can be just while at the same time in their person unjust. Brown provides no explanation. Brown concludes that sin, committed by a saint, does not un-saint the saint, nor destroys their condition as 'just', yet accuses me (Robert Barclay) of antinomianism. Christ has

¹⁷⁰ *ibid*, 415-16. Justification is complete by Christ without, and Sanctification & Justification are continuous through Christ working within. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.' 2016, 102-3. The degree to which the older generation of Friends were troubled by developments in the 1880s can be gauged from pencilled notes in the copy of *A Reasonable Faith* held in the Bevan-Naish collection at Woodbrooke Library: 'If this be true and my dear friends are right so far, then there are 2 sorts of saved sinners - one whose sins have been trifling & the above account of salvation [previous footnote 168] is enough for them; and others whose sins are so heavy - so deep that they need the Lords personal expiation for them - for each sin of theirs. And I Arthur John Naish (1816-1889) am one of the latter!' Naish needed the full-blooded evangelical account of the atonement. The transformation that the Society was undergoing would leave him and others in a state of bereavement. [Cf. Pink Dandelion, 'Those who leave and those who feel left', *Journal of Contemporary Religion*, Vol. 17, no. 2, 2002, 213-228.] Barclay addresses the dilemma of justification through the pure justification of Christ without and the purifying justification of Christ within. This is the pure teaching of salvation through theosis to a derivative imputed justification. The statement by Naish reveals the incompleteness of imputed justification addressed by Barclay as indwelling justification through Christ within.

¹⁷¹ *ibid*, 419-20. Justification through the Inward birth and Regeneration of the Spirit produces the Consequence of Righteous Works. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.' 2016, 103. By the time Worsdell wrote *The Gospel of Divine Help* he had taught himself to believe that the concept of God that had been presented to him in his youth was not only repellent but also untrue. Christ shows us, by exemplifying lovable qualities in himself, that God possesses these same qualities, as we know and love them in other human beings: he shows us 'that truth, justice, and compassion, are not in God things different in kind from what they are in ourselves'. Or, in the words of the beloved American Quaker poet J.G. Whittier, 'I cannot think that good in Him, Which evil is in me'. What Worsdell and Whittier describe is the righteousness and goodness that comes from God's purifying work within, being worked out as hitting the mark of God's prelapsarian intent. The 2nd Adam is the pure human and administers purifying effects which become righteous works. God is good and we are made good through Christ within. To quote Athanasius of Alexandria 'He [the Incarnation of the eternal Word] assumed humanity that we might become God. He manifested Himself by means of a body in order that we might perceive the Mind of the unseen Father. He endured shame from men that we might inherit immortality. He Himself was unhurt by this, for He is impassable and incorruptible: but by His own impassability He kept and healed the suffering men on whose account He endured.' (*On the Incarnation*, 2013, pg. 69)

justified the person physically without, and now justifies the person metaphysically within through Christ indwelling. Brown's epistemology and theological nominalism prohibits justification in 'what God is by nature humanity becomes by grace' through the resurrected seed of the second Adam.¹⁷²

26 Christ Formed in the Mind Noetically is the *telios* of Christ's indwelling Habitation

Real justification falls under the inward sensation of the soul, for Christ is formed in the mind (the *nous*) noetically, where Christ is said to be revealed inwardly, and gives the real sense of justification (I Corinthians 2:14-16). The Scripture that speaks so is Paul stating '*But when it pleased God, who separated me from my mother's womb and called me through his grace, to reveal His Son in me*' Galatians 1:15-16.¹⁷³ Barclay contends that the works wrought by the Spirit in the saint are pure works necessary to salvation. People ought not to call the Spirit of God in his children 'filthy rags'. All the works wrought by the Spirit are pure which Brown and his brethren deny (Matthew 12:30-33; Hebrews 6:6-8).¹⁷⁴

¹⁷² *ibid*, 421. Justification in being made Just by Christ Without and now by Christ Within rejects licentious Antinomianism for Godliness through Christ's kataphatic Indwelling.

¹⁷³ *ibid*, 425-6. Justification is Jesus Christ Indwelling & Forming the Mind-Noetic. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.' 2016, 114. The fact that many evangelical Friends united with the liberal wing in resisting the imposition of a 'creed' shows that the evangelicals were not always on the side of dogma and against freedom. Quakers such as Jonathan Hodgkin, while they might distrust the 'unsound' views of those who sought to incorporate modern thought into their Quakerism, might be just as attached as the young rebels to patterns of worship established in the seventeenth century, if for different reasons. Nevertheless, the Yearly Meeting's resistance to the attempt to bring a doctrinal test of orthodoxy into the Society must be understood as a victory for those, like Graham, who wished to see Quakerism remain a 'mystical' faith, finding its inspiration within and not in outward forms of words. The work of the Barclay amongst those who espoused a Puritan (evangelical) Christianity of his day coincides with Christians in Graham's day who maintained the true center of Christianity as the eternal Word incarnate and the living word of the Spirit within the heart of humanity. This is a defense, pure and simple, of new covenant Christianity leading to theosis which would be subverted by evangelicalism. The shadow scriptures and the creeds under the auspices of the Holy Spirit (Acts 15:28) were secondary to Christ who brings freedom from sin and bodily death through theosis.

¹⁷⁴ *ibid*, 428-9. Cleansing by the Spirit of God as Grace & Fire makes ones works Pure. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991,420. The obedient soul is beloved of the Holy Spirit, and soon knows the Lord and receives the gift of prayer of the heart.

Brown concludes that Barclay affirms a person may be regenerated without the least help of the grace of God which Barclay abhors, as there cannot be a greater falsehood. The clean water of the Spirit passing through an unclean pipe is the cleansing within of the person being regenerated.¹⁷⁵

Brown defines perfection as the sincerity and integrity in which the whole person is changed so that they are born a new creation, sanctified wholly in mind, heart, spirit, affections, conscience, memory, and body in small degrees; yielding impartial obedience to God's precepts. This view of perfection Barclay can agree with in part, but Brown refuses to dismiss breaking Christ's commands daily in thought, word and deed. Barclay agrees that in God's house there are diverse sizes and degrees of people but disagrees that it is necessary for people, in whatever degree they find themselves to sin daily in thought, word, and deed. Barclay affirms that to grow in grace is to put off the old person who is corrupt and to put on the new person by mortifying its members, but disagrees that it is necessary to sin daily in thought, word, and deed. Obedience to the gospel does not make the gospel commands less nor does having more sins make the vilest sinner less needful of fulfilling Christ's commands. Freedom from sin for the purpose of hitting God's mark eliminates pride and security, and increases humility and diligence. The grace of rebirth brings one to diligent watchfulness, holy fear, humility, and the keeping of Christ's commands.¹⁷⁶

27 Barclay's view of Purification in Justification coincides with the Church Fathers and the shadow Scriptures

What Barclay argues for is spoken of in the Church Fathers and written in the shadow Scriptures being that the uncreated Spirit is able to bring momentary and progressive freedom from sin in this

¹⁷⁵ *ibid*, 429. Cleansing by the Spirit of God as Grace & Fire brings forth Regeneration.

¹⁷⁶ *ibid*, 431-2. Grace of rebirth brings one into the Saintly nature of the New Person eliminating pride & security and increasing humility & diligence. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 420. The obedient man has surrendered himself to God's will, wherefore if given the gifts of freedom and rest in God, and he prays with mind untrammelled; but the proud and disobedient cannot pray with a single mind, however austere they may live. They know neither the manner of the working of grace nor whether the Lord has given them their sins. But the obedient man is conscience without a shadow of a doubt that his sins are forgiven him, because he feels the presence of the Holy Spirit in his soul.

life. The Fathers believe that humanity might be free from sin by grace though none are free from sin in all their life. Barclay contends that this is different from the willful Pelagians.¹⁷⁷ It is contrary to God's wisdom to make freedom from sin impossible except for only the saints in heaven. Those joined to sin are disjoined from God since the saints are said to be '*partakers of the divine nature*' (II Peter 1:4) and to be '*one spirit with God*' (I Corinthians 6:17). Regeneration does not plead for sinlessness, the necessity of pressing after sinlessness, and the possibility of obtaining sinlessness after regeneration is begun. To the degree humanity is joined to sin, regeneration is retarded. Yet Barclay understands that perfection begins where some parts are yet to be mortified. God can have fellowship with his own work in the soul, and with the soul, so far as the soul is sanctified, but no farther.¹⁷⁸ Brown charges Barclay with Pelagianism in maintaining that the possibility of not falling from grace depends on man's will. Instead, Barclay maintains that the regeneration of the saint comes by the uncreated light and Spirit of Christ inhabiting the saint, bringing forth the new creation.¹⁷⁹

Barclay instructs that God begins and perfects humanities condition by working with the will. Humanity performs in cooperation with the operant strength God provides through the seed of the second Adam and the Spirit of Pentecost. Paul alleges the possibility he might fall, reproves those who are too secure, and shows that where sin is there is always ground for jealousy. Paul considered it necessary to keep under his body to subdue sin that he not become reprobate (I Corinthians 9:27).¹⁸⁰

There will be sometimes an inward struggle in the worshiper against the power of darkness and the devil so that the body will be strangely moved by the power of God. This is confirmed by the

¹⁷⁷ *ibid.*, 434. Quakers with the Fathers reject freedom from sin by man's natural strength.

¹⁷⁸ *ibid.*, 435. Perfection is the Pathway of Mortification unto Partaking of the Divine Nature.

¹⁷⁹ *ibid.*, 444. The uncreated Spirit of Grace is the effectual operant in the saint.

¹⁸⁰ *ibid.*, 447. Perseverance in Synergy with God is the way of sin being subdued and strength being restored which is Theosis.

Presbyterian, Robert Fleming.¹⁸¹ Outward distractions are known to draw into temptation. Humanity must be delivered from temptation as part of restoring God's kingdom. Barclay counters that Quakers did not borrow '*Turning their Mind Inward*' from John Stillinfleet's book or from Johannes Taulerus (1300-1361) of which Quakers are unfamiliar.¹⁸²

ORTHODOX SCHOLARSHIP AND CONCLUSION

Bradshaw instructs that a description in Paul's writings of divine *energeia* is Paul's reference to God's perfecting *energeia* in him. He speaks of himself as 'striving according to Christ's working, which works in me mightily' (Colossians 1:29).¹⁸³ The *energeia* of Christ works within Paul, transforming him, so that from that point onward Paul is the object of God's activity while at the same time he expresses his struggle to promote the gospel, Paul being the agent or conduit through whom God is working.¹⁸⁴ In this there is nothing in Christ's working which prevents Paul's action from remaining his own.

Paul has described vividly his various trials and excursions. At Paul's conversion to restored communion with God, Paul is challenged by Christ to quit kicking against the pricks or goads (Acts 9:5). Bradshaw takes this to mean that the divine *energeia* at work in Saul before becoming Paul becomes Paul's own *energeia* through Christ in Paul. In the union between Christ and Paul, Paul has achieved freedom from self-deception leading to purification.¹⁸⁵

¹⁸¹ *ibid.*, 474-5. The Power of God Noetic sometimes moves the Worshiper in inward Struggle against the powers of darkness and the devil.

¹⁸² *ibid.*, 480-1. Worship in silent waiting includes the removal of temptations. William Smith (d. 1673) writes a defense of the people called Quakers in 1662 (reissued 1663) response to John Stillingfleet's *Shetihah* [sic], Rector of Beekingham in Lincolnshire in which he declared many perverse things against the people of God called Quakers.

¹⁸³ Bradshaw, David. *Aristotle East and West: Metaphysics and the Division of Christendom*. Cambridge University Press, 2004, 121

¹⁸⁴ *ibid.*, 121

¹⁸⁵ *ibid.*

Colossians 1:29 and Galatians 1:16 reveal that Paul understands the presence of the divine in human life through synergy being humanities cooperation with God from within. Paul writing to the Thessalonians states that he gives thanks that they received his word ‘not as word of man, but as it is in truth, the word of God, which effectively worketh (*energeia*) in you that believe’ (I Thessalonians 2:13).¹⁸⁶ Bradshaw underscores that it is human words and deeds which God makes His own: the word that Paul spoke is also the word of God which is active in those who receive it in faith. That human acts can also be divine acts is affirmed by Paul in Philippians 2:12-13 where humanity is to ‘work out their own salvation with fear and trembling while it is God who works (*energeia*) in you too will and to do of his good pleasure’. The exhortation to act is coupled with God who is acting. Neither negates the other as the Philippians are both the objects of God’s working and the conduit by which God works through their obedience with fear and trembling.¹⁸⁷ The spirit of God working and acting in humanity, and humanities working and acting as Christ’s Body physical is uniform with Barclay.

Bradshaw claims that Christian authors in the two centuries following Paul speak of divine indwelling in terms of a coalescence of human and divine *energeia*. In this they tend to limit the use of *energeia* to miraculous cases such as prophecy and speaking in tongues, and warn against the possibility of demon indwelling.¹⁸⁸ Bradshaw notes that the *Shepherd of Hermas*, written between 100-150 A.D., presents human character traits as *energeia* of the angel of righteousness which are purity, holiness, contentment, and ‘every good deed’, in contrast with the traits of the angel of wickedness which are anger, bitterness, gluttony, lust, and pride.¹⁸⁹ Justin Martyr (100-165) speaks

¹⁸⁶ *ibid*, 121-2

¹⁸⁷ *ibid*, 122

¹⁸⁸ *ibid*, 123

¹⁸⁹ *ibid*.

of the *energeia* of evil demons leading people into foul deeds.¹⁹⁰ The fruit of God's Spirit is evidence of people filled with the Spirit.

Norman Russell in his analysis of the doctrine of deification in the Greek patristic tradition states that Justin Martyr who had considered the work of the Stoics, and had for a while satisfied his thirst for 'the science of being and the knowledge of truth' from the Platonists, became dissatisfied that either could articulate the *telos* of seeing God as the supreme cause of all things because the Platonists in particular were more focused on morality than being.¹⁹¹ Justin concluded that no one will see God 'except he who shall have lived righteously, purified by righteousness and every other virtue'.¹⁹² But the full possession of the divine *logos* can only take place through the personal knowledge of the *incarnate logos* that comes by grace, via baptism and the Eucharist.¹⁹³ Baptism is 'the bath of repentance and knowledge' as it cleanses the soul from the sins of anger, avarice, envy, and hatred which precludes one's knowledge of God.¹⁹⁴ The knowledge of God is not external like 'natural' knowledge but is internal which comes by living life through participating in Christ's life within.¹⁹⁵ New birth and illumination through baptism is nurtured by the Eucharist in receiving Christ's flesh and blood to nourish bodily transformation. Such inward conformity to Christ is equivalent to the believer's restoration to the pre-fallen Adam state which Scripture shows to have been divine.¹⁹⁶ While Barclay does not use the language of Fox in reentering the Garden of Eden through the flaming swords, he does articulate the way in which purification returns one to pre-fallen relationship with the Lord God. This relationship implicitly affects self-other relationships.

¹⁹⁰ *ibid.*

¹⁹¹ Russell, Norman. *The Doctrine of Deification in the Greek Patristic Tradition*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004, 96.

¹⁹² *ibid.* 97

¹⁹³ *ibid.*, 98

¹⁹⁴ *ibid.*

¹⁹⁵ *ibid.*

¹⁹⁶ *ibid.*

Chapter five has revealed the place of the essence and energy of God in the purification of the Christian. This corresponds with the ‘real justification’ for which Barclay argues rather than the metaphorical cleansing through Protestant believe-ism, or the Catholic infused righteousness through sacramental infusion. Purification includes the purification of the disordered passions of the heart through the fire of the Spirit of Pentecost, and restoration of sight toward God’s original creation intent. The purification of the Christian coincides with the topic of the next chapter being the universal call of God on humanity, as it is God who calls, and it is the human ‘being’ purified as Christ’s Body physical, who organically participates in that call.

CHAPTER 6: Barclay and the Universal Call of God

INTRODUCTION: Chapter 6 opens with what recent scholarship has said about Barclay, reveals the place of the universal call of God in Barclay using the Lonergan method, and concludes with scholarship on the universal call of God in Eastern Orthodoxy. This chapter is important in that for Barclay, Christianity provides the universal call of God on all humanity following upon the new covenant witness of God in all humanity through the gospel Incarnation and the Spirit of Pentecost. The new covenant witness of God is centered metaphysically within humanities inherited fallen condition from the first Adam resulting from the seed of the resurrected Jesus Christ, the second Adam indwelling. This is the universal evangelical principle opening the way to restored prelapsarian communion with the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit through every person's day of visitation. This call of God to lived discipleship, as hitting the mark of God's original righteous intent goes beyond the infused righteousness of the Papists, the imputed righteousness of the Reformer, and is a call to incarnational life as Christ's Body.

BARCLAY SCHOLARSHIP RELATED TO THE UNIVERSAL CALL OF GOD

Michael Birkel in his 2018 *Quakers Reading Mystics* concludes his chapter on Robert Barclay and John Cassian with a question by Anglican Owen Chadwick 'Does mysticism need a church'? Chadwick goes on to say that the individual experience of the divine passes beyond the memory of biblical texts and every other thought, concluding with 'Does it also pass beyond sacraments or sermons'?¹ This chapter will demonstrate that the seed of new covenant Christianity in Barclay

¹ Birkel, Michael. *Quakers Reading Mystics*. Brill Publishing, Leiden, Netherlands, Issue 1.2, 2018, 22.

passes through all time and space to all people metaphysically through the eternal second Adam, the Father, and the Spirit by sovereign design.

Birkel's 2019 chapter on Robert Barclay and Kabbalah in *Quakers and Mysticism*² draws from Barclay's *only* two combined Propositions V and VI in his *Apology*, 'Concerning the Universal Redemption by Christ, and also the Saving and Spiritual Light, wherewith every Man is enlightened' [emphasis mine].³ Here Birkel affirms that the Light, of divine origin, is available universally to all people.⁴ This chapter will demonstrate the reason why Barclay carefully combines these two propositions on the new covenant second Adam born in human flesh, crucified, resurrected, ascended, and come again metaphysically in his glorified body within each person as 'Light'. The contrast between Jesus Christ indwelling all as seed and Jesus Christ inhabiting the Christian as Lord will be exploited through Barclay's use of Jewish and Christian texts.

Madeleine Ward in her 2017 thesis on the 'The Intellectual Context for the Development of Quakerism, 1647-1700' begins in her introduction with the universal possibility of an intimate and animated communion with the immanent presence of Christ dwelling the individual.⁵ Ward acknowledges in Fox's writing concerning the righteous seed of God, and the word of the living God manifest in all consciences, that Christ is both present in the human heart and in heaven.⁶ The Light of Christ was something other than the Pelagian self-will but was the perfect and perfecting Presence in human hearts, complete in its divine nature offering the universal possibility of union with the Divine.⁷ The opponents to this belief were horrified that Christ might dwell in sinners as

² Kershner, Jon, editor. *Quakers and Mysticism: Comparative and Syncretic Approaches to Spirituality*. Michael Birkel: Robert Barclay and Kabbalah. Palgrave Macmillan, 2019.

³ *ibid*, 85-6

⁴ *ibid*, 86

⁵ Ward, Madeleine. 'The Intellectual Context for the Development of Quakerism, 1647-1700'. PhD dissertation submitted to Wolfson College, University of Oxford, July 2017, 8.

⁶ *ibid*, 99

⁷ *ibid*, 100

well as saints.⁸ Ward cites evidence from George Whitehead (1669) to support the association between Quakers and Catholics in the Quaker rejection of Reformed Protestant imputed righteousness (believe-ism) and the Catholic belief in the universal bestowal of grace.⁹ Ward notes Barclay's acknowledgment of both the seed and light in reference to the universal witness of Christ.¹⁰ While Ward acknowledges that Christ's incarnate identity comprises a physical body united to God in all three persons, his 'body' also, even before the resurrection provided salvation for all throughout the ages.¹¹ Richard Vickris who was the only Quaker to receive a death sentence in England (d. 1700) affirmed and defended that the universal light of Jesus Christ was the only epistemological certainty of the 'Real Spiritual Substance'.¹² In 1993 George Whitehead positively asserted at the second day meeting in London the universal possibility of salvation and the vital necessity of the experiential knowing of Christ, while also stressing that this did not preclude affirmation of the historical truths of Christianity.¹³ This chapter will demonstrate the universal and metaphysical nature of Christ's bodily death and resurrection meant for all humanity past, present, and future beyond derivative Platonism or Neo-Platonism, and that Jesus Christ is eternal to human creation, and anticipated bodily through old covenant Judaism.

Yasuharu Nakano in his 2011 dissertation 'Self and Other in the Theology of Robert Barclay', states that Barclay's universal redemption which is core in his theology has long been misread in Liberal ideology.¹⁴ Nakano considers universal redemption in Barclay's soteriology to be accessed through

⁸ *ibid*, 117

⁹ *ibid*, 135. Ward draws on George Whitehead's *The divinity of Christ* (1669) to distance Quakers from Reformers

¹⁰ *ibid*, 163

¹¹ *ibid*, 168

¹² *ibid*, 190 Ward notes that Vickris was the only Quaker to receive a death sentence in England – which, notably, came three years after the last religiously-motivated execution of a Catholic on English soil. Maryann S. Feola

¹³ *ibid*, 235 George Whitehead's *The Christian doctrine [sic] and society of... Quakers* is illuminating, as the Second Day Morning Meeting sent more copies of this pamphlet to the New World in 1693 than any other publication.

¹⁴ Nakano, Yasuharu. 'Self and Other in the Theology of Robert Barclay'. PhD dissertation submitted to the University of Birmingham, April 2011, 8.

‘passiveness’ or ‘self-denial’.¹⁵ Nakano points out that universal redemption in Arminianism was rejected by five point Calvinists at the Synod of Dort (1618-19).¹⁶ However, the universal nature of Christ’s redemption is clearly expressed in the Bible (Hebrews 2:9, I Timothy 2:6, I John 2:2).¹⁷ Barclay stood on the side of the unlimited nature of Christ’s salvation and rejected the common applications of universal redemption. The Arminians gave too much strength to man’s will, and the Calvinists misconstrue the new covenant nature of God’s sovereignty.¹⁸ Barclay in his combined fifth and sixth propositions advocates for the ‘Inward Light’, ‘Day of Visitation’, and ‘Passiveness’ to refute the double predestination of the Calvinists while also arguing against the ‘human’ achieved salvation by the Arminians.¹⁹ Nakano claims that Fox and Barclay are uniform in their position on human depravity and on the new covenant light of Christ within the conscience of all humanity. Fox asserts that reprobation lives in human attitude, not in God, for God has bestowed the light upon all people through Christ’s unifying death and has revealed the way of salvation in all people.²⁰ Nakano concludes that in Barclay the new covenant condition of co-existence in self-other relationships *becomes* the location of perfection, God’s Kingdom, and where Christian truth is realized [emphasis mine]. The organic and communal maturation (and maintenance) of the Body of Christ is the lived embodiment of Christian truth.²¹

Alan Sell centers Barclay’s use of the Church Fathers to coincide with the Scripture testimony through his quoting of the Fathers of the first four centuries concerning the universal salvation of humanity. Barclay’s case is that the universal call of the gospel is meaningless if the reprobation of

¹⁵ *ibid*, 19

¹⁶ *ibid*, 27

¹⁷ *ibid*, 27

¹⁸ *ibid*, 29

¹⁹ *ibid*, 29-30

²⁰ *ibid*, 62-3

²¹ *ibid*, 233

any is predestined.²² Sell concludes that while most Quakers accept the universalism of Barclay and of early Friends, some are happy to drop this particularity. It is on this point especially that Sell is convinced that Barclay could have used the Fathers further.²³ This chapter will demonstrate that the influence of the Fathers in Barclay is significant to this end.

Elton Trueblood in his 1968 work on Robert Barclay highlights that the universal evangelical principle is applied to all people whose faith is clearly and forthrightly Christ centered. Trueblood claims that emphasis on the centrality of Christ, as truly revealing the Father, was the most obvious single feature of powerful early Quakerism. It was not divinity in some vague sense, but Christ Himself who reached the seeker.²⁴ Trueblood considers that Barclay followed in Fox's footsteps in stating that this is the spiritual day of Christ's appearance, wherein Christ is again revealing the *ancient paths* of truth and righteousness [emphasis mine]. This is the voice of the One who said, 'Come unto me'.²⁵ Trueblood refers to the evangelical nature of 'new covenant' Christianity which combines mind and heart²⁶ into what this chapter argues becomes noetic knowing. This chapter will demonstrate that in Barclay's thought each person was inclined to sin but was never wholly forsaken by the heavenly Visitant. It was the 'Light' being truly Christ resurrected, ascended, and come again as seed in the human heart which encourages, but also reproves, revealing to all their missing the mark of God's original righteous intent, and the way forward in the 'ancient' path.²⁷

BARCLAY AND THE UNIVERSAL CALL OF GOD [LONERGAN METHOD]

²² Sell, Alan P. F. Robert Barclay (1648-1690), *The Fathers and the Inward, Universal Saving Light: A Tercentenary Reappraisal*. School of Advanced Study, University of London, *The Journal of the Friends' Historical Society*, Vol 56 No 3 1992, 217.

²³ *ibid*, 222

²⁴ Trueblood, Elton. *Robert Barclay*, Harper & Row Publishers, New York, 1968, 242.

²⁵ *ibid*.

²⁶ *ibid*, 243

²⁷ *ibid*.

1 The breathing seed of the 2nd Adam calls those claiming Infusion, Imputation, or Election to hear the Shepherd and Bishop of their Soul

Barclay argues that it was not the later reformers' way in which the Quakers walked but was the way which the Lord's arm drew them as His seed implanted suffered like a cart under sheaves (Amos 2:13). It wasn't until the Quakers were delivered from the later reformers that the Quakers were raised unto life and dominion.²⁸ Barclay believes that the Lord has a people in Babylon with the breathing seed of the second Adam within who calls them out from the dry mountains of dead profession to return to the Shepherd and Bishop of their souls. In regard to the breathing seed in the Papists with their infusion, and the later reformers with their imputation the Lord has called and stretched forth his arm to gather them off their hills and from Babylon as sheep gone astray, now to return to the Shepherd and Bishop of their souls indwelling.²⁹

²⁸ Barclay's Works I, *Truth Cleared of Calumnies*, 135-6. The Lord's arm drew the Quakers as His Seed & Plant suffered them beyond the later Reformers stopping point. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 370-1. O gracious Lord, how great is thy love for me, a sinner! Thou didst give me to know Thee. Thou didst give me to taste of thy grace. O taste and see that the Lord is good, Thou hast let me to taste of Thy goodness and mercy, and, insatiable, my soul reaches toward Thee day and night, and cannot forget her beloved Creator, for the Spirit of God gives her to love the Beloved. My soul longing knows no appeasement but strains to her heavenly Father. Blessed is the soul that was humility and tears, and abhors all evil thoughts. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.' 2016, 21. Graham's wife, Margaret was the eldest daughter of Richard Bowman Brockbank, a stalwart defender of the 'ancient way' of Quakerism against the innovations of nineteenth-century evangelicals. Margaret represented her father as welcoming the form of Quakerism arising in his latter days, as seeing that 'the world was riper than ever for a religion free from form and ceremony'. For Barclay, Quakerism was pure and simple, the path of 'True Christian Divinity' in which humanity becomes by Grace indwelling what God is by nature.

²⁹ *ibid*, 136. The Quakers are returning to the Lord from the hills of Babylon calling all by the Breathing Seed of the Lord. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 370. Sophrony claims that in these past 40 years since the Lord through the Holy Spirit gave me to know the love of God, have I grieved over God's people. O brethren, there is nothing better than the love of God, when the Lord fires the soul with love for God and our fellow-man. Great is the Lord's mercy! My soul came to know God, her Heavenly Father, and she weeps and mourns for having grieved Him so often, and the Lord accords her forgiveness of sins, and the joy and gladness of loving her Creator, and of loving and weeping for her fellows, that the Lord in his mercy may take every soul to Himself, to the place He prepared for us by His sufferings on the cross. The man who knows the delight of the love of God, when the soul warmed by grace knows love for God and her brother, knows in part that the kingdom of God is within us. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.' 2016, 22-3. Since Graham's contribution to the forging of a new, liberal Quakerism is a major theme, I confine myself to naming the major events in his campaign. These are 1) his part in the struggle to prevent the Religious Society of Friends in Britain from adopting the 'Richmond Declaration' in 1888, which Friends of Graham's turn of mind saw as tantamount to a creed, challenging the authority of the Inward Light; 2) his campaign against the Home Mission Committee and its perceived threat to the silent meeting, punctuated by spontaneous vocal ministry, 'as led', a practice seen by Graham as essential to authentic Quakerism; this struggle came to a head at the Home Mission Conference of 1892; 3) his contribution to the Manchester Conference of 1895 which was an opportunity for liberal Friends to voice their sense of the direction in which the Society should be heading. Graham's visits to America were motivated largely by his sense that American Quakerism should be saved from un-Quakerly ways, and be amenable to modern thinking. Graham's direction coincides with Barclay's argument

2 Faith is wrought through Cooperating with Christ who dwells in the Soul

Barclay argues that where there is no union with Christ there is no fruit brought forth to God. The fruit brought forth comes through conversion accomplished through humanities cooperation with Christ, through which cooperation faith is wrought that unites humanity with God. Christ is in the seed and light which bears witness against all iniquity in humanity, who is willing to purify.³⁰ The Spirit is in all inviting, calling, and drawing until humanities resistance ends the day of visitation (John 19:8, Acts 7:50, Genesis 6:3). All have sufficient light to convert them.³¹

Barclay claims that owning the light of Christ and other principles held by the Quakers will make the heathen nations, and all professors of Christ to overflow with true and saving knowledge of God and Christ. So long as the nations follow such blind guides as the reformer John Menzies, who oppose the uncreated grace of the Spirit and the light of Christ, darkness will cover them while they deny Christ in their works and remain estranged from His light within.³²

The Quakers say the light and seed of the second Adam within must not only be acknowledged, but believed, obeyed, and walked in. In those who do, the light of Christ will lead them to read and

for an experiential Christianity commensurate with the lives of the Fathers who emphasized the living tradition of the dead rather than the dead tradition of the living. Creedal statements came by hearing the voice of the Spirit rather than purely subscribing to a statement. Ministry is inclusive of the Body as a whole as joined to the Head. Truth is reality Incarnate lived by the faithful.

³⁰ *ibid*, 138-9. Christ is in that Seed and Light which bears witness against all iniquity; Fruit is brought forth through man's cooperation with Christ in begetting faith. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 151-2. In the state of freedom from the passions the ascetic knows himself, and in knowing himself knows man in general by virtue of the consubstantiality of the whole human race. In his depths where the genuine resemblance to God of the whole human race is revealed, where his high calling is manifest, the ascetic sees things unknown to the man who has not entered into his own heart.

³¹ *ibid*, 143. All have sufficient light & calling from God until their day of visitation runs out. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 152. In reflecting on the day of visitation running out, John Damascene describes in his funeral canticles, 'I weep and lament when I think of death and see lying in the grave our beauty, created in the image of God, bereft of glory.' Thus do all weep and lament who have known in Christ the primordial fairness of man when they return from the ineffable spiritual banquet in the deep recesses of the heart, and see the world bereft of beauty and glory.

³² *ibid*, 148. The light of Christ in the heathen nations provides the true & saving knowledge of Christ. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 383. Here is a thing to marvel at: We look with distaste upon our fellow-man – a human being just like ourselves – if he is poor or dirty, but the Lord, like a loving mother with her children, forgives us all things, and does not turn from the sinner in loathing but even gives him the gift of the Holy Spirit.

make use of the Scriptures, and lead them to the assemblies of God's people to hear and receive the ministry of those whom God has called. The light of Christ will lead them to love and esteem the assembled greatly for their works sake. Barclay emphasizes that the light of Christ will lead them to own Jesus Christ, the benefits of his death, his sufferings, and give them understanding to conceive and use rightly the benefits of his death and sufferings as opportunity is given.³³

3 The Voice of the Father supersedes the Canon of the Church in calling all too Prelapsarian Communion

The Jews hearkened not to the inward voice and testimony of the Father concerning Christ, who had the Scriptures and yet resisted the testimony of the light within concerning Jesus which was testimony greater than John the Baptist's (John 5:36-40).³⁴ Though some fall away, the dishonor of the foolish builder cannot be cast upon God but remains upon the foolish builder. It stands with the wisdom and power of God to 'suffer them to fall away' who knowingly and willingly depart from

³³ *ibid*, 148-9. Christ's light and seed will lead one in believing, obedience, making use of the Scriptures, to assembling with Christ's Body, and to owning the benefits of Christ's death & sufferings.

³⁴ *ibid*, 159. The Jews resisted the inward Voice and Testimony of the Father, the Old Covenant scriptures and its final prophet, and the New Covenant light concerning Jesus the Christ. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.' 2016, 112-13. The 'Declaration' came out of a conference held in Richmond, Indiana, in September, 1887, to which Quakers from Britain and Ireland as well as America were invited, in an attempt to bring unity and definition to the worldwide Quaker movement. Its chief author was Joseph Bevan Braithwaite, as a delegate from London Yearly Meeting. It was accepted by those present at the Conference, but hardly succeeded in uniting Friends in America, let alone elsewhere. The Hicksites were not invited to the party, and several groups of Friends would not accept the Declaration when it was published. When Braithwaite proffered the Declaration to London Yearly Meeting for their acceptance in 1888, Graham was prominent in the fight against it. In 1884 he had struggled to keep the fledgling Cambridge Meeting free from outmoded and unacceptable dogma: now he fought to save the soul of British Quakerism. 'The Society of Friends', he declared, 'existed as a protest against all creeds'. The liberal American Quaker Rufus Jones called the Richmond Declaration 'a relic of the past', which made no attempt to address current issues. With Jones, the Apostle of Progress meant to keep the Quakers facing towards the future. Barclay maintains that reliance on creeds at the expense of Christ supplants the New Covenant. Jesus' words to the Jews that they hold to the scriptures and ignore the voice of the Father (John 5:36-40) maintained the 'the living tradition of the dead [Judaism] as the expense of the dead tradition of the living [Christianity]'. Christ is in our midst (Matthew 28:19) and at our door (Revelation 3:20). When creeds or scripture replace the voice of Christ, a semblance of old covenant Judaism masquerading as Christianity is reestablished, and theosis fades. The 'Apostle of Progress' held the line from within Quakerism as did Barclay against those outside of Quakers. Scholasticism then and evangelical Protestantism now threatened true Christian divinity.

the Lord, who will not concur with Him in kingdom work as subordinate instruments, but resist the Lord, though He invite, call, and draw.³⁵

Barclay argues that having saving grace and being in a state of grace are two different things. A manifestation of the Spirit is given to everyone who bears iniquity, to profit them.³⁶ Universal grace is the same to all humanity as in the servant responding to his master (Luke 17:6-10), to the eight left behind in Noah's day, and to those of Lot's family in Lot's day (Luke 17:22-37; I Peter 3:18-20). The nature of the Lord's visitation is timeless to include both old and new covenant periods.³⁷

4 The light of Christ and the gospel of Christ are one in calling all through the Resurrected seed of the Incarnation

Barclay ensures that the seed of the kingdom and the light of Christ given to every person does not result in saving faith in all receiving the seed (Matthew 13:3) but is saving only in those in whom the seed takes root and flourishes (John 1:10-12).³⁸ The person that believes in the light believes in Christ. Where the light of Christ is, there is Jesus Christ himself. The light of Christ and the gospel of Christ are one. The gospel of which Paul was minister was the new covenant light of Christ preached noetically in every creature (Galatians 1:15-16; Colossians 1:23, 29; Romans 10:4-8, 20).³⁹

³⁵ *ibid*, 211. The Lord suffers the foolish to fall away, who knowingly depart, though the Lord invite, call, and draw. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 148. To say that man who is called into life out of nothingness by a creative act of God does not possess eternal life in himself does not mean that in dying he returns to nothingness, to non-existence. Gifted with freedom, when he turns away from God he leaves Light and Life for perpetual death and outer darkness; but this darkness does not correspond to nothingness, or the non-existence of which the creature was called into being. This state is the state of 'the reasonable being indestructible' in their nature. Turning away from God, the creature cannot find any realm inaccessible to God. Even in hell Divine love will embrace all men, but, while this love is joy and life for them that love God, it is torment for those that hate Him.

³⁶ Barclay's Works I, *William Mitchell Unmasked*, 1672, 248. Being in a state of grace and having saving grace are two different things.

³⁷ *ibid*, 248-9. Humanity is in a similar place as the demons in regards to the grace & coming of Christ.

³⁸ *ibid*, 249. Saving faith grows in whom the seed of the Kingdom takes root and flourishes.

³⁹ *ibid*, 249-50. The light of Christ kataphatic and gospel of Christ in the flesh apophatic are the same to be believed in. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 358-9. O ye peoples of the earth, fashioned by God, know your Creator and His love for us! Know the love of Christ, and live in peace and thereby rejoice the Lord, who in His mercy waits for all men, to come to Him. Turn to Him, all ye peoples of the earth, and lift up your prayers to God; and the prayers of the whole earth shall rise to heaven like the sun, and all the heavens will rejoice, and sing praises to the Lord for His sufferings whereby He saved us. Know, all ye people, that we are created for the glory of God in the heavens. Cleave not to the earth, for God is our Father and He loves us like dear children.

5 The Voice of the Father is a witness greater than Jesus's miracles and John the Baptist's testimony

Barclay instructs that he that believes in the Son, has the witness in himself (I John 5:10). It is the voice of the Father at Christ's baptism, and the voice of the Father at Christ's Transfiguration that is the greater witness in those who reject Christ. It is the voice of the Father (John 5:37) which is a witness more than Jesus's miracles and John the Baptist.⁴⁰ Christ came to his own that he might save them and yet it is said '*they received him not*'. The evangelist John states in John 10:27-28, John 13:1 and I John 2:19 that those who receive Christ are made thoroughly regenerate.⁴¹ Peter acknowledges that the Spirit's work in convicting Simon Magus (Acts 8:22) is the same Spirit who aids the repentant in prayer, and restores communion.⁴²

6 The Voice of the Spirit is more than the immovable wax of Scripture in calling every Person

Barclay denies his message to have proceeded from any light or illumination in him as a human, but that the light is from the immediate testimony of the Spirit of God in his heart, a manifestation of which is given to every person to profit them according to the plain testimony of Scripture (I Corinthians 12:7). It cannot be proven that the Spirit spoke with an audible voice to the prophets, being also the new covenant testimony within.⁴³ The Spirit of Christ within humanity continues to speak to the condition of humanity which is rejected by the Westminster divines who claim the scripture, and reject the Spirit's immediate voice. As soon as Christ was revealed *in* Paul (Galatians 1:16-17) he went straight away and obeyed. Christ says he will dwell *in* us and walk *in* us to the end of the world (II Corinthians 6:16). Except Christ be *in* you, you are reprobate (II Corinthians 13:5).

⁴⁰ *ibid*, 266-7. The Father's voice at Jesus's Baptism and Transfiguration was also the voice in the Jews.

⁴¹ *ibid*, 314-5. Those who have entered into the fullness of regeneration become secure

⁴² *ibid*, 318-9. The Spirit convicts the wicked before aiding the repentant in prayer.

⁴³ Barclay's Works I, *Warning/Exhortation to Aberdeen*, 334-5. God's message comes to humanity other than humanities discursive mind both seeking relationship and instructing the saints through the *nous*. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 353. The Lord loves man and reveals Himself to man, as it pleases Him. And when the soul beholds the Lord she humbly rejoices in the Master's compassion, and from that hour her love is greater than her any other love – though she may see all things and love all men, yet will she love the Lord above all

The inward anointing is to teach and lead in all things, so that the Christian need not any to teach them (I John 2:26-29). This plain teaching of Scripture is rejected by the Westminster men in their making the Scripture an immovable 'nose of wax'.⁴⁴

Barclay surmises that when one purposes to know God out of their unworthiness and weariness, occasioned by the secret checks of their conscience, and the tender, yet real glances of God's light upon their heart; their earnest desire being to be redeemed from their troubles, to be eased from disordered passions and lusts, and to find quietness and peace in the certain knowledge of God. Through being assured of God's love and goodwill, their heart becomes ready to receive any impression, and they being impatient, embrace anything that brings ease. In this comfort they become hardier; the enemy being near creates a false peace and a certain confidence. Strengthened by an unwillingness to enter into new doubtfulness, or the former anxiety of search, they stop short of acquiring true knowledge of God.⁴⁵

Barclay contends that God spoke always and immediately in every age. To the old covenant Jew God spoke through the high priest when he entered the holy of holies, which afterwards relayed to the Israelite people the voice and will of God. Through the Levites, the Aaronic high priests, and the prophets, none were rejected who sought the Spirit. Moses wished that all the Lord's people were prophets (Numbers 11:24-29).⁴⁶ But now Jesus Christ has promised to guide through his own

⁴⁴ Barclay's Works I, *Catechism and Confession of Faith*: Westminster, 450-1. The Westminster men both claim the Scriptures and reject the Spirit. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 87. For Saint Silouan the life of the Church meant life in the Holy Spirit, and Sacred Tradition the unceasing action of the Holy Spirit in her. Sacred Tradition, as the eternal and immutable dwelling of the Holy Spirit in the Church, lies at the very root of her being, and so encompasses her life that even the very Scriptures come to be but one of its forms.

⁴⁵ Robert Barclay, *An Apology for the True Christian Divinity*, 25-6. True Knowledge Noetic comes from God Kataphatically while False Knowledge discursive from the Enemy stops Humanity short of Knowing God. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 87. Were the Church to be deprived of Tradition she would cease to be what she is, for the ministry of the New Testament is the ministry of the Spirit 'written not with ink, but with the Spirit of the living God; not in tables of stone, but in the fleshly tables of the heart'.

⁴⁶ *ibid*, 41. God spoke Always & Immediately in the Jewish Old Covenant Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 87-8. Suppose that for some reason the Church were to be bereft of all her will, of the All and New Testaments, the works of the holy Fathers, of all liturgical service books – what would happen? Sacred Tradition would restore the Scriptures, not word for word, perhaps – the verbal war might be different but his essence

unerring Spirit, through the temple veil being rent in two, and our drawing near to him with pure hearts. Jesus Christ reveals his will by his Spirit and has written the fulfilled laws in our heart. The object of faith and the revelation is inward, immediate, and objective.⁴⁷

Barclay argues that becoming acquainted with the heavenly voice in the heart, to put off evil and corrupt affections and lusts, opens the way to save and understand the mysteries of God's kingdom.⁴⁸ Whether a person is in the faith or an heir of salvation the Scripture cannot tell. Jesus Christ being in you, and according due diligence makes one's calling and election sure.⁴⁹ Barclay affirms that the new covenant message about Jesus Christ is larger than the Hebrew Old Testament Scriptures and the philosophy of the Greeks (Acts 17:16-34).⁵⁰ Lost communion and fellowship with God is restored through Jesus who calls himself the door back into the Garden of Eden, and unto the tree of life. This is 'mystical Paradise restored' in which communion and fellowship is obtained with God by the saints through the incarnation and Spirit.⁵¹

the new Scriptures with the expression of the same 'they which was once delivered on to the Saints'. They would be the expression of the one and only Holy Spirit continuously active in the Church, her foundation and her very substance..

⁴⁷ *ibid*, 58-9. Jesus guides by his unerring Spirit in the Heart. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 88. The Scriptures are not more profound, not more important than Holy Tradition but they are one of Tradition's forms – the most precious form, both because they are preserved and convenient to make use of. But removed from the Spirit and stream of Sacred Tradition, the Scriptures cannot be understood through scientific research.

⁴⁸ *ibid*, 72. Kingdom mystery is understood by putting off corruption through listening to the Heavenly Voice in the Heart Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 88. If the Apostle Paul had 'the mind of Christ', how much more does this apply to the whole body of the Church which all is one member. If the writings of Paul and the other apostles are Holy Scripture, then new Scriptures of the Church, written after the loss of the old books, would in their turn become Holy Scripture, for according to the Lord's promise, God, the Holy Trinity, will be in the Church even unto the end of the world.

⁴⁹ *ibid*, 81. Calling comes from Jesus Christ in you and increases through Due Diligence more than by scripture words. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 88. Men are wrong when they set aside Sacred Tradition and go, as they think, to its source – to the Holy Scriptures. The Church has her origins, not in the Scriptures but in Sacred Tradition. The church did not possess the New Testament during the first decade of her history. She lived then by Tradition – the Tradition Paul calls upon the faithful to hold. (II Thessalonians 2:15)

⁵⁰ *ibid*, 93. The New Covenant Message concerning Jesus is more comprehensive than the Old Testament Scriptures and the Philosophy of the Athenians. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 139-40. Silouan contends that the Athenian Areopagites take the path of cognition and not prayer. Those setting out on the path of cognition are often misled. Assimilating intellectually, even apophatic theology, they content themselves with intellectual delights. Not attributing due significance to their unconquered passions, they imagine that they have achieved what the Areopagites teach, whereas in the majority of cases, while apprehending the logical structure of their theological system existentially, they do not attain to the One they seek.

⁵¹ *ibid*, 99. The Garden of Eden, consisting of mystical Communion with God and the Tree of Life is now restored through Jesus the Door Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 140. Hesychasm is

Barclay argues that the revelation of God, as God's Son begotten bodily of the *Theotokos*, now resurrected as kataphatic seed and light of the second Adam, enlightens every person coming into the world for the salvation of all who would receive. This renders the seed of first fallen Adam to be of fading consequence. The uncreated light of Christ that enlightens the hearts of all for a time in order to save, reproves the inherited sin of first Adam, and would work out the salvation of all if not resisted. The light of Christ is no less universal than the seed of first Adam, being the 'purchase' of Christ's death, who tasted death for every person (Hebrews 2:9). For as in first Adam all die, even so in second Adam all shall be made alive (I Corinthians 15:20-22).⁵²

Barclay argues that the universality of the mercy and justice of God towards humankind is both in the bodily death of his beloved son the Lord Jesus Christ and in the manifestation of his bodily resurrection as metaphysical light and seed in the heart. The voice and law of the Spirit in the conscience is seed and knowledge to be received, believed, and partaken of noetically.⁵³

Barclay contends that instead of the doctrine of 'sovereign' predestined wrath, the Quakers propose that God out of his infinite love sent his begotten Son into the world, who tasted death for every person, that the world would be saved from sin and eternal death. This is God's merciful and just love. The universal redemption and the saving light of Jesus Christ is the answer to the Westminster

uninterrupted dwelling in God. This may be encouraged by eliminating external impressions and influences by distancing oneself from the world under divine auspices. Without divine leadership, separation by self-will will be fruitless. In whatever endeavor or act of service a person may pursue, the quest for pure prayer remains imperative. Prayer is pure when accompanied by the softening of the heart so that both heart and mind in harmony with any words are without any irrelevant thought intruding. Only in rare instances does pure prayer evolve into perfect prayer.

⁵² *ibid*, 109-10. The Son as 2nd Adam who enlightens the whole world would work out the Salvation in all if not Resisted. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 141. God is Light inaccessible. Is the is far superior to any image – not only material image but mental image to And therefore so long as the human mind is concerned with thoughts, words, conceptions, images, it cannot achieve contemplative pure prayer.

⁵³ *ibid*, 110-11. An evangelical and saving light is begotten in all through the crucified and resurrected Son and Lord, Jesus Christ. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 141. When the created human mind, the created human *persona*, stands before the Supreme Mind, before the Personal God, it attains to genuinely pure and perfect prayer, but only when from love of God every created thing is set aside and the world forgotten. When entering into pure contemplation before the Supreme God one cannot tell whether they are in the body or outside the body.

doctrine of ‘sovereign’ absolute reprobation and predestined damnation.⁵⁴ The universality of Christ dying bodily for all humanity, and the light of God’s Son shining metaphysically in the hearts of all humanity makes the gospel an annunciation of glad tidings to all rather than only the elect. This reveals God’s heart that the Body of Christ would include all.⁵⁵ Christ sent his servants, his disciples to preach the life changing gospel to be within all creatures without exception.⁵⁶

7 The Offer of Restored Communion with God is complete through Participation

Barclay argues that the blame is on humanities part if the will of God that all people be saved has not taken effect. God has done his part in coming incarnationally to save. The full invitation and path of salvation is humanities for the taking if they will but receive his offer and respond.⁵⁷ Barclay summarizes that the evangelical dispensation of the full, evident, and everlasting truth is that God, out of his infinite love, sent his Son, the Lord Jesus Christ into the world who tasted death for every person, has given every person a certain day or time of visitation during which it is possible for all to partake of the fruit of Christ’s bodily death and be saved. Secondly, to this end, God has communicated a measure of the light of his own Son, a measure of the Spirit, a measure of Grace which Scripture calls: the seed of the kingdom, the light which makes all things manifest, the word of God, a manifestation of the Spirit to profit withal, a talent, a leaven, and the gospel preached in every creature. Thirdly, that God, in and by his light and seed invites, calls, exhorts, and strives with every person to save, which, as his light and seed is received and not resisted works the salvation of

⁵⁴ *ibid*, 118. Universal Redemption & Saving Light is the Answer to Absolute Reprobation & Predestined Damnation.

⁵⁵ *ibid*. The Universal Redemption & Saving Light of Christ is an Annunciation of Glad Tidings to all Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 141-2. Pure prayer is a rare gift of God. It depends in no way on human effort. Divine power comes and with elusive care and ineffable tenderness transports man into the world of Divine light – or rather, Divine light appears and lovingly embraces the whole man, so that he can recall nothing, incapable of any thought.

⁵⁶ *ibid*, 118-9. The Gospel is not Exclusionary but is preached, and is to be preached to all.

⁵⁷ *ibid*, 122-3. God earnestly desires salvation through his coming, waiting, seeking, knocking, and calling. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 142. Silouan held that ‘He whose prayer is pure is a theologian.’ Without practical knowledge of the Divine light, theology in the sense of beholding God is out of reach. The mind that has never known purity, that has never contemplated Divine light, however cultivated in its intellectual experience, is inevitably subject to the imagination, and in its task to know the Divine depends on conjectures, which only too often are mistaken for genuine revelation and divine visions.

all by bringing them to a sense of their own misery, to be sharers in the sufferings of Christ inwardly, making them partakers of Christ's resurrection in becoming pure, holy, righteous, and recovered out of sin. They are saved who have the knowledge of Jesus Christ outwardly, in that Christ's seed and light opens their understanding to apply the things delivered in the shadow Scriptures, and to receive the saving use of the Scriptures. It is equally in the incarnationally uninformed that Christ's light and seed is resisted or accepted. God is said to be rejected and pressed down, and Christ again to be crucified and put to shame in all who reject. Hebrews 6:4-6; Amos 2:13-16; Matthew 13:12⁵⁸

8 The Twelve Consequences of being informed by the light and seed of the second Adam, the Spirit of Pentecost, and the Fulfilled Law of Christ written in the Heart

Barclay contends that the consequences of Christ dying bodily for all humanity, and that God in and by the resurrected new covenant seed of the second Adam invites, calls, exhorts, and strives with every person to save produces twelve consequences: 1) None are necessarily shut out from salvation. God's justice is demonstrated in that God condemns none who are offered salvation and the means of salvation. 2) The doctrine of God's seed through the second Adam and the uncreated light of Christ is the foundation of Christian salvation and assurance. 3) That God in and by the uncreated seed and light of the second Adam invites, calls, exhorts, and strives with every person agrees with the promises and threats of the gospel, and with the nature and ministry of Christ,

⁵⁸ *ibid*, 130-1. Christ who tasted Death for all, justly Manifests himself in all through his bodily resurrection and is willing that all Partake of his Sufferings & Life unto Eternal Life; This More Full, Evident & Perfect Knowledge-Noetic communicated by Jesus Christ within & Sealed by the Holy Spirit in the Heart is in accordance with sensible Experience & the shadow Scripture. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.' 2016, 100-1. Francis Frith, William Pollard and William Turner, these 'Three Friends' insisted that the Bible is 'obviously the record of a progressive Revelation. It began with the dim dawn of human intelligence & spiritual insight, & gradually advances to the full light of day.' As for imputed righteousness, the authors are scathing: 'an unchanged nature "reckoned" righteous "for Christ's sake."... Free forgiveness is one thing; the reckoning a man to be what he is not is quite another'. (1884) In this they were in accord with early Friends. James Nayler (1618-1660) accused the Calvinists of his day of preaching that human beings might be saved while they 'yet live in their sins and filthiness', whereas Christ's work is to bring 'righteousness, sanctification, justification, and redemption'. For Barclay the Bible was a never-ending source of spiritual insight for those receiving from the Spirit but was not the Spirit. The seed of the 2nd Adam and the baptizing of the Spirit within were toward righteousness, sanctification, justification, and redemption in man in realizing prelapsarian union with God restored. The scriptures were a progressive shadow used by the Spirit in theosis.

according to which salvation and repentance is preached; being preached *already* within every creature without respect of nation, kindred, family, or tongue [emphasis mine]. 4) That the merits and death of Christ being brought near all puts all into the capacity of being saved. 5) That Christ dying for all exalts the grace of God to not only the smallest beginning of good, but to the whole conversion and salvation of soul and body. 6) That God in and by the seed of the second Adam and uncreated light striving with all overturns the doctrine of the human light of fallen nature, the liberty and effectiveness of the fallen will, and that people ‘naturally’ of their own nature can save themselves. 7) That God in and by the seed of the second Adam and uncreated light striving with all makes the whole of salvation to depend on God, one’s condemnation to be of oneself, and forces all to acknowledge the just mercy and judgment of God. 8) That God in and by the seed of the second Adam and light of Christ striving with all people gives every person hope, and a certain assurance, that they may be saved through forsaking evil and closing with the good; from ‘missing the mark’ to ‘hitting the mark’ of God’s original righteous intent. 9) That God in and by the seed of the second Adam and uncreated light striving with all commends the certainty of the Christian religion amongst infidels; that the infidel has found ‘somewhat’ in their heart reproving them of evil, threatening a consequence if they continue in evil, as also promising and communicating peace as they give way and do not resist. 10) That God in and by the seed of the second Adam and light of Christ strives with all reveals the wisdom of God, in that God has made the means of salvation universal and comprehensive through the new and final covenant. 11) That God, in and by the seed of the second Adam and the uncreated light of Christ, strives with all people has already been established and confirmed by the ‘doctors’ of Christianity and the Fathers and saints of the first three centuries. 12) That God by the seed of the second Adam and the light of Christ strives with all requires that all acknowledge that God is merciful and just toward them.⁵⁹

⁵⁹ *ibid*, 132-134. Redemption through Jesus Christ physically dying for all and that the Seed of the 2nd Adam and the

9 Through the seed taking Root, the new Person or Creation is born, bringing forth Prelapsarian Communion

Barclay argues that the mercies of God are over all his works in that God invites and calls sinners to repentance, and has opened the way of salvation. God reproves sinners for evil, and encourages good. Humanity ought never to believe that God is unmerciful, or that God has from the beginning ordained humanity to come into the world that they might be left in their evil (John 16:7-12).⁶⁰

As every unrighteous action witnesses against and reproves the light of Christ, and seed of his kingdom, so the light and seed is hurt, wounded, slain, and flees from unrighteous action. Because the light is never separated from Christ or God, and the promised seed is never separated from the kingdom at hand, God is said to be again resisted, borne down, slain, and crucified (Amos 2:13-16; Hebrews 4:4-6). As the seed and light is received in the heart, and is suffered to bring forth its proper effects, Christ comes to be formed and raised, of which the Scripture calls *the new person* (Colossians 3:10), *Christ within*, the *hope of glory* (Colossians 1:27). This is Christ within, which the Quakers are heard so much to speak and declare, preaching Christ and exhorting people to believe in the light and obey, that they may come to know Christ in them, to deliver them from sin (Galatians 2:20). The *new person* being separate and distinct from the holy man, the Lord Jesus Christ born of the Virgin Mary, is metaphysically reborn (born again) of the seed of the second Adam who is metaphysically distinct from the physical egg and sperm of humanities originating mother and father.⁶¹

Barclay contends that the seed of the second Adam, uncreated light of Christ, and grace of the Spirit is real spiritual substance which the soul of humanity is capable to feel and apprehend. It is from this substance that the real, spiritual, inward birth called the '*new creature*' (II Corinthians 5:17) or the

uncreated new covenant Light, calls all produces 12 consequences.

⁶⁰ *ibid*, 134. Christ's Redemption & Saving Light, Seed and Spirit is an Expression of God's Mercy to Sinful Evil Man.

⁶¹ *ibid*, 136-7. Being one with Christ, the Light & Seed can be borne down & pressed under or raised up over iniquity as New Humanity distinct from the holy man, the second Adam Jesus Christ.

‘new man’ (Colossians 3:10) is born in the heart. Quakers know this substance and are sensible of it by a true and living experience. If humanity holds the substance in the mere notion of it, it avails them little. It is in and by the inward and substantial seed of the second Adam in the heart, as the seed comes to receive nourishment, and to have birth or geniture, that the person comes to have their senses raised by which they are capable of tasting, smelling, seeing, and handling of the things of God (Psalm 34:8; 36:9; John 6:51-54). The carnal person cannot reach these things by their fallen spirit.⁶²

10 The History of the Incarnation is Profitable and Comfortable with the Mystery, and never without the Mystery

Barclay affirms that the knowledge of Christ’s incarnational appearance is very comfortable to such as are subject to and led by the inward light and seed. The history of Christ is profitable and comfortable with the mystery, and is never without the mystery. The sayings of Christ are meat and drink to those under the yoke and burden of Christ.⁶³

Christ crucified in the Gentiles (I Corinthians 2:2; Galatians 3:1) is the light of the world from which Jesus Christ is never separated, and has his habitation forever (Psalm 36:9, John 1:9).⁶⁴ Barclay affirms that it is heresy to believe that the new covenant light of Christ, seed of the second Adam, or grace of the Holy Spirit is part of man’s natural nature or conscience. Some project that the Quakers preach a natural light in humanities conscience which is the error of Faustus Socinus (539-604) and Pelagius (354-420). The light of Christ, which the Quakers speak of, is of a wholly different uncreated nature, than the soul of humanity, and the soul’s faculties.⁶⁵

⁶² *ibid*, 137-8. The Light, Seed or Grace of God is real substance noetic as the Rays of the Sun are real substance of the sun.

⁶³ *ibid*, 139-40. The Knowledge of Christ’s Historical Appearance, the Kingdom Seed, and the Light of Christ coincide comfortably with a sense of Mystery.

⁶⁴ *ibid*, 141. Jesus Christ & the Supernatural Light of Christ are inseparable for eternity

⁶⁵ *ibid*, 141-2. The uncreated Light, Seed or Grace of God is distinctly separate from humanities natural conscience or created nature

Instead, humanity has set up antichrist in the fallen rational brain rather than knowing God noetically and savingly in the heart (*nous*). This inherited rational principle has been the cause of great apostasy in setting up fallen humanity in the temple of God as sovereign (Genesis 1:26-27, Psalm 82:6, John 10:31-39).⁶⁶ The holy seed of God is bruised by the rational principle in humanity which rules as antichrist. Fallen reason is capable of ruling in the natural person who will fade, but the divine light of Christ is necessary to rule in the human heart to give birth to life eternal.⁶⁷ From God has proceeded the uncreated light of his Son, a spiritual divine light to rule in things spiritual and heavenly. The divine light comes in response to the fallen light of reason which rules in things fallen and worldly.⁶⁸

11 God directs in the Application of the light of Christ in every Person

Barclay argues that humanity cannot stir up the light of Christ or grace of the Spirit so as to procure for themselves tenderness of heart. Humanity must wait for Christ's light whereby they come to know salvation. God moves in love toward humanity in his seed in their heart at singular times, setting their sin in order before them and inviting them to repentance, offering remission of sins, and salvation.⁶⁹ The seed of the kingdom is a thing that humanity cannot bring upon themselves with all their asceticism. It is by the day of God's gracious visitation to the soul, that if they do not resist, they will be happy forever. This day of the Lord is like lightning, which shines from East to West, and the wind of the Spirit which blows upon the heart that no man knows where it goes or whence it comes.⁷⁰

⁶⁶ *ibid*, 142. Antichrist emerges from the Fallen-Sovereign Rational Brain

⁶⁷ *ibid*. The Holy Seed of the Kingdom & Light Noetic is bruised by the fallen seed of Rationalism.

⁶⁸ *ibid*, 142-3. The Light of Christ informs Reason as the Sun enlightens the Moon

⁶⁹ *ibid*, 144-5. The Light of Christ orders the path of Salvation in humanity. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 354-5. Pride is at the root of unbelief. The proud man would acquire knowledge of things through his mind and his study, but it is not given to him learn to know God, and that the Lord reveals Himself only to the lowly in heart. To the lowly in heart does the Lord discover His works, which are beyond the understanding of our minds but are unfolded through the Holy Spirit.

⁷⁰ *ibid*, 145. The Light & Grace of God Working in All is as Lightning & Wind

Barclay acknowledges that as the grace and light of Christ in all is sufficient to save, and of its nature would save all; so the seed and light strives and wrestles with all in order to save. They who resist the Spirit are the cause of their own condemnation. The one who does not resist, Christ becomes their salvation. In the one that is saved, the working is of the uncreated grace of God and not of humanity. The working is a passive response in humanity rather than an act, which raises the will by which one becomes a coworker with God. As Augustine (354-430) states, '*He that made us without us, will not save us without us*'.⁷¹ Synergy is required in humanity not working contrarily in God's work of justification. In humanities receptivity, humanity experiences God's new covenant salvation.⁷²

12 God's Mercy and Justice Work consequentially in those responding to God's seed

Barclay argues that God working in those in whom the prevalence of grace is given hides himself to shut out all security and presumption that the person may be humbled, the grace of God magnified, and all grace reputed to be of God's free gift, and nothing from the strength of self (Isaiah 6:8-13; Matthew 13:11-15; Acts 28:24-28). Those who perish, when they remember God's visitations, wherein God wrestled with them by his light and Spirit, are forced to confess that there was a time when the door of mercy was open to them and they are justly condemned because they rejected their salvation.⁷³ By establishing God's mercy and justice at the center of the human heart, humanities fallen will is brought down, and salvation depends only on God with the light, seed, and Spirit of Christ given to all. The giving of the 'means' of salvation to some and the 'obduration' (hardening) of the heart of others is solved by the universal reality of God's new covenant mercy and justice.⁷⁴

⁷¹ *ibid*, 145-6. The Light & Grace of God Working in All as Lightning or Wind is the Passive Means of working out Salvation.

⁷² *ibid*, 146. New Covenant Redemption includes Synergistic Receptivity on humanities part per Augustine.

⁷³ *ibid*, 148-9. The Saving Light of God affects humility in Humanity justly in bringing forth the salvation of God.

⁷⁴ *ibid*, 149. By God's new covenant Mercy & Justice established through the Light of Christ & Kingdom Seed, both the universal means of Salvation and the hardening of the Heart is solved. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 384. The soul feels that the Lord loves her despite the multitude of sins. Just as in those days the

Barclay claims that a day of visitation is given to the wicked wherein the wicked might have been saved, which is illustrated by Jesus weeping over Jerusalem as a hen would gather her chicks. Such is the love and care of the hen over her brood, but Jerusalem would not suffer Jesus to gather them, and so the things belonging to her peace were hidden from her eyes. Jesus's long suffering forbearance resulted in Jerusalem being hardened in unbelief.⁷⁵ It is by God's long suffering offers of mercy and salvation that hearts are hardened. Even what the servant has is eventually taken away (Matthew 13:12, 25:29; Mark 4:25; Luke 19:26). It is only as God's visitation is continuously rejected that the hardening in a person becomes cement (Acts 28:26-27).⁷⁶

Barclay informs that the saving spiritual light is the gospel preached in every creature under heaven (Colossians 1:21-23) and is that which Paul was a minister. This gospel is the power of God unto salvation to all who believe. This gospel is the inward power and life noetic which preaches glad tidings in the hearts of all people, offering salvation, and seeking to redeem all from iniquity.⁷⁷ The word that Paul preached and the gospel that Paul preached is one and the same as being in the heart and in the mouth. The divine preacher has sounded in the ears and hearts of all humanity, within and without to the end of time and to the ends of the earth (Romans 10:4-8, 18).⁷⁸

Lord said to Zacchaeus: Zacchaeus, to day I must abide at thy house (and that because he wanted to see Christ), so it is now with the sinner when the soul turns to God. Nowadays the nations have forsaken the good path, and people have hardened their hearts and become pitiless, and there is no love in them, and so they are not conscious of God's love. In the hardness of their hearts they think that God, too, is without pity, like themselves, and sometimes they entirely lose their faith.

⁷⁵ *ibid*, 153-4. God's Forbearance toward Humanity is as a Hen gathers her Chicks without Force until finally received, or hidden through unbelief. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 384-5. O, if only it were possible I would show them the Lord and say, Behold and see what the Lord is like! The face of His love melts the soul of man. But this love is not to be discerned simply by the mind: it is made known through the Holy Spirit. O Lord, grant me tears to shed for myself, and for the whole universe, that the nations may know Thee and live eternally with Thee. Oh Lord, vouchsafe us the gift of Thy humble Holy Spirit, that we may apprehend Thy glory.

⁷⁶ *ibid*, 154. God's Judgment of Obduration occurs after God's Day of Visitation is continuously Rejected. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 385. My soul grieves, weeping in sorrow for people who do not know the sweetness of a wholly softened heart. My soul burns with longing for the mercy of the Lord to be with all men, for the whole wide universe and all mankind to know how dearly the Lord loves us, like beloved children.

⁷⁷ *ibid*, 163. The Spiritual Saving Light is the Gospel Noetic in the Heart which Paul preached.

⁷⁸ *ibid*, 165. The Divine Preacher has preached the Gospel in every Heart and Mouth

Barclay argues that the word from God placed within both condemns and bears witness for God in the same way that Jesus Christ was a ‘witness’ and is leader and commander. The light of Christ is given, that all through the light may believe. The word is given, *‘for faith comes by hearing, and hearing by the word of God’*, (Hebrews 11:1, 6) which word is placed in humanities heart to witness for God, and to be a means of bringing humanity to God through repentance. The word is like a two-edged sword that cuts off iniquity, and separates the precious from the vile. The word is like fire, like a hammer so that the cold hard heart of humanity, by the virtue and power of the word near and in the heart, as the heart resists not is warmed, softened, and receives a celestial and heavenly impression and image. The church Fathers have spoken at length on the word, seed, light, and saving voice calling all unto salvation, and able to save.⁷⁹

Barclay contends that those who hear the gospel preached outwardly are not saved but by the working of the grace and light of Christ in their hearts. By the manifestation and working of Christ’s grace and light, many have been, and some may be saved to whom the gospel has never been outwardly heard, but inwardly preached.⁸⁰ Christ died for all humanity, all are enlightened by Christ, and all have a measure of saving light and grace. The gospel preached in all is the power of God, and God’s power is intended to save.⁸¹

13 People can know Jesus kataphatically and savingly in their Heart without knowing His incarnational Name

Barclay contends that it is by the inward uncreated gift, grace, and light that those who have the gospel preached in them, have Jesus brought forth in them and by His universal light all may be saved. God calls, invites, and strives with all in a day and saves many whom God has not seen meet to convey the outward knowledge. The saved who have the experience of the inward and powerful

⁷⁹ ibid, 166. Christ’s Saving Light, Word & Seed spoken of by the Church Fathers Calls All and is able to Save All

⁸⁰ ibid, 169. The Light & Grace of Christ as seed in the heart is the sole means of Salvation.

⁸¹ ibid, 175. The Gospel preached in all people is God’s power intended for the Salvation of all.

work of the uncreated light of Christ in their heart, Jesus Christ revealed in them, cannot cease to proclaim the day of the Lord that has risen in them for their salvation. Humanity knowing this ‘still small thing’ that reproves them in their hearts, however they despise and neglect it, it is nothing less than the gospel preached in them: Christ, the wisdom and power of God, being in and of the seed of the second Adam seeking to save their soul.⁸²

In rejection of the Platonists and the semi-Platonists, Barclay looks to Augustine in his *Confessions* who claims that the soul gives testimony concerning the light, yet the soul is not the light of John 1:14 come into the world as flesh, enlightening every person.⁸³ Augustine writes that the light shines ‘bringing tremble’ within where one is unlike the light, and ‘inflaming’ where one is like the light; the light being wisdom dispels the cloud which covers.⁸⁴ Augustine claims that the shining of the ancient and new chased away the darkness within more than the light without, which Augustine had sought without remedy. Formational in Augustine rejecting Manichaeism, was his ‘putting on Christ’ (Romans 13:12-14) in rejecting the futility of this world.⁸⁵

⁸² *ibid*, 186-7. The Gospel to be proclaimed is the Light & Seed of Christ in all seeking to save all.

⁸³ *ibid*, 186. Augustine claims that the soul gives testimony to the light which came into the world which was the word of John 1:14 become flesh. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.’ 2016, 63-4. In *The Divinity in Man*, Graham claimed the support of no less an authority than Plato for ‘the existence of a spiritual world over against materialism’. By this time he felt able to assert that nervousness on this score could be consigned to the past: ‘No one can now, if well informed on current science, have behind his consciousness a nervous fear that all the statements he hears about God and the Soul from religious people are invalid and fanciful, the illusions of some queer material combinations in the grey matter of the brain’. For the Apostle of Progress ‘materialism’, this most fearsome of dragons spawned by the science of the age, was slain. Barclay distinguishes between the pure ‘idea’ above of Plato and the reality of the light of Christ manifest from the resurrected and ascended Incarnation. The light of Christ is available to the world and realized in those with eyes to see. These become children of the Light who is Christ.

⁸⁴ *ibid*, 187. Augustine claims it is wisdom that shines as light dispelling his clouds & darkness.

⁸⁵ *ibid*. Augustine claims the ancient and new was all along within while he had sought without. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.’ 2016, 64. 1.4.2. The Problem of Sin The close connection between the theology of the Inward Light, newly revived in the Quaker Renaissance, and the idea of moral progress is demonstrated in the title of Thomas Hodgkin’s Swarthmore lecture* of 1911: ‘Human Progress and the Inward Light’. The same subject is touched on by Edward Grubb in *Authority and the Light Within* (1908). Here he explains that the Inward Light, or ‘that of God’ within, enables the conscience, which, unlike the Light, is the product of historical circumstances, to recognise a higher morality when it appears, as with the teachings of Jesus as compared with those of the Old Testament. Hodgkin argues in orthodox Quaker fashion that the Light is available even without the knowledge of Christ, and it is through this Light that the ‘age-long ascent of the human race has been accomplished’, even though Christians enjoy a privileged understanding of the will and purposes of God through Jesus Christ. Barclay argues for the reality of the universal light available to all through humanity’s condition being restored through the Incarnation. Like Grubb and Hodgkins, Barclay differentiates between the Jewish old covenant and the Christian new

14 The Prayer of those responding to the Seed comes by the Spirit

Barclay acknowledges that repentance is the prayer of those receiving the Seed. Repentance comes from the inward retirement of the mind where the Spirit of God influences such to pray and to call upon God whereby the darkened mind (*nous*) is enlightened.⁸⁶

The seed of the second Adam is in the ungodly through the *nous* but the ungodly are not denominated by the seed but by ungodliness. The seed is a kataphatic substance since no accident can be in a subject unless the subject is denominated from that substance. This is taken up by Paul in Acts 17:28, '*that humanity is the offspring of God who lives and moves in him*'. To be denominated by the kataphatic seed of the second Adam through the *nous* is to receive the accident of godliness.⁸⁷

Many that have had a day of visitation have resisted the mercy and Grace of that day. Barclay denies that people receive from Christ only what is common and natural but receive comprehension as apprehension supernaturally. Again, by receiving or apprehending from the light of Christ, humanity receives by virtue of the light, supernatural comprehension of God's Kingdom. The light of Christ being saving and supernatural, and that humanity is commanded to believe in the light, remains unremoved by Barclay (the Quaker position).⁸⁸

15 The Result of God's Universal Love is that the Well Disposed Understanding receives God's Revelation

Barclay argues that the principle of pure love as seed, grace, word, and light is in all humanity as free gift to weed out the fruit and nature of unrighteousness, and to beget the fruit and nature of righteousness, purity, and holiness even where the incarnational knowledge of Jesus Christ is lacking. While the shadow Scriptures are useful, God has made a way without the Scriptures by

covenant in which the Light of Jesus Christ paves the way for the Christian to realize the righteousness of God intended in the Garden of Eden. Prelapsarian relationship is realized through the light of Christ.

⁸⁶ *ibid.*, 377-8. The Prayer of Repentance comes by retiring the Mind to the Spirit of Christ.

⁸⁷ Barclay's Works III, *Apology Vindicated*, 389-90. Availing Ourselves of the Kataphatic Seed of the second Adam as Grace produces Godliness; Receiving Grace, Light, and the Kingdom Seed Noetic results in Theosis.

⁸⁸ *ibid.*, 393-4. Universal Grace as the supernatural Light of Christ apprehended, brings Comprehension of the Kingdom in those who receive.

virtue of his universal love. The essence and being of the Christian is conversion of the heart by the operation of the light of Christ, seed of the second Adam, and Spirit of grace in the heart.⁸⁹ Several sects of Christianity have confined God's love to a narrow compass claiming the necessity of the outward Scripture. Noah, Job, Socrates, and Pythagoras would all be excluded by their definition. God's universal love makes God's universal ministry possible for all.⁹⁰ While the Scripture is a rule, the Spirit, being God, is a surer rule. The well-disposed understanding receives divine revelation available to all as received by the Spirit. All well-disposed understandings receive the same gracious revelation from God.⁹¹

Barclay argues that new covenant revelation, more than the shadow Scriptures old and new, is common to all. The will of God delivered through the Incarnation, as revealed in the Scriptures, is the new covenant revelation revealed in all people. The new covenant Incarnation is the certain, infallible, and final revelation of truth. That the first Protestants were for the 'uncertainty' of immediate revelation is false. It is the later reformers who limit themselves to the shadow Scripture.⁹²

16 Gentiles do the Things contained in the Law by Visitation of the New Covenant seed of God Within

The first man, Adam, fell and was degenerated both as to soul and body (Genesis 3:22-23). That part in first Adam which could not be degenerated by the fall was reduced to a seed (Genesis 2:7, 6:3), and could never have been raised in Adam but by a visitation from Christ, the second Adam,

⁸⁹ Barclay's Works III, *Universal Love*, 225-6. The essence and being of Christianity is the conversion of the Heart by the operation of God.

⁹⁰ *ibid*, 232. God's love reaching all people through Christ and the Spirit puts all into the capacity of reconciliation and eternal purpose. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 148. Concerning the experience of eternity and the resurrection of the soul, I think of the mighty Divine goodwill that poured down on man, catches him up into the realm of Eternal Light, where he can live with certainty his freedom from death, his eternity.

⁹¹ Barclay's Works III, *Apology Vindicated*, 297. The Spirit is a surer rule than the Scriptures whose Revelation becomes Disposed to others noetically.

⁹² *ibid*. 301. Rigid later Protestants bind themselves to the physically less certain rule of faith, while first Protestants stood in the metaphysical certain new covenant rule in the heart.

administered from the promise under first Adam (Genesis 3:15) and is now raised in all humanity by Christ the second Adam in a day. The breath (Genesis 2:7; 6:3) as *spiraculum vitarum* is confirmed in the writings of Athanasius of Alexandria (296-373) and Cyril of Alexandria (376-444) and is not a new doctrine of the Quakers.⁹³ The nature by which the Gentiles did the things contained in the law (Romans 2:10-16) cannot be understood of the Gentiles' corrupt nature, but was of the spiritual nature which proceeds from the seed and grace of God as humankind receives a new visitation of divine life. All people are visited by God in order to beget the spiritual nature in them unto regeneration and life eternal.⁹⁴

17 The Disciple joins in God's Universal Call by entering Prelapsarian Life with God through God's light and seed

Concerning the call of God and the fallen condition, Barclay states that herbs and trees are not considered sinners even though they experience natural decay and death. Spiritual death is the result of humanities sinning or missing the mark of God's righteous intent. Eternal death is opposed to eternal life in Paul's writing to the Romans (Romans 5:8). Natural death is unavoidable while outside the Garden of Eden, while eternal death is avoidable through Jesus Christ who obtained eternal life for the world through resurrecting from bodily death. Eternal death is destroyed through the bodily death and resurrection of the incarnation.⁹⁵ Rather than determining the 'sovereign' decrees of God, it is necessary and sufficient that God calls everyone everywhere to repent and to be saved through Christ Jesus, who tasted death for every person, and is given for a light to enlighten the Gentiles, and to be God's salvation to the ends of the earth.⁹⁶

⁹³ *ibid*, 329-30. The Seed remained in Adam as Breath until Raised by Christ as new covenant Seed promised to all people in a day.

⁹⁴ *ibid*, 331. God's Noetic Visitation is by the Seed & Grace of the second Adam whereby Humanity is begotten by the Spirit unto Regeneration and Eternal Life.

⁹⁵ *ibid*, 345. Eternal (Spiritual) Death, different from Natural (Fleshly) Death is opposed to Eternal Life provided through Jesus Christ for the World.

⁹⁶ *ibid*, 351. God calls every person everywhere to repent and be saved through Faith in Jesus Christ, who is given as a Light to enlighten the Gentiles to the ends of the Earth. Irenaeus of Lyon. *The Scandal of the Incarnation: Irenaeus*

The gospel Incarnation, according to the four evangelists, reveals the will of God for all and the Spirit's call to all to repent and to be saved through the light of Christ, as opposed to some are necessarily excluded from the revealed will and call of God by irrevocable decree before they are born. Barclay argues that he (referring to God) that desires to starve a person contributes equally to the person's starvation. Instead, the life-giving water comes to all by the Spirit (John 7:37-39).⁹⁷ Resistance to the Spirit and the rejection of Christ's pardon through Christ's blood is a sin resulting in eternal death. Receiving Christ's pardon and participating in life through the Son and the Spirit results in life eternal. The reason not all will experience pardoning by Christ who tasted their death is because they reject the seed of the second Adam and Spirit of Pentecost by which Christ's death is made effectual.⁹⁸ Christ has purchased salvation for all, and has purchased for all, grace prevalent to salvation. Paul in Romans (8:32, 39) speaks of those who had received the grace of the Spirit purchased. In them regeneration is at work begetting salvation.⁹⁹

18 The Preaching of the Gospel in all People is more universal than the Vineyard Workers receiving Wages from their Owner

Barclay argues that 'all humanity' is the proper subject of the gospel being preached. 'All humanity' is to believe that Christ died for them. The gospel is mercy and goodwill through the merit of Christ who tasted death for everyone. The gospel is preached to all by the light and Spirit of Christ, and is the commission of humanity.¹⁰⁰ Barclay asks if one outlives their day of visitation is God willing to

against the Heresies, Ignatius Press, 1990, 42-3. As regards God's grandeur, He is unknown to all who have been made by Him, for no one has ever scaled the heights of God, neither the ancients nor the men of today. But as regards His love, He is evermore known through the One through whom He made all kinds. This is His Word our Lord Jesus Christ, who in the last times became man among men, in order to join the end to the beginning, that is, man to God.

⁹⁷ *ibid*, 359-60. The Gospel Incarnation & light includes the Revealed Will & Call of God by the Spirit for All to Repent and to be Saved.

⁹⁸ *ibid*, 362. Non-Reception of God's Spirit by the seed of the resurrected 2nd Adam who tasted death for everyone results in Eternal Death.

⁹⁹ *ibid*, 362-3. Christ has Purchased Faith & Salvation; the Spirit of Grace Prevalent for the Salvation of All to work in All.

¹⁰⁰ *ibid*, 364-5. The Gospel is Mercy & Goodwill to All through the Merits of Christ who tasted the death of All. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 371. Blessed is the soul that loves her brother, for our brother is our life. Blessed is the soul that loves her brother: the Spirit of the Lord lives manifests within her, affording peace and gladness, and she weeps for the whole world. My soul remembered the Lord's love, and my heart

give them repentance. He concludes that God is long-suffering and unwilling that any would perish (II Peter 3:9) being different than the reformed Protestant who defends that some are never visited by God, by sovereign irrevocable decree.¹⁰¹ That the gospel is preached *in all* people is *far greater* than the outward administration of the gospel, making God *more just* than the vineyard owner in Jesus' parable giving wages to all workers (Matthew 20:12-14).¹⁰²

19 Doing Justice, Loving Mercy, and Walking Humbly with God is the indefinite Universal Call of God in all People

The Genesis account '*My Spirit shall not strive (abide) with man forever...*' (Genesis 6:3) reveals God's self-imposed limitation of striving with humanity. The prophet Micah recording '*What does the Lord require of thee, but to do justly, and to love mercy, and to walk humbly with thy God*' (Micah 6:8) reveals God's prelapsarian designs for all humankind indefinitely. Barclay firmly agrees that humanity cannot lay hold of salvation without the indwelling Spirit of God revealing that which is required indefinitely.¹⁰³ Barclay argues that to this end the seed of the second Adam is in the ungodly through the *nous*, but the ungodly are not denominated by the seed but by ungodliness. The

grew warm. My soul was given over to bitter lamentations that I had so deeply grieved the Lord, my beloved Creator; but he remembered not my sin; and then my soul surrendered and sorrowful weeping that the Lord might have mercy on every soul and take each one into his Heavenly Kingdom. And my soul weeps for the whole world.

¹⁰¹ *ibid*, 372-3. That God is Long-Suffering & not willing that any should Perish, invalidates the later reformers teaching that some are 'justly' never visited. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 371. I cannot remain silent concerning the people, who I love to the point of tears. I cannot remain silent because my soul ever grieves for the people of God, and weeping I pray for them. I cannot refrain from making known to you, brethren, the mercy of God and the wiles of the enemy. Forty years have gone by since the grace of the Holy Spirit taught me to love mankind and every living thing, and revealed to me the wiles of the enemy, who works his evil in the world by means of deceit. Believe me, brethren. I write before the face of God, Whom my soul by His mercy knew through the Holy Spirit. But had my soul not tasted of the Holy Spirit, she could not know the Lord, nor His love.

¹⁰² *ibid*, 376-7. The Gospel preached in All People is consistent with the unequal Payment to All the Laborers. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 371-2. The Lord is gracious and good but we could tell nothing of His love beyond what is in the Scriptures, were we not taught by the Holy Spirit. But you, brother, be not troubled if you do not sense the love of God within yourself: think upon the Lord, how He is gracious, and keep yourself from sin, and the grace of God will instruct you.

¹⁰³ *ibid*, 379. Doing Justice, Loving Mercy & Walking Humbly with God is possible for all through the uncreated Spirit of Grace indwelling. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 372. Love does not depend on time, and the power of love continues always. There are some who believe that the Lord suffered death for love of man but because they do not attain to this love in their own souls, it seems that it is an old story of bygone days. But when the soul knows the love of God through the Holy Spirit, she feels without a doubt that the Lord is our Father, the closest and dearest of fathers, and there is no greater happiness than to love God with all our mind, with all our heart and with all our soul, according to the Lord's commandment, and our neighbor as ourself.

seed is a kataphatic substance noetic; since no accident can be in a subject unless the subject is denominated therefrom ‘*We move and have our being in him*’ (Acts 17:26-29). To be denominated by the kataphatic substance of the second Adam is to receive the accident of incarnational godliness.¹⁰⁴

20 The Gospel to be preached is in Every Creature under Heaven

For the antagonist John Brown, the universal gospel by which salvation *is available* to those who don’t hear ‘the gospel’, renders preaching unnecessary. Barclay states that God still commands everyone to ‘believe’ the historic truths of the gospel to which God brings the historic truth. Yet saving ‘belief’ is both historic and saving without the incarnational details for the remote person who ‘believes’ kataphatically but has never heard of the incarnation.¹⁰⁵ The light of Christ is come into the world, yet humanity loved darkness, and none became children of the light but by ‘believing’. Brown, in puzzlement, concludes all are enlightened (John 1:9), the life of Christ is the light-noetic in humanity, yet all do not become children of the light.¹⁰⁶ Brown reasserts that if the gospel is in people the gospel needs no preacher. Barclay counters that the gospel was preached from the beginning of the world in measure, which was wrought in the human heart to save; albeit the full, plain, manifest discovery and precious effects of the gospel was preserved until the ministration of Jesus Christ and his apostles. Barclay asks, was not the promised seed (Genesis 3:15) a preaching of the gospel to fallen Adam? Paul reveals that the gospel is preached in ‘every creature’

¹⁰⁴ *ibid*, 389-90. Availing Ourselves of the Kataphatic Substance-Seed of the second Adam as uncreated Grace produces the Accident of Godliness; Receiving the Grace, Light & Kingdom Seed Noetic results in Theosis. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 372. When the love of God through the Holy Spirit is in the soul, everything rejoices her, but when it is lost sight of, man cannot find peace, and is troubled, and blames others as if they had done him injury, and does not realize that he himself is at fault: he has lost his love for God and has accused, or conceived a hatred for, his brother.

¹⁰⁵ *ibid*, 385. The Universal Communication of the historic Gospel is necessary to be Believed whether communicated in Words and/or by the Spirit.

¹⁰⁶ *ibid*, 392. The Life of Christ is the light of All, yet All are not become Children of the Gospel light.

under heaven (Colossians 1:23). Barclay concludes that while the good herbs are in the garden, the owner of the garden invites co-workers to inform of the herbs.¹⁰⁷

Barclay is adamant that the gospel is inward strength common to all people as the power of God (Romans 1:16), and that the gospel preached *in* every creature is communicated plainly (Colossians 1:21-23). The seed of the second Adam, and resurrection power manifest *in* all people, is the gospel.¹⁰⁸ Preaching provides an outward testimony of the mystery; the revelation that had been hid, the word being ‘*near in the heart and in the mouth*’ (Romans 10:8) and even sparingly revealed *in* the visible church but openly declared by Christ and his apostles.¹⁰⁹ Barclay argues that every person has sufficient grace, a day of visitation, and the shining of the sun of righteousness, yet who remains unconverted. No person can convert themselves by any human light, grace, or seed until quickened, visited, and stirred by visitation from God. There must be a concurring of the will of God in humanities conversion. No person is saved against God’s will. The concurrence and pliability of humanity to the grace of God is the product and effect of Grace being uncreated.¹¹⁰

A manifestation of the Spirit is given to every person indefinitely and absolutely and not only to those in the church. The manifestation of Grace is both the light of Christ and the Spirit of Pentecost sent of the Father which must be synergistically received by the recipient *in* the begetting, and *in* the maturing of the new creation.¹¹¹

Brown disagrees that the seed can be both hid and manifest at the same time. Jesus’s statement that the kingdom of God is within and among (Luke 17:21) reveals both the hidden ‘leaven’ and the ‘mustard seed’ (Matthew 13:31-33). The second Adam is intrinsic through his coming within, and

¹⁰⁷ *ibid*, 395. The Gospel to be Preached is preached in Every Creature under Heaven as promised Seed beginning with fallen Adam.

¹⁰⁸ *ibid*, 395-6. The Gospel is the Seed and Resurrection Power common to all people without discrimination.

¹⁰⁹ *ibid*, 396-7. The Mystery & Revelation Noetic hid in all Men’s Heart is further revealed through Outward Preaching.

¹¹⁰ *ibid*, 399. The Visitation of the Life of God provides the Energy-Synergy necessary to Salvation.

¹¹¹ *ibid*, 401. The Manifestation of the Spirit is given indefinitely & absolutely, intended for the begetting of every Human unto the new Adam.

extrinsic through the incarnation of the Son without.¹¹² The gospel preached in every creature means every person may be saved, and not every creature will be saved. Job and the prophets are examples of salvation from inward preaching. Barclay's argument remains that salvation for all is in no other name but Jesus.¹¹³

21 Jesus Christ and His Body are Uniform in the Way in which the Gospel is to be preached

Barclay argues that Colossians 1:19-23 in which the new covenant gospel is preached universally to all creatures is consistent with Titus 2:11-14 in which the grace of God bringing salvation has appeared to *all* humanity. Grace manifest to all creatures is parallel with Jesus Christ being the propitiation for the sin of the world (I John 2:1-2). This in no way reduces the call to preach the gospel outwardly but unifies the nature of Christ's commission with the new covenant reality of the Spirit of Christ.¹¹⁴ Barclay explains that the preaching of the gospel inwardly by the light of Christ is necessary to salvation as all are under the bodily condemnation of first Adam's seed. The new covenant seed of the second Adam is indiscriminately available to all as light through the bodily death, bodily resurrection, and bodily ascension of the second Adam which ushered in the Spirit of Pentecost proceeding from the Father.¹¹⁵

The world, God was *in* Christ reconciling, is not only to be understood of the elect. If the world is reconciled, there would be no need for entreating by Christ. All are made alive by God at one time or another. Paul does not say that all for which Christ died are made alive, but that all that are made alive, should live as having been made alive. Though Christ bore the sins of all on the tree, yet all

¹¹² *ibid*, 401-2. The Reality of the New Covenant Kingdom is both the seed Intrinsic within and Christ Extrinsic among at the same time.

¹¹³ *ibid*, 403-4. While all *may be* Saved, not all *will be* Saved; Salvation is in no other Name but Jesus.

¹¹⁴ *ibid*, 404-5. The Gospel within, Grace universal, & the Propitiation of Christ for the World unites with vocal Preaching.

¹¹⁵ *ibid*, 405. The indiscriminate Gospel is preached by the light of Christ to All inwardly who are under the Bodily condemnation of fallen Adam.

are not free from guilt until they receive ‘the condition’ of being born again through joining with the seed of the second Adam in being reconciled to God.¹¹⁶

Barclay affirms that the sinner cannot repent without the grace of God, or pray without the Spirit. A sinner prays by uncreated Grace when his iniquity has been exploited, and he approaches God, seeking pardon and help to amend. The grace of God works in all as the Spirit of God, to pray as received.¹¹⁷ Because of the divine mode and the inward supernatural operation of God, the mind (*nous*) does not always feel and perceive the voice of God. The voice of God is known as one would recognize the voice of a confidant. God is known by his own uncreated nature and property (John 1:9) being distinguishable from every created thing and recognized by the person *in* Christ when stirred (John 10:1-18; Romans 8:16, John 16:12-13).¹¹⁸

ORTHODOX SCHOLARSHIP AND CONCLUSION

Clement of Alexandria allows that the *energeia* of the devil and unclean spirits are able to sow into the non-believer seeds of destruction, but denies that the spirits dwell in the soul of the unbeliever. His concern is that heretics would claim that it was the agency of demons which produce the sins transgressed. Clement does not discount that bondage of sin is empowered by the operation of the devil. He recognizes that the demonic is something which humans will choose to cooperate with, and come under bondage if not resisted.¹¹⁹

¹¹⁶ *ibid*, 417-8. Justification as being made Alive through receiving the Condition of being Reconciled to God.

¹¹⁷ *ibid*, 492-3. The Prayer of Repentance involves Synergy with the Spirit of Grace.

¹¹⁸ Barclay’s Works III, *The Possibility and Necessity of the Inward & Immediate Revelation*, 568. The uncreated God as Father, Son, and Spirit speaks to the fallen created condition to humanities benefit.

¹¹⁹ Bradshaw, David. *Aristotle East and West: Metaphysics and the Division of Christendom*. Cambridge University Press, 2004, 124

Like Clement, Gregory of Nyssa shares the traditional emphasis on divine unknowability. He argues that the divine nature has no extension or limit, and therefore cannot be named.¹²⁰ But rather than referring to the names of God [Father, Son, Holy Spirit] as divine powers, Gregory refers to them as the divine *energeia*.¹²¹ The term ‘godhead’ is significant of operation and not of nature. God’s nature is the *energeia* of compassion and long-suffering.¹²² Regarding the divine names *as* names of the *energeia* enables Gregory to achieve a synthesis [emphasis mine]. He unifies the Trinitarian argument of Athanasius with traditional divine names, with the apophaticism that these names have, concluding with *energeia* leading universally to Theosis for all who would participate.¹²³ This blends the idea of the apophatic nature of the witness of God in all people with the kataphatic opportunity for all people to know Jesus savingly in Barclay.

Basil speaks of the divine *energeia* that fits the sense of ‘energy’. He speaks of the distribution of the gifts of the Spirit as that of divine energy that is equally present to all though received only in proportion to ‘faith’. Bradshaw quotes Basil: The Spirit is by nature unapproachable, apprehended by reason of its goodness, filling all things with its power, but communicated only to the worthy; not shared in one measure, but distributing its energy according to the proportion of faith; in essence simple, in powers various, wholly present in each, and wholly present everywhere; impassively divided and shared without loss, after the likeness of the sunbeam, whose kindly light falls on him who enjoys it as though it shown for him alone, yet illumines land and sea and mingles with the air. So, too, is the Spirit to everyone who receives it, as though given to him alone, and yet it sends forth grace sufficient and full for all humankind, and is enjoyed by all who share it, according to the capacity, not of its power, but of each person’s nature’.¹²⁴ This same nature included in Barclay is

¹²⁰ *ibid*, 163

¹²¹ *ibid*.

¹²² *ibid.*, 163-4

¹²³ *ibid*, 164

¹²⁴ *ibid*, 173

part of the good raised up in Barclay in his conversion moment in Quaker meeting. It is the divine *energeia* in Barclay that is evident in others, to include children.

Gregory of Nazianzus describes how Moses is able to perceive only the ‘back parts’ of God (Exodus 33). The limitation is not in God Himself but in Moses’s ability to apprehend Him. In the same way, although the Spirit is wholly present in His energies, He is received only in proportion to the capacity of faith of the recipient.¹²⁵ The occurrence of the sense of *energeia* as ‘energy’ reminds that the divine *energeiai* [plural] are not merely operations, but God Himself as manifested within creation. The sort of participation Basil describes is not merely cooperation with God, but actual participation in the divine being.¹²⁶ This contributes in Barclay to one being a co-worker with God.

In concert with the Basil passage quoted, Gregory asks how the Holy Spirit can be brought into such intimate association with a human soul. His answer is that the soul must be purified of the passions that alienate from God, cleansing and restoring the image of God within. This enables the soul both to see clearly its divine ‘model’ and reflect that ‘model’ to the world.¹²⁷ Bradshaw quotes Basil again: ‘Just as when a sunbeam falls on bright and transparent bodies, they themselves become brilliant to, and shed forth a fresh brightness from themselves, so souls wherein the Spirit dwells, illuminated by the Spirit, themselves become spiritual, and send forth their grace to others. Hence comes forth knowledge of the future, understanding of mysteries, apprehension of what is hidden, distribution of good gifts, the heavenly citizenship, a place in the chorus of angels, joy without end, abiding in God, the being made like to God, and the highest of all, the being made God’.¹²⁸ In this the effects of justification in Barclay, understood as deification in Orthodoxy, find uniformity.

¹²⁵ *ibid.*

¹²⁶ *ibid.*, 174

¹²⁷ *ibid.*

¹²⁸ *ibid.*, 175

The reference in Basil to ‘being made God’ is an expression of the Eastern Christian belief in Theosis or deification. Bradshaw states that this belief is most famously encapsulated in the dictum of Athanasius the Great that Christ ‘was made man in order that humanity might be made God’. Basil’s description is not limited to the afterlife, but is a description of the gifts of the Spirit available here and now. Nor is there any hint that ‘being made God’ is a *metaphor* [emphasis mine]. The divine state that Basil describes is *derivative* of the action of the Spirit and the presence of the divine image in which humanity was created [emphasis mine]. One who is illuminated by the Spirit truly is deified, just as truly as the *energeia*, in which he shares is God.¹²⁹ This is the reality Barclay finds in Quaker Christianity.

Chapter six begins with the place of the universal witness of God in Barclay scholarship; in particular Barclay’s combined Propositions V and VI concerning the redeeming bodily Jesus Christ and the metaphysical light of Jesus Christ which reveals the incompatibility of the Western framework in Barclay’s view of God, and new covenant Christianity. Instead the spiritual *energeia* of God is found in the gospel accounts, in Paul’s epistles, and in the teaching of the early Church as emphasized by Orthodox Christianity. Divine *energeia* is the universal call of God uniformly displayed in Barclay’s outlook of God’s view of the world. With the divine *energeia*, the conflict between the competing Calvinist and Arminian positions, which has plagued the Protestant reformer, is answered. The universal witness and call of God on the world opens the final Barclay chapter on the testimony of the saint, as the saint becomes the selfless co-worker with God toward the desired end of bringing all humanity into prelapsarian communion with God.

¹²⁹ *ibid*, 174

CHAPTER 7: Barclay and the Testimony of the Saint

INTRODUCTION: Chapter 7 opens with what recent scholarship has said about Barclay on the testimony of the saint, moves to revealing the saint as a co-worker with God in Barclay using the Lonergan method in theology, and concludes with scholarship on the nature of co-working with God leading to sainthood in Eastern Orthodoxy. This chapter is important in that for Barclay the saint reflects the *telios* of the Body of Christ in the world. The testimony takes effect through the restoration of the likeness and image of God in the disciple's journey back to the Father. The effect emerges from the metaphysical seed of the second Adam taking root from which the new person or new creation is born. The emergence is like the flowering of a mustard tree from a small seed, or as a child in the womb emerges from the egg of the mother being impregnated by the sperm of the father. The ongoing result comes by the Spirit of Pentecost, the Spirit of truth sent of the Father in Christ's name inhabiting the new creation unto the physical body shining like the glorified face of Jesus on the Mount of Transfiguration. The life of the saint is the fruit of the Kingdom of the Father (Matthew 13:43) shining forth from the soul, administering mercy, and justice toward all creation. The focal point of the saint is the inclusion of all humanity through the holistic nature of the Incarnation dying for all, resulting in transforming justification of the heart, coinciding with transfiguration of the life unto prelapsarian being and incarnational perfection (Matthew 5:33-37, 38-48; Luke 6:31-38).

BARCLAY SCHOLARSHIP RELATED TO THE TESTIMONY OF THE SAINT

Michael Birkel in his 2018 *Quakers Reading Mystics* states that Barclay intimates that as every person is gathered to the measure of life in them there is a secret unity and fellowship enjoyed which

the devil and all as instruments can never break or hinder.¹ Birkel continues that this ‘measure of life’ comes through the highest communication of God through the *nous* which is beyond reason, images, and diabolical attack.² This chapter will demonstrate that the measure of life beyond fallen reason and diabolical attack is the non-dualistic way of discipleship which combines the inward heart with the outward expression in realized eschatology.

In his 2019 chapter on Robert Barclay and Kabbalah in *Quakers and Mysticism*³ Birkel draws on the Kabbalistic nature of reincarnation in Francis Mercurius van Helmont’s writings while contrasting this with the biblical imagery of Christ being formed in the faithful producing the ‘new man’.⁴ The concrete guidance for action which Birkel claims the Light from Christ provides⁵ will be considered with the Spirit of Pentecost by which the saint is led. Concerning the testimony of the saint in Barclay will be the rejection of the *filioque* clause of which this researcher argues the Quakers would join the Orthodox in affirming the person of the Spirit proceeding from the Father to both pray within the believer and guide the disciple in prayer as fulfillment of life in the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit. It is a rejection of the Western doctrine of cessationism leading to the final Word of God being scripture.

In Madeleine Ward’s use of the word disciple which in Orthodox Christianity is an ascetical learner, she quotes Ethyn Kirby Williams who criticizes George Keith as expressing a Quakerism which is rationalistic and pedantic. Keith has departed from the ways of George Fox. This perspective is reiterated in John Pomfret’s history of West Jersey in Keith’s use of the Scriptures in preaching as a

¹ Birkel, Michael. *Quakers Reading Mystics*. Brill Publishing, Leiden, Netherlands, Issue 1.2, 2018, 21

² *ibid.*

³ Kershner, Jon, editor. *Quakers and Mysticism: Comparative and Syncretic Approaches to Spirituality*. Michael Birkel: Robert Barclay and Kabbalah. Palgrave Macmillan, 2019.

⁴ *ibid.*, 87

⁵ *ibid.*, 86

sign of departure in spirit from the priesthood of all believers.⁶ Keith is described as a ‘questioning disciple’ capable of living in harmony with Quakers when they agreed with him but not when they disagreed. Ward argues this is a result of Keith’s theological-metaphysical development related to the body of Jesus Christ.⁷ This she details as Keith’s development of ‘metaphor’ related to the inward body of Jesus Christ with the outward body of the Incarnation.⁸ This chapter will demonstrate that the rational conflicting nature of scholasticism in the West is incongruent with the Way of sainthood. Ward illustrates the Western conflict of an intellectual Christianity centered in the head with the contrariness of George Keith. Ward adopts the protestant use of ‘believer’ whilst disciple is only used in quotations.

Ward quotes the emphasis in the 1652 Quakers as being those who partake of the divine nature (II Peter 1:4) in the words of Richard Farnsworth.⁹ In 1694 Keith makes note in support of Barclay of a ‘middle being’ as being the Divine Nature of Christ.¹⁰ This would be in concert with Edmund Elys’ 1690 affirmation of the Good, Wise, and Godly coming about through partaking of the Divine Nature.¹¹ Barclay joins a measure of Grace with the Light of the Son and a measure of the Spirit.¹² Richard Vickris, a later martyr of Quakerism, accused opponent John Norris of divorcing the Light within from God’s grace.¹³ In 1694 Penn uses uniformly in the same sentence ‘The Lord has given unto us his Light and Grace....’¹⁴ In 1700 Richard Claridge would communicate that by directing people to the Light within, disciples would experience ‘that Peace with God, that Quietness and

⁶ Ward, Madeleine. ‘The Intellectual Context for the Development of Quakerism, 1647-1700’. PhD dissertation submitted to Wolfson College, University of Oxford, July 2017, 210.

⁷ *ibid.*, 224.

⁸ *ibid.*, 226. Ward refers to Keith’s 1677/1679 writing on *The true Christ owned as he is*, 6, 11, 17, 20-21; and his 1684 tract *Divine immediate revelation*, as evidence that Keith privilege’s the historical Christ [the Incarnation]

⁹ *ibid.*, 24

¹⁰ *ibid.*, 173

¹¹ *ibid.*, 194

¹² *ibid.*, 168

¹³ *ibid.*, 192

¹⁴ *ibid.*, 201

Assurance in Your Bosoms, which is the Work and Effect of Righteousness’ as they were ‘made Partakers of the Holy Life of Jesus’.¹⁵ This chapter argues that sainthood through Theosis is something more than legalistic moral perfection brought on by a derivative view of divine imminence in making the light of Jesus Christ something less than Christ’s full presence in the individual.¹⁶ Sainthood is accomplished by Christ and through Christ.

Yasuharu Nakano in his 2011 dissertation ‘Self and Other in the Theology of Robert Barclay’ identifies the nature of discipleship as being integrated into a religious community or church through which one is transformed as a disciple of Jesus unto his peaceable people.¹⁷ Nakano considers that through Sonship God’s realm on earth begins with God’s goal being embodiment in every person. Consequently Jesus expects his disciples called to God’s Sonship to believe in him and to follow his example so that they might become practitioners of His Kingdom. The steps of the disciple are neither logical nor straight leading to the realization of God’s kingdom but organic as the saint enters eternal time according to the dimension of human time realized through the Incarnation. This Nakano claims comes by the new covenant law of God, self-sacrifice in bearing one’s cross, and being led into the life of God’s Kingdom. (Matthew 10:38-39; Mark 10:15)¹⁸ Nakano concludes that for Barclay, love is the principal token of Christ’s disciple, the fulfilling of the law, and to love God above all things and one’s neighbor as one loves self is the sum of the law and the gospel.¹⁹

Alan Sell claims that Barclay intended to ‘defend God’s honor’ as part of his *Apology’s* rejection of the *Westminster Catechism* (1647) with primary resistance being to Calvin’s double predestination, which this researcher strongly argues has a direct effect on how one views the nature of God, God’s

¹⁵ *ibid*, 248

¹⁶ *ibid*, 241

¹⁷ Nakano, Yasuharu. ‘Self and Other in the Theology of Robert Barclay’. PhD dissertation submitted to the University of Birmingham, April 2011, 165.

¹⁸ *ibid*, 195-6

¹⁹ *ibid*, 259

sovereignty, and the nature of discipleship.²⁰ Sell draws attention to Barclay's first 13 *Theses* which follow the questions of the Westminster divines.²¹ It is in the final two propositions that Barclay will reflect the Jansenist leanings of his Scots College of Paris training culminating in the deification of Eastern Christianity: 'Humanity becomes by "Grace indwelling" what God is by nature'. This chapter will demonstrate that the testimony of the saint revealing the prelapsarian intent of God is the 'true Christian divinity' for which Barclay argued.

Elton Trueblood in his 1968 writing on Robert Barclay concludes that the path of purifying discipleship provides the witness of Christian salvation and the way forward through that witness. This is the true godliness of 'Christian worldliness'²² which this researcher argues can be expressed uniformly and indiscriminately between 'sinner and Saint' and 'theist and non-theist'. This would bring together what Hugh Pyper separates as narrow evangelical or humanist liberal. Trueblood opens up what this researcher considers to be nonconformity with the world through deification in the world.²³ Trueblood argues that ascetical discipleship does not forgo relaxation which is necessary to the tentativeness of the mind as long as people are clothed in tabernacles of clay [skin]. Relaxation was good and necessary in Barclay.²⁴ Barclay's integrity preferred that people see Christ when viewing others by eliminated the use of 'flattering' titles.²⁵ Barclay was careful that there is never a double standard in how people are addressed. Uniformity of value with all people is the heart of the incarnation.²⁶ Trueblood points out what this researcher considers as the apophatic

²⁰ Sell, Alan P. F. Robert Barclay (1648-1690), *The Fathers and the Inward, Universal Saving Light: A Tercentenary Reappraisal*. School of Advanced Study, University of London, *The Journal of the Friends' Historical Society*, Vol 56 No 3 1992, 212.

²¹ *ibid.*

²² Trueblood, Elton. *Robert Barclay*, Harper & Row Publishers, New York, 1968, 238.

²³ *ibid.*, 239

²⁴ *ibid.*

²⁵ *ibid.*

²⁶ *ibid.*, 239-40

nature of lived faith with the kataphatic nature of empirical understanding.²⁷ The kataphatic new covenant universal call of the resurrected Christ unto ascetical discipleship is realized empirically and uniformly as the con-contradictory and non-dualistic intent of God in the Garden of Eden and now. Barclay is committed to a Christianity which discarded incoherence.²⁸ This chapter will demonstrate that union with God produces restored hitting the mark of prelapsarian righteousness while at the same time releasing the believer/disciple from missing the mark.²⁹ The living tradition of the Saints combined with the non-dualistic universal call finds cogency with the government of this world in stopping evil while advocating for good.³⁰ Trueblood concludes by stating that Barclay's words acknowledge the reality of military peacemaking coexisting at the same time with humanitarian compassion. This chapter will demonstrate that there is room for both expressions within 'Christian worldliness'. Christian perfection sought the whole kingdom now with the equal realism that a Christian standard be raised by which all humanity may eventually be drawn.³¹

BARCLAY AND THE TESTIMONY OF THE SAINT [LONERGAN METHOD]

1 Inward Holiness and Righteousness is the means by which the twice born experiences Christ and His Kingdom

Nonverbal actions may be a declaration of a person's mind more than their words. The word of the Lord, which the prophets received, of which the shadow Scriptures record came immediately from God through the *nous* which words William Mitchell claims now to have ceased.³² Christ died for all that they who live eternally might no longer live to themselves but to God. Everywhere Christ

²⁷ *ibid*, 241

²⁸ *ibid*, 241-2

²⁹ *ibid*, 242-3

³⁰ *ibid*, 243-4

³¹ *ibid*, 248

³² Barclay's Works I, *Truth Cleared of Calumnies*, 154-5. God's immediate word & signs are New Covenant declaration according to scripture.

holds forth inward holiness and righteousness as that without which ‘*the new creature*’ (II Corinthians 5:17) cannot claim Christ and his kingdom (Matthew 13:43).³³

Barclay argues that the Lord did appear and was near the simple-hearted some 20 years ago (1652). Some who are now amongst the Quakers (1670) remember that day. Those who remember can testify that to follow the Lord in his leadings does far exceed that which was in that day. The sun is now set upon that day for the Lord is calling his people further. They are not to limit the Lord to invented forms (new covenant ‘sacraments’) but are to be found following the footsteps of the flock (the saints) whom the Lord is leading to a further state, in which they find the Lord appearing more gloriously than ever to their refreshment (II Corinthians 3:18; I Corinthians 13:12; I John 3:1-3).³⁴

The Quakers, wearing the armor of God, are out of reach of Mitchell’s hidden sword of Joab (II Samuel 20:8-10). Perseverance resulting from the uncreated Spirit has given the Quakers eyes to see through Mitchell’s designs.³⁵ The Quakers do not deny true worship of God but deny idolatrous superstitious worship of God. In offering thanks to God for the gifts and benefits received they wait upon the Lord for a period of time, that they may feel the Lord’s presence and know themselves

³³ *ibid*, 178. The New Creature lives to God eternally in inward holiness and righteousness. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 362-3. What shall I render unto the Lord? I am a sorry wretch, as the Lord knows, but my pleasure is to humble my soul and love my neighbor, though he may have given me offence. At all times I beseech the Lord Who is merciful to grant that I may love my enemies; and by the grace of God I have experienced what the love of God is, and what it is to love my neighbor; and day and night I pray the Lord gives me tears to weep for the whole world. But if I find fault with any man, or look on him with an unkind eye, my tears dry up, and my soul faints into despondency. Yet I begin again to entreat forgiveness of the Lord, and the Lord in his mercy forgives me, a sinner.

³⁴ *ibid*, 183. The Lord leads his people-flock into a further state in which the Lord appears more gloriously to their refreshment. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 363. Brethren, before the face of my God I write: Humble your hearts, and while yet on this earth you will see the mercy of the Lord, and know your Heavenly Creator, and your souls will never have their fill of love. Irenaeus of Lyon. *The Scandal of the Incarnation: Irenaeus against the Heresies*, Ignatius Press, 1990, 44. Love is the most excellent gift, more precious than knowledge, more gloriously than prophecy, superior to all other charisms.

³⁵ *ibid*, 212. Perseverance through Grace gives Eyes to see through Hidden Designs. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 363. No man of himself can know what God's love is unless he be taught of the Holy Spirit; but God's love is known in our Church through the Holy Spirit, and so we speak of this love. The sinful soul which does not know the Lord fears death, thinking that the Lord will not give her first sense. But this is because the soul does not know the Lord and how greatly He loves us. But if people knew this, that no man would despair, for the Lord not only forgives but rejoices exceedingly at the return of a sinner.

stated in the Lord's fear. The Quakers stand in the fear of God and are blessed from which any external expression comes.³⁶

2 Restored Communion with God comes by the Spirit of Pentecost by whom one knows God and prays

Barclay contends that to pray without the Spirit's drawing is hypocritical and deceitful. All prayers should be performed with the help of the Spirit. *'I will pray with the Spirit. The Spirit helps with our infirmities, for Christians know not what Christians should pray for, as Christians ought'* (I Corinthians 14:15; Romans 8:26) Barclay asks if they know not what to pray for without the Spirit, how can they pray without the Spirit? *'No one can say Jesus is Lord, except by the Spirit'* (I Corinthians 12:3). Such may truly be said to pray who wait upon the Lord, who stand in his fear, and bring forth the fruit of his righteousness which is to be in continuous prayer, which is more than outward words.³⁷ Barclay argues that Spirit-less prayer is a 'vain oblation' expressly forbidden. It is expressly commanded that prayer be unceasing in the Spirit. When the saints are dying or in difficulty, the Spirit will never be lacking to breathe through the saints at such occasions, and give words, as the giving of words is a service of the Spirit.³⁸

Barclay contends that the kingdom of God consists not in words but in reverence toward all people, seeing that the gospel according to Mitchell is but words, the shadow letter of Scripture itself.³⁹ In defense of the Quakers, a dying person had an abundance of the outward knowledge of Christ, and

³⁶ *ibid*, 212-13. Worship is comprised of waiting upon the Lord until the Lord's presence is felt unto holy Fear from which outward Expression comes. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 363. The Lord is not like us. He is meek, and merciful, and good; and when the soul knows Him she marvels greatly, and exclaims: O what a Lord is ours! The Holy Spirit gives the church to know how great is God's mercy.

³⁷ *ibid*, 214-15. Prayer comes by waiting on the Spirit of the Lord, standing in his Fear, and results in bringing forth the Fruit of his Righteousness.

³⁸ *ibid*, 215-16. As the Saint is dying or in difficulty the Spirit gives words of comfort through the Saint, who prays unceasingly for those who remain.

³⁹ *ibid*, 242-3. God's Kingdom gospel involves Equal Reverence towards All Others. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 363-4. The Lord loves us, and gently, without reproach, receives us, just as the father in the Gospel story did not reproach his prodigal son but called his servants to bring a new robe, and put a precious ring on his finger and shoes on his feet, and told him to kill the fatted calf and be merry; and in nothing did he condemn his son. O, how gently and patiently in our turn must we set our brother right, that there may be rejoicing in the soul over his return! The Holy Spirit teaches the soul ineffable lovingkindness.

the Quakers did not need to preach the historical knowledge of Christ which he knew, but to lead the dying man to know Christ within.⁴⁰ The apostle John writes that by being of God humanity knows the Spirit of truth and the spirit of error (I John 4:6). Being of God is the ground of knowledge more than the shadow Scriptures old and new.⁴¹

While the apostles and primitive Christians met the first day of the week to worship God yet Barclay asks of what significance are the remaining days of the week. John Calvin states the Sabbath day is ‘*a spiritual rest, wherein leaving our own works the Spirit of God may work in us*’ which agrees with the Quakers. The keeping of the first day is only for convenience and to preserve order in the church that the saints might have a time, set apart, to meet together in worship.⁴²

Though Mitchell charges that the Quaker principle refrains from repentance, mortification, believing, and the application of the blood of Christ, the contrary is abundantly shown in the Quakers.⁴³ Like the Quakers, Jesus Christ and the apostle Paul were accused of pushing the agendas of both hierarchy and anarchy. The Quakers like Christ are witnessing for God’s truth which has been ‘in measure’ hidden until many witnessed the truth, and now walk in the light of the Lord.⁴⁴

⁴⁰ *ibid*, 255-6. Knowing Christ within remains necessary for those with outward knowledge.

⁴¹ *ibid*, 271-2. By the Spirit of truth the Christian knows the spirit of error.

⁴² *ibid*, 304-5. The Church meets on the First Day as the means of the Saints preserving Order when Together and Separate under the Spirit.

⁴³ *ibid*, 321. The Quaker witness is one of repentance, mortification, believing and the application of the blood of Christ unto Theosis. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 364-5. Since the days of my youth I have loved to reflect: The Lord ascended into heaven and awaits our coming; but to be with the Lord we must be like Him, or like little children – lowly and meek – and we serve Him. Then, according to the words of the Lord, ‘Where I am, there shall also my servant be’ – we, too, shall be with Him in the Kingdom of Heaven. But now this day my soul is very downcast and dejected, and I am unable to lift an undistracted mind to God, and I have no tears wherewith to bewail my evil deeds: my soul is withered away and spent with the night of this life.

⁴⁴ Barclay’s Works I, *The Anarchy of the Ranters and the Hierarchy of the Romanists Refuted*, 459-60. Christ was accused of being a Jew and a Samaritan. Paul was persecuted by Gentile and Jew. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 364. We should continue in prayer without imagining, and ask of the Lord a humble spirit, and the Lord will love us and give us here on earth all things wholesome for soul and body. ‘O merciful Lord, give thy grace to all the peoples of the earth, that they may come to know Thee, for without thy Holy Spirit man cannot know Thee, and conceive of thy love.’ Little children, know the Creator of heaven and earth! ‘Oh Lord, send thy mercy on the children of the earth, whom thou dost love, and give them to know thee by the Holy Spirit. With tears I implore thee, hear my prayer for thy children, and grant that all may know thy glory through the Holy Spirit.’

3 Questions of Equity and Justice amongst the Body are determined by the Body

In response to the Quaker William Rogers, Robert Barclay is faithful to God's light and Spirit in his heart without needing to repent for his integrity and witness.⁴⁵ Barclay's faithfulness to truth is evident both with Rogers,⁴⁶ and in Barclay quoting Hai Eben Yokdan-Arabian Island Writer whom he later discovers is a fictional person.⁴⁷ The Vindication for Barclay's 1674 book entitled *The Anarchy of the Ranters and The Hierarchy of the Romanists Refuted*, being renamed *Robert Barclay's Book of Government* was affirmed by 33 Quakers in their own signatures in 1679. The 33 members who made up the 2nd Day Meeting stated that Rogers was not in disagreement with any of the doctrine but that Barclay might have written about some of the terms and expressions in a plainer, easier, and more familiar manner.⁴⁸

⁴⁵ Barclay's Works I, *Vindication & Postscript: The Anarchy of the Ranters and the Hierarchy of the Romanists Refuted*, 557-559. Barclay writes from the integrity of his awareness, wanting to starve the spirit that has any life in divisions or controversies amongst Friends. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 366-7. Beloved Brethren, let us humble ourselves that we may be worthy of the love of God; that the Lord may adorn us with His lowliness of spirit, with His humility; that we may become worthy of the heavenly mansion which the Lord has made ready for us. The Lord has love for all men but His love is greater for the one who seeks Him. 'I love them that love me;' saith the Lord, 'and those who seek me shall find grace.' And with grace life is good, and the soul rejoices and says, 'MY Lord, I am THY servant.' In these words there is great joy: if the Lord is ours, then all things are ours. That is how rich we are!

⁴⁶ *ibid*, 564. Rogers refers to Barclay's writing that 'this was but like the entertainment of Christ in the manger' which for Barclay shows too little Christian sobriety and too much scornful reflection for which Barclay chooses to forgive the Quaker William Rogers than contend with him due to their 'common bond' being one with the Vine. Those who break the bond with the Body have first broken the bond with Christ within. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 365-6. We cannot fathom the depth of the love of the Mother of God, but this we know: the greater the love, the greater the sufferings of the soul; the fuller the love, the fuller the knowledge of God; the more ardent the love, the more fervent the prayer; the more perfect the love, the holier the life. Not one of us is able to attain to the fullness of the Mother of God's love, and we have need of repentance like Adam. Yet in part, as we are taught of the Holy Spirit in the Church, we may comprehend that love of hers.

⁴⁷ Robert Barclay, *An Apology for True Christian Divinity*, 186. Barclay maintains integrity with what he has written, but concludes later, that with more accurate information on Hai Eben Yokdan, he would have written differently. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 366. The two apostles exclaimed 'Did not our hearts burn within us?' after the Lord withdrew from them. So does the soul recognized and love her Lord, and the delight of His love is a burning delight. In heaven there is one and the same love in the hearts of all, but on earth there are some that greatly love the Lord, others who love Him in small degrees, while still others love Him not at all. The soul that is filled with love of God is oblivious both of heaven and earth. The spirit burns, and invisibly beholds the Desired One, and the soul sheds many sweet tears and is unable to forget the Lord for a single second, for the grace of God gives strength to love the Beloved.

⁴⁸ Barclay's Works I, *Vindication & Postscript: The Anarchy of the Ranters and the Hierarchy of the Romanists Refuted*, 580. The 2nd Day Meeting (33 signatures) recommended that Barclay write a postscript to his book with further explanation of the content for those yet to understand.

4 The True Seed of the Ancient Christians is joined with by the Quakers according to God's Love

Barclay argues that the true seed in the most refined ancients of the Christian faith, the Fathers of Christianity has been answered by God's love through the Quakers.⁴⁹ The new covenant anointing, according to the apostle John's epistle '*abides in you, teaches all things, is truth and no lie, and as it teaches you, you abide in him*' (I John 2:27). The anointing is common to all the saints. The anointing is a more certain touchstone from which to discern and try seducers. By the anointing you do not need any person to teach you. After all has been said, the apostle John refers the readers to the anointing as being the most firm, constant and certain bulwark against all. The anointing is a lasting and continuing thing in whom it abides, teaching all things and guarding against all hazard.⁵⁰ Tumult, sedition, and horrible bloodshed have been committed by those who lean on tradition, sacred Scripture, and reason who claim to have been authorized by these. Strangers are killing strangers with no awareness as to why.⁵¹

The Quakers have proved that the doctrine of inward, immediate, objective revelation is primary to the secondary rule of shadow Scripture, according to the Scriptures themselves. This is Christ and his apostles' doctrine. The Quakers have shut the door on alternative doctrines, affirming that the shadow Scriptures give a full and ample testimony of all the principle doctrines of the Christian faith. There is no other gospel or doctrine but that which was delivered by the apostles. '*Let him be*

⁴⁹ Robert Barclay, *An Apology for the True Christian Divinity*, 30. The Fathers conclude with one voice that the seed of the Eternal Knowledge of God is revealed inwardly by God's Spirit. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 138. The phrase *silence of the mind* is given to us in the life and writings of the Holy Fathers from the first centuries of Christianity to the present day. God's Spirit speaks out of silence. (I Kings 19; Hebrews 3 & 4)

⁵⁰ *ibid.*, 59-60. The New Covenant Anointing Abides in, Teaches & is common to all Saints. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 367. Great and inapprehensible is our Lord, but for our sakes He belittled Himself that we might know Him and love Him; that for love of Him we should forget the earth, and live in heaven and behold the glory of the Lord. The Lord bestows such rich grace on His chosen that they embrace the whole earth, the whole world with their love, and their souls burn with longing that all men should be saved and behold the glory of the Lord.

⁵¹ *ibid.*, 64. Tradition, Scripture & Reason within themselves provide No Complete Answer.

accursed who preaches another gospel' Galatians 1:8.⁵² In this, the Quakers stand for the new covenant revelation of the same old gospel doctrine, and deny a revelation of a new gospel doctrine. No other foundation can be laid than that which is already laid by Christ, his apostles, and the fathers of the church.⁵³

5 The Grace of God, Uncreated, has been communicated to all Humanity

Barclay instructs that all humanity has a measure of saving grace as communicated by the apostle Paul to Titus. *'The grace of God, that brings salvation, has appeared to all men; teaching us, that denying ungodliness and worldly lusts, Christians should live soberly, righteously, and godly, in this present world'* (Titus 2:11). The grace of God that brings salvation is no natural principle or light, and has appeared to all people. The grace of God comprehends the whole duty of humanity, teaches to forsake evil, deny ungodliness and worldly lusts, to live soberly with temperance, chastity, and meekness as relating to oneself, to live righteously with equity, justice, and honesty relating to one's neighbor, and to live godly with piety, faithfulness, and devotion to God. There is nothing required or is needful that the measure of grace does not teach or instruct.⁵⁴

⁵² *ibid*, 94. Inward, Immediate, Objective Revelation is the Doctrine of Christ, the Apostles & the Scriptures. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 88-9. Individual members of the Church – not excluding her finest sons and teachers – do not achieve the whole fullness of the gifts of the Holy Spirit, and so their teachings and writings are marred by one or another imperfection – sometimes even error – whereas as a whole the Church's schooling, possessed of gifts and knowledge, remains true for all time.

⁵³ *ibid*. Quakers stand for the New Covenant Revelation in the same Old Gospel & Old Doctrine. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 89. Unwavering faith in the Conciliar Church's teaching and profound confidence in all that the Church has recognized and confirmed in her experience lies at the root of the Athonite monk's life, preserving him from nonconformist dilettantism and fumbling research. Thus entering through faith into the life of the universal Church, the monk becomes co-possessor of boundless riches, and his own personal experience acquires absolutely authentic character.

⁵⁴ *ibid*, 175-6. The Grace of God as Saving Light has Appeared to All and Teaches Godly Things. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 368. The Lord's love is such that He would have all men to be saved, and abide eternally with Him in heaven, and behold His glory. We do not know the fullness of the Lord but through the Holy Spirit we may conceive of it here. But the man who has not come to know the Holy Spirit can have no conception of this glory: he can only believe in the promise of the Lord, and keep His commandments. However, he, too, is blessed, as the Lord explained to the disciple Thomas, and will have equal place with those who beheld the glory of God while still here below.

6 Jesus Christ Formed Within is the Means of Hitting the Prelapsarian Mark of God's Righteousness

Remission of sins comes by the righteous obedience of Jesus Christ performed in the flesh as the outward procuring cause of Jesus Christ now being formed within in works of righteousness whereby the new creation hits the mark of God's prelapsarian intent.⁵⁵ The apostle James writes 'ye see that by works a man is justified, and not by faith alone' (James 2:24). If no one can be justified without faith, and no faith be living without works, then 'works' are integral in justification.⁵⁶

7 Humility is at the Heart of God's Kingdom being established through Watchfulness and Diligence

Barclay argues that humility is necessary in overcoming sin, and in establishing the kingdom of God so as not to encourage iniquity or lie down in presumptuous security. Watchfulness and diligence are indispensable to growth in fertile kingdom soil.⁵⁷ God has given assurance to his children, and is willing to give to all a full and certain assurance that all are His and that '*no power shall be able to pluck them out of his hand*' (John 10:29-30). But this assurance is no assurance if those so assured are not established and confirmed beyond all doubt and hesitation. If then they are so established, then there is no doubt or any power that can pluck them from his hand. '*He that overcomes will be made a pillar in the temple of God and will go no more out*' (Revelation 3:12). This general promise

⁵⁵ *ibid*, 198. Hitting the mark comes by Jesus Christ in the flesh being formally formed within in works of righteousness. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 368. If you would know the Lord, humble yourself to the utmost, be obedient and sober in all things, love truth, and the Lord of a surety will give you to know Him through the Holy Spirit; and then he will know by experience just what love towards God is, and what is love towards man. And the more perfect the love, the more perfect your knowledge. There is love in small measures; there is a mean of love; and there is great love.

⁵⁶ *ibid*, 218. Works of Justification are necessary to Salvation in Christ. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 369. The grace of God enlightens in various degrees of love for God. Where a man fears to distress God by sinning in any way, that is the first degree of love. The man whose mind is undistracted has love in the second degree, which is greater than the first. A third and higher degree is when a man is aware of grace in the soul. And, finally, the man who has grace of the Holy Spirit in both soul and body is in a state of perfect love; and if he preserves this grace, the bones of his body will become sacred relics, as did the bones of the holy martyrs, prophets, the blessed fathers, and other great Saints.

⁵⁷ *ibid*., 254. Fertile Kingdom Growth requires Watchfulness, due Diligence & Humility. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 369. The Lord is so dear and so kind that from love of Him the soul can think of nothing else. The grace of the Holy Spirit is so wondrously sweet, and so transforms a man that he will even forget father and mother. The soul that has come to know the Lord in His fullness, undivided in Him, desires nothing else, and clings to nothing on earth, and were she offered a kingdom she would have no desire for it, for the love of Christ is so sweet, and so rejoices and gladdens the soul, that even to live like a king would hold no attraction.

is for all. Paul himself declares to have obtained the sealed condition by affirming ‘*I have fought a good fight*’ (II Timothy 4:7). But Barclay contends that there are those, both in former and in present times, who have not fought the good fight, and so have fallen away from what had been so far secured.⁵⁸

8 The Church under the leadership of the one Spirit has been disrupted through Scholasticism

The church signifies a certain number of people gathered by God’s Spirit, and by the testimony of his servants raised for the end of the true belief of the principles and doctrines of the Christian faith, who through their hearts being united by the same love, and understandings informed in the same truths, gather, meet, and assemble together to wait upon the Lord, to worship him, and to bear joint testimony for truth against error, suffering for the same truth, and so become through fellowship, one family and one household. Barclay asks that in certain respects, does not each watch over, teach, instruct, and care for one another according to the measure received and attainment secured? This visible original Church has been greatly interrupted since the apostles’ day by reason of the [scholastic] apostasy (8th-16th centuries).⁵⁹

Barclay instructs that to be a member of the church of Christ, the inward work of being leavened into the nature and Spirit of the second Adam is indispensable. So also is the outward profession of belief in Jesus Christ, and adherence to the holy truths delivered by the Spirit in Scripture. The mediate testimony of the Spirit in shadow Scripture answers the same immediate testimony of the

⁵⁸ *ibid.*, 255-6. God desires to give All the Assurance of Inheritance that is beyond Doubt & Hesitation. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 368. The man who fears sin loves God; the man with a gentle heart loves Him more; still greater is the love of the man in whose soul dwell light and joy; but the man with grace in soul and body knows perfect love. This is the grace that the Holy Spirit gave to the martyrs, the grace that helped them to bear every suffering with fortitude.

⁵⁹ *ibid.*, 259-60. The Church gathers to Wait upon the Lord, Worship Him, Bear Truth against Error, Suffer for the Truth & Watch over One Another according to each Person’s Measure of Attainment. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 354. Many philosophers and scholars have arrived and believe in the existence of God but they have not come to know God. We monks apply ourselves in study of the Lord’s command but not all of us by a long way have come to come to know the Lord, although we believe in Him. To believe that God exists is one thing, to know God another.

Spirit in the heart even as face answers face, as in a mirror (James 1:22-24). The inward work of holiness and forsaking iniquity is necessary in every respect to be a member of the universal Church.⁶⁰

The devil has taught his followers to affirm that no person, however holy, is a member of the church without outward profession and ceremony. Such who are inwardly unholy and elevated over the saints have elevated darkness for light, words for action, and vanity over holiness.⁶¹ Those not clothed with Christ cannot affect others with the righteousness by which humanity is to be clothed. When a person ceases inwardly to be a Christian by turning to Satan and becoming reprobate, they are no more Christian than a dead corpse is a living person. It is only God who created first Adam that revives fallen Adam from within as second Adam, and clothes with righteousness.⁶²

Barclay argues that Christ is the vine. Unless Christ's disciples abide in Christ they cannot bear fruit, and if they are unfaithful they will be cut off and cast forth as a branch to wither. The redeemed arms, legs, eyes, ears, nose, etc. of the Body come only by Christ the Vine (John 15:1-8).⁶³ Uncreated grace in measure brings forth the kingdom, converting and acting powerfully in the person's soul. Grace works as seed in fertile soil, operating as leaven, bringing forth the fruit of blameless conversation, justice, holiness, patience, and temperance necessary to minister.⁶⁴

True learning proceeds from the inward teaching and instruction of the Spirit whereby the soul learns the secret ways of the Lord, and becomes acquainted with the inward travails and exercises of the mind. The soul learns by a living experience how to overcome evil and the temptations of the

⁶⁰ *ibid*, 260. The Inward Leavening into the Nature & Spirit of the light of Christ, the outward Profession of Jesus Christ and the Truths delivered by the Spirit in the Heart as in the Scriptures even as Face answers Face in a Glass is indispensably necessary to become a Member of the Church.

⁶¹ *ibid*, 260-1. Inward Holiness, Light, and Actions are more a testimony than Profession, Darkness, & Words.

⁶² *ibid*, 269-70. Only God as Second Adam Revives and Clothes Fallen Humanity with Righteousness making Humanity an Effective Witness

⁶³ *ibid*, 276. Renewed members come only through disciples remaining in Christ the Vine.

⁶⁴ *ibid*, 287. Grace works as Kingdom Seed in Fertile Soil bringing forth Blameless Conversation, Justice, Holiness, Patience, and Temperance.

evil one by following the Lord, walking in his light, waiting daily for wisdom and knowledge immediately from his revelation. This soul lays up heavenly and divine treasure in the heart. Out of the treasury of the heart, the disciple brings forth treasure new and old, as the Spirit moves and gives true liberty, and as the glory of the Lord requires for whose glory the disciple, being the temple of God (I Corinthians 6:19), learns to do all things.⁶⁵

9 The Day is restored whereby the Gospel as New Covenant Reality is realized

Barclay contends that God has raised witnesses for himself in Barclay's day as God did the fishermen of old, altogether without carnal learning, and has by the power and Spirit of God struck at the very root of Babylon. In the strength and might of his power, God has gathered thousands by reaching their consciences to the Power and Life, which, as to the full historical knowledge, are far from knowing, yet are not able to resist the virtue that proceeds from the Quakers raised. Barclay acknowledges that he declares from certain experience because his heart has been greatly broken and tendered by the virtuous life that proceeds from these illiterate ones. By their countenance, as well as their words he felt the evil in him chained down and the prelapsarian good reached and raised.⁶⁶

Barclay argues that by the outward church establishing their own order, rather than order being established from the immediate counsel and influence of the Spirit (Acts 15:28) there has been a tearing of one another, contending, verbal disputes, fighting, wars, and bloodshed no less amongst

⁶⁵ *ibid*, 289-90. The inward Instruction of the Spirit provides the Secret Ways of the Lord, and Lays up Heavenly Treasures in the Heart to be later Used. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 384. We should live our lives on earth in such fashion that the soul is always aware of abiding with God! The Lord said, I will not leave you comfortless, and gave us the Holy Spirit, and the soul must feel that the Divine Spirit lives in her – though she have but little grace, the soul is still conscious of the Lord's love, feels that the Lord is ours and we are His. But the man whose soul this is not so has lost grace.

⁶⁶ *ibid*, 297. The Ministry of the Quakers is like the Fishermen of old in chaining down Evil and raising up Virtue at the Dismay of the Learned of which Robert Barclay is recipient. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 372. Grace proceeds from brotherly love, and by brotherly love is grace preserved; but if we do not love our brother, then the grace of God will not come into our souls. If people kept Christ's commandments, there would be paradise on earth, and with little labor man would suffice his needs, and the Divine Spirit would live in the souls of man, for He Himself seeks us and would dwell in us, and if He does not take up His abode in us, it is all because of the arrogance of our minds.

Christians as amongst heathen.⁶⁷ Ministry is not to be monopolized by a certain kind of clergy and the rest of the church to remain laity. Ministry is left to the free gift of God to choose whom God sees meet without respect to background or gender. Such as have this call, verify the gospel by preaching not in speech only but in power, in the Holy Spirit, in much fullness which cannot help but be received and heard by those of Christ.⁶⁸ From the clergy-laity distinction, the clergy discriminate against blue-collar men, saying they are not fit for ministry because of defective education. Thus blue-collar men neglect the gift and call of God in themselves and quench the pure breathings of the Spirit of God in their hearts, which if given way to will provide more for the edification of the church than the professional clergy's sermons. The apostle Paul's advice and exhortation is "*Quench not the Spirit nor despise prophesying*" (II Thessalonians 5:19-23).⁶⁹

Barclay argues that male and female are one in Christ Jesus as God gives his Spirit in all, making it unlawful for the female to quench the Spirit's gifting and calling. It is by evil discrimination that the Christian equality of male and female (Galatians 3:28) is quenched. Paul gives rules for how women should behave in public preaching and praying, gives testimony to how women labored with him in the work of the gospel, and that God has effectually converted many souls by the ministry of women.⁷⁰

10 The Singular Nature of Worship amongst Quakers has a Cleansing Effect in all Participants

Though worship according to the Quakers is not limited to times, places, nor persons, yet worship does include assembling together at set times and places. Nor does being driven from worship by

⁶⁷ *ibid.*, 299. Instead of the immediate counsel of the Spirit, tumults, war & bloodshed have reigned amongst Christians as much as heathens. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 372-3. Nowadays men's hearts have grown proud, and only through affliction and repentance can we arrived at salvation, while as for love – it is rarely obtained. Saint Antony the Great said, I no longer fear God but love Him. He said this because his soul was flooded with the grace of the Holy Spirit, Who testifies to this love, and then it is impossible for the soul to speak otherwise. But to those who have not this immense grace, the holy Fathers teach repentance; and repentance is not far removed from love, whose coming depends on simplicity of heart and humility.

⁶⁸ *ibid.*, 300-1. God's free Ministry comes through All irrespective of Background or Sex.

⁶⁹ *ibid.*, 306-7. Apostolic Ministry is equally intended for the Uneducated yet Spirit filled.

⁷⁰ *ibid.*, 307-8. The New Covenant Spirit of Christ does not discriminate against calling Women into public Ministry.

threats and persecutions of the enemy stop the Quakers from waiting upon the Lord and worshipping him. Barclay contends that as long as we are clothed in the fleshly tabernacle there is the necessity of a joint and visible fellowship, a bearing of an outward testimony of God and a seeing of faces, one of another in concurring with the body as well as the spirit, to be accompanied with inward love and unity of spirit which greatly encourages and refreshes the gathered.⁷¹

Divine strength is communicated through Christ's Body gathered, and waiting upon the Lord in silence. Sometimes when one enters that has been unwatchable and wandering in mind from the hurry of worldly affairs, and so is not inwardly gathered, so soon as they retire inwardly, the power of Christ, being raised in good measure in the gathered will suddenly lay hold upon their spirit and wonderfully raise the good in them, and beget them into the same power by melting and warming their heart.⁷² Even the rude and wicked who come into the meeting, in whom the power of darkness prevails, if the whole meeting be gathered into the Life, and the Life be raised in good measure, it will strike terror into the wicked by virtue of the life raised. The power of darkness will be chained down, and the measure of grace raised to the redeeming of their soul.⁷³

⁷¹ *ibid.*, 325. The Outer Body & Inner Person Gathers at set times with others for Worship that is Timeless in unity of spirit unto Restored Likeness through Christ indwelling. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 359. The Merciful Lord gave the Holy Spirit on earth, and by the Holy Spirit was the Holy Church established. The Holy Spirit unfolded to us, not only the things of the earth but those, too, which are of heaven. By the Holy Spirit we came to know the love of the Lord, which is a consuming love. Filled with love, the holy Apostles went into all the world and their spirit thirsted that all men might know the Lord. The Prophets, beloved of the Lord, rejoiced in the Holy Spirit, wherefore the words they spoke with mighty and pleasant, for every soul would hear the word of the Lord.

⁷² *ibid.*, 332. The Noetic Power of the Lord in Gathered worship is raised in the Unwatchful and Unsettled One. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 148. When one returns from the realm of Eternal Light, where one lives with certainty his freedom from death, and in eternity, the veil of this life shrouds him again and yet he finds that both his personal cognition and his perception of the world as altered radically, and for numerous reasons cannot be modified. This effect, effects those coming in contact with this person.

⁷³ *ibid.*, 333. The Life in Gathered Worship Reaches and can Redeem the Rude and Wicked. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 148-9. The incident of the person who experiences a fall from the Eternal Light, freedom from death, and eternity gained, results in him seeing in every other human being an immortal brother. The lively sense of unity and interior contemplation of God unconnected with creation fill the soul with an incomprehensible manner with love for humanity and every other living creature. It becomes clear that only after one has known the grandeur of man in his spiritual understanding and one really appreciate and love one's fellow being.

This was Robert Barclay's experience as he confesses that when he came into the silent assemblies of God's people he felt a power among them which touched his heart noetically, and as he gave way unto the power he found the evil weaken in him and the good raised and so became knit and united unto them, hungering more and more after the increase of power and life whereby he might feel himself perfectly redeemed. Barclay determined that this was the surest way to become a Christian as the natural fruit of the good root, and such knowledge will not be barren or unfruitful. Barclay concludes that though thousands be convinced in their understandings of the truths the Quakers maintain yet few are sensible of the inward life in the *nous*, and their souls are not changed from unrighteousness to righteousness. For the kataphatic power noetic is the cement whereby Christians are joined to the Lord, and to one another, and without this power none can worship.⁷⁴

Barclay emphasizes that instead of the name of Quaker, the name 'Tremblers' was first cast upon the Quakers. The Quaker adversaries were sensibly laid hold of by the power and were made to yield to the Quakers, join them, and attest to the truth of the Quakers before they had any distinct knowledge of the doctrine. The Lord's power kataphatic would also reach to and wonderfully work in little children to the admiration and astonishment of many.⁷⁵

11 Worship in Spirit and in Truth produces Fruit in keeping with Christ indwelling as seed

Barclay witnesses that instead of beatings and imprisonments hindering the Quakers' fellowship with God, one another, and the pure Light of righteousness, the Lord knowing their sufferings and reproaches for his testimony's sake caused his power and glory more and more to abound among them, refreshing them by a sense of his love which filled their souls. As the Quakers found

⁷⁴ *ibid.*, 333-4. The good rose up in Barclay when encountering the Power and Righteousness of the Lord Noetic amongst the Quakers. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 149. The first ecstasy of vision is given to man from on high without his seeking it, since, ignorant of it, he could not look for it. But then, later, he cannot forget it, and sad at heart he seeks it again and again, not only for himself but for everyone else, too. This was the journey of Robert Barclay who experienced the Power and Righteousness of the Lord experimentally and noetically as had George Fox and the first Quakers.

⁷⁵ *ibid.*, 335-6. The Prevailing Power of Truth and Spirit works in young Children as well as in adults

themselves gathered ‘*into the name of the Lord*’ which is the strong tower of the righteous (Proverbs 18:10) they felt themselves sheltered from receiving inward hurt, being delivered by the Lord from the vain name and ‘Christian profession’ of their opposer. As the ‘power of truth’ brought the adversary to a measure of quietness and stillness, stopping their fury and madness, God made a way, in their raging wickedness, to peaceably enjoy and possess Him, and in worship to convince the adversary of ‘the truth’ as it is in Him.⁷⁶ The Quaker adversaries were sensibly laid hold of by the power kataphatic, were made to yield unto the Quakers, join them, and attest to the truth before they had any discursive knowledge of the Quaker doctrine.⁷⁷

As a result, Barclay claims that the Quakers know they are partakers of the new covenant dispensation, disciples of Jesus Christ, sharing with Christ and the Spirit in the worship of the Trinity. As the Incarnation was in the world, so are the Quakers become in the world as the image and likeness of God through immersion into the Father, the Son, and the Spirit is restored.⁷⁸ Jesus

⁷⁶ *ibid*, 349. The Lords Power and Protection is evident within, and to the Opposer during periods of Hostility. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.’ 2016, 66-7. Graham assumes that the conquest of sin can be achieved by conscious and deliberate striving, by which human beings can grow into their true nature, as intended by God. ‘The nature within us which is good, St. George fighting the dragon, is our true nature, to which we grow more harmonious, more obedient’. If we fail to struggle, if we allow bad habits to grow on us, we can fall under the power of sin, but there is, in Graham’s theology, no need for divine intervention to set us right, for we are already united with God through his indwelling presence, which is indistinguishable from our own better nature. St Paul could be quoted in support of this view: ‘Work out your own salvation with fear and trembling, for it is God which worketh in you’. (Philippians 2:12) ‘The at-one-ment of God and Man is according to nature, is the goal of the saints; and sin is mere friction, mere dirt, mere defacement’. Thus in Graham there are two natures, the lower, which we inherit from our animal past, and the higher, the goal to which we are destined, by virtue of our union with God and Christ. For Barclay the animal past and the Christian becoming is accomplished through Christ and is the trajectory of the Christian united with Christ. Christ within is metaphysically separate from human physicality being glorified, ascended and within. Our true nature is restored and is like Saint George in fighting the ancient dragon of evil.

⁷⁷ *ibid*, 335-6. The Prevailing Power of Truth and Spirit works in the Adversary.

⁷⁸ *ibid*, 350. In sharing as Christ did in Spiritual Worship, so as Christ was, so does the Disciple become in this World. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.’ 2016, 67-8. There was nothing magical about the Atonement. In the speech at the Manchester Conference Graham speaks of Christ’s sacrifice in terms of its moral power: ‘His teaching about self-consecration would have been futile, had it not been carried out by Himself to the bitterest of bitter ends, and so gained power to draw all men to Him’. He stresses the Pauline doctrine that we should be crucified with Christ, deprecating Bunyan’s account in Pilgrim’s Progress of how Christian finds himself freed from the ‘burden’ of sin when he looks on the Cross: ‘We no longer think of sin as a burden on the back which we need the sight of the cross to magically lose – we regard sin rather as a law in our members from which we are to be redeemed by being crucified with Christ to the lusts which war against the soul’. Barclay spoke of mortification of the flesh as did Graham towards freedom from sin. The at-one-ment with God included picking up our cross and following Christ as Christ revealed the way to life. This life concluded in our realizing the love, mercy and kingdom of the Father through love of enemy, forgiveness, and the righteousness of hitting the mark restored. This is theosis.

Christ, the author and institutor of new covenant worship testifies that God is neither to be worshiped in this place nor that place but is to be worshiped in spirit and in truth (John 4:24). For as much as God's kingdom is not of this world, neither does worship consist of the wisdom, glory, riches, or splendor of this world to beautify or adorn it. Worship is performed by those who are spiritually minded through the *nous*. Because worship of God is purely spiritual, being in spirit and in truth, it is out of the reach of natural man to interrupt or obstruct.⁷⁹

Barclay claims that the worship of the Quaker opposers, both Papist and Protestant is of the worldly kind because they are not in the patience of Jesus, to serve and worship him with sufferings, calumnies, and reproaches. Hence, from the Papists and Protestants have sprung wars, fighting, and bloodshed while each, by the fleshly arm of man, endeavors to defend and protect their own righteousness and worship.⁸⁰

Barclay reveals that the nature of Christ's worship is performed by the operation of the Spirit; the natural part being silent appears from the words of Christ to the Samaritan woman. It was the first, chief, and most ample testimony given by Christ concerning worship as contradistinguished from old covenant worship under the Law of Moses. *'But the hour comes, and now is, when the true*

⁷⁹ *ibid*, 350-1. Worship instituted by Jesus Christ is both Spiritual and not of this World; being of another Spirit and Kingdom altogether. Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.' 2016, 71. Grubb is an example of a Christian who combined a liberal view of the Bible and ecclesiastical authority with a firm attachment to the doctrine of atonement, however much he might seek to reinterpret it. His 'synthesis' of Christianity and evolutionary theory leaves what many would consider the doctrinal heart of Christianity unchanged: the reality and gravity of sin as rebellion against God and nature and hence the need for redemption, and the 'supernatural' intervention of God as redeemer in the person of Jesus Christ. Renaissance Quakers as represented by Grubb and Graham faced up to the challenges posed by evolutionary theory by demonstrating that Quakerism was adaptable enough to embrace a modern scientific outlook. Dale brings together the renaissance of Grubb and Graham to adapt to Darwin's theory of evolution. This PhD argues that the sin issue and the bodily death consequence are dealt with through transformation of the person through theosis. There is not a conflict between religion and science related to God's redeeming work in humanity. Both are dealt with through faith which brings death to sleep and sin to righteousness in God's reign restored. Through the incarnation humanity finds at-one-ment, the Spirit resides within the human temple, and the Bible finds its rightful place. Mary, as ark of the new covenant, realizes the heart of Christian bodily expression.

⁸⁰ *ibid*, 351. The Kingdom defended by the Spirit is not with Bloodshed & Arms of Flesh as is the way of the papists and Protestants.

worshippers shall worship the Father in spirit and in truth: for the Father seeks such to worship him. God is a Spirit and they that worship him, must worship him in spirit and in truth' John 4:23-24.⁸¹

The Quakers present themselves before the Lord by inward retirement of mind as his Spirit helps and draws, exercising them for the trial of their patience that He might teach them not to rely on outward performances, that their dependence upon Him might be more firm and constant, to draw near unto Him with great freedom and enlargement of Spirit upon their hearts.⁸² Singing that pleases God proceeds from that which is pure in the heart, from the words of life within which becomes spiritual songs returned to the Lord. Artificial music with rote words can bring expressions that are hypocritical and false to the singer.⁸³ The Quakers find the Spirit of God to be the seal, pledge, and earnest of their inheritance. What is in the heart, and the work that comes from the heart fits one for heaven or hell.⁸⁴

As communion with Christ is the Christian's chief and greatest work so also is the Christian to do all things with respect to God and fellowship with him as they are tied and united of their very nature according to the command of God. Communion with Christ cannot be enjoyed apart from inclusion in all things. Thus salvation has a necessary respect to holiness, because '*without holiness no man shall see God*' (Hebrews 12:14). Eating the flesh and blood of Christ has a necessary respect to life, just as our feeling God's presence has a necessary respect to meeting together where Jesus is felt in the midst of two or three gathered in his name (Matthew 18:20, 28:20).⁸⁵

The Scripture witness reveals that external rites are no necessary part of the new covenant dispensation yet certain practices continued for a time until they faded away, to be replaced by the

⁸¹ *ibid.*, 351-2. Jesus Christ authored New Covenant Worship to be in the Spirit requiring silent Waiting & Watching.

⁸² *ibid.*, 367. Prayer is learned Response in the Mind to Communion with the Spirit-Noetic.

⁸³ *ibid.*, 379. Singing Psalms from a Pure Heart expressing Pure Expressions rather than Rote Expressions.

⁸⁴ *ibid.*, 384. The Heart is the locus of the Spirit's Seal and Pledge, or the Spirit's absence.

⁸⁵ *ibid.*, 424-5. The Chief Work in Communion with Christ leads to Personal Holiness in all things & Knowing Christ's Real Presence amongst the Gathered.

new covenant dispensation. The ceremony of bread and wine is ceased being replaced by righteousness and joy in the Holy Spirit. The kingdom of God stands in '*righteousness, peace and joy in the Holy Spirit*' (Romans 14:17). Eating of bread and wine is no necessary part of the gospel nor is it a perpetual ordinance of the kingdom of God being manifest in the heart and flowing through the live.⁸⁶

12 God's Kingdom is propagated organically through Liberty of Conscience and Persuasion

The pretended power of the government, in religious matters of the conscience is contrary to and inconsistent with the nature of the gospel. Christ expressly said '*my kingdom is not of this world*', and if propagating the gospel had any necessary relation to civil government then Christ would not have said his kingdom is not of this world. But Christ has abundantly shown that the gospel is propagated by persuasion, and the power of God brings suffering from the wicked but never causes the wicked to suffer. It is not the nature of lambs to destroy or devour. Jesus Christ as Son of God had a true right to all kingdoms, and was the righteous heir of the earth but instead laid down his life.⁸⁷ Jesus could have called legions of angels to defend him but did not. It is contrary to the nature of Christ's administration to use force or violence in the gathering of souls. The Son of man did not

⁸⁶ *ibid.*, 445. The New Covenant Kingdom or Gospel of Christ now stands in Righteousness, Peace, and Joy in the Holy Spirit. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, If one only knew the Lord's love for us they would surrender heart and soul to His holy will, and live peacefully in God, like children of a king. The king has manifold concerns: his kingdom, his family, his son, his children; but the son lives carefree in the palace, with servants to wait upon him, taking no thought and enjoying all things. Thus is it with the man who has submitted himself to God's will - he lives at peace, content with his lot will be ill, poor, persecuted. He is at peace because the grace of the Holy Spirit is with him, and the delights of the Holy Spirit solace him, and his only sorrow is that he has grieved his beloved Lord.

⁸⁷ *ibid.*, 454. Christ's Kingdom being not of this World is not to be propagated through Civil Government but through the Nature & Way of the Shepherd. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 376. If we wish to love God, we must observe all that the Lord commanded of us in the Gospels. Our hearts must brim with compassion, and not only feel love for our fellow man but sympathy for everything created of God. The green leaf on the tree which you needlessly plucked – it was not wrong, only rather a pity for the little leaf. The heart that has learned to love feels sorry for every created thing. But man is a supreme creation, and therefore if you see that he has gone astray, and is bringing destruction on himself, pray for him, and weep for him if you are able, or at least sigh for him in the sight of God. And the soul that acts after this fashion is beloved of the Lord, for she is like unto Him.

come to destroy lives but to heal them. Those who propagate Christ by violence do not realize whose spirit they are propagating.⁸⁸

Barclay claims that those of the Spirit discern both hypocrite and heretic. Those without, discern neither. Magistrates have punished for truth when they were convinced one is a heretic. The reality is that the Lord's servants did discern the tares yet were liable to hurt the wheat if they pulled up the tares (Matthew 13:24-30).⁸⁹ The precepts and practices of Christ and his apostles overturn the Jewish Law. If one followed the Jewish Law legalistically it would require the nearest of kin of a person murdered to kill the murderer. It would also require the brother, son, daughter, or wife to kill a person who incited a family member to forsake the Lord (Deuteronomy 13:5-9). To argue from the practice of the Jewish covenant overturns the gospel and sets up the carnal standard of the Jews in reversal of the new covenant commands and practices of Christ.⁹⁰

Barclay argues that both heresy and hypocrisy are intrinsically evil. Government cannot punish heresy or hypocrisy which is God's prerogative but should regulate moral evils between citizens.⁹¹

⁸⁸ *ibid*, 454-5. It is Contrary to the Nature of Christ's Gospel & Ministry to use Violence in Gathering Souls, The Son of Man is come to Heal Souls. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 376-7. The soul cannot know peace unless she prays for her enemies. The soul that has learned of God's grace to pray, feels love and compassion for every created thing, and in particular for mankind, for whom the Lord suffered on the cross, and his soul was heavy for every one of us. The Lord taught me to love my enemies. Without the grace of God we cannot love our enemies. Only the Holy Spirit teaches love, and then even devils arouse our pity because they have fallen from good and lost humility in God.

⁸⁹ *ibid*, 456-7. The Spiritual Discerning discerns the Heretic standing amongst the Wheat. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 377. Put this to the test. When a man affronts you or brings dishonor on your head, or takes what is yours, or persecutes the Church, pray to the Lord, saying: O Lord, we are all Thy creatures. Have pity on Thy servants, and turn their hearts to repentance, and you will be aware of grace in your soul. To begin with, constrain your heart to love enemies, and the Lord, seeing your good will, will help you in all things, and experience itself will show you the way. But the man who thinks with malice of his enemies has not God's love within him, and does not know God.

⁹⁰ *ibid*, 457-8. The Commands & Practices of Christ Overturn (fulfill) the Jewish Law. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 377. If you will pray for your enemies, peace will come to you; but when you can love your enemies – know that a great measure of the grace of God dwells in you, though I cannot say perfect grace as yet, but sufficient for salvation. Whereas if you revile your enemies, it means there is an evil spirit living in you and bringing evil thoughts into your heart for, in the words of the Lord, 'Out of the heart proceed evil thoughts' or good thoughts.

⁹¹ *ibid*, 458-9. Hypocrisy & Heresy is evil & punishable by God yet Government is charged with regulating Moral Evils between person & person. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 377. The good man thinks to himself in this wise: everyone who has strayed from the truth brings destruction on himself and is therefore is to be pitied. But of course the man who has not learned love of the Holy Spirit will not pray for his enemies. The man

That human error is to be suppressed and removed is allowable by Christ for the church cannot be edified by the accession of both secret hypocrites and open heretics who will defy and leaven the body. But if these prove resolute and suffer greatly for their opinions, such suffering tends to commend them in the eyes of outsiders. Dissenters will not venture all for fame or be martyred without reason. Unless the dissenter's opinion is confronted through better argument than persecution, the dissenter will be commended. Confronting with better argument is the work of the Body of Christ and not the government.⁹²

Barclay points out that history shows that with both Protestant and Papist, if the other side did not give in that use of force by burning at the stake was implemented. This standard is of the world. As long as any party is persuaded that it is lawful to destroy those who differ from them it follows that they use all means to gain power and secure the ruin of their opponent.⁹³ While Papists and Protestants boast of antiquity, the Fathers testimony is of liberty of conscience and the denial of violence. The Quakers identify with the Fathers testimony.⁹⁴

Barclay continues that it is by the mercy of the Lord that these past 25 years since the Quakers were known to be a distinct and separate people that the Lord has given them faithfully to suffer for Christ's name, without shrinking or fleeing the cross. And what liberty the Quakers enjoy. It is by

who has learned to love from the Holy Spirit sorrows all his life over those who are not saved, and sheds abundant tears for the people, and the grace of God gives him strength to love his enemies.

⁹² *ibid*, 461. Christ allows for Error & Heresy and that Error & Heresy be Removed; The Dissenter's Opinion is to be confronted through Argument, and not Violence or it is Strengthened. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 377-8. If you cannot love, then at least do not revile your enemies, and things will already be better; but if a man curse and abuse his enemies, it is plain that an evil spirit lives in him, and if he does not repent, when he dies he will go to the place where evil spirits dwell. The Lord preserve every soul from such adversity!

⁹³ *ibid*, 463-4. The policy of Papist and Protestant is for those in power to use that power to destroy their opponent. Irenaeus of Lyon. *The Scandal of the Incarnation: Irenaeus against the Heresies*, Ignatius Press, 1990, 43. Paul says that without love of God, there is no value in knowledge, nor in the understanding of mysteries, nor in faith, nor in prophecy. They are all hollow and vain without love. Paul says that it is love which makes man perfect, and that he who loves God is perfect in this world and in the world to come. We will never cease to love God, but the more we behold Him, the more we shall love Him.

⁹⁴ *ibid*, 467. The Fathers and Quakers are uniform in liberty of conscience and against forced coercion. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 378. Understand me. It is simple. People who do not know God, or go against Him, are to be pitied; the heart sorrows for them and the eye weeps. Both paradise and torment are clearly visible to us: we know this through the Holy Spirit. And did not the Lord Himself say, 'The kingdom of God is within you?' Thus eternal life has its beginnings here in this life; and here it is that we sow seeds of eternal torment.

God's mercy and not by any outward violence or force. For God has preserved the Quakers hitherto in the patient sufferings of Jesus, that they have not given away their cause by persecuting any. If ever the Quakers are proven guilty of persecution by forcing others by government punishment to the Quaker way, then let the Quakers be judged with the greatest of hypocrites, and let no one spare to persecute them.⁹⁵

13 Six Practices affecting the realization of God's Kingdom to be ascetically implemented

Barclay articulates six priorities that the Quakers have been commanded by the Lord to live which have brought sufferings, hatred, and malice from the world. These practices include: 1. Inclusion of all Humanity: It is unlawful to judge people discriminately or prejudicially in opposition to our Lord who comes to all without prejudice or exception. 2. Exclusive worship of God: It is unlawful to give worship to any person that is reserved only for God. 3. Transformation of the Heart: Outward beauty comes through the light of Jesus Christ in the soul (heart) more than through outward adornment. 4. Transfiguration of the Life: Anything of humanities making that diminishes communion with Christ, the evangelical witness of the Spirit in the heart, and God's kingdom being realized is to be resisted. 5. Prelapsarian Communion and Being: Union with God through Christ's kingdom come within, allows for truth speaking, and 'hitting the mark' of God's original garden intent. 6. Incarnational Holiness and Perfection: Resisting evil through worldly violence and affirming war for revenge is contrary to the nature of God, incarnational life, God's kingdom, and the image and likeness in which humanity was created.⁹⁶

⁹⁵ *ibid*, 473. Integrity in Conscience & Suffering for Christ and his name over the past 25 Years without Compromise is the Quaker Witness.

⁹⁶ *ibid*, 476-7. Practicing Christ's Virtue of Equal Human Value, Deference to God, Inward Beauty, Protection of God's leading, New Covenant Transparency, and the Non-violent nature of Christ's kingdom brings Trials & Sufferings. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 373. If a man thinks kindly of his brother, deeming that the Lord loves him – especially if he believes that the Holy Spirit dwells in his soul – that man is close to the love of God. One may protest: you talk about nothing but discourse on the love of God. But what else should we deliberate on but God? Did He not create us that we might live eternally with Him and behold His glory? When a man

14 God's Prelapsarian Mark is expressing the Perfection of the Father through Mercy, Love, Integrity, and Transparency

Barclay continues that the most holy name of God is daily blasphemed by those that defend swearing before the magistrate, and then stir up the magistrate to persecute the Quakers who will not swear out of obedience to Christ.⁹⁷ It is admirable how any that profess the name of Jesus Christ can pronounce an oath with a quiet conscience, or who will persecute another that dares not swear because of their allegiance to Christ. It is Christ who said '*Swear not by heaven, earth or anything; instead let your yes be yes and your no, no*' (Matthew 5:33-34).⁹⁸

Barclay argues that it is clear that the modern fathers and priests have departed from the Fathers of the first three centuries on the matter of taking oaths and effecting revenge.⁹⁹ Barclay continues that all oaths, Sabbaths, bodily circumcisions, and sacrifices of the Law of Moses are abolished in the coming of the incarnate Son, one with the Father, who is the Alpha and Omega, eternal Word, oath, and amen, and substance replacing the shadow. In Christ all the promises of God are yea and amen toward humanity hitting the righteous mark of God beyond Jewish forms.¹⁰⁰

loves, his desire is to talk of the object of his love; and then habit enters in – if you make a habit of thinking of God, you will always carry God with you in your soul. If you are forever thinking of earthly matters, they will absorb your mind. Make a habit of meditating on the Lord's sufferings, or on eternal fire, and they will become ingrained in your soul.

⁹⁷ *ibid*, 501. Christ's New Covenant Coming & Witness makes all Swearing & Oath Taking Obsolete & without Purpose Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 375. Did the heart of the Holy Apostles grow heavy at the death of their Lord, mourning that their hope was lost. But the Lord appeared to them after His Resurrection, and they knew Him, and rejoiced. So now does the Lord manifests Himself to our souls, and the soul knows Him by the Holy Spirit. Simeon of the Wonderful Mountain was a child when the Lord appeared to him, and he had not known Him before, but when the Lord appeared to him, he knew Him by the Holy Spirit. The Lord gave the Holy Spirit on earth, and by the Holy Spirit the Lord and all things heavenly are made known; whereas without the Holy Spirit, man is but sinful clay. The soul is filled with such insatiable love for God that the mind in all its strength dwells continually in God, captive only to Him.

⁹⁸ *ibid*, 501-2. Christ denounces Swearing for New Covenant Authenticity in Speaking & lived Truth. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 375-6. God has shown me much mercy, though by my deeds I merit punishment both here on earth and after death. But the Lord so loves mankind that we are unable even to conceive of such love. Happy is the sinner who has turned to God and loves Him. The man who has come to loath sin has mounted the first rung of the heavenly ladder. When he is not tempted in his heart to sin, he is already on the second rung; while the man who through the Holy Spirit has come to know perfect love of God has reached the third step of the ladder. But this rarely happens.

⁹⁹ *ibid*, 503. Modern Fathers are in opposition to the Fathers in the 1st 300 years concerning swearing and violence.

¹⁰⁰ *ibid*, 504-5. Christ is the Final Substance, Eternal Word, Essential Oath & Amen, in whom the Promises of God are Yea & Amen. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 373. God helps us in what is

Under the Jewish Constitution, bodily circumcision, purification exercises, and other rites signified the holiness of God. Oaths and ceremonies under the shadow signified the truth of God, his faithfulness, and certainty. Barclay argues that truth was the prelapsarian mark and now new covenant Christianity makes oaths no longer necessary. Christians have the immediate revelation of Truth within and are capable of truthful witness always through communion unto hitting the mark of God's righteousness. Barclay quotes Polybius (c.203-120 BC) a Greek historian of the Hellenist period) '*The use of oaths in judgment was rare among the ancients; but by the growth of perfidiousness (untrustworthiness), so grew the use of oaths*'.¹⁰¹

Barclay continues that Jesus as prophet, whom every soul is commanded to hear under the pain of being cut off says: *resist not evil, turn the other cheek, give the second cloak, go the extra mile, love your enemy, bless those who persecute you, do good to those who hate you, pray for those who use and persecute you that you may be children of your Father in heaven who makes his sun to shine on the good and the evil. In this way, as children, be perfect even as your Father in heaven is perfect.*¹⁰²

good, while the enemy incites us to evil, but this depends also on her own wills; we must constrain ourselves to do good, but with moderation and knowing the measure of our strength. We must study our souls to know what is salutary for us: it may be more profitable for one man to pray, for another to read or write. It is a good thing to read but it is better to pray without distraction, and better still to weep: each as it is given to him by the Lord. To be sure, when we rise from sleep we must render thanks to God, then repent and pray our fill. Next, we should read to rest the mind, and after that pray again, and then work. Grace proceeds from everything that is good; but above all from brotherly love.

¹⁰¹ *ibid*, 506. Having the New Covenant Immediate Revelation of Truth within Makes One Capable of Truth filled Witness Always. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 373-4. One Easter-time after Vespers I was on my way back to the monastery to where I lived at the mill, and by the roadside stood a labourer. When I drew level with him he asked me to give him an egg. Not having any, I returned to the monastery, got a couple from my spiritual father and gave one to the labourer. He said, there are two of us at home. I gave him the other egg also, and afterwards I wept with pity for the poverty-stricken people, and felt compassion for the whole universe and every living creature. Another time I was walking along from the main gate of the monastery to the new Transfiguration block when I saw a little four-year-old boy running towards me with a happy face – the grace of God gladdens the hearts of children. I had an egg on me, which I gave to the child. He was delighted, and ran off to show his present to his father. For a little thing like that I received great joy from God, and a love for every one of God's creatures, and my soul sensed the Divine Spirit. Reaching home, seized with pity for the world, I prayed long to God, weeping many tears. O Holy Spirit, dwell in us always! It is good to be with Thee.

¹⁰² *ibid*, 515. Christ as Prophet & Exact Representation of the Father calls his Children to Resist not Evil, Love your Enemies and demonstrate the Perfection of the Father toward humankind. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 374-5. But it is not always well with my soul: grace is lost through pride and then I fall to lamenting, as Adam lamented his lost Paradise, and I cry, Where Art thou O my Light? Where Art thou, my joy? Why hast Thou forsaken me? My heart is heavy. Why hast Thou hidden Thyself from me? And my soul is sorrowful. When thou camest into my soul, Thou didst consume my sins with fire. Come now again into my soul, and again consume my sins with fire, for they conceal Thee from me as clouds conceal the sun. Do thou come and rejoice me with thy coming.

These words of Christ with respect to love and mercy (Matthew 5:38-48; Luke 6:31-38) and truth and integrity (Matthew 5:33-37) forbid things that were to the old covenant Jew lawful. Under Christianity there is a more perfect, eminent, and full signification of charity, patience and suffering than under the old covenant. This is the judgment of the Fathers in the first 300 years following Christ's Ascension.¹⁰³

The outward sword under the Law of Moses was used for defense and not for getting equal or for revenge. According to Ambrose of Milan (347-390), in gospel times Christ's words to Peter '*it is enough*' concerning his use of the sword was meant for the prelapsarian perfection of goodness.¹⁰⁴

15 The way of Christ (*Theosis*) in returning to the Father is inconvenient and reprehensible in the World's eye

Barclay acknowledges that defense of one's self seems the most natural, and denial of self-unto complete confidence in God the most unnatural. Christ and his apostles left a most perfect example. Christians do not deny Christian magistrates the name of Christian yet Christians boldly affirm that they are far from the perfection of Christianity, not having come to the pure dispensation of the gospel through the *Theotokos*. Christians shall not say that war undertaken upon a just occasion is not altogether unlawful for the magistrate. As the Jews were not ready to give away the rudiments, so the magistrate who is in the mixture of the world and God, and not in the suffering Spirit is not

Why tarryest thou, O Lord? Thou seest how my soul languishes, and I seek Thee in tears. Where hidest Thou Thyself? Indeed, Thou art in every place, but my soul sees Thee not, and aching and in sorrow seeks Thee. In like manner the Most Holy Virgin, and Joseph, sought Thee, sick at heart, when Thou wast a young lad. What thoughts passed through her sorrowing mind when she found not her beloved Son?

¹⁰³ *ibid*, 515-6. Revenge & Swearing were both addressed in the Words of Christ & agreed upon by the Fathers in the first 300 years following Christ's ascension. Charity, Transparency, Patience and Suffering are made plain in the New Covenant. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 378. Where there is pride there cannot be grace, and if we lose grace we also lose both love of God and assurance in prayer. The soul is then tormented by evil thoughts and does not understand that she must humble herself and love their enemies, for there is no other way to please God.

¹⁰⁴ *ibid*, 522. The move from Justice through War to a New Covenant Perfection of Goodness is revealed in Christ's words to Peter '*It is Enough*' Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 378. 'The enemy persecutes the Holy church,' you say. 'And I then to love him?' My answer: 'Your poor soul has not come to know God, how greatly He loves us, and how longingly He looks for all men to repent and be saved. The Lord's love, and he gives the Holy Spirit on earth, Who teaches the soul to love their enemies and pray for them, that they, too, may find salvation. That is to love. But if they are to be judged according to their needs, then they merit punishment.' Glory be to the Lord for His great love toward us, that He gives us our sins, and reveals His mysteries to us by the Holy Spirit!

ready for the gospel dispensation. For those whom the Lord has brought to the gospel it is not lawful for them to bear arms as they over all trust in the Lord.¹⁰⁵

Barclay concludes that if to use worldly things is to walk in the straight way that leads to life, is to take up the cross of Christ, is to die with Christ to the lusts of this world, is to arise with Christ in newness of life, and sit with Christ in heavenly places then the Quaker adversary may be accounted on the straight path. It is the Quakers who are mistaken that have laid aside worldly things to the crucifying of their lusts, to the procuring of shame, reproach, hatred, and ill will from the world. It is not by doing so that the Quakers merit heaven, but by knowing that these are contrary to the will of Him who redeems them from love of this world leading to life.¹⁰⁶

16 Barclay argues that True Christian Divinity begins within the prelapsarian Disciple of Jesus Christ

Barclay argues that people are obliged to obey the commands of Christ through one another as well as the immediate commands of Christ within themselves. In the same way as the children of Israel were obliged to keep the Law of Moses, and the prophets' prophecies, so also Christians are to keep the commands of Christ immediately as well as mediately.¹⁰⁷ Barclay claims that while the shadow

¹⁰⁵ *ibid*, 524-5. Confidence in the Lord is a designation of Trust when confronted with Conflict between Friend & Enemy; The Magistrate is conflicted in the mixture of World & Kingdom. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 378-9. The Lord gave us the commandment, 'Love your enemies.' But how are we to love them that do us evil? Or how can we love those who persecute the Holy church? When the Lord was on His way to Jerusalem and the Samaritans did not receive Him, His disciples John and James were ready to call down fire from heaven to consume them; but the Lord in His mercy said, 'I am not come to destroy to destroy what to save. Thus our one thought must be that all should be saved. The soul sorrows for her enemies and prays for them because they have strayed from the truth and their faces are set towards hell. That is love for our enemies. When Judas bethought him to betray the Lord, the Lord was stirred to pity and showed him what he was doing. Thus must we, too, be gentle with those who err and stray, and we shall be saved by God's mercy.'

¹⁰⁶ *ibid*, 527. The ways of the World are contrary to the will of Him who redeems his children from the love of this World, its lust, and leads them in Truth and Holiness [Theosis]. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 357. If you know of the Lord's love for us, hate sin and evil, and evil thoughts. The Lord will give you His grace, and he will know Him through the Holy Spirit, and after death, when you enter into paradise, there, too, you'll know the Lord through the Holy Spirit, as you knew him on earth. Both in heaven and on earth the Lord is made known only by the Holy Spirit, and not through ordinary learning.

¹⁰⁷ Barclay's Works III, *Apology Vindicated*, 286-7. Christ speaks within, and through one another under the New Covenant in the same way as the Israelites were obliged to keep the Law of Moses & the Prophets in the Old Covenant. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 379. Love is made known by the Holy Spirit. And the Holy Spirit the soul knows through peace and loveliness. O, how we should render thanks to God for His great

Scriptures are a rule, the Spirit is a surer rule. The well-disposed understanding receives divine revelation which is disposed to others as received from the same Spirit.¹⁰⁸

Barclay argues that it was never the Quaker principle to say God affords humanity no opportunity to be saved but one. The day of visitation remains a kataphatic reality for anyone exposed to waiting worship. In humble waiting, God reveals Godself inwardly to all who would seek, breaking through unto restored communion with God.¹⁰⁹

John Brown claims that reformed Christians practice according to Scripture, while an evil spirit acts through the Quakers as an enemy to gospel order, crying up pagan and devilish confusion. In Quakers being centered in new covenant grace and not the old covenant 'shadow of grace', John Brown says Quakers make repugnant the substance of grace through neglecting the shadow. Barclay responds by saying that the Quakers claim that it was never the mind of Christ to establish the shadow of 'human leaders' without the new covenant power and efficacy of the eternal Spirit. It is the new covenant Spirit that empowers and orders ministry and not the spirit of man.¹¹⁰

Barclay argues that divine providence can restrain evil people at God's pleasure, and does not suffer evil people to go further than God allows. Carnal and atheistic reasons cannot submerge the faith of those, who out of obedience to God desire to be conformed to the image of his Son, according to the measure of grace received, so as to make them think they are less secure under the protection of the

love towards us! Consider, my beloved brethren: the Lord bestows His Holy Spirit on the sinful soul and gives her to know His mercy. And to know God we have no need of riches: we need only love our neighbor and be lowly in spirit, sober and obedient, and for these virtues the Lord allows us to know Him. Could anything on earth be more precious than this knowledge? To know God, know how He loves us and enlightens our spirits in the way they should go?

¹⁰⁸ *ibid*, 297. The Spirit is a surer rule than the Scriptures whose Revelation noetic becomes disposed to others.

¹⁰⁹ *ibid*, 474. Noetic Worship in silent waiting opens the way to The Day of Revelation which can save the Unaware Irenaeus of Lyon. *The Scandal of the Incarnation: Irenaeus against the Heresies*, Ignatius Press, 1990, 43. As regards His grandeur and indescribable glory, 'no one can see God and live' (Exodus 33:20), for the Father is incomprehensible. But as regards His love and kindness towards men, and because He can do all things, He grants to those who love Him the privilege of seeing Him. The prophets foretold. For 'what is impossible for man is possible to God' (Luke 18:27). Man by his own powers cannot see God, but if He so wills, God can be seen by men: by whom He wills and when He wills and as He wills.

¹¹⁰ *ibid*, 460-1. Reformed stand in the Old Covenant Shadow and mediate Scripture over the New Covenant Spirit and immediate 'law' of Grace.

Almighty than under guns and swords. Christian boldness and a godly conscience guard against evil people.¹¹¹ In laying aside lawful worldly means Barclay affirms defending humanities principle of conscience. God's people are delivered when they trust in the Lord's arm to deliver them beyond the use of worldly arms. Christ commands no more of the law than what is in his teaching in Matthew chapter five. Rather than looking to the Westminster confession of faith, Quakers look to the arm of Christ and his words.¹¹²

Brown confesses that in nothing more than war does humanity see the corrupt nature of humanity. The fruit of communion with the Lord and Shepherd leads humankind beyond war, and the same communion leads into the perfection and compassion of the Father (Matthew 5:48; Luke 6:36).¹¹³

Barclay argues that where the government of Christ prevails people speak truth and confess there is no need for oaths. Perjury, justly inflicted where people speak lies does not break Christ's command of no oath taking. John Brown claims that Christ is only interpreting the law and not adding to the law. However, neither Christ, nor the apostle James says '*swear not at all*' unless called before a civil judge.¹¹⁴

¹¹¹ *ibid*, 523. Divine Providence protects the Regenerated Christian of Boldness and good Conscience, from Evil War, Atheistic Reasoning, and General Carnality.

¹¹² *ibid*, 523-4. The Lord's arm will defend Man's principle of conscience

¹¹³ *ibid*, 524-5. The Fruit of Communion with God leads Humankind beyond the need of War and unto the Perfection & Compassion of the Father. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 380. I cannot understand why it is people do not ask the Lord for peace. For the Lord loves us so dearly that He would refuse us nothing. I used not to know this, and thought in my ignorance: Is the Lord going to be solicitous for me, since I have so often grieved Him? But then my soul was filled with the love of God and the sweetness of the Holy Spirit - and to such an extent that had the Lord asked me, 'Wilt thou that I give thee My love and the grace of the Holy Spirit in greater measure?' My soul would have said, Thou sees, O Lord, that I cannot bear more, I would die.' And if the measure of the Lord's wondrous mercy to a sinner is beyond comprehension, what are we to say about the Saints? What grace is theirs?

¹¹⁴ *ibid*, 525. The Government of Christ makes obsolete Oath Taking; Perjury is a sin under the New Covenant.

Barclay instructs that hardness of heart which gave rise to Moses writing a bill of divorce is the work of the devil. Christ commands prelapsarian truth, truth speaking, and regenerated transparency. Hardness of heart results in taking oaths, and selfish worldly living through darkness of mind.¹¹⁵

ORTHODOX SCHOLARSHIP AND CONCLUSION

David Bradshaw states that the greatest difficulty in understanding the Eastern tradition has always been that it is deeply embedded in lived practice. Even to speak of the ‘philosophical aspects’ of the East is to risk serious distortion. Bradshaw maintains that in the East there were never the same divisions between philosophy and theology, or theology and mysticism as in the West, partly because these divisions presuppose a concept of natural reason that is itself a product of the West. To study the East from the West is to encounter *a great difference* in Trinitarian theology, prayer, asceticism, charity toward the poor and Scriptural exegesis [emphasis mine].¹¹⁶ The difference in lived faith and theology from the West in Barclay’s soteriology is at the heart of his understanding of ‘true Christian divinity’, and represents his alignment with Eastern Christianity. The definition of ‘a theologian’ for both Barclay and the East is one whose life results from knowing God, reproducing the image and likeness of God in whom humanity is created restored. The testimony is the fruit of this restored communion resulting from abiding in the vine who is Christ.

Bradshaw continues that in the New Testament writings, the apostle Paul speaks of *energeia* frequently. At the cosmic level Paul refers to the *energeia* whereby God is able to ‘subdue all things

¹¹⁵ *ibid.*, 525-6. New Covenant Truth & Truth Speaking contributes to Transparency & the Regenerated New Person while Swearing reflects Hardness of Heart and Darkness of Mind. Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991, 381. The grace of the Holy Spirit is so, and mercy of the Lord so great, that they are beyond all description – the soul is simply drawn insatiate to Him, for she is consumed by the love of the Lord, and wholly absorbed in God, and in Him finds perfect peace, and the world that is quite forgot. But the Lord in His mercy does not always give the same gift to the soul: sometimes He gives her love for the whole world, and the soul weeps for the whole world, and entreats her Good and Gracious Master that He pour out His grace and have mercy on every soul according to His compassion.

¹¹⁶ Bradshaw, David. *Aristotle East and West: Metaphysics and the Division of Christendom*. Cambridge University Press, 2004, xiii-xiv.

to himself' (Philippians 3:21) and to the *energeia* by which He raised Christ from the dead (Ephesians 1:19-23).¹¹⁷ Paul's writings whereby he refers to the *energeia* of God within the human soul are more complex. Paul describes the Church as a body whose head is Christ from whom the whole Body joined together, is supplied by the effectual working (*energeia*) of every part, increasing unto edification of each part in love (Ephesians 4:16).¹¹⁸ Each part comprises the individual member yet the activity of each person as they contribute to the whole is subject to direction from Christ. Thus the activity of each person is a divine activity by which God works within and through the collective.¹¹⁹ This love which is God is reflective of the incarnational righteousness of the Orthodox East and the Quaker gathered.

Paul uses the terms *sunergein* and *sunergos* to describe himself and his fellow apostles as co-workers with God: '*Christians are laborers together with God*' (I Corinthians 3:9); '*Christians then, as workers together with him*' (II Corinthians 6:1); and '*Timothy, our brother and coworker of God*' (I Thessalonians 3:2).¹²⁰ One can find in this progression both George Fox and Robert Barclay in their movement from Puritan believer, to unmediated communion with God, culminating in being God's co-workers.

The belief that God is active in human beings is deeply rooted in the Hebrew Old Testament. Bradshaw explains that it is usually God's word or spirit that is the vehicle of divine dwelling. These ways of speaking suggest a Jewish kind of control from without, most obviously with the prophets, but also with Kings Saul and David (I Samuel 10:10, 11:6, 16:13-14, 19:23).¹²¹ Paul's use of *energeia* in New Testament Christianity shifts the emphasis from external control to direct cooperation. This is especially true when Paul speaks of the new covenant Spirit proceeding at

¹¹⁷ *ibid*, 119-20

¹¹⁸ *ibid*, 121

¹¹⁹ *ibid*.

¹²⁰ *ibid*, 122

¹²¹ *ibid*.

Pentecost. Paul writes to the Corinthians (I Corinthians 12:3-11) that the ordinary and voluntary act of calling upon Jesus as Lord requires the cooperation of the Spirit.¹²² The culmination of the incarnational manifestation of the Body of Christ in Barclay's praxis is that the co-worker with God exercises God's justice as healing and God's mercy as compassion in discipleship and evangelism. This becomes the witness of the Christian Quaker.

Bradshaw goes on that cooperation continues in the use of the grace gifts given by the Spirit. They include not only extraordinary gifts like the working of miracles but also ordinary faith and 'words of wisdom'. In the use of gifts there is *no dividing* between the natural and the supernatural [emphasis mine]. All believers who become disciples, culminating as co-workers with God are called to a life of continual cooperation with the Spirit manifested in both the 'exceptional' and the 'mundane'.¹²³ This is the heart of theosis or 'humanity becomes by "Grace indwelling" what God is nature' depicted as the *telios* of the Church Fathers, saints, and Quakers. There is a progression from the inherited fallenness of the first Adam through the seed of the second Adam comprised of the path of purification (purgation), illumination (*theoria*), and glorification (deification).

The apostle Paul in his epistles provides a rich variety of ways of conceiving of the coalescing of human and divine activity. Bradshaw considers Paul's comprehension of the divine as underdeveloped during the ante-Nicene era.¹²⁴ The first step in direct coalescence was described by Basil in his *On the Holy Spirit*. Basil makes clear that participation in the divine *energeia* results not only in the miraculous but also in the enduring and habitual state of the soul.¹²⁵

Bradshaw quotes Basil 'As is the power of seeing in the healthy eye, so is the *energeia* of the Spirit in the purified soul... And as the skill in him who has acquired it, so is the grace of the Spirit ever

¹²² *ibid*, 122-3

¹²³ *ibid*, 123

¹²⁴ *ibid*, 172

¹²⁵ *ibid*.

present in the recipient, though not continuously active. For as the skill is potentially in the artisan, but only in operation when he is working in accordance with it, so also the Spirit is present with those who are worthy, but works as need requires, and prophecies, or heals, or in some other way carrying into effect His powers'.¹²⁶ Here Basil claims the *energeia* of the Spirit are not only individual acts but also include the state of the soul that make these acts possible. Basil comes to the paradoxical conclusion that the *energeia* is present both 'potentially' and 'in operation'.¹²⁷ For Basil both first and second actualities are divine operations. Basil's passage underscores the imminence of the divine *energeia* within the soul, and the extent to which, once acquired, it is an integral and enduring characteristic even when it is not openly manifested.¹²⁸

The purification of the fallen image of God in humanity, the vision of God, and participation in the divine *energeia* are further worked out in Gregory of Nyssa's *Homilies on the Beatitudes*. From Christ's beatitude '*Blessed are the pure in heart, for they shall see God*' (Matthew 5:8) Gregory explains 'to see' God is synonymous with 'to have' God or 'to share in' God.¹²⁹ The *energeiai* [plural] are God's operations within the created order with the fulfillment being God's Kingdom within (Luke 17:21).¹³⁰ Here Bradshaw quotes Gregory: 'By this Christians should learn that if a person's heart has been purified from every creature and from all unruly affections, he will see the image of the divine nature *in his own beauty*... If a person who is pure of heart sees himself, he sees *in himself* what he desires; and thus he becomes blessed, because when he looks *at his own purity*, he sees the *archetype* in the image'. Gregory goes on to describe what is seen: 'The Godhead is purity, freedom from [disordered] passion, and separation from all evil. If therefore *these things* be

¹²⁶ *ibid*, 172-3

¹²⁷ *ibid*, 173

¹²⁸ *ibid*.

¹²⁹ *ibid*, 174-5

¹³⁰ *ibid*, 175

in you, *God* is indeed *in you*... The vision is purity, sanctity, simplicity, and all such luminous reflections of the divine nature, in which *God* is contemplated'.¹³¹ [Emphasis mine]

The crucial question which Bradshaw raises is 'does the divine *energeiai* [plural] operating in the human heart require human cooperation'? If the answer is no then 'Christian information' is purely analogical. God works upon the created world which remains passive with respect to Him as does a work of art with respect to its maker. If the answer is yes, and cooperation is necessary, then participation gains critical meaning. The human agent would manifest divine traits in virtue of his own action, the divine *energeia* working only in and through the human *energeia*.¹³² In this case it would be precisely in virtue of the coalescing of activities that the image of God which had been obscured becomes clear, enabling the human agent to see God within their own heart; the 'vision' would include a 'shared activity', a way of 'seeing God' by 'doing what He does' and 'sharing in His life'.¹³³ This speaks to the culmination of the apostle Paul, the Orthodox saints, and the Quakers as argued by Barclay being co-workers with God in salvation. This reflects Barclay's strong rejection of the Calvinist and Arminian protestant dichotomy. Their telos was corrupt.

To the question of what one must do to become pure in the way Gregory has described, his answer is simply 'the whole teaching of the Gospel'. Unlike the Law given through Moses, the Gospel

¹³¹ *ibid*, 175

¹³² *ibid*. Jaroslav Pelikan in his *The Spirit of Eastern Christendom* Vol. 2, 1974, pp. 182-3, writes of the striking difference between the Augustinian tradition and the Greek tradition in the understanding of grace and salvation. Maximus claimed that our salvation depends on our own will, yet Maximus was in no way a Pelagian because the antithesis of Pelagius and Augustine was not in Maximus's thought. His doctrine of salvation is based on participation and communion that excludes neither grace nor freedom but includes their union and collaboration. These were re-established once and for all in the incarnate Word and his two wills. With Barclay, Eastern theology emphasizes that divine sonship is a gift from God and an achievement of man, the one not without the other. In the west these remain clouded under the Augustinian doctrine of Original Sin [Sin Depravity being unaddressed by the 2nd Adam] and the predestinarianism of the elect. In Maximus the sin of Adam did not have in it the idea of transmission of sin through physical conception. Maximus saw Adam not as the individual from whom all human beings sprang by lineal descent, but as the entire human race embodied by one concrete and universal person. Barclay furthers that in the 2nd Adam not only is every person's death tasted (Hebrews 2:14) but every person's sin is affected as prophesied by Isaiah 53:6; Jeremiah 31:26-30; and Ezekiel 18:1-20. Free will in response to sin like sleeping in response to death comes by the Grace [Seed] of the 2nd Adam restoring freedom and participation through communion.

¹³³ *ibid*.

punishment is not so much the evil deed as much as it guards against even the beginning of evil. To remove evil from the very choice of the will is to free life perfectly from bad works.¹³⁴ Purity is the extinction of the desire to do evil coinciding with the assimilation of ‘the Gospel’ through discipline over one’s thoughts which evil seeks to enjoin.¹³⁵ At the end of his homily Gregory returns to the role of free will and producing inner purity: ‘Christians have learned what evil life is and what good life is, for Christians have it in their free will to choose either good or evil... Let us become clean of heart, so that humanity may be blessed when the divine image is formed within through purity of life’.¹³⁶ The result being that what is sometimes referred to as dualism in Barclay becomes the goal of transcending the world while being in it. It is joining with the Orthodox in joining faith with works in Christian maturation.

Gregory sees participation in the divine *energeia* as not something imposed from without but that which must be sought through the exercise of one’s free capacities. Thus the divine *energeia* are the operations of God in the world at large and in the human heart; operations which God calls upon each person to share and to make their own.¹³⁷ In effect Gregory presents an understanding of participation as synergy, a way of *knowing* another by *sharing* in their activity. [emphasis mine]¹³⁸

Gregory performs a further synthesis by emphasizing that to participate in the divine life is not an adventitious achievement but is the fulfillment of humanities nature as originally made in the image of God. His description of the restored image as ‘God in you’ suggests like Basil that he sees such participation as a means of deification.¹³⁹ The faith and works dilemma which incited the

¹³⁴ *ibid.*

¹³⁵ *ibid.*

¹³⁶ *ibid.*, 176-7

¹³⁷ *ibid.*, 177

¹³⁸ *ibid.*, 177

¹³⁹ *ibid.*

reformation in the 16th century finds its resistance in Barclay through his insistence that restored communion with God synergistically produces original works.

To the opposite end, Bradshaw considers that it is likely that pagans and Christians are motivated by similar aspirations and found similar ways of articulating them.¹⁴⁰ In contrasting Iamblichus' (c. 240-325) work *De Mysteriis*, an original work which constitutes a philosopher defending the religious practices of paganism,¹⁴¹ Bradshaw considers that both Gregory and Iamblichus insist that there can only be a union of *energeia* between man and God, not of *ousia*. Bradshaw states that it is true that Gregory insists more strongly on the unknowability of the divine *ousia* than does Iamblichus.¹⁴² Bradshaw considers that this merely represents that Gregory is a monotheist whereas for Iamblichus the gods with whom union can be achieved are subordinate to other more fully unknowable deities.¹⁴³

They both view union with the divine *energeia* as a way of achieving self-knowledge and recovering one's true self. For Gregory the process is one of purifying and uncovering the divine image within the soul. It is by making manifest what had in a sense been true all along, that 'God is in you'. For Iamblichus the knowledge of the gods is 'coexistent with our very being', so that in theurgy we do not invoke the gods as being born to us; rather the divine within 'seeks eminently that which is like itself'.¹⁴⁴ Both Gregory and Iamblichus ground the possibility of union with the divine in the fact that divine authority constitutes the inmost reaches of humanities being.

Iamblichus also affirms that 'Christians exercise activity' in common with God. This would seem to be the highest form of union recognized by Iamblichus, and presumably, would be the goal.

Nevertheless Iamblichus does not give it much attention. In Gregory the possibility of such a

¹⁴⁰ *ibid.*

¹⁴¹ *ibid.*, 135

¹⁴² *ibid.*, 177

¹⁴³ *ibid.*, 177-8

¹⁴⁴ *ibid.*, 178

coalescence of *energeia* is the focal point. It is the only way of participating in the divine that he recognizes, *rejecting* a purely analogical knowledge.¹⁴⁵ [emphasis mine]

For Iamblichus the way to achieve participation is by performing the rites instituted for this purpose by the gods. He thinks of the state achieved as one in which the human agent's personality is submerged, or, transcended. He allows that the divine *energeia* can be appropriated and misused in a way that the gods would abhor. In either case the relation between the *energeia* and the human agent's personality remains external: either the *energeia* controls the human agent, or the human agent controls the *energeia*.¹⁴⁶

For Gregory the way to achieve participation is by obtaining the image of God restored, and this purity comes only through voluntary obedience to the commands of the Gospel. The human agent's personality remains engaged throughout the whole of restored union with God. Gregory's achievement is to have identified a way in which the divine can penetrate the human without suffocating the human.¹⁴⁷

In the testimony of the Saint, Christians see the 'come and see' of the Orthodox Divine Liturgy, and the Theosis of Eastern Orthodox soteriology in 'humanity becoming by "Grace indwelling" what God is by nature' realized as deification. The purpose of the incarnation is for humanities deification which Barclay joins with the work of justification and regeneration coming from the heart. It is the heart of the saint joining with the other which produces the Kingdom originally intended by God in the Garden of Eden. The life transfigured increases with the increase of God as the saint in continuous motion experiences kenosis (self-emptying) while simultaneously experiencing theosis (God-filling) so that in this world one's life becomes hidden with Christ in God (Colossians 3:3). As Saint Seraphim of Sarov (1759-1833) states some will say that the aim of the Christian life is to 'Go

¹⁴⁵ *ibid.*

¹⁴⁶ *ibid.*

¹⁴⁷ *ibid.*

to church, pray to God, do the commandments of God, do good – that is the aim of the Christian life’, and ‘Do not seek things which are beyond you’. Seraphim continues ‘that although prayer, fasting, vigils and other Christian practices are indispensable means of reaching the aim, the true aim of the Christian life consists of the acquisition of the Holy Spirit of God’.¹⁴⁸ This for Barclay and Saint Seraphim is to acquire Godliness.

¹⁴⁸ Seraphim of Sarov, *On Acquisition of the Holy Spirit*, Pantianos Classics, IL, 2001, 6. Pope John Paul II formally confirmed Seraphim a saint. Imagery and relics depicting Saint Seraphim are displayed throughout many churches in Russia and elsewhere.

CHAPTER 8: Conclusion

This dissertation has argued through demonstration of Barclay's collective writing that the 'true Christian divinity' Barclay defends as Quakerism is misaligned with Protestant Christianity and instead comports with the soteriological notion of Theosis in Eastern Orthodoxy that 'humanity becomes by "Grace indwelling" what God is by nature'. The Lonergan method provided the means of analyzing Barclay through a speculative, exegetical, empirical, and transcendental manner, exploiting what was, so as to eliminate what was not.¹

Concerning the key ideas in the introductory chapter 1, readers will find Quaker purification flowing out of God's perfection in the Incarnation and the Spirit of Pentecost uniform in Robert Barclay and the Eastern Orthodox. Secondly readers will find deification in Eastern Orthodoxy as the Quaker equivalent of the prelapsarian realization of God's original Garden of Eden intent for humanity. Thirdly readers will find that the *filioque* clause addition to the Nicene Creed by the Roman West is inconsistent with the new covenant Body of Christ being the Temple of the Spirit for which Barclay advocates. It is the new covenant Spirit of Christ coinciding with the fullness of the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit which provides the way forward in divinization. Fourthly a section on where the doctrine of Theosis exists in the West with the problems of scholasticism is addressed. This paves the way for seeing a way forward with aligning Quakerism with the foundation of Orthodoxy where Quaker Christianity can thrive once again. In addition to the originality of the research and a

¹ Daniels, Wess C., Healey, Robynne Rogers, Kershner, Jon. *Quaker Studies Issue 1.1: An Overview, The Current State of the Field*. Brill Research Perspectives, Leiden/Boston, 2018, 54. Kershner in his analysis of theological debates concerning Quaker origins states that 'new interpretations will correspond with an attempt to redefine normative contemporary Quakerism. This is different from historical scholarship on Quaker origins in that the emphasis is to find in Quaker origins justification for the author's preferred view of Quakerism'. While there is precedence in later authors omitting interpretations of the religious Society of Friends such as the omission of Rufus Jones' linking Quakerism to mystical movements (Braithwaite, *The Beginnings of Quakerism*, 2nd Edition, vii.) the use of the Lonergan Method in Theology provides a way forward in analyzing what Barclay said, why Barclay said it, and what Barclay meant in saying it. This method provides for a conclusion of what was foremost in Barclay's mind as a three century corrective.

description of Lonergan's Method in Theology, a section on the reception of Barclay's epistemology in the Quaker tradition has been summarized.

In the area of apophatic knowledge being at the heart of restored communion, readers will find affirmative, the distinction between the Uncreated Divine being wholly other than created humanity in 'knowing' God. Apophatic knowing which requires a level of ignorance coincides with kataphatic knowledge in that for Barclay there is distinct positive knowledge which can be known of God, and God's will through the gospel Incarnation and the Spirit of Pentecost within.² This is in rejection of the Protestant doctrine of Scripture alone being joined with the cessation of the Holy Spirit outside of scripture text which Barclay categorically rejects as undercutting new covenant Christianity. Faith by its nature is behavioral belief more than non-participatory believing. Faith is restored cooperation with God, and is representative of the relationship, and consequent life which God intended in the Garden of Eden. Grace is the heartbeat of Quakers and Orthodox who understand grace as restored relationship with God through God's initiative in time through the eternal Word, the Father with whom the incarnation, Jesus Christ is one, and the Holy Spirit or Spirit of God, who resides in the human heart or Body of Christ. Union with God as eternal life coincides with Jesus the Savior who has destroyed death by death through resurrection, and destroys sin. This is in variance with Protestant believe-ism which places grace as a mental adherence to Christ's death on the cross and bodily resurrection from the grave. Finally, the reader will find Barclay and the Orthodox concurring on the fullness of the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit being more than Christ's body alone; the aim of the Christian being to be filled with the Holy Spirit of God mystically through the Son, who both prays, and aids in prayer to the Father.

² Daniels, Wess C., Healey, Robynne Rogers, Kershner, Jon. *Quaker Studies Issue 1.1: An Overview, The Current State of the Field*. Brill Research Perspectives, Leiden/Boston, 2018, 19. Healey makes note of Pink Dandelion's unique interpretation of history being the paradox of spiritual withdrawal from society heightening social reform during the Quietist era. Dandelion suggests a "pair of dualisms": worldly and non-worldly, and the natural and supernatural functioning trans-formatively together. What Dandelion suggests is at the heart of theosis and is a distinction needing further development. This blending, I argue, is the heart of Eastern Orthodoxy and Robert Barclay's soteriology.

In chapter two, by looking at Barclay's historical context raised as a Puritan, educated as a Roman Catholic apologist, and influenced by a Jansenist³ Catholicism, the reader finds that Barclay's journey is both uniform with George Fox, and congruent with Orthodox Theosis. Chapter two concludes with an outline of Barclay defending prelapsarian and Christian life.

Concerning Barclay scholarship which precedes Barclay's soteriology in chapters three through seven we find that Carole Spencer has already suspicioned and claimed that what early Quaker's found was Theosis in the Orthodox East. This is in rejection of a western sovereign God who hates the reprobate and elects his chosen before they are born. In the east the purpose of the Incarnation is for humanities deification through the eternal appropriation of God's image and likeness. This appropriation is dynamic and not static as with Reformed Protestantism. In addition each of the following Barclay scholars hinted positively at different aspects of Barclay's Theosis but none of them emphasized actual Theosis. Ward's middle neo-platonic substance (2017) contrasted with a later Pauline framing (2018) both come from a Western mindset which David Bradshaw amongst many argues never realizes the centrality of Eastern Christianity.⁴ Ward views the Church Fathers

³ In Saint Louis De Monfort's (1673-1716) *True Devotion to Mary*, Tan Classics, 1941, edition 2010, p.15, he articulates the Jansenist heresy in France by saying that the teaching of Cornelius Jansen (1585-1638) spread an atmosphere of harshness and moral rigor, claiming that human nature was radically corrupted by Original Sin as opposed to the Catholic teaching that human nature is still essentially good, though fallen, although it has suffered a darkening of the intellect and weakening of the will. Jansenists denied that God's mercy is available to all, and they allowed only infrequent reception of the Sacraments of the Holy Eucharist, and only after a long and severe preparation. Holy Communion was seen as a reward rather than a remedy. Jansenism was twice condemned by the Roman Catholic Church. Jaroslav Pelikan in his analysis on Jansen's *Augustinus* in Volume 4 of his *The Christian Tradition: A History of the Development of Doctrine*, University of Chicago Press, 1984 states that while Jansen denied the 'aids of grace' in his protest against Pelagianism and Semi-Pelagianism (p. 375), siding with Augustine's position that 'no one has anything of himself except lies and sin' (p. 376), and that no man by the powers of his nature is able to dispose himself to grace (p. 381), yet affirmed that Jesus in the Gospel said 'apart from me you can do nothing', and that grace was 'altogether necessary for every good work' (p. 381). Pelikan concludes that Jansen's interpretation of the Augustine doctrine provided a stalemate between Pietism and Puritanism (p. 385) which this researcher picks up as Robert Barclay's entrance into Christ indwelling as second Adam, as new covenant Grace unto salvation.

⁴ Daniel Clendenin in his *Eastern Orthodox Christianity: A Western Perspective*, Baker Academic, 2003, pages 48-49 recounts in detail the Eastern rejection of such Western staples as CS Lewis, Rene Descartes, Spinoza, Leibniz, and Immanuel Kant in his years of teaching at Moscow State University. The Western enthronement of rationalism is categorically marginalized in Eastern metaphysics. In Metropolitan of Nafpaktos, Hierotheos Vlachos' introduction to the two volume *Empirical Dogmatics of the Orthodox Catholic Church according to the spoken teaching of Father John Romanides*, Birth of the Theotokos Monastery, Volume 1, 2012, page 15, Hierotheos states Romanides started from the West and reached the Orthodox East, expressing the genuine patristic, ecclesiastical, and Philokalic spirit that was the

through a Western epistemology. Birkel's apophatic knowing and Jewish Adam Kadmon centers itself in a Western framework drawing primarily from John Cassian and from Judaism. In Barclay's use of John 17:3 to head his first proposition we find Barclay drawing from a precreation oneness of Jesus Christ with the Father of which the disciple John writes his gospel.⁵ Pyper's narrow evangelical and liberal humanist helpfully articulates the universal nature of Christ to taste every person's bodily death with the exclusivity of Jesus Christ to inclusively embrace all of humanity in his life. Nakano's new covenant self-and-other is reflective of the universal nature of Christ in love of one's neighbor. Sell's emphasis on Barclay's use of the Fathers, and his insistence that Barclay could have gone further is affirmed. And finally, Trueblood's third way finds its *telios* in the Fathers Justin Martyr, Clement of Alexandria, Athanasius of Alexandria, Cyril of Alexandria, and others which reveals the tradition of the church⁶ of which scripture is a part.

answer to the scholasticism and moralism of the West. Romanides having studied at the Theological Schools of America, Holy Cross, Yale, Columbia, St Vladimir's, and Harvard provided the foundation from which he would argue in continuous detail the incompatibility of a western framework to arrive at Eastern Christianity.

⁵ John Behr, in his *Formation of Christian Theology, Volume 1, The Way to Nicaea*, SVS, 2001, page 51. Behr articulates that John's gospel begins with the precreation eternal Word of God one with the Father. Barclay begins his Apology with John 17:3 with eternal life being 'knowing the only true God and Jesus Christ', who is returning to the Father after revealing the fullness of 'being human'. Jesus Christ, the eternal Word predates Judaism in Barclay.

⁶ John Anthony McGuckin in his *The Orthodox Church: An Introduction to its History, Doctrine, and Spiritual Culture*, Wiley-Blackwell, 2011, states that the Orthodox regards the first seven ecumenical councils differently than the later councils because all bishops attended and were unanimous in the first seven. The corporate decisions were seen as having the authoritative blessing of the Holy Spirit (Acts 15:28) concerning faith and discipline. The assembled were considered to have the mind of Christ (I Corinthians 2:16). The Fathers and Mothers of the Church are examples of the Spirit-filled who teach the church the authentic message of the Spirit of God in any age or era. The Orthodox does not restrict the age of the Fathers and Mothers to a dead past but as Spirit-bearers in the present age, authentic theologians of God (p.15). In every instance their teaching formed a seamless union with the quality of their lives (p. 17). The bulwark of the Orthodox faith is the lives of the Spirit-filled, the Holy Scriptures, and the ancient tradition manifested in the sacred liturgy and ritual practices. The creeds of the ecumenical councils, the patristic writings, prayers, and ascetical writings of the saints are living and ongoing, with maintenance of tradition being the responsibility of the whole church (p.100). While Protestants elevate Scripture above all things, and Roman Catholics separate scripture from tradition creating twin sources of authority, the Orthodox maintain that Scripture is a pure manifestation within tradition without ever separating from it as part of the continuous flow of God through the ages (p. 101). The principle of consonance allows for the 'theologian' to enter ever deeper into the sacredness of life pressing every more fully into purity of heart and acumen of mind. It is divine *energeia* which brings about comprehension of the things of God in the human heart (p.107). While the body of conciliar doctrines and patristic literature are viewed differently than Scripture they are not set apart as in the West. Each has its place (p.110). The wider consonance demonstrates the patristic mentality of becoming a prophetic voice with the evident grace of the Lord's own Spirit, leading from within the community (p.111). For purposes of this argument Trueblood's 'third way' is resistant to the Protestant *sola scriptura*, by which the static doctrine stagnates into presumption, entitlement, and non-humility instead of ever leading the 'theologian' within lived tradition.

At the conclusion of the Barclay chapters it is David Bradshaw in his 2004 work *Aristotle East and West: Metaphysics and the Division of Christendom* who provides the core center of Eastern Orthodoxy to coincide with the core center of Quakerism. Both the Orthodox and the Quakers in varying degrees, differ from Western Protestant Christianity. Quakers will find in the speculative, exegetical, empirical, and transcendental use of the Lonergan method that Robert Barclay, centered in the Saints and Fathers of the Church, identifies with the energy and essence of God through apophatic and kataphatic knowing, affirms the purification of the Christian as restoration to God's prelapsarian righteous intent, reveals God's sovereign merciful and just call to the world through the gospel Incarnation and Spirit of Pentecost, and realizes the aim of the Saint to be filled with the Spirit of God as coworker with God. This is uniform with the Eastern Christianity as defined by Orthodox theologians Vladimir Lossky and Norman Russell.

Future Research

In conclusion this dissertation provides an academic resource for Modernist and Orthodox Quaker⁷ scholars to study Robert Barclay's 'True Christian Divinity' through the lens of Eastern Orthodox Christianity.⁸ The following are themes to be developed in future research.

A Common Anthropology through the diversity and unity of all Humanity

⁷ Ward, Madeleine. 'The Intellectual Context for the Development of Quakerism, 1647-1700.' PhD dissertation submitted to Wolfson College, University of Oxford, July 2017, 95. Ward outlines a critique of Quakerism from Charles Leslie's *The present state of Quakerism* (1701) in stating that the Quaker movement had become Christian. This assessment of a non-Quaker would be consistent with those who would jettison the Quaker path of the Christian faith for Protestant Christian expressions. This researcher argues that when the Quaker path is dismissed for Protestant formulas, Barclay's True Christian Divinity loses its soteriological telos of 'Humanity becomes by "Grace indwelling" what God is by nature'.

⁸ In 2015 September 17, David Bridges, Pastor of Friendswood Friends Church raised the following query: 'This is a big picture question, but I want to know—when you're all said and done—why it should matter that Quaker theology is closer to Orthodox than Roman or Protestantism. Does it matter because we Quakers ought to turn to Orthodox writings to guide us today? Does it matter because we need to see ourselves (Quakers) as more connected ecumenically to Orthodox traditions than to Western traditions? Does it matter because an Orthodox framework casts light on some significant theological positions that Quakers have long misunderstood?' This researcher's answer is that Quaker Christianity finds its roots and future in Eastern Orthodoxy and the termination Quaker Christianity in Reformed Protestantism.

The core of this argument has to do with the reality of ‘True Christian Divinity’ as Barclay understood it. The first point being the universal manner in which a sovereign God views all humanity. In this world there are many expressions of religion, Christian and otherwise which must be acknowledged and embraced under God’s sovereignty. The universal scope by which God through his Son and Spirit has reached into the mass of all humanity has been argued by Robert Barclay and needs to be further developed through a Quaker outlook on anthropology. What is the nature of God reaching into all humanity and how are Christians to view all humanity in whatever state humanity finds it?⁹ In the final analysis the Orthodox claim is that Christianity is the final reality for all humanity.

A Common Trinitarian Monotheism in light of the diversity and unity of all Humanity

The second theme is the nature of God¹⁰ in all humanity. This dissertation argues that the transcendent God has come bodily to all humanity through God’s Son being birthed through the *Theotokos*. The impregnation of Mary as Mother of God comes by the Holy Spirit who would later be economically sent into the world ten days following the Ascension of the risen Son. Mary, as the Mother of God is the Ark of the New Covenant through whom God is incarnated into human flesh. Central to the incarnation is the Father of whom the Son is begotten, and from whom the Spirit proceeds. It is the Spirit by which any cries ‘*Abba, Father*’ in the most intimate of words. The

⁹ Daniels, Wess C., Healey, Robynne Rogers, Kershner, Jon. *Quaker Studies Issue 1.1: An Overview, The Current State of the Field*. Brill Research Perspectives, Leiden/Boston, 2018, 104. Daniels suggests that Quaker sociology is a research project that is developing just in time. He suggests that Rufus Jones and William Braithwaite’s conviction that history will bring about the needed renewal among Friends, held considerable success in early twentieth century but not since. Nor is theology possible to bring about the needed change Quakerism faces. ‘Given the deep fracture of Friends in the West, not only is unifying history a challenge, unifying theology is almost an impossibility’. This researcher argues that Barclay’s true ‘Christian’ divinity begins with a common anthropology which is the emphasis of sociology. The emphasis in Theosis is that all humanity is created in the image and likeness of God, and that the realization of God’s image and likeness is the saving future for all humanity.

¹⁰ At Barclay’s core is the nature of the Father as revealed through the Son. The nature of the Father is to resist not evil by aggression, to turn the other cheek to the one who strikes, to give to the person who sues, to go the second mile with the one who compels, to give to the one who asks, to love those who persecute you, to bless those who curse you, to do good to those who hate you, to pray for those who use and persecute you. (Matthew 5:38-48) As you would have others do to you, do to them. Love your enemies, do good, lend, expect nothing in return, be kind to the unthankful, and the evil. Be merciful as the Father is merciful, don’t judge, don’t condemn, and forgive. Give in good measure. (Luke 6:31-38) The purpose of the Incarnation who reveals the Father is our deification.

intimacy by which the broken person cries is representative of the mercy and justice of God. God is merciful toward all wanting that none would perish from the effects of missing the mark, and is equally just towards all in restoring humanity into prelapsarian being from the loss that came by sin.

The Transformation of the Human Heart as Salvation Journey

The third theme is God's transformation of the heart. The prophet Jeremiah speaks the word of the Lord that the heart is deceitfully wicked, and asks who can understand it? (Jeremiah 17:9) The complementary Scripture related to the heart comes through Solomon, the king who states that one should 'guard their heart for out of it spring the issues of life'. (Proverbs 4:23) New covenant reality comes through the words of the apostle Paul who states that it is the heart that must be circumcised. (Romans 2:28-29) The heart being purged is a lifelong journey by which the disciple experiences the purification of disordered passions by the fire of the Spirit through baptism.¹¹ The indwelling grace of the Spirit of Christ and God brings the righteous life originally intended, beginning first in the heart.¹²

The Transfiguring nature of Discipleship in all of Life

The fourth theme is the transfiguring nature of discipleship. The nature of the kingdom of God is realized through believing, trusting, behavioral faith by which one becomes by 'indwelling Grace' what God is by nature. This 'becoming' includes becoming as light in any and all places where one finds themselves, and as salt seasoning everything encountered. In the final analysis the kingdom of

¹¹ Daniels, Wess C., Healey, Robynne Rogers, Kershner, Jon. *Quaker Studies Issue 1.1: An Overview, The Current State of the Field*. Brill Research Perspectives, Leiden/Boston, 2018, 56. Kershner notes that Fox declared an inward and spiritual Second Coming, the advent of a new age. Early Quakers believed the crucial mistake of the Puritans and Church of England was a short-sighted future; the physical return of Christ. Instead the Quakers of the 1650's experienced Christ's second coming inwardly. This researcher has demonstrated theosis as the reality of Christ's second coming.

¹² The apostle Paul says poignantly 'the Spirit of God dwells in us' and specifically 'he who has the Spirit of Christ' is God's; 'as many as are led by the Spirit of God, are children of God'. (Romans 8:9, 14) The separation between the East and West has to do with the reality of the Spirit, the spirit of Christ, the Spirit of God, and the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit at the center of life eternal.

the Father is realized through the indwelling of the Son and Spirit, who is the principle of the one God given to all humanity as Christian reality unto deification or theosis.¹³

Prelapsarian ‘Communion’ with God and Human ‘Being’ Restored

The fifth theme is the generating seed of the second Adam and the indwelling of the Spirit resulting in restored communion with God and human ‘being’. Humanity finds its way home through the seed of rebirth into the Garden of Eden intent from whence humanity was originally created to know God’s image and likeness. This second birth begins in infant-like status, and proceeds in childlike steps until one gains footing on the road of incarnational realization.¹⁴ The nature of prelapsarian ‘being’ centers in the transformation of the heart and results in the transfiguring of the life. It is in being healed and restored that one incarnates the perfection of Christ in all one’s relationships which contributes to the spread of healing overall, and the realization of God’s kingdom.¹⁵

Incarnational Perfection and Holiness as Christ’s Body

The final theme is that the work of God is finished with the Incarnation, and consequent deification of humanity. It is God’s intent that all humanity realizes the incarnational design God established for humanity in being created in God’s likeness. This reality is not realized without humanity’s free

¹³ Daniels, Wess C., Healey, Robynne Rogers, Kershner, Jon. *Quaker Studies Issue 1.1: An Overview, The Current State of the Field*. Brill Research Perspectives, Leiden/Boston, 2018, 57. Kershner quotes Douglas Gwyn who states that “As Christ re-enacts his fulfillment of the first covenant through the individual’s personal experience, then he or she *knows* the truth of it and may *incarnate* that truth through obedience to it.” This researcher has argued that the future of the Christian is to shine in the kingdom of the Father. ‘The righteous will shine forth as the sun.’ (Matthew 13:43) There is correspondence between the body, soul, and spirit in the shining forth of the person enveloped by God.

¹⁴ Daniels, Wess C., Healey, Robynne Rogers, Kershner, Jon. *Quaker Studies Issue 1.1: An Overview, The Current State of the Field*. Brill Research Perspectives, Leiden/Boston, 2018, 63. Jeffrey Dudiak exploits the weakness of Western Enlightenment to contribute to God being reduced to reason. The theist and non-theist debate is reduced to human rationalism as God. Dudiak in his ‘*Post-Truth? Facts and Faithfulness*’ Wipf and Stock Publishers, 2022, pg.47 states that “There is no formula for faithfulness. There is no formula for faithfulness to God, no formula for our faithfulness to our neighbor, no formula for our faithfulness to our fellow creatures. We are called to make the Kingdom of God a reality.” This reality is the heart of salvation and the heart of faithfulness. Kataphatic formulas lead to apophatic knowing.

¹⁵ The realization of incarnational perfection comes through the most contradictory of texts: ‘If any person come to me, and hate not his father, and mother, and wife, and children, and brothers, and sisters, yes, and his own life also, they cannot be my disciple. And whosoever does not bear his cross, and come after me, cannot be my disciple.’ (Luke 14:26-27) The contradictory nature of this statement is that it is absolutely through this that one becomes the pure love of the Father toward all humanity to include oneself. The twice born realize the relationships God intended through being recreated through the bearing of one’s cross (s).

choice. Just as first Adam responded to God's design and desire, so does all humanity have opportunity to respond to God's design and desire through the seed of the Incarnation¹⁶ and Spirit sent of the Father. The interaction with 'the whole world' as Jesus Christ interacted with 'the whole world' is the direction of the disciple as Body of Jesus Christ. It is through selfless interaction with God that God's kingdom is restored in the context of all humanity.¹⁷

The academic implications of these six themes are circular in nature and should be engaged by Quaker studies scholars who wish to explore the 'true Christian divinity' which Barclay discussed. Quakers will find their rootedness amongst the Eastern Orthodox who open the way to Christian union with God of which their praxis points.

In conclusion, the Orthodox Church has embraced mystery beyond reason. Reason can take one kataphatically to the apophatic reality of God through embracing the essence and energy of God. As David Bradshaw states, the divine essence is God as He is in Himself, unknowable not only to humanity but to any created intellect; the energies are God as He manifests Himself and gives Himself to be shared by creatures.¹⁸ It is this real distinction by which the Orthodox Church defends real participation in divine life without implying or endorsing pantheism.

Heart transformation, lifestyle discipleship, prelapsarian being, and incarnational holiness are the means by which humanity enters into the life God intended, and into the life which the Incarnation reveals. This path is the holistic nature of Christianity by which one becomes absorbed into God's original intent. This path is the same as Christ who made himself nothing in representing the full

¹⁶ Braithwaite, William. *The Beginnings of Quakerism*, Second Edition. Cambridge University Press, 1955, 504. Isaac Penington by seed meant a part of God's nature capable of growth brought into the heart of humanity. This finds uniformity with the essence and energy distinction, and with the body of the glorified second Adam.

¹⁷ The love of God knows no boundary, and the Body of Jesus Christ represents this lack of boundary. 'For I am persuaded, that neither death, nor life, nor angels, nor principalities, nor powers, nor things present, nor things to come, nor height, nor depth, nor any other creation, shall be able to separate us from the love of God, which is in Christ Jesus our Lord.' (Romans 8:38-39) The light of Christ manifest is without darkness. The person of Christ *becomes* pure light; Romans 8:38-9, being a core text in Barclay's proposition nine on Perseverance *following* proposition eight on the Perfection brought on by Jesus Christ formed in the human heart.

¹⁸ Bradshaw, David. *The Divine Energies in the New Testament*. St. Vladimir's Theological Quarterly 50, 2006, 189.

nature of God in being laid down for all humanity. The culmination of this life is the life of the virgins whose lamps were filled with oil, the maturation of the servant who applied his life as returned gift to God, and the selfless sheep who unthinkingly sought Christ in the prisoner, the naked, the hungry, and the sick (Matthew 25). This is the true nature of God, and this is the true nature of the Christian.

It is the deified saints which the Christian resembles. It is the patriarchs, matriarchs, prophets, and apostles who are the 'sent ones' into the world in which one finds companionship. These 'sent ones' are the temple of the new covenant Spirit in which Christ resides. The church or Body of Christ is inclusive of all who are Christ's body with no discrimination or preference given to any one member. The body of Christ functions uniformly as Christ functioned in historical time. The saint's term corresponds with the apostle Paul who said to live is Christ and to die is gain (Philippians 1:21). The life of the saint is the hope of the world. The life of the saint is the hope of the 'church'. By the life of the saint¹⁹ both the world and the church find their way in becoming by 'Grace indwelling' what God is by nature.

Barclay, Church Fathers, and Teachings to be researched

Barclay specifically names Apollinarianism of the 4th century, Monophysitism associated with Eutyches of the 5th century, and Pelagianism which Quakers reject. He also rejects the scholasticism of Arius in what became Arianism of the 4th century, and Origen in what is called Origenism of the 2nd century. While there is reference of Dr. John Smith of the Cambridge Platonists, there is no

¹⁹ In the five volume series of *'Piety Promoted, in a Collection of Dying Sayings of many of the People called Quakers'*, Volume Fifth, Philadelphia: Friends' Book Store, 1890, we find the means of retaining the final words of those who lived with integrity and diligence in the work of the Lord. That their words might stimulate survivors and successors to follow them, as they followed their Divine Master, as monuments from the past to stimulate the present day. Daniel Fanous, in his research of canonized Saint Kyrillos VI (2013) states: "In the life of many, Christian or otherwise, the last words are considered a profound summation of one's life. But for the desert father, they only reveal who someone really is in the face of death-where there can be no pretense-but such words reveal what is absolutely and positively needful-an exquisitely personal utterance of their "way" to Christ." *"A Silent Patriarch: Kyrillos VI (1902-1971) Life and Legacy*. SVS Press, 2019, 371. The path of the saint is to be made whole or holy in likeness to God.

mention of Henry Moore. Barclay does mention correspondence with a certain Lady associated with the Cambridge Platonists which could be explored. Barclay speaks favorably of Tertullian who fell into the 2nd century heresy of Montanism at the end of his life. Barclay is able to differentiate between the positive in what someone has to offer such as Augustine and Origen while rejecting aspects of their teaching. In addition Barclay is positive toward Philip Melancthon. This is a sign of a good scholar and a differentiated person.

Universalism and Hesychasm in Quakerism and Orthodoxy

Further comparative exploration in universalism and hesychasm in Quakerism and Orthodoxy is combined due to the organic nature of God as Father, Son, and Holy Spirit being universal to all and *hesychasm* being available in all. As a researcher from the Quaker perspective, this section will emphasize the work of Orthodox practitioners as consideration for further research in Quaker Christianity. Currently, there is limited research in addressing a specific Quaker Christianity, and a beginning work in advancing a distinctive Evangelical Friends Christianity tied to its Quaker roots. The work of Isaac Crewdson and the Beaconites (1835-1840) in forming the first 'Evangelical Friends' would argue that Evangelicals have little in common with Quaker Christianity, and with Robert Barclay's epistemology in particular.

Vladimir Lossky in his chapter on The Theology of the Image states that man created in the image is capable of manifesting God to the extent to which his nature allows itself to be penetrated by deifying grace. Thus the image can be similar or dissimilar to God depending on union. The two extremes are the incarnate image realized through the eternal and historical person of Jesus, the Christ, and the un-incarnate Image eventually residing in Hades.²⁰ These are the two extremes by which one working out there salvation can arrive. The hope of everyone, according to Lossky is the incarnate Image of the God who willed to create every person in His own image.²¹ Archimandrite Zacharias' in his chapter on The Mystery of Man's Heart states that since

²⁰ Lossky, Vladimir. *In the Image and Likeness of God*. SVS Press, NY, 1974, 139. Deifying Grace is uncreated through the 2nd Adam

²¹ *ibid.* 139 The concepts of Sheol and Hades have place in the Old Testament narrative and Hell in the New Testament narrative. Spiritual conflict between heaven and hell is real in both Barclay and the Orthodox as are angels and demons. Barclay fully embraces the universal desire of God in the writing of the apostle Peter '*The Lord is not slack concerning His promise but is longsuffering toward us, not willing that any would perish but that all should come to repentance.*' II

the kingdom of God is within us (Luke 17:21), the heart is the battlefield of our salvation, and all ascetic effort is aimed at cleansing it of filthiness, and preserving it pure before the Lord (Luke 6:45).²² This reveals the closeness of God in universalism and in the hesychast work of asceticism by which humanity becomes one with God. Vladimir Lossky in his chapter on The Creation brings together creation and humanity with the cosmos. He claims the world knows man, since the world is like man in nature. The *anthropo*-cosmic link is accomplished when the human image is accomplished, with God its prototype. Man discovers his fullness when he assumes the very universe in his offer to God. In creation man was given responsibility for the world (Genesis 1:28). As a result we are the word through which the universe bespeaks itself and Lossky claims that it depends solely on us whether the world blasphemes or prays. Only through us can the cosmos receive grace. In this, not only the soul but also the material body of humanity as created in the image of God corresponds to all creation. (Romans 8:18-23)²³

Archimandrite Zacharias in his section on The Delusion of an Impersonal Absolute states that for man, God is the unoriginate Reality and the mystery hidden from all ages. He gave man the first revelation of His Being in the garden (Genesis 3:7-8) whereby the LORD God walked with Adam and Eve in the cool of each day.²⁴ In this Zacharias claims that it is clear that the Absolute Truth of the Triune God cannot be learned through human logic. It is knowledge based on the particular and eternal Fact of the Living God who walks in time with humanity. Man formed by the true God, bears innate within him the quest for God.²⁵ Zacharias continues

Peter 3:9. However working out your salvation in fear and trembling (Philippians 2:11-12) and grace through faith unto the works intended by God (Ephesians 2:4-10) is a matter of controversy amongst Protestants. Both the Orthodox and Barclay have a clear picture of this scenario as ascetical Christianity. Picking up your cross and following Christ is a universal principle in both.

²² Zacharias, Archimandrite. *The Hidden Man of the Heart (I Peter 3:4) The Cultivation of the Heart in Orthodox Christian Anthropology*. Mount Tabor Publishing, PA, 2014, 1. Jesus' baptism of the Holy Spirit and with fire finds uniformity in the heart.

²³ Lossky, Vladimir. *Orthodox Theology: An Introduction*. SVS Press, NY, 1978, 71. Philip J. Lee writes in his book *Against the Protestant Gnostics*, Oxford University Press, 1987, vii, that promise of salvation by knowledge rather than by faith stresses a distance between a good creation over and against an alienated humanity. Creation affected by healed humanity is near non-existent in Protestant Gnosticism.

²⁴ Zacharias, Archimandrite. *Christ, Our Way and Our Life: A Presentation of the Theology of Archimandrite Sophrony*. St Tikhon's Seminary Press, PA, 2003, 36. This PhD argues that Barclay sees both the primordial relationship with God in the Garden of Eden restored but also accelerated through the incarnation of God in the 2nd Adam. I spent 10 unforgettable days at St John the Baptist Orthodox monastery in Essex, England during research at Woodbrooke Centre for Quaker Studies in 2014. Empirical participation in the life of the Monastery accelerated my conviction that there was a connection between Quaker communion and Orthodox prayer.

²⁵ *ibid*. 36 Humanity has an innate desire to be reunited to its Maker. This is universally understood in Barclay and the Orthodox.

that relationship and communion between Giver and receiver is always personal, and knowledge of God is the fruit of God's strength entering into us. Man as a potential hypostatic spirit has the capacity to know divine Being. Man knows God by living according to divine will received through the relationship.²⁶ When man abides in the spirit of Christ's commandments the existential union of mutual love between divine Persons and a human person is brought about. The divine Form of Being is transmitted to him as his own state.²⁷ The universal will of God unfolds through hesychasm and theosis.

Hierotheos Vlachos of Nafpaktos in his chapter on The Human Person according to the holy Fathers states that when the Father's call the crown of creation man, they do not simply mean his biological substance, but also the presence of the Holy Spirit in him. One does not have to be born biologically to be called a human, but one must have the Holy Spirit within. Thus the living and real human is one favored with the grace of God. Otherwise he is a man dead to God and swayed by various passions like the animals.²⁸ Vlachos claims that the ontology of man is found in his archetype, God Who created him. Thus "biological existence" does not exhaust man as God is not exhausted. Man is understood as a theological being. His ontology is iconic to God.²⁹ Vlachos continues that the term person is applied to those partaking of the purifying, illuminating, and deifying energy of God. In this the person is referred to as those on their way to deification by Grace (the Holy Spirit) and being deified. Just as "in the image" is potential likeness and "in the likeness" is the intended "image".³⁰ It is through personal struggle and the grace of God that a person attains to the likeness of God in their person. Vlachos continues that all people can be regarded as persons, even the devil himself, but

²⁶ *ibid.* 36 This is uniform with Barclay's position that God indwells all but only inhabits the receptive. Inhabitation is God's desire in restored relationship, and relationship between humanity and humanity is indication of restored relationship with God.

²⁷ *ibid.* 36-7 The universals of love of God (Deuteronomy 6:5) and love of neighbor (Leviticus 19:18) are realized in theosis. Theosis is healing. This is more than the juridical picture in the courtroom. Becoming tender is the path of humility and the Jesus Prayer.

²⁸ Vlachos, Hierotheos of Nafpaktos. *The person in the Orthodox Tradition*. Birth of Theotokos Monastery, Levadia, Greece, Second edition 2021, 71. Jeremiah's sleep was peaceful because the seed of beasts and the seed of man are to be reseeded. (31:26-28) Orthodox in their morning prayers quote Psalm 49:20 in which People who boast of their wealth don't understand, and will die like animals. The person in his vanity without understanding is like the beasts that perish. Also, those who worship idols become like idols; becoming like the gods they trust. Psalm 115:8. Vlachos' book has become a text in the Cultural Anthropology class I teach to undergraduates.

²⁹ *ibid.* 73 The restoration of 'being' is Barclay's 5th principle: Becoming one in our Person with the righteousness God intended

³⁰ *ibid.* 73 In Barclay, the Baptism of Jesus is baptism in the Holy Spirit and with fire (Matthew 3:11-15). Salvation is the healing restoration of the image and likeness of God through "God becoming man so that man might become G[g]od." Irenaeus, Athanasius...

soteriologically we are not persons until we attain the likeness originally intended.³¹ In the biblical-patristic tradition God is not an object of conjecture and logical understanding, but a matter of participation, of revelation, of experience. The experience of God is the *nous* returning to the heart from its diffusion in the surroundings of created things fallen, and from the heart the *nous* ascends to God.³² The fourth century [F]athers spoke of the way of experiencing and of participating in the Trinitarian God. The way of purification of the heart did not do this under the influence of Neoplatonism. Vlachos explains that Neoplatonism discards desire and anger, and considers illumination as knowledge of the archetypes of beings. For the Platonist and Neoplatonist, salvation is the souls return to the world of ideas.³³ For the Fathers purification is the dismissal of evil thoughts from the heart and their sojourn in the rational mind. Illumination is enlightenment of the *nous* returning to the heart by the grace of God. The method of purification and of illumination of the heart and *nous* is called hesychasm.³⁴ Vlachos identifies this path through blending apophatic and kataphatic revelation. The Holy Trinity is experienced as far as possible for finite human nature. One participates in the uncreated energies of the Holy Trinity but one cannot form apodictic syllogisms about the mystery of the Holy Trinity.³⁵ In the end, man has limited rational knowledge of the full experience of the Holy Trinity in the likeness of God realized. God is uncreated mystery.

³¹ *ibid.* 76 Entering the likeness comes by the ascetical struggle of [F]aith by [G]race. Both Grace and Faith are dynamic coming from God and participated in freely by self (Hebrews 4:14-6:8)

³² *ibid.* 152 Ascending to God comes through the *nous* in the heart being joined to God through the Jesus Prayer.

³³ *ibid.* 152-3 The Ecumenical Councils of 325 *On the Incarnation* and 381 *On the Holy Spirit* affirmed the role of the Incarnation and the Spirit in redeeming humanity. Quaker James Wood (1839-1925) claimed in “The doctrines of the Religious Society of Friends: a lecture delivered at the 12th Street Meeting House” Philadelphia, 1 month, 24th day, 1908” that Quakers were in basic agreement with the Nicene and Apostles Creeds. These creeds were never mentioned in this researcher’s Quaker upbringing but two of its greatest contributors Athanasius (296-373) and Basil (330-379) are quoted affirmatively in Barclay’s Works in response the Idea world of Plato (428-347 B.C.E.). Neo-Platonism would expand ‘the Idea’ to the Emanating One, the human Mind (*nous*), and world Soul. Barclay considered that the eternal revelation of God’s Spirit and the pre-incarnate Christ in the Old Testament was savingly available to such persons as Socrates and Plato. Orthodox Trinitarian theology emphasizes this. See Vlachos, Hierotheos of Nafpaktos. *Empirical Dogmatics of the Orthodox Catholic Church according to the spoken teaching of Father John Romanides: Volume I - Dogma, Ethics, Revelation*. Birth of Theotokos Monastery, Levadia, Greece, 2012, a text I’ve used with undergrads in Spiritual Formation: Making Disciples.

³⁴ *ibid.* 153 Hesychasm is joined with the Jesus Prayer. My first exposure to the Jesus Prayer was by reading French, R. M. *The Way of a Pilgrim* and *The Pilgrim Continues His Way*, Harper Collins, 1991. Reading this in 1994 provided disorientation in a good way.

³⁵ *ibid.* 191 Rene Descartes philosophy is a problem to Orthodox and Quaker apophatic and kataphatic Christianity. See Clendenin, Daniel B. *Eastern Orthodox Christianity: A Western Perspective*, Baker Publishing, 2003, The Mystery of God: *Apophatic Vision* pp 47-49. The Orthodox students disconnect with the logic of C.S. Lewis in Clendenin’s Russian classroom was remarkably insightful. I had used Lewis’s *Mere Christianity* as sole text in an Apologetics class for undergraduates and had remained thoroughly unaffected by its contents having gone through it once as a freshman in

Vladimir Lossky in his chapter on Created Being states that each aspect of creation achieves cooperation with God according to its receiving the grace and power given by God that God possesses by nature and without measure. All creatures are called to perfect union with God which is accomplished in the synergy of created wills with the idea-willings of God. The path is the idea-willings becoming reality through transformation and transfiguration. Lossky looks to Dionysius in stating that it is difficult to distinguish between the first state of creatures and their final union with God. This is because union presupposes cooperation, the agreement of wills and therefore includes liberty. Lossky continues that it is possible to see in the initial state of the created cosmos an unstable perfection in which the fullness of union is not yet achieved, and in which created beings still grow in order to accomplish the thought-will of God.³⁶ This blends the universal nature of creation with the over arcing desire of God within the context of man's created freedom. Archimandrite Zacharias in his chapter on Constantly Rubbing against God's Energy states that God's divine energy is what bridges the gap between man and God. Otherwise there is nothing much in common between God and man. In being created in the image and likeness of God we are given a potential, but God Himself is completely Other. We can only unite with Him when he is well pleased to bridge the gap and give Himself to us in the form of His energies, through grace. God has given us the means of contributing our part to the realization of the grandiose miracle by uniting with him in prayer, worship, and meditating on Christ's words.³⁷ This combines the revelation of God in the creation of man, the Holy Spirit as grace and energy, liberty in the image of God, the incarnate Word, sacred Scripture and hesychasm all as realities in human realization.

Peter Bouteneff in his introduction to *Seeds of the Word: Orthodox thinking on other Religions* states that the Word [Logos] of God, identified with Christians as Jesus Christ, is accessible in "seed form" in non-Christians and pre-Christian faiths alike. It is on this basis that Orthodox Christians are open to mutual

college (1981) and a second time as instructor at the same college (2012). While acknowledging that it is a classic for many in the East and West, it was empirically underwhelming for this Quaker instructor.

³⁶ Lossky, Vladimir. *The Mystical Theology of the Eastern Church*, SVS Press, 1976, 97. God's intentions are revealed in creation according to the apostle Paul in his epistle to the Romans 1:20-23. Lossky's narrative has encouraged me to move from a+b=c logic to cyclical paradigm shifts. Along with Lossky, Romanides has helped in understanding the pre-incarnate Christ in the Old Testament, angels and demons, and Paul's experience of the third heaven in II Corinthians 12:4. The scripture narrative has vastly opened.

³⁷ Zacharias, Archimandrite. *Monasticism: The All-Embracing Gift of the Holy Spirit*. The Stavropegic Monastery of St John the Baptist, Essex, UK, 2020, 272. Freedom makes way for humanity to experience the energy of God through asceticism. God is personal in Quakerism and God is personal in Orthodoxy in a way different from Protestant Pentecostal Christianity.

learning and mutual transformation with those who have yet to identify as Christian.³⁸ The Christian responsibility Bouteneff contends is to embody Christ's love, compassion, and truth in all circumstances. The receptivity of the other is not within the Christian's control and in the end is beside the point. Bouteneff acknowledges that we live in a world in which God, in the mystery of his will has allowed a diversity of faiths to develop and flourish. It is the Christian's work who lives in pluralistic contexts to learn how to relate to other faiths and to the people who hold them.³⁹ This coincides with Orthodoxy insisting that the fullness of truth is found in the Tradition of the Orthodox Church. Orthodox teaching is that God has worked outside the boundaries of the Church, and that religious truths have been manifested in other places.⁴⁰ Orthodox Christians agree on many points with Taoism, Buddhism, Judaism, Islam, and other religions and philosophies on many ethical and spiritual principles. But they do not join with those who say, because of these agreements, all religions are the same.⁴¹ Differences matter as much as similarities. Differences teach and challenge the Christian to understand their own tradition more deeply. Christians insist on a few things that make people uncomfortable. We affirm that Jesus Christ is the Word of God become human for the redemption of all humanity.⁴² Concerning Orthodoxy and other religions, interreligious dialogue leads Christians to see what makes Christian claims unique in light of the encounter, and wise to the differences

³⁸ Garvey, John. *Seeds of the Word: Orthodox Thinking on Other Religions*, SVS Press, 2005, 12. The seed rooted in fertile soil is the same seed in others. The 2nd Adam who tasted every person's bodily death is the immortal seed of eternal life. Garvey's thought is very helpful in the World Religions and Intercultural Ministries classes I teach to undergrads. I roots mission in Quaker Christianity.

³⁹ *ibid.* 13 The Christian has no control over another person's receiving God's seed planted in them. God has protected every person's liberty, and God is the righteous judge in every person's case, knowing the heart of the person. Hebrews 4:13 Barclay's 1st principle is that we share a common anthropology. God values every human being respectfully, and so shouldn't we. Peter Bouteneff has been an important companion through book in instilling a respect and freedom for the other as God respects and gives freedom. This is God, and this is Quaker and Orthodox Christianity.

⁴⁰ *ibid.* 17 The God who created is the God to which other religions have some semblance of identification. (Romans 2:14-16) The Christian responsibility is first, in the words of William Covey, to seek first to understand, and then to be understood.

⁴¹ *ibid.* 17-18 The exclusive Jesus is inclusive of all humanity. Barclay states there is only one name JESUS [emphasis Barclay] by which humanity is saved. There is conflict on both sides of the statement, the exclusivity of Jesus AND his inclusion of all humanity [emphasis mine]. This is why Barclay is categorically not a Calvinist in its mathematical understanding of the Sovereignty of God, and instead identifies with Orthodox Christianity which blends that same inclusivity & exclusivity of Jesus and the Persons of the Trinity.

⁴² *ibid.* 18-19 The one Word, Jesus Christ is eternally distinct from the many words of sacred scripture who was incarnate for all, in all ages. Distinguishing between the eternal-incarnate Word, the living word of Christ within and the Holy Spirit, and the written word of sacred scripture was helpfully illustrated in a 1990's *Renovare* newsletter by Quaker Richard Foster. Only one of these Words is God.

which cannot be overcome by dialogue.⁴³ In encountering another world tradition one encounters something that is in some degree truth bearing. While everything lies within the sphere of the spiritual Sun of Righteousness, everyone accumulates various aspects from the rays of the Sun. Such accumulators have given the world an imperfect light but cannot be regarded as self-reliant within them-selves or to take the place of the Sun. The criterion for Orthodoxy remains the Son and eternal Word of God, who embodies the truth of God as Trinity.⁴⁴

To this end, Abbott Peter (Vryzas) in his section on Participation in the Uncreated Divine Energies looks to Gregory Palamas in his distinguishing between the ‘imparticipability’ of God’s Essence and the ‘participability’ of His energies. Man can partake of the Energies of God, but not of His Essence.⁴⁵ Palamas joins with Basil of Caesarea in saying ‘His energies come down to us, but His essence remains inaccessible... From His energies we know God, and we do not undertake to approach His essence’.⁴⁶ The uncreated Divine Energy becomes participable to every man, and so reasonable beings created in the image and after the likeness of God partake of the Life of God, only in its energetic form, yet in all its fullness and infinity.⁴⁷ Peter continues that following the coherence of the divine and human natures of Christ, man can partake of the energetic form of the Living God to such an extent that he sits on the right hand of the Father, in the

⁴³ *ibid.* 114 Jesus modeled navigating and circumventing dialogue that proved unproductive in the Gospel of Jesus Christ according to Matthew, Mark, Luke, and John. In these same accounts we learn what fruitful dialogue is as well. The larger point being that Christianity is a matter of faith that in the end is greater than mere words and belief. This is the problem with the Protestant faith ‘alone’ dilemma.

⁴⁴ *ibid.* 114-15 Barclay states that every person has a principle of the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit. This principle is not Sabellianism or modalism but is the new covenant witness (Jeremiah 31:33-34; Heb. 8:7-13, 10:14-18) and seed (Mt. 13:12, 25:29). While being children of the light (Ephesians 5:8-14) the Christian never replace Jesus Christ as Light giver in the world.

⁴⁵ Peter, (Vryzas). *Theology as Spiritual State in the Life and Teachings of Saint Sophrony*, Stavropegic Monastery of St John the Baptist, 2021, 81. The new covenant witness of God is consistent with the uncreated energies of God. (John 1:9) This joins together the Light of Christ and Jesus Christ as both being God; one accessible and the other inaccessible while both being God.

⁴⁶ *ibid.* 82 While the energies of God are experienced, the essence of God remains wholly other. This was the experience I had as a child going to Valton Friends meeting. It went away when I experienced evangelical Christianity. It returned during the student only vespers experience while a high school camper at Camp Quaker Heights in Eldora, Iowa, then returned in a radical way while taking retreats at the Trappist Benedictine New Melleray Abbey in Peosta, Iowa. This began the journey that finally arrived at Orthodoxy.

⁴⁷ *ibid.* 82 Gregory of Nazianzus states that the un-assumed is the unhealed. Man’s total condition is assumed by God while God remains totally other. The problem of the Protestant vicarious humanity of Jesus Christ doctrine is that it doesn’t become real except through asceticism. We need healing in reality, not just vicariously. It for freedom and healing that Christ has come and is come within.

person of the incarnate Word.⁴⁸ Peter summarizes this section by saying that union with God through participation in his energies does not mean that instead of His essence, God offers a substitute of himself. However, God is fully present in His energies, and by partaking of them, man is made a god by grace (John 10:34), a dwelling place of the Holy Trinity without identity of essence.⁴⁹

Peter continues in his section entitled “A man shall approach and the heart is deep” Psalm 63:7 that the true man unceasingly seeks the sensation of God, yet the sensation is not physical, but noetic, divine and spiritual. It is the spiritual sensation of Grace. This precious gift presupposes the practice of repentance and prayer, for this is the only way to heal the noetic spiritual nature of man, which was created to receive visitations of grace imparted to the body as well.⁵⁰ In his chapter on The Birth of the Word in Man’s Heart and section The word of God makes man like unto God Peter states that the birth of the word of God in the heart is a special mystery of spiritual life. God reveals the traces of his presence in the heart, which is the spiritual center of the person. The revelation of God to the prophets, the apostles, and the Saints is first imparted to the heart through the uncreated energy of grace.⁵¹ The unspeakable words which grace communicates grant perfect knowledge of the age to come (II Corinthians 12:4). These words are loaded with the energy of the Spirit and ignited by the transcendent Light of the reign of God. The word of Christ is the uncreated Light, which is addressed to the logical mind and the deep heart. When accepted in the deep heart, the word of God makes man like unto God. God sews his word richly in all places and at all times. Its fruition, however, depends on receptivity of the heart.⁵² Union of mind and heart is the condition for the seed of the divine word to flourish.

⁴⁸ ibid. 83 Set down at the right hand of the throne of God is the place where the saint stands with Jesus having completed the race (Hebrews 11:1-12:2) The understanding of the Church triumphant and the Church militant is helpful here. Our battle is not against flesh and blood... II Corinthians 10:3-6 is helpfully pointed out by Barclay as we follow in the perfection and mercy of the Father (Matthew 5:38-48; Luke 6:1-38). Shining like the *sun* in the Kingdom of our *Father* [emphasis mine] (Matthew 13:43) was helpfully pointed out in my reading of Orthodox texts. Perfection and holiness went from being negative words in the Protestant context to being embraced in the Orthodox context. Becoming a saint (holy) is the path of becoming fully human in the kingdom of our *Father*.

⁴⁹ ibid. 84 The distinction between Creator and creation remains eternal though the Creator assumed the full condition of creation. The relation is more than vicarious and outside of the body. The relation is within the soul and body.

⁵⁰ ibid. 106 Grace ultimately is God in restoring union with God comprising soul and body; faith including deeds. This is beyond what Philip J. Lee and Orthodox convert Robin Phillips, *Recovering the Goodness of Creation: A Manual for Recovering Gnostics*, Ancient Faith Publishing, 2023 call Protestants. Protestants, in their opinion are Gnostics.

⁵¹ ibid. 123 This is reminiscent of I John 4:19 ‘*We love Him because He first loved us.*’ Peter also includes old covenant Prophets.

⁵² ibid. 123-4 The sewing of the word or the reception of the voice of God is spoken of clearly in Hebrews 3 and 4 where the writer exclaims that once again God’s voice is heard as in the days of the Israelites. This word is living and is the

When the mind is detached from the heart, man cannot apprehend the word of God and becomes a victim of his own fantasy, disturbed by demonic suggestions through thoughts and passionate images. In the presence of the Living God, man no longer needs books and writings because the Holy Spirit writes ‘words of eternal life’ in the heart. This is a mystery at work in the Saints and all those regenerated through repentance. Grace writes ‘the laws of the Spirit’ in the heart. Pseudo-Macarius writes: His very Grace writes in their heart the laws of the Spirit. They should not put all their trusting hope in the Scriptures written solely in ink. For divine Grace writes on the “tables of the heart” the laws of the Spirit and the heavenly mysteries.⁵³

Peter continues that the spiritual birth of God the Word in the heart of humanity is a mystery that is always new and works continuously in those who desire it. Maximus the Confessor states that in souls such as this Christ always desires to be born in a mystical way, becoming incarnate in those who attain salvation, and making the soul that gives birth to Him a virgin mother. Such a soul is not conditioned by categories like male and female that typifies a nature subject to generation and corruption. The Lord Himself is pleased to bestow His messianic dignity as teacher and prophet upon all flesh, so that all may become taught of God and bears in their heart the witness of the Comforter.⁵⁴ Through His coming on the day of Pentecost, the Holy Spirit no longer carved the law of grace in the stone tablets of Moses, but in the hearts of the apostles and all Christians born anew. Paul was called to serve a greater covenant in receiving a law written on fleshly tables of the heart.⁵⁵ The ministry of the New Covenant is a ministry of the spirit, and it demands pure apostolic hearts, able to conceive of and transmit the word given them by the Holy Spirit. As Jesus stated, “Whatsoever

final word to all humanity. The heart is the believing mechanism in salvation (Romans 10:9-10). This is more than reason. The heart is to be guarded most of all.

⁵³ *ibid.* 125 The narrative of the law of the Spirit written in the heart is communicated in Paul’s epistle to the Romans, 8:1-11. Barclay rightly spoke of the scriptures being a shadow to the Spirit who is God. The position of the Spirit never acting contrary to the scriptures has, in my experience, always fallen in favor of the scriptures. A clearer distinction between the Spirit and the static scriptures needs to be made to address this problem. Otherwise we become Jewish Christians in the same manner as Jewish legalism. This is why Puritanism didn’t sustain either George Fox or Robert Barclay. They knew as Puritans what it meant to be ‘Biblical’.

⁵⁴ *ibid.* 133 The nature of rebirth ‘of the Spirit’ is what stumped Nicodemus in his encounter with Jesus in John 3:1-8. The mystery is complimented by Saul who became Paul in his rebirth as described by Paul in Galatians 1:14-18, 2:20, 4:19. Peter helpfully puts together the womb of Mary (Mother of God) and the human heart in the same context. The ark of the new covenant, Mary, coincides with the human heart as being the temple of God – a mystery. This is the meaning of Jesus cleansing the temple in John 2. Zeal for his Father’s house, the human heart, consumed Him. It was his body that would be torn down and in three days raised signifying the new temple. The new wineskin is the human heart.

⁵⁵ *ibid.* 133-4 This covenant by Christ is the new covenant undertaken by his flesh and blood now written in the human heart.

shall be given you in that hour, that speak: for it is not you that speak, but the Holy Spirit.” (Mark 13:11)⁵⁶

Peter concludes that the mystery of the birth of the word in the heart is not easily or quickly attained. Yet it is desired that one know the perfect measure of the word in the heart through humility.⁵⁷

Hierotheos Vlachos of Nafpaktos in his section on Hesychia and Mission states that sacred hesychia is linked with the churches missionary work. There can be no true mission unless it is inspired by hesychia. For the Christian, hesychia being the receiving of God’s very nature (Matthew 5:38-48; Luke 6:31-38), flows naturally into missionary activity. Divorcing mission from sacred *hesychia* creates human incongruence.⁵⁸ Knowledge of God is first and foremost empirical and existential. Passing on this knowledge results in people being reborn. Hesychia is the way and method which Christ handed to the apostles by which humanity acquires knowledge of God. This method is linked with experiencing the beatitudes of Christ by which a person is healed. The outcome of this method is mission and equally martyrdom. First-comes self-knowledge leading to humility, followed by repentance, meekness, hunger and thirst for God’s righteousness, keeping Christ commandments, the experience of God’s mercy, purity of heart through which man tastes the theoria of God, sharing with others that which we have tasted which may produce persecution, the joy of living in God’s kingdom, and the acquisition of the gift of prophecy.⁵⁹ When someone receives the grace of the Holy Spirit he becomes a magnet for large numbers of people. Vlachos quotes Justin Popovich: The ascetics are Orthodoxies only missionaries. Asceticism is Orthodoxies only missionary college. Orthodoxy is *ascesis* and life, so mission is preached and accomplished only through *ascesis* and life.⁶⁰

⁵⁶ *ibid.* 134 The Person of Christ is led by the Spirit sent of the Father. Barclay aligns with Basil the Great ‘*On the Holy Spirit*’ and Photius of Constantinople ‘*The Mystagogy of the Holy Spirit*’ in resistance to the Filioque addition to the Constantinopolitan Creed.

⁵⁷ *ibid.* 137 Barclay aligns with the ascetical Christianity of the east which learns from the humility of the incarnation as Light of the world (Phil 2:4-5)

⁵⁸ Vlachos, Hierotheos of Nafpaktos. *Orthodox Monasticism as the Way of Life of Prophets, Apostles and Martyrs*. Birth of Theotokos Monastery, Levadia, Greece, 2011, 49-50. Hearing the voice of God comes with time and perseverance with the Spirit cleansing the heart. Barclay states that truth came to Mary and the disciples slowly. Hearing God’s voice comes slowly through refinement and is necessary to evangelism. Being in God for the world opens relationships and conversations differently than going into the world for God. The monastic way is the Quaker way when realized.

⁵⁹ *ibid.* 50 For Barclay, evangelism comes by hearing the voice of God and sharing what one hears. It is more than sharing Bible information. In becoming fully human, we journey with others on the same course... as prophets.

⁶⁰ *ibid.* 55-6 Asceticism produce evangelism and mission differently than its Protestant counter-part. Hiddenness is the beginning, and becomes evident with time. The way of Jesus began in hiddenness and became public over time.

Vladimir Lossky in his chapter on Created Being maintains that Christ's prelapsarian creation is now the Church and the plenitude it contains is grace, being the profusion of divine energies by which and for which the world was created. Outside of the Church the divine energies act as determining causes, as the constant willing of God by which all being is created and preserved. However, it is only in the Church that creation realizes its end as given by the Holy Spirit. In the church the energies appear as grace in which all things are called to union with God. In the final analysis the entire universe is called to enter through the Church that it may be transformed after the consummation of the ages into the eternal Kingdom of God. The world finds its fulfillment in the Church where creation finds the unshakable foundation in accomplishing its vocation.⁶¹

Dumitru Staniloae in his section on Christian Obligations to the World Today in Light of Orthodox Soteriology maintains that the person cannot attain salvation if they remain in isolation, caring only for themselves. Inasmuch as Christ has accomplished the work of salvation, Christians as servants of Christ are obliged to strive for the union of all in the Kingdom of perfect love. Christ offered his sacrifice and rose from the dead outside Jerusalem to sanctify those who had no connection with the God of the Jewish law.

(Hebrews 13:13-14)⁶² The call is to leave the world behind and to rise above the world. The work among those who remain outside is to join with God in transcending the world as a static order to a condition higher than its own. Christ became man in the world. It was in the world he offered himself. He rose from the dead in the world and sent his disciples into the world teaching foreign languages (wisdom) through the Holy Spirit. It is in the world that Christ still works while being also in heaven, sending his disciples with the promise that he is with them.⁶³

Staniloae maintains that Christ is in the world but he is also in heaven. We ascend to the heavenly Christ through the earthly Christ within the world which is always seeking to progress beyond its present condition,

⁶¹ Lossky, Vladimir. *The Mystical Theology of the Eastern Church*, SVS Press, 1976, 113. The Church universal as Christ's Body joined to the Head is the hope for humanity and creation. The Church is more about togetherness than individuality as Bride.

⁶² Staniloae, Dumitru. *Theology and the Church*, SVS Press, 1980, 204. In whatever capacity, monastic or otherwise, the person in Christ exists for the world.

⁶³ *ibid.* 205 The Church triumphant and the Church militant join as one under Jesus the Head. 'To him who has ears to hear, let him hear what the Spirit is saying' is the conclusion to each of the seven churches of the Revelation. The Saints perfection is inclusive of our arrival as revealed in Hebrews 11:39-12:2. The Church throughout time will be as one.

yearning for something better beyond status quo.⁶⁴ Today Christ draws the world towards himself as much as ever to realize continuous change. Christ reveals himself to the world at every step of the way in some new perspective even though to the world he remains somebody incognito. The Christian must move forward along this road together with the world, telling the world who this person is who is attracting it.⁶⁵ In the face of every person we see and love some aspect of the face of Christ, the very face of Christ himself. Every face is potentially a face of Christ as Christ has placed his image there and we have a part to play from this potential state to one in which it is truly the face of Christ.⁶⁶ If the humanity of Christ belongs to all and is for the sake of all, it is destined for each of us for the humanity of Christ to become the possession of every person and to form them inwardly as it was formed inwardly in Christ, the divine hypostasis. As the humanity of God and of ourselves it is destined to be reflected in all men. All of us are called to be reflected in the humanity of Christ and to take our image from him. Symeon the New Theologian says the man who does not meet the needs of his fellow man despises Him who said: “as you did it to one of the least of these my brethren, you did it to me” (Matthew 25:40). Thus He has accepted to take on the face of every person. He has made himself one with every man that none who believe in him might despise his brother but treat his brother as if he were his God. We must treat all as we would treat Christ himself, and seek union through the service we offer.⁶⁷ Staniloae continues that everything which Christ did emphasizes the value of human life on earth. No eschatology bypasses life on earth. It is Christ we serve in the person who needs our help in this life. Christ has identified himself with them.⁶⁸ The Fathers speak of this world as a fair where we make purchase of the Kingdom of Heaven. Anyone who does not take part will leave this life with an empty soul. Life comes to us from our neighbor for if we win our neighbor we win God. If we destroy our neighbor we sin against Christ. The fair is universal and we must deal with every person. We acquire the kingdom more readily from our common man than from fellow believers because service like Christ’s demands effort and

⁶⁴ *ibid.* 205 George Fox proclaimed that Christ has come and is coming! Christ is present in heaven and on earth is agreeable with Quakers and the Orthodox. ‘Christ is present in our midst. He is and ever shall be’ is proclaimed by Quakers and Orthodox alike.

⁶⁵ *ibid.* 205-6 Christ is universally present. As the Psalmist says there is no where one can go without his presence Psalm 139. This does not discount the present prince of this world (Eph. 2:1-3) as affirmed by Barclay. Satan is an angel of light (II Corinthians 11:14)

⁶⁶ *ibid.* 206. The Benedictines maintain that we should see the face of Christ in every stranger.

⁶⁷ *ibid.* 206-7 This becomes the perfection of the Father in loving all humanity, even our enemy.

⁶⁸ *ibid.* 207 We are to treat others as if they were Christ himself.

humility towards all. It is not others who give the Kingdom of heaven but Christ who gives the kingdom through them.⁶⁹

Staniloae concludes that any sacrifice one man makes for another comes from the sacrificial consciousness and power of Christ in the form of *kenosis*. Any appeal addressed by one to another is an appeal made inwardly or in silence by Christ himself. Any sacrifice, any active service is prompted by the power of Christ's sacrifice as the appeal through us comes by Christ himself. Men are beings who do cry out and who do respond, and because of this they are bound together.⁷⁰ If Christians must see Christ in every man and hear Christ cry for help in every human cry, then he cannot accept that his brother exists in a condition inferior to his own. One who loves does not consider himself superior to his beloved. Love prompts us to strive for the achievement of equality and justice among all. The person who treats his neighbor as himself is not content to have more than his neighbor. Even should he serve and give to as many of his fellow persons as he can yet if he despises or ignores even a single one it will be counted as though he had ignored Christ.⁷¹ Reconciliation is inseparable from love which strives to secure equality and justice amongst all people and to promote mutual exchange by love. Christians can make no fruitful contribution and at the same time neglect to promote just and equitable relations on an international scale. The one who struggles to end injustice follows the path of Christ. Justice, equality, brotherhood, and lasting peace is realized in the material universe as in the heavenly universe. The material universe, like humankind, is destined for Transfiguration through the power of the risen body of Christ.⁷²

This section has realized the congruency of the universal nature of salvation and the role of *hesychia* in communion with the energies of God. It has opened the path to where further exploration in universalism and hesychasm in Quakerism and Orthodoxy can be explored. The points critical to Barclay's understanding of Theosis through this thesis coincide with the principles in this chapter. These principles include a new covenant view of humanity, a new covenant understanding of God, a new covenant view of soul-

⁶⁹ *ibid.* 207-8 This is the ultimate universalism by which the Quakers and the Orthodox join as one.

⁷⁰ *ibid.* 208-9 The *kenosis* of Christ expressed in Philippians 2:4-5 is one with *kenosis* & *Theosis* in us expressed in Philippians 3:7-11

⁷¹ *ibid.* 209-10 The call of Christ is universal of the world. We remain in Christ for the world more than in the world for Christ.

⁷² *ibid.* 210-11 Salvation begins on a personal level and moves to a world scale. It is inclusive of the cosmos.

transformation, a new covenant view of body-transfiguration, a new covenant view of human being from the heart, and a new covenant view of prelapsarian communion with God leading to the likeness of God through Theosis: becoming by Grace indwelling what God is by nature.

Bibliography

Primary Sources:

Athanasius of Alexandria. *On the Incarnation*. Fig-Books, KY, 2016.

Barclay, Robert. *An Apology for the True Christian Divinity being an Explanation and Vindication of the Principles and Doctrines of the People called Quakers*. Philadelphia Friends' Book Store, 1848, 1855, 1857, 1859, 1877. [Autographed 25 November 1675, Printed in Latin 1676, Printed in English 1678]

Barclay, Robert. *Truth Triumphant through the Spiritual Warfare, Christian Labours, and Writings of that Able and Faithful Servant of Jesus Christ, Robert Barclay*. To Which is Prefixed, An Account of his Life and Writings. 'He being dead, yet speaketh.' (Hebrews 11:4) In Three Volumes from the Octavo Edition of 1718, collated with the Folio Edition of 1692. Philadelphia: republished by Benjamin C. Stanton. Adam Waldie, Printer, 1831.

Basil of Caesarea. *On the Holy Spirit*. Beloved Publishing, KY, 2014.

Gregory of Nyssa. *The Life of Moses*, Harper One, 1978, 2006.

Gregory Palamas. *The Triads*. Paulist Press, 1983

Irenaeus of Lyon. *The Scandal of the Incarnation: Irenaeus against the Heresies*, Ignatius Press, 1990.

John of Damascus. *An Exact Exposition of the Orthodox Faith*. Veritatis Splendor Pub., LLC. TX, 2019.

Maximus the Confessor. *Selected Writings*. Paulist Press, NJ, 1985.

Mitchell, William. *A Sober Answer to An Angry Pamphlete: Or, Adminadversions*, by way of reply to Robert Barclay's late book (entitled *Truth Cleared of Calumnies*) in answer to a *Dialogue between a Quaker and a Stable Christian* by William Mitchell. Matthew 24:24, II Peter 3:17 [Quoted] *Aberdene*, printed by Iohn Forbes, 1671; *University of Aberdeen*.

Photius I of Constantinople. *The Mystagogy of the Holy Spirit*. Holy Cross Orthodox Press, MA, 1987.

Seraphim of Sarov, *On Acquisition of the Holy Spirit*, Pantianos Classics, IL, 2001.

Symeon the New Theologian. *The Discourses*. Paulist Press, NJ, 1980.

Secondary Sources:

Alfeyev, Hilarion. *Orthodox Christianity Volume II: Doctrine and Teaching of the Orthodox Church*, SVS Press, New York, 2012.

Barrett, Matthew. *God's Word Alone-The Authority of Scripture: What the Reformers Taught... and Why It Still Matters*. Zondervan, MI, 2016.

Behr, John. *The Formation of Christian Theology Volume I: The Way to Nicaea*. SVS Press, NY, 2006.

Birkel, Michael. *Quakers Reading Mystics*. Brill Publishing, Leiden, Netherlands, Issue 1.2, 2018.

Bowyer, Sergius. *Acquiring the Mind of Christ*, STM Press, 2015.

Bradshaw, David. *Aristotle East and West: Metaphysics and the Division of Christendom*. Cambridge University Press, 2004.

Bradshaw, David. *The Divine Energies in the New Testament*. St. Vladimir's Theological Quarterly 50, 2006, 189-223.

Braithwaite, William. *The Beginnings of Quakerism*, Second Edition. Cambridge University Press, 1955.

Brayshaw, A. Neave, *The Quakers, Their Story and Message*, Macmillan Co., NY, 1927

Brinton, Howard. *The Religious Philosophy of Quakerism*, Pendle Hill Publications, PA, 1973.

Cabasilas, Nicholas. *The Life in Christ*. SVS Press, NY, 1974.

Clendenin, Daniel. *Eastern Orthodox Christianity: A Western Perspective*. Baker Academic, MI, 2003.

Constantinou, Eugenia. *Thinking Orthodox: Understanding and Acquiring the Orthodox Christian Mind*, Ancient Faith Publishing, 2020.

Daniels, Wess C., Healey, Robynne Rogers, Kershner, Jon. *Quaker Studies Issue 1.1: An Overview, The Current State of the Field*. Brill Research Perspectives, Leiden/Boston, 2018.

Dales, Joanna Clare. John William Graham (1859-1932): Quaker Apostle of Progress.' PhD dissertation submitted to the University of Birmingham, 2016.

Dobson, David. *Scottish Quakers and Early America*, Baltimore, MA: Clearfield Publishing Company, 2006.

- Erickson, Millard J. *Concise Dictionary of Christian Theology*, Baker, 1986
- Fagerberg, David W. *On Liturgical Asceticism*, Catholic University of America Press, 2013.
- Fagerberg, David W. *St Vladimir's Theological Quarterly* 53 2-3 (2009) 197-207. The Cost of Understanding Schmemmann in the West, SVS Press, 2009.
- Fairbairn, Donald. *Life in the Trinity: An Introduction to Theology with the Help of the Church Fathers*. IVP academic, IL, 2009.
- French, R. M. *The Way of a Pilgrim and The Pilgrim Continues His Way*, Harper Collins, 1965, 1991.
- Garvey, John. *Seeds of the Word: Orthodox Thinking on Other Religions*, SVS Press, 2005.
- Grubb, Edward. *What is Quakerism*, London: Headley Brothers, 1917.
- Jones, Rufus. *The Later Periods of Quakerism* Vol. I, Greenwood Press, CT, 1970
- Karkkainen, Veli-Matti. *One with God: Salvation as Deification and Justification*. MN: Liturgical Press, 2004.
- Kershner, Jon, editor. *Quakers and Mysticism: Comparative and Syncretic Approaches to Spirituality*. Michael Birkel: Robert Barclay and Kabbalah. Palgrave Macmillan, 2019.
- Khomiakov, Aleksei. *On Spiritual Unity: A Slavophile Reader-The Church is One*. Lindisfarne Books, NY, 1998.
- Kokkonen, Laura. *Nordic Journal of Comparative Religion, Temenos* Vol. 58 No. 1 (2022), 91-117. The Dichotomy of Branding: Discourses in the Orthodox Church of Finland, 2022.
- Kurtz, Johann Heinrich. *Church History: Volume I.*, Frankfurt, Germany, Outlook Publishing, 1890, reprint 2020.
- L'Huillier, Peter. *The Church of the Ancient Councils: The Disciplinary Work of the First Four Councils*. SVS Press, NY, 1996.
- Latourette, Kenneth S., *A History of Christianity*, Harper One, 1977.
- Leiman, Pentti Mikael. *The Ecumenical Review*, 38 No. 1 Jan 1986, 17-22. The Mission of a Monastery in Present-day Finland, 1986.
- Lonergan, Bernard. Collected Words of Bernard Lonergan: *Grace and Freedom: Operative Grace in the Thought of St Thomas Aquinas*, University of Toronto Press, 2013 edition.
- Lonergan, Bernard. *Method in Theology*, University of Toronto Press, 2013 edition.
- Lossky, Vladimir. *In the Image and Likeness of God*. SVS Press, NY, 1974.
- Lossky, Vladimir. *The Mystical Theology of the Eastern Church*. SVS Press, NY, 1976.
- Mantzaridis, Georgios. *The Deification of Man: Gregory Palamas and the Orthodox Tradition*. SVS Press, NY, 1984.

McGuckin, John. *Saint Cyril of Alexandria and the Christological Controversy: Its History, Theology and Texts*. SVS Press, NY. 2004.

McGuckin, John. *The Orthodox Church: An Introduction to its History, Doctrine and Spiritual Culture*. Wiley-Blackwell, 2011.

McInally, Tom. The Scots College Paris, “1652 – 81: A Centre for Scottish Networks Journal of Irish Scottish Studies” Volume 2 Issue 1, September 2008. Available at: www.electricscotland.com/history/aberdeen/chapter11.htm accessed September, 2015.

Meyendorff, John. *Byzantine Theology: Historical Trends & Doctrinal Themes*. Fordham Press, NY, 1979.

Nakano, Yasuharu. ‘Self and Other in the Theology of Robert Barclay.’ PhD dissertation submitted to the University of Birmingham, April 2011.

Nassif, Bradley. *The Evangelical Theology of the Orthodox Church*. SVS Press, NY, 2021.

Nickalls, John. *The Journal of George Fox*, Friends Press, 1995.

Pelikan, Jaroslav. *The Christian Tradition, A History of the Development of Doctrine, Volume I The Emergence of the Catholic Tradition (100-600)*. The University of Chicago, IL, 1971.

Pelikan, Jaroslav. *The Christian Tradition, A History of the Development of Doctrine, Volume II The Spirit of Eastern Christendom (600-1700)*. The University of Chicago, IL, 1974.

Phillips, Robin. *Rediscovering the Goodness of Creation: A Manual for Recovering Gnostics*, Ancient Faith Publishing, 2023.

Pyper, Hugh S. Resisting the Inevitable Universal and Particular Salvation in the Thought of Robert Barclay, *Quaker Religious Thought*, (1998), 6-18

Pyper, Hugh S. Book Review: Robert Barclay A Catechism and Confession of Faith: A New Edition edited in Modern English by: Dean Freiday & Arthur Roberts, Barclay Press, (2001), *Quaker Religious Thought*, (2003), 98-99

Pyper, Hugh S. Robert Barclay: The Art of Apologetics, *Cambridge Journal of Early Quaker Faith*, 2015.

Rolt, Clarence. *Dionysius the Areopagite on The Divine Names & The Mystical Theology*. Cosimo, Inc, NY, 2007.

Russell, Norman. *Fellow Workers with God: Orthodox Thinking on Theosis*. SVS Press, NY. 2009.

Russell, Norman. *The Doctrine of Deification in the Greek Patristic Tradition*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004.

Schreiner, Thomas. *Faith Alone: The Doctrine of Justification*. Zondervan, MI. 2015

Schmemmann, Alexander. *For the Life of the World: Sacraments and Orthodoxy*. SVS Press, NY. 1973.

Scupoli, Lorenzo, editor Nicodemus of the Holy Mountain. *Unseen Warfare*. SVS Press, NY, 2000

Sell, Alan P. F. Robert Barclay (1648-1690), *The Fathers and the Inward, Universal Saving Light: A Tercentenary Reappraisal*. School of Advanced Study, University of London, *The Journal of the Friends' Historical Society*, Vol 56 No 3 1992, pgs. 210-226. Available at:
DOI: <https://doi.org/10.14296/fhs.v56i3.3531>

Sophrony, (Sakharov). *Saint Silouan the Athonite*. SVS Press, NY. 1991.

Sophrony, (Sakharov). *We Shall See Him as He Is: I John 3:2*. Patriarchal Stavropegic Monastery of Saint John the Baptist, Essex, UK, 2004.

Spencer, Carole Dale. *Holiness: The Soul of Quakerism*, Paternoster-Wipf & Stock Press, Eugene, OR, 2008.

Staniloae, Dumitru. *Theology and the Church*, SVS Press, 1980.

Trueblood, Elton. *Robert Barclay*, Harper & Row Publishers, New York, 1968.

Trueman, Carl. *Grace Alone: Salvation as a Gift of God*. Zondervan, MI. 2017.

Veniamin, Christopher. *The Orthodox Understanding of Salvation: Theosis in Scripture and Tradition*. Mount Tabor Publishing, PA, 2013.

Vlachos, Hierotheos of Nafpaktos. *Empirical Dogmatics of the Orthodox Catholic Church according to the spoken teaching of Father John Romanides: Volume I - Dogma, Ethics, Revelation*. Birth of Theotokos Monastery, Levadia, Greece, 2012.

Vryzas, Archimandrite Peter. *Theology as a Spiritual State in the Life and Teaching of St Sophrony the Athonite*, The Stavropegic Monastery of St John the Baptist, Essex, UK, 2021.

Ward, Madeleine. 'The Intellectual Context for the Development of Quakerism, 1647-1700.' PhD dissertation submitted to Wolfson College, University of Oxford, July 2017.

Ward, Madeleine (2018) "Robert Barclay's Christology," *Quaker Religious Thought*: Vol. 131 , Article 3. Available at: <https://digitalcommons.georgefox.edu/qrt/vol131/iss1/3>

Ware, Timothy. *The Orthodox Church*. Penguin Books, UK, 1991, 2015.

Wellum, Stephen. *Christ Alone: The Uniqueness of Jesus as Savior*. Zondervan, MI. 2017.

Zacharias, Archimandrite. *Christ, Our Way and Our Life: A Presentation of the Theology of Archimandrite Sophrony*. St Tikhon's Seminary Press, PA, 2003.

Zacharias, Archimandrite. *Hesychasm: The Bedewing Furnace of the Heart*, The Stavropegic Monastery of St John the Baptist, Essex, UK, 2022.

Zacharias, Archimandrite. *Monasticism: The All-Embracing Gift of the Holy Spirit*. The Stavropegic Monastery of St John the Baptist, Essex, UK, 2020.

Bibliography of Consulted Works

Afanasiev, Nicholas. *The Church of the Holy Spirit: Vision of the Eucharist and the Church*. University of Notre Dame Press, IN. 2007.

Alfeyev, Hilarion. *Christ the Conqueror of Hell: the Descent into Hades*, SVS Press, 2009.

Alfeyev, Hilarion. *Orthodox Christianity Volume I: The History and Canonical Structure of the Orthodox Church*, SVS Press, New York, 2011.

Alfeyev, Hilarion. *Orthodox Christianity Volume II: Doctrine and Teaching of the Orthodox Church*, SVS Press, New York, 2012.

Alfeyev, Hilarion. *Orthodox Christianity Volume V: Sacraments and Other Rites*, SVS Press, NY, 2019.

Aulen, Gustaf. *Christus Victor: An Historical Study of the Three Main Types of the Idea of the Atonement*, The Macmillan Company, NY. 1969.

Anatolios, Khaled. *Deification Through the Cross: An Eastern Christian Theology of Salvation*, Eerdmans, 2020.

Anatolios, Khaled. *Retrieving Nicaea: The Development and Meaning of Trinitarian Doctrine*, Baker Academic, 2011.

Bartos, Emil. *Deification in Eastern Orthodox Theology: an Evaluation and Critique of the Theology of Dumitru Staniloae*. Carlisle, Cumbria: Paternoster press, 1999.

Beggiani, Joseph. *Early Syriac Theology with Special Reference to the Maronite Tradition*. Catholic University of America Press, 2014.

Behr, John. *Irenaeus of Lyons: Identifying Christianity, Christian Theology in Context*. Oxford, UK, 2013

Behr, John. *The Mystery of Christ: Life in Death*. SVS Press, NY, 2006.

Behr, John. *The Formation of Christian Theology Volume I: The Way to Nicaea*. SVS Press, NY, 2006.

Berdyaev, Nicolas. *Slavery and Freedom*. R. M. French, translation London: Charles Scribner's Sons, NY, 1944.

Berdyaev, Nicolas. *Spirit and Reality*. Semantron Press, CA, 2009.

Bloom, Anthony. *Meditations on a Theme*. Mowbray, London, and Oxford, 1971, 1980.

Bloom, Anthony. *School for Prayer*, Anchor Brendon Ltd. Tiptree, Essex, 1984.

Boosalis, Harry. *Person to Person: The Orthodox Understanding of Human Nature*, STM Press, 2018.

Boosalis, Harry. *Sin and Salvation: An Orthodox Understanding of Redemption*, STM Press, 2021.

- Bouteneff, Peter. *How to Be a Sinner*, SVS Press, 2018.
- Bouteneff, Peter. *Sweeter than Honey: Orthodox Thinking on Dogma and Truth*, SVS Press, 2006.
- Bradshaw, David. *Divine Energies and Divine Action*, IOTA Publications, 2023.
- Breck, John. *Scripture in Tradition*, SVS Press, 2001.
- Breck, John. *The Sacred Gift of Life*, SVS Press, 1998.
- Bulgakov, Sergius. *The Bride of the Lamb: The Dialectic of the Idea of Divine-Humanity in the Patristic Epoch*. Boris Jakim, translation Grand Rapids, Michigan: Eerdmans/Edinburg: T&T Clark, 2002.
- Bulgakov, Sergius. *The Comforter: The Doctrine of the Holy Spirit in the Patristic Literature*. Boris Jakim, translation Grand Rapids, Michigan: Eerdmans/Edinburg: T&T Clark, 2004.
- Bulgakov, Sergius. *The Lamb of God*. Boris Jakim, translation Grand Rapids, Michigan: Eerdmans/Edinburg: T&T Clark, 2007.
- Bunge, Gabriel. *Despondency: The Spiritual Teaching of Evagrius Ponticus on Acedia*. SVS Press, NY, 2012.
- Bunge, Gabriel. *Spiritual Fatherhood: Evagrius Ponticus on the Role of the Spiritual Father*. SVS Press, NY, 2016.
- Cassian, John. *Conferences 1-3, 9-11, 14-15, 18*. Paulist Press, NJ, 1985.
- Cavarnos, Constantine. *Greek Letters and Orthodoxy their Relations during Two Millennia*. The Institute for Byzantine and Modern Greek Studies, MA, 2004.
- Cavarnos, Constantine. *Orthodoxy and Philosophy: Orthodox Christianity with reference to Ancient Greek and Modern Western Philosophy*, The Institute for Byzantine and Modern Greek Studies, MA, 2003.
- Chitty, Derwas J. *The Desert A City*, SVS Press, 1999.
- Christiansen, Michael J. and Wittung, Jeffrey A., editors. *Partakers of the Divine Nature: The History and Development of Deification in the Christian Traditions*. Madison/Teaneck: Fairleigh Dickinson University Press, 2007.
- Chrysostom, John. *On the Providence of God*, Herman of Alaska Brotherhood, CA. 2015, 2021.
- Chrysostomos and Auxentios. *Scripture and Tradition*, Center for Traditionalist Orthodox Studies, Etna, CA, 1999.
- Chumley, Norris. *Be Still and Know: God's Presence in Silence*. Fortress Press, MN, 2014.
- Clement, Olivier. *The Song of Tears*, SVS Press, 2021.
- Coniaris, Anthony. *Confronting and Controlling Thoughts According to the Fathers of the Philokalia*, Light and Life Publications, MN. 2004.
- Crow, Gillian. *This Holy Man: Impressions of Metropolitan Anthony*, SVS Press, 2005.

Cunningham, Mary and Theokritoff, Elizabeth (editors). *The Cambridge Companion to Orthodox Christian Theology*. Cambridge University Press, UK, 2010.

Damick, Andrew Stephen. *Orthodoxy and Heterodoxy: Finding the Way to Christ*. Ancient Faith Publishing, IN, 2nd Edition, 2017.

Danielou, Jean. *From Shadows to Reality*, Ex Fontibus – Bloomsbury Publishing, PLC, 2018.

Danielou, Jean. *Platonism and Mystical Theology*, SVS Press, 2022.

DeYoung, Rebecca. *Glittering Vices: A New Look at the Seven Deadly Sins and their Remedies*, Brazos, 2009.

Dmitri (Royster). *The Kingdom of God*, SVS Press, 1992.

Dokos, George. *The Watchful Mind: Teachings on the Prayer of the Heart by a Monk of Mount Athos*, SVS Press, 2014.

Ephraim the Syrian. *Hymns in Paradise*, SVS Press, 1990.

Fagerberg, David W. *Liturgical Mysticism*, Emmaus Academic, OH. 2019.

Fanous, Daniel. *A Silent Patriarch: Kyrillos VI Life and Legacy*, SVS Press, 2019.

Fanous, Daniel. *Taught by God*, SVS Press, 2020.

Foltz, Bruce V. *The Noetics of Nature*, Fordham University Press, NY. 2014.

Fortescue, Adrian. *The Greek Fathers: Their Lives and Writings*, Ignatius Press, 2007

Freeman, Stephen. *Every Where Present*. Ancient Faith Publishing, IN, 2010.

Gallatin, Matthew. *Thirsting for God in a Land of Shallow Wells*, Conciliar Press, CA. 2002.

Gregory, Hierodeacon. *The Church, Tradition, Scripture, Truth, and Christian Life*, Center for Traditionalist Orthodox Studies, Etna, CA, 1995.

Gundry and Stamoolis. *Three Views on Eastern Orthodoxy and Evangelicalism*. Zondervan, 2004.

Guroian, Vigen. *The Orthodox Reality: Culture, Theology, and Ethics in the Modern World*, Baker, 2018.

Harrison, Nonna Verna. *God's Many-Splendored Image: Theological Anthology for Christian Formation*. Baker Academic, MI, 2010.

Hippolytus. *On the Apostolic Tradition*, SVS Press, 2015.

Huneycutt, Joseph. *Defeating Sin: Overcoming Our Passions*, SVS Press, 2018.

Ignatius IV. *The Resurrection of Modern Man*, SVS Press, 1985.

Isaac of Syria. *Daily Readings*, Templegate Publishers, IL. 1989.

Jakim, Boris and Robert Bird editors, *On Spiritual Unity: A Slavophile Reader*, Lindisfarne Books, NY, 1998. Alexie Khomiakov. *The Church is One*.

- John Climacus. *The Ladder of Divine Ascent*. Paulist Press, NJ, 1982.
- John of Damascus. *Three Treatises on the Divine Images*. SVS Press, NY, 2003.
- John, Elijah. *The Mystical Path of Christian Theosis*, Monastic Press, NV, 2020.
- Keating, Daniel A. *Deification and Grace*. Sapientia Press, FL, 2007.
- Kotsonis, Ioannikios. *Themes from the Philokalia: Watchfulness and Prayer, Number 1*. Publications of the Holy Monastery of St Gregory Palamas, Thessaloniki, Hessa, 1998.
- Kotsonis, Ioannikios. *Themes from the Philokalia: The Nous, Number 2*. Publications of the Holy Monastery of St Gregory Palamas, Thessaloniki, Hessa, 1999.
- Kragiopoulou, Symeon. *Do You Know Yourself?* Divine Ascent Press, CA. 2010
- Kronstadt, John. *Spiritual Counsels*, SVS Press, 1966.
- Larchet, Jean-Claude. *Theology of the Body*. SVS Press, NY, 2016.
- Leith, John H. *Creeds of the Churches: A Reader in Christian doctrine from the Bible to the present*. John Knox Press, Louisville, 1982.
- Loukes, Harold. *The Discovery of Quakerism*, George G Harrap & Co., London, 1960
- Lossky, Vladimir. *Orthodox Theology: An Introduction*. SVS Press, NY, 1978.
- Lossky, Vladimir. *The Vision of God*. SVS Press, NY, 1963.
- Loudovikos, Nikolaos. *Church in the Making: An Apophatic Ecclesiology of Constubstantiality*, SVS Press, 2016.
- Louth, Andrew. *Introducing Eastern Orthodox Theology*. IVP academic, IL, 2013.
- Louth, Andrew. *The Origins of the Christian Mystical Tradition: From Plato to Denys*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2nd ed. 2007.
- Mathewes-Green, Frederica. *The Illumined Heart: Capture the Vibrant Faith of Ancient Christians*, Paraclete Press, 2001
- Matthew the Poor. *The Story of Jesus Christ*, Ancient Faith Press, IN. 2022
- McGuckin, John. *Saint Cyril of Alexandria and the Christological Controversy: Its History, Theology and Texts*. SVS Press, NY. 2004.
- McGuckin, John. *The Orthodox Church: An Introduction to its History, Doctrine and Spiritual Culture*. Wiley-Blackwell, 2011.
- McGuckin, John. *The Path of Christianity: The First Thousand Years*. IVP academic, IL. 2017.
- Meredith, Anthony. *The Cappadocians: Plato, Origen, Basil of Caesarea, Gregory of Nazianzus, Gregory of Nyssa*. SVS Press, NY, 1995.

- Merton, Thomas. *The Wisdom of the Desert: Sayings from the Desert Fathers of the Fourth Century*. New Direction Books, NY, 1960.
- Meyendorff, John. *A Study of Gregory Palamas*. SVS Press, NY, 1998.
- Meyendorff, John. *Byzantine Theology: Historical Trends & Doctrinal Themes*. Fordham Press, NY, 1979.
- Meyendorff, John (editor). *Gregory Palamas: The Triads*. Paulist Press, NJ. 1983.
- Meyendorff and Schmemmann. *The Primacy of Peter in the Orthodox Church*, Faith Press, UK, 1963.
- Muse, Stephen. *Becoming Flame*, St Tikhons Monastery Press, 2015.
- Muse, Stephen. *Being Bread*, St Tikhons Monastery Press, 2015.
- Nassif, Bradley. *Bringing Jesus to the Desert: Uncover the Ancient Culture, Discover Hidden Meaning*. Zondervan, MI, 2011.
- Nassif, Bradley. *The Evangelical Theology of the Orthodox Church*, SVS Press, 2021.
- Nellas, Panayiotis. *Deification in Christ: Orthodox Perspectives on the Nature of the Human Person*. SVS Press, NY, 1987.
- Maximus the Confessor. *The Church's Mystagogy*, Paulist Press, 1985.
- Nikodimos and Makarios. *The Philokalia volume 4*, Farrar, Straus, and Giroux, NY. 1995.
- Opperwall, Daniel G. *A Layman in the Desert*, SVS Press,
- Origen. *An Exhortation to Martyrdom, Prayer and Selected Works*. Paulist Press, NJ, 1979.
- Papadakis, Aristeides. *Church in Byzantium: The Filioque Controversy in the Patriarchate of Gregory II of Cyprus (1283-1289)*, SVS Press, 1996.
- Papanikolaou, Aristotle. *Being with God: Trinity, Apophaticism, and Divine-Human Communion*. Notre Dame Press, IN, 2006.
- Papanikolaou, Aristotle & Demacopoulos, George (editors). *Orthodox Constructions of the West*. Fordham Press, NY. 2013
- Papanikolaou, Aristotle & Demacopoulos, George (editors). *Orthodox Readings of Augustine*. SVS Press, NY, 2008.
- Payton, James. *Light from the Christian East: An Introduction to the Orthodox Tradition*. IVP, IL, 2007.
- Pennington, Basil. *O Holy Mountain: Journal of a Retreat on Mount Athos*, Michael Glazier Inc., DE. 1984.
- Plummer, Robert (editor). *Journeys of Faith: Evangelicalism, Eastern Orthodoxy, Catholicism, and Anglicanism*, Zondervan, 2012
- Pentiuc, Eugen J. *The Old Testament in Eastern Orthodox Tradition*, Oxford University Press, 2014.

Peter, (Vryzas). *Theology as Spiritual State in the Life and Teachings of Saint Sophrony*, Stavropegic Monastery of St John the Baptist, 2021.

Philaret (Drosdov). *The Longer Catechism of the Eastern Orthodox Church*, 1839.

Porphyrios, *Wounded by Love: The Life and the Wisdom of Saint Porphyrios*, Denise Harvey, Greece, 2015

Reardon, Patrick. *Reclaiming the Atonement: An Orthodox Theology of Redemption*, Ancient Faith Publishing, 2015.

Romanides, John. *Notes on the Palamite Controversy and Related Topics - Part I*, The Greek Orthodox Theological Review, vol. 1, no. 2 (1960-61) pp. 186-205.

Romanides, John. *Notes on the Palamite Controversy and Related Topics – Part II*, The Greek Orthodox Theological Review, (1964) pp. 225-270.

Romanides, John. *The Ancestral Sin: A comparative study of the sin of our ancestors Adam and Eve according to the paradigms and doctrines of the 1st and 2nd century Church and the Augustinian formulation of original sin*. Zepher Publishing, NJ, 2002.

Rommen, Edward. *Come and See: An Eastern Orthodox Perspective on Contextualization*, William Carey, 2013.

Rommen, Edward. *Get Real: On Evangelism in the Late Modern World*, William Carey, 2010.

Rose, Seraphim. *Nihilism: The Root of the Revolution of the Modern Age*, St Herman of Alaska Brotherhood, 2020.

Rose, Seraphim. *The Place of Blessed Augustine in the Orthodox Church*, St Herman of Alaska Brotherhood, 2007.

Schmemmann, Alexander. *Great Lent*. SVS Press, 2003.

Schmemmann, Alexander. *O Death, Where is Thy Sting*. SVS Press, NY. 2003.

Schooping, Joshua. *A Manual of Theosis*, St Theophan the Recluse Press, PA. 2020.

Schooping, Joshua. *Disillusioned: Why I Left the Eastern Orthodox Church*, Theophany Press, AR. 2023.

Shenouda III. *The Life of Repentance and Purity*, SVS Press, 2016.

Slesinski, Robert. *The Theology of Sergius Bulgakov*. SVS Press, NY. 2017.

Sophrony, (Sakharov). *On Prayer*. SVS Press, NY. 2020.

Staniloae, Dumitru. *Orthodox Dogmatic Theology: The Experience of God Volume I – Revelation and Knowledge of the Triune God*. Holy Cross Seminary Press, MA, 1998.

Staniloae, Dumitru. *Orthodox Dogmatic Theology: The Experience of God Volume II – The World: Creation and Deification*. Holy Cross Seminary Press, MA, 2000.

- Staniloae, Dumitru. *Orthodox Spirituality: a Definitive Manual for the Scholar*. Archimandrite Jerome (Newville) and Otilia Kloos, translation South Canaan, PA: Saint Tikhon's Seminary Press, 2002.
- Stavropoulos, Christos. *Partakers of the Divine Nature*, Light and Life Publishing, MN. 1976.
- Stewart, Alistair, editor. *On the Two Ways: Life or Death, Light or Darkness*, SVS Press, 2011.
- Strickland, John. *The Age of Paradise: Christendom from Pentecost to the First Millennium*, Ancient Faith Press, 2019.
- Strickland, John. *The Age of Division: Christendom from the Great Schism to the Protestant Reformation*, Ancient Faith Press, 2020.
- Strickland, John. *The Age of Utopia: Christendom from the Renaissance to the Russian Revolution*, Ancient Faith Press, 2021.
- Strickland, John. *The Age of Nihilism: Christendom from the Great War to the Culture Wars*, Ancient Faith Press, 2022.
- Thomas, Stephen. *Deification in the Eastern Orthodox Tradition: A Biblical Perspective*. Gorgias Press, NJ. 2007.
- Tibbs, Eve. *A Basic Guide to Orthodox Theology*, Baker Academic, 2021.
- Trenham, Josiah. *Rock and Sand: An Orthodox Appraisal of the Protestant Reformers and Their Teaching*. Newrome Press, Columbia, MO, 2015.
- Vlachos, Hierotheos of Nafpaktos. *Empirical Dogmatics of the Orthodox Catholic Church according to the spoken teaching of Father John Romanides: Volume II -Trinity, Creation, Fall, Incarnation, Church Life after Death*. Birth of Theotokos Monastery, Levadia, Greece, 2013.
- Vlachos, Hierotheos of Nafpaktos. *The person in the Orthodox Tradition*. Birth of Theotokos Monastery, Levadia, Greece, Second edition 2021.
- Vlachos, Hierotheos of Nafpaktos. *Orthodox Monasticism as the Way of Life of Prophets, Apostles and Martyrs*. Birth of Theotokos Monastery, Levadia, Greece, 2011.
- Vasileios, Archimandrite. *Hymn of Entry: Liturgy and Life in the Orthodox Church*. SVS Press, NY, 1984.
- Veniamin, Christopher. *Saint Gregory Palamas: The Homilies*. Mount Thabor Publishing, PA, 2014.
- Veniamin, Christopher. *The Orthodox Understanding of Salvation: Theosis in Scripture and Tradition*. Mount Tabor Publishing, PA, 2013.
- Waddell, Helen. *The Desert Fathers*, Ann Arbor, University of Michigan Press, 1957.
- Ware, Timothy. *The Orthodox Way*, SVS Press, 1979.
- Webber, Meletios. *Steps of Transformation: An Orthodox Priest Explores the Twelve Steps*, Conciliar Press, 2003.

Williams and Anstall. *Orthodox Worship: A Living Continuity with Synagogue, Temple, and Early Church*, Ancient Faith Publishing, 2018.

Yannaras, Christos. *Metaphysics as a Personal Adventure: Yannaras in Conversation with Norman Russell*. SVS Press, NY, 2017.

Yannaras, Christos. *Person and Eros*. Holy Cross Orthodox Press, MA, 2007.

Zacharias, Archimandrite. *Remember Thy First Love (Revelation 2:4-5): The Three Stages of the Spiritual Life in the Theology of Elder Sophrony*. Mount Thabor Publishing, PA, 2006.

Zacharias, Archimandrite. *The Enlargement of the Heart (II Corinthians 6:13) in the Theology of Saint Silouan the Athonite and Elder Sophrony of Essex*. Mount Thabor Publishing, PA, 2010.

Zacharias, Archimandrite. *The Hidden Man of the Heart (I Peter 3:4) The Cultivation of the Heart in Orthodox Christian Anthropology*. Mount Thabor Publishing, PA, 2014.

Zizioulas, John. *Being as Communion: Studies in Personhood and the Church*. SVS Press, NY, 1985.

Zizioulas, John. *Eucharist, Bishop, Church: Unity in the Divine Eucharist and the Bishop in the First Three Centuries*. Holy Cross Orthodox Press, MA, 2001.

Appendix Bernard Lonergan: Method in Theology

Bernard Lonergan (1904-1984) who argued for a 14th through 16th century clarification in the 13th century writing of Thomas Aquinas⁷³ provides a way forward in a research method in theology. In the introduction to his dissertation Lonergan reveals Aquinas working into a synthesis the speculative theorems discovered by his predecessors of the previous eight centuries. It is looking backward rather than forward which reveal the development of Aquinas' mind. It suggests that research of Aquinas' thought be systematic of the whole and not incidental of the individual which Lonergan argued had resulted in an impasse by later interpreters of Aquinas.⁷⁴

⁷³ Lonergan, Bernard. *Collected Words of Bernard Lonergan: Grace and Freedom: Operative Grace in the Thought of St Thomas Aquinas*, University of Toronto Press, 2013 edition.

⁷⁴ *ibid.*, 155.

For Lonergan it was necessary that a study of Aquinas (1225-1274) be systematically centered on Aquinas' prior interests in order to discover a scientific conclusion in which an inductive search could terminate. Without the integral unity of Aquinas' comprehensive thought postulated, an inquiry into Aquinas' central argument could not be realized.⁷⁵ Lonergan puts the confusion of Aquinas' thought in context by saying that the Molinists conclusion and the Bannezian conclusion of the three centuries following Aquinas had ruled out the most important point for which Aquinas had been arguing, creating an impasse for later readers.⁷⁶

Though a method which solves the interpretation problem is possible, its use makes extreme demands on the reader-researcher of Aquinas. It involves the exposition and use of the theory of the history of theological speculation. It postulates a capacity to see in several hundred pages a single argument with a major in the theory of development, and a minor in the number of facts. Lonergan, while apologizing for the use of so complicated a procedure saw no other alternative. A study of Aquinas cannot be but historical. A historical study cannot be but inductive. An inductive conclusion, though it may be certain when negative, can for the most part be no more than a probability when positive. If the probability is to be, not an opinion, but a scientific conclusion, no other method than the speculative method adopted by Lonergan appeared possible.⁷⁷

The use of speculative theology through analysis of the idea of its development yields a general scheme but does so from consideration of the nature of anthropological speculation on any subject.⁷⁸ In Lonergan's method the argument concerning Aquinas was able to proceed not from the 13th century through the 16th century and then back to the 13th century but instead proceeded from 4th century Augustine (354-430) to 13th century Aquinas (1225-1274) where Lonergan finds Aquinas

⁷⁵ *ibid.*

⁷⁶ *ibid.*

⁷⁷ *ibid.*, 155-6.

⁷⁸ *ibid.*, 157.

working out his own theology in light of his predecessors.⁷⁹ Lonergan concluded that the only possible way to demonstrate an interpretation is to enumerate the entire list of speculative possibilities, demonstrate that the enumeration is complete, and then exclude all views except what remains.⁸⁰ For this reason certitude can only be arrived at through negation. All guessing is excluded by the method. The argument does not consist in proposing and then verifying hypotheses through the incidental. Instead what is used is the ‘a priori’ scheme of speculative development, which is not a hypothesis but a demonstrable conclusion.⁸¹

Lonergan employs the ‘pincer’ movement by looking at the nature of grace from fourth century Augustine, followed by Anselm, Peter Lombard, Albert the Great, and so on up to 13th century Aquinas. Secondly Lonergan proceeds from the general by assembling the explicit statements on the nature of grace to be found in the fourth century writings of Augustine up to 13th century Aquinas. Thirdly and fourthly in simpler sciences the ‘pincer’ movement processes from both general to particular and particular to general at the same time to yield the conclusion, but in speculative theology there is conceived the supernatural with the natural which requires a special inquiry into Aquinas’ mind of operation. This involves analysis of the human will along with the operations of God. The inquiries are subsidiary, undertaken not for their own sake but principally to eliminate the misinterpretation of Aquinas’ position, and reveals that Aquinas’ mind is more resourceful than commonly proposed.⁸² Throughout the research attention is paid to the chronological order of Aquinas’ work, and the conclusions resulting from the sequence become evident. While the degree of importance to the chronological sequence varies on almost every question raised yet the sequence

⁷⁹ *ibid.*

⁸⁰ *ibid.*

⁸¹ *ibid.*, 158.

⁸² *ibid.*

is paramount with respect to establishing Aquinas' theory of grace and free will which was universally understood as Aquinas' core work.⁸³

Lonergan affirms that he is not engaged in proposing a theory in speculative theology. He is giving an account of Aquinas' theology. Lonergan's task is not concerned with the implications of his position, the ulterior development of his position, or even the defense of his position. Lonergan analyzes what Aquinas said, why Aquinas said it, and what Aquinas meant in saying it.⁸⁴ It is a conclusion of what was foremost in Aquinas' thought.⁸⁵

Lonergan acknowledges that theology mediates between a cultural matrix, and the significance and role of religion in that same matrix. In the classicist notion of culture there is but one normative notion while with the empirical notion of culture there is a set of meanings and values that informs a way of life which may remain unchanged for ages but may also dissolve into irrelevance.⁸⁶ When the classicist notion of culture prevails, theology is conceived as a permanent achievement, and then one discourses on its nature. When culture is conceived empirically, culture is known to be in ongoing process, and then one writes on its method. In the empiricist context, method is the framework for collaborative creativity.⁸⁷

Lonergan claims that his model is not something to be copied or imitated. His model is not meant to be a description of reality or a hypothesis about reality. Lonergan's model is simply an intelligible, interlocking set of terms and relations to have when describing reality or forming hypotheses. His first chapter on method sets forth what one can discover in themselves as the dynamic structure of

⁸³ *ibid.*, 159.

⁸⁴ *ibid.*, 159-160.

⁸⁵ *ibid.*, 160-1.

⁸⁶ Lonergan, Bernard. *Method in Theology*, University of Toronto Press, 1971, 2013 edition. xi

⁸⁷ *ibid.* xi

their cognitional and moral being. It is not open to radical revision as Lonergan's method doesn't offer rules to be followed blindly but offers a framework for historical creativity.⁸⁸

Lonergan's method is conceived more as art than science. It is to be learned more in the laboratory of empirical experience than in books or lectures. What counts is the example of the master (Aquinas) and the effort to do likewise in the reader-researcher (Lonergan).⁸⁹ Lonergan argues that classical scientific approaches to the problem of method do little to advance the less successful (theological) subjects. For in the less successful subject (Aquinas' core thought) there is a lack of masters to be followed and of models to be imitated.⁹⁰ Recourse to science will be of little help. Lonergan contends that a third way must be found even though difficult and laborious. The price must be paid if the less successful subject (Aquinas' core argument) is not to remain in mediocrity or fall into disuse.⁹¹

Lonergan outlines his method appealing first to the successful sciences, secondly to the procedure of the human mind, thirdly through the human mind discerning a transcendental method which is employed in any cognitional enterprise, and fourthly affirming the relevance of the transcendental method in the formulation of more special methods appropriate to such fields as theology.⁹²

Lonergan defines 'method' as a normative pattern of recurrent and related operations yielding cumulative and progressive results. This is a method of distinct operations, each operation is related to the other operations, the set of relations forms a pattern, the pattern is described as the right way of doing the job, and the operations in accord with the pattern are repeated indefinitely of which the fruit of such repetition are not repetitious, but cumulative and progressive i.e. the chronological pattern of going through Barclay's collective works multiple times.

⁸⁸ *ibid.* xii

⁸⁹ *ibid.*, 3.

⁹⁰ *ibid.*, 4.

⁹¹ *ibid.*

⁹² *ibid.*

Lonergan claims that the scientific method of a normative pattern of recurrent and related operations yielding cumulative and progressive results as a set of rules is possible when the same result is produced over and over again as in the assembly line.⁹³ But the scientific method will not do if progressive and cumulative results are expected. Results are progressive only if there is a sustained succession of discoveries; they are cumulative only if there is effected a synthesis of each new insights with all previous insights.⁹⁴ Lonergan articulates that neither discovery nor synthesis is at the beck and call of any set of scientific rules. Instead there are currents which follow statistical laws. These currents can be made more probable but they cannot be assured by a set of scientific prescriptions.

Lonergan continues that the preliminary notion conceives method not as a set of rules but as ‘a prior,’ normative pattern of operations from which the rules may be derived. It includes such operations as describing content, formulating problems, formulating hypotheses, and deducing implications. It does not hesitate to move outside this group and to speak of inquiry, observation, discovery, experiment, synthesis and verification.⁹⁵ While the logical operations tend to consolidate what has been achieved, the non-logical operations keep all achievement open to further advance. The conjunction of the logical and the non-logical result in an open, ongoing, progressive, and cumulative process....⁹⁶

Operations in the basic pattern are seeing, hearing, touching, smelling, tasting, inquiring, imagining, understanding, conceiving, formulating, reflecting, marshaling and weighing the evidence, judging, deliberating, evaluating, deciding, speaking, and writing. It is the goal to bring into light the pattern within which these operations occur and which cannot succeed without an exceptional amount of

⁹³ *ibid.*, 5-6.

⁹⁴ *ibid.*, 6.

⁹⁵ *ibid.*

⁹⁶ *ibid.*

exertion and activity on the part of the reader-researcher (Lonergan).⁹⁷ The reader-researcher will have to discover in his own experience the dynamic relationship leading from one operation to the next. Otherwise he will find the work as illuminating as a blind man finds a lecture on color which Lonergan describes in his prior work entitled *Insight* (1957).⁹⁸

The operations are transitive. They have objects. They are transitive not merely in the grammatical sense but also in the spiritual-psychological sense. By seeing, there becomes present what is seen, by hearing, there becomes present what is heard, by imagining, there becomes present what is imagined and so on where in each case the present in question is a spiritual-psychological event.⁹⁹ Secondly, the operations are operations of an operator, and the operator remains the subject. The operator is a subject not merely in the grammatical sense but in the active voice referring to the operations. He is subject in the psychological sense that he operates consciously. Whenever any of the operations are performed, the subject (Lonergan) is aware of himself operating, present in himself operating, experiencing himself operating.¹⁰⁰

The operations of the object (Aquinas) occur consciously and by the operations the subject (Lonergan) is conscious. The presence of the object is different from the presence of the subject. The object is present when what is gazed upon by the subject is attended to. The presence of the subject resides in the gazing, the attending, and the intending. By this the subject can be conscious, as attending, and yet give his whole attention to the object.¹⁰¹ The subject experiences himself operating. This experience is not intending but is being conscious. The operation is intrinsically intentional as well as intrinsically conscious.¹⁰²

⁹⁷ *ibid.*, 6-7.

⁹⁸ *ibid.*, 7.

⁹⁹ *ibid.*

¹⁰⁰ *ibid.*, 7-8.

¹⁰¹ *ibid.*, 8.

¹⁰² *ibid.*

Lonergan defines introspection in this process. Introspection may be understood to mean not consciousness itself but the process of objectifying the contents of consciousness. We move from the data of consciousness through inquiry, understanding, reflection, judgment, to statements about conscious subjects and their operations. The reader-researcher (Lonergan) will discover not by looking inwardly but by recognizing in his expression the objectification of his subjective experience.¹⁰³

Fourthly, Lonergan distinguishes different levels of consciousness and intentionality for the successive, related, and qualitatively different levels. On the empirical level we sense, perceive, imagine, feel, speak, and move. On the intellectual level we inquire, come to understand, express what we have understood, work out the presuppositions, and the implications of our expression. On the rational level we reflect, marshal the evidence, pass judgment on the truth or falsity, certainty or probability, of a statement. On the responsible level we deliberate over possible courses of action, evaluate, then decide, and carry out our decisions. All four of these levels are intentional and conscious.¹⁰⁴

In this process there is a fuller self of which one would become aware, and in which the awareness is different. As intelligent, the subject seeks insight and, as insights accumulate, the reader-researcher reveals them in his behavior, his speech, his grasp of situations, and his mastery of theoretical domains. But as reflectively and critically conscious, he incarnates detachment and disinterestedness, gives himself over to criteria of truth and certitude, makes his soul concern the determination of what is, or what is not; the awareness of self, residing in the incarnation, the self-surrender, and the single-minded concern for truth.

¹⁰³ *ibid.*, 8-9.

¹⁰⁴ *ibid.*, 9.

The attending of our senses is normally selective but not creative. The attending that is conceptual puts together both the content of the insight and as much of the image as is essential to the occurrence of the insight; the result being an attending of a concrete being selected by an incomplete determined (in this sense, abstract) content.

Lonergan states that what has been described is the transcendental method. It produces cumulative and progressive results. The transcendental method is concerned with meeting the exigencies and exploiting the opportunities presented by the human mind. It is foundational, universally significant, and relevant. Everyone knows and observes the transcendental method in the measure that they are attentive, intelligent, reasonable, and responsible. In another sense it is difficult to be at home in the transcendental method when one is engrossed in reading books, listening to lectures or analyzing language. Instead it is a matter of heightening one's consciousness by objectifying the conscience, and is something that the individual has to do within himself and for himself.¹⁰⁵

The objectification of the conscience consists of experiencing, understanding, judging, and deciding. These operations are conscious and intentional. Their application is (1) experiencing one's experiencing, understanding, judging, and deciding, (2) understanding the unity and relation of one's experienced experiencing, understanding, judging, and deciding, (3) affirming the reality of one's experienced and understood experiencing, understanding, judging, and deciding and (4) deciding to operate in accord with the norms immanent in the spontaneous relatedness of one's experienced, understood, and affirmed experiencing, understanding, judging, and deciding.¹⁰⁶

There is then a rock on which to build. Any theory, description, account of our conscience and intentional operations is bound to be incomplete and to admit further clarifications and extensions but all such clarifications and extensions are to be derived from the conscious and intentional

¹⁰⁵ *ibid.*, 13-14.

¹⁰⁶ *ibid.*, 14-15.

operations themselves. They as given in consciousness; they confirm every exact account; they refute every inexact or incomplete account. Lonergan concludes that the rock then is the subject in our conscience, an un-objectified attentiveness, intelligence, and reasonableness leading to responsibility.¹⁰⁷

In the transcendental method there is the normative function, the critical function, the dialectical function, and the systematic function which assures continuity without imposing rigidity. There is the heuristic function which aims at transforming the unknown into the known; the inquiry between ignorance and knowledge. The heuristic intermediary between ignorance and knowing is an intending, and what is intended is an unknown that is to be known.¹⁰⁸ The method is the exploitation of such intending by outlining the steps to be taken if one is to proceed from the initial intending to the eventual knowing. The use of the heuristic device is fundamental. The heuristic device consists in designating and naming the intended unknown, in setting down at once all that can be affirmed about it, and in using the explicit knowledge as a guide, a criterion, and a pre-miss in the effort to arrive at a fuller knowledge.¹⁰⁹

Lonergan concludes that the transcendental method is not the intrusion into theology of alien matter from an alien source. Its function is to advert to the fact that theologies are produced by theologians, that theologians have minds and use them, that their doing so should not be ignored or passed over, but explicitly acknowledged in itself and in its implications.¹¹⁰ The transcendental method is not philosophy but is a heightening of consciousness which brings to life, and is a conscious and intentional operation which leads to answering three basic questions: What am I doing when I know? Why is doing that knowing? What do I know when I do it? The first answer is cognitional theory. The second answer is epistemology. The third answer is metaphysics where metaphysics is

¹⁰⁷ *ibid.*, 19-20.

¹⁰⁸ *ibid.*, 20-22.

¹⁰⁹ *ibid.*, 22.

¹¹⁰ *ibid.*, 24-25.

transcendental, and an instigation of heuristic structures.¹¹¹ It remains that the transcendental method is only a part of the theological method. It supplies the basic anthropological component. It does not supply the specific religious component.¹¹² The religious component comes with the assimilation of the subject's experience with the object's experience.

The Lonergan Method in Theology provides a way forward in analyzing Robert Barclay's soteriology as wrongly placed within the Protestant framework of the five *solas* which has become the norm of Protestant theology. A closer analysis of Barclay's soteriology using the operations of the Lonergan method reveals that what Barclay argued was for Theosis in the Eastern Orthodox Church. The cultural matrix of the Protestant movement in which Barclay wrote (1670-1679, 1686), this reader argues had not come fully into fruition until the Tolerance Act of 1688 was enacted by royal assent in 1689. This research analyzes Barclay's 'True Christian Divinity' following the method of Bernard Lonergan who claimed that Thomas Aquinas had been misunderstood in the centuries following Aquinas through the subject - Bernard Lonergan transcendently identifying with the object - Thomas Aquinas.

¹¹¹ *ibid.*, 25.

¹¹² *ibid.* 25