

Some Uses of Pastoral: from Marvell to Wordsworth

By

Aurora Faye Martinez

A thesis submitted to the University of Birmingham for the degree of DOCTOR OF  
PHILOSOPHY

Department of English Literature  
School of English, Drama, & Creative Studies  
College of Arts and Law  
University of Birmingham  
April 2021

UNIVERSITY OF  
BIRMINGHAM

**University of Birmingham Research Archive**

**e-theses repository**

This unpublished thesis/dissertation is copyright of the author and/or third parties. The intellectual property rights of the author or third parties in respect of this work are as defined by The Copyright Designs and Patents Act 1988 or as modified by any successor legislation.

Any use made of information contained in this thesis/dissertation must be in accordance with that legislation and must be properly acknowledged. Further distribution or reproduction in any format is prohibited without the permission of the copyright holder.

## **Abstract**

Accounts of English literary history which have drawn upon the Neoclassical pastoral theory of Rene Rapin and Bernard le Bouvier Fontenelle have often excluded the poetry of Andrew Marvell. Marvell's lyrics were not considered to be pastoral because of the wit with which his courtly swains uttered philosophical insights as compared with Neoclassicists' concept of pastoral as the depiction of the simplicity of the Ancient shepherd which was conveyed through his actions and perceptions. This thesis attends to that omission in accounts of English pastoral and begins with Marvell's satiric renderings of it. It then turns to similar renderings of Alexander Pope, James Thomson, and Joseph and Thomas Warton, and the later Romantic responses of William Wordsworth and Samuel Taylor Coleridge in manuscript and print. Through these texts, this thesis examines how the habits of mind which each successive poet forms because of the habits of writing he develops through imitating earlier models in literary history then shapes his understanding and accounts of it, creative and critical. This thesis thus studies the verse and prose of the noted authors to examine the concept of pastoral which may be formed from it. It considers how pastoral serves as a mode in which the images and underlying ideals of Ancient examples of this kind of writing allowed later poets to examine the succession of poetic responses to it. It concludes with a discussion of what ideas may be formed of genre and literary history.

## **Acknowledgments**

I am grateful for the funding I received from the University of Birmingham in the form of Doctoral Research Bursaries, without which I would not have been able to complete this thesis. I also am grateful for the several Postgraduate Research Support Fund awards I received from College of Arts and Law, which permitted me to conduct the archival research necessary to this project.

To my primary supervisor Tom Lockwood, and to my co-supervisor Sebastian Mitchell, I owe a particular debt of gratitude for their instruction, guidance and support, and discussion which have afforded me the opportunity for learning, development, and growth.

Lastly, I thank the archivist Jeff Katterkorn and library staff at the British Library; Oliver House, the Superintendent of Special Collections at the Bodleian's Weston Library and his staff; the archivist Chris Penny at the Hurd Library; Anne Padgett at the Wordsworth Library at Grasmere; the archivist Anne Perry and her staff at the Cadbury Research Library; the staff at the National Art Library at the Victoria and Albert Museum; and the staff at the Newberry Library for their assistance with archival research, without which I could not have completed this project.

## Table of Contents

Chapter 1	Introduction	5
Chapter 2	Andrew Marvell and Renaissance Pastoral: The Occasion, Context, and Reception	26
	A Renaissance Tradition of Wit: Marvell’s Satiric Renderings of Pastoral	39
	A Pastoral Frame to a Literary Response: Marvell’s <i>An Horatian Ode</i>	53
	Reading Marvell in Context: The Haward Manuscript and Clandestine Satire	63
Chapter 3	The Uses of Pastoral: The Juvenile Writings of Alexander Pope	82
	Poetic Engagements and Poetic Traditions in Pope’s <i>Pastorals</i>	88
	A Satiric Account in Pope’s <i>Essay on Pastorals</i>	102
	Satirizing the Pastoral Poet in Pope’s <i>The Guardian</i> Essays	110
	Re-writing History in Pope’s <i>Messiah</i> and <i>Windsor Forest</i>	117
Chapter 4	His Hand in Writing: The Pastoral Manuscripts of James Thomson	134
	Pastoral Beginnings: The Early Manuscripts of James Thomson	139
	Thomson and Classical Learning: Examining the Sublime	151
	The Afterlife of Thomson: the ‘Romantic Thomson’ and the ‘Canonical Thomson’	172
Chapter 5	The Place of Pastoral in the Creative and Critical Writing of Thomas and Joseph Warton	186
	A Pastoral Beginning and a Pastoral Return within the Wartons’ Careers	190
	Understanding Imitation and Allusion within a Recursive Pastoral Tradition	205
	Patterns of Imitation and Transmission in Literary History	225
Chapter 6	Romantic Readings of the Renaissance and Romantic Legacies	240
	Coleridge’s Early Pastoral Readings: Marvell and Wordsworth	246
	Romantic Responses to Marvell: Coleridge’s ‘Dejection’ and Wordsworth’s ‘Intimations’	254
	Writing and Reflecting in the Pastoral Mode	263
	Coleridge’s <i>Biographia Literaria</i> and Notions of Literary History	273
Chapter 7	Conclusion	296
	Bibliography	304

## Chapter 1 Introduction

Histories of pastoral, from the Neoclassical to those more recent, have been based upon the notion of pastoral as the depiction of shepherds and the uses to which that depiction is put. Neoclassical accounts drew upon Aristotle's concept of genre that distinguished between three literary forms: epic, drama, and the dithyramb—or hymns sung to Dionysus—according to whether the poet, the characters, or both narrated the action depicted.<sup>1</sup> This classical concept served as the basis for Neoclassical accounts of pastoral. From this version of pastoral, theorists developed a concept of genre as a literary mode in which the method of representing action conveyed the character of those speaking through the manner with which they expressed their perceptions of that action. The Neoclassicists in Early Modern England derived a notion of the genre of pastoral from the writings of the seventeenth-century French philosophers and pastoral poets Rapin and Fontenelle which placed emphasis on the impression readers formed of the innocence and candor of the shepherd, because of his manner of describing his life and that which he experienced.<sup>2</sup> Evidence of the influence of Rapin's and Fontenelle's essays on the work of his contemporaries and their later readers remains in extant copies of the translations of them and other writings which responded to them. John Evelyn translated Rapin's verse *Of Pastorals* (1672) into English following its publication in Latin in 1659 with Rapin's *Discourse de Carmine Pastoralis* as preface.<sup>3</sup> Thomas Creech translated Rapin's prefatory essay and prefixed it to his

---

<sup>1</sup> Gerard Genette, *The Architext: An Introduction* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1992), p. 9

<sup>2</sup> Rapin Rene, 'Discourse of Pastorals' in *The idylliums of Theocritus with Rapin's discourse of pastorals, done into English by Mr. Creech* (Oxford: Printed by L. Lichfield for Anthony Stephens, 1684), pp. 1-68; Bernard de Bouvier Fontenelle, *Of Pastorals, published with Bossu's Treatise of the Epick Poem, trans by Pierre Motteux* (London: Printed for Tho Bennet at the Half-Moon St Paul's Church-yard, 1695), pp. 277-95

<sup>3</sup> Cambridge, Mass. Harvard Houghton Library EC65 Ev226 Y672ra (A), Rene Rapin, *Of Gardens, Four Books Written in Latine Verse by Renatus Rapinus and now made English by J. E.* (London: Printed by Thomas Ratcliffe & Nathaniel Thompson for Thomas Collins and John Ford at the Middle Temple Gate and Benjamin Tookes at the Ship in St. Pauls Church-yard, 1672)

translation of Theocritus' *Idylliums*.<sup>4</sup> Knightley Chetwood's preface to John Dryden's translation of Virgil's eclogues offered a defense of Virgil against Fontenelle within that concept of pastoral Rapin's essay propounded.<sup>5</sup> Among the extant books from Alexander Pope's library held at the British and Hurd libraries are his annotated copies of Dryden's translation and Creech's translation of Rapin's *Discourse on Pastorals* which precedes his translation of Theocritus' *Idylliums*.<sup>6</sup> The copy of Creech's translation of Rapin's 'Discourse' and Theocritus' *Idylliums* which Percy B. Dobell obtained while amassing a bibliography of Dryden's works that is held at Folger Shakespeare Library attests to the continued interest in Rapin's essay.<sup>7</sup>

Evidence of the influence of Rapin's discourse upon ideas about pastoral may also be seen in the writings of several eighteenth-century theorists, who defined pastoral according to the aesthetic character of simplicity because of the nature of the delight, which the methods used to represent the shepherd elicited, as compared with the sublime character of epic conveyed through its depiction of heroes engaged in battle. This may be found in *The Guardian* 'Essays' thought to be composed by Sir Richard Steele, Ambrose Philips, John Dennis, John Gay, and Alexander Pope, as well as Pope's *Essay on Pastorals* in manuscript that he revised, and later published as preface to his pastorals under the title *Discourse on Pastorals* in his 'Works' (1717).<sup>8</sup> More

---

<sup>4</sup> Rapin Rene, 'Discourse of Pastorals' in *The idylliums of Theocritus with Rapin's discourse of pastorals, done into English by Mr. Creech* (Oxford: Printed by L. Lichfield for Anthony Stephens, 1684), pp. 1-68

<sup>5</sup> Knightley Chetwood, "'Preface to Pastorals'", with a Defense of Virgil Against Some of the Reflexions of Monsieur Fontenelle' in *The works of Virgil containing his Pastorals, Georgics and Aeneis : adorn'd with a hundred sculptures, translated into English verse by Mr. Dryden* (London : Printed for Jacob Tonson, 1697)

<sup>6</sup> Worcester, Hurd Library, no shelfmark, *The idylliums of Theocritus with Rapin's discourse of pastorals, done into English by Mr. Creech* (Oxford : Printed by L. Lichfield for Anthony Stephens, 1684); London, British Library C 28 f 6, Virgil, *The works of Virgil: containing his pastorals, Georgics and Aeneis. Translated into English verse; by Mr. Dryden. In three volumes. Adorn'd with above a hundred sculptures* (London: printed by Jacob Tonson at Grays-Inn Gate, 1709)

<sup>7</sup> Washington, District of Columbia, Folger Shakespeare Library, T855, *The idylliums of Theocritus with Rapin's discourse of pastorals, done into English by Mr. Creech* (Oxford : Printed by L. Lichfield for Anthony Stephens, 1684)

<sup>8</sup> Alexander Pope, *The Works of Alexander Pope, Esq Vol I, With Explanatory Notes and Additions Never Before Printed* (London: Printed for B. Lintot, 1736)

recent studies of pastoral such as that of Paul Alpers and Annabel Patterson also draw upon the discourses of Rapin and Fontenelle.<sup>9</sup>

Alpers argues that while pastoral is both ‘a means of depiction and the means by which what is depicted is representative’, ‘its common features belong to a central fiction that shepherds’ lives are representative of human lives’.<sup>10</sup> Alpers writes that the features of pastoral such as an idyllic landscape, an atmosphere of otium, and shepherds, rustics, or others socially inferior people, particularly as lovers, which the Neoclassicists noted because they enabled depictions that recall a ‘Golden Age’ of ‘Innocence’, ‘can be emphasized or developed in varying ways as that central fiction itself is developed or transformed’.<sup>11</sup> Alper’s turn to Rapin’s essay about pastoral offers evidence of how representation may be used as a mode of knowledge for critical discourse. He explains that Rapin’s description of the Ancient shepherd engaged in song while at leisure serves as ‘representational anecdote’ of the Golden Age of Innocence to ‘signify a reality separate from ... but which permits a clear and compendious understanding’ of that Golden Age as an ‘informing idea’ of the kind that ‘produces phenomena and details that make poems poems’.<sup>12</sup>

This illustrates how the ideas later readers of Virgil’s *Eclogues* such as Rapin recorded in their writings, as Patterson writes, are ‘key to their cultural assumptions, because the text was so structured to provoke, consciously or unconsciously an ideological response’.<sup>13</sup> Patterson shows though that although a concept of pastoral develops that it is not or should not be ideological, ‘at the same time ... [that idea] has been contested by thinkers and artists of stature, and that it is no

---

<sup>9</sup> Annabel Patterson, *Pastoral and Ideology: Virgil to Valery* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1987); Paul Alpers, *What is Pastoral?* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1996)

<sup>10</sup> Paul Alpers, p. 22

<sup>11</sup> Paul Alpers, p. 22

<sup>12</sup> Paul Alpers, pp. 16-18

<sup>13</sup> Annabel Patterson, p. 7



less political in intention and effect than opinions that have sought to exile it' (8).<sup>14</sup> The method Rapin and Fontenelle and Alpers describe of selecting and simplifying human experience that makes pastoral 'representative' and enables its 'symbolic function' invites the 'easy acquiescence' in a 'spurious simplicity' Chaudhuri notes, which is key to the central fiction Alpers describes.<sup>15</sup> That feigned simplicity permitted poets to use pastoral to represent the kind of 'country world' that Chaudhuri suggests to be 'a creation of the urban imagination and must necessarily embody its values'.<sup>16</sup>

Diane McColley demonstrates how Andrew Marvell and John Milton achieved this, by putting pastoral to use to engage with the emerging empirical science in the Renaissance, the growing awareness of issues now referred to as 'ecological', and the justification for its pursuit in 'hope of relieving human suffering and prolonging life'.<sup>17</sup> The two poets' method she describes of retaining 'the emblematic, allegorical, and topological connotations' of pastoral metaphors while 'subordinat[ing] figurative meanings' to express 'specific and affinitive perceptions' allowed them to 'detach types from particulars'; through this, they developed a 'philosophical language' to 'translate' 'the nature of visible things' and 'God' into an unchanging and unambiguous language through which knowledge could be attained'.<sup>18</sup> Ken Hiltner demonstrates how the use to which Marvell and Milton put such a language to make nature a landscape against which to set human action in this manner may be considered pastoral.<sup>19</sup> He discusses how both poets drew example from Virgil's first eclogue in which the

---

<sup>14</sup> Annabel Patterson, p. 8

<sup>15</sup> Sukanti Chaudhuri, *Renaissance Pastoral and Its English Developments* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1898), p. 441

<sup>16</sup> Sukanti Chaudhuri, pp. 1 and 441

<sup>17</sup> Diane Kelsey McColley, *Poetry and Ecology in the Age of Milton and Marvell* (Farnham: Ashgate Publishing, 2007), pp. 1-3

<sup>18</sup> Diane Kelsey McColley, p.94

<sup>19</sup> Ken Hiltner, *What Else is Pastoral? Renaissance Literature and the Environment* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2011), p. 5

contrast between the city in Meliboeus' view and the countryside which emerges to the shepherd because of that city's encroachment upon it impacts how the countryside looks to individuals aesthetically engaged with what appears.<sup>20</sup>

The work of each of these scholars anticipates the concept of pastoral from which my thesis proceeds. Pastoral, I will argue, is a mode in which the images and underlying ideals of Ancient examples of this kind of writing provided a system of meanings that allowed later poets to examine the succession of poetic responses to it, and so, formed the habits of mind with which they perceived their corrupted societies. These habits allowed them to then engage in a critical commentary in which they measured the values held in each successive historical period through their responses to the ideal of moral innocence of which pastoral simplicity is representative. My thesis begins with the pastorals of Andrew Marvell. Alpers argues that Marvell is the representative figure of seventeenth century pastoral which he describes as 'the age of the pastoral speaker and pastoral lyrics'.<sup>21</sup> Alpers suggests that Marvell's lyrics enact the kind of modal transformation of which Fowler writes through the 'loose play' of generic repertoire or type-specific traits'.<sup>22</sup> Those traits permit Marvell's first-person speakers to perform or call up the various roles and characters of ordinary pastoral in a manner through which Marvell both fixes and distances those speakers from the Arcadian shepherd of ordinary pastoral. That allows Marvell to locate his speaker in a historical moment and at the same time, deflect 'his song from a full representation of the new world of which he speaks'.<sup>23</sup> Drawing upon this idea, I will show how distancing permits Marvell to make his speakers representative of the values of their culture

---

<sup>20</sup> Ken Hiltner, p. 7

<sup>21</sup> Paul Alpers, p. 238

<sup>22</sup> Paul Alpers, p. 66; Alastair Fowler, *Kinds of Literature* (Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press, 1982), p. 700

<sup>23</sup> Paul Alpers, p. 239

while treating them with irony, lending his pastorals a satirical character that enables him to make a critical assessment of both.

My thesis turns to reexamine the Neoclassical accounts of the history of pastoral which influenced contemporaneous and the more recent ideas about pastoral noted above that did not include Andrew Marvell's verse, because it drew upon assumptions about that simplicity to satirize the men and culture of his historical period. In Marvell's pastorals, the innocent Neoclassical shepherd is portrayed as insensible to the insights about his own sinful nature that he might otherwise derive from his perceptions of and affective response to his experience. Such depictions were not in keeping Neoclassical pastoral theory which prescribed that a shepherd's description of his actions and the ideas he formed demonstrate his simple nature that should correspond to his moral virtue. This thesis begins with the pastorals of Marvell's to attend to its omission from such accounts which we have inherited as that of such Moderns as Dennis' *Advancement of Poetry*.<sup>24</sup> It examines the pattern of a succession of interpretative responses to that of both Ancient and Modern from Marvell to Wordsworth to explore the noted concept of pastoral which may be derived from an account that includes Marvell's, and from it, an understanding of genre and literary history.

Recent accounts of literary history have drawn upon the noted Neoclassical notion of genre to explain the individual lines of development within literature. Such histories discussed the development of the techniques that have been considered to lend each genre its distinctive character. Those accounts have been predicated upon the understanding that the methods of writing were what made the intangible quality of aesthetic character perceptible. Contemporary

---

<sup>24</sup> John Dennis, *The Advancement and Reformation of Modern Poetry. A Critical Discourse, in Two Parts ... By Mr. Dennis* (London: Printed for Richard Parker, at the Unicorn under the Piazza of the Royal Exchange in Cornhill, 1701)

genre theory has enumerated the ways in which those methods could be deduced from the aesthetic impression readers formed of a text's literary elements.<sup>25</sup> That has served as the basis for more recent taxonomies of genre that represent the concept of genre in terms of those literary traits or elements that they use to distinguish one genre from another and the relation between them. Such taxonomies enable a study of how pastoral verse such as Marvell's withstands the pressures other genres place upon it, because of how its poets have employed the traits of those genres to adapt the methods used in their renderings. Alastair Fowler has demonstrated that definitions of genre according to those taxonomies are pliable. His notion of pastoral as a mode through which elements can be combined to effect a transformation of georgic offers a partial explanation for what may be observed in the Early Modern period.<sup>26</sup> Drawing upon this idea, I will demonstrate that by detaching types and elements drawn from other genres and combining them with those of pastoral, Marvell and the other Early Modern poets discussed in thesis were able to develop a language that drew upon the varying systems of meanings of which they were emblems and enabled a mode of writing through which they derived insight about their historical period and its relation to its history.

That idea provides the basis for the alternative account of the literary history of pastoral to that of the Neoclassicists this thesis offers. Milton's depiction of Adam's Fall into a state of sin in *Paradise Lost*, as Chaudhuri writes, gives reason to distinguish between an 'Arcadian pastoral of poetic fancy' and 'the religious allegory of the intellectual and moral rigour of the orthodox pastoral of Milton's earlier poems'. Chaudhuri's description of Milton's orthodox

---

<sup>25</sup> See Northrope Frye, *Anatomy of Criticism* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1957), Rosalie Colie, *The Resources of Kind: Genre-Theory in the Renaissance*, ed. by Barbara K. Lewalski (Berkeley & Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1973), Gerard Genette, *The Architext*, and Alastair Fowler, *Kinds of Literature* (Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press, 1982)

<sup>26</sup> Alastair Fowler, *Kinds of Literature*, p. 70

pastoral as that which ‘brings conventional devices and ingredients into new combinations’ draws attention to its aesthetic character noted in Neoclassical theory – ‘a fastidious seeking after ease’ – which he suggests to be ‘an escape from the intellectually taxing world of reality’ that explains the delight which Neoclassicists credited such examples as Milton’s depiction of Eden with eliciting.<sup>27</sup> By contrast, Marvell, Chaudhuri notes, ‘breaks [with] the conventional forms of pastoral, [and] weaves new concerns and energies into components levered from their standard settings by his poetic play’ (426).<sup>28</sup> Marvell’s ‘paradoxical pastoral’ which results offers an ‘intellectual dreamland’ which still ‘resembles the imaginative release of orthodox pastoral’ in its ‘tangible pursuit of whims and conjectures’.<sup>29</sup> In doing so, though, it achieves a kind of modal transformation of the genre of pastoral.

Patterson offers a poem of Robert Burns which illustrates how a poet might achieve this to allegorize the double meaning of the gentleman’s pastoral through its depiction of a pre-election garden party in which ‘the magic circle of idyllic manners and aesthetic pleasure ... exclude political experience while implicitly supporting a conservative ideology’.<sup>30</sup> This image reminds of the stance adopted by such Whigs as John Dennis, Ambrose Philips, and Joseph Addison, though it might as easily be compared to the Cavaliers’ libertine verse which Marvell parodies. Neoclassical pastoral, as Patterson notes, as conceived in both historical and in recent studies represents both a temporal boundary which excludes such Renaissance writers as Marvell, and a theory ‘of containment, of rationality, of a benevolent or idealizing view of the social order’ whose perceived ‘cultural dominance defined a historical period’; this is though Neoclassicists in the period continued to ‘denote their ideological stance in relation to their

---

<sup>27</sup> Sukanta Chaudhuri, p. 441

<sup>28</sup> Sukanta Chaudhuri, p. 426

<sup>29</sup> Sukanta Chaudhuri, p. 449

<sup>30</sup> Annabel Patterson, p. 194

sociopolitical environment’, positioning themselves ‘through irony, anxiety, or anger against the status quo’.<sup>31</sup> That gives evidence of how an alternate account may illustrate the development of the uses to which such elements and methods are put in pastoral in a manner that reflects changing attitudes towards the aesthetic value of simplicity, according to the social values held at the time; this proves true though the literary value, or principle according to which such pastoral depictions are given merit, and which thus serve as the basis for a history of the genre, remains constant.

The account of literary history that we have inherited from such authors as Dennis which have praised Milton’s verse as an example of the simplicity noted in the Neoclassical theory of Rapin and Fontenelle has led to the more recent accounts of pastoral as Chaudhuri’s and Judith Haber’s in which they judge Marvell’s satiric renderings of pastoral to be ‘paradoxical’ or a form of ‘anti-pastoral’ as compared with Milton’s ‘orthodox pastoral’.<sup>32</sup> Haber applies the term ‘anti-pastoral’ to such verse as Marvell’s which failed to meet the criteria of critics of Renaissance poetry that viewed pastoral as ‘a static, idealizing genre, whose goal was the recovery of an Edenic past’ they ‘pursued by creating images of idyllicism within their works, and by imitating their predecessors as closely as possible’.<sup>33</sup> Patterson uses the term ‘fete champetre’ to denote this version of pastoral denominated Neoclassical that was promoted by the French theorists Rapin and Fontenelle and favored by Dennis.<sup>34</sup> Neoclassical critics had maintained that modern pastoral continued to possess the aesthetic character of simplicity of ancient pastoral that evoked delight, even though its shepherds used modern colloquial speech

---

<sup>31</sup> Annabel Patterson, p 194

<sup>32</sup> Sukanta Chaudhuri, p. 449; Judith Haber, *Pastoral and the Poetics of Self-Contradiction: Theocritus to Marvell* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994)

<sup>33</sup> Judith Haber, p. 1

<sup>34</sup> Annabel Patterson, p 193

and manners. They had argued that this mixture of the ancient and modern demonstrated that the virtue of that ‘Golden Age’ of Antiquity still persisted in England.<sup>35</sup> John Milton’s use of pastoral convention to describe the Garden of Eden setting for innocence in which Adam only values Eden as a repository of symbol and memory after his transgression against God anticipated the pastoral commonplaces that suggest the underlying reason for this: it betrayed the nostalgic alienation and hope of georgic reparation that results because of participation in the fallen world.<sup>36</sup>

Marvell’s poetry, by contrast, displayed the sophisticated wit and irony characteristic of Renaissance literature and that of such eighteenth-century poets as Alexander Pope and James Thomson which turned to it for example. Marvell’s verse reveals the flawed perceptions of its speakers, a consequence of their fallen nature, to suggest that the innocence lost to the modern world could not be retrieved. Marvell’s pastorals offer modern speakers whose manners resembled the courtly swains of Virgil. By doing so, Marvell’s verse flouts Rapin and Fontenelle’s precept that pastoral should maintain a decorum appropriate to the humble character of the shepherd.<sup>37</sup> Marvell’s verse is the kind of Renaissance pastoral that made simple people use sophisticated language to express strong feelings that were fundamentally ‘true’ about all people in the manner William Empson describes.<sup>38</sup> This may also be seen in the pastorals of Pope and Thomson. The style of speech of Marvell’s characters, and that of Pope’s and Thomson’s, is appropriate to the subjects about which they speak. However, Neoclassical theorists had viewed such philosophical statements as ill-fitting for the station of a rustic. Those

---

<sup>35</sup> Dustin Griffin, *Regaining Paradise: Milton and the Eighteenth Century* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1986) p. 64

<sup>36</sup> Deborah Solomon, ‘Walking the Commonplaces of Pastoral Precursors in Milton’s Garden of Eden’, *Seventeenth Century* (2020), 773-98 (pp. 790-91)

<sup>37</sup> Rene Rapin, p. 67; Bernard de Bovier Fontenelle, p. 294

<sup>38</sup> William Empson, *Some Versions of Pastoral* (Harmondsworth: Penguin Books Ltd, 1935), p. 17

Neoclassicists faulted the kind of pastoral of which Marvell's is an example, because its speakers' expressions lent themselves to the kind of allegory that assumed the men depicted to be of a corrupt nature to which eighteenth-century poets Alexander Pope, James Thomson, and the Warton brothers turned to satirize and to which Wordsworth's and Coleridge's early poetry also responds.

This history of pastoral poetry begins, then, with the lyrics of Andrew Marvell to show how pastoral as a mode of interpretative reading through which several Early Modern and Romantic poets engaged in the study of classical rhetoric shaped their habits of writing, and so, the habits of mind with which they examined England's history through its literature. This project draws upon later accounts of the history of pastoral such as that of William Empson, Frank Kermode, and Annabel Patterson that have examined Marvell's satiric renderings of the pastoral shepherd within notions about how such allegories were put to use to offer a critical commentary on the conditions and characters of the societies in which they were composed.<sup>39</sup> It examines the idea Michelle Callaghan propounds in her study of Edmund Spenser's influence upon Jacobean writers, that later poets found a 'pattern' in the pastorals of an earlier poet within which to 'define their identities' in opposition to their 'corrupted society'.<sup>40</sup> It also follows the study of Nigel Leask that measures Robert Burns' 'naïve pastoral' written in the Scottish vernacular, within ideas about the 'classical' denoted in its 'Neoclassical values of linguistic improvement and poetic decorum' and the 'Romantic' and ideas about 'natural genius' and 'primitivism'.<sup>41</sup>

---

<sup>39</sup> William Empson, *Some Versions of Pastoral*; Frank Kermode, *English Pastoral Poetry: from the Beginnings to Marvell* (London: George G. Harrap & Co., 1952); Annabel Patterson, *Pastoral and Ideology: Virgil to Valery* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1987)

<sup>40</sup> Michelle Callaghan, *The 'Shepherd's Nation': Jacobean Spenserians and Early Stuart Political Culture 1612-1625* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000), p. 1

<sup>41</sup> Nigel Leask, *Robert Burns and Pastoral: Poetry and Improvement in late Eighteenth-Century Scotland* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2015), pp. 3-4



For eighteenth-century authors, pastoral represented a form whose elements of Modern country life and the manners of Modern rustics could be used to translate the aesthetic values of innocence and simplicity of classical pastoral into terms that allowed those poets to measure contemporaneous social values against Ancient pastoral's underlying ideals. Example of this is given in Wordsworth's reply to the distaste John Wilson expressed in his letter of 25 May 1802 for such depiction of men of rustic simplicity as Wordsworth's 'The Idiot Boy' in the second edition of *Lyrical Ballads* (1802).<sup>42</sup> In his letter, Wordsworth offers insight into why depictions of aesthetic simplicity should delight: poetry should 'please human nature, as it has been [and ever] will be' among 'men who have never known false refinements, wayward and artificial desires, false criticism, effeminate habits of thinking and feeling, or who, having known these things, have outgrown them'.<sup>43</sup> To Wilson, Wordsworth wrote that poetry should not only represent faithfully the feelings of human nature, but 'rectify men's feelings, to give them new compositions of feeling, to render their feelings more sane, pure, and permanent, in short more consonant to nature, that is to eternal nature, and the great moving spirit of things'.<sup>44</sup> Because pastoral allowed Wordsworth and other poets to form the moral character of men in this manner, Wordsworth suggested, it offered the means to rebuild England by forming its national character.

This thesis, then, discusses a succession of satiric renderings of pastoral that take Milton's *Paradise Lost* (1667) as a point of departure.<sup>45</sup> Chaudhuri notes that although Milton's *Paradise Lost* contains very little that is pastoral, its account of Eden offers illustration of a 'use of pastoral details and assumptions that reinstate the basic pastoral impulse as unfallen and

---

<sup>42</sup> Ernest de Selincourt, ed., *The Early Letters of William and Dorothy Wordsworth (1787-1805)* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1935), p. 292-95

<sup>43</sup> Ernest de Selincourt, ed., p. 292-95

<sup>44</sup> Ernest de Selincourt, ed, p. 295

<sup>45</sup> John Milton, *Paradise Lost a Poem written in Twelve Books By John Milton. Licensed and Entered according to Order* (London: Printed, and to be sold by Peter Parker under Creed Churchneer Aldgate's and by Robert Boulter at the Turks Head in Bishpgate-Street and Martin Walker, under St. Durstan Church in Fleet Street, 1667)

paradisaal'.<sup>46</sup> Neoclassicists lauded Milton's use of prosody and diction and the sublime character it lends to his epic as his manner of description in his adaptation of the Fall of Man in the Garden of Eden was thought to illustrate Longinus' idea of the sublime as the image of the mind of the poet which offered evidence of his virtue. That which Chaudhuri notes to be a 'dismissive use of explicit references to pastoral and sylvan myth in Milton's habitual contrast with Christian myth about Eden' however also 'enables the kind of depiction of the nature of paradisaal innocence that incorporates a sensuality or libertinism within its pristine simplicity and spotless innocence' (427).<sup>47</sup> Through parody, Marvell reverses the 'relation between man and nature' as seen in Milton's 'orthodox pastoral' and his description of Eden in *Paradise Lost* and so, enables a 'paradoxical pastoral' depicting an 'archetypal conflict' between 'nature' as the 'moral order' and 'human impulse' as an 'unregulated, subversive state of sin'.<sup>48</sup> Marvell and the other poets that will be discussed in this thesis adopted the use of the colloquial dialect and other mannerisms of a simple shepherd to depict each poet-speaker's attempt to attain philosophical insight about his experiences in such a fallen world despite his sinful nature, which lent that speaker an artificial simplicity noted in Virgil's courtly swains. That manner those poets gave to their speakers permitted them to satirize the prophetic bard to whom later critics and writers turned to fashion their image of the Romantic poet.

My account draws its concept of pastoral from the premise underlying William Empson's history of the genre within which he situates 'Marvell's Garden'; for Empson, pastoral is a process of putting 'the complex into the simple and the resulting social ideas'.<sup>49</sup> This can be seen in Marvell's poems which adopt the form of the lyric to offer satiric renderings of pastoral.

---

<sup>46</sup> Sukanta Chaudhuri, p. 427

<sup>47</sup> Sukanta Chaudhuri, p. 427

<sup>48</sup> Sukanta Chaudhuri, p. 432

<sup>49</sup> William Empson, *Some Versions of Pastoral*, p. 25

His poems dramatize the simple character of the subjectivities of their speakers through their methods of narrating thought: the manner with which each speaker explains his simple reasoning about the complex perceptions of the objects and persons of the fallen garden of humanity's making in terms that intertwine his thoughts with his feelings lent an irony to it that makes the effects of such a corrupt world upon men palpable. This method of depiction allows Marvell and the later poets Pope, Thomson, and Thomas and Joseph Warton to show how the speaker's perceptions prompted responses that reveal his true sinful character. Through this method, Marvell and Pope made the emblems of the aesthetic values of Neoclassical pastoral into the means through which they examined the social values underlying the political and religious conflict that enveloped each of them; that method also allowed Thomson and the Wartons to draw upon that historical context to examine the effects of their cultures upon the nature of men. That gave such verse what Frank Kermode refers to as a 'transgressive character' because of its manner of 'treating taboos'—the sexual, religious, and political practices—through its characters' encounters with that which represents 'an imposed institution or social order'.<sup>50</sup>

This project examines, then, how this mode of pastoral reading allowed the poets to be discussed to exploit the many ways in which the familiar elements of pastoral may be used to satirize the corrupting influence of the society each of them inhabited. The familiar figure of the shepherd is treated lightly in the setting of the garden to illustrate the consequences of the loss of innocence and Edenic bliss. Marvell remade fallen Adam into speakers that remind of the courtly swain, who speaks with the wit Neoclassical pastoral theorists faulted, to insinuate the manner through which their sinful nature leads them to misapprehend themselves and their circumstances. In a similar manner, the verse of the other poets discussed in this thesis turned to

---

<sup>50</sup> Frank Kermode, *History and Value: The Clarendon Lectures and the Northcliffe Lectures* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1987), pp. 18-20, 30

the literary past to examine the recurring ideas about the nature of men betrayed in the fallen world of their making. The pastoral mode of reading which allowed each poet to have done this also enabled him to reflect upon his circumstances within notions about the consequences of the loss of that pastoral ideal of innocence which the image of the garden of Eden represents. Such allegorical figures allowed the poets discussed to expose the folly of the pursuit of pride or sensuous pleasure as observed in their respective cultures and to apprehend what has proved to be true about human nature in each. This, in turn, suggests how pastoral enables the kind of self-reflexive writing through which each poet realized the truth of the subjective meaning his experience held for him. Such meaning took the form of the emotions his experience elicited and the ideas that it evoked and enabled the poet to derive insight about the consequences and implications of his culture and the nature of men. Such writing offers evidence of how the pastoral mode of interpretative reading, in doing so, enabled the poets to be discussed in this thesis to meditate upon and begin to write literary history.

This thesis considers that generative moment when this pastoral mode of reading spurs this self-reflexive kind of writing within the concepts of convention and tradition. Here convention is thought of as a rule or precept that governs our behaviour. Alastair Fowler's discussion of taxonomies of genre in *Kinds of Literature* leads to a notion of genre in which it forms a code or a set of conventions for a system of ways of representing meaning.<sup>51</sup> The precepts from which the code is derived possess underlying values that from a system of meanings and that are accepted interpretations of the symbols used in expression; the persistent use of such a system in writing of that genre demonstrates what Northrop Frye has noted to be the recurring attention that writers have given to the concerns that arise in each of their periods,

---

<sup>51</sup> Alastair Fowler, *Kinds of Literature*, p 191-95

because of what remains common to human experience.<sup>52</sup> This thesis is interested in the ways in which conventions define patterns of reading which give form to patterns of interpretation. The habits of writing to be discerned within the verse that will be considered in this thesis reflect the manner through which committing a thought to paper allows poets to apprehend the way a convention communicates such values. It is within these habits of mind that emerge and of which patterns of interpretation consist that this project will reevaluate our understanding of traditions of pastoral and the literary history of which they are part.

This study examines the manuscripts of several poets and their imitators. It does so to analyse how those habits of writing form habits of mind that shape their notions of convention and its relation to tradition and that of their historical and contemporary readers. Such practices in manuscript offer evidence of the shared set of habits which result from imitating examples of pastoral. These shared habits then gave form to the development of the genre and its place – in a poet’s career and in literary history. This study benefits from work that treats allusion, inheritance, and imitation as fields of enquiry within which to examine the relation between manuscript practices, tradition, and genre. Christopher Ricks discusses the manner through which earlier texts serve as sources for making and allusion for meaning and the question of intentionality in the interpretation of earlier writing through which the later text is realized.<sup>53</sup> The research of William Costello and Christopher Burlinson approaches these concerns through an examination of the underlying principles of the use of commonplace books and the universal mind that emerges from the patterns in them.<sup>54</sup> Colin Burrow explores how ‘imitatio’ takes the

---

<sup>52</sup> Northrop Frye, *The Anatomy of Criticism* (Princeton NJ: Princeton University Press, 1957)

<sup>53</sup> Christopher Ricks, *Allusion to the Poets* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002)

<sup>54</sup> William Costello, *The Curriculum at Seventeenth-Century Cambridge* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1958); Christopher Burlinson, ‘The Use and Reuse of Early Seventeenth-Century Student Notebooks: Inside and Outside the University’ in *Material Readings of Early Modern Culture: Text and Social Practices, 1580 – 1730*, ed by James Daybell and Peter Hinds (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010)

form of the learning practices of recording selected quotations in commonplace books, which allowed the later poet to extract attributes from a body of an author's writing he finds to be common to the texts, and 'construct an imagined view of what is distinctive about that author'.<sup>55</sup> This thesis will demonstrate how those learning practices form the shared habits of writing which become apparent upon examining a poet's interpretative responses reveal the underlying habits of mind whose expression writers and critics have come to conceive of in terms of the conventions of genre.

Chapter 1 examines the pastoral mode of interpretative reading to be found in Marvell's lyrics and how that shaped such habits developed into a kind of pastoral satire that allowed later poets to assess the literary and political culture of their periods within ideas about the simplicity of manner and moral virtue of the shepherds of the pastoral tradition they inherit. This enables a study in later chapters of how the creative engagement they fashion also spurred them to critical writing as well. Each poet turned to a programme of classical humane learning that began with the manner through which Virgil's verse reflects his interpretative reading of Theocritus' *Idylliums*. Virgil's use of courtly swains, who speak as though the poets of epic commenting about greater concerns to parody the pastoral shepherd, reminds of Theocritus' use of the Doric dialect to lend his simple shepherd the clownishness Rapin and Fontenelle censured. Chapter 2 studies how Alexander Pope's efforts to imitate Neoclassical pastoral convention prescribed by Rapin and Fontenelle results in ironic rendering of its precepts of a similar kind. Pope's engagement with the debate between the Ancients and Moderns within the form of a pastoral dialogue in this manner led him to illustrate the faults in each position. It then considers the self-reflexive writing that prompted. His *Essay on Pastoral* studies the origins of pastoral and the

---

<sup>55</sup> Colin Burrow, *Imitating Authors: Plato to Futurity* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2019), pp. 1-3

methods of both Ancient and Modern pastoralists as it meditates upon his own writings within that context.

This thesis then turns to consider later pastoral satire written in this manner to reflect upon how the self-reflexive writing that creative writing spurs led each poet to examine the nature of the act of writing itself. Chapter 3 considers James Thomson's use of a pastoral mode of reading to parody the figure of the epic poet in *The Seasons*, and how this allowed him to question humanity's capacity to arrive at self-knowledge if the fallen nature of its poet prevents him from seeing the meaning of providential history. It then considers the uses to which George Lyttelton and John Mitford put Thomson's verse in their accounts from which ideas about the traditions of classical and Romantic poetry have developed. Chapter 4 turns to Thomas Warton's method of weaving the elements of pastoral and of medieval romance to satirize the modern sensibility and values of his day, and how that spurred him to investigate the origins of both genres. The chapter examines his account of poetry that resulted from such reading and how he situated his own writing within it. The chapter looks at the recurring patterns of thought Warton discovered as he recorded his responses to his readings. It considers how that shapes such narratives as his of the pattern men perceive within the development in English literary history. Chapter 5 examines Coleridge's reading of William Wordsworth's pastoral in relation to the interpretative response it makes to Marvell's satiric renderings of pastoral, and how that formed the patterns of thought with which Coleridge turned to engage with their poetry and write a narrative of the development of his mind under its influence. It reflects upon the critical history of the development of English literature that is offered in that account and what ideas may be formed about pastoral and its literary value from which one may derive a concept of literary history.

The question arises of how one writes a representative literary history. More specifically my project responds to the question of how one writes a representative literary history of the first period that set itself the task of writing a representative literary history. It therefore is indebted to the scholarship of Frank Kermode and David Fairer which, in attempting such a project, discusses ideas about method and embedded literary values.<sup>56</sup> What I offer here is not intended to be a comprehensive critical analysis of the main lines of development and structure of the English tradition of pastoral poetry and the critical tradition that surrounds it from the Renaissance to the present. Such histories are premised upon a notion of tradition in which conventions are that from which one derives descriptive generalizations. Such generalizations are intended to elucidate underlying literary values that are thought to be translated and transmitted from one literary generation to the next. The familiar Neoclassical account of the history of pastoral was founded on a notion of literary value in terms of the noted delight to be derived from the aesthetic character of simplicity, conveyed in the depictions of the simple lives of shepherds. It placed emphasis on the aesthetic values of innocence, happiness, and ease underlying such Ancient and Modern depictions which the Moderns employed to demonstrate the persistence of virtue within England in a manner that affirmed their social values. According to the account of such eighteenth-century Moderns as Dennis, Philips, and Addison, this use of contemporaneous mannerisms and speech illustrated that the ideals of the past could be translated into modern equivalents that gave definition to the expression of their national character.

---

<sup>56</sup> See Frank Kermode, *English Pastoral Poetry: from the Beginnings to Marvell* (London: George G. Harrap & Co, 1952); Frank Kermode, *History and Value*; David Fairer, *English Poetry of the Eighteenth Century 1700-1789* (London: Pearson Education, 2003)



The turn among the Ancients to that same pastoral ideal of the innocence conveyed in the representations of the simplicity of a Golden Age allowed them to demonstrate the inherent fiction that such simplicity was indicative of moral virtue. This they accomplished through their depictions of shepherds which demonstrated how men reasoned about their experiences of the sinful world according to those aesthetic values of innocence, happiness, and ease. This served as a means of measuring the social values according to which their cultures had been fashioned. The allegory it enabled allowed them to examine the consequence of the loss of that innocence among men in their modern times. A similar underlying value may be derived from the Ancients' writings to that from the Moderns, then, in the sense that those aesthetic values attributed to pastoral offered a means of apprehending the effects of the social values that shaped the manner of expressing character illustrated in the feigned simplicity of the courtly swain.

By contrast, the verse of each of these poets to be discussed in this project illustrates how a pastoral mode of interpretative response lends itself to a satiric view of his circumstances. From this position, one may form a concept of pastoral then as a kind of mode of reading enacted through a tradition of writing in which each successive poet draws upon the system of metaphors and emblems such as the garden which were used to communicate meaning in pastoral to meditate upon the character of their societies within ideals about the lost innocence of a Golden Age depicted in it. This tradition demonstrates the subjective nature of the literary values that one may derive from the examples of Marvell's verse, as one attempts to form notions of what characterizes pastoral. Both Marvell's verse and that of the poets who follow share a sense of the subjective meaning they gained from the conventional expressions of earlier pastoral and satiric renderings of it. It demonstrates how they drew meaning from the manner with which such

poetry treats the permanent truths about the aesthetic influence of Nature upon men and its potential to shape their manner of perceiving.

What makes Marvell's use of the methods of satire in his lyrics part of the tradition of pastoral poetry that is to be discussed in this thesis is this mode in which the irony with which he employs the shepherd and other elements of pastoral enables the critical reading and interpretative response to previous texts that it shares with its earlier models in Theocritus, Virgil, and Spenser and later poets who also do so. The concept of tradition which one may form from this verse departs from both historical and contemporary theories of genre that turn to subjective judgments about underlying literary values, reconciling social values to aesthetic values, to explain why the genre of pastoral persists. This notion also results from the ideas one may form about how such mechanisms as those that lend irony to the pastorals to be discussed permit the poet to interpret the cultural values and beliefs about human society treated in older verse. The literary value illustrated within that concept of tradition reflects the recurring understanding with which each poet translates the ideas that arise, because the affective meaning he derives from his engagement with depictions of aesthetic experience enables him to translate them into knowledge of his own nature, as compared with eternal Nature and its truths. That is the literary value upon which I offer this history of some uses of pastoral from Marvell to Wordsworth. The irony with which poets turned to the Ancient ideal of the innocence of a past Golden Age to measure the society they fashioned first began in the Renaissance in seventeenth-century England. That irony which enables the self-knowledge came to characterize the writing emblematic of the Renaissance wit, of which Marvell is one of the most familiar examples, and to which several of the later poets turned to examine. It is thus with Marvell's 'pastorals' that this thesis begins.

## Chapter 2

### Andrew Marvell and Renaissance Pastoral: The Occasion, Context, and Reception

The two treatises that became the most noted texts to which English pastoral poets and theorists turned were Rene Rapin's *Dissertatione de Carmine Pastoralis*, which preceded his *Ecologiae* (1659), and Bernard le Bouvier de Fontenelle's *Discours sur l'Eclogue et une Digression sur les Anciens et les Modernes*, which preceded his *Poesies Pastorales* (1688), as noted.<sup>57</sup> Thomas Creech's translation of Rapin's *Discourse on Pastorals* (1684) was one example of the rendering into English of these texts that delineated for readers the tenets according to which the literary text that followed, Theocritus' *Idylls*, should be judged.<sup>58</sup> Creech's translation of Rapin's *Discourse* would have been the most familiar of these renderings, and so the translation most likely to have influenced readers' reception of Marvell's poems following their posthumous publication in *Miscellaneous Poems* (1681).<sup>59</sup>

Narcissus Luttrell's extensive book collection, parts of which are now held at the Houghton and Newberry Library, testifies to this. The collection included extant copies of John Evelyn's translation of Rapin's *Of Gardens* (1672), to which Rapin's essay about pastoral Creech had translated had served as preface, and Marvell's *Miscellaneous Poems* bound with other satires and poems published from 1679 to 1680 much like a miscellany.<sup>60</sup> Transcribed in the inner cover is this quotation from *The Life of Edmond Malone* by James Prior:

---

<sup>57</sup> Renati Rapini, Societatis Jesu, *Ecologie cum dissertatione de carmine pastoralis*, (Parisiis, Apud Sebastianum Cramoisy, regis ac regionae architpographum via locobea, sub Ciconiis, 1659); Benard de Bouvier Fontenelle, *Poesies pastorales, ace une Traite sur la nature de l'ecologie, et une Digression sur les anciens et les modernes* (Imprime a Paris, et se vend A Lyon: chez Thomas Amaurry, rue merciere, au Mercure Galant, 1688)

<sup>58</sup> *The idylliums of Theocritus with Rapin's discourse of pastorals, done into English by Mr. Creech* (Oxford: Printed by L. Lichfield for Anthony Stephens, 1684)

<sup>59</sup> Andrew Marvell, *Miscellaneous Poems by Andrew Marvell Esq. Late Member of the House of Commons* (London: Printed for Robert Boulter, at the Turks-Head in Cornhill, 1681)

<sup>60</sup> Cambridge, Mass. Harvard Houghton Library MS EC65 Ev226 Y672ra (A),

Five volumes of lampoons, ballads, and occasional poems, chiefly expressions of the day, and published between the Restoration and the end of the century, were secured by Mr. Bindley.<sup>61</sup>

The inclusion of Marvell's *Miscellaneous Poems* (1681) among a volume which also contained satires, epitaphs, and humorous ballads offers evidence that early readers such as Luttrell and James Bindley, to whom the note refers, recognized Marvell's satiric treatment of its pastoral figures and themes.

It also suggests that reading Evelyn's translation of Rapin's *Of Gardens* influenced Luttrell's reception of Marvell's verse. Evelyn himself had also written *A Character of England* (1672), a satire about how the customs of the country would appear to a foreigner.<sup>62</sup> The text gives evidence of how Evelyn had received Rapin's statements about the delight elicited by the simplicity of shepherds or rustics in Ancient and Modern pastoral because it evoked an impression of their innocence. Luttrell's manuscript included text similar in character and theme to Evelyn's—Rochester's *A Satyr against Mankind* (1675); *Mantuan English'd and Paraphras'd, or the Character of a Bad Woman* (1679); and *Female Excellence: or woman Display'd, in Several Satyirical Poems*, both of which make allusion to the Garden of Eden and use pastoral conventions in their depictions—as well as several that gave the historical context to which those texts responded—*An Epitaph to Thomas, Lord Fairfax; Cromwell's Ghost*; and several satires about popery and the popish plot of 1678.

The treatises of Neoclassicists Rapin and Fontenelle offered Marvell's readers a notion of pastoral literature that was based upon the premise that readers derived delight from its

---

<sup>61</sup> Chicago, Newberry Library Case Y 185.M376

<sup>62</sup> John Evelyn, *A Character of England* (London: Printed for John Cook and are to be sold at the Ship in St. Paul's Churchyard, 1659)

representation of a shepherd's life because it communicated tranquility, innocence, ease and happiness that reminded them of the 'Golden age'.<sup>63</sup> This concept was derived from Rapin and Fontenelle's impressions of Theocritus and Virgil's depictions of that 'Age of Innocence' of Antiquity. Renaissance poets turned to such writings to 'recover the abstract principles ... that would give their own achievements enduring value', but how they applied those principles in their renderings of pastoral betrayed their consciousness that their period was 'irrevocably distinct from the past'.<sup>64</sup> The manner in which their shepherds described their perceptions of their experience of romantic desire conveyed the longing for a return to the idyllic innocence with which they were afflicted because of the sinful character of the culture in which they lived. The notion of a 'Golden Age' of Antiquity, however, to which later authors looked for a cultural ideal denoted in alternate values was one that pervaded such Renaissance writing as Marvell's.<sup>65</sup> The elements of pastoral which Marvell interwove into his creative verse, I will argue, made palpable the effects of the loss of that cultural ideal in a manner that enabled critical reflection about its consequences.

Such statements as Rapin's in his *Dissertione de Carmine Pastorali* placed pastoral's aesthetic values and their underlying ideals within a context according to whose terms Marvell and his contemporaries divided themselves. This shaped their notions about the relevance of those ideals to them. Such scholars as Nigel Smith have proposed that Marvell's lyrics were composed in the 1640s and during his stay at the home of his patron Lord Thomas Fairfax, Nun Appleton, from 1650-1652, before the publication of Rapin's essay in 1659. Of Marvell's pastoral dialogues which depict a shepherd and a shepherdess discussing idyllic love or paradise,

---

<sup>63</sup> Rene Rapin, 'Discourse of Pastorals', p. 5

<sup>64</sup> Ingrid D. Rowland, *The Culture of the High Renaissance: Ancients and Moderns in Sixteenth-Century Rome*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998) p. 1

<sup>65</sup> Rosalie Colie, p. 3

*Clorinda and Damon, Amestylis and Thrysis Making Hayropes, and A Dialogue between Thrysis and Dorinda*, extant manuscripts date to this period: a verse miscellany with the inscription H. Ramsey c. 1630s and an autograph manuscript of William Lawe's musical setting c. 1638-1645 before Lawes' death. Lawes' setting, however, remained unpublished at the time. Later musical settings of the poem by John Gamble and Matthew Locke were published in 1659 and 1675. Many of the manuscripts that contain transcriptions of Marvell's other pastorals have been dated to the late seventeenth or eighteenth century. These include Marvell's 'Mower' poems and *The Garden*, which Smith contends were composed at the during his period of residence with the Fairfaxes. He offers as evidence the transformation of bucolic and country house conventions similar to that found in *Upon Appleton*.

Yet these pastorals, as well as several others of Marvell – *Young Love* and *To His Coy Mistress* - depict types such as the other rustics and courtly swains for which Rapin had censured Theocritus and Virgil. The coarseness with which they speak, as compared with the Arcadian shepherd that won Rapin's praise, enabled Marvell to employ that which Paul Hammond describes as the 'imagery of sexual impropriety of the anti-court verse satires' which circulated in manuscript and then in print in the later 1660s. The manner with which these poems take Milton's *Paradise Lost*, first published in 1667, as a point of departure and parody Adam's fall into a state of sin as depicted in it, offer evidence of the later date of composition proposed by Hammond of 1668. Marvell's method of praise and dispraise in his poem *On Mr. Milton's Paradise Lost*, published as preface to the second edition of Milton's epic in 1674, suggest the critical view with which Marvell received Rapin's statements and composed the noted lyrics as parodies of Neoclassical pastoral to which Milton's description of Eden has been compared.

Rapin's statement, as Paddy Bullard and Alexis Tadis have recently argued, illustrated then how both the Ancients and the Moderns' use of 'figures of speech' as an 'argumentative mode' in the *querelle* 'reconfigured the field' of poetics in a manner that permitted Marvell and his fellow writers to understand the 'defining aspects of their modernities'.<sup>66</sup> For the Neoclassicists who drew the tenets of their position from Rapin's discussion, the happiness and innocence that evoked delight were intertwined and derived from the simplicity of a shepherd's existence made their loss palpable, and so shaped their understanding of the fallen world that had 'succeeded the infancy of human history'.<sup>67</sup> Those who aligned themselves with the Modern position, by contrast, believed that because a shepherd's actions could be translated into the terms of Modern life, the ideal represented virtue which readers could still be observed among the English people.<sup>68</sup>

These contentions about the *Anciennete* (an 'inheritance' now 'reinforced by a repugnance' to 'disturbing revolutionary events') characterized Restoration culture, and, as Joseph Levine has influentially argued, allowed it to both 'situate itself within history' and define its 'place in relation to Antiquity'.<sup>69</sup> For later poets who adopted the positions the Ancients and Moderns had taken in the first half of the seventeenth century, pastoral was one literary form through which they remade Restoration culture into a 'metamorphosed present' in

---

<sup>66</sup> Paddy Bullard and Alexis Tadie, 'Introduction' in *Ancients and Moderns in Europe: Comparative Perspectives*, ed by Paddy Bullard and Alexis Tadie (Oxford: Voltaire Foundation, University of Oxford Press, 2016) p. 4-7

<sup>67</sup> Rene Rapin, 'Discourse on Pastorals', p. 3 and 5; See also Alexander Pope's 'Essay on Pastorals' which draws upon the ideas presented in Rapin's 'Discourse' and Annabel Patterson's discussion of Neoclassicism in *Pastoral and Ideology: Virgil to Valery* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1987) p. 193-203

<sup>68</sup> See David Hopkins, 'Dryden and his Contemporaries' in *The Oxford History of Literary Translation in English, Volume 3, 1660-1790* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005) for seventeenth-century debate about literary translation. Also see John Dryden's 'Prefaces' in *Ovid's Epistles, Translated by Several Hands* (London: Printed for Jacob Tonson, 1680); *Sylvae: or, the Second Part of Poetical Miscellanies* (London: Printed for Jacob Tonson, 1685); and *Fables, Ancient and Modern. Translated into verse from Homer, Ovid, Boccace and Chaucer; with original poems* (London: Printed for Jacob Tonson, 1700)

<sup>69</sup> Joseph M. Levine, *Between the Ancients sand the Moderns: Baroque Culture in Restoration England* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1999) p. vii-ix

which their use of ‘language [that] worked against itself’ enabled them to find their ‘identity by reflection’.<sup>70</sup> Pastoral offered Marvell a mode of writing in which its conventions that were used to express those ideals of the ‘Golden Age’ afforded the structure within which he came to grasp the consequences of their loss during the English Civil Wars and Restoration which followed.

The principles regarding the decorum appropriate to shepherds’ speech that Rapin derived from his impressions of Theocritus and Virgil’s pastorals represents the prevailing ideas about the use of aesthetic values to characterize the shepherd that permitted Marvell to engage with those Ancient ideals through his manner of rendering. Thus Marvell’s Mower Damon resembles the rustics of Theocritus for whom Rapin faulted him as at times his shepherds lacked the gentleness, civility, and politeness of Virgil’s, and at other times uttered weighty philosophical statements not fitting a shepherd.<sup>71</sup> For Rapin, simplicity, brevity, and delicacy of expression were the means by which a pastoral author might have impressed upon the reader the image of the innocence and happiness that characterized a shepherd’s life.<sup>72</sup> These ideas were the basis for his precept which maintained that each should have spoken according to that which best befitted him.<sup>73</sup>

Such rules explained the affective power of the two pastoral figures which populated the verse of Marvell and other Renaissance authors. The simplicity and candor with which the first of the two figures, the humble Arcadian shepherd spoke, evokes delight because it allows the reader to imagine a past in which life was without the concern or complexity foreign to Renaissance society. This figure was used in representations of the *otium*, as Paul Alpers has written, and in doing so, stirred the longing for that ideal past which Rosalie Colie has noted to

---

<sup>70</sup> Paul Hammond, *Dryden and the Classical Traces of Rome* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999), pp. 9 and 18

<sup>71</sup> Rene Rapin, p. 67

<sup>72</sup> Rene Rapin, p. 15

<sup>73</sup> Rene Rapin, p. 31



characterize the feeling pastoral elicited.<sup>74</sup> By contrast, the second figure of the courtly swain to be found in the pastorals of Virgil, Tasso, and the other Modern Italians spoke too politely and elegantly and whose dress displayed the neatness of the Town and complement attained at the Royal Court.<sup>75</sup> This courtly swain bears semblance to the cultivated poet of Frank Kermode's description who assumed the manner of a primitive poet when he spoke of more serious concerns.<sup>76</sup>

That figure of the cultivated poet permitted Renaissance poets to engage with contemporaneous circumstances in ways that demanded a sophistication unknown to the primitive poet. The artificiality of a courtier with which such sophisticated poets spoke afforded Marvell the means through which he was able to satirize the corrupting effect of Renaissance culture as may be seen in *The Garden*. Through his writing, Marvell examined his culture's malignant effect upon the emotions and values of men who were believed to possess a sympathy with Nature in their original state of innocence. Wordsworth later explained in his reply in May 1802 to John Wilson's criticism of 'The Idiot Boy', and their different views about the depiction of rustics in pastoral, that England should turn to those men depicted for example of how intercourse with natural landscape of England might form its moral character.<sup>77</sup> For Marvell, though, the task before him was to comment on the characters of the English civil wars and the Restoration that followed. Both the figure of the Arcadian shepherd and the courtly swain offered types which could be parodied to accomplish this.

The differences between these two figures which the Ancients and Moderns drew upon to denote their positions within the *querelle*, I will argue, offered Marvell the means through which

---

<sup>74</sup> Paul Alpers, p. 22; Rosalie Colie, p. 3

<sup>75</sup> Rene Rapin, p. 31

<sup>76</sup> Frank Kermode, *English Pastoral Poetry*, p. 12

<sup>77</sup> Ernest de Selincourt, ed., p. 295

he satirized his society within the contentions about its relation to the Golden Age they represented. It allowed Marvell to examine whether the pastoral ideal of simplicity which the Moderns attempted to illustrate by adapting the conventions used to convey the Arcadian shepherd's character to the colloquial speech and manners of modern rustics was historically specific. Marvell did so by lending a wit to his courtly swain and an irony to his shepherd's plaint in his treatment of romantic love in poems such as *To His Coy Mistress* that enabled him to engage with the Ancients' position that such an ideal was peculiar to the 'Golden Age'. Marvell's depictions drew readers' attention to the stark difference between the sophistication the courtly swain's modern mannerisms represented and that classical ideal of innocence and simplicity of character which eluded him despite his guise of the shepherd. In doing so, these depictions offer evidence that the cultural values of Ancient pastoral poetry were specific to that historical period.

Marvell's poems suggest, then, that to support their claims that the Arcadian shepherd could be presented in modern dress, Neoclassical pastoral theorists detached the values from the historical and cultural context in which they were conceived. Theocritus' use in 'Idyll 16' of the image of the poet singing a song of praise in which Theocritus notes the reknown which the pastoral song brings to the deeds of the shepherd described is made within an appeal for the patronage of the tyrant Hiero II.<sup>78</sup> The pastoral description of the 'countless excellent sheep [that] were tended by shepherds in the plain of Crannon for the hospitable descendants of Creon' is only offered as illustration of the virtue of Antiochus and Aleuas.<sup>79</sup> Theocritus offered it to suggest how those kings would have 'been unremembered for long ages among the wretched

---

<sup>78</sup> Theocritus, 'Introduction' in *Theocritus, Moschus, Bion*, ed. and trans. by Neil Hopkinson (Cambridge, Mass. : Harvard University Press, 2015), p. vii

<sup>79</sup> Theocritus, 'Idyll 16', *Theocritus, Moschus, Bion*, ed. and trans. by Neil Hopkinson (Cambridge, Mass. : Harvard University Press, 2015), p. 233

deed if the inspired bard of Ceos, with his varied songs on a lyre ... had not made them famous'.<sup>80</sup> The Moderns turned in a similar manner to Milton's *Paradise Lost* which attests to God's munificence through its description of Adam and Eve in the Garden of Eden who

under a tuft of shade that on a green  
Stood whispering soft, by a fresh Fountain side  
They sat down, and after no more toil  
Of their sweet Gardening labour than suffic'd  
To recommend cool *Zephyr*, and made easie  
More easie, wholesome thirst and appetite  
More grateful, to their supper Fruits they fell'.<sup>81</sup>

Milton, like the Moderns, used pastoral conventions in this manner to convey Adam and Eve's virtue, without placing their story within the depiction of the conflict between Heaven and Satan within which to have read the recent events of the English Civil Wars that gave occasion for it. That, in turn, permitted Modern pastoralists to translate Ancient pastoral values into terms within which such virtues could be conveyed through shepherds who spoke in a manner familiar to their readers. To do so, however, required that Renaissance writers apply a method of gleaning from Ancient sources that suggested the idealization present in Neoclassical theory predicated upon the detachment of such values from historical reality. Such Renaissance writers as Marvell, by contrast, drew the context within which they understood the Ancient cultural ideal underlying pastoral depiction from this historical reality. That understanding shaped how Marvell and his contemporaries employed the two types of pastoral figures to convey the sense that such an Ancient ideal was irrecoverable to assess their own historical moment.

---

<sup>80</sup> Theocritus, 'Idyll 16', p. 235

<sup>81</sup> John Milton, *Paradise Lost a Poem written in Twelve Books* (1667)

This aspect of Marvell's poetry represented a political inheritance, though, which posed a dilemma for eighteenth-century poets and critics who sought to fashion a narrative history of England in which those lost ideals still described the virtues of their nation. What I will call in this chapter the intellectualized pastoral of Marvell bordered on 'polemic' as Annabel Patterson has noted.<sup>82</sup> Its figures such as Damon the Mower have been seen by such scholars as Nigel Smith to espouse the religious and political beliefs underlying the conflict of the English Civil Wars of the seventeenth century.<sup>83</sup> Yet it was also an expression of sentiment underlying an alternate account of English history to those of later eighteenth-century writers in its depictions of the subjective responses to the eternal truth underlying human experience within their specific historical context. Both impulses found their basis in a notion of the loss of virtue expressed in lyrics such as *The Match* and *Young Love*.<sup>84</sup> This loss was understood to be the fallen state denoted in an absence of pastoral simplicity of human existence that was a consequence of the original sin of Adam and Eve in the Garden of Eden. Polemic interpretations of Marvell's verse were based upon its allegorical features that used this idea of fallenness to comment on contemporaneous culture.

These aspects of Marvell's writing that lent themselves to polemical interpretation influenced readers' reception of both Marvell and his contemporary John Milton's poetry. What T. S. Eliot has noted to be the wit of Marvell was not easily disengaged from the treatment of contemporaneous society which it took as its subject.<sup>85</sup> Readers' response to that wit shaped the

---

<sup>82</sup> Annabel Patterson, *Pastoral and Ideology*, pp. 153-6

<sup>83</sup> Andrew Marvell, *The Poems of Andrew Marvell*, ed. by Nigel Smith (Harlow: Pearson Longman, 2007)

<sup>84</sup> Andrew Marvell, *The Match* in *The Poems of Andrew Marvell*, ed. by Nigel Smith (Harlow: Pearson Longman, 2007), p. 127-27; Andrew Marvell, *Young Love* in *The Poems of Andrew Marvell*, ed. by Nigel Smith (Harlow: Pearson Longman, 2007), pp. 73-74

<sup>85</sup> T. S. Eliot, 'Andrew Marvell' in *The Complete Prose of T S Eliot: the Prefect Critic 1919-1926, Volume 2*, ed. by Anthony Cuda and Ronald Schuchard (Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press, 2014), pp. 309-310

view of Renaissance writing such as that of Marvell later writers inherited. Marvell's verse may have circulated among such members of the Royal court as his acquaintance George Villiers, the Duke of Buckingham, who married Marvell's former pupil Mary, the daughter of Lord Thomas Fairfax.<sup>86</sup> There are not, however, any extant autograph manuscripts of Marvell's lyrics and very few existing seventeenth-century manuscripts that contain transcriptions. Much of what remains in manuscript and print are of his political satires. The absence of autograph manuscripts of Marvell's lyrics and that much of the manuscript transcriptions are of his political satires has supported such responses to the debate about whether the poems were composed during the period of the English Civil Wars or the Restoration. That evidence which does remain has also supported claims about attribution as that of T.S. Eliot to Annabel Patterson that 'the subjectivity and withdrawal which characterize[d] his lyrical and reflective verse' denoted the writing of the skill of a poet for whom the political satires have been a source of embarrassment.<sup>87</sup> This has given reason for continued doubt as to the relation between Marvell's lyrics and his satires and whether such poems as *To His Coy Mistress* and the 'Mower' poems should be considered pastoral because of their use irony and parody.

A purely pastoral Marvell is hard to reconstruct from the surviving manuscripts of the Restoration or the eighteenth century, nearly all of which contained transcriptions of his lyrics along with his satires. This mixed manuscript context for Marvellian pastoral is one of its most important features. One manuscript which has drawn attention in this way has been the Haward Manuscript (Bodleian MS Don. B 8). Sir William Haward of Tandridge, Surrey was or has been presumed to be the compiler as his signature, dated 21 January 1676/7 appeared on page 66. Sir

---

<sup>86</sup> John Michael Wright, 'Villiers, George, Second Duke of Buckingham (1628-1687) Oxford Dictionary of National Biography, ed. by Lawrence Goldman, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004)

<sup>87</sup> Harold Love, *English Clandestine Satire 1660-1702* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004) p. 103

William was a member of the Privy Chamber to Charles I, resumed his position within the royal household at the beginning of the Restoration, and was a member of the Cavalier Parliament from 1668 to 1678.<sup>88</sup> The miscellany contained thirteen poems and a mock-speech that were part of the Marvell canon and eleven poems by Rochester, as well as apocryphal items, from which the period during which the contents were transcribed may be deduced. The manuscript was most likely compiled in stages over a period of up to fifteen years from 1667 to 1682 as discerned from the dates that accompanied Sir William's signature at the conclusion of several transcriptions.

The means through which Sir William obtained a copy from which to transcribe *To His Coy Mistress* prior to its publication in 1681 has remained unclear. The poem itself was in the carpe diem tradition of Cavalier lyric that would have circulated in manuscript among such poets as Herrick, Lovelace, Shirley, Cotton, and Brome as well as Marvell in the 1640s in Lord Stanley's attempt to preserve prewar literary culture.<sup>89</sup> Sir William may have encountered the verse in a manuscript from that period which would suggest an earlier composition date. He may have also been acquainted with Marvell during his tenure as an MP or someone who possessed a copy from which to make a transcription. Whichever may be true, the placement of the transcription among libels in the Haward Manuscript suggests the interest in Marvell as a satirist in the Restoration. Many of the miscellanies also included his underground government satires that circulated in manuscript and were later printed in 1668. Marvell's 'growing disillusionment with the Restoration settlement and the failing optimism that he would have achieved a career in diplomacy under the New Regime' offers an explanation for the satiric elements present even in

---

<sup>88</sup> William H Kelliher, 'Haward, Sir William'

<sup>89</sup> Nicholas McDowell, *Poetry and the Allegiance in the English Civil Wars: Marvell and the Cause of Wit* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008) p. 40

his lyrics and make the time of composition of the 1660s proposed by Allan Pritchard and Paul Hammond likely.<sup>90</sup>

Though the dating of the composition of those poems has remained uncertain, such manuscripts as Pope's annotated copy of *Poems on Affairs of State* which contained several of Marvell's satires attest to Marvell's reputation as a satirist.<sup>91</sup> Marvell's lyrics employed the methods of those satires to transcribe the pastoral values conveyed in its generic elements and reinscribe them within his historical context in a manner that enabled him to take a critical view of the society he inhabited. Further evidence that Marvell's pastorals were read in relation to his political satires and the circumstances within which they were composed is offered in the history of the ownership of Luttrell's manuscript. Beneath the transcription quoted above, Louis H. Silver appended a note that gives the history of book:

All were at one time in the possession of Bertram Dobell. This volume was bought from him by Sir Charles Firth who sold it to me. o (?) are at the British Museum. One was bought by Maggs on June 12, 1939 at Sotheby's. it was bound and lettered as is this volume, and now in the Clark Library in California. Another is in the Huntington Library and this is the only volume which survives in England.<sup>92</sup>

Bindley was a friend of John Nichol's and to whom Nichol's dedicated his *Literary Anecdotes*.

Bindley read, suggested emendations, and added notes to both *Literary Anecdotes* and Nichol's

---

<sup>90</sup> Stephen Bardle, *The Literary Underground in the 1660s: Andrew Marvell, George Wither, Ralph Wallis, and the World of Restoration Satire and Pamphleteering* (Oxford: Oxford University Press 2012) p. 8; Alan Pritchard, 'Marvell's *The Garden*: A Restoration Poem?', *Studies in English Literature*, 23 (1983), 371-88; Paul Hammond, *Notes & Queries* (June 2006)

<sup>91</sup> London, British Library MS C 28.e.15, *Poems Relating to State Affairs, from Oliver Cromwell to this present Time: By the Greatest Wits of the Age* (London: 1705) 8th edition

<sup>92</sup> Chicago, Newberry Library Case Y 185.M376

*Literary History of the Eighteenth Century*. Nichols was also editor of the *Gentleman's Magazine* and edited an edition of Steele's *The Guardian*, which included the satiric renderings of the pastoral essays Rapin and Fontenelle written by Alexander Pope, John Dennis, Ambrose Philips, and John Gay. In addition, Bertram Dobell was a friend and publisher of James Thomson's verse (1900) and author of *The Laureate of Pessimism: A Sketch of the Life of James Thomson* (1902), which gives an alternate account of Thomson, the poet, than that of poet of the sublime in the manner of Milton.

That much of what circulated of Marvell's in print even after his death were his political satires often referred to as his 'State Poems' or his series of 'Instructions to a Painter' verse satires in miscellanies such as Luttrell's also testifies to the degree in which Marvell's verse was viewed within the political circumstances of his time. Paul Hammond has suggested that the textual variants in the transcription of *To His Coy Mistress* in the Haward Manuscript from the 1681 published text may have represented revisions made in the manuscript to a poem of libertine courtship for a later Restoration male audience.<sup>93</sup> As this, they demonstrate how the seventeenth century clandestine manuscript culture in which Marvell and his readers participated shaped later ideas about the character of his writing. Interwoven with these ideas were notions about genre and the permeable division between pastoral and satire to which later writers responded. Examining Marvell's verse itself first will explain the turn to pastoral as a mode of interpretative response for the purpose of satire.

### **The Renaissance Tradition of Wit: Marvell's Satiric Renderings of Pastoral**

The elements of Marvell's lyrics that have lent them the appearance of historical allegory offers evidence of the manner through which the classical form of a pastoral might be remade, by

---

<sup>93</sup> Paul Hammond, *The Making of Restoration Poetry* (Cambridge: Brewer, 2006) p. 185



treating its' characters and themes with irony in the manner of a satire, to offer a critical examination of it. In doing so, those elements also suggested how conventions might be used to express the subjective meaning one might derive from examining one's historical circumstances within that genre's underlying ideal.

In *The Garden*, Marvell wrote:

Such was that happy garden state,  
While man there walked without a mate:  
After a place so pure, and sweet,  
What other help could yet be meet?  
But 'twas beyond a mortal's share  
To wander solitary there:  
Two Paradises 'twere in one  
To live in Paradise alone.<sup>94</sup>

The self-contradictory character of Marvell's verse in which he recreated pastoral's idyllicism, while at the same time criticized it, aided his examination of the seeming oppositions between the literary and the historical or social that were to be found in Renaissance 'anti-pastoral'.<sup>95</sup>

That self-contradictory character that gives such writing the appearance of anti-pastoral denotes a self-conscious rendering of pastoral in which it turned to measure itself in the manner of satire.

Marvell's use of 'metaphor' such as the conceit of the garden taken from pastoral to translate its values illustrates how pastoral offered the 'picture' that 'framed' the Renaissance in a manner

---

<sup>94</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'The Garden' in *The Poems of Andrew Marvell*, ed. by Nigel Smith (Harlow: Pearson Longman, 2007), p. 158 lines 57-64

<sup>95</sup> Judith Haber, *Pastoral and the Poetics of Self-Contradiction: Theocritus to Marvell* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994), p. 1 and 7

that revealed the nature of the nostalgia with which it was afflicted.<sup>96</sup> Marvell's turn to the image of the garden to parody pastoral allowed him to draw upon the underlying idea of innocence which the genre's aesthetic character of simplicity was thought to denote to understand the implications of its loss in the Renaissance England he inhabited.

Marvell's lyric quoted above drew upon the history of usage of the conceit of the garden, as other Renaissance writers had done, to represent an ideal state of innocence made tangible in the image of Nature it offered. Those poets used this garden much like a 'commonplace' to 'establish intertextual relationships with other iterations', and so, defined the genre of pastoral under which they were subsumed.<sup>97</sup> Depictions of this garden in Renaissance pastoral represented a tradition in which the idyllic terms used to describe it alluded to the Garden of Eden to fashion depictions of the 'Golden Age' in which men once lived. This allowed poets to make use of the idea that the physical loveliness of that paradisaal garden represented a state of spiritual purity reflected in that uncorrupted character of Nature. The most familiar examples of this to Renaissance readers, John Milton's *Paradise Lost*, demonstrated how Modern writers might use the metaphor of the garden to fashion an image of that Golden Age through which they could understand their own historical moment in the reflection of its true character it revealed.

In his poem, Milton described Eden in language that suggested a connection between moral purity and the corporeal nature of both the Garden and Adam and Eve. Of Eden, Milton wrote 'A happy rural seat of various view' in which 'the flourie lap' of an 'irriguous valley spread her store / Flours of all hue, and without Thorn the Rose' to offer an image of moral

---

<sup>96</sup> Matthew Reynolds, *The Poetry of Translation: From Chaucer & Petrarch to Homer & Logue* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011), p. 4

<sup>97</sup> James Loxley, 'Echoes as Evidence in the Poetry of Andrew Marvell', *Studies in English Literature* 52 (2012), 165-85 (p. 170)

beauty which God made perceptible in its physical nature.<sup>98</sup> In this manner he also described Eve as with ‘unadorned tresses wore ... in wanton ringlets wav’d’ which ‘As the Vine curls her tendrils ... impli’d subjection’ to suggest innocence made tangible in the simplicity of her loveliness.<sup>99</sup> To this, Milton adds lines describing Adam and Eve to ‘their morning’s work they haste / among sweet dewes and flours’ as ‘any row of fruit trees reach’d to far ... needed hands to check their fruitless imbraces’.<sup>100</sup> He sets this image of the two in Eden with the circumstances in which they laboured after God banishes them from the Garden for disobeying him: ‘Beast now with beast began war ... to graze the herb all leaving / Devour’d each other’ were ‘from without the growing miseries, which Adam saw’, because of which, Adam reasons ‘it was but breath of life that sinn’d; what dies but what had life and sin’ which makes palpable that idea that God made the human body mortal to reflect the corruption of the soul.<sup>101</sup> Other Renaissance writers drew upon this idea in Milton’s verse that such labour represented man’s fallen condition. This offered the picture within which they apprehended the corrupted character of their society. Several depictions of life amidst the fallen garden, though, attempted to ‘revise Adam’s curse’ into an opportunity to retrieve in England, at least in part, what humanity had lost in the Garden of Eden.<sup>102</sup>

The lines quoted above illustrate how Marvell’s satiric renderings of pastoral made use of the Neoclassical method of evoking delight through the aesthetic character of simplicity conveyed in the shepherd-speaker’s perceptions of the objects of the garden. Here Marvell adopted this pastoral method, as in his other verse, of using his speaker’s perceptions of a

---

<sup>98</sup> John Milton, *Paradise Lost* (1667), Book X, p. 105

<sup>99</sup> John Milton, *Paradise Lost* (1667), Book X, p. 107

<sup>100</sup> John Milton, *Paradise Lost* (1667), Book X, p. 140

<sup>101</sup> John Milton, *Paradise Lost* (1667), Book X, p. 313

<sup>102</sup> Katherine Bootle Attie, ‘Enclosure Polemics and the Garden in the 1650s’, *Studies in English Literature* 51 (2011), 135-57 (p. 138)

‘fountain’s sliding foot’ and ‘some fruit-tree’s mossy root’, giving his garden its aesthetic character, to reflect upon the meaning of his affective response to them in which his ‘soul into the boughs does glide’.<sup>103</sup> This then allowed him to examine the subjective meaning the image of the Garden of Eden held for men within Renaissance beliefs about it. Marvell’s speaker in *The Garden* misunderstands his ‘fall on grass’ within the imitative garden as a ‘Fortunate fall’ that enabled Marvell’s parody of the original ‘Fall’ of Man in a kind of Eden which ‘lay within yet removed from the fallen world’.<sup>104</sup>

In this manner, Marvell transcribed such elements of pastoral as the garden and reinscribed them within satires in which the conventional ideas with which his contemporaries associated them offered the context within which he measured his culture. Satirizing pastoral enabled Marvell to use the conceit of the paradisaical Garden of Eden to depict that fallen condition of Man in a manner in which the garden demonstrated the susceptibility of humanity to seduction through its senses.<sup>105</sup> This recalled the belief that such a fallen state was a consequence of Adam and Eve’s original sin. In *On a Drop of Dew*, Marvell painted a contrast between heavenly paradise and the earthly garden through the dew drop’s descent ‘Into the blowing roses / Yet careless of its mansion new’.<sup>106</sup> The language Marvell used to describe the garden suggested how it served as a metaphor for society which sought to fashion a paradise of sensuous pleasure of its own making. Damon, in *The Mower against Gardens*, explained,

Luxurious man, to bring his vice in use,

---

<sup>103</sup> Andrew Marvell, ‘The Garden’, p. 158 lines 49. 50 and 52

<sup>104</sup> A. D. Cousins, *Andrew Marvell: Loss and Aspiration, Home and Homeland in Miscellaneous Poems* (Abingdon: Routledge, 2016) p. 85 and 93

<sup>105</sup> Aurora Faye Martinez, ‘Feeling Fallen: A Retelling of the Biblical Myth of the Fall in a Musical Adaptation of Marvell’s “A Dialogue between Thyrsis and Dorinda”’ in *Music Myth, and Story in Medieval and Early Modern Culture*, ed. by Katherine Butler and Samantha Bassler (Woodbridge: The Boydell Press, 2019), 224-338 (p. 226)

<sup>106</sup> Andrew Marvell, ‘On a Drop of Dew’ in *The Poems of Andrew Marvell*, ed. by Nigel Smith (Harlow: Pearson Longman, 2007), p. 41 lines 3-4

Did after him the world seduce:  
And from the fields the flowers and plants allure  
Where Nature was most pain and pure.<sup>107</sup>

This description of a kind of imitation of Eden of man's making offers evidence of how pastoral offered a mode in which making the garden the setting for seducing innocence in which Nature itself succumbs illustrated how it could be used to construct a language that showed how it embodied the values of Renaissance society. This garden in which 'With strange perfumes he did the roses taint, | And flowers themselves were taught to paint' alluded to the common belief that the Modern world represented man's corrupting influence.<sup>108</sup> In doing so, it suggested the fallen nature of humanity itself.

Many of the women of Marvell's lyrics were figured as imitations of Nature which the garden represented. Marvell employed pastoral conventions likening them to that garden to illustrate the consequences of such a fallen condition. This allowed Marvell to suggest that the seductive power those females possessed over men lay in the seeming purity men perceived in the resemblance they bore to Nature. Marvell described his 'orient dew' as,

[...] the soul, that drop, that ray  
Of the clear fountain of eternal day,  
Could it within the human flower be seen,  
Rememb'ring still its former height,  
Shuns the swart leaves and blossoms green;<sup>109</sup>

---

<sup>107</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'Mower Against Gardens' in *The Poems of Andrew Marvell*, ed by Nigel Smith (Harlow: Pearson Longman, 2007), p. 133 lines 1-4

<sup>108</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'Mower Against Gardens' (2007), p. 133 lines 11-12

<sup>109</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'On a Drop of Dew' (2007), p. 41 lines 19-24

This allowed him to capture both the pure quality of the dew's spiritual character and how men perceived it in terms of its manifestation through the physical characteristics of its material form. The language of the speaker of *The Picture of Little T. C. in a Prospect of Flowers* in which he perceived that 'every verdant thing | Itself does at thy beauty charm' suggested the manner through which he experienced his fallen state in terms of his affective response to that material form.<sup>110</sup> His request that she 'Make that the tulips may have share | Of sweetness, seeing they are fair' illustrated that such men were insensible to the effects of that mortal condition because of which they could only conceive of the innocence they perceive in such loveliness in terms of their physical desire to possess it.<sup>111</sup>

This kind of predisposition to sexual dalliance was a common pastoral theme through which Renaissance poets characterized its pursuit as a physical appetite to denote the consuming nature of the longing to regain the simplicity lost to the Modern world. The language of the speaker of Marvell's poem *The Match* painted such loveliness as Nature formed in his lady to be a balm for men who had grown weary of their world 'For, with one gram of them diffused, | She could that world repair'.<sup>112</sup> The speaker's comment that Celia represented that in her creation he had 'therefore store a magazine, | To save him from the cold' drew particular attention to the sensuous character of the solace that such women emblematic of seductive Nature offered and the men that sought to possess it.<sup>113</sup>

The language used in such depictions placed them within a historical context within which they permitted Marvell to meditate on the attitudes and practices that he encountered.

---

<sup>110</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'The Picture of Little T. C. in a Prospect of Flowers' in *The Poems of Andrew Marvell*, ed. by Nigel Smith (Harlow: Pearson Longman, 2007), p. 115 lines 25-32

<sup>111</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'The Picture of Little T. C. in a Prospect of Flowers' (2007), p. 115 lines 25-32

<sup>112</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'The Match' (2007), p. 126 lines 11-12

<sup>113</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'The Match' (2007), p. 126 lines 19-20

Marvell's use of the imagery of enclosure allowed him to modify the conceit of the Cavaliers' libertine garden in which they 'conceitedly and pornographically describe[d] women in terms of the land and its fruits' to instead have 'describe[d] the land and its fruits in terms of women'.<sup>114</sup> Marvell's speaker in *The Garden* in libertine fashion, describes how 'The luscious clusters of the vine | Upon my mouth do crush their wine'.<sup>115</sup> The speaker's words likening the indulgence in the fruits of nature to a woman's expression of sexual interest to suggest its intoxicating effect allowed Marvell to parody the Cavaliers' use of language reflecting the humor with which a later readership of Restoration wits would have received it. Marvell's speaker continues to describe how 'The nectarine, and curious peach, | Into my hands themselves do reach' illustrating how Marvell imbued his words with an irony noted to be aesthetic character of satire.<sup>116</sup> That irony betrayed the speaker's sensuousness, though it did so by maintaining the simplicity of expression of a pastoral. Writing in this mode allowed Marvell to draw upon the methods of satire to convey his speaker's simpleness of mind and perspective through the manner with which he mistakenly perceives Nature to possess a will. Marvell's rendering offers an example of how pastoral writing could make use of the types and elements of other genres and combine them with those of pastoral to develop a language that drew upon the varying systems of meanings of which they were emblems. That language then enabled his use of the methods of satire to measure his culture and its social values against the aesthetic values of simplicity and innocence through which he derived insight about his contemporaries.

In doing so, Marvell's poem illustrates a more persistent aspect of human nature by suggesting how the longing for reprieve took the character of a consuming desire for sexual

---

<sup>114</sup> Richard Burt and John Michael Archer, eds., *Enclosure Acts: Sexuality, Property, and Culture in Early Modern England* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1994) p. 252

<sup>115</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'The Garden' (2007), p. 157 lines 35-36

<sup>116</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'The Garden' (2007), p. 147 lines 37-38

dalliance, as noted, because of a need to wield control over those objects of their lust. This parodic use of language draws attention to the delusive affective state in which this renders the speaker. The impressions he draws of Nature that cause him to attribute lust to her as a result, betrays how he misunderstands his appetite for sensuous pleasure. The lines convey the attitude that underlay the Cavalier's sexual practices through the speaker's manner of conceiving of himself as the object of Nature's desire over whom he exercises influence because of his imagined appeal.

Marvell's depictions also reveal the manner through which the Cavaliers' language demonstrated that such men must have made a display of turning women into objects with which to satiate their appetites because they felt the power they exercised over them. In *Young Love*, the speaker suggests to the young girl he addresses 'beauties ... Such as yours should swifter move' though he likens her to 'fair blossoms [that] are too green | Yet for Lust, but not for Love.'<sup>117</sup> This offers proof that because of his own affective response, he becomes cognizant of his own sensuousness which, in Marvell's depiction, is a moral corruption that is inherent in men. In this manner, Marvell's use of the conventions of pastoral depictions of love illustrated how this corruption only revealed itself under the influence of the women who displayed such beauty indicative of their moral innocence. That allowed Marvell to demonstrate how men themselves served as the source of corruption commonly thought by Calvinists to have arisen because of the temptations the seductive garden of Renaissance society posed.<sup>118</sup>

Marvell fashioned his speakers to suggest the resemblance they bore to the courtly swain of Virgil. The pretense to the demeanor of an Arcadian shepherd of such figures recalled the

---

<sup>117</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'Young Love', lines 9-12

<sup>118</sup> See A. D. Cousins discussion in 'Andrew Marvell's Mower Poems and the Pastoral Tradition', *International Journal of the Classical Tradition* 18:4 (2011), 523-46 (p. 537)



sense among the Ancients that the lost innocence of the Golden Age was irretrievable as compared with the Moderns' belief it persisted. The plaint of love of the Arcadian shepherd, depicted in Moderns' pastoral, conveyed his perceptions of idyllic love and the lady he sought in language that referred to the objects of country life to suggest his virtue. This allowed such poets to idealize love, lending a candor to the manner through which the shepherd made his plaint, that suggested that to have won the affection of his object of his desire allowed him to reclaim the innocence lost to the Modern world. The ironized wit of a courtly swain with which Marvell's pastoral lovers spoke, as Virgil's had, enabled parodies of this such as *To His Coy Mistress*. The speaker's turn of stark images of 'Time's winged chariot hurrying near' and the 'Deserts of vast eternities' cleverly made use of such expressions of his sexual desire to draw attention to the immediacy with which he sought to satisfy it; his comment that 'The grave's a fine and private place, | But none I think do embrace' made pointed the inference to be drawn from the Ancients' position regarding the lost innocence of a moment passed.<sup>119</sup>

This wit with which Marvell's speaker expressed his perceptions of the resistance of the woman to whom he addressed his unsuccessful sexual appeal betrayed a sophistry to his reasoning. This sophistry with which Marvell's lovers spoke allowed Marvell to suggest that such human desires represented the corrupted values of men which stirred the longing for reprieve from the society they had fashioned which held them. The manner through which Marvell characterized his lovers' pursuit of sexual dalliance suggests the concern with which he viewed the thinking that underlay the recent opposition to the sensuous excess of the king and his Cavalier supporters. The clandestine satire that circulated in manuscript at Marvell's time depicted what his contemporaries thought to be the corrupting influence of the court and the

---

<sup>119</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'To His Coy Mistress' in *The Poems of Andrew Marvell*, ed. by Nigel Smith (Harlow: Pearson Longman, 2007), p. 82 lines 22 and 24 and p. 83 lines 31-32

town and questions of prudence in sexual relations, particularly among women.<sup>120</sup> Marvell's depictions implied though that life at court life simply evoked the inclination to sensuous indulgence and vice.

Marvell's use of a pastoral mode of interpretative response to his historical circumstances allowed him to satirize the Cavalier libertine and his critics to treat the complexities of life in the Renaissance in simple terms that permitted him to apprehend the consequences of the loss of innocence betrayed in the fallen character of his society. Marvell's lovers who resembled the cultured poet veiled their vice in reasoning about their affective responses to the implied moral virtue of the women they desired with sophistry that allowed them to justify the subjective meaning such experience held for them. Damon, the Mower, complained:

‘This heat the sun could never raise,  
Nor Dog Star so inflames the days  
It from an higher beauty grow’th,  
Which burns the fields and mower both:  
Which mads the dog, and make the sun  
Hotter than his own Phaeton.  
Nor July causeth these extremes,  
But Juliana’s scorching beams.’<sup>121</sup>

This illustrates how Marvell's parodies of pastoral depictions employed the aesthetic values which such sentiments suggested to illustrate the moral corruption of Renaissance society of which both the Cavaliers and the Roundheads were representative. The contrast between the

---

<sup>120</sup> Harold Love, *English Clandestine Satire*, pp. 66-79

<sup>121</sup> Andrew Marvell, ‘Damon the Mower’ in *The Poems of Andrew Marvell*, ed. by Nigel Smith (Harlow: Pearson Longman, 2007), p. 137 lines 18-32

character of the shepherd who spoke with a simplicity that connoted the aesthetic values of tranquility, innocence, candor, and happiness and Damon who spoke in a manner that conveyed aesthetic values of sensuousness, ugliness, artificiality, and displeasure demonstrated how the sophistication, sensuous excess, and power which Renaissance society valued led to a deterioration of the mind. This allowed Marvell to illustrate the degradation of men in the successive poems of the 'Mower' cycle which resulted and reflect upon its implications.

Such lovers in Marvell's poems enabled Marvell's depictions of the consequences of humanity's fallen condition through which he apprehended the difference in the moral character of his contemporaries and the culture of their making from that of the shepherds of the 'Golden Age' depicted in Neoclassical pastoral. Although Damon was 'capable of seeing correspondences between his own feelings and nature', he presented a self-delusive figure whose illusory comparisons reflected most favorably upon himself and were therefore questionable.<sup>122</sup> The lines Damon spoke quoted above called to mind the belief in the seventeenth century that the altered nature of postlapsarian Man led him to suffer from partial knowledge and thus allowed his passions to cloud his reason.<sup>123</sup> The contradictions observed in Damon between the 'naivete' and the 'hyperbolic distaste for gardening' and the 'witty knowingness' and self-delusive 'rightness of his brief celebration of his own Arcadia' represented the psychological degeneration from innocence to experience that resulted because of that altered state.<sup>124</sup> Damon became guilty of the pursuit of sensuous pleasure of which the Cavaliers were to be faulted, and pride in declared principles that were the basis for Oliver Cromwell and the Roundheads'

---

<sup>122</sup> Linda Anderson, 'The Nature of Marvell's Mower', *Studies in English Literature, 1500-1900* 31 'The English Renaissance' (1991), 131-46 (p. 136)

<sup>123</sup> Katherine Fletcher, 'Uncertain Knowing, Blind Vision, and Active Passivity: Subjectivity, Sensuality and Emotion in Milton's Epistemology' in *Passions and Subjectivity in Early Modern Culture*, ed by Brian Cummings and Freya Sierhuis (Farnham: Ashgate, 2013), 113-28 (p. 114)

<sup>124</sup> Susan Snyder, *Pastoral Process: Spenser, Marvell, Milton* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1998), 48-49

position against the Cavaliers. Marvell's satiric portrayals of such characters as Damon thus offer proof of how they enabled him to deduce that those corrupted values and practices were simply the visible manifestations of the moral character of his contemporaries.

Marvell's pastoral satires gave reason, then, to doubt both Cavalier practices and the Puritans' position which they employed to justify violence against them. The ironized ambiguity which Marvell created through the speech of his 'pastoral' lovers permitted him to examine the thinking underlying both positions in a manner that revealed the flawed principles upon which the rhetoric of those positions was based. Damon's first words draw upon Calvinist discourse and that of other dissenters to condemn 'Luxurious man' in terms of 'urban humankind's inclination to material self-indulgence, in general, and to sexual self-indulgence, in particular'.<sup>125</sup> This language which Damon employs imitates the language of the Roundheads who faulted the monarchy and the Cavaliers, as noted. Yet Damon's reasoning about his perceptions of his experience of unrequited love in *Damon the Mower* demonstrate that he was guilty of the same.

In this manner, Marvell's verse often created resemblance as it distanced itself from its sources which gave the impression of ironized ambiguity towards his relation to them in a similar manner to his use of allusion.<sup>126</sup> Marvell's use of pastoral conceits served as a method of reflecting upon what the use of emblems in rhetorical expression implied about the use of rhetoric to justify one's perspective and what that revealed about the speakers themselves. Damon's reference to the pipe of 'the piping shepherd stock' suggested the idyllic play to which the song and dance it inspired alluded.<sup>127</sup> Damon comments, however, 'This scythe of mine discovers wide | More ground than all his sheep do hide', suggesting it to be an emblem of Death

---

<sup>125</sup> A. D. Cousins, 'Andrew Marvell's Mower Poems and the Pastoral Tradition', p. 537

<sup>126</sup> Tom Lockwood, 'Marvell and Jonson' in *The Oxford Handbook of Andrew Marvell*, ed. by Martin Dzelzainis and Edward Holberton, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2019) p. 585

<sup>127</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'Damon the Mower', p. 138 line 49

to which Damon's final words refer to again allude to his vice and the eternal consequence of such sin.<sup>128</sup> This use of symbols would have been striking if Damon was viewed as an allusion to the Roundheads within the context of the beheading of Charles I and their demise with Oliver Cromwell's inevitable death. Damon, as Cousin writes, voices the Calvinists convictions about the excesses of which the Cavaliers were guilty, and because of which the Roundheads opposed them.<sup>129</sup> That also placed such behavior particular to the English Civil Wars though within a larger context of the import of the debate between Ancients and Moderns of whether the innocence that characterized man's Edenic existence could be regained or was irreparably lost.

Elusive love then, as Marvell depicted it in his parodies of pastoral, suggested more than that such lost innocence could never be recaptured by winning the love of the women they sought. If the depictions of this idealized love in the Renaissance pastoral tradition alluded to the state of moral virtue in which Adam and Eve lived in that garden, Marvell's poems showed that the love his male characters felt was of a character that corresponded to their nature. The passionate desire to possess an unattainable young girl which the speaker of *Young Love* expressed betrayed his own consciousness of the doubtfulness of his realizing a love of dubious character. The inability of such lovers to have won the love they desired also demonstrated that achieving the moral purity foreign to his own nature was impossible. For Damon and Daphnis, the wounds which unrequited love rendered them suggested their fallen mortal nature as it represented the physical suffering that was a consequence of their physical appetite of lust, and as such, the expression of the inherent corrupted character of their souls.

Marvell depicted the psychological progression of each of these male lovers through the language with which each reasoned about the love that eluded him. His satiric renderings of

---

<sup>128</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'Damon the Mower', p. 138 lines 51-52

<sup>129</sup> A. D. Cousins, 'Andrew Marvell's Mower Poems and the Pastoral Tradition', p. 537

pastoral illustrate the knowledge to be gained through such writing which enabled him to examine his culture within the notions about man's fallen state drawn from the positions of the Ancients and Moderns regarding the persistence or loss of the innocence depicted in Ancient pastoral: that the loss of the virtue represented in images of the Golden Age was irreparable and that such virtue could not be regained. In doing so, Marvell's poems allowed his readers to apprehend that truth which those male lovers should have attained through their subjective experience of love, but which escaped those male suitors because of their fallen nature. Through Marvell's depictions, he offered evidence that they could never attain the innocence that had never been an aspect of their innate characters. This kind of knowledge of an innocence that never was nor could have been which Marvell's satiric renderings of pastoral enabled also shaped the manner through which Marvell understood the leading figures of his period and the society they had made. A turn to examine his *An Horatian Ode upon Oliver Cromwell's Return from Ireland* will illustrate how that knowledge gained through such writing permitted him to do so.

### **A Pastoral Frame to a Literary Response: Marvell's An Horatian Ode**

Marvell's *An Horatian Ode upon Oliver Cromwell's Return from Ireland* belonged to the tradition of odes of Horace that imitated Catallus' 'Carminas'.<sup>130</sup> An ode was an elaborately structured poem that praised or glorified an event or individual while it described nature intellectually as well as emotionally. Although Marvell's *An Horatian Ode* was not considered to be a pastoral because of the literary form it took and the aesthetic character it lent it, Marvell's poem offers an example of how pastoral served as a mode of writing through which he could

---

<sup>130</sup> Marilyn B. Skinner, *Catallus in Verona: A Reading of the Elegiac Libellus, Poems 65-116* (Columbus: The Ohio University Press, 2003) p. 5; Andrew Marvell, 'An Horatian Ode upon Oliver Cromwell's Return from Ireland' in *The Poems of Andrew Marvell*, ed. by Nigel Smith (Harlow: Pearson Longman, 2007), p. 273-79

measure his historical circumstances against its underlying ideal of the simplicity and innocence of a Golden Age now past. *An Horatian Ode*'s exalted and inspired emotions and language, which were seemingly imaginative, dignified, and sincere, adhered to Marvell's description in *On Mr. Milton's Paradise Lost* of the sublime 'majesty' which such narrative poetry as Milton's epic was thought to possess.<sup>131</sup> The written form of the epic retained that aesthetic quality which were in keeping with the form it took of a poet-speaker narrating the actions of others to recount history for an audience.<sup>132</sup> The ode, though, offered Marvell with another form of lyric poetry, like the pastoral, which derived its method of a poet-speaker narrating emotion or feeling from the Ancient Greek genre of the dithyramb.<sup>133</sup> An ode, then, was a ceremonious poem that could combine elements of the pastoral and epic to unite personal emotion and general meditation upon an occasion of public dignity.

Marvell's *An Horatian Ode* demonstrated how this literary form of the tradition of Catallus and Horace's odes could be adapted to employ the elements of pastoral to enable a kind of revelatory examination. The tradition itself was the natural consequence of a 'steadily self-regarding and psychologically analytical trend in ancient literature'.<sup>134</sup> Catallus began his 'carmina Battidae' with a *resucatio*, or gesture of declining to write specific verse because of 'self-acknowledged limitations', which framed his use of figurative language to enact a 'progression from the mute despair of bereavement to a kind of poetic epiphany'.<sup>135</sup> Horace employed a modified *resucatio* whose use of speech and parody endowed the person depicted

---

<sup>131</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'On Mr. Milton's Paradise Lost' in *The Poems of Andrew Marvell*, ed. by Nigel Smith (Harlow: Pearson Longman, 2007), p. 182-84

<sup>132</sup> Gerrard Genette, p. 9

<sup>133</sup> Gerrard Genette, p. 11

<sup>134</sup> Peter Green, 'Introduction' in *The Poems of Catallus: A Bilingual Edition*, ed by Peter Green (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2005), p. 12

<sup>135</sup> Marilyn B. Skinner, p. 5

with 'the attributes incommensurate with those attributed to the preferred genre' to 'recuperate precluded generic motifs'.<sup>136</sup>

Marvell modified this method so that his use of pastoral conventions such as 'his muses dear' and the 'shadows sing' to characterize the figure of the youth as a shepherd-poet whose must part with his life of rural simplicity. That then allowed him to place the youth in contrast with the seemingly heroic figure of Cromwell who 'through advent'rous war / Urges his active star' to enable a pastoral mode of interpretative response to the historical event about which he wrote. Marvell adopted a satiric mask or persona so that he could manipulate the devices of poetic rhetoric. This permitted him to dutifully acknowledge Cromwell as the leading figure in that historical event of public interest as was expected of a celebratory poem while at the same time consider what Cromwell's role implied about him in the manner of satire. When read within the context of Royalist panegyric of the 1640s and 1650s, Marvell's use of sources and allusions gave the impression that he 'embodie[d] a pragmatic consistency rather than contradictory positions'.<sup>137</sup> Read within that historical context at the time of its publication in 1681, this would have been even more clear in the attempts during the Restoration to reassess the events of the English Civil Wars and the Protectorate that followed. Weaving elements of pastoral, set in contrast with those of epic, into his ode enabled his use of allusive language that recalled the irony with which Virgil and Spenser's poet-speakers spoke of the reason that had summoned them from the rural shade to speak. That enabled Marvell to consider his role and that of Cromwell within the recent events that gave occasion for the ode.

---

<sup>136</sup> Gregson Davis, *Polyhymnia: The Rhetoric of Horatian Lyric Discourse* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1991), p. 11-77

<sup>137</sup> James Loxley, 'Prepar'd at Last to Strike in with the Tyde? Andrew Marvell and Royalist Verse', *The Seventeenth Century* 10 (1995), 39-62 (p. 42)



The lines with which Marvell began *An Horatian Ode* recalled the beginning of Virgil's *Aeneid* and Spenser's *The Faerie Queene* in which each speaker, in the guise of the shepherd, begins by relating how he has been called upon to emerge from the pastoral shade to sing of arms and deeds.<sup>138</sup> Both offered Marvell with an example of how he might employ the speaker to perform or call up the characters or roles of pastoral and epic in a manner through which Marvell both fixes and distances his speaker from the Arcadian shepherd of ordinary pastoral. This distancing offers example of writing in the pastoral mode as it allowed Marvell to treat his shepherd-speaker with irony, and at the same time, make a critical assessment of the heroic figure of Cromwell within the occasion.

An alternate beginning to Virgil's epic which appeared in a first century AD edition was thought by ancient commentators to be the work of Virgil that the editor Varius deleted.<sup>139</sup> The alternate opening survived antiquity and demonstrated the logic that underlay the progression through the three successive genres of pastoral, georgic, and epic it enacted:

I am the one who once measured his song by a simple reed, then  
leaving the woods, compelled the neighboring fields to obey those  
who till them, however greedy, a work pleasing to farmers, but  
now of Mars' bristling arms and the man I sing ...".<sup>140</sup>

Spenser's beginning lines in the *The Faerie Queene* made use of similar generic conventions as those found above in Virgil in which the relation Spenser established between pastoral and epic writing allowed him to echo the sentiments that Virgil expressed. In the manner of Renaissance

---

<sup>138</sup> Virgil, 'Aeneid' in *Eclogues, Georgics, Aeneid Books 1-6*, trans. by H. R. Fairclough, rev. by J. P. Gould (Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press, 1999); Edmund Spenser, *The Faerie Queene: The Shepheard's Calendar: Together with the Other Works of English ArchPoet Edm. Spenser. Collected into One Volume and Carefully Corrected* (Printed by H. L. for Matthew Lownes. Anno Domini 1611)

<sup>139</sup> Virgil, p. 263

<sup>140</sup> Virgil, p. 263

pastoral, Spenser assumed the guise of the primitive poet to dress his words in the seeming humility of a simple shepherd summoned to fulfill the duties of an epic bard. Spenser began,

Lo I am the man, whose Muse whilome did mask,  
As time her taught in lowly shepherds weeds,  
And now enforst a far unfitter taske,  
For Trumpets sterne to chaunge mine Oaten reeds,  
And sing of Knights and Ladies gentle deeds.<sup>141</sup>

Spenser's reference to the Muse's hand in masking him in the simple clothing of a shepherd for that 'unfitter taske' responded to the more explicit censure of those of higher rank of whom he was called upon to speak. Virgil's beginning suggested a wariness of such men which Spenser made more palpable. This Spenser achieved through the irony with which he spoke of relating the heroic deeds to have recorded the reluctance and melancholy with which he assumed that duty. The allusions to Virgil and Spenser with which Marvell began his *An Horatian Ode* suggests the manner through which these sentiments shaped his affective response, and so, framed for him the similar task which he had at hand. The contrast Marvell's lines presented between the simplicity of the shepherd's life depicted in pastoral, and that of the public life of a military hero, alluded to the difficulties Marvell faced as a poet when tasked with lauding his political patron according to the heroic ideals of epic while suggesting him to possess the virtue of a figure of pastoral.

Marvell's *An Horatian Ode* began, then, with lines that imitated Virgil and Spenser to dress the serious matter at hand in the simple speech of a shepherd. The speaker of the poem, first explained,

---

<sup>141</sup> Edmund Spenser, *The Faerie Queene* (1611)

The forward youth would appear  
Must now forsake his muses dear  
Nor in the shadows sing  
His numbers languishing.<sup>142</sup>

These lines offered the speaker's perceptions of the idyllic landscape from which the youth was to part with the innocence and candor that denoted the simplicity thought to characterize pastoral. Here Marvell used such descriptive language as the allusion to pastoral song as 'his muses dear' and pastoral shade as 'shadows' to narrate the actions of the youth in terms of his affective responses to those aspects of his life. That, in turn, suggested the importance of the moment with the graveness with which he forsook them.

In doing so, Marvell drew upon contemporaneous pastoral theory about the principle of decorum which demanded that a shepherd should have spoken only as was appropriate to that humble station. The language Marvell's speaker used to recount the actions of a youth illustrates how his earlier readings had shaped his understanding of how the sentiment which colored his perceptions could be used to convey character. The speaker's suggestion that 'Tis time to leave the books in dust, | And oyl th'unused armour's rust' expressed the seeming reluctance with which the youth departed from the shade to lend a dignity to such conduct and endowed him with a noble character.<sup>143</sup> This language which communicated such sentiments towards the objects he perceived imbued Marvell's poem with a quiet grandeur that suggested the poignancy of the moment described. The aesthetic character of austere simplicity which that poignancy gave to Marvell's verse created an ironized ambiguity as noted before to be characteristic of his satires. Marvell's description of the Virgilian archetypal youth framed the decision between the

---

<sup>142</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'An Horatian Ode', p. 273 lines 1-4

<sup>143</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'An Horatian Ode', p. 273 lines 5-6

*vita activa* in which ‘through advent’rous war | [Cromwell] urged his active star’ or *the vita umbratilis* of ‘the glorious arts of peace’ that the wit and poetry which marked Royalist polemic and ‘the repudiation of allegiance’ the word ‘forsake’ represented.<sup>144</sup>

The pastoral simplicity with which the speaker mediated upon that decision struck the imagination in a similar manner to the greatness noted to be the sublime style of epic which described such military pursuit. The contrast between the tone of the speaker’s sentiments and the effect of grandeur conveyed the ambivalence with which the speaker viewed Cromwell’s response to the choice that laid before him. The speaker’s reference to the ‘shadows’ Cromwell also had to forsake insinuated the irony with which he suggested the seeming sorrow and regret Cromwell should have felt when called to action. Underlying this irony with which the speaker’s described Cromwell was the contrast such language was used to paint between Cromwell’s ambition and his moral duty.

Marvell’s *Ode* parodied the simple character of pastoral, then, to satirize the figure of Cromwell in a manner that suggested the high degree of moral sentiment the subject of such an ode should possess but which Cromwell lacked. The ironized language and use of puns to convey this sentiment betrayed that which Marvell overcame to face the ‘darker recognitions’ about Cromwell’s response to the events of the English Civil Wars.<sup>145</sup> His satiric rendering also intimated the reason that gave occasion for Marvell to have written in this mode. Marvell’s succession of symbols of the unused armour’s rust which was oiled and the active star which Cromwell urged made the underlying apprehension with which Marvell viewed Cromwell palpable for his readers. Marvell’s juxtaposition of the images of pastoral and those noted

---

<sup>144</sup> Nicholas McDowell, *Poetry and the Allegiance in the English Civil Wars*, p. 225

<sup>145</sup> Michael O’Neill, ‘Marvell and Nineteenth-Century Poetry: Wordsworth to Tennyson’ in *The Oxford Handbook of Andrew Marvell*, ed. by Martin Dzelzainis and Edward Holberton (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2019), 756-72 (p. 758-59)

offered perceptible suggestions of the simplicity of rural retirement and those that connoted the pursuit of worldly ambition whose success was usually celebrated in odes. Marvell's use of these symbols illustrated then how the ideals which such images were used to convey allowed him to interpret the recent events that involved Cromwell.

Writing in this mode of interpretative response allowed Marvell to draw upon pastoral to depict felt experience in a manner which T. S. Eliot noted because it 'modified his sensibility'.<sup>146</sup> He combined the somewhat disparate images to unite them into one structural whole. In doing so, Marvell showed how his affective response to aesthetic influences they connoted enhanced his grasp of his experiences. The 'shadows' from which the forward youth had to emerge to sing suggested the notion of shade as a place of safety or protection. Shadows represented an unintentional substitution though in what John Keats would refer to as the 'working out of a conceit'.<sup>147</sup> Marvell's choice of the word 'shadows' in place of Virgil's choice of 'woods', or the more conventionally pastoral 'shade', suggests this interpretative process through which Marvell apprehended the thought he formed of Cromwell's decision to emerge from rural retirement into public life. He realized that thought as he selected the word to use as a 'verbal equivalent' to express the sentiment he felt in a manner that Eliot referred to as 'the direct sensuous apprehension of thought' or a 'recreation of thought into feeling'.<sup>148</sup> The manner through which Marvell linked the idea of shadows to the image of books to denote the quiet contemplation to be abandoned and the rusted armor which was oiled to prepare to engage in battle illustrates this.

---

<sup>146</sup> T. S. Eliot, 'The Metaphysical Poets' in *The Complete Prose of T S Eliot: the Perfect Critic 1919-1926, Volume 2*, ed. by Anthony Cuda and Ronald Schuchard (Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press, 2014), pp. 381

<sup>147</sup> John Keats, 'Letter to John Hamilton Reynolds, November 22, 1817' in Quentin Skinner and Christopher Ricks, 'Up for Interpretation or What Is This Thing that Hearsay Is Not?' *Literary Imagination* 14 (2012): 125-42

<sup>148</sup> T. S. Eliot, 'The Metaphysical Poets', pp. 379 and 381

The ‘ironized ambiguity’ that Tom Lockwood has noted to be a characteristic effect of Marvell’s ‘refractive lyric voice’ which ‘created resemblance as it distanced itself’, here from Virgil, illustrates the manner of reasoning underlying the working out of a conceit.<sup>149</sup> Marvell used the satiric effect of this ambiguity to reason about Cromwell’s true character through the series of linked images noted, which delineated this subjective process, and in doing so, suggested that he incorporated each sentiment as he felt it. This demonstrated the degree to which the increased sensitivity to his responses to sensory perceptions he developed also heightened his understanding of the represented ideals. These ideals he apprehended in terms of the emotions the aesthetic experience of the objects he chose as emblems prompted. This method of using symbols which enabled Marvell to feel each thought and thus enhanced his ability to integrate his affective responses to each into his reasoning about the complex experience they represented.

A second instance in which Marvell drew upon pastoral convention demonstrates how this method of using imagery to communicate thoughts modified his sensibility, which would have prompted the apprehension with which he should view his patron’s military deeds as the language of the poet suggests. A rapid succession of images in the poem comparing Cromwell to ‘the three-forked lightning’ which ‘breaking the clouds where it was nursed’ culminates in a vision of the violence Cromwell committed as ‘And Caesar’s head at last | Did through his laurels blast.’<sup>150</sup> This Marvell placed in contrast with Cromwell’s ‘private gardens, where | He lived reserved and austere’ to insinuate the doubt with which one should feel that ‘Much to the man is due’.<sup>151</sup> ‘The reversal of celebrations of otium and eros in Roman lyric’ or conventional

---

<sup>149</sup> Tom Lockwood, ‘Marvell and Jonson’, p. 581-82 and 585

<sup>150</sup> Andrew Marvell, ‘An Horatian Ode’, p. 274 lines 13-14 and 23-4

<sup>151</sup> Andrew Marvell, ‘An Horatian Ode’, p. 274 lines 29-30 and line 28

pastoral with which Marvell juxtaposed ‘Cromwell’s choice of negotium in a time of civil war’ offered a frame in which to view Cromwell’s destruction of the ‘structures of State and Church’, and ‘a culture and a king’.<sup>152</sup> Marvell’s comparison of Cromwell to the forces of nature likened his actions to a use of power that only God was thought to possess. Through this, Marvell demonstrated how he realized the threat Cromwell’s ambition posed. This threat he came to understand in terms of the derision which the lines were intended to evoke.

The hyperbolic language of satire at this moment is striking because it presents the succession of insights about Cromwell through each felt thought. The ‘limited possibilities for praise and blame’ which the form of an ode offered enabled Marvell to recognize ‘the tensions and contradictions in his subject and his society’s value system’.<sup>153</sup> The ironized ambiguity with which Marvell began he developed to the intensity of emotion conveyed here through use of the noted images to describe Cromwell’s actions in a manner that betrayed his patron’s character. If read as if spoken in earnest, the diction suggested an image of power in the force with which Cromwell acted to have made his own destiny. Embedded in these lines, however, was the deep anxiety that was implied in the speaker’s description of Cromwell’s actions using that exaggerated language. The wildness with which the speaker depicted Cromwell suggested the fear with which Cromwell actions ought to have been viewed because of the impression it gave of Cromwell’s opinion of his pursuit of military action as compared to his garden retreat. This betrayed Cromwell’s dark nature which Marvell apprehended through his depiction and because of it. This sort of piercing insight with which Marvell wrote was an element of his satiric

---

<sup>152</sup> A. D. Cousins, *Loss and Aspiration, Home and Homeland in Miscellaneous Poems* (London: Routledge, 2016) p. 160 and 163

<sup>153</sup> Annabel Patterson, *Marvell: The Writer in Public Life* (Harlow: Pearson Education Ltd., 2000) p. 35-36

renderings of pastoral to which his contemporaries responded, as a turn to a response to it in The Haward Manuscript will demonstrate.

### **Reading Marvell in Context: The Haward Manuscript and Clandestine Satire**

The margins of the canon to which Marvell was seemingly relegated in the century following his death was due in part to the consequences of the literary culture of the period of the English Civil Wars. While Milton's verse appeared in print, most of Marvell's poems were not published until 1681, three years after his death. His verse satires such as his 'Advice to a Painter' poems were published in *Poems on Affairs of State* (1687), *A Collection of Poems on the Affairs of State* (1689), and *Poems on the Affairs of State* (1704).<sup>154</sup> Eighteenth-century editions of Marvell's 'Works' such as Captain Edward Thomson's and Captain Thomas Cooke's were designed so that the order within them placed them in relation to his verse satires and other writings and so offered the historical context within which they were composed and might be read.<sup>155</sup> Thomson's editions included explanatory notes about Marvell's poems about the affairs of state and his letters to such correspondents as Edward Popple in which he related the issues that arose during Parliamentary sessions and the confrontations such as the assault of Sir John Coventry that resulted. Within Cooke's edition, Marvell's lyrics which he entitled 'Carmina Miscellenea' began with Marvell's verse to his former patron and former General of the Parliamentary Army

---

<sup>154</sup> *A Collection of Poems on the Affairs of State viz Advice to a Painter. Hodge's Vision. Britain and Raleigh. Statue at Stock M. Young Statesman. To K. Nostradamus prophecy. Sir Edmunbury Gofrey's Ghost. On the King's voyage to Chattern. Poems on Oliver by Mr Dryden. Mr Sprat. and Mr. Walter. By A Marvel Esq, and other eminent wits. Most whereof never been printed* (London: Printed in the Year 1689); *Poems on Affairs of State, from 1640 to this present year 1704. Written by the greatest wits of the age. Viz. The late Duke of Buckingham. Duke of D-re. Late E. or Rochester, Ear of D-t. Lord J-Rvs. Ld Hal-x, Andrew Marvel, Esq. Col. M-d-t.Mr. St. J-ns. Mr. Hampden. Sir Fleet Shepherd. Mr. Dryden. Mr st. y. Mr. Pr-r. Dr. G-rt & c. Most of which were never published* (London: Printed in the Year 1704);

<sup>155</sup> Andrew Marvell, *The Works of Andrew Marvell, Poetical, Controversial, and Political; Containing Many Original Letters, Poems, and Tracts, Never Before Printed, with a New Life of the Author by Captain Edward Thompson* (London: Printed for the Editor, by Henry Baldwin, and Sold by Dodleys, in Pall-Mall, 1776); Andrew Marvell, *The Works of Andrew Marvell, Esq. In Two Volumes.* (London: Printed for T. Davies, in Russell Street, Convent Garden, 1772);



during the English Civil Wars, Lord Thomas Fairfax, followed by his pastorals, and then by his ‘State Poems’, notes to them, and epistles.

The few lyrics of Marvell which readers encountered during Marvell’s life, however, were read in manuscript alongside his ‘State Poems’ and ‘Instructions to a Painter’ verse satires, as noted. Manuscripts such a mid-eighteenth century verse miscellany which contained a transcription of Marvell’s *Damon the Mower* and was first sold by the Fairfax family of Leeds Castle, Kent in 1843 to book and manuscript collector Sir Thomas Phillips (1792-1872), to W. A. Lindsay in the 1899 Phillips sale, and then to Dobell on 14 February 1927 offer evidence that Marvell’s pastorals continued to circulate in manuscript even after the eighteenth-century editions were published.<sup>156</sup> The Haward Manuscript testified to the degree in which Marvell’s writing was read within the political circumstances of his time during his life and after his death.<sup>157</sup>

The Haward Manuscript was a large folio formal miscellany of both verse and prose, written in a single rounded hand throughout, with margins ruled in red, and with an alphabetical index numbered pages 719-21. It contained 738 pages, although pages 722 to 738 were blank, and included 40 pages of preliminary inserted material. The miscellany was most likely re-bound in 1936 when the Bodleian Library purchased it.<sup>158</sup> The new binding was in contemporary elaborately tooled leather which denoted its previous inclusion in the Hayward Collection consisting of the twenty-nine manuscripts of Sir William’s scripting which he later sold when he later experienced financial difficulty.<sup>159</sup> The manuscript was later owned by Peter LeNeve (1661-1729), his wife Francis LeNeve whose signature appears on page vii, their servant Joseph Allen,

---

<sup>156</sup> Catalogue of English Literary Manuscripts

<sup>157</sup> Bodleian MS Don. b 8, ‘The Haward Manuscript’

<sup>158</sup> William H Kelliher, ‘Haward, Sir William’

<sup>159</sup> William H Kelliher, ‘Haward, Sir William’

by Francis' second husband Thomas Marin (1697-1771) of Palgrave, the Aston family of Tixall, Staffordshire, and sold at Sotheby's on 7 November 1899 to Bertram Dobell (1842-1914), then George Thorn-Drury (1860-1931), and later sold by P. J. Dobell in 1935.<sup>160</sup>

Sir William Haward situated Marvell's *To His Coy Mistress* in his miscellany among libels and historical documents concerned with notions of monarchical power.<sup>161</sup> These other texts in relation to which Sir William situated Marvell's text for the making of his manuscript allowed him to recontextualize it in a manner which suggested how the notions drawn from them shaped his response to the language and ideas communicated in Marvell's *To His Coy Mistress*. That revealed the way in which to have read the poem as a pastoral satire allowed him to have made an interpretative response to it through which he was able to meditate upon his historical situation. Sir William's witness to Marvell's verse was much like the modified transcriptions of copyists or users. Sir William's manuscript contained variants in the transcription of both Marvell's poem and a libel also entitled 'An Poeme Amorous' in the Index of MS Don b 8 which was attributed to John Wilmot, the Earl of Rochester.<sup>162</sup> The modifications in this pair of a poem that was pastoral in form and diction, and a libel character situated among other libels and the contemporaneous historical documents, suggests the ways in which such manuscripts served as 'as a form of commentary or social authorship'.<sup>163</sup> Manuscripts which offered the context in which such verse could be read illustrate how they functioned as a form of personal expression, if not 'political or ideological motives', as they were often shared and copied.<sup>164</sup>

---

<sup>160</sup> Catalogue of English Literary Manuscripts

<sup>161</sup> Bodleian Library, MS Don. b 8 fols. 283-84

<sup>162</sup> See Cadbury Library MS r q PR3669.R2, John Wilmot, *Collected Works of John Wilmot, Earl of Rochester*, ed by John Hayward (London, The Nonesuch Press, 1926) and Harold Love, *English Clandestine Satire 1660-1702*; MS Don b 9 fols. 429-30

<sup>163</sup> James Daybell, 'Early Modern Letters-Books, Miscellanies, and the Reading and Reception of Scribally Copied Letters' in *Manuscript Miscellanies in Early Modern England*, ed. by Joshua Eckhardt and Daniel Starza Smith (Surrey: Ashgate Publishing Limited, 2014) p. 686

<sup>164</sup> James Daybell, p. 686

The miscellany contained thirteen poems and a mock-speech that were part of the Marvell canon and eleven poems by Rochester, as well as apocryphal items, from which the period during which the contents were transcribed may be deduced. The manuscript was most likely compiled in stages over a period of up to fifteen years from 1667 to 1682 as discerned from the dates that accompanied Sir William's signature at the conclusion of several transcriptions. It was difficult to determine, however, whether documents Sir William added documents as he became acquainted with them or gained access to copies, or he purposely situated texts preoccupied with the same themes, as the transcriptions were not always in chronological sequence. Several of the poems by Marvell, his *Further Advice to a Painter*, *Ballad on Haymarket Hectors*, *Nostradamus' Prophecy*, *Fourth Advice to a Painter*, and *Second Advice to a Painter* are placed together and precede his *To His Coy Mistress*, which is transcribed on folios 283-84.<sup>165</sup> The libel addressed to 'Phyllis', attributed to Rochester, and entitled an 'Amorous Poeme' in the Index, is transcribed on folios 429 to 430, is preceded by a lampoon entitled *The Disabled Debauchee* and Marvell's *A Dream of the Cabal: A Prophetic Satire Anno 1672*, and followed by Edward Hyde, first Earl of Clarendon's letters to Duke of York and Duchess of York upon the occasion of her conversion to Roman Catholicism, Marvell's *Advice to a Painter about Anglo-Dutch wars* on folios, and *Signor Dildoes* attributed to Rochester and *Additions to Signor Dildo*.<sup>166</sup> This suggests that these poems were possibly additions or entries made in the 1670s given their position in the later part of the miscellany and the dates of the documents that preceded and followed the verse.

---

<sup>165</sup> Bodleian MS Don b 8 fols. 205-06, 210, 217, 218-21, 237-46, and 283-84

<sup>166</sup> Bodleian MS Don b 8 fols. 429-30, 409, 409-11, 457-63, 465-67, 480-82

Love has noted that Paul Hammond was the first to draw attention to the broad dating implications of the order of material in the volume.<sup>167</sup> Much like other collectors, Sir William frequently interrupted his transcription of current material to insert retrospective ones and preserved lampoon versions in the distinctive form in which they circulated at Whitehall before they were distributed to a wider public.<sup>168</sup> Previous scholarship such as Love's draws attention, then, to Sir William's role as historian and antiquarian, and active participant in networks of manuscript circulation. This role makes Sir William's response to the texts in circulation, and thus, his part in it as a kind of author that exhibited a shared habit of mind among such readers and writers of the seventeenth century particularly interesting. His knowledge of history and conventions informed his reading of Marvell's poem which may allow a better understanding of its place within the context of the historical documents and other clandestine satire within the miscellany. That in turn may enable reflection upon the poem's place within the genres of pastoral and satire themselves and ideas about them.

Situated among the libels in the miscellany were historical documents that concerned a monarch's power to build and maintain an empire. Such documents included Charles II's commission that appointed a captain general over the king's forces, a charter granted to the East India company that expanded its authority to have included the powers of governance in India, and a transcription of a letter that discussed the 'Business with Dutch and the Danes at Berghen in Norway'.<sup>169</sup> Other transcriptions included a letter about how to respond to a libelous book published against Elizabeth I; the letter of Philip Arundell of appeal to Elizabeth I as he left the country in disgrace; the Articles of high treason and other crimes against Roger, Earl of Orrey, in

---

<sup>167</sup> Harold Love, *English Clandestine Satire 1660 – 1702*, p. 267

<sup>168</sup> Harold Love, *English Clandestine Satire 1660 – 1702*, p. 267

<sup>169</sup> Bodleian MS Don b 8 fols 310-38

Ireland for his failure in his commission Elizabeth I gave to him; and similar articles against the Earl of Clarendon.<sup>170</sup> These transcriptions suggested Sir William's interest in notions of censure and control. His positions within the Royal court and Parliament acquainted him with and made him subject to similar measures of each successive monarch.

The libels in the miscellany, however, were less concerned with the men of the royal court. Such libels as *Seignor Dildoe*, and *Additions to Seignor Dildoe* mockingly treated the affairs of such ladies as the Duchess of Cleveland and Anne, the Duchess of York. Additions to *Seignor Dildoe* humourously suggested that the ladies of the court preferred *Seignor Dildoe* to their former lovers and husbands.<sup>171</sup> It concluded with the comment that the Duchess of Cleveland intended to have the king bestow her son's blue garter on *Seignor Dildoe*.<sup>172</sup> It has been within such a context that modern readers have discovered Sir William's transcription of the libel that John Hayward and Harold Love attributed to Rochester, but which David Vieth did not include in his edition of Rochester's works.<sup>173</sup> The satire recalled the 'witty cavalier lyric of the carpe diem tradition' that circulated in manuscript among the Stanley circle in the 1640s of which *To His Coy Mistress* has been thought to be an example, as discussed.<sup>174</sup> Rochester's verse was one of the several libels exchanged among the later generation of Restoration wits which Love has noted to have been written to mock Nell Gwyn, a mistress of Charles II.<sup>175</sup> The Duke of Buckingham promoted Nell as a potential mistress to the king which Love believes to be Rochester and Buckingham's attempt to undermine the influence of Barbara Villiers, the

---

<sup>170</sup> Bodleian MS Don b 8 fols 75-83, 97-107, 84-5, and 159-66

<sup>171</sup> Bodleian MS Don b 8 fols 480-2

<sup>172</sup> Bodleian MS Don b 8 fols 482

<sup>173</sup> John Wilmot, *Collected Works of John Wilmot*; Harold Love, *English Clandestine Satire*; John Wilmot, *The Complete Poems of the Earl of Rochester*, ed. by David Vieth (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2002)

<sup>174</sup> Nicholas McDowell, *Poetry and Allegiance in the English Civil Wars*, p. 40

<sup>175</sup> Harold Love, *English Clandestine Satire*, p. 41

Duchess of Cleveland, with the king and at court.<sup>176</sup> Both women offered examples of the efforts to amass power through the use of the means and the context satirized in terms which bear semblance to Marvell's *To His Coy Mistress*.

The speaker of Rochester's libel used the language of pastoral convention, declaring 'Att the sight of my Phillis from ev'ry part | A Spring tyde of Joyes doe flow to my heart' to frame the similar notion of a woman's sovereignty over a man's mind suggested in the libel *Seignor Dildoe*.<sup>177</sup> The lines that follow note the 'delights are mingl'd with pain' as 'To my knowledge Love was a more quicker thing' to do so within common ideas about sexual dalliance which pervaded Renaissance pastoral as seen in Christopher Marlowe's *A Passionate Shepherd to His Love*.<sup>178</sup> Both libels attempted to place such female virtue in question through suggestions that such sexual abstinence was a ploy to maintain dominion over the men who desired each of the ladies described. The 'Phyllis' libel achieved this, though, through description of the speaker's affective response to the woman satirized in terms that likened her appeal to the effects of seductive Nature as noted above.

Much like the 'Mower' poems, the manner through which the speaker insinuated the impure character of Phyllis was exaggerated to have made him a comic figure. The language of empire which the speaker used to offer his lover's plaint only drew attention to how his mocking words formed a show of self-assertion. Such lines as that which referred to 'the Boy ... much growne & alter'd so Late' because his 'furious passion' had become 'hate' betrayed the weakness the speaker felt. The lines gave the impression that such emotion arose from his sense of his failure to attain power over Phyllis because his lust for her allowed her to conquer him.

---

<sup>176</sup> S. M. Wynne, 'Gwyn, Eleanor [Nell] (1651-1687)', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, ed. by Lawrence Goldman, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004)

<sup>177</sup> Bodleian MS Don b 8 fol. 429

<sup>178</sup> Bodleian MS Don b 8 fol. 429

The speaker, however, seemed unaware that the language he used to paint a picture of the object of his desire suggested that his own character was to be questioned. The notion of the 'Empire of harts' over which she reigned with which the speaker attempted to shape impressions of his mistress must have struck Sir William.<sup>179</sup> The pairing of the libel with the miscellany's other documents that expressed a concern with power and dominion among women attested to this.

If compared to the 'Phyllis' libel, Marvell's *To His Coy Mistress* contained similar notions that suggested a sexually attractive woman's power lay in her choice to remain chaste.

The verse, in its 1681 published form, began as follows:

Had we but world enough, and time,  
This coyness lady were no crime.  
We could sit down, and think which way  
To walk, and pass our long love's day.  
Thou by the Indian Ganges' side  
Shoudst rubies find: I by the tide  
Of Humber would complain. I would  
Love you ten years before the flood:  
And you should, if you please, refuse  
Till the conversion of the Jews.  
My vegetable love should grow  
Vaster than empires, and more slow.<sup>180</sup>

---

<sup>179</sup> Bodleian MS Don b 8 fols. 283-84

<sup>180</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'To His Coy Mistress' in *Miscellaneous Poems* by Andrew Marvell Esq. Late Member of the House of Commons (London: Printed for Robert Boulter, at the Turks-Head in Cornhill, 1681), pp. 19-20

In this manner, *To His Coy Mistress* parodied the amorous shepherd and his perceptions of the object of his desire to treat the pastoral ideal of love amidst an idyllic rural landscape. The suggestion that the speaker makes that they indulge in thoughts about their romantic desire while parted, 'thou by the Indian Ganges' side' while 'I by the die of Humber would complain' is made with the shrewdness of a courtly swain in the guise of a simple shepherd. The language he uses to describe both the lady's action – 'This coyness were no crime' – and how she might benefit from it - 'Shoud'st rubies find' – betrays the speaker's character through his perceptions of her that suggest his knowledge of sin. In this manner, Marvell's satire exposed the vice and folly in pursuing worldly pleasures within the familiar Christian notions of the loss of innocence that characterized man's state in Eden. His verse, like the Phyllis libel, accomplished this through its humorous depiction of a lover's expressions of lust that was not satiated. Sir William seemed to have recognized the similar theme and satiric treatment of both poems, having labeled his transcriptions of each a 'Poeme Amorous' in the index, as noted.

Marvell's poem, however, used the language of empire to suggest such an idyllic or pastoral setting in a manner that drew attention to the historical circumstances within which it was composed. The context the Haward Manuscript offers within the notions of empire conveyed in its documents suggest that he and his contemporaries read Marvell's satiric rendering of a pastoral lover's plaint as a challenge to a female's use of her sexuality as a form of power. The landscape Marvell painted within *To His Coy Mistress* was of a distinctly 'country' one in contrast to a more urban town setting in which the amorous conflicts at court might have taken place. It was made upon a much grander scale though through allusion to India in which England had established its mercantile interests through the charters Elizabeth I and Charles I had granted to the East India Company, the latter of which Sir William transcribed into the



miscellany, as compared with England which later pursued its imperial interests through the colonization of settlements originally established to further its mercantile ambitions. Such notions of British imperialism offered Sir William a context within which to interpret Marvell's language. The 'Indian Ganges' beside which the lady would have strolled and 'Shouldst rubies find' while the speaker 'by the tide | Of Humber would complain, I would' would have seemed to compare a woman's desire for sovereignty in romantic relations with imperial self-interest.<sup>181</sup> The enjambment at the line which ended with 'I would' offered the speaker's humorous threat to part with her in a manner that made that suggestion more striking.

The conception of empire as that which rose and declined derived from the other contents of the miscellany provided the context within which Marvell's depiction of the repose to be found in pastoral sport adopted a new sense. That context drew attention to the contrast Marvell offered between the lovers' proposed sexual relationship—a 'vegetable love', organic and capable of growth, but also finite with impending death—and that of eternal time. Within it, the speaker's language would have seemed to express an understanding of time as successive phases in empire which corresponded to phases of sexual love and intimacy denoted in the period devoted to the adoration of each part of the body. The ambiguity in the speaker's meaning Marvell created with his use of enjambment at the line that ended 'An hundred years to praise' left the reader uncertain whether the next line, 'Thine eyes, and on thy forehead gaze', alluded to the speaker's desire or the lady's vanity. The reference to the period of 'An hundred years' in which 'to praise' obliquely alluded to a period of imperial dominion. The reference to 'Thine eyes, and on thy forehead gaze', however, because of the pause created between the two lines,

---

<sup>181</sup> See Andrew Marvell, 'To His Coy Mistress' (1681), p. 19 lines 15-16. This 1681 edition was the edition published during the time Sir William Haward compiled MS Don b 8 and to which he may have referred for his transcription.

may be read as the speaker insinuate the lady's vanity through suggestion that she admire her own beauty rather than an expression of his infatuation with her. Nigel Smith has noted that the 'last age' alluded to 'the last coming of Christ to draw upon the idea of final judgment' when the lady 'should show her heart'.<sup>182</sup> Read within the notion of empire gleaned from the miscellany, the lines would have made the speaker's sardonic insinuation that the lady's love was to be doubted more pointed.

Much like the suggestion that the lady's coyness was affectation which betrayed that her reserve or her interest was not genuine, the poem's language led the reader to infer that her lover's affection was transient. 'For Lady you deserve this state', declared the speaker of the poem, 'Nor would I love at lower rate'.<sup>183</sup> The choice of the words 'state' and 'rate' offered puns that made use of notions of a woman's personal circumstances as compared with a female's dominion as monarch and that of duration of time as distinguished from a measure of monetary value. The phrasing then would not have appeared to suggest the lady to be worthy of adoration as assessed both by the degree to which and the length for which the speaker loved her, as would be typical of pastoral poetry. It may have been read, instead, as to have humorously suggested the absence of such worth. Such a new meaning pointed to the speaker's desire for his lady as something from which she benefited in the language of empire: the word 'state' also recalled the lines of homage before, but which denoted political sovereignty, while 'rate' within that context suggested the profit of such imperial endeavours. The emphasis in this manner of comparing his love to that of eternal time allowed the reader to imagine that 'Time's winged chariot hurrying near' brought with it the end of earthly existence and sexual dalliance, but also sexual frustration. The phrasing of the poem within such a notion of empire suggested the speaker's attempt to

---

<sup>182</sup> Nigel Smith, ed., *The Poems of Andrew Marvell*, p. 82

<sup>183</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'To His Coy Mistress' (1681), p. 19-20 lines 19-20

abate both the lady's resistance to his advances and her sexuality as a form of power. The images of impending death communicated the urgency the speaker felt, but also the consciousness that such sexual desire, and consequently the power he believed her to wield, were transient. This was an idea he also conveyed through reference to the absence of his echoing voice in the lady's tomb.

Sir William's modification of Marvell's *To His Coy Mistress* itself offered evidence of the degree to which the notions about a woman's sexual potency used as a form of power to gain sovereignty in the miscellany's other documents provided the context for this reading. Hammond has noted that such variants as the substitution of 'You' for 'Thou' in the opening lines of the transcription might have been amendments made to appeal to the libertine taste and idiom of court or coffee-house wits.<sup>184</sup> The use of 'Thou' would have seemed dated and out of place in a poem of libertine courtship to which comparison to Rochester's usage would have attested.<sup>185</sup> Such use of language in Sir William's appropriation gave the impression of the humour with which he viewed the more subtle attempt of Marvell's speaker to abrogate his sense of his mistress' power over him because of his desire for her. The tone of the poem with such alterations as the substitution of 'Madam' conveyed a coldness combined with insolence that rendered more pointed this affective response which exaggerated the sentiment the speaker expressed in the Phyllis libel.<sup>186</sup> The gesture made towards an understanding between speaker and the lady to whom he spoke was absent here with the substitution of the singular 'I' for the plural pronoun 'we', juxtaposed with the 'you' by the Ganges. This modification gave the reader

---

<sup>184</sup> Paul Hammond, *The Making of Restoration Poetry*, p. 187

<sup>185</sup> Paul Hammond, *The Making of Restoration Poetry*, p. 186

<sup>186</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'To His Coy Mistress' (1681), p. 19 line 2; Bodleian MS Don b 8 fols. 283 and 429

the sense that the speaker viewed his mistress to be his opponent in amorous warfare in a similar manner to the language of the speaker of the Phyllis libel.

Sir William's substitution also reflected the sense of irony with which Marvell's speaker used the term 'we' as preface to the distinction between himself and his lady. Marvell's use of language drew attention to this separateness when the speaker referred to her walking apart from him. Sir William's substitution of 'I' suggested the manner through which the Phyllis libel had framed his understanding of the relation between speaker and lover the former established. The 'I' of the Phyllis libel noted the effect Phyllis had upon him 'so much to wake me when I lay alone' to have denoted their separation. This relation the speaker then characterized in the language of war: 'Since [Love is] by Phyllis restored to the Empire of harts'.<sup>187</sup> The meaning Sir William derived from reading the two poems together among the others in the miscellany was also registered in the substitution of 'I' for 'We' in Marvell's original lines 'We should sit down, and think which way | To walk and pass our long love's day'. The notion of love in terms of imperial conflict was insinuated further in Sir William's replacement of the word 'seeke' for 'find' in the lines 'you by the Indian Ganges side | Should rubies find, I by the Tyde | Of Humber complaine'. The original lines may have been viewed as the use of pastoral convention to depict a young woman gathering the fruits of love's labour. Sir William alterations placed emphasis on the language of empire of Marvell's poem to convey the speaker's sentiment that she should reflect upon her romantic desire while separated from him to suggest that her efforts to 'seek' the profit of love was a fruitless pursuit of self-interest.

This language of an imperialism found upon mercantile interests enabled this rendering of further insult in what Sir William's amendments painted as the speaker's attempt to deny or

---

<sup>187</sup> Bodleian MS Don b 8 fol. 429

ridicule, and thus perhaps discredit, the lady's sexual potency as a tool in the amorous war she waged with him. In doing so, they registered the understanding Sir William gained of the precariousness of imperial sovereignty and the potential success of a challenge to it within the larger truths about man's fallen nature underlying the conventions of pastoral. These alterations also suggested that men such as the speaker were insensible to the manner through which their language admitted this to be true. Such modifications then offered evidence of the degree to which the Phyllis libel had influenced Sir William's reading of Marvell's verse. Although the transcription of Marvell's *To His Coy Mistress* appears on folios 283-84, it is placed after several folios containing copies of other poems such as those by John Dryden.<sup>188</sup> Rochester's libel, placed among others by him, which is then followed by Marvell's *Advice to a Painter*, offers evidence that Sir William entered the copy of *To His Coy Mistress* after the others noted.<sup>189</sup> Those amendments demonstrate how Sir William used *To His Coy Mistress* to apprehend such notions of sexual potency within the ideas he had formed about the desire for power underlying the quest to build an empire.

What was thought to be a corrupted transcription seemed to reflect the ways in which Sir William was responding to this use of a distinctive diction, rhythm, and imagery to express each speaker's sentiments about his sexual desire that remained an unsatisfied appetite for power. To return to Sir William's modification of the Marvell poem in the first line of his transcription from 'We' to 'I', the manner through which the amendment fixed attention on the speaker enabled his reading of the original poem. The substitution permitted him to make use of the original diction, rhythm, and imagery to transform a satire about the experience of lust into an expression of the

---

<sup>188</sup> Bodleian Ms Don b 8 fols. 283-84

<sup>189</sup> Bodleian Ms Don b 8 fols. 430-32

subjective meaning he derived from using it as a vehicle for examining his own historical circumstances.

However, Sir William did exclude the lines in the 1681 poem,

And while thy willing soul transpires  
At every pore with instant fires,  
Now let us sport us while we may'.<sup>190</sup>

He also removed the lines,

Let us roll all our strength, and all  
Our sweetness, up into one ball:  
And tear our pleasures with rough strife,  
Through the iron gates of life'.<sup>191</sup>

Both suggested the sexual urgency the speaker felt, and which prompted him to propose that they love, abandoning caution. Sir William's deletions amended this sense the poem communicated of pressing immediacy with looming death to mock a woman's sense of sexual dominion to insinuate its end within ideas of the fall of empire. The variations between the Haward MS and the published text draws attention to the difference between the two depictions of the speaker's understanding of the character of his love. In the 1681 published poem, he described his love as that which would have grown in intensity with time as the lady resisted as compared with that which was mockingly absent according to the speaker in the Haward transcription. The modification made which implied that the speaker's love would have grown more slowly if denied emphasized the physical nature of the speaker's vegetable love. This character became more pointed with the modification from the thousands of years he would have devoted to praise

---

<sup>190</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'To His Coy Mistress' (1681), p. 20 lines 35-37

<sup>191</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'To His Coy Mistress' (1681), p. 20 lines 41-44

the rest of his desire to her thighs to make the stark contrast between a shepherdess or nymph to whom a pastoral plaint of romantic love was typically addressed and an empress or queen that lacked her moral virtue.

Other modifications Sir William made noted the coming end to the Madam's dominion over him. Sir William rewrote several lines to have laughed,

'For in the hollow Marble Vault

Will my Song Eccho, Worms must try

Your longe preserv'd Virginty'.<sup>192</sup>

In the 1681 published text the lines read

'Nor, in thy marble vault, shall sound

My ecchoing song: then worms shall try

That long preserved virginity'.<sup>193</sup>

Such amendments suggest Sir William's understanding of how such pastoral elements as the courtly swain in the guise of a shepherd, the pastoral song or plaint, and the idea of innocence represented in chastity could be used to satirize sexual love in an idyllic landscape. These modifications also betray that he recognized how in doing so, they might have been used to assail or defame a person. This may be observed from the manner through which he exaggerated the ironic tone of Marvell's poem to bring undeserved ill-repute to suggest immorality as a libel did.

A libel represented 'a communicative practice' in which a 'linguistic act' within the 'public sphere' of 'political discourse' was 'embedded in habits, modes, and conventions' which

---

<sup>192</sup> Bodleian MS Don b. 8 fol. 430

<sup>193</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'To His Coy Mistress' (1681), p. 20 lines 26-28

reflected a shared way of perceiving through their ‘structures of grammar’.<sup>194</sup> Pastoral provided Sir William with the structures that allowed him to depict shepherds to treat notions about sexual love within prevailing attitudes or beliefs about the simplicity or innocence of which sexual purity was the expression. The ironic use of descriptive language to treat such ideas in Marvell’s original verse and Sir William’s transcription demonstrate the import of that depicted which has resonated with readers, because of the delight a pastoral mode of interpretative reading evokes. The humour with which readers are struck also makes them attune to their own subjective responses to the speaker’s experiences in a manner that enables them to attain such insight about that nature of their humanity. Marvell had rendered his speakers and other male figures unconscious, unaware, or indifferent to the implications of their behavior. For example, Damon’s fallen nature, much like that of the speaker’s in *To His Coy Mistress*, made him insensible to the meaning of his sensory perceptions. This enabled the kind of parodic depictions in which readers have experienced Damon’s sensory perceptions and emotions second-hand in a manner that has permitted readers to reason about them as Damon had done while assessing that reasoning. It is through this mechanism which the ironic treatment has enabled that has led readers to grasp the consequences of such thinking and behavior as Marvell presented them. His verse considered here thus serves as examples of pastoral satire. The perspectives of those depicted have been drawn from the figures to be found in pastoral; but the wit with which they have been made a vehicle for developing readers’ ideas and manners of acting has provided the context in which they have assessed such points of view.

This can be seen in the modifications Sir William made that suggested how his response to the satiric treatment of sexual love and sexual purity within the allusions to empire Marvell’s

---

<sup>194</sup> James Loxley, ‘On Exegetical Duty: Historical Pragmatics and the Grammar of the Libel’, *Huntington Library Quarterly* 69 (2006), 83-104 (p. 85-88)



*To His Coy Mistress* offered shaped his ideas about the practices he witnessed. Sir William's manner of amending the poem allowed him to work through Marvell's conceit in which sexual desire was compared to that to attain power over a pastoral garden imagined as an empire. Marvell's conceit offered the structure fashioned from the ideas about the lost innocence that characterized an idealized, past Golden age which pervaded Renaissance pastoral within which he examined the practices among the royal court in terms of the larger truths about men. The references to Christian teleological idea of time Marvell's speaker made which undermined the logic of his argument in support of sexual libertinism also offered several perspectives.<sup>195</sup> Such references enabled Sir William's to apprehend the delusive character of the seductive pleasures of the world which represented the notions of power upon which the contemporaneous understanding of empire was based within ideas about moral virtue poets conveyed through their depictions of the pastoral shepherd and shepherdess.

Working through Marvell's conceit then permitted Sir William to realize the subjective meaning the poem held for him within the context of his historical circumstances represented in the other documents of the Haward Manuscript and so, the relationship his period bore to its history. The same might be said of Marvell's working through the conceit in each of his poems. Both Marvell's poems and Sir William's modifications of *To His Coy Mistress* reflect the cognizance they gained of the irony inherent to the pursuit of sexual pleasure to retrieve the imagined innocence of a time past that may have never existed. Sir William 'recorded and preserved as he remade and reworked' Marvell's poem to 'inscribe continuities across the mid-century rupture' just as Rochester, in Tom Lockwood's account, renewed pre-war libertine

---

<sup>195</sup> A. D. Cousins, 'The Replication and Critique of Libertinism in Andrew Marvell's "To His Coy Mistress"', *Renaissance Studies* 28 (2013) 392-404, (p. 401)

literary culture as he ‘measur[ed] the restored king’s new times’.<sup>196</sup> Marvell’s poems themselves captured the ideas of that pre-war libertine literary culture that had defined it and to which the Restoration turned to understand itself. Sir William’s amendments to Marvell’s satiric rendering of pastoral illustrated the mechanism by which he translated that subjective meaning he gained into knowledge of the eternal truths underlying human nature and the experiences of desire and ambition they shaped of which any historical period consists.

In the patterns of both Marvell’s satiric renderings of pastoral and Sir William’s reading of *To His Coy Mistress*, then, lay the habits of mind reflected in the patterns that emerged from each author’s expression of the understanding of his society’s character. The irony that is a key element of these satiric adaptations of the pastoral mode suggested the sensibility with which they conceived of their modernity when they looked to its history. The reflection of itself the period viewed in its turn to its past to consider its loss of innocence expressed a longing for an idealized past in which lay the self-knowledge gained: through the patterns that emerged, they realized the fiction inherent to the history they fashioned from the image of a garden in which men once possessed what had never been. Alexander Pope also looked to those past narratives to understand his culture and fashion one of his own in which such patterns enabled him to place himself and his historical moment within the history they formed, and to which I turn in the next chapter.

---

<sup>196</sup> Tom Lockwood, ‘Rochester and Rhyme’ in *Lord Rochester in the Restoration World*, ed. by Matthew Augustine and Stephen Zwicker, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2015), 270-90 (p. 288)

### Chapter 3

#### The Uses of Pastoral: the Juvenile Writings of Alexander Pope

Among the books from Alexander Pope's library that remain is a copy of Thomas Creech's translation of Theocritus' *Idylliums*.<sup>197</sup> The annotations Pope made in such books of his suggest the careful study he made of the poetic models they offered. Evidence of this reading remains in the manuscript of *Essay on Pastorals* and *Pastorals* which included a note in Pope's hand which claimed the date of composition to be 1704.<sup>198</sup> Among the authors to whom Pope refers in the *Essay* are Theocritus, Virgil, Rapin, Fontenelle, Spenser, and Dryden. His annotations included corrections of spelling, punctuation, and syntax, as well as amendments to make the meter regular and improve the sound. Warburton had written that Pope's copy of Thomas Tickell's translation of the Homer's *Iliad* in his possession bore different markings that 'classed the several faults in translation, language and numbers, under their proper heads', giving evidence of Pope's habits of reading and annotation.<sup>199</sup> Pope's copy of Dryden's *Comedies, Tragedies, and Operas* also included passages marked of 'things finely said', using different symbols to distinguish descriptions of action, from those that also conveyed the character of his speaker's experience of it such as 'a decline in emotional pitch'.<sup>200</sup>

In Pope's copy of Creech's text, Rapin's *Discourse on Pastorals*, which served as preface to the *Idylliums*, is without annotation. The passages of the *Idylliums* Pope marked suggest, however, how earnestly he read the essay with Rapin's *Discourse on Pastorals* in mind. Those

---

<sup>197</sup> Worcester, Hurd Library, no shelfmark, *The idylliums of Theocritus with Rapin's discourse of pastorals, done into English by Mr. Creech* (Oxford : Printed by L. Lichfield for Anthony Stephens, 1684)

<sup>198</sup>

<sup>199</sup> Alexander Pope, *The Works of Alexander Pope Esq In Nine Volumes Complete With His Last Corrections, Additions and Improvements Published by Mr Warburton With Occasional Notes* (London: Printed for J and P Knapton, H Lintot, and J and R Tonson, and S Draper, 1751), iv p. 27

<sup>200</sup> Richard D. Erlich and James Harner, 'Pope's Annotations in His Copy of Dryden's *Comedies, Tragedies, and Operas*: An Exercise in Cryptography', *Restoration and Eighteenth Century Theatre Research* 10 (1971), p. 14

he marked are rich with descriptive language that captures the simplicity with which Theocritus' rustics perceived the beauty of a pastoral setting and the candor with which they expressed their humble desires:

The Day is fair but quickly yields to shades,  
The Lilly white, but when tis pluckt it fades:  
The Violet lovely, but it withers soon,  
Youths beauty charming, but tis quickly gone:<sup>201</sup>

These lines are particularly striking to a modern reader because the aesthetic character they convey evokes the longing for innocence. In doing so, they recall the image of a world viewed with the wonder of a heart not yet knowing of worldly cares.

The other annotated texts from Pope's library suggest Pope's concern with how a poet might communicate to his contemporaries this sense expressed in such verse. Pope's copy of Tickell's version of the *Iliad* in which he noted mistranslations which placed in doubt 'Tickell's Masculine Strength owed to Homer's Native Simplicity' suggest that he read and annotated such texts within the terms of the debate between the Ancients and the Moderns about translation.<sup>202</sup> Pope also marked Sir John Denham's 'Preface' to the *Destruction of Troy* in which Denham wrote of the poet that it was 'not his business alone to translate Language into Language, but Poesie into Poesie' as 'in pouring out of one language into another, it will all evaporate; and if a new Spirit will not be added in the Transfusion, there will remain nothing but a Caput

---

<sup>201</sup> Worcester, Hurd Library, *The idylliums of Theocritus with Rapin's discourse*, p. 113

<sup>202</sup> Felicity Rosslyn, 'Pope's Annotations to Tickell's *Iliad* Book One', *The Review of English Studies* Volume XXX, Issue 117 (1979): 49-59 (p. 51 and 55)

Mortuum'.<sup>203</sup> The lines of commendatory verse that preceded Dryden's translation of Virgil's *Pastorals* which Pope marked, as well, praised Dryden's translation for achieving this.<sup>204</sup>

His readings of Theocritus and Virgil within the critical statements made in the essays of Rapin, Fontenelle, Denham, and Dryden upon which he draws in his *Essay on Pastoral* formed the context within which Pope turned at the age of sixteen in 1704 to the first of the Virgilian triad of genres, pastoral, to begin his development as a poet. The noted manuscript of Pope's *Pastorals* and *Essay on Pastorals* offers his first attempt at writing in and about that pastoral mode and bears the comments of the Restoration author William Walsh who participated in the *querelle* of Ancients and Moderns.<sup>205</sup> The suggestions and amendments Walsh recommended, the replies to which Pope appended to the manuscript, attested to the schooling Pope received in the methods through which his contemporaries fashioned an image of their historical present. That image reflected an understanding of its past within the ideal of the innocence thought by Neoclassicist to correspond to the virtue of the shepherd represented in Ancient pastoral. Pope's manner of response, I will argue, demonstrated that his creative engagement with it served as a generative moment spurring a critical response to earlier pastoral and pastoral theory. The passages Pope marked in his copies of Creech's Theocritus, Spenser's *The Faerie Queen*, and Dryden's Virgil suggested his interest in the use of modern dress to translate conventions used to

---

<sup>203</sup> Worcester, Hurd Library, no shelfmark, *Poems and Translations with the Sophy, written by the Honorable Sir John Denahm, Knight of the Bath, The Fourth Edition, To which is added Cato-Major of Old Age* (London: Printed by T. W. for H. Harrington and sold by Jacob Tonson at Grays-InnGate in Grays-Inn-Lane, and Thomas Beckett at the Half-Moon in St. Paul's Church-Yard, 1705)

<sup>204</sup> London, British Library (BL) C.28.f.6, Virgil, *The works of Virgil: containing his pastorals, Georgics and Æneis. Translated into English verse; by Mr. Dryden. In three volumes. Adorn'd with above a hundred sculptures*, (London: Printed by Jacob Tonson at Grays-Inn Gate, 1709), p. 101

<sup>205</sup> 'The Pastorals', privately owned by Quatrach (1990). First published with the permission of the previous owner Arthur A. Houghton, Jr. prior to auction at Christies in 1980 in *The Last and Greatest Art: Some Unpublished Poetical Manuscripts of Alexander Pope*, trans. and ed. by Maynard Mack (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 1984), pp. 62-69

convey the simple shepherd's perceptions which gave him the coarseness for which Fontenelle censured Theocritus.<sup>206</sup>

Pope offered his interpretative reading of those works in which he rendered his juvenile pastoral poetry and his prefatory *Essay* with an irony that denoted satire. Pope's use of that irony drew attention to the false reasoning that underlay the precepts of Rapin and Fontenelle which concerned the decorum and character of the shepherd. In doing so, Pope's *Essay* gave reason to doubt the basis for the account of literary history and the place in it both the Ancients and the Moderns made for themselves. Pope's juvenilia illustrated how the habits of writing he formed through imitation had shaped the habits of mind of each successive author who had done the same. Such habits of mind, I will suggest, offered evidence of how that pattern of ideas shaped those he formed about the writings of the poets from whom he learned his methods. That pattern of ideas defined Pope's alternate account of the tradition of pastoral which alluded to the origins of Spenser and Dryden's satiric approach in the writings of Theocritus and Virgil to which they turned for models.

Pope's *Pastorals* were published in print five years after he first composed them in manuscript in a collection of pastorals by various authors — Volume 6 of *Poetical Miscellanies* printed for Jacob Tonson (1709) — that also included the pastoral of Ambrose Philips.<sup>207</sup> The difference in the character of the two sets of pastorals situated at the beginning and the end of the miscellany marked the birth of a rivalry between the two poets which attested to the continued efforts of eighteenth-century literary authors to wage a war of Ancients and Moderns. This conflict, however, took a new turn in which the poets used the points of prosody and poetics that

---

<sup>206</sup> Bernard de Bovier Fontenelle, *Of Pastorals*, pp. 278-80

<sup>207</sup> David Foxon and James McLaverty, eds., *Pope and the Early Eighteenth-Century Book Trade, The Lydell Lectures, Oxford 1975-76* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1991) p. 19

denoted the pastoral of the two positions to offer differing accounts of national history through their accounts of the development of English literature. In Pope's set of juvenile writing, his *Pastorals* and the *Essay on Pastorals* that accompanied it, he adopted the conventions drawn from his study of Ancient and Modern literature to respond to the *querelle* in a manner that resembled the pastoral mode of interpretative reading of classical verse discussed in the previous chapters. Writing in that pastoral mode, I will show, allowed Pope to engage with his literary inheritance in a way that addressed the difficulties it posed for his contemporaries. It enabled him to translate subjective response to pastoral poetry, both Ancient and Modern, and the contentions its authors made about the cultures which it represented, into knowledge of the larger truths about the human experiences depicted within the stories told of literary history.

The view of literary history Pope formed then shaped his understanding of the account of England's recent literary past that his contemporaries rewrote to offer their narrative of the development of a national literature which attested to the strength of virtue and character of their country. Neoclassical pastoral allowed eighteenth-century authors to suggest the noble simplicity of English countrymen through their depictions in which the Arcadian shepherd was taught to speak in the modern vernacular with the mannerisms of a native rustic. *The Guardian's* Essay no. 22 (1713) recast this figure to be found in Philips' pastoral as the clownish gentleman reader of pastoral.<sup>208</sup> Pope's response in Essay No. 40 in the same publication in 1713 was to exaggerate the feigned humility and candor that the earlier essay lent to that figure.<sup>209</sup> This, I will demonstrate, allowed Pope to draw upon the methods of imbuing pastoral with an aesthetic character of simplicity to show how they could be employed in the manner of a tradition of

---

<sup>208</sup> 'Essay 22' in *The Guardian*, ed. by John Calhoun Stephens (Lexington: University of Kentucky Press, 1982) p. 105-07

<sup>209</sup> 'Essay 40' in *The Guardian*, ed. by John Calhoun Stephens (Lexington: University of Kentucky Press, 1982) p. 160-65

satiric renderings formed from the verse of the poets he noted to undermine the principles upon which Neoclassical accounts of literature were based. Pope's essay suggested the sophistry with which the Modern English poets employed the rhetoric of Neoclassical pastoral to paint themselves to be the descendants of that Golden Age of Antiquity whose ideals persisted in the culture they depicted. This rhetoric was among the methods which members of the Kit Kat Club employed to define a native canon that conformed to literary standards of a Whig-sponsored literary culture which intertwined literary endeavors with public life.<sup>210</sup> Pope's parodic essay offered evidence of an alternate way of conceiving of the tradition of Modern English poetry to that from which they constructed their native Whig canon.

Pope's Essay no. 40 served as preface to his satiric depiction of the war they waged with their critics in Essays Nos. 91 and 92.<sup>211</sup> In these satiric replies, Pope drew attention to the literary aspirations which such poets and their detractors had masked in the concern they asserted about the account to be told of the history of the English character. These essays provided the occasion for his later poetry which drew upon his earlier pastoral mode of interpretative reading. The character of his *Messiah* also published in 1713 remade Virgil's fourth eclogue into an expression of the desire for a rebirth and return to the Golden Age which permeated much of the pastoral of the Renaissance. That use of a pastoral mode, I will show, allowed Pope to fashion verse that reflected the insight he gained through examining his subjective response to the consequences of the loss of innocence that had formed England's character and so, shaped the understanding of English history his account shared. The holograph of his *Windsor Forest* which

---

<sup>210</sup> Abigail Williams, 'Patronage and Whig Culture in the Early Eighteenth Century' in *Cultures of Whiggism: New Essays on English Literature and Culture in the Long Eighteenth Century*, ed. by David Womersley (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 2005) p. 158 and 162-64

<sup>211</sup> 'Essay 91' and 'Essay 92' in *The Guardian*, ed. by John Calhoun Stephens (Lexington: University of Kentucky Press, 1982), p. 325-27 and 328-30



he first made in 1712 and later published in print in 1713 bears witness to how the recurring examples in literary history helped him to envision that account of England.<sup>212</sup> To begin, a turn to examine Pope's *Pastorals* will demonstrate how his satiric rendering of pastoral derived from his readings of earlier models of this mode of interpretative response enabled this knowledge.

### **Poetic Engagements and Poetic Traditions in Pope's *Pastorals***

In 1704, Pope began his poetic career by attempting the first of genres following the Virgilian progression, pastoral, as noted.<sup>213</sup> The manuscript of these compositions contains twenty leaves in which the cover leaf with an inscription added later is followed by the *Essay on Pastoral* on pages two to five, a sixth blank page, and the remaining pages on which the *Pastorals*, 'Spring', 'Summer', 'Autumn', and 'Winter', are written. The autograph note on the coverleaf reads:

Mem. This Copy is that wch past thro ye | hands of mr. Walsh, Mr.  
Congreve, Mr. | Southern, Sr, H. Sheets, Sr. W. Trumball, | Ld.  
Halifax, Marq. of Dorchester, | D. of Bucks. &c only ye 3rd Eclog  
was / written since some of these saw ye other 3 | wch were written  
as they here stand wth | ye Essay, anno. 1704 – Aetat. Meas., 16.  
The alterations from this copy were upon | ye Objections of these,  
or my own.<sup>214</sup>

There has been some question as to the accuracy of the date of 1704 for the composition of the *Pastorals*. The Twickenham editors have noted that the handwriting of the above note looks to be

---

<sup>212</sup> Robert Schmidt, *Pope's Windsor Forest 1712: A study of the Washington University Holograph* (St. Louis, MO: Washington University, 1952)

<sup>213</sup> Alexander Pope, 'The Pastorals' (1984), pp. 34-61

<sup>214</sup> Alexander Pope, 'An Essay on Pastoral' in *The Last and Greatest Art: Some Unpublished Poetical Manuscripts of Alexander Pope*, trans. and ed. by Maynard Mack (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 1984) p. 1a

later than that of the manuscript texts.<sup>215</sup> The content of the note has been thought to fit into the period of the 1730s when Pope began to issue small octavo editions of his poems which included variant readings from the manuscripts among the footnotes.<sup>216</sup> That date Pope gave of 1704 has been considered probable though, as both Walsh and William Wycherley, whose name was not included in the note, had written that they had examined ‘papers’ of Pope’s that he identified as ‘Mr. Pope’s Pastorals’ when he published their letters to him.<sup>217</sup> Granville also wrote in a letter to an unidentified friend that Pope was ‘not above Seventeen or Eighteen Years of Age, and promises miracles ... If he goes on as he has begun, in the Pastoral way, as Virgil first try’d his strength’.<sup>218</sup> By 20 April 1706, Congreve had shown the manuscript to Jacob Tonson, who solicited it for publication.<sup>219</sup>

Maynard Mack has noted an additional detail that supports the early date of composition: that Strephon’s riddle in ‘Spring’ alluded to the victory of the ‘Thistle of Anne’ over the ‘lily of Louis XIV and France at Blenheim on 13 August 1704, though Pope later revised it to refer to the Union of England and Scotland on 1 May 1707 recorded in the change to the royal arms.<sup>220</sup> Such details suggest the care with which Pope used his creative writing as a means of critical reflection about the uses to which a pastoral mode of writing could be put and how that would allow him to engage in discourse with his contemporaries about their historical context. His use of typeface after the manner of a printed book in the holograph, prepared to be circulated among his aristocratic friends, attested to his participation in manuscript culture, with the intention of entry into that of

---

<sup>215</sup> E. Audra and Aubrey Williams, eds., *Pastoral Poetry and an Essay on Criticism*, Twickenham Edition, Volume I (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1961), p. 38

<sup>216</sup> Maynard Mack, trans and ed, ‘The Pastorals’, *The Last and Greatest Art: Some Unpublished Poetical Manuscripts of Alexander Pope* (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 1984) p. 19

<sup>217</sup> George Sherburn, ed., *The Correspondence of Alexander Pope, Volume 1 1704-1718* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1956), p. 6-7, ‘Wycherley to Pope, 7 April 1705’ and ‘Walsh to Wycherley, 20 April 1705’

<sup>218</sup> George Sherburn, *The Early Career of Alexander Pope* (Oxford: The Clarendon Press, 1934), p. 52

<sup>219</sup> George Sherburn, ed., *Correspondence*, i, p. 17

<sup>220</sup> Maynard Mack, *The Last and Greatest Art*, p. 20

print culture as well.<sup>221</sup> The amendments which are appended to the manuscript suggest that the introduction his friends gave him to the methods of prosody, which poets of the period used to fit the ancient forms of verse to the readers' tastes in keeping with Neoclassical theory, was offered with that in mind.

Pope's *Pastorals* would not be published in print until 1709 when they appeared at the end of a Tonson's *Poetical Miscellanies*, as noted. Several of Pope's contemporaries such as John Dennis and Joseph Addison considered Philips' verse which appeared at the beginning of the volume to be in the style of Arcadian pastoral the Whig authors favored. Pope's *Pastorals*, by contrast, were thought to be in the style of Virgil's *Eclogues*, as Granville had written, because Pope's verse featured courtly swains who offered more complex observations for which Neoclassical theorists had censured Virgil. That reception has influenced the way in which Pope has been read by subsequent critics within the war political factions waged through the positions they adopted about what the character of poetry should be and the values that it should be made to represent. This conflict was fought within the context of the *querelle* between the Ancients who believed the verse of antiquity which conveyed the ideals of a distance past to be inimitable, as compared with the Moderns who contended that such values could be translated into contemporary terms, as noted. Pope's poetry was set in contrast to that of Tickell, Addison, and Dennis, as well as Philips. Such authors thought and were thought to have 'remodel[ed] and reform[ed] literary culture, as political and social life was reformed', through their verse whose literary and political values defined the historical aesthetic of a native 'Whiggish' literary tradition.<sup>222</sup> This context within which Pope's pastoral was read reminds of the manner through which the political,

---

<sup>221</sup> Dustin Griffin, *Literary Patronage in England, 1650-1800* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996), p. 125

<sup>222</sup> Abigail Williams, *Poetry and the Creation of Whig Literary Culture 1681-1714* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005), p. 2-3

historical, and literary circumstances within which Marvell wrote shaped how his response to it was received.

The first stanza of Pope's *Spring Pastoral* began with a turn to the past that captured the sentiment underlying the Renaissance verse Pope had read. Those lines conjured images of that idealized past which suggested a desire to return to the simplicity with which shepherd bards were thought to have once sung. Pope's language betrayed, though, the consciousness that the state of innocence in which those shepherds were thought to have lived may have always eluded men. Pope's first few lines imitated Virgil's *Aeneid*, Spenser's *The Faerie Queene*, and Dryden's translation of Virgil's epic, as Marvell's *An Horatian Ode* did:

First in these Fields I sing the Sylvan Strains  
Nor blush to sport in Windsor's Plain:  
Fair Thames flow gently from that sacred Spring  
While on thy bank Sicilian Muses sing;  
Let Vernal Airs thro' trembling Oeiers play,  
And Albien's Cliffs resound the rural lay.<sup>223</sup>

Here Pope combined the grammar which characterized epic with the diction of pastoral that lent his verse a quiet grandeur. That quiet grandeur gave it an aesthetic character in a similar manner to the quality that resulted because of Theocritus' method of combining a 'lyric tone with epic meter and doric dialect' to imbue his *Idylliums* with the simplicity for which the Sicilian poet was noted.<sup>224</sup>

---

<sup>223</sup> Alexander Pope, 'Spring: The First Pastoral or Damon' in *The Last and Greatest Art: Some Unpublished Poetical Manuscripts of Alexander Pope*, trans and ed by Maynard Mack (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 1984), p. 35

<sup>224</sup> Neil Hopkinson, trans. and ed., *Theocritus, Moschus, Bion* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2015), p. ix

Pope's allusion to Theocritus whom the 'Sicilian Muses' inspired alluded to the context within which he wrote his pastorals. The 'potent image and concept of corruption, both moral failure and historical decay', in Pope's later poetry began with a vision of place: ancient, with a legend attached to each name, and modern, in the tale of the present it offered, that shaped his 'vision of time', 'the processes of the world,' and the 'patterns of history', within which he understood the hopes and fears of his historical moment.<sup>225</sup> Each of the poets mentioned had made an interpretative reading of the verse of the succession of poets who wrote before him. Pope's note to the first few lines of his 'Spring Pastoral' informs the reader that each of the first three pastorals imitates the beginnings of Theocritus, Virgil, and Spencer.<sup>226</sup> Pope's reference to Theocritus' native Sicily suggested though that in doing so, each of those latter poets was indebted to Theocritus from whom Virgil had learned the method of intertwining the elements of pastoral with epic to conjure the past and evoke the sentiment that came to denote the pastoral genre.

Pope's lines quoted above illustrate how a poet might have woven the diction of a Modern English shepherd with the objects and figures of conventional pastoral that drew attention to the Modern sensibility with which he would have understood the depictions of the shepherd's rustic existence. Pope's speaker expressed his sentiments towards the task in which he engaged in plain language that suggested the simplicity of that perspective. Pope translated the innocent pride with which a classical shepherd might have spoken of his life into colloquial speech: 'Nor blush to sport in Windsor's Plain'. This choice of words exaggerated the candor with which an Arcadian shepherd spoke which rendered his shepherd boastful. This allowed Pope to lend the coarseness to his speaker for which Rapin and Fontenelle had censured Theocritus whose shepherds displayed a

---

<sup>225</sup> Howard Erskine-Hill, ed., *Alexander Pope, World and Word* (Oxford: Oxford University Press for the British Academy, 1998), p. 1

<sup>226</sup> Alexander Pope, 'Spring Pastoral' in *The Works of Alexander Pope, Esq Vol I, With Explanatory Notes and Additions Never Before Printed* (London: Printed for B. Lintot, 1736), p. 28

similar character.<sup>227</sup> Creech's translation used such modern dress for his shepherds' speech in a manner that placed emphasis on this quality so that the clownishness of Theocritus' characters that had struck Fontenelle made Creech's anglicized rustics seem less than virtuous. Dryden had rendered such anglicized shepherds as his Mencalas in his translation of Virgil's third pastoral comic figures in a similar manner:

'Two figures on the side emboss'd appear;  
Conon, and what's his Name who made the Sphere,  
And shew'd the Seasons of the sliding Year'.<sup>228</sup>

The manner with which Mencalas referred to God, the Creator, as 'what's his Name' and His power over mortal Nature, made perceptible in the progression of the seasons, as a display of it, 'shew'd [through] the Seasons of the sliding Year' betrayed the dubious figure the English peasant posed. The words Dryden places in Mencalas' mouth lend him a coarse simplicity suggests the sinful pride with which he views himself as compared with the reverence he should feel towards God because he is unable to draw insight about his own nature as compared with that of a Being whose possesses such power. Dryden's satiric depiction revealed, then, that simplicity and candor did not always correspond to virtue.

Pope drew his example from such passages in Dryden for the manner with which he used the shepherd's descriptions of his perceptions. This allowed Pope to insinuate the simple mind betrayed in such formulations expressing how such shepherds conceived of the emblems of pastoral simplicity. Pope's Daphnis offered this description of a similar bowl to that which Mencalas described:

And I this bowl, where wanton Ivy twines,

---

<sup>227</sup> Rene Rapin, 'Discourse on Pastorals', pp. 32-33; Bernard de Bovier Fontenelle, *Of Pastorals*, p. 80

<sup>228</sup> BL C.28.f.6, p. 15 lines 60-62

And Clusters lurk beneath the curling Vines:  
Four figures rising from the Work appear,  
The various Seasons of the rowling Year;  
And what is That, which binds the Radiant Sky,  
Where twelve fair Signs in beauteous Order lie?<sup>229</sup>

Pope's use of 'wanton' and 'lurk' conveyed his shepherd's affective response to the difference he perceived between the manner through which 'Ivy' grew as compared with the 'Vines'. This revealed the intuitive sense with which a simple rustic discerned the evil present in the objects and persons of nature but the import of which he did not grasp. Through these subjective responses, Pope suggested that a simple shepherd such as Daphnis was vulnerable to corrupting influence. In doing so, however, Pope also suggested that such influence only made manifest what was inherent to men.

This method of depiction allowed Pope to use his *Pastorals* to respond to the debate about translation and the nature of poetry in which Denham and Dryden had engaged in a manner that also permitted him to examine larger claims about the literary history of England within the context of the positions of the Ancient and Moderns' in the *querelle*. Because a common priority of translation was to reproduce classical aesthetic qualities, making them available for assimilation into modern poetic possibilities, translation became central to English Augustanism, which took such works as Virgil's for its models for poetics.<sup>230</sup> This turn to imitate classical models may be seen as a form of repetition that structured modes of thought and behavior: it represented an 'attempt to impose continuity on incongruities' or an effort to reconcile the difference between the

---

<sup>229</sup> Alexander Pope, 'Spring' (1984), p. 37

<sup>230</sup> Stuart Gillespie, *English Translation and Classical Reception* (Chichester: Wiley-Blackwell, Ltd., 2011), p. 12

present and the past in sameness.<sup>231</sup> Imitation also provoked the question that divided the Ancients and the Moderns of whether a nation and its literature should replicate another historical moment or move towards a modernity that self-consciously separated itself from it.<sup>232</sup> Maintaining the sense of the original rather than a literal translation gave a newer poet the freedom to make an interpretative reading of the earlier poet's writings. That also granted the later poet the freedom to use such methods as allusion to draw upon the meaning his model had conveyed to offer his own understanding of the truth underlying the experience depicted. Pope's *Pastorals* adapted Spenser's structure of a calendar and the methods of prosody of those whom he had read to give them the form that enabled this.<sup>233</sup> Pope's 'Rural Lay' also employed sound through its diction and symmetries in syntax and rhythm that suggested the repetition, cycles, and echoes in the succession of events, season and diurnal: the pattern of its prosody mirrored the recurrences in the poetic depictions of the temporal experience of human life to which he alluded and human history itself.<sup>234</sup>

The remaking of conventions in this way allowed a later poet such as Dryden or Pope to position himself as heir to a literary inheritance and one whose contribution was to be noted for its own sake within that literary tradition. In his *Preface to Fables, Ancient and Modern*, Dryden named Chaucer to be the father of Modern English poetry, while qualifying that assertion with the comment that the English poets were to be admired for their manner of improving upon their

---

<sup>231</sup> Lorna Clymer, *Ritual, Routine, and Regime: Repetition in Early Modern British and European Cultures* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press for UCLA Center for Seventeenth and Eighteenth-Century Studies, 2006), p. 3

<sup>232</sup> See Joseph M. Levine, *The Battle of the Books: History and Literature in the Augustan Age* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1991)

<sup>233</sup> Alexander Pope, 'Essay on Pastoral', p. 33

<sup>234</sup> Pat Rogers, 'Form and Patterns in the Pastorals in *Essays on Pope* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993) 37-53 (p. 38-39, 44, and 46)



models, rather than inventing new poetry of their own.<sup>235</sup> This was the position which the Moderns held in England whose tenets were drawn from Fontenelle's praise of Theocritus, as noted. Dryden's use of modern dress to recast the Arcadian shepherd as an English rustic seemingly placed him among the Modern English pastoralists rather than the Ancients. Yet Dryden's satiric rendering of Virgil that made humorous use of Theocritus' method of depicting shepherds recalled Chaucer's techniques of parody in his *The Canterbury Tales*. This placed Dryden in relation to the lineage of Modern English poets among whom Spenser was included and to whom Marvell might be added for reasons other than Dryden's use of modern dress or the Arcadian shepherd as a central figure. Dryden's use of these in which he drew upon that of the Modern English poets to satirize that Arcadian shepherd, undercut the claims about translating pastoral values into contemporary terms upon which the Moderns' account of a national literature that attested to the persisting virtue of England was based. Through parody, Pope was likewise able to question an image of an innocence that England may have been lost or may never have existed. This gives evidence of the ideas he formed that later shaped his account of English literary history which drew upon Dryden's and remade it to offer insight of his own.

In his 'Spring' pastoral, Pope presented the two positions of Ancients and Moderns through satiric depictions of their emblems, the Arcadian shepherd of Theocritus in the character of Daphnis, on the one hand, and courtly swain of Virgil, in the figure of Strephon on the other. He rendered the Modern a comic figure through Daphnis' comments alluding to the preoccupations of the poet of that position:

Pan, let my Numbers equal Strephon's lays,

Of Parian Stone thy statue will I raise;

---

<sup>235</sup> John Dryden, 'Preface to Fables, Ancient and Modern' in *The Poems of John Dryden, Volume V, 1697-1700*, ed. by David Hopkins and Paul Hammond (Harlow, England: Pearson Longman, 2005), p. 67

But if I conquer, and through my Fold,  
Thy Parian Statue will be chang'd to Gold.<sup>236</sup>

Here Pope employed the colloquial speech of an English rustic obeying the precepts of Rapsin and Fontenelle. This gave Daphnis a character of simplicity through the manner with which he expressed his aspirations with a candor that drew attention to the naivete with which he conceived of the renown given to the gods and epic heroes. That, however, allowed Pope to insinuate the simplicity with which the Modern poet concerned himself with the points of prosody noted in Neoclassical theory in the hope of establishing his immortal fame that was not in keeping with the character of the humble shepherd.

Pope's Strephon, by contrast, offered his perceptions of his love with the sophistication of a courtly poet,

Me lovely Sylvia beckons from the Plain,  
Then hides in the Shades from her deluded Swain;  
But feigns a laugh, to see me search around,  
And by that Laugh the Willing Fair is found.<sup>237</sup>

Strephon's perceptual reasoning allowed Pope to parody the manner through which the courtly swain offered his philosophical statements about the matters of greater concern with feigned simplicity. In this manner, Pope's use of the persona the humble shepherd offered depicted a Modern attitude towards its rustic ladies through his manipulation of the country setting for irony.<sup>238</sup> Using the language of pastoral, Strephon insinuates the shrewdness with which 'Sylvia' the 'Willing Fair' 'feigns a laugh' to 'see' him, 'her deluded Swain', 'search around'. In doing so,

---

<sup>236</sup> Alexander Pope, 'Spring' (1984), p. 39

<sup>237</sup> Alexander Pope, 'Spring' (1984) p. 39

<sup>238</sup> Claudia Thomas Kairoff, 'Living on the Margin: Alexander Pope and the Rural Ideal', *Studies in the Literary Imagination* 38 (2005): 15-38, (p. 17)

however, Strephon betrays his own understanding of such ploys that is not in keeping with the simplicity of a humble shepherd. Pope thus made Strephon resemble the courtly swain to twist the words of the Ancients who used that figure to illustrate the difference between Antiquity and Modernity that marked the loss of the innocence which characterized that past age through the figure of Strephon and what his words suggest about idyllic romance in the Modern world.

The humour with which Pope masked Strephon's insights suggests how Pope crafted shepherds whose speech maintained the precepts of decorum to respond to the eighteenth-century turn to 'Virgilian discourse' in which Virgil's *Eclogues*, as much as his *Georgics*, were to be imitated to shape the literary, moral, and cultural development of the individual.<sup>239</sup> The aestheticization that enabled this transvaluation meant that the Moderns had to conform to conventions which reflected the social structures and bounds of a Golden Age that had shaped the forms of classical discourse.<sup>240</sup> Pope's adherence to such rules, however, only drew attention to the idealization that adherence required in order to give such shepherds the moral character which denoted Neoclassical pastoral. Pope's depictions, then, demonstrated how the aesthetic values underlying the rhetoric of pastoral could be made to serve one's position and in doing so, undermined the claims of both.

Pope's turn to parody the figures of the Arcadian shepherd and the courtly swain drew upon the tradition of satiric renderings of pastoral noted to examine contrasting perspectives of human experience. These differing views denoted the Ancients and Moderns varying understanding of their historical moment in relation to its inheritance. In the 'Summer' pastoral,

---

<sup>239</sup> See Kurt Heinzelman, 'Roman Georgic in the Georgian Age: A Theory of Romantic Genres', *Texas Studies in literature and Language* 33 (1991), 182-214 for a discussion of the displacement of Georgic's salient features in other genres.

<sup>240</sup> Fran de Bruyn, 'From Virgilian Discourse to Agricultural Science: An Instance of Transvaluation of Literature in Eighteenth-Century Britain' in *Augustan Subjects: Essays in Honor of Martin C. Battestin*, ed. by Albert J Rivero, (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 1997) p. 48

Alexis, the speaker, spoke as an Arcadian shepherd with the humble and candid language that again befitted a rustic:

Ye shady Beeches and ye cooling Streams,  
Defense from Phoebus, not from Cupid's beams,  
To you I mourn; nor to the Deaf I sing,  
The Woods shall answer, and their Echo ring.<sup>241</sup>

Alexis' words, though, suggested the limited perspective with which a simple shepherd understood his experience of unrequited love. His comment that 'The sultry Sirius burns the thirsty Plains, | But in my Heart eternal Winter reigns!' betrayed that he was only capable of reasoning about his desire in terms of his perceptions of his sensory experiences.<sup>242</sup> Although that manner through which Alexis conceived of love suggested that he was innocent of intention, such sentiments also betrayed his fallen condition which precluded the moral innocence in all men that was a consequence of Adam and Eve's original sin in the Garden of Eden.

The limited understanding which Pope gave to Alexis allowed Pope to consider the reasoning underlying the Modern position about the connection between such depictions suggesting innocence and the delight they elicited. Alexis struggled to comprehend why his plaint did not win his desired love: 'My Numbers please the Sylvan Throng; | Rough Satyrs dance, and Pan attends the Song'.<sup>243</sup> His words voiced the Moderns view that the conventions of prosody were the source of delight pastoral elicited because they lent that aesthetic character of simplicity which reflected the innocence with which the shepherd perceived human experience. To Amaryllis, he

---

<sup>241</sup> Alexander Pope, 'Summer: or The Second Pastoral or Alexis' in *The Last and Greatest Art: Some Unpublished Poetical Manuscripts of Alexander Pope*, trans and ed by Maynard Mack (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 1984), p. 43

<sup>242</sup> Alexander Pope, 'Summer', p. 43

<sup>243</sup> Alexander Pope, 'Summer', p. 44

admitted, though, that ‘For you all the Swains their choicest Flow’rs design, | And in one Garland all their Beauties joyn’.<sup>244</sup> This conceded that prosody to which he alludes through reference to a poets’ diction as ‘their choicest Flow’rs design’, and their arrangement in a line of rhyme and meter which ‘in one Garland joyn’, was not sufficient despite the lyric quality it gave to evoke the aesthetic impressions of loveliness which were the source of the pleasure of reading pastoral.

In the ‘Autumn’ pastoral that followed, then, Pope illustrated how the beauties of prosody and poetics might be combined to elicit feeling that drew upon the notion of the innocence of an idealized past which characterized the pastoral of the Ancients. Here, his speaker expressed the subjective meaning his perceptions of the pastoral setting held for him:

In Flow’rs that languish when forsook by Spring,  
Ye birds that cease when Summer’s past to sing,  
Ye Trees that fade when Autumn Heats remove,  
Say, is not Absence Death to those who love?<sup>245</sup>

The bittersweet quality that Pope gave to the speaker’s expressions of the grief, which colored his perceptions of the absence of nature’s beauty, made palpable this means through which men apprehended the loss of love because of the sentiments sensory experience evoked. Pope turned to Augustan art for an example in which the use of emblems possessing typological qualities connected ideals of measure, rationality, and organic structure to lend a purity and refinement to an expression of emotion that threatened to overwhelm.<sup>246</sup> Through this, Pope’s pastoral illustrates how the affective power of pastoral arose because it captured such feeling in a manner

---

<sup>244</sup> Alexander Pope, ‘Summer’, p. 44

<sup>245</sup> Alexander Pope, ‘Autumn: The Third Pastoral, or Hylas and Aegon’ in *The Last Greatest Art: Some Unpublished Poetical Manuscripts of Alexander Pope*, trans. and ed. by Maynard Mack (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 1984), p. 51

<sup>246</sup> Mario Citroni, ‘The Concept of the Classical and the Canons of Model Authors in Roman Literature’ in *The Classical Traditions of Greece and Rome*, ed. by J. I. Porter (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2006), p. 227, 234, and 238

that was thought to characterize the Augustan sublime. The irony Pope lent to the final line, though, insinuated the dubiousness of the Moderns contention that the sublime allowed men of a simplicity of thought and feeling to attain knowledge of human life because the affective state it induced aided their understanding.

This kind of knowledge also distinguished the satiric renderings of pastoral to which Pope turned for a model in that of the Ancients and Moderns. Working through that reasoning underlying both methods of depicting human experience allowed Pope to reflect upon the understanding of human history implied in the positions about the pastoral of each. At the close of Pope's 'Winter' pastoral, Meliboeus says:

Thy Songs, dear Thyrsis, more delight my mind.

Than the soft Musick of the breathing Wind [...]

When teeming Ewes increase my fleecy Breed,

To Thee, bright Daphne, oft' a Lamb shall bleed.

While Vapours rise, and driving Snows descend,

Thy Honor, Name and Praise, shall never end!<sup>247</sup>

His words alluded to the literary value upon which the Moderns' account of the history of pastoral was based: that the pastoral of note possessed an aesthetic character which bore witness to the persisting moral virtue it represented in the image it painted of the shepherd that continued to inhabit England. The pun suggested in pairing 'mind' with 'Wind' in the first couplet insinuated the impressions to be drawn from such Moderns' use of prosody to which Meliboeus was insensible.

---

<sup>247</sup> Alexander Pope, 'Winter: The Fourth Pastoral, or Daphne' in *The Last and Greatest Art: Some Unpublished Poetical Manuscripts of Alexander Pope*, trans. and ed. by Maynard Mack (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 1984) p. 61

Through Strephon's reply, Pope conveyed the greater truth that eluded Meliboeus: 'Sharp Boreas blows, & Nature feels Decay; | Time conquers all, and we must Time obey!'<sup>248</sup> This suggestion that the moments in which pastoral captured the sentiment appropriate to it pass expressed the literary value upon which alternate accounts of the history of pastoral were premised. That notion was central to the Ancients' account of that history which was founded upon the belief that the pastoral of Antiquity possessed a quality derived from the Ancient ideals it represented. This admission which Pope uttered through the voice of Strephon echoed the Ancients' position, however, that those ideals were irretrievable in their historical present and only served as a means by which to measure it. In doing so, it suggested the knowledge Pope gained of how this understanding of one's literary inheritance framed the manner through which one might fashion the context in which one's own writing was read. A turn to Pope's *Essay on Pastorals* will reveal how that knowledge shaped the way in which Pope conceived of the history of pastoral to which he appended these.

### **A Satiric Account in Pope's *Essay on Pastorals***

The 1704 manuscript itself suggested the reason Pope provided a preface to his *Pastorals* entitled *Essay on Pastorals*. In his manuscript, Pope made use of such features of a printed text as various fonts and footnotes.<sup>249</sup> This allowed him to structure the manner through which a reader would respond to the ideas about pastoral presented in a manner that also betrayed the intention with which Pope offered the *Essay* as a set of propositions to frame the reception of his pastorals of his acquaintances among whom the two compositions circulated. Pope's manuscript resembled Creech's translation of Theocritus' *Idylliums*, which was prefaced with his translation of Rapin's *Discourse on Pastorals*, and Dryden's translation of Virgil's *Pastorals*, which

---

<sup>248</sup> Alexander Pope, 'Winter', p. 61

<sup>249</sup> Maynard Mack, 'The Pastorals', p. 19

Knighly Chetwood's defense against Fontenelle preceded.<sup>250</sup> Pope's annotation in his copies of both works, as noted, bears the evidence of the methods he gleaned from them in the references he makes to the statements of their authors in his *Essay*. Pope's *Essay*, however, did not appear with the first publication of his *Pastorals* in Tonson's *Poetical Miscellanies*. The *Essay* first appeared in a revised form under the title *Discourse on Pastorals* in *The Works of Alexander Pope* (1717) when the intervening years since his contribution of satiric essays about pastoral in *The Guardian* made its publication more appropriate.<sup>251</sup> The *Essay* gave evidence in both its original manuscript form and the printed text in 1717 though that Pope's thoughts had already turned to consider what place he might fashion for himself in the history of English poetry.

In the first few lines of his *Essay*, Pope offered a liberal translation of the assertion with which Rapin's began his philosophical discourse, *Discourse on Pastorals*, to lend a humorous skepticism to it: 'And as the Feeding of Flocks seems to have been the first Employment of Mankind; the most Ancient sort of Poetry was probably Pastoral'.<sup>252</sup> This idea was key to the theory of pastoral of Rapin who claimed that the delight derived from reading pastoral depictions was based upon this claim that its central figure, the shepherd, was emblematic of the innocent character of the culture during the Golden Age. Pope, however, offered a caveat that betrayed the false premise on which that claim was made. Pope suggested that 'The Original of Poesie is attributed to that Age of Innocence which succeeded the Creation of the World'.<sup>253</sup> Pope's comment insinuated the dubiousness with which he viewed the circumstances in which pastoral

---

<sup>250</sup> Hurd Library, *The Idylliums of Theocritus*; Knightley Chetwood, "'Preface to Pastorals", with a Defense of Virgil Against Some of the Reflexions of Monsieur Fontenelle' in *The works of Virgil containing his Pastorals, Georgics and Aeneis : adorn'd with a hundred sculptures, translated into English verse by Mr. Dryden* (London : Printed for Jacob Tonson, 1697), pp. 21-32

<sup>251</sup> E. Audra and Aubrey Williams, 'Introduction' in *Pastoral Poetry and An Essay on Criticism*, eds. E. Audra and Aubrey Williams (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1961), p. 13-15

<sup>252</sup> Alexander Pope, 'Essay on Pastoral', p. 25

<sup>253</sup> Alexander Pope, 'Essay on Pastoral', p. 25



poetry was thought to have been invented. Rapin reasoned that the aesthetic character that reflected the nature of the society which those first of men were thought to have enjoyed was given expression in the leisure that prompted them to pastoral song. Pope's comment drew attention to the state of innocence in which those first of men, shepherds, lived, though Rapin credits them with the sufficient complexity of reason necessary to devising songs that resemble poetry. The irony of that reasoning to which Pope drew attention subtly framed his satiric response to the precepts of Neoclassical pastoral theory and its judgments that followed.

Pope's *Essay* offered his own account in a parodic rendering of a discourse on pastoral by such Neoclassicists as Rapin and Fontenelle. A key feature of this example of Pope's early writing which satirized those who took pride in the state of current learning was the impression of his independence from power or patronage it gave to make his unimpeachable life underwrite the ethical truth of his writing'.<sup>254</sup> The *Essay's* manner enacted what the two authors recommended to be the beauties of pastoral to lend it the simplicity to suggest that Pope possessed the moral character which corresponded to such aesthetic impressions. Pope wrote of pastoral,

The fable simple. The Manners not too polite, nor yet too rustic: In  
Order to a just Preservation of which, they are represented  
according to the Genius of the Golden Age. Conformable to the  
Manners, the Thoughts are plain and pure; yet admit a little  
Quickness and Passion, but that short and flowing. The Expression  
humble, yet as pure as the language will afford: neat, but not  
exquisite; easy, but yet lively. In short, the Fable, Manner

---

<sup>254</sup> Brean Hammond, *Pope Amongst the Satirists 1660-1750* (Tavistock: Northcote House Publishers, Ltd, 2005), p. 31 and 66

Thoughts, and Expressions are full of the greatest Simplicity in  
Nature.<sup>255</sup>

Pope's language above rendered Rapin and Fontenelle's dictims natural and with a delicacy that lent them the aesthetic character which the theorists attributed to pastoral because of the delight it elicited. Pope's writing though feigned a candor that suggested the sophistication of a cultured poet who assumed the guise of a primitive poet. Pope added,

If we design to copy Nature, it may be useful to take this  
Consideration along with us; that Pastoral properly belongs to the  
Golden Age [...] a Pastoral ought to preserve some Relish of the  
Ancient Way of Writing. For which Reason the Connexions  
shou'd be loose; the Narrations and Descriptions little; and the  
Periods short'.<sup>256</sup>

The irony with which Pope used the same simple language he had to express his aesthetic judgments to then communicate that which such theorists as Rapin and Fontenelle had deduced to be the methods through which the Ancients had conveyed the simplicity they attributed to pastoral. The language Pope used to communicate these insights – 'conneexions ... loose', 'Narrations and Descriptions little', and 'Periods short' – was of a simplicity which offered proof that they were also the result of simple reasoning arising from simple perceptions. This allowed him to imbue his words with an irony and obliquely suggest that which should be inferred from Rapin and Fontenelle's claims: that the simple speech which reflected the character of the Golden Age precluded communicating complex insights. This flouted the Neoclassical precept that the decorum maintained in such writing should be appropriate to the subject and station of

---

<sup>255</sup> Alexander Pope, 'Essay on Pastoral', p. 27

<sup>256</sup> Alexander Pope, 'Essay on Pastoral', p. 27

the shepherd-speaker. Much like his *Pastorals* themselves, Pope's *Essay* emulated the demeanor of a simple rustic to illustrate the shrewdness with which such rhetoric could be employed to undercut its principles.

Pope's *Essay* illustrated, then, how a creative response to the verse of earlier poets served as a generative moment for critical reflection upon one's literary inheritance. In his *Essay*, Pope examined that heritage in terms of those judgments made that were based upon the prevailing literary values derived from the writings of antiquity, and so, shaped his contemporaries' accounts of the place they gave to their compositions within it. In doing so, Pope satirized the pretensions of both those authors and the philosophers Rapin and Fontenelle to whose works they referred in a manner that suggested the origins of his ridicule of the learned in his letter in *The Spectator* in 1712 and *The Dunciad*.<sup>257</sup> Pope's *Essay* suggested the classical and biblical origins of the notion of innocence which underlay pastoral's depiction of the shepherd. Within this context, Pope delineated the actions of a shepherd which illustrated his moral character within the ideas about rural life in England used in Modern pastoral to denote its virtues. Thus, Pope wrote that poets 'should give the shepherds ... an Air of Piety to the Gods which is so visibly diffus'd thro' all the Works of Antiquity, [and] shou'd shine throughout the poem': this, when combined with a knowledge of farming, demonstrated the shepherd's interrelationship with nature that was in keeping with that moral virtue.<sup>258</sup> These comments reflected Pope's readings of Creech's and Dryden's translations in which he had marked such lines as those in which Dryden had refashioned conventions in the New Testament using colloquial speech to give Virgil's shepherds the appearance of English rustics. Pope's comments used this kind of allusion

---

<sup>257</sup> Dustin Griffin, *Authorship in the Long Eighteenth Century* (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 2014), p. 131

<sup>258</sup> Alexander Pope, 'Essay on Pastoral', p. 27

to such reading that had acquainted him with the *querelle* between the Ancients and the Moderns to situate his *Essay* within it.

The feigned earnestness with which Pope's *Essay* spoke placed emphasis on the attention Rapin and Fontenelle paid to prosody and other means of characterizing the shepherd. Dryden had employed these methods to exaggerate the shepherd's mannerisms in a way that drew attention to the affective responses such methods elicited. The *Essay* showed Pope to be, in Dustin Griffin's useful phrase, a 'conscious pastoralist' who knew his Pastorals resembled Virgil's, Spenser's, and Dryden's in what it demonstrated about the generic possibilities available when illustrating a 'Golden Age' theory of pastoral.<sup>259</sup> Though Pope noted Dryden's praise of Spenser as the best among Modern pastoralists, Pope suggested that Spenser had drawn his influence, as many Moderns did, from Theocritus, to whom he compared Spenser because of his use of dialect.<sup>260</sup> In doing so, Pope betrayed his opinion of Rapin and Fontenelle's reasoning that underlay their aesthetic judgments as both theorists had censured Theocritus for the use of such language that gave his shepherds a coarseness. Pope borrowed the language of the two theorists to refashion the conventional statements about how pastoral evoked delight to draw attention to the meaning to be derived from them which eluded the Neoclassicists because of their focus on points of prosody. Pope reasoned that if the delight Ancient pastoral elicited was because it copied nature, to do so required that pastoral poets represented such Golden Age shepherds as they were conceived to be, rather than as they were in his present day.<sup>261</sup>

Pope insinuated doubt as to whether the subjective response to pastoral, then, did not betray the consciousness that such shepherds represented an idealized notion of men an example

---

<sup>259</sup> Dustin Griffin, *Regaining Paradise: Milton and the Eighteenth Century* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1986), p. 64

<sup>260</sup> Alexander Pope, 'Essay on Pastoral', p. 27 and 33

<sup>261</sup> Alexander Pope, 'Essay on Pastoral', p. 27

of which could not be found and may have never existed. Pope also offered judgments of the Ancients as evidence of that illusion necessary to the pleasure pastoral gave. He noted the defective manners of Theocritus' swains who used 'abusive and immodest language'.<sup>262</sup> He also drew attention to Virgil's imitation of Theocritus which 'only wanted simplicity' for which Pope faulted 'Virgil's age' and 'propriety of style' because of its 'language'.<sup>263</sup> These comments offered context for his discussion of his turn to Spenser as a model for his own *Pastorals*. He noted several points of Neoclassical theory in which Spenser failed to emulate the example of the Ancients to provide that context within which he suggested that Spenser had copied Theocritus whose use of dialect Spenser had adopted but to which he proved inferior.

Each of these failings that Pope emphasized in his account of pastoral were a method that was key to the satiric character of the verse he discussed and from whom he drew influence, as discussed in the previous section. His method of parodying pastoral simplicity undermined those precepts from which the Ancients and Moderns derived their positions, which drew attention to the form of rhetoric they employed in the *querelle*. Through their discourse about such methods, eighteenth-century commentators had formed a connection between pastoral criticism and the traditional theory of the 'natural man' and his innate virtue that had gained popularity in the period.<sup>264</sup> Much of eighteenth-century discourse about pastoral noted what Alastair Fowler has referred to as the genre's metaphoric properties which evoked the 'the genre's mental set' through the use of the elements of Ancient exemplars to call to mind the associations from which readers derived the sense of *otium*.<sup>265</sup> That method drew attention to how a shepherd's manner of

---

<sup>262</sup> Alexander Pope, 'Essay on Pastoral', p. 31

<sup>263</sup> Alexander Pope, 'Essay on Pastoral', p. 33

<sup>264</sup> James Sambrook, *English Pastoral Poetry* (Boston: Twayne Publishers, 1983), p. 98

<sup>265</sup> Alastair Fowler, 'The Formation of Genre in the Renaissance and After', *New Literary History* 34 (2003): 185-200 (p. 190-92 and 194-95)

expression illustrated the habits of mind that betrayed the ideals within which he interpreted his subjective responses to his experiences, which, in turn, revealed the shepherd's moral character. The Moderns claim to an aesthetic sensibility that found the prosody through which pastoral conveyed this character delightful was meant to suggest that they possessed a similar moral virtue.

Imitating that method of parodying the rhetoric of such men allowed Pope to apprehend what it implied about the men who employed it. The exaggerated simplicity conveyed in the plainness of speech and seeming openness with which Pope explained their observations enabled him to see the flawed reasoning underlying their assertions because of the irony that was inherent to it. His *Essay* demonstrated that such frankness connoted the simple mind who betrayed the speciousness with which such men were required to lend their speech the candor of a shepherd to shape impressions of the truth. Frank Kermode has written that pastoral, like satire, belonged to a base style because according to the notion of decorum of Neoclassical theory in which the provincialisms and archaisms such as those found in Spenser may also evoke delight through flattery and inveighing.<sup>266</sup> Pope's method of parody the Modern English poets employed made palpable the cultured poet's pretensions to a sophistication that denoted the modern sensibility with which, according to Knightley Chetwood, they judged such simplicity of the Arcadian shepherd.<sup>267</sup>

In rendering such theorists as comic figures then, Pope illustrated how their use of rhetoric only undermined the illusion inherent to the Neoclassical account of literary history. Pope's satiric rendering of a Neoclassical discourse on pastoral allowed him to examine his literary inheritance in terms of the idealized image derived from the pastoral ideal of the

---

<sup>266</sup> Frank Kermode, *English Pastoral Poetry*, p. 30

<sup>267</sup> Knightley Chetwood, 'Preface to Pastorals', p. 22

simplicity that corresponded to moral innocence within which his contemporaries understood their society. His parody enabled him to work through the reasoning that the successful translation of this Ancient pastoral ideal into Modern English mannerisms and speech illustrated the persistence of such virtue throughout their nation's history to their present day.

In applying those methods of satire to his *Essay*, Pope demonstrated the ways in which they could be made to elicit subjective responses which enabled one to see the assumptions necessary to the Neoclassical account of the history of pastoral based upon the literary value of its aesthetic character of simplicity and its implications. This, in turn, shaped his ideas of the nature of pastoral through what it enacted: it enabled the discovery of moral character through what it betrayed about a poet's use of aesthetic qualities to shape impressions through the social values those qualities suggested. This knowledge Pope gained allowed him to conceive of his literary inheritance in terms of the literary value of the greater truth to be discovered in the understanding attained through the subjective meaning of the pastoral of which his discussion consisted. It also permitted him to realize the nature of the literary debates in which his writings participated and the implications of how his fellow authors chose to wage that *querelle* for how literary history would come to be understood. A turn to *The Guardian's* essays about pastoral to which Pope responded in essays of his own will demonstrate this.

### **Satirizing the Pastoral Poet in Pope's *The Guardian* Essays**

*The Guardian's* essays first appeared in half-sheets, Mondays through Saturdays from 12 March to 1 October 1712, through the publisher Jacob Tonson, Junior as a more politically-inflected sequel to *The Spectator*—a joint effort between Sir Richard Steele and Joseph Addison.<sup>268</sup> In his 'Publisher to the Reader', Steele alluded to the difference among the contributors which had

---

<sup>268</sup> John Calhoun Stephens, ed., *The Guardian* (Lexington: University of Kentucky Press, 1982), p. 2-3

spurred them to write the essays contained therein.<sup>269</sup> The uncertainty about the authorship of each essay that would aide a study of how they were used to wage the war of Ancients and Moderns has remained unresolved.<sup>270</sup> Pope's letter to John Caryll in 1712 alluded to a project with which he was involved with Steele which has thought to have been *The Guardian*.<sup>271</sup> Steele credited Pope with the authorship of Essays 4, 61, 78, 91, 92, and 193 as well as having had a hand in 'some others'.<sup>272</sup> Each of those essays addressed the character of an author, the various forms of genre, and its enthusiasts. Essays 91 and 92 satirized the members of the Kit-Kat Club who expressed their position in their poetry which conformed to ideas about Neoclassical pastoral and its central figure, the Arcadian shepherd. Several of the essays delineated a theory of pastoral that suggested that its domestication lent the genre's classical subject matter social relevance as they demonstrated how the principles of Neoclassical pastoral might be used to illustrate the persisting virtue of the Englishman through the manner and character with which its figures expressed their perceptions. This, as Brean Hammond has noted, was employed to cultivate a Whig cultural politics of politeness rather than a testament to the libertarian principles of the Glorious Revolution.<sup>273</sup>

Essay no. 40 has commonly been credited to Pope as well because of the tone it took in its defense of Pope's verse as compared with his rival Philips whom several members of the Kit Kat Club promoted.<sup>274</sup> Essay no. 40 responded to Essays nos. 22 and 23 which have been thought to have been written by Steele, Tickell, or Philipps himself—each a leading member of

---

<sup>269</sup> See 'Publisher to the Reader' in *The Guardian*, ed. by John Calhoun Stephens (1982), p. 75

<sup>270</sup> See Norma Ault, ed., *The Prose Works of Alexander Pope, Vol 1* (1936) and John Calhoun Stephens edition of *The Guardian* noted above for their discussions about attribution.

<sup>271</sup> George Sherburn, ed., *Correspondence*, i, 156

<sup>272</sup> See 'Publisher to the Reader' in *The Guardian* (1982), p. 75

<sup>273</sup> Brean S. Hammond, *Professional Imaginative Writing in England 1670-1740: 'Hackney for Bread'* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1997), p. 250-52

<sup>274</sup> John Calhoun Stephens, ed, *The Guardian*, 26; Valerie Rumbold, 'Appendix' in *The Dunciad in Four Books*, ed. by Valerie Rumbold (Harlow: Pearson Education, Ltd. 1999), p. 376



the Kit Kat Club, and among the circle of Whigs who turned to Neoclassical pastoral as part of a programme to build a native Whig canon that served as evidence of the persisting strength and virtue of England's national character.<sup>275</sup> The essays offered parodic renderings of pastoral essays such as that of Rapin and Fontenelle delivered with the seeming simplicity of expression and candor of an English gentleman turned amateur philosopher and pastoral theorist. Essay no. 22 began with allusion to both Spenser's *The Faerie Queene* and Shakespeare's *The Tempest*, whom Dryden and Pope's contemporaries that espoused the positions of the Moderns had noted to be prominent figures in the development of England's national literature. To introduce the reader to the genre, the speaker explained,

PASTORAL Poetry not only amuses the Fancy the most  
delightfully, but is likewise more indebted to it than any other sort  
whatsoever. It transports us to a kind of Fairy Land, where our  
Ears our soothed with the Melody of Birds, bleating Flocks, and  
purling Streams; our Eyes enchanted with flowery Meadows and  
springing Greens; we are laid under cool Shades, and entertained  
with all the Sweets and Enchantments of Nature. It is a Dream, 'tis  
a Vision, which we wish may be real, and we believe that it is  
true.<sup>276</sup>

This beginning placed emphasis on the idealized character of pastoral to frame what followed in which the speaker insinuated that the illusion the elements of pastorals were used to fashion induced a delusive affective state of delight that rendered the reader's judgments questionable. This offered a context for the speaker's biased account of Fontenelle's judgments upon which the

---

<sup>275</sup> See John Nichols's Note to Essay 22 in *The Guardian*, Printed for John Nichol (1789)

<sup>276</sup> 'Essay no. 22' in *The Guardian* (1982), 105-107 (p. 105)

Moderns' position that using modern dress to translate the social values underlying the aesthetic values of Ancient pastoral demonstrated their persistence in the eighteenth century.

Pope's speaker adopted an easy tone that gave his essay the kind of colloquial character which elicited the impression of coarseness. Fontenelle had first attributed such clownishness to Theocritus which lent the comic effect to the pastorals of Spenser and Dryden who imitated it, as noted. In Essay no. 40, the speaker's blunt judgment of the simplicity 'necessary in the Character of Shepherds ... [as] Their Minds must be supposed so rude and uncultivated, that nothing but what is plain and unaffected can come from them' served as preface to excerpts from Philips' pastoral.<sup>277</sup> The passage Pope noted illustrated how such lack of perception could be attributed to the poet through his manner of depiction. The speaker reasoned,

'Those who have little Experience, or cannot abstract, deliver their Sentiments in plain Descriptions, by Circumstances, and those Observations, which either strike upon the Senses, or are the first Motions of the Mind ... [and] gives more Pleasure, and soothe us more naturally.'<sup>278</sup>

The essays resembled Pope's *Essay in Pastoral* in their turn to feign a character of simplicity to offer such simple perceptions of the character of pastoral, its methods and effects, and its enthusiasts. This the speaker performed with pretended innocence that reminded of the cultured poet's guise of a primitive one to suggest the import of such observations about pastoral. In doing so, the essays satirized the men who employed rhetoric to persuade that the mannerisms of

---

<sup>277</sup> 'Essay No. 23' in *The Guardian*, ed by John Calhoun Stephens (Lexington: University of Kentucky Press, 1982), pp. 107-109 (p. 107)

<sup>278</sup> 'Essay No. 23', p. 108

the Arcadian shepherd made his character evident. This, in turn, allowed him to insinuate the absence of such virtue in such men themselves.

Pope's response of Essay no. 40 to Essays nos. 22 and 23 responded in kind and adopted the mannerisms of speech and tone of the other two essays. Valerie Rumbold has written that Pope's ironic praise of Philips served as a pretext for asserting his own conception of genre to respond to the political agendas underlying the debate among *The Guardian's* contributors about pastoral.<sup>279</sup> Pope's reply drew upon the tension between imaginative sympathy and moral judgment suggested in the ideas of 'imagination' and 'fancy' in the two essays to depict 'the tragi-comedy of man's pride and self-deception' in its demonstration of how the faculty's operations may be either 'inspired or mad'.<sup>280</sup> This allowed Pope to suggest the error which arises from the delusive affective state Neoclassical pastoral induces in its theorists to suggest a different concept of pastoral within which to assess his in relation to that of Philips.

In Essay 40, Pope referred to Rapin and Fontenelle's pastoral theory to delineate the points of their model for pastoral within which his pastorals were considered to have been of the tradition of Virgil's *Eclogues* and within which the Ancients wrote. He draws attention to Virgil's 'too Courtly a Stile' that caused one to

have frequently wonder'd that ... he had not imitated the Rusticity  
of the Doric, as well, by the help of the old obsolete Roman  
Language as Philips hath by the antiquated English ... by which  
Means he [might have] attained as much of the Air of Theocritus,  
as Philips of Spencer.<sup>281</sup>

---

<sup>279</sup> Valerie Rumbold, 'Appendix', p. 376

<sup>280</sup> David Fairer, *Pope's Imagination* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1984), p. 6

<sup>281</sup> 'Essay No. 40' in *The Guardian* (1982), pp. 160-165 (p. 160-61)

With this, Pope introduced examples from Philips as compared with excerpts from his own to illustrate 'the standard of pastoral'. His choices made clear how this standard served as a way of reducing complex perceptions across similar passages to simplicity:

Phil. Come, Rosalind, O come; here shady bowers  
Here are cool Fountains, and here springing Flow'rs,  
Come, Rosalind, here let us stay,  
And sweetly wast, our live-long Time away.

Pope Sylvia's like Autumn ripe, yet mild as May,  
More bright than noon, yet fresh as early Day;  
Ev'n Spring displeases, when she shines not here.  
But blest with her, 'tis Spring throughout the Year.<sup>282</sup>

In presenting the contrast between their manners of expression, Pope suggested the inanity with which Philips rendered the Arcadian shepherd of an innocent character to satisfy the precepts of Neoclassical theory which the Moderns had adopted. Pope's observations, by contrast, demonstrated the insight to be derived from the reasoning of the cultured poet who represented the courtly swain that only feigned the simplicity of the shepherd.

Pope's examples drawn from both Philips' and his pastorals offered the basis for his critical observations and prescriptions about pastoral. The quotation he used illustrated the manner through which the methods of prosody the Moderns employed could be made to give pastoral the comic effect of parody as seen in Spenser's pastorals. Pope conceded how Philips' verse satisfied the criteria according to which Modern writing such as that of his and his model Spenser was deemed to be pastoral. In demonstrating, though, how the shepherd might be given

---

<sup>282</sup> 'Essay No. 40', p. 162

such a simplicity of nature that he only evokes pleasure because he was unable to communicate his sexual desires without betraying his less than virtuous intentions, Pope undermined the claims of the Moderns as to the reason for such renderings. This allowed Pope to allude to the parodic character of such writing which denoted the tradition of Modern English pastoral to which it was attributed, while positioning his verse within such a concept that maintained the premises upon which the *querelle* between the Ancients and Moderns were based.

To this, Pope added Essays nos. 91 and 92 which satirized the members of the Kit Kat Club that espoused the position of the Moderns. In the form of epistles written to the fictitious publisher Nestor Ironside, Pope delineated each of the rules of the Short Club. He prefaced such a creed though with this reasoning for the Club's existence that 'concerning Persons in low Circumstances of Stature, that their Littleness would hardly be taken Notice of, if they did not manifest a Consciousness of it themselves in all their Behaviour'.<sup>283</sup> Much of the essays consisted in demonstrating how the Neoclassical rules concerning poetry to which the members of the Kit Kat Club conformed might be translated into those according to which one might define a position and, in doing so, an identity. Pope mocked such methods by defining the rules of the Short Club in which the physical person and speech and mannerisms of the Club's members made tangible the precept that the character of simplicity of pastoral could be conveyed through conciseness and brevity of expression. Pope's persona Bob Short explained to Nestor, 'We began by sending Invitations to those of a Stature not exceeding five Foot'.<sup>284</sup> Short also reported that they elected Dick Distick, 'a little poet, a little politician, and a little hero', president of the Short Club because of his undertaking of 'a long Work in short Verse to

---

<sup>283</sup> 'Essay No. 91' in *The Guardian* (1982), 325-27 (p. 325)

<sup>284</sup> 'Essay No. 92' in *The Guardian* (1982), 325-27 (p. 326)

celebrate the Heroes of our Size'.<sup>285</sup> The name played upon the distiche or the couplet that consisted of a self-contained statement rendered in two lines of verse.<sup>286</sup> The essays suggested how such precepts could be applied to make palpable the values and character of their proponents through their manner of behavior expressing them.

This allowed Pope to undermine the claims about the methods of versification through which the adherence to the decorum of pastoral were made to illustrate the virtues of its representative figure of the Arcadian shepherd. That permitted Pope to question this basis for the accounts of Modern English pastoral premised upon the idea that Ancient pastoral values could be conveyed using contemporary colloquial speech and mannerisms to characterize Modern England in terms of those virtues to be observed among its inhabitants. Pope's essays offered reason to doubt the impressions the Kit Kat Club fashioned of themselves through the precepts of the Moderns they expressed in their writing. In doing so, though, they also gave reason to question any who crafted impressions of their character through the story they told of their literary inheritance to which they appended their names. These satiric essays offered Pope the means through which he learned what concerns presented themselves to those who aspired to re-fashion accounts of the history of England's literature and the country itself through it. It is with this understanding he gained that he turned to his poetic renderings of history as a look at his *Messiah* and *Windsor Forest* will show.

### **Re-writing History in Pope's *Messiah* and *Windsor Forest***

Pope's *Messiah* and *Windsor Forest* were first composed at a moment of uncertainty for England following the prosperity under Anne which had succeeded a second period of revolution under the Stuarts in the latter part of the seventeenth century. *Messiah* was first published in *The*

---

<sup>285</sup> 'Essay No. 92', p. 328

<sup>286</sup> 'distich', *Oxford English Dictionary* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2020)

*Spectator* in 1712.<sup>287</sup> Extant manuscripts of the poem have not been uncovered, making it difficult to determine whether the text had circulated in manuscript prior to publication. Parts of a manuscript of *Windsor Forest* held at Washington University and Harvard's Houghton Library have been dated to 1712 prior to its publication in 1713.<sup>288</sup> The manuscript consists of a title page on a half-sheet and four sheets of folio to make sixteen pages of text consisting of twenty-four lines each written in Pope's formal hand with marginal additions in an informal cursive script. The design of the manuscript suggests that it, much like his manuscript of his *Pastorals* and *Essay on Pastorals*, may have been intended for circulation to solicit the responses of his acquaintances and patrons who then contributed to the marginal additions he appended. Pope's correspondence offers evidence of this. Pope's letter to Caryll in November 1712 referred to the difficulties he had encountered while writing and preparing it for publication because lines of his verse resembled that of Tickell's treatment of the subject of trade in his poem, while letters on 5 December to Caryll and in January 1713 to Lansdowne confirmed that both had seen Pope's.<sup>289</sup> Pat Rogers has suggested that the changes made to the manuscript before publication noted in Robert Schmidt's study of it reflect Pope's efforts to rethink the political import of the pastoral sections, as he recast his earlier poem to fit the needs of the Peace of Utrecht at the end of 1712 or early 1713.<sup>290</sup> On 2 November 1713, Addison had written to Pope concerning prose of his and suggested that he not content himself with half the nation, to which Pope responded in letter dated to December 1713, confirmed his authorship of the *Guardian* essays for which he was

---

<sup>287</sup> Alexander Pope, 'Messiah' in *The Spectator, Volume the First* (Printed for Peter Wilson, 1755) p. 240-243

<sup>288</sup> Robert Schmidt, *Pope's Windsor Forest 1712: A study of the Washington University Holograph*, (St. Louis, MO: Washington University, 1952)

<sup>289</sup> George Sherburn, ed., *Correspondence*, i, pp. 163-64 and 172

<sup>290</sup> Pat Rogers, *Pope and the Destiny of the Stuarts: History, Politics, and Mythology in the Age of Queen Anne* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005), p. 19-20

‘suspected of being a Whig’.<sup>291</sup> Both *Messiah* and *Windsor Forest* reflected Pope’s later turn to a pastoral mode of interpreting the past to respond in part to that historical present. Both poems drew upon the manner through which earlier authors, as Joseph Hone has recently argued, ‘constructed Anne’s right to the throne [which] implied a stance on the future succession’ to capture the ‘nostalgia’ for the ‘Golden Age’ with which England anticipated Anne’s accession.<sup>292</sup> This enabled Pope’s critical reflection in which poetic forms served as a means of examining the meaning beneath the uncertainty with which England was once again afflicted.

For Pope, the literary past not only told a story of the development of literature in England. The history of literature also told the history of civilization. Pope’s later pastoral writings, *Messiah* and *Windsor Forest*, suggested this in the methods he derived from his readings of the writings of such authors as Virgil, Spenser, and Dryden. The three poets employed satiric devices, in similar ways to Marvell, to examine their historical moments within a context constructed from the literary conventions which had been used to capture the character of their pasts. In Virgil’s fourth eclogue and Dryden’s translation of it entitled *Pollio*, Pope read the meaning of the historical circumstances in which England found itself in their turn to measure their historical moments which presented the occasions for their writing. Dryden’s argument that prefaced *Pollio* noted that ‘many of the verses are translated from one of the prophecies of the Sybils, who prophesie our Savior’s birth’.<sup>293</sup> The Sybils of the Oracle of Delphi had made several prophecies which were believed to be about Jesus Christ who was born at the beginning of the first century anno domini. Dryden’s reference to them then offers the context for his eclogue which re-interpreted Virgil’s, both of which are written in a manner that

---

<sup>291</sup> George Sherburn, ed., *Correspondence*, i, pp. 196-98

<sup>292</sup> Joseph Hone, *Literature and Party Politics at the Accession of Queen Anne* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2017), p 5, 170, and 172

<sup>293</sup> BL C.28.f.6, ‘Pollio’, p. 17



gives reason to consider their historical circumstances that would occasion the coming of such a king.

These pastorals represented the kind of interpretative mode of reading which reflected a shared way of perceiving in the structures of grammar embedded in its habits, modes, and conventions both Virgil and Dryden derived from reading Theocritus.<sup>294</sup> The conventions of such a mode demonstrated how the imitative habits of writing they developed shaped their understanding of their historical present within the ideals of pastoral simplicity and virtue. Such habits, modes, and conventions provided their accounts of history with the form or set of regulative ideas and what persisted as a determinate reference when the content ascribed to a specific political and cultural context was removed.<sup>295</sup> Their historical allegories characterized the emperor and his action in terms of the responses from and the effect upon the natural world as might be expected of a god. Virgil drew upon the prophecy and biblical conventions to reflect upon the Pax Romana of Augustus during the first century BC within the ideas about a golden age in which ancient shepherds of humble birth such as King David of Israel had ruled as kings during the ninth century BC.

For Dryden, Virgil's fourth eclogue served, then, as a means of measuring his culture whose members likened their historical moment to Augustan Rome. Erskine-Hill has described the 'Augustan Idea' as the 'shifting pattern of ideas' that 'formed the arguments in a debate about the nature of Augustan Rome' as may be found in assessments by the Roman historian Livy to Dryden's period.<sup>296</sup> Virgil's fourth eclogue suggested the notions about a peaceful empire and the enlightened patronage of poets that shaped both Dryden's and Pope's image of

---

<sup>294</sup> James Loxley, 'On Exegetical Duty: Historical Programmatic and the Grammar of the Libel', *Huntington Library Quarterly* (2006), 83-104 (p. 85)

<sup>295</sup> James Loxley, 'On Exegetical Duty', p. 85

<sup>296</sup> Howard Erskine-Hill, *The Augustan Idea in English Literature* (London: Edward Arnold, 1983), p. xii

their historical moments to which their interpretative readings of Virgil's eclogue attested. Virgil adapted the ancient 'curriculum' of poetic development in which the poet approached more ambitious genres according to the progress of the political career of his patron.<sup>297</sup> His fourth eclogue offered evidence of the rapprochement with the political and military realities of Rome he achieved that followed the reluctance his persona Mencalas betrayed to accept the aims and ideology of the principate in the first eclogue.<sup>298</sup> The character of Dryden's and Pope's depiction of the new Augustan Age in their own adaptations revealed how they understood the reception among their contemporaries of such notions which shaped their view of the period of Caesar Augustus and theirs. Their poetic responses set the picture they fashioned of their culture based upon that view in contrast with the measured account of the period Virgil's literary engagement with it represented.

In his *Messiah*, Pope drew upon the structures of grammar—the habits, modes, and conventions—in the pastoral satires of Virgil and Dryden which the authors had derived from Theocritus. This allowed him to appropriate and transform the 'Roman triumph' of *Pollio*, which manifested 'an ideology of concord' as compared with the 'military *uirtus*', into a Christian triumph in which 'spiritual or heavenly victory is won through temporal or worldly defeat'.<sup>299</sup> Virgil made use of the premise that the delight which the simplicity of the beauty of the objects and persons described in pastoral indicated moral innocence in a manner that suggested how Augustus and his society could be measured according to the natural world's response to his birth. Pope's *Messiah* imitated Virgil's and Dryden's *Pollio* to offer a historical allegory in which he translated Isaiah's prophecy to reflect the modern sensibility with which such news

---

<sup>297</sup> Philip Hardie and Helen Moore, *Classical Literary Careers and their Reception* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010), p. 3-4

<sup>298</sup> Philip Hardie and Helen Moore, p. 5

<sup>299</sup> Anthony Miller, *Roman Triumphs and Early Modern English Culture* (Basingstroke: Palgrave, 2001), p. 2 and 12

would have been received. Pope combined pastoral convention with an elevated diction that mixed the archaic of biblical scripture with the speech of his contemporaries:

Ye Nymphs of Solyma! Begin the Song,  
The Mossy Fountains and the Sylvan Shades,  
The Dreams of Pindus and th' Aonian Maids,  
Delight no more—O thou my voice inspire  
Who touch'd Isaiah's hallow'd Lips with Fire!  
Rapt into Future times, the bard begun,  
A virgin shall conceive, A Virgin bear a Son!  
From Jesse's Root, behold a branch arise,  
Whose sacred Flow'r with Fragrance fills the Skies!<sup>300</sup>

Pope's reference to the 'Song of Solyma' or Solomon, son of David and once king of Israel, drew upon its authority for 'expressing mystical love in erotic imagery' which placed such spiritual love in terms of the natural beauty that evoked physical love.<sup>301</sup> Such lines offered example of Pope's 'enabling idiom' which, according to James McLaverty, made 'accutely present to us' the parallelism that existed between the earlier texts and his own to realize 'the idea of powerful congruencies'.<sup>302</sup> This allowed him to suggest the difference between the grandeur his corrupted society would have expected of the announcement of a king's birth and the meaning of Christ's coming alluded to in such expressions describing the virtue attributed to a shepherd that he possessed.

---

<sup>300</sup> Alexander Pope, 'Messiah' in *The Spectator, Volume I* (1755), p. 278

<sup>301</sup> Frank Kermode, *English Pastoral Poetry*, p. 31

<sup>302</sup> James McLaverty, *Pope, Print and Meaning* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001), p. 75

If Pope's lines are compared to those of Virgil, the sense Pope communicated in his interpretation was of the sentiment which such a contrast suggested. Virgil's beginning, much like Pope's, conveys the irony that a king whose birth should have been announced with the grandeur of sublime strains was told using the simple expressions of pastoral necessary to shaping the impressions of the infant's virtue:

But for you, child, the earth untilled will pour forth its first pretty  
gifts, gadding ivy with foxglove everywhere, and the Egyptian  
bean blended with the laughing briar; unbidden it will pour forth  
for you a cradle of smiling flowers.<sup>303</sup>

The effect of such a incongruity which Pope exaggerated in his adaptation of the above lines denoted the Augustan sublime: a recurrent source of the irrational in Augustan poetry lay in its manner of depicting the mind's inability to make sense of the princeps as it rendered the comparison drawn between divine and human within pastoral conventions meaningless.<sup>304</sup> That, in turn, provided an assessment of the culture in which Virgil wrote through the muted tone of ambivalence it betrayed to be characteristic of its sensibility. It also provided the means with which to measure Pope's literary text through his response to Virgil's.

Pope also drew upon Dryden's use of the dialect of the rustics of his period in England in his *Pollio* to emphasize the character of the culture he addressed through his turn to express that sentiment suggested in Virgil's. Dryden translated Virgil's lines thus:

The goats with strutting Dugs shall homeward speed  
And lowing Herds, secure from Lyons feed.

---

<sup>303</sup> Virgil, 'Eclogue IV' in *Eclogues, Georgics, Aeneid Books 1-6*, trans. by H. R. Fairclough, rev. by G. P. Gould, Loeb Classical Library (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1999), p. 51

<sup>304</sup> Philip Hardie, ed, *Augustan Poetry and the Irrational* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2016), p. 7-8

His Cradle with rising Flow'rs shall be Crown'd  
The Serpents brood shall die: the sacred ground  
Shall Weeds and pois'nous Plants refuse to bear,  
Each common Bush shall Syrian roses wear.<sup>305</sup>

Dryden's use of this diction drew attention to the limited ability of the audience the prophet-speaker addressed to grasp the significance of the consul's birth. His words suggested that they could only conceive of its effects in terms of their sensory perceptions which betrayed the value they placed upon physical comfort and affluence. This allowed Dryden to satirize Restoration society which valued the sophisticated wit with which it perceived itself and has been perceived as demonstrated in his writings from which his eighteenth-century heirs took their example.<sup>306</sup>

Pope drew his method from that example to suggest the resemblance his society bore to that of Isaiah's through the contrast he painted between the aesthetic values of pastoral convention, and the speaker's manner of expressing them which betrayed those social values of the culture to whom he spoke. His ironic tone and diction conveyed the doubt and disbelief or cynicism with which his society would have responded to Christ's arrival through which he insinuated the fallen character of his culture that had occasioned his birth.

Pope's *Messiah*, then, illustrated the discontinuity between the method of using pastoral convention to denote virtue and the aim of employing it to offer an account of national history through English literary history. Pope's description of the Messiah drew attention to the Christian notion of Jesus Christ as the Good Shepherd as compared with the Ancient belief

---

<sup>305</sup> BL C.28.f.6, p. 60 lines 25-30

<sup>306</sup> T. S. Eliot, 'John Dryden' in *The Complete Prose of T S Eliot: the Prefect Critic 1919-1926, Volume 2*, ed by Anthony Cuda and Ronald Schuchard (Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press, 2014), pp. 350

derived from such prophecies as Isaiah's that the Messiah descended from King David of Israel would be a king among kings:

The tender Lambs he raises in his Arms,  
Feeds from his Hand, and in his Bosom warms:  
Mankind thus his Guardian Care engage,  
The promis'd Father of a future Age.  
No more shall Nation against Nation rise,  
Nor ardent Warriors meet with hateful Eyes,  
For Fields with gleaming Steel be cover'd o'er,  
The Brazen Trumpets kindle Rage nor more;  
But useless Lances into Scythes shall bend,  
And the broad Flachion in Plough-share end.<sup>307</sup>

Here Pope re-imagined the Ancient Jewish prophecy within the tradition of Christian belief about its fulfillment. The contrast he painted between the expectations for the birth of a political leader and that of a Saviour allowed Pope to illustrate the effects of using pastoral writing as a mode to convey simplicity when fashioning history. Pope drew upon 'Spenser's native version of political pastoral' which, as a mode of discourse, 'enabled poets to suggest that national strength' derived from a country's 'teleology' that could be re-inscribed within the providential history of its race.<sup>308</sup> His rendering, in doing so, offered a parody that gave reason to question efforts to

---

<sup>307</sup> Alexander Pope, *Messiah*, p. 242

<sup>308</sup> Pat Rogers, *The Symbolic Design of Windsor Forest: Iconography, Pageant, and Prophecy in Pope's Early Work* (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 2004), p. 193

fashion a story of England within providential history through the parallel Pope drew to the anticipated Golden Age of Israel and the restored Pax Romana in a Pax Britannia.<sup>309</sup>

The irony with which he imbued his eclogue offered perspective to the use of that pastoral mode to shape impressions of the virtues which his contemporaries claimed to be the character of England that merited such a destiny. Messiah gave the impression that such virtue was feigned because of the artificial quality the use of its language lent. Through that, the poem suggested the manner through which writing in this imitative pastoral mode allowed Pope to take a critical view of his moment in literary history. It allowed him to examine his period through the attitude its authors took towards their relation to the past and how that formed the stories his contemporaries told. The understanding of that relation among his fellow authors enabled him to satirize the methods they used to craft an identity for themselves. That enabled him to understand the underlying concerns which occupied them as those writers looked to the future to shape the account of that history they offered.

Pope's *Windsor Forest* also turned to use pastoral as mode in which he could employ its conventions to provide the frame in which to interpret the historical events that presented themselves within broader notions about human history. Pope began with an invocation before he painted this image,

The Groves of Eden, vanish'd now so long  
Live in Description, and look green in song:  
These, were my brest inspired with Flame,  
Like them in Pleasure, should be like in Fame.  
Here Hills and Vales, the Woodland and the Plain,

---

<sup>309</sup> Maynard Mack, *The Garden and the City: Retirement and Politics in the Later Poetry of Pope 1731-1743* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1969), p. 20-21

Here Earth and Water seem to strive again;  
Not chaos-like, together crush'd and bruis'd,  
But as the World, harmoniously confus'd:  
Where Order in Variety we see,  
And where tho' all things differ, all agree.  
Here arching Groves a glimm'ring Scene display,  
And part admit and part exclude the Day,  
As some coy Nymph her Lover's warm Address  
Nor quite indulges, nor can quite repress.<sup>310</sup>

The set of familiar pastoral metaphors with which Pope began his poem suggested the 'literary and theological matrix' within which to read it and reminded his readers that the Eden to which he alluded had become the world in which man's first temptation was not his last.<sup>311</sup> Pope employed this method of weaving the elements of pastoral with georgic to characterize the rulers of England in a measured account of its past within a greater view of history of his own:

Succeeding Monarchs heard the subjects cries,  
Nor saw displeas'd the peaceful cottage rise.  
Then gath'ring flocks on unknown mountains fed,  
O'er sandy wilds were yellow harvest spread,  
The forests wonder'd at th' unusual grain  
And secret transports touch'd the unconscious swain.<sup>312</sup>

---

<sup>310</sup> Alexander Pope, *Windsor Forest*, lines 1-14 in Pope's *Windsor Forest 1712: A study of the Washington University Holograph* (St. Louis, MO: Washington University, 1952). This edition provides a facsimile of the original manuscript draft of the poem made in 1712 as well as revisions to it and the text as it was first published in 1713 in *The Spectator*.

<sup>311</sup> Maynard Mack, *Collected in Himself: Essays Critical, Biographical, and Bibliographical on Pope and Some of His Contemporaries* (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 1982), p. 24

<sup>312</sup> Alexander Pope, *Windsor Forest*



Here Pope uses the pastoral images of ‘gath’ring flocks’ and ‘unconscious swain’ to describe the subjects of England whom the ‘Monarchs’ fed to suggest the virtue of their kings through their action towards them and to whose suffering he alluded using the phrase ‘subjects cries’. Pope, however, suggests the dubious with which such rulers do so through his use of a common georgic image to paint the image of bounty, the ‘yellow harvest’, is noted to ‘spread’ and produce ‘unusual grain’ without reference to the monarchs to suggest their active hand in the change of the fate of the people of the country. The result are lines which seemingly praise while dispraising England’s rulers who are set in contrast to the goodness of the people of England suggested in the ‘secret transports’ of the ‘unconscious swain’ who is thus innocent and unknowing.

Describing the origin of those rulers on England using a mixture of pastoral and epic conventions, allows Pope to imbue the comparison he makes of them to the gods of ancient mythology with an irony that insinuates the critical view to be taken of them,

Let India boast her plants, nor envy we  
The weeping Amber, or the Balmy Tree,  
While our Oaks the precious Loads are born,  
And Realms commanded which those Plants adorn.  
Nor high Olympus yields a nobler Show,  
When crown’d with Gods, he views the World below,  
Than what more humble Mountains offer here,  
Where in their Blessings, all those Gods appear.<sup>313</sup>

---

<sup>313</sup> Alexander Pope, *Windsor Forest*

This allowed Pope to offer a narrative of his country in which he used the descriptive language of the conventions of the two genres to make palpable the character of each sovereign's reign in terms of the ideals those expressions were commonly used to convey. The doubtfulness as to the character of the monarchs of England is obliquely referred to with the idea of a nation taking to 'boast her plants', setting the epic value of honour in contrast with the value of simplicity of pastoral. Howard Erskine-Hill has written that to approach Pope and his writing in a historical fashion requires a study of its prominent figures of representative value to supply form and clarity necessary to reconstructing his social milieu as it was conceived of and felt by those who belonged to it.<sup>314</sup> Pope's manner of fashioning English history might be viewed as adopting a similar method. In *Windsor Forest*, Pope depicted selected monarchs using literary conventions that captured the character of life in England during their reigns. This provided definition to the narrative of the effects of struggles over succession of which that history consisted.

Pope use of such conventions enable him to recast the leading figures of recent English history through allusion to ancient pagan gods and their English ancestors, adapting the methods of the Jacobite lyric, to offer a satiric picture of them against which to measure the Stuart monarchy. Pope's *Windsor Forest*, as Murray Pittock suggests, presented an example of a quasi-Jacobite poem in which the 'Stuart cause' was re-envisioned using such elements of 'topological history' as 'myth, archetype, and image' to take a 'remote historical era, and glorify it to either lament its passing or praise its return'.<sup>315</sup> This allowed him to weave a mythology about the origin and history of the Stuart line whose future was uncertain as Queen Anne did not have an

---

<sup>314</sup> Howard Erskine-Hill, *The Social Milieu of Alexander Pope: Lives, Example, and the Poetic Response* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1975), p. 6-7

<sup>315</sup> Murray Pittock, *Poetry and Jacobite Politics in Eighteenth-Century Britain and Ireland* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994), pp. 7, 10

heir. Through allusion, Pope refashioned the image of the Virgin Queen Elizabeth I to whom he likened Anne:

Above the rest a Rural Nymph was fam'd,  
Thy offspring, Thames! The fair Lodone nam'd  
Whose wondrous Fate (in long Oblivion cast)  
The Muse shall sing, and what she sings shall last.  
Scarce from the Goddess, could the Nymph be known  
But by her Crescent and her golden Zone.  
She scorn'd the Praise of Beauty, and the Care;  
A Belt her Waste, a Ribband her Hair,  
A painted Quiver on her Shoulder sounds,  
And with her Dart the flying Deer she wounds.<sup>316</sup>

The language of the speaker's description of Elizabeth I through allusion to the virgin goddess Artemis is rendered with irony through the suggestion that she uses her sexual appeal much like a pastoral nymph, as the women in the pastoral satires of Marvell would, to maintain power. This Pope achieves through reference to her 'golden Zone' and the 'Dart' with which 'the flying Deer she wounds'. The pun that is offered through the two possible meanings that might be attributed to 'wounds' of injuring or twisting another made the insinuation that her virtue was to be doubted the more pointed. Pope's panegyric verse adopted a tone of exaggerated grandeur, using hyperbolic language in his comparison of Elizabeth I to the goddess Artemis, to lend it this irony and suggest the doubt with which her virtue should be viewed that recalled Marvell's *Horatian Ode upon Cromwell's Return from Ireland* and its method of praise and dispraise.

---

<sup>316</sup> Alexander Pope, *Windsor Forest*, lines 71-80

Pope's annotations in his copy of *Poems upon Affairs of State* indicated that he had read Marvell's *Advice to a Painter* and *Hodge's Vision* with interest.<sup>317</sup> Pope echoed Marvell's sentiment towards such political leaders as Cromwell, writing, 'The fields are ravish'd from th' Industrious Swains, | from Men their Cities, from Gods their Fanes' to describe the circumstances of England under earlier and later rulers.<sup>318</sup> Pope added a footnote to the 1713 published text that these lines referred to 'the destruction William the Conqueror made in Windsor Forest'.<sup>319</sup> This manner of allusion offered context for the lines that followed: 'Oh may no more a foreign Master's Rage | With Wrongs yet legal curse a future Age!<sup>320</sup> This would have called to mind the recent events surrounding William III and the potential rule of George of Hanover.

These couplets gave the impression that Pope read recent history through the parallels that could be drawn between William the Conqueror and William III as compared with Elizabeth I and Anne. In doing so, the couplets suggested the manner through which Restoration satire and, particularly Marvell, had shaped his understanding of his historical present. Pope's depiction of William reminds of the picture Marvell had offered of Cromwell in *An Horatian Ode*. Pope told the history of English monarchs within which he placed William in terms that used the conventions of pastoral and georgic to paint a contrast between the state of England and the effects upon its inhabitants that might have characterized the reign of Cromwell. This can be seen in such lines as

In vain kind Seasons swell'd the teeming Grain,  
Soft Show'rs distill'd, and Phoebus shone in vain;

---

<sup>317</sup> BL C 28.e.15

<sup>318</sup> BL C 28.e.15

<sup>319</sup> Alexander Pope, *Windsor Forest*,

<sup>320</sup> Alexander Pope, *Windsor Forest*, lines 91-2

The Swain with Tears to Beasts his Labor yields,  
And dies for Want amidst his fruitful Fields.<sup>321</sup>

This turn to the images of plenty to denote the prosperity in which England lived allowed him to draw attention to its cost in the suffering among its inhabitants under the yoke of such rulers. That betrayed the sense with which Pope told his narrative in a manner that drew upon his reading and writing which framed its view of the past within the pastoral ideal of lost innocence.

Erskine-Hill has noted that in the seeming paradox that Pope equated ‘William III, a prince of the Stuart dynasty, with “l’Usurpateur” Cromwell’, without invoking providence to ‘restore ancient laws and the true masters’, Pope relied upon a dominant habit of thought about the cycles of history according to which that return would be expected.<sup>322</sup> His rendering of Stuart mythology suggested though the nostalgia for an ideal past that had never been which betrayed the self-knowledge with which he and his contemporaries looked to its history to re-imagine its present. This is the truth that presented itself when Pope turned to respond to his fellow writers’ position about pastoral and the ideals underlying it. The sense that the history they told was in part a fiction through which they hoped to evoke a more pleasing image of the past within which they figured a place pervaded Pope’s early writing, as discussed here. The methods with which Pope makes a critical assessment of such histories and the inherent fiction of an ideal past necessary to them were the results of the habits of mind he formed because of the imitative habits of writing he learned from reading Marvell’s pastorals and satires. It is with that sense that later eighteenth-century writers wrote to understand this turn to satiric renderings of pastoral such as those of Marvell and the literary history they told through it to reflect upon the literary

---

<sup>321</sup> Alexander Pope, *Windsor Forest*, lines 51-60

<sup>322</sup> Howard Erskine-Hill, *The Poetry of Opposition and Revolution: Dryden to Wordsworth* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1996), p. 58

inheritance which shaped their understanding of themselves, as will be discussed in the next two chapters.

## Chapter 4

### His Hand in Writing: The Pastoral Manuscripts of James Thomson

To a manuscript of James Thomson's *Juvenile Poems* (1800), Henry Oldham appended his judgment: "I doubt very much the fact of these poems being Thomson's: but if they are, they are utterly unworthy of him, and would scarcely furnish even a score of lines for the *N. M. M.* [New Monthly Magazine] and they would certainly disgrace the memory of their reputed author".<sup>323</sup> Oldham's assessment communicates the sense that these early poems were a schoolboy's exercises in pastoral imitation. It also suggests how the readers formed their image of Thomson, the poet, by measuring the verse he wrote in his mature years as compared to that imitation. In 1743, Thomson himself re-examined his writing, constructing a hypothetical source text for his revisions to *The Seasons* using a copy of his *Works* (1738) to which he added interleaves of correspondence containing early draft passages and his amendments to both.<sup>324</sup> The interleaved copy, however, also contains the changes George, Lord Lyttelton recommended against which he and later readers might assess *The Seasons* and form ideas about Thomson's place in literary history. This manuscript passed to the nineteenth-century scholar, John Mitford, who then transcribed Lyttelton's revisions into a copy of David Murdoch's edition of *The Works of James Thomson* (1768) to comment upon Thomson's writing, as compared with the revisions Lyttelton introduced in his posthumous edition (1750).<sup>325</sup> The manuscripts Thomson made of his juvenile pastorals and later revisions to *The Seasons* give us his hand in writing. The multiple forms of pastoral, both material and literary, that Thomson adopted, I will argue, suggest the several uses

---

<sup>323</sup> London, Victoria and Albert Museum (VA), Forester MS 598, James Thomson, *Juvenalia*

<sup>324</sup> London, British Library (BL), C.28.e.17, James Thomson, *The Works of Mr. Thomson* (1738)

<sup>325</sup> London, British Library (BL), C.134.c.1, James Thomson, *The Works of Mr. Thomson* (1768)

to which he put pastoral and which then shaped, and continued to shape, the afterlives of his verse.

Oldham's comment about Thomson's juvenile poems insinuates the mechanical character of those imitations of pastoral, as might be expected of a young undergraduate, as Thomson was in 1718, when he wrote them at Edinburgh University. The allusion Oldham made to Thomson's later reputation also suggests though that the habits of writing he developed through such juvenile imitations formed the habits of mind with which he composed his more mature verse. Those early pastorals, I will demonstrate, shaped the manner through which his satiric verse reveals the habits of mind with which he studied the methods through which the Ancients and Moderns had defined positions within the *querelle*, and so offered the context in which later readers viewed his verse. Thomson's contemporaries came to think of him as a didactic poet: Joseph Warton, for example, credited Thomson with the skill at writing descriptive poetry which Samuel Johnson attributed to Thomson's use of poetic landscapes to serve an 'interest' in 'systematic natural knowledge' and 'sentiment'.<sup>326</sup> Wordsworth, James Sambrook has influentially argued, appropriated Thomson's reputation of being a descriptive poet to perpetuate a tradition of the painter-poet.<sup>327</sup> These comments considered together suggest that Thomson's verse lent itself to an account of Romantic literary history which reflected the Moderns' position of continued achievements based upon how each successive poet adapted the literary forms and methods of earlier poets to engage with the concerns of his period.

Oldham's comment also calls to mind though an image of an unskilled Thomson who turned to imitative writing that may be viewed within the context of the Ancients' position that

---

<sup>326</sup> James Sambrook, 'Introduction' in *The Seasons*, ed. by James Sambrook (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1981), pp. xxix-xxx

<sup>327</sup> James Sambrook, 'Introduction' in *The Seasons*, pp. xxix-xxx



classical poetry could not be surpassed. Oldhams' impression of the mechanic nature of Thomson's juvenile pastoral whose use of literary form and convention in satiric renderings, when compared to his later verse, reminds of Coleridge's assessment of Ben Jonson in *Biographia Literaria* to which John Thewall responded in his annotated copy. Thewall noted that surely Jonson was an exception to Coleridge's claim that he lacked skill, as compared with the 'Ancients' and 'elder dramatists of England and France' who had not sought to make us laugh by 'mechanic' caricature, for which Jonson was placed in 'the margins of the constitution of Romantic life'.<sup>328</sup> Thomson's later verse offers evidence of the skill he developed as the result of his youthful imitation of exemplars, both Ancient and Modern, that also made him an exception. The Romantic Thomson as Sambrook has noted to be of Wordsworth's making, and a Classical Thomson that Mitford suggested to be of Thomson's, would seem to be the natural consequence of the way in which Thomson learned to fashion his manner of creative response within and to the context the *querelle* posed.

Thomson's manuscripts gave tangible form to his developing capacity to direct his readers' reception of such ideas as they offer evidence of how his readings directed his own. Thomson's manner of imitating the satiric renderings of pastoral of earlier verse suggests the recursive character he perceived in each poet's turn to the notion of the lost innocence of an idealized past to understand his historical present within the values he had inherited. Thomson's practices as a maker of such manuscripts, I will suggest, demonstrate how the return to pastoral he made at several moments in his poetic development shaped the patterns of his thoughts that emerge from the patterns, within which he examined his relation to the past, through the ideals expressed using pastoral's conventions as his literary influences had.

---

<sup>328</sup> Tom Lockwood, *Ben Jonson in the Romantic Age* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005), p. 1-2

The manuscript of Thomson's juvenilia in his autograph entitled 'Miscelany Poems' (1720) suggests the manner through which he turned to pastoral conceits to translate the values of classical pastoral into a Christian context within which to understand the underlying notion of virtue.<sup>329</sup> The design of his manuscript resembles that of a complete works of an author: it constructs the literary context within which he read and for reading his poetry through allusion to authors whose use of conventions Thomson imitated within each grouping to engage with a classical pastoral ideal. This, I will show, allowed him to develop a manner of perceiving the recurring patterns through which earlier poets had turned to pastoral convention to examine those ideals within their own historical context. His manuscript enacted the kind of programme of poetic development that enabled his critical study of England's literary inheritance in which he shared.

Thomson's more mature writing in *The Seasons* illustrates the dual nature of his poetic response, both creative and critical, within classical and Early Modern notions of a poet's progression. His method of weaving pastoral convention with the formal elements of epic offered the means through which he satirized the development of the philosopher-poet. That method allowed him to suggest the recurring patterns of the speaker's thought that emerge in the narrative the speaker tells of his own developing aesthetic impressions of the recurring patterns of Nature—diurnal and seasonal. Those patterns, I will demonstrate, gave definition to Thomson's account of England's history offered through his satiric rendering of his poet-speaker's recurring ideas about unfolding history, as he conceived of them in terms of his recurring perceptions of the natural world and its effects upon men.

---

<sup>329</sup> Chicago, Newberry Library, no shelfmark, James Thomson, 'Miscelany Poems'

Changes to *The Seasons* contained in the interleaved copy of Thomson's *Works*, but revised in the 1744 edition of his *Works*, suggest how pastoral also served as a return for him to his literary beginning.<sup>330</sup> The revisions and amendments alongside the original drafts and earlier published editions offer evidence of how Thomson engaged with the classical thought he had read and how he employed the methods he developed through his early imitations of literary models at the varying stages of his career. The two annotated copies of Thomson's *Works* in his, Lyttelton's, and Mitford's hands suggest how and why Thomson used pastoral to demonstrate his intellectual development which his readings in classical and contemporaneous texts guided. The original complete text of *The Seasons* presents a self-conscious assessment of the role of the poet-prophet and such bards ability to achieve the sublime understanding to which such development should lead according to Platonic and Stoic philosophy.

Thomson's revisions in the interleaved copy, when compared with those of Lyttelton and which Mitford transcribed into a second copy, made the two noted readings available: that of the Romantic Thomson in the tradition of Milton and that of the Classical Thomson, which Mitford discussed in his published essays about the two annotated books.<sup>331</sup> The revision in the two annotated editions of Thomson's *Works*, when considered alongside those published essays about them, I will show, give reason to reassess the notion of the 'Romantic Thomson', as compared with Thomson's own account to be found in his manuscripts and revised texts. The understanding to be gained of the manner through which Thomson's writing contributed to the 'Romantic Thomson' of Lyttelton's hand, and the 'Classical Thomson' of Mitford's making, shaped the place of Thomson's pastorals within literary history and the corresponding accounts

---

<sup>330</sup> BL, C.28.e.17; BL, C.134.c.1

<sup>331</sup> See John Mitford, 'Thomson's The Seasons and Their Various Readings', *Gentleman's Magazine* (December 1841) for a discussion of Lyttelton's revisions as compared with Thomson's and Thomson's classicism in *The Seasons*.

of England's history. It also shaped the image Romantic writers fashioned of literary traditions to which they presented themselves as heirs. A turn first to Thomson's juvenile pastorals will enable a study of how the dual nature of pastoral—creative and critical—permitted him to form later views of literary history through the manner through which he formed himself.

### **Pastoral Beginnings: The Early Manuscripts of James Thomson**

Two extant manuscripts of Thomson's 'juvenile' poems remain, the first of which is a fairly accurate transcript with lacunae that is held in the Forester Collection (MS 598) at the Victoria and Albert Museum.<sup>332</sup> The memoranda, including Oldham's note appended to it, suggest that the transcription was made between 1818 and 1830. The second manuscript in Thomson's hand is held at the Newberry Library. The latter employed different methods to achieve a similar aim to that of Pope's *Essay on Pastorals*: the form and structure of Thomson's 'Miscelany Poems' guided his reader from the use of an aesthetic value of pastoral to denote an idea, through its development in each grouping of its poems, to nurture the favour with which that reader might receive the simple manner of conveying an idea of greater concern to the understanding. The manuscript has been missing since 1970, but the Newberry Library still holds a fascimile of it. The manuscript itself consisted of 27 poems, with writing on both sides of each leaf, and was bound in morocco. Page 1 is titled 'Miscelany poems' and page 55 consists of an index. Page 55 is also signed Dr. Cranstoun, probably referring to Thomson's friend the Rev. John Cranstoun. Alan Dugald McKillop concludes that the poems were written between 1716 and 1719 during the period Thomson and David Mallet attended Edinburgh University; he adds that the autograph ms

---

<sup>332</sup> VA Forester MS 598,

begins as a fair copy, and is later marked with deletions and corrections which suggests it was intended as a workbook.<sup>333</sup>

There is some debate as to the transmission of the manuscript following its composition. William Goodhugh announced in *The Gentleman's Magazine*, 18 April 1818, and in the *Monthly Magazine* 46 (1818) that he had acquired the manuscript.<sup>334</sup> When Goodhugh published two of the poems in *The Observer*, 19 September 1818 and his fellow bookseller J. Brown published an additional two poems in the *Literary Gazette*, 3 October 1818, they stated that either Thomson or David Mallet had given the manuscript to Lord George Graham.<sup>335</sup> It then passed to Lord George's son, his grandson, and then his great niece Miss Graham, from whom Goodhugh acquired it in 1817.<sup>336</sup> The letters of the Earl of Buchan offer a different account. In a letter dated 15 January 1819, he wrote, 'Lord Lyttelton & Sir Andrew Mitchell & I used to often talk of those chirpings as yr. correspondent calls them of Thomson's and were afraid they might be brought forth from hereafter from Mallet's repositories or Riccaltons'.<sup>337</sup> In a second letter dated 26 January 1819, the Earl of Buchan wrote that he had seen the same manuscript in the possession of David Mallet fifty-four or fifty-five years earlier from whom he supposed 'they had come to the heir of Lord George Graham'.<sup>338</sup> When Thomson arrived in London in 1725, Mallet served as tutor to William and George Graham, the sons of the Duke of Montrose, at the

---

<sup>333</sup> Alan D. McKillop, 'Two 18th Century "First Works": 2 James Thomson's Juvenile Poems', *Newberry Library Bulletin* 4 (1955), 13-23

<sup>334</sup> William Goodhugh, *The Gentleman's Magazine* (April 1818); William Goodhugh, *The Monthly Magazine* 46 (1818)

<sup>335</sup> William Goodhugh, *The Observer* (18 September 1818); J. Brown, *Literary Gazette* (3 October 1818)

<sup>336</sup> Alexander Lindsay, 'James Thomson' in *Index of English literary manuscripts. Vol. 3, 1700-1800. Pt. 4, Laurence Sterne - Edward Young, with a first-line index to parts 1-4*, ed. by Alexander Lindsay (London: Mansell, 1997), 93-118 (p. 93)

<sup>337</sup> Alan Dugald McKillop, ed., *James Thomson (1700-1748) Letters and Documents* (Lawrence, KS: University of Kansas Press, 1958)

<sup>338</sup> Alan Dugald McKillop, ed., *James Thomson (1700-1748) Letters and Documents*

residences of which Thomson resided.<sup>339</sup> Sambrook notes that although Thomson had met members of the Duke's family, Lord George died in 1747, making it difficult to account for the transmission of the manuscript, which, he conjectures, passed to the family at Mallet's death, as the poor quality of the poems made it unlikely that Thomson would have presented them to Lord George.<sup>340</sup> In his edition of Thomson's *Poetical Works* (1849), John Nichols wrote, however, that Thomson became a favorite of the Duke's after the publication of *Winter* in 1726, assisted Mallet with Lord George's education, and transcribed as many of his juvenile poems as he could recollect at Lord George's request.<sup>341</sup> Later printings of several of the juvenile poems in addition to those noted by Goodhugh and Brown in 1818 are included in Goodhugh's *The Gentleman's Library Manual* (1827), an edition of Nichol's that followed (1830), the Muses Library edition by H. D. Roberts (1906), and an edition by Robertson (1908).<sup>342</sup>

Thomson's *Miscelany Poems* includes several literary forms that he adapted using elements taken from pastoral, which were noted in the Neoclassical pastoral theory of Rapin and Fontenelle. His use of such conventions garnered criticism, as had Theocritus' manner of depicting shepherds in his *Idylls*, which gave them a clownishness of which the two theorists disapproved. The varied poems—from the amorous to versified fables, biblical paraphrases, moral and devotional poems, formal pastorals, and 'much conventional pastoral twittering in other descriptive pieces'—gave the impression, writes Sambrook, of stock exercises on set themes that display little promise.<sup>343</sup> This suggests how Neoclassical theory had offered the

---

<sup>339</sup> Alexander Lindsay, 'James Thomson', p. 94

<sup>340</sup> James Thomson, 'Juvenilia' in *Liberty, The Castle of Indolence and Other Poems*, ed. by James Sambrook (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1986), p 225

<sup>341</sup> John Nichols, ed., *The Poetical Works of James Thomson* (London: 1849)

<sup>342</sup> William Goodhugh, *The English Gentleman's Library Manual* (London: Printed for William Goodhugh, 195 Oxford Street and Goodhugh and Co 1 Berkeley Square, 1827); John Nichols, *The Poetical Works of James Thomson* (London: 1830); J Logie Robertson, ed., *The Complete Poetical Words of James Thomson* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1908)

<sup>343</sup> James Sambrook, *James Thomson 1700-1748: A Life*, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1991) p. 18

criteria for judging a poet's skill in its prescriptive rules for prosody, which came to define the poetry referred to as Augustan. Patrick Murdoch, Thomson's friend and editor of posthumous editions, commented upon the response of several gentlemen to Thomson's juvenilia: 'Some inaccuracies of stile, and those luxuriances a young writer can hardly avoid, lay open to their cavils and censure' that 'the fire and enthusiasm of the poet had entirely escaped their notice'.<sup>344</sup>

Murdoch borrowed the language of Dennis and his fellow Moderns, who based their accounts of Modern English poetry upon the notion of an Augustan sublime they derived from the affective response such method of prosody elicited. Murdoch's observation suggests the reason why Thomson's *The Seasons* was read in relation to Milton's epic *Paradise Lost* in the Moderns' accounts of literary history. Later critics such as Richard Terry who have drawn upon those accounts view the two works as a literary form whose many modes of discourse resists the categories of genre: the long poem, Terry has influentially argued, 'may describe, reflect, digress, moralise, and rhapsodize, but does not narrate' to engage the 'imagination' in a manner that suggests a 'pre-Romantic aesthetic to be distinguished from the Augustan'.<sup>345</sup> The attention that Terry has given to the form's methods of discourse suggests, though, how it enacts a mode of interpretative response that enables the satiric renderings of pastoral within which poets examined inherited notions about the aesthetic values underlying that concept of the sublime.

Thomson's *Miscelany Poems* begins with *Upon Beauty* which turned to draw upon the history of usage of the pastoral convention of likening Nature to a woman, discussed in earlier chapters, to consider the understanding of innocence represented in uncorrupted physical beauty.

---

<sup>344</sup> Patrick Murdoch, *The Works of James Thomson, with His Last Corrections and Improvements; with a life of the author by Patrick Murdoch* (London: Printed for A Millar and sold by T Cadell, 1768) p. v

<sup>345</sup> Richard Terry, 'The Longer Eighteenth-century Poems (Akenside, Thomson, Young, Cowper and Others)' in *The Cambridge History of English Poetry*, ed. by Michael O'Neill (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010), 378-96 (p. 379 and 389)

The poem combines allusions to the Bible, with the diction of classical pastoral, to personify the quality of beauty in terms that make palpable the desire among men to recapture the simplicity with which the first shepherds were thought to have once enjoyed a life of simplicity that denoted their moral virtue. In doing so, Thomson's verse offers evidence of how adopting these methods of the tradition of pastoral verse, which turned to the image of the Garden of Eden to capture the longing for the state of innocence of a Golden Age now lost to the Modern world, formed his ideas about that innocence. Sambrook writes that the dream satirizing such depictions offered in No. 301 of *The Spectator* may have been the inspiration for the poem as suggested in the echo in lines 60-61 which he returns to in lines 320-21 of *Spring*: 'Blossoms and fruits at once the trees adorn | With glowing blushes like the rosie morn'<sup>346</sup> Beauty personified in the manner of the lady addressed in No. 301 is "The new-made Eve in her early bloom | Not yet obscured with sin's sullen gloom".<sup>347</sup> This manner through which the speaker can only conceive of moral purity through his perceptions of physical beauty is further suggested in his comment 'Her dress was plain not pompous as a bride | Which would her sweeter native beauties hide'.<sup>348</sup> That use of pastoral convention to allude to Eve allowed Thomson to translate the Neoclassical pastoral ideal of simplicity into Christian ideas about moral innocence. Doing so then enabled his satire of the Arcadian shepherd whose perceptions of Nature's beauty were thought to convey his virtue.

Thomson's manner of rendering, however, also suggests how the satiric responses of the Modern English poets Spenser, Marvell, Dryden, and Pope framed his understanding of the concerns of the literary debates that shaped the context within which they and their

---

<sup>346</sup> See James Sambrook, ed., *Liberty, The Castle of Indolence and Other Poems* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1986), p. 398

<sup>347</sup> James Thomson, 'Upon Beauty' in Newberry, *Miscelany Poems*

<sup>348</sup> James Thomson, 'Upon Beauty' in Newberry, *Miscelany Poems*



contemporaries wrote. The speaker who utters those words quoted above, speaks in the manner of a simple Modern shepherd that suggests the coarseness to be observed in the shepherds depicted in the poems, discussed in earlier chapters, which took their example from Theocritus' *Idylliums*. That coarseness was to be distinguished from the melodious numbers for which Milton's *Paradise Lost* was lauded in the accounts of literary history of the eighteenth-century. In the period between early editions of Milton's poetry such as Bentley's *Paradise Lost* (1732) and the romantic era of poetry, the interest in the musicality of Milton's verse gave rise to a scholarly tradition of verbal criticism and textual analysis.<sup>349</sup> Milton's verse, much like that of his contemporaries, was thought to require 'knowledge, capacity, and talents, rarely to be met with' in what Eliot notes to be its display of erudition as well as its magniloquence.<sup>350</sup> The mixture of elements from biblical scripture and Ancient pastoral with the use of Modern dress Thomson employed allowed him to engage with such discourse within the context of the *querelle* in which prosody remained a criteria for measuring Modern verse, according to the virtue it was thought to represent. His turn to Modern diction, to translate the values of the Ancient sources to which his poems allude, situated his verse within the Ancient and Modern positions about whether the innocence of the Age of Antiquity was lost to them or continued to persist.

Thomson's use of Modern language to parody the figure of the Ancient shepherd enabled him to grasp the irony inherent to the premise that a simplicity of manner denoted that virtue pastoral depictions were meant to demonstrate. In doing so, his turn to imitate the kind of satiric renderings of pastoral discussed in the previous chapters suggests the manner through which his readings of them shaped the methods with which he fashioned his response to the literary values

---

<sup>349</sup> See John Leonard, *Faithful Labourers: A Reception History of "Paradise Lost," 1667–1970, vol. 2: Interpretative Issues* (Oxford: Oxford Univ., 2013), especially 521–22.

<sup>350</sup> Samuel Whyte, *Miscellanea Nova* (1801); T S Eliot, 'Andrew Marvell', p. 310

underlying the accounts of the history of pastoral, and through which both Ancients and Moderns fashioned an identity for themselves. Thomson's rendering of the pastoral shepherd in his speaker fixes the impression of that figure's limited understanding of the larger truth to be inferred from his words to preface the next poem in the set. In *A Pastoral betwixt David Thyrsis and the Angell Gabriel upon the birth of our Saviour*, Thomson made use of the 'parodic possibilities' in a manner David Fairer writes to be characteristic of eighteenth-century pastoral, illustrated in the satiric depictions of the shepherd found in the poets noted to examine the effects of the shepherd's fallen state.<sup>351</sup>

The poem itself imitates Virgil's *Pollio* in a manner that might be compared to Dryden's translation of it and Pope's *Messiah* eclogue. The dialogue presents a character referred to as David, perhaps alluding to King David in the Old Testament from whom Jesus Christ was thought to be descended. In the poem, David's words anticipate Nature's response to Christ's birth:

No more the year shall wintry horrors bring  
Fix'd in the indulgence of eternal spring  
Immortal green shall cloath the hills and vales  
And od'rous sweets shall load the balmy gales  
The silver brooks shall in soft murmurs tell  
The joys that shall their oozy channels swell  
Feed on my flocks and crop the grass  
Let blooming joy appear on ev'ry face  
For lo! This blessed propitious morn

---

<sup>351</sup> David Fairer, *English Poetry of the Eighteenth Century*, p. 19

The savior of lost mankind is born.<sup>352</sup>

Thomson's poem borrowed the language of those earlier poets, to compare the 'wintry horrors', with the pleasing images of spring, which David associates with the renewal of nature at the season's coming. This demonstrates how Thomson used such pastoral conventions to develop the idea of the natural world untainted before Adam and Eve's original sin as he introduced in *Upon Beauty*. That allowed Thomson to denote the love of moral beauty of the Saviour that men should feel through reference to the emotion of joy the beauties of nature in bloom were thought to elicit in the language of such pastoral conventions. That, in turn, permitted Thomson to respond to the classical Platonic idea that a love of physical beauty will lead to a love of moral and intellectual beauty, and ultimately, the idea of beauty within Christian belief.

David's language suggests the Modern sensibility with which a contemporary of Thomson's would have perceived the effects Christ's coming would have had upon Nature. Thomson's poem displays a 'mature' and 'civilized' classicism and an idiomatic modernity that reminds of the 'tough reasonableness' combined with the 'lyric grace' of Marvell's poetry; from it a 'line of wit' may be traced to Pope's verse whose 'metaphysical descent' is as important as its 'Augustanism'.<sup>353</sup> Thomson's description of such effects using sensuous language demonstrates how thought may be fused with feeling in the manner of that tradition of wit. This allowed Thomson to make palpable David's mortal condition which prevents David from grasping the importance of the event except in terms of what his sense perceives.

The reply of Thyrsis (who ironically recalls the shepherd of Ancient pastoral but speaks with the manners of courtly swain) interwove the language of pastoral convention and allusions

---

<sup>352</sup> James Thomson, 'A Dialogue betwixt David, Thyrsis, and the Angell Gabriel' in Newberry Library, *Miscelany Poems*

<sup>353</sup> For a discussion of the Line of Wit from the Metaphysical poets to Pope, see F. R. Leavis, *Revaluation: Tradition and Development in English Poetry* (London: Chatto and Windus, 1936)

to the Messiah. He described 'Thou fairest morn that ever sprang from night' in a manner that made perceptible the return to a state of sinless grace and the salvation the occasion promised 'Since here Emmanuel condescends to stay'.<sup>354</sup> In doing so, David's comments recontextualized the classical image of a pastoral dawn, in terms of the Christian opposition of light connoting goodness and darkness connoting evil, so that the reader would come to equate natural beauty with Christian moral virtue.

Thyrsis's manner of speaking, though, also reflected the diction of a Modern shepherd who spoke with a sophistication that characterized the courtly swain, dressed in the guise of the simple shepherd Thomson would have encountered in his readings of the Modern English poets discussed. In the manner of this sophisticated poet, Thyrsis used descriptive language to convey the import of the responses of Nature to be observed. Thyrsis' speech suggests the irony with which he offered his observation using a metaphor in which the aesthetic appeal of sunlight is the stimulus to the emotion of hope, and with it, the idea of a spiritual purity or innocence from sin that leads to heaven. Thyrsis' phrase 'deck'd the op'ning skies with rosie light' set in contrast to the 'Our fears our guilt our darkness to dispel' of the 'horrid jaws of hell' lent an artificial quality to render him a comic figure, in a similar manner to Dryden's speaker in his translation of Virgil's fourth eclogue and Pope's *Messiah*.<sup>355</sup> The attitude this kind of Modern dialect conveyed betrayed Thyrsis corrupted character in a manner that allowed Thomson to illustrate the effects of his fallen condition within the sinful society that has shaped his way of expressing its perspective.

---

<sup>354</sup> James Thomson, 'A Dialogue betwixt David, Thyrsis, and the Angell Gabriel' in Newberry Library, *Miscelany Poems*

<sup>355</sup> James Thomson, 'Upon Beauty' in Newberry Library, *Miscelany Poems*

The poem that follows, *Psalm 104 Paraphrased*, turns to its biblical source to consider the context within which one should reflect upon this notion of redemption to be gained through the cultivating of a love of the idea of beauty. Thomson did this through parody in which the conventions of pastoral allowed him to consider the inherent flaw in the popular Neoplatonic belief that man develops a love for God through his sensitivity to the aesthetic beauty of Nature. Creation, as Thomson paraphrased the Psalm, leads us ‘To praise thy Authour, soul, do not forget | Canst thou in gratitude deny thy debt’ because God provides man with a path to Him through His works of nature which are the manifestation of His goodness. Much like Thyrsis’ comments in the previous poem, though, Thomson’s speaker adopted the Modern mannerisms of speech of his period,

Thou’st firmly founded this unready earth  
Hand fast for are thou saidst att natures birth  
The swelling flood o’er the earth madst creep  
And cover’d it with the vast hoary deep’.<sup>356</sup>

The speaker’s words suggest the cynicism of a Modern sensibility with which a contemporary of Thomson’s would reason about God’s hand. The humour with which Thomson offered this depiction of the speaker describing God’s power also betrays how that made him insensible to his own fallen nature which would merit God’s punishment.

The grouping of poems concluded with a poem that returned to the idea of pastoral love which a woman’s physical beauty prompts in terms drawn from Christian belief that demonstrate the consequences of that fallen condition. Thomson’s parody of the pastoral plaint, *A Yielding*

---

<sup>356</sup> James Thomson, ‘Psalm 104 Paraphrased’ in Newberry Library, *Miscelany Poems*

*Maid*, concluded with an insight drawn from the attempt of a young virgin to resist a would-be lover's seduction it relates:

Then he drew nigh and sunk upon her breast  
With wreathing arms he clung about her waste  
And to conclude the yielding maid enjoyed  
And six years' vertue in a trice destroy'd.<sup>357</sup>

In explaining the temptation to sinful sexual indulgence to which physical beauty leads in the final lines, Thomson completed his efforts to recontextualize Platonic thought by describing the acknowledged tendency to indulge in aesthetic pleasure that physical beauty prompts within a Christian context. Thomson implied that love of moral beauty takes shape in the attempt to preserve the sexual purity which is the virtue made visible in a woman's physical appeal.

Sambrook notes *A Yielding Maid* to be of a character, however, that 'totters timidly on lubricity'.<sup>358</sup> The speaker's colloquial diction which lent it that character allowed Thomson to adopt the guise of the shepherd-bard to suggest the irony with which it is that loveliness through which the virtue it represents is lost. In doing so, Thomson offered a satiric rendering of pastoral that engaged with the notion that the physical nature of man's mortal condition is what makes it susceptible to seduction. The simplicity Thomson gave to his speaker's manner makes the ease with which one should realize this more pointed.

Each grouping of poems in Thomson's *Miscelany Poems* repeated the same pattern in which each set began with a hymn-like ode that introduced a pastoral ideal which was then developed through the set. Each poem within the set satirized a stage corresponding to a phase of life and its accompanying degree to which an individual at that stage should have developed an

---

<sup>357</sup> James Thomson, 'The Yielding Maid' in Newberry Library, *Miscelany Poems*

<sup>358</sup> James Sambrook, *James Thomson 1700-1748, A Life*, p. 18

understanding of that pastoral ideal in relation to his experiences. Each successive cycle within the manuscript allowed Thomson to lead his reader through a series of associations, through which he examined the ideal of innocence underlying such classical pastoral conventions, to develop his understanding of that ideal within a Christian frame. That method suggests the shared desire among the poets of the tradition of pastoral noted to imagine a literary past in which their ideal of poetic expression--a fusion of form and content that offered a distinctive vehicle for truth—had been the discursive norm from which Eliot's and Leavis' notions of the 'dissociation of sensibility' proceeded.<sup>359</sup> In Thomson's verse, as in the tradition of wit from which he and Pope were descended, the narrative he told of the literary inheritance he shared 'mirrors the verbal textures' with which he told it, so that the 'conduct of his narrative' enabled him to apprehend the meaning of the matter he attempted.<sup>360</sup> This allowed him to transform the shepherd's utterances within the discursive context of Neoclassical pastoral theory into a critical assessment of the understanding of the English nation they were used to fashion.

Thomson's *Miscelany Poems* illustrate how the examples of this in earlier satiric renderings of pastoral offered him the means to engage with the underlying question which divided the Ancients and the Moderns about the character of his society as conceived in relation to the ideal of innocence attributed to the Golden Age. Thomson's manuscript made use of the form of a printed miscellany in which his choice of poems illustrated 'a combination of established and modern voices [which] remind his readers of a British tradition whilst at the same time introducing them to less conventional examples of taste'.<sup>361</sup> In doing so, his schoolboy

---

<sup>359</sup> David Hopkins, 'Dr. Leavis's Seventeenth Century', *Essays in Criticism* 64 (2014), 293-317 (p. 302)

<sup>360</sup> See 'The Metaphysical Poets' in *The Complete Prose of T S Eliot: the Perfect Critic 1919-1926*, Volume 2, ed. by Anthony Cuda and Ronald Schuchard (Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press, 2014) and F. R. Leavis, *The Common Pursuit* (London: Chatto and Windus, 1952)

<sup>361</sup> Louise Curran, 'Reading Milton in Eighteenth-Century Poetic Miscellanies', *Eighteenth-Century Life* 41 (2017), 32-55

exercises that drew upon the classical humane learning also gave occasion for a more sophisticated system of thought. The habits of mind that Thomson formed because of the imitative methods he applied to fashioning his miscellany, formed his habits of writing with which he wove a pattern of ideas into his verse, and through it, later readers' impressions of the patterns of history, as a turn to his *The Seasons* will demonstrate.

### **Thomson and Classical Learning: Examining the Sublime in The Seasons**

Thomson's *Winter* was first published in April 1726. A revised second octavo edition was published in July of the same year. These were followed by a third edition in September 1726 and a fourth edition in February 1727 which appear to be press-variants printed in the same press run as the second edition.<sup>362</sup> A fifth edition was published in March 1728. An octavo edition of *Summer* was published separately in February 1727. A second edition advertised in March 1728 was re-issued with a cancel title-page. The complete *The Seasons* was offered as a subscription quarto in 1730 in which revisions were made to *Winter* and 70 lines transferred to *Autumn*. Sambrook writes that the several pamphlet editions of separate parts of *The Seasons* descend from the quarto edition of 1730 and that the 1730 octavo edition and the *Works* (1738) 'follow the pamphlets by separate lines of descent'.<sup>363</sup> Thomson did not make authorial changes until 1744 edition, some of which are recorded in his hand in the interleaved copy of his 1738 *Works* noted. He authorized further revisions in the 1745 small octavo edition and 1746 duodecimo editions of *The Seasons*. To those amendments, Thomson's friend and executor, Lyttleton, made textual changes in his posthumous edition (1750) which, he writes in his

---

<sup>362</sup> Alexander Lindsay, 'James Thomson', p. 95

<sup>363</sup> James Thomson, *The Seasons*, ed. by James Sambrook (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1981), pp. lii-lvii



‘Preface’, incorporated the last amendments of Thomson, some of which were written in the interleaved copy but which Thomson himself did not choose to publish.<sup>364</sup>

Munby’s catalogue of the books from Thomson’s estate that were sold after his death offers evidence of whose writings he read and from whom he drew the material for making his manuscripts and books from the those that he owned and consumed.<sup>365</sup> Thomson’s manuscripts and early published editions, when compared, reveal that the relation between creative and critical writing lies in how a poet uses allusion to examine the knowledge drawn from reading the classical texts of humane learning: classical conventions offer the poet a means through which he may assess that knowledge, and return to re-assess it within his cultural context through his manner of adapting them into terms that permit him to measure his society against its past. Through this creative process, the poet applies the routine skill he gains from the reading of classical texts that spur him to an interpretative response to it, whose character speaks of an intensity of thought and feeling about the poetic landscape it depicts. Much like Virgil’s *Eclogues*, Thomson’s *The Seasons* made the world of time and place more evident, though there is little geographical consistency, ‘partly because various landscapes function not only as settings but as symbols of states of mind and feeling’.<sup>366</sup>

Such creative writing is also critical though in the sense that Thomson appears to have heeded Thomas Blackwell’s *Enquiry into the Life and Writings of Homer*, a copy of which was among his books that were sold upon his death.<sup>367</sup> He reconstructed a complete *The Seasons*

---

<sup>364</sup> *The Works of James Thomson*, edited by George Lyttelton (London: 1750)

<sup>365</sup> A. N. L. Munby, gen. ed., *Sale Catalogues of Libraries of Eminent Persons, Volume I: Poets and Men of Letters* (London: Mansell, 1971), 45-65

<sup>366</sup> James Sambrook, *English Pastoral Poetry*, p. 23

<sup>367</sup> See Catalogue of Thomson’s estate which lists a copy of Thomas Blackwell, *Letters Concerning Mythology* (London: 1748) on p. 55 among the items for sale in A. N. L. Munby, gen. ed., *Sale Catalogues of Libraries of Eminent Persons, Volume I*

from his early drafts of *Winter* and *Summer* so that in a similar manner to that in which Blackwell noted,

thro' the various Scenes of Antiquity from the first barbarous State of wretched Mortals [he] hurries their gradual Improvement by arts and Laws and Learning, ... [so that the reader] quickly los[es] the Idea of the preceding Section, and would have found it very difficult to have recollected the Thread of the subjects when ... [he] had done.<sup>368</sup>

Thomson did this, however, to modify what in the original *Winter* and *Summer* seemed to be an engagement with ideas about the poet-philosopher and the experience of the sublime with which he became acquainted through reading his copies of Creech's edition of Lucretius' *De Rerum Natura* (1717) and *Paradise Lost* (1711). The latter included Marvell's *On Mr. Milton's Paradise Lost*, which drew its language from Lucretius' verse to both praise and dispraise Milton, as it distinguished the poet's treatment of the sublime from the poet that would fashion an image of himself through such expression.<sup>369</sup>

In *The Seasons*, Thomson drew upon the pattern of use of generic conventions among the tradition of satiric renderings of pastoral discussed, to describe the physical attributes of nature during each season, and at different times of day to depict a stage of psychological maturity. He did so in the first lines of *Summer*, however, in a manner that suggests, as do the cycles of poems

---

<sup>368</sup> Thomas Blackwell, *Letters Concerning Mythology* (London: 1748).

<sup>369</sup> See Munby's Catalogue which lists both Creech's *T Lucretii Cari de Rerum Natura Libros Sex* (Londini: E Typographaeo Mariae Matthews, Sumptibus T Child, B. Tooke, H Clements, W Churchil, 1717) on p. 56 and Andrew Marvell's 'On Mr Milton's Paradise Lost' in *Paradise Lost a Poem in Twelve Books The Author John Milton* (London: Printed for Jacob Tonson at Shakespear's Headover-against Catherine Street at the Strand, 1711) on p. 57 among the items for sale.

in *Miscelany Poems*, that such maturity is indicative of the degree to which one understands the relation of physical beauty to moral beauty:

From brightening Fields of Ether fair disclos'd,  
Child of the Sun, refulgent Summer comes,  
In pride of Youth, and felt thro' Nature's Depth:  
He comes attended by the sultry Hours,  
And ever-fanning Breezes, on his Way;  
While, from his ardent Look, the turning Spring  
Averts her blushing Face; and Earth, and Skies,  
All-smiling to his hot Dominion leaves.<sup>370</sup>

The speaker's reference to the 'sultry hours' and Spring's response of averting her blush as she retreated from Summer's 'hot Dominion' suggests the knowledge gained of sexual desire explained through sensory experience. This allowed Thomson to parody the philosopher-poet, who here resembles the cultured poet that adopted the guise of the simple shepherd. The speaker's developing aesthetic sensibility to nature, conveyed through the sensuous language noted above, also denotes the fallen condition into which he is rendered, because of the innate disposition to sinful pleasure that it suggests.

The speaker's response to 'haste into the mid-wood Shade, | Where scarce a Sun-beam wanders thro' the Gloom' to 'the dark-green Grass, besides the Brink | Of haunted Stream' suggests the psychological effects of this.<sup>371</sup> His retreat from the display of sensual nature enacts the pastoral notion of respite to be found in solitary contemplation. In doing so, though, it betrays

---

<sup>370</sup> James Thomson, 'Winter' in *The Seasons*, ed. by James Sambrook (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1981), p. 58 lines 1-8

<sup>371</sup> James Thomson, 'Winter', p. 58, lines 9-10 and 11-2

the loss of innocence necessary to attain the sophistication with which the philosopher-poet attains knowledge of larger truths. Thomson's depiction of his speaker's fall suggests that he was cognizant of the potentially sexual corrupting effect that such aesthetic impressions of nature's beauty prompts. Thomson's manner of parodying that fall, however, insinuated that the speaker's mortal nature prevents him from attaining the love of moral beauty and God, its source, to which nature should lead.

This method of use of pastoral conventions Thomson had learned allowed him to construct that satiric response to classical philosophy using three kinds of classical allegory: physical, historical, and moral. Thomson drew upon the tradition of such replies to classical ideas, as found in the verse noted, which used the practice of inventing myths to account for natural phenomena. In doing so, he imitated the tradition's use of the progression of the times of day and the seasons to explain the finite essence of nature as metaphor for the stages of human desire within a Christian idea of sin and human mortality as consequence. Thomson also made use of the practice in classical historical allegory of making gods of earthly rulers whose subjects deified them or benefactors who taught them specific skills.<sup>372</sup> His speaker's eye ranged from simple perceptions of nature, and the forms of fancy they evoke, to suggest the manner through which sense enables the reason to form abstract notions about what it perceives, which should lead to higher intimations.

This allowed Thomson to fashion 'allegorical renderings of the seasons' as represented in the plates in the Millan and Millar's quarto and octavo editions in 1730 to satirize the kind of 'mythopoetic' account of the 'divinely ordered universe' offered in the illustrations.<sup>373</sup> Thomson

---

<sup>372</sup> Isabella Rivers, *Classical and Christian Ideas in English Renaissance Poetry* (New York: Routledge, 1994), p. 22

<sup>373</sup> Kwinten Van der Walle, 'Editorialising Practices, Competitive marketability, and James Thomson's *The Seasons*', *Journal for Eighteenth Century Studies* 38 (2015), 257-76 (p. 259)

depiction of his personified seasons drew upon Dryden's translation of Virgil's description of Venus speaking to Aeneas in the disguise of a huntress, and Pope's *Windsor Forest*, which recasts Elizabeth I as Diana as preface to its image of Anne. This enabled his parody of the kind of idealized myths earlier and contemporaneous writers fashioned about their history. This also allowed Thomson to describe a nation's history in terms of Hellenic cycles that mirror the pattern of the times of day or seasons within human history. These methods of satire offered the means through which he, much like Pope, insinuated the illusive character of such accounts of history that relied upon the fiction of a state of ideal innocence once lost which has never characterized the fallen world.

Thomson's pastorals *Winter* and *Summer* were written as stand-alone pieces - each an exercise in imitating a form. Thomson refashioned them according to an idea gleaned from his reading in classical humanist thought. In his letter to Aaron Hill dated 18 April 1726, Thomson distinguished social love, which carries with it the idea of moral beauty and perfection, and self-love, which some consider to be its original.<sup>374</sup> His comment suggests his acquaintance with John Dennis' *The Advancement of Modern Poetry*. Robert Inglesfield writes that both Dennis and Hill, who had been proponents of the Longinus' concept of the poetic sublime, influenced Thomson's writing at that time.<sup>375</sup> Dennis contended that religion raised poetry to a sublimity, which pleased both the passions and the reason to instruct and move, as compared with the enthusiasm the Ancients evoked through their mixing of obscene verse with Cupid, Venus, and the 'Amorous Divinities' that tended toward ribaldry.<sup>376</sup> In his 'Preface' to *The Creation* (1720), Hill drew

---

<sup>374</sup> Alan D. McKillop, ed., *James Thomson (1700-1748) Letters and Documents*

<sup>375</sup> Robert Inglesfield, 'James Thomson, Aaron Hill, and the Poetic Sublime', *Journal for Eighteenth-Century Studies* 13 (1990), (p. 215)

<sup>376</sup> *The Advancement and Reformation of Modern Poetry. A Critical Discourse, in Two Parts ... By Mr. Dennis* (London: Printed for Rich. Parker, at the Unicorn under the Piazza of the Royal Exchange in Cornhil, 1701)

upon Dennis' treatise to note that this aesthetic character of sublime religious poetry seen in Hebrew verse was achieved through a 'terrible Simplicity' and 'a magnificent Plainness'; to that he added that while the Moderns praised that character, it was 'commonly lost, in Paraphrase, by our mistaken Endeavours after heightening the Sentiments, by a figurative Expression' in the manner of the his contemporaries notions of the Miltonic sublime.<sup>377</sup> Dennis' argument had echoed Longinus' notion of the sublime to maintain 'for Passion in a Poem, is Genius and the Power of exciting Passion, is Genius in a Poet; to the raising of which, Religion, as we have shown above, gives a very great Advantage'.<sup>378</sup> Aaron Hill's comment though suggests why the methods of prosody, to which Dennis attributed the character of both the verse of the Ancients and Milton, impeded the understanding of the divine attained through the heightened state of consciousness, the sublime experience of nature enables depicted in Lucretius' *De Rerum Natura*.

Thomson's 'Preface' insinuated the view to be taken of the positions derived from Dennis and Hill's writings, as compared with his own reading of Ancient and Modern verse, and his imitations from it. He turned to paraphrase Virgil using Modern colloquial diction to demonstrate the effect rendered as the poet turns to that kind of simplicity of expression when speaking of God's Creation:

Me may the Muses, my supreme Delight!  
Whose Priest I am, smith with Immense Desire,  
Snatch to their Care; the Starry Tracts disclose,  
The Sun's distress, the Labours of the Moon:

---

<sup>377</sup> Aaron Hill, *The Creation a Pindaric Illustration of a Poem Originally Written by Moses on that Subject With a a Preface to Mr Pope Concerning The Sublimity of Ancient Hebrew Poetry and a Material and Obvious Defect in the English* (London: Printed for T. Bickerton, at the Crown in Pater-Noster-Row 1720), p. vi

<sup>378</sup> John Dennis, *The Advancement and Reformation of Modern Poetry*, p. 28

Whence the Earth quakes: and by what Force the Deeps

Heave at the Rocks, then on themselves reflow:<sup>379</sup>

Thomson's use of the speech of a Modern English rustic lent Virgil's verse the simplicity Dennis lauded. It also gave it a coarseness though that was deemed ill-suited to the sublime poetry which undermined claims that such sublimity reflected the image of the mind of the poet-prophet of Longinus' description.

The language of Thomson's preface, which Tim Fulford likens to Dennis' description of the sublimity of Milton's poetry in terms of Longinus' ideas about the affective power of figurative language, suggests that nature elicits such an outburst of excited thought that should raise the viewer to higher moral feeling.<sup>380</sup> Thomson's manner of doing so though offers evidence of how Marvell's measured assessment of Milton in *On Mr. Milton's Paradise Lost* had served as his model. The poem which, as noted, preceded *Paradise Lost* in Thomson's copy drew upon Lucretius' notion of the sublime captured in *De Rerum Natura*, Book III, lines 28–30, which Nigel Smith translates: 'Thereupon from all these things a sort of divine delight gets hold upon me and a shuddering, because nature thus by thy power has been so manifestly laid open and uncovered in every part'.<sup>381</sup> Marvell paraphrased this to insinuate the fault in Milton to be discerned in his method of evoking sublime feeling of 'delight and horror [that] on us seize' through his manner of presenting the prospect of God's Creation in which 'he hast not miss'd one thought that could be fit'.<sup>382</sup> Marvell praised as he dispraised, noting 'That majesty which through thy work doth reign | Draws the devout, deterring the profane', so that the 'things divine'

---

<sup>379</sup> James Thomson, 'Preface' in *The Seasons*, ed by James Sambrook (Oxford, Clarendon Press, 1986), Appendix B, p. 306

<sup>380</sup> Tim Fulford, *Landscape, Liberty, and Authority: Poetry, Criticism and Politics from Thomson to Wordsworth* (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, September 2009), p. 20

<sup>381</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'On Milton's Paradise Lost' in *Paradise Lost* (1711)

<sup>382</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'On Milton's Paradise Lost', lines 27 and 35

Milton treats also seems intended to draw a comparison between him and the Creator.<sup>383</sup> His manner of doing so though so ‘As them preserves, and thee, inviolate’ suggests to Marvell that the Milton composed his verse to give the impression of him as ‘above human flight dost soar aloft’ because of his desire to appear a poet-prophet.<sup>384</sup>

Thomson’s comments in his ‘Preface’ which framed his illustrative translation of Virgil employ a similar irony in its description of the effect sublime Nature has upon the poet that echoes Marvell’s. In his ‘Preface’, Thomson appropriated Marvell’s interpretation of Lucretius to likewise to offer a humorous image of the philosopher-poet who sublime Nature moves to an outpouring of religious ecstasy:

I know no subject more elevating, more amusing; more ready to awake the poetical Enthusiasm, the philosophical Reflection, and the moral Sentiment, than the Works of Nature. Where can we meet with such Variety, such Beauty, such Magnificence? All that enlarges, and transports, the Soul? ... but there is no thinking of these Things without breaking into POETRY: which is, by the bye, a plain, and undeniable, Argument of their superior EXCELLENCE’.<sup>385</sup>

Thomson use of hyperbolic language to parody that of Dennis in his rendering of the gentleman, turned philosopher and critic, reminds of Pope’s satiric reply to the other satiric renderings of pastoral discourse in *The Guardian*. In doing so, it offers evidence as to why Thomson engaged with the position of Dennis and other Moderns about the aesthetic and literary values underlying

---

<sup>383</sup>Andrew Marvell, ‘On Milton’s Paradise Lost’, lines 31-32, 33, 34 and 37

<sup>384</sup>Andrew Marvell, ‘On Milton’s Paradise Lost’, lines 31-32, 33, 34 and 37

<sup>385</sup>James Thomson, ‘Preface’, p. 305



their account of literary history in which Milton, whom they would likewise render ‘inviolable’, was given a prominent position.

With this idea, Thomson’s revisions suggest the limits to which a student of the underlying philosophy may attain understanding. Edward Holberton has suggested that Milton is the source for the metaphors of empire with which Thomson’s *The Seasons* engaged with the questions of British national identity that concerned the Moderns account of its literary history: the poem’s ‘representations of the natural world became more of a theodicy of nature’s variety’ that also addresses man’s attempt to harness that variety.<sup>386</sup> The speaker’s digressions about nature’s violence drew attention though to the speaker’s struggle to reconcile the corruption inherent to society’s persistence that turned to the ‘law of nations’ identified with the ‘law of nature’ to justify its cost within ideas about a Providential history.<sup>387</sup> Thomson illustrated through several of the speaker’s other digressions how each of his perceptions about the nature of human experience impeded his ability to understand that it is social love that allowed men to come to love the idea of moral beauty that is the divine rather than aide it. The recurring pattern of the speaker’s thoughts, which the recurrences he perceived in nature elicit, reenacted the fall into a state of sin that rendered man into a mortal condition, denoted in his susceptibility to seduction through the senses. Thomson’s speaker then illustrated that because man is insensible to his fallen state, he is prevented from apprehending God’s hand in the recurring pattern with which his subjective experience mirrors that of human history. Thomson suggested through this that his humanity, which such a fallen condition represents, prevents him from attaining the understanding of Providence that the sublime was thought to enable.

---

<sup>386</sup> Edward Holberton, ‘James Thomson’s *The Seasons* and the Empire of the Seas’, *Huntington Library Quarterly*, 78 (2015), 41-60 (p. 56)

<sup>387</sup> Annabel Brett, *Changes of State: Nature and the Limits of the City in Early Modern Natural Law* (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 2011) p. 11–36 and 75–89.

Sambrook notes that the character of the first folio edition of *Winter* (1726) resembles a 'devotional prayer' which includes personified Melancholy in the second stanza.<sup>388</sup> It lacks, however, the apostrophes to specific historical figures and the use of notions of empire and the times of day that make the 1730 edition of *The Seasons* a complete allegorical cycle. The allegory presented in Thomson's set of pastorals is possible because of the manner through which an isolated reference, such as that to personified Melancholy, is developed more fully in the second and later editions. In the first folio of *Winter*, Thomson wrote:

A Philosophical Melancholy breathes,  
And bears the swelling Thought aloft to Heaven  
Then forming Fancy rouses to conceive,  
What never mingled with the Vulgar's Dream.<sup>389</sup>

Thomson later drew upon this method of abstracting a mood to characterize it through the poet-speaker's perceptions of melancholy's effects upon him. In the second edition, Thomson used the notion of melancholy as a mood to depict the aesthetic character of Winter through the speaker's impression of Winter's actions that elicit such a psychological response. Thomson wrote,

... Thus Winter falls,  
A heavy Gloom oppressive o'er the World,  
Thro' Nature shedding Influence malign,  
And rouses the Seeds of dark Disease.  
The Soul of Man dies in him, loathing Life,

---

<sup>388</sup> James Sambrook, ed., *The Seasons* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1981), pp. vii-x and Appendix A, pp. 260-70

<sup>389</sup> James Thomson, 'Winter' in *The Seasons*, ed. by James Sambrook (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1981), Appendix A, l. 66-69

And black with more than melancholy views.<sup>390</sup>

Thomson's engagement with Platonic and Stoic philosophy thus relied upon how he depicted the poet-speaker as that whom the aesthetic influence of nature in the figure of Winter personified acted upon him. This allowed Thomson to demonstrate the difficulty aesthetic sensibility to nature poses to cultivating the reason in a manner that leads to the love of moral and intellectual and the idea of beauty.

This kind of development may be found in comparing the 1726 edition to 1730 edition where the personification of Winter as the conqueror and Year as his conquest that were isolated references using generic conventions of the tradition were developed into more substantial personifications. Amendments such as these allowed Thomson to develop the figures and the poetic methods to characterize them that are key to the allegory of later works and revisions. McKillop notes *The Seasons* are 'a syncretism of traditions of Stoic contemplation of the divine harmonies of the universe, the identification of the individual reason with the world-reason illustrated in Cicero, and Seneca revived in Renaissance humanism, accessible through Shafteburian enthusiasm'.<sup>391</sup> The revisions Thomson made to these personifications allowed him to use detailed description broaching history and science to depict the ideal philosopher-poet-virtuoso's career of discovery, in which he observed the 'perfect world order' within Christian notions of the Book of Nature as God's works, which may be read to achieve a religious sublime.<sup>392</sup> The more burlesque language and elements in later editions enabled Thomson to amend the personifications of the two figures of Winter and the Year to offer a satiric rendering

---

<sup>390</sup> James Thomson, 'Winter' in *The Seasons*, ed. by James Sambrook (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1981), p. 205 lines 57-62

<sup>391</sup> Alan Dugald Mckillop, *The Background of The Seasons* (Minneapolis; University of Minnesota Press, 1942) p. 18

<sup>392</sup> Alan Dugald Mckillop, *The Background of The Seasons*, p. 18

of the philosopher-poet whose subjectivity, Sambrook has influentially argued, is dramatized in *The Seasons*.<sup>393</sup> A section added in 1730 and later versions until 1738, but excised in 1746, describing the nightly toils of the Matron at the spindle are prefaced with the following lines:

The Stars obtuse emit a shivering Ray;  
Or frequent seem to shoot athwart the Gloom,  
And long behind them trail the whitening Blaze,  
Snatch'd in short eddies plays the wither'd Leaf;  
And on the Flood the dancing Feather floats.<sup>394</sup>

The seeming sexual nature of these lines which use figurative language that might describe sexual organism. Much like amendments elsewhere in the later editions, those lines allowed Thomson to create his caricature of the figure of the Stoic philosopher. This change revised the allusion to him in the folio 1726 edition which has been read as an early example of the Romantic prophetic bard. Here the poet-speaker's perceptions do not suggest the Stoic 'wise man' in a 'state of apathy', 'free from the passions'; instead his subjective impressions of the effects of Winter suggest both the 'fear' and 'lust' of the 'diseased passionate man'.<sup>395</sup> The speaker's reason, weakened by his sensuous nature, impeded his progress along the path of virtue, so that trust in Providence is the speaker's final comfort, rather than the happiness he ought to have attained by the conclusion of *Winter*.

In doing this, Thomson once again drew upon Lucretius' notion of the sublime, which influenced Milton depiction of it, and Marvell's measured assessment in *On Mr. Milton's Paradise Lost*, as noted above. Milton attempted to show how the sublime is linked to notions of

---

<sup>393</sup> James Sambrook, ed, *The Seasons*, p. xxxiv

<sup>394</sup> James Thomson, 'Winter' (1981), p. 208 lines 126-29

<sup>395</sup> Isabella Rivers, *Classical and Christian Ideas in English Renaissance Poetry*, p. 22

beauty in which God's moral essence becomes manifest to us through nature. Milton offered an example of how moral beauty is expressed in physical beauty in an early description of Eve in the Garden of Eden: that Satan is rendered 'stupidly good' when faced with Eve's physical loveliness illustrates how God's moral beauty, reflected in the physical beauty of Nature, overwhelms in a manner that renders men humble.<sup>396</sup> This idea is reflected in Shaftsbury's *Characteristics of Men, Manners, Opinions, and Times*, a copy of which was included in Munby's catalogue of the items of Thomson's library.<sup>397</sup> For Shaftsbury, moral beauty was a 'beauty of the sentiments, the grace of actions, the turn of characters, and the proportions of a human mind'.<sup>398</sup> Eve's graceful form served as Milton's demonstration that beauty is a matter of harmonious proportions or 'numbers'. Milton's Eve also offered evidence supporting Shaftsbury's assertion that if moral goodness is analogous to beauty, then it is still possible for moral goodness to be non-arbitrarily grounded in objective features of the natural world, and for a moral agent to be attracted to virtue for its own sake, rather than because of self-interest.

Thomson drew directly from his reading of Shaftsbury, illustrating his own contention in the episode of Damon and Musidora that he added to the revised edition of *Summer* in 1730. The episode imitated a tradition of usage from Spenser and Dryden that inspires Pope's use of the figure of Diana (also referred to as Lodona) to addresses such notions. The tradition of classical historical allegory of likening human figures to goddesses suggests that physical beauty is, as it was in Thomson's *A Dialogue betwixt David, Thyrsis, and the Angell Gabriel upon the Birth of*

---

<sup>396</sup> John Milton, *Paradise Lost* (1711)

<sup>397</sup> Anthony Ashley-Cooper, Earl of Shaftsbury, *Characteristics of Men, Manners, Opinions, and Times in Three Volumes By the Right Honorable Anthony, Earl of Shaftsbury The Fifth Edition corrected With the Addition of a Letter Concerning Design* (London: Printed by John Darbyl, 1732)

<sup>398</sup> Anthony Ashley-Cooper, Earl of Shaftsbury, *Characteristics of Men, Manners, Opinions, and Times*

*our Saviour*, simply the dress through which moral beauty manifests itself, and through which virtuous action may arise:

... and now with streaming Locks,  
That half embrac'd Her in a humid Veil,  
Rising again, Damon drew  
Such madning Draughts of Beauty to the Soul,  
... Check'd at last,  
By Love's respectful Modesty, he deem'd  
The theft profane ... struggling from the Shade,  
With headlong Hurry fled; but first these lines ...  
with trembling Hand he threw. " Bathe on, my Fair,  
"Yet unbeheld safe by the sacred Eye  
"Of faithful Love. I go to guard thy Haunt,"<sup>399</sup>

Damon, however, failed to apprehend the nature of moral beauty through Musidora's physical beauty suggesting moral innocence. Though her loveliness prompted his moral action, Damon's words suggest that he only conceived of her virtue in terms of his sensuous desire to possess it. This passage seems to echo Francis Bacon's *Of the Advancement of Learning* which was among Thomson's books.<sup>400</sup> In it Bacon concedes the limits of human understanding because of its sensual nature. Of this he writes in:

So of Knowledge it selfe & the Mind of Man, whereto the Senses  
are but Reporters ... *God hath made all things Beautiful and*

---

<sup>399</sup> James Thomson, 'Summer' in *The Seasons*, ed by James Sambrook (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1981), p. 122 lines 1329-51

<sup>400</sup> A. N. L. Munby, gen ed, *Sale Catalogues of Libraries of Eminent Persons, Volume I*

*Decent in the true returne of their seasons; also he hath placed the  
world in man's heart, yet cannot man find out the worke which  
God worketh from beginning unto the end:*<sup>401</sup>

In a similar manner to Marvell's Damon, Thomson's Damon presents a comic figure whose susceptibility to seduction through his senses rendered him insensible to his own moral character. That, in turn, impeded his understanding from attaining the self-knowledge which his subjective experience should have aided.

Thomson framed this episode of Damon and Musidora within the narrative of the poet-speaker – the figure through whom he responded to the idea with which Bacon engaged that some knowledge is beyond human understanding. Thomson adopted the conventions of the tradition of usage mentioned above, which he refashioned to allude to Adam and Eve, in the context of satirizing the philosopher-poet-speaker musing about the divine plan. The addition of the episode illustrates the clouded vision of the poet-prophet that was a theme developed through the length of the poem. The speaker, for example, described Musidora's response to Damon's virtuous action in the 1730 edition of *Summer* thus:

As if to Marble struck, devoid of Sense,  
A stupid Moment motionless she stood;  
So stands the \*Statue that enchanted the World,  
So bending tries to veil the matchless Boast,  
Recovering, swift she flew to find those Robes  
Which blissful Eden knew not.<sup>402</sup>

---

<sup>401</sup> Francis Bacon, *Of the Advancement of Learning* (Oxford: 1640)

<sup>402</sup> James Thomson, 'Summer' in *The Seasons*, ed. by James Sambrook (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1981), 1  
1326-51

Thomson's lines here imitated the language of Milton's description of Satan who, as noted previously, was rendered insensible when he beheld Eve's beauty, to suggest the manner through which the sense and the passions it evokes can overwhelm. In doing so, Thomson parodied Milton's illustration of the power of the beautiful to elicit the feeling of affection that denotes God's virtue in those of his making. Thomson's allusion to the innocent state in which Adam and Eve lived in the Garden of Eden drew attention to the nature of the fallen condition from which Satan also suffered after they each transgressed against God. That allowed him to demonstrate how the effects of that fallen state in which their faculties of sense made their reason vulnerable to misapprehension.

Thomson, in doing so, presented the irony that the sense which should aide man's understanding only enables knowledge of his sinful character. The speaker's language describing Musidora suggests that he perceived the difference between these two states to which his sense made him subject. Still, he was unable to grasp that larger truth to which his own reason should have led him. The speaker's lengthy digression reminds of Marvell's comment referring to Milton's detailed attention to describing sublime Nature, which leads him to the ecstatic outpouring of poetry, to preserve his inviolate image. Thomson's poem thus demonstrated how the speaker's corporeal form through which his perception of the beauty ought to have permitted him to experience social love, could impede, rather than enable the moral sentiments it should prompt.

The Damon and Musidora episode, which was not present in the 1727 folio edition of *Summer*, was revised for the 1744 edition, though the lines above were included in all the editions from 1730 forward. In the 1730 edition, the passage began:

'Twas then beneath a secret-waving shade



Where winded into lovely solitudes  
Runs out the rambling dale, that DAMON sat,  
Thoughtful, and fix'd in philosophic muse:  
DAMON who still amid the savage woods,  
And lonely lawns, the force of beauty scorn'd,  
Firm, and to false philosophy devote.<sup>403</sup>

His response to Musidora's appearance made explicit the position towards Platonic philosophy concerning the love of moral beauty that develops in response to physical beauty:

Delicious dress'd in rosy-dimpled smiles,  
And all one softness, melted on the sense.  
Nor PARIS panted stronger, when aside  
The rival-goddesses the veil divine  
Cast unconfin'd, and gave him all their charms,  
Than, DAMON, thou; the stoick no more ...<sup>404</sup>

The language and references suggest Thomson's intentional engagement with classical learning.

The revisions in the 1744 edition, however, reframed the episode:

CLOSE in the Covert of an Hazel Copse,  
Where winded into pleasing Solitudes  
Runs out the rambling Dale, young DAMON sat,  
Pensive, and pierc'd with LOVE's delightful Pangs,  
There to the Stream that down the distant Rocks

---

<sup>403</sup> James Thomson, 'Summer' (1981), p. 120 note about lines 1269-75 in 1730 edition

<sup>404</sup> James Thomson, 'Summer. A Poem' in *The Seasons*, ed. by James Sambrook (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1981), Appendix A, 1286-97

Hoarse-murmuring fell, and plaintive Breeze that play'd  
Among the bending Willows, falsely he  
Of MUSIDORA'S Cruelty complain'd.  
She felt his Flame: but deep within her Breast,  
The soft Return conceal'd; save when it stole  
In side-long Glance from her downcast Eye,  
Or from her swelling Soul in stifled Sighs.<sup>405</sup>

Thomson's revisions in 1744 conceded the unqualified eroticism of the episode in the 1730 edition which, Sebastian Mitchell has influentially argued, Thomson justified by showing how the sexual desire Damon feels, allows him to overcome his inhibiting sense of stoical self-detachment, and become an affective social being.<sup>406</sup> In the 1744 edition, Thomson replaced the classical context in which one might have read Damon's virtuous action later in the passage to that of a Christian one. Thompson's choice of the word 'falsely' to describe Damon's subjective impression of Musidora's cruelty because she refrained from any physical expression of her desire for him betrayed the poet-speaker's Christian moral position towards sexual indulgence. The speaker's language also expressed his sense of the character of love with which Damon was struck at the sight of Musidora bathing: the 'pure ingenuous Elegance of Soul | a delicate Refinement, known to Few, | [that] perplex'd his Breast, and urg'd him to retire'.<sup>407</sup> The passage quoted above likewise places emphasis on the moral action of Musidora, who despite the promptings of desire, chooses to remain modest.

---

<sup>405</sup> James Thomson, 'Summer', p. 118 lines 1269-81

<sup>406</sup> Sebastian Mitchell, 'James Thomson's picture collection and British history painting', *Journal of the History of Collections* 23 (2011), 127-51 (p. 138)

<sup>407</sup> James Thomson, 'Summer' (1981), p. 119 1295-97

That allowed Thomson to give example of how the physical beauty that is supposed to reflect inner moral beauty can impede moral development. The amendments Thomson made to the description of Musidora's expression of her reserve towards Damon suggests the dubiousness of such a premise. Although Musidora's physical beauty filled him with sensation and emotion, Damon was, as Thomson wrote 'Check'd at last, | By Love's respectful Modesty ... deem[ing] the theft profane'.<sup>408</sup> To the 1744 edition, however, Thomson added Musidora's response:

Her sudden Bosom seiz'd: Shame void of Guilt,  
The charming Blush of Innocence, Esteem  
And Admiration of her Lover's Flame,  
By Modesty exalted. Even a Sense  
Of self-approving Beauty stole across her busy Thought<sup>409</sup>

The irony with which Thomson imbues this addition through his choice of words describing the physical manifestations of Musidora's affective response makes clear the speaker's Christian view of Musidora's vanity which Damon's moral action stirs. Additional lines which Thomson added also gave Musidora's confession:

'By Fortune too much favour'd, but by Love,  
'Alas! Not favour'd less, be still as now  
'Discreet: the Time may come you need not fly.'<sup>410</sup>

These lines suggest that reasoning about what he observed of Damon and Musidora only enables the speaker to realize that a love of physical beauty may lead to sinful indulgence. This allowed

---

<sup>408</sup> James Thomson, 'Summer' (1981), p. 122 lines 133-34

<sup>409</sup> James Thomson, 'Summer' (1981), p. 123 lines 1356-61

<sup>410</sup> James Thomson, 'Summer' (1981), p. 123 lines 1368-70

Thomson to undermine the belief that a love of nature, perceived to be the expression of God's moral beauty, leads men to apprehend His essence.

The speaker's moral tone suggests the importance to be placed upon beauty as the manifestation of that goodness within the context of Lucretius' notion of the sublime as described in Marvell's 'On Mr Milton's Paradise Lost' and to which Thomson alluded through his reference to Damon's 'delightful pangs'.<sup>411</sup> That allowed Thomson to address the limits of human reason to fully understand sensory experience itself. Thomson developed this idea further in *Winter*, where the speaker exclaimed,

And here can I forget the generous Band\*,  
Who, touch'd with human Woe, regressive searched  
Into the Horrors of the gloomy Jail?  
Unpitied, and unheard, where Misery moans;  
Where sickness pined; where Thirst and Hunger burn ...<sup>412</sup>

This insinuates that the speaker was unable to see beyond the physical reality of the experience of oppression, described in terms of the sensations which the Winter season induced, to see how his own sympathy arose because of the ugliness of suffering, as compared with the effects of moral beauty. The speaker, as depicted, could not see the evil in the world as conceived in terms of the experience of hardship that were the effects of deified Winter to understand the nature of the divine hand at work to bring about good from evil. At the passing of Hammond, the bardic speaker could only exclaim of the poet that his "diffusing charm" and "wit" and "virtues ... only shew'd, to check our fond Pursuits, | And teach our humble Hopes that Life is vain" to express his doubt in the power of poetry to cultivate the moral beauty, intellectual beauty, and finally the

---

<sup>411</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'On Mr Milton's Paradise Lost' in *Paradise Lost* (1711)

<sup>412</sup> James Thomson, 'Winter' (1981), p. 220 lines 359-63

idea of beauty as the Platonists write.<sup>413</sup> The lines Thomson added to *Summer* which preface this, then, allowed Thomson to more explicitly characterize the speaker in a manner that challenges the underlying premise that prophetic vision will arise from the experience of the sublime.

### **The Afterlife of Thomson: the ‘Romantic Thomson’ and the ‘Canonical Thomson’**

The self-conception Thomson presented to his readers through his manuscripts and printed books as may be discerned from the discussion above plays against later responses to him. The response to Thomson in the Augustan era of correctness and didacticism was to suggest that his descriptive qualities enabled moral instruction. For later editors and scholars who sought to fashion a ‘canonical Thomson’, however, the task was to demonstrate that Thomson’s writing satisfied such criteria. In the eighteenth century, authors from Alexander Pope and Joseph and Thomson Warton to William Collins were admiring and, in some cases, understood to have adapted the Miltonic sublime, which contemporaries such as John Dennis had appropriated, but dissociated from its Civil War associations.<sup>414</sup> In following this, a taste developed among his rivals mentioned in which extravagant description, similar to that of Arabian poetry, was used to examine the manner through which it evoked moral sentiment, without the inhibiting rationality and ‘omnipresent social tone’ of Augustan verse.<sup>415</sup> Later editors and scholars, however, such as George Lyttelton and John Mitford revised and fitted Thomson according to the rule by which they constructed their canon.

---

<sup>413</sup> Isabel Rivers, *Classical and Christian Ideas in the English Renaissance*; James Thomson, ‘Winter’ (1981), p. 230 lines 559-70

<sup>414</sup> Christine Gerrard, ‘Pope, Peri Bathous, and the Whig Sublime’ in *“Cultures of Whiggism”*: *New Essays on English Literature and Culture in the Long Eighteenth Century*, ed. by David Womersley (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 2005), p. 201-202

<sup>415</sup> Roger Lonsdale, ed, *The Poems of Gray, Collins, and Goldsmith* (New York: Longman Limited Group, 1969), p. 368

Although Thomson made very few changes to *The Seasons* between the 1730 and 1738 editions, some of those he did make in 1744, as noted above, he recorded alongside those Lyttleton made in an interleaved copy of Thomson's 1738 *Works*.<sup>416</sup> This interleaved copy passed into the ownership of the nineteenth-century scholar John Mitford, as he wrote in his 'Preface' to his edition of *The Poetry of Thomas Gray* (1814).<sup>417</sup> Mitford later published several of the revisions, comparing those which Thomson made to those which Lyttleton made in his posthumous 1750 edition of Thomson's *Works* in *The Gentleman's Magazine* in December 1841.<sup>418</sup> A transcript of the copy may be found in D. C. Tovey's edition of Thomson's *Poetical Works* (1897).<sup>419</sup> Otto Zippel also included the substantive revisions in his critical edition of *The Seasons* (1908).<sup>420</sup> Peter Cunningham identified the second hand to be that of Lyttleton's in 1847, which George Macaulay confirmed in 1904, by comparing the interleaved copy to letters of Lyttleton's included in the Newcastle Papers in the British Library.<sup>421</sup>

Thomson's letter to Elizabeth Young on 28 April 1743 suggests the occasion for the revisions he was about to begin to make: 'I am going, if I can, to put a finishing Hand to the Description of a Season now in high Song and Beauty, but to which I am dead. You alone I hear, You alone I see: all Harmony and Beauty are comprized in You'.<sup>422</sup> Inglefield notes that Thomson, who hoped to wed Miss Young, probably intended the interleaved copy to be used

---

<sup>416</sup> BL, C.28.e.17, James Thomson, *The Works of James Thomson* (London: 1738)

<sup>417</sup> John Mitford, 'Essay on Gray's Poetry' in *The Works of Thomson Gray* (London: 1816), pp. cxi-clxxvi

<sup>418</sup> John Mitford, 'Thomson's *The Seasons* and Their Various Readings', *Gentleman's Magazine* (December 1841), 563-83

<sup>419</sup> James Thomson, *Poetical Works: New Edition with memoir and critical appendices by D C Tovey*, 2 vols (London: G Bell, 1897), i, pp. 189J-260

<sup>420</sup> *Thomson's Seasons*, edited by Otto Zippel (1908)

<sup>421</sup> Robert Inglefield, 'The British Library Revisions to *The Seasons*', *The Library*, 6 (1979), 62-9 (p. 62)

<sup>422</sup> Alan Dugald McKillop, ed., *James Thomson: Letters and Documents*, p. 154

directly by the compositor, as he made revisions for an edition in hopes of obtaining the additional sum promised by Andrew Millar for a revised and expanded version.<sup>423</sup>

In a letter dated 14 May 1743, Thomson wrote again to Miss Young of the effect she had had on him, which again suggests the impetus to have made revisions: 'Should my Name live, and I be mentioned hereafter, I shall be ambitious to have it said of me, that when seduced by that most fatal Syren Indolence and false Pleasure, to the very Brink of Ruin, the Angel of Love came in your Form and saved me.'<sup>424</sup> The circumstances in which the interleaved copy was compiled give reason to conclude that Thomson's experience of unrequited love for Elizabeth Young prompted his return to reexamine the ideas with which he engaged discussed in the previous section. For example, Thomson inserted the following lines before line 444 in the interleaved copy, which were included in the 1744 edition:

And thou, Amanda, come Pride of my Song,  
Formed by the Graces, loveliness itself  
Come with those downcast eyes, sedate and sweet  
Those looks demure that deeply pierce the Soul,  
Where with the Light of thoughtful Reason, mix'd  
Shines Lively Fancy and the feeling Heart.  
O Come ...<sup>425</sup>

The lines which this amendment preceded proposed that the speaker and his love engage in the idyllic dalliance of pastoral convention in the sensuous language that insinuate the speaker's vulnerability to seduction through the senses. The amendment itself makes pointed this fallen

---

<sup>423</sup> Robert Ingelsfield, 'The British Library Revisions', p. 63

<sup>424</sup> Alan Dugald McKillop, ed, *James Thomson: Letters and Documents*, p. 155

<sup>425</sup> BL C.28.e.17 p. 27

condition, as Thomson exaggerated the language of a lover's plaint, to suggest the shrewdness with which a courtly swain clothes his nature in the guise of a shepherd. Thomson does this in manner through which the hyperbolic character of the speaker's words suggest the intensity of the affective state to which he was rendered because of his desire. In doing so, Thomson made pointed the degree to which the speaker's sensitivity to aesthetic influence hindered him from developing the social love to which such authors as Shaftsbury and Milton had suggested it would lead.

Thomson inserted lines to Amanda into *Spring* and *Summer* in each of the three 1744 editions of *The Seasons*. Their inclusion was a procedure that explains the poem of eight lines 'Accept, loved Nymph' addressed to 'Miss Young' written and signed by him on the fly-leaf preceding the half title to 'Spring' in a copy of the 1744A octavo edition (Harvard College Library Sum 139) intended to be a gift copy to her.<sup>426</sup> Lyttelton later warned in his 'Preface' to his posthumous 1750 edition of Thomson's *Works*:

This edition of Mr. Thomson's works was designed by him, and must be considered by the reader, as a collection of such of his works as he thought worth preserving, corrected, and amended. If therefore detached poems of his appeared in other collections, or are to be found in manuscript in private hands, they are such as his judgment rejected; and the publication of them in any future editions or otherwise, would be contrary to his will, and prejudicial to his memory'.<sup>427</sup>

---

<sup>426</sup> Harvard Library Sum 139, *The Seasons* (1744); Alexander Lindsay, 'James Thomson', p. 99

<sup>427</sup> George Lyttelton, 'Preface' in *The Works of James Thomson*, edited by George Lyttelton (London: 1750)



Lyttelton served as one of two executors for Thomson as well as editor for the 1750 edition, as discussed. His preface, then, suggests the reason for his interest in how the revisions he made might be interpreted, and shape the image later readers formed of Thomson's verse.

A return to the interleaved copy shows that Thomson also amended *Spring* to demonstrate how the speaker's fallen condition prevented him from apprehending the meaning of the pattern of his thoughts through which his sense led him to perceive nature in terms describing human society. Thomson expanded upon the comparison he made in the 1738 edition between flora and human tribes, and added these lines in the interleaved copy which follow in the 1744 edition:

On the charm'd Florist's Eye, with secret Pride  
He marks the gay Creation of his Hand,  
No gradual Bloom is wanting; from the Bud  
The First Spring blows to musky Tribes  
Nor Hyacinths nor sweet-breathing Joaquils.<sup>428</sup>

These revisions suggest the insight to be drawn about God's wisdom as Nature allows men to perceive a design in Nature through which God aids men to perceive a design in human history as well. The unaltered lines that follow, however, allowed Thomson to use the temporality of language to demonstrate the effects of his speaker's fallen condition: the 'random order' with which the speaker described 'vistas and alleys' forms a gradual movement that revealed his inability to 'comprehend' the 'Universal Soul' because of the limits to which he could perceive 'the boundless multiplicity' of Nature at once.<sup>429</sup> The hyperbolic character of the speaker's

---

<sup>428</sup> BL C.28.e.17 p. 29

<sup>429</sup> W. B. Hutchings, 'Can Pure Description Hold the Place of Sense: Thomson's Landscape Poetry' in *James Thomson: Essays for the Tercentary*, ed by Richard Terry (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2000), pp. 40-41 and 48

digression that described his recurring perceptions of the ‘vegetable tribes’ suggests that the variety he observed, instead prompted him to the ecstasy with which he indulged in the sensuous experience of Nature. That indulgence then prevented him from reasoning about it which ought to have allowed him to attain that knowledge.

Upon comparing the 1744 edition with Lyttleton’s posthumous 1750 edition of Thomson’s *Works*, it becomes clear that Lyttleton had revised several passages or added to them. The revisions he made returned to the underlying concept that God forms the mind and therefore the lives of men through nature of the 1726 version of *Winter*, but expanded upon that idea. For example, in the 1728 to 1738 editions of *Spring*, line 309 explained ‘Hence, in old dusky Time, they say a Deluge came,’.<sup>430</sup> Thomson later revised this in 1744 to read ‘Hence in old Dusky Time, a Deluge came’. Lyttleton, however, altered the line in 1750 to say ‘Hence, on the guilty World a deluge came,’.<sup>431</sup> Line 309 was followed in the 1744 edition with line 327 that related ‘Sound slept the Waters; no sulphureous Glooms’.<sup>432</sup> Lyttleton modified the line in his posthumous edition of Thomson’s *Works* to say ‘No Clouds impregnate with sulphureous Glooms’.<sup>433</sup> The addition of the word ‘guilty’ and ‘sulphurous Glooms’ suggests the image of hell as God’s judgment by insinuating the occasion for and the exercise of God’s power. This modification offers the impression that Thomson, like Milton, drew from the Bible in a similar manner to Milton to suggest a similar moral position about the consequences of sin as Milton depicted in *Paradise Lost*. The notion of the absence of the response of nature to subject the world to such wrath, which is amended in line 327, makes more explicit the allusion to the

---

<sup>430</sup> BL C.28.e.17 p. 22

<sup>431</sup> *The Works of James Thomson*, edited by George Lyttelton (London: 1750)

<sup>432</sup> BL C.28.e.17 p. 23

<sup>433</sup> *The Works of James Thomson*, edited by George Lyttelton (London: 1750)

biblical story to the Flood from which God saved Noah, to rebuild the human world again under a new covenant with him after purging the world of the wicked.

Other modifications and additions more explicitly altered Thomson's meaning. Line 1535 of *Summer* in the 1744 edition originally read 'Thine is a BACON, hapless in his Choice' where 'Thine' refers to Britannia. Lyttleton alters the line to say 'First BACON rose, deep comprehensive, clear,' and then expanded with the following passage:

By him instructed Boyle with pious search  
Amid the dark recesses of his works,  
The great Creator sought, and Knowledge fix'd  
On sure Experiment, not Systems vain.  
Thine too, Britannia, thine sagacious Locke,  
Who taught the Human Mind itself to know,  
Its Powers unfolded and it's limits markt,  
With cautious Modesty supremely wise:  
And Newton, pure intelligence, whom God  
To Mortals lent, to trace his boundless Works  
From Laws sublimely simple. Lo! To These  
In every Land th' admiring Sages bend  
And Them their Master sown! Nor far behind  
The generous Ashley stands, the friend of Man;<sup>434</sup>

Here Lyttleton rewrote Thomson's verse to make Bacon and his fellow natural philosophers such as 'Ashley', Earl of Shaftsbury, into admirable figures for whom the understanding of the

---

<sup>434</sup> BL C.28.e.17

‘sublime laws’ was not a sinful pursuit to serve human vanity nor beyond their capacity. To do so, he described them in such terms as ‘sagacious’ and ‘Human Mind’ borrowed from Locke’s *Essay on Human Understanding* and ‘Friend of Man’ from Shaftsbury’s ‘Characteristics’ to allude to their writings for which they were noted. In doing so, Lyttleton’s posthumous 1750 edition poem echoes the argument of Bacon’s *Of the Advancement of Learning*. A copy of the text was listed in Munby’s catalogue of Thomson’s estate of which Lyttleton was executor, as noted.<sup>435</sup> This revision changed the reading one may have made of Thomson’s *The Seasons*. It revised his depiction of the poet-prophet whose experience of the sublime in nature as compared with human civilization only demonstrated the limits to which sensory experience aids the understanding’s grasp of God’s vision in human history. Lyttleton’s amendments give the impression that such knowledge gained in sublime vision is neither granted nor withheld because it is the domain of the divine mind of which man is incapable.

What Lyttleton added or amended elsewhere in *The Seasons* gives the impression that Thomson consciously imitated depictions of the sublime for which many later writers and critics credit Milton as influence. Such scholars as Sambrook have noted Milton to be the source for the allusions to Christian Neoplatonism present in Thomson’s *The Seasons*. Yet Thomson’s notion of ‘poetry as gazing through a veil’ is an idea later critics have inherited which has led them to craft the account of the sublime bard in which Thomson is descended from Milton.<sup>436</sup> Amendments Thomson made in his interleaved volume, which have been thought to engage with contemporaneous philosophy, have also been noted as evidence of Thomson’s conscious emulation of Milton. Thomson, for example, also revised lines 1075 and 1076 to read:

An elegant sufficiency, content

---

<sup>435</sup> A. N. L. Munby, gen ed., p. 63

<sup>436</sup> Lawrence Lipking, *The Life of the Poet*, (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1981), p. 151

Retirement, rural Quiet, Friendship, Books.

Ease and alternative Labour, useful Life

Progressive Virtue, and approving Heaven

These are the matchless Joys of virtuous Love.<sup>437</sup>

These lines paint the image of pastoral with an exaggerated simplicity made pointed in the final line. The account in which Thomson is thought to have adopted Milton's poetic methods tends to ignore the parodic character of Thomson's use of pastoral convention in *The Seasons* rendering using burlesque language. That language in later editions suggest Thomson's return to reexamine the suspicion he betrays in the first edition of *Summer* that subjective impressions of nature could be misleading and impede prophetic vision. It is from the notion of the sublime poet-prophet offered with Lyttleton's amendments that later scholars, however, have fashioned a tradition of the Romantic sublime, which Wordsworth seemingly appropriates. The reputation Thomson gained because of this descriptive quality in his poetry as noted by such contemporaries as Joseph Warton and Johnson is what, according to Sambrook, Wordsworth draws upon to perpetuate the tradition of the painter-poet.<sup>438</sup>

John Mitford, writing in 1841 as noted, referred to Lyttleton as the 'improver' in an article in which he lamented the alterations and improvements made to works such as Thomson,

while, in fact, all the combined resources of erudition and industry  
[that] have been employed, are all but exhausted, in the endeavor  
to restore these shattered relics [of Greece and Roman] of  
unequalled beauty to something of their original form and lustre;  
the poets of our own country, the emulators, and in some cases, the

---

<sup>437</sup> BL C.28.e.17 p. 263

<sup>438</sup> James Sambrook, 'Introduction' in *The Seasons*, pp. xxix-xxx

rivals or more than rivals, of their fame, have been placed in the hands of men more or less competent to perform the high duty so rashly undertaken by them'.<sup>439</sup>

This was the assessment Mitford made of the changes Lyttleton had made in his 1750 edition. In the article, Mitford did what Thomson did in the interleaved copy. Mitford first offered a draft of Thomson's juvenile poem titled *Of a Country Life, by a student in university*, and then added some examples of Thomson's amendments. Mitford noted that Thomson rewrote *Spring* line 296 which had said 'This to the poets gave the golden age, / When, as they sung, in elevated praise' to 'When, as they sung in boldly-figured phrase'.<sup>440</sup> This gives evidence that Thomson amended *The Seasons* to make more explicit the aim of the poem. In doing so, Thomson, through the voice of the poet-speaker, betrayed his doubt concerning the inspired vision the sublime grants to instead suggest the artifice of the pastoral bard, evidence of which lay in his figurative language.

Mitford followed this with a comparison of the Thomson's published text of *The Seasons* (1738) with the alterations which Lyttleton made in the interleaved copy and appear in his posthumous edition. For example, he noted, "In describing the Golden Age, Thomson wrote (Spring 263)':

This, when emergent from the gloomy wood,  
The glaring lion saw, his horrid heart  
Was meeken'd, and he joined his sullen joy  
For music held the whole in perfect peace.<sup>441</sup>

---

<sup>439</sup> John Mitford, 'Thomson's *The Seasons* and Their Various Readings', p. 564

<sup>440</sup> John Mitford, 'Thomson's *The Seasons* and Their Various Readings', p. 572

<sup>441</sup> John Mitford, 'Thomson's *The Seasons* and Their Various Readings', p. 577

This Thomson writes to be Nature 'In consonance. Such were those prime of days.'<sup>442</sup> Mitford also noted, though, that 'These, Lord Lyttleton has erased, and substituted':

Kind deeds, and friendly talk successive share  
The blissful hours; while in the rosy vale  
Love breath'd his tender sighs, from anguish free  
And free from guilt. Such were those prime of days.<sup>443</sup>

In comparing the two, one notes that the revision Thomson made returned to classical pastoral convention, in keeping with such pastoral theory as that of Rapin, but clothed in Modern diction. Thomson's use of pastoral convention as compared with Lyttelton's revision recalls Theocritus' methods. Sambrook notes that Theocritus uses several elements of epic such as the heroic measure, as well as an admixture of literary words drawn from the genre, despite his use of a Doric dialect and the ritualistic expressions in the lament for Daphnis that remind of the Homeric hymns; these, however, indicate 'an elaborate, conscious, manner art which hints at a distant origin in popular song, but an art whose allusiveness suggests that Theocritus was writing pastorals that were for a small and learned audience rather than public and popular works such as classical tragedy'.<sup>444</sup>

The comparison Mitford offered between Thomson's and Lyttelton's revisions also suggests that 'the first descriptive poet', as Sambrook has described him, seems to be a poet practicing the methods of Neoclassical pastoral, grounded in the erudition for a readership well-read in classical literature. Thomson's exaggerated and artificial language is in keeping with such qualities of sublime and pathetic poetry which Mitford delineated in 'Essay on Gray's Poetry',

---

<sup>442</sup> BL C.28.e.17 p. 17

<sup>443</sup> John Mitford, 'Thomson's The Seasons and Their Various Readings', p. 577

<sup>444</sup> James Sambrook, *English Pastoral Poetry*, p. 2-3

and in the change to line 296 of *Spring* noted above, to influence our surmise about the simplicity for which classical pastoral is noted. Thomson's turn to Antiquity for the aesthetic values, which he rendered with an artifice that emphasized his speaker's Modern sensibility, suggests the manner through which such seeming classicism enabled him to satirize the philosopher-poet. Lyttleton's revisions, by contrast, imitated Milton's magniloquence, which made use of descriptive language to recast the poem, which often drew upon a Christian perspective, to offer the context within which it later was read as the effusions that lend it the character of prophetic vision of *Paradise Lost*. Lyttleton thus altered the reading that later readers made of *The Seasons* which served as the basis for situating Thomson in the account of Modern English poets that emphasized the imaginative character of Spenser, Shakespeare, Milton, and Mitford's contemporary Wordsworth.

Mitford's 'Essay on Gray's Poetry' that served as preface to his 1816 edition of Thomas Gray's *Works* written twenty-five years earlier offers the context to his account as to why Thomson displayed such seeming classicism. Mitford explained in the essay how the elements of composition in poetry, much like composition in art according to Sir Joshua Reynolds who he quoted, address themselves to the faculties and dispositions to produce the pleasurable effects of Gray's verse. Such elements reflect the genius and structure of the Greek and Latin languages which Milton attempted to introduce into English, a method which Mitford explained: 'Through ... their artificial nature renders artificial sentiments more artificial and more perfect'.<sup>445</sup> The effects of the expression of such sentiments in Gray Mitford attributed to the manner through which they call to mind those of Greece and Rome by association.

---

<sup>445</sup> John Mitford, 'Essay on Gray's Poetry', p. cxv



Although Mitford conceded that Milton's language was to be admired, it was not the element with which he credits Gray's sublime and pathetic poetry: 'Gray never allows the impressions of scenery which had a strong and forcible hold on his feelings to become the subject matter of any poem, instead hastening to what they suggest to the excitement of serious feeling, pathetic sentiment, or powerful and sublime emotion'.<sup>446</sup> The criticism Mitford offered of other poets who made the impressions of nature become the focus of the poem was a method for which he faulted Thomson. Mitford's assessment suggests the different character of Thomson's verse which used that method to demonstrate his poet-speaker's inability to achieve sublime vision through the speaker's frequent digressions into descriptive detail. That character is to be noted in the poetry belonging to the tradition of satiric renderings of pastoral discussed, as distinguished from such verse as Milton's that was lauded in the account of Modern English literary history based upon Neoclassical aesthetic values.

Through these essays Mitford, like Thomson, gives us his hand in writing. The multiple forms of pastoral, both material and literary, that Thomson adopted suggest the several uses to which he put pastoral and which then shaped, and continued to shape, the afterlives of his verse. For Lyttleton this resulted in the discovery or forging of links to biblical texts that have served as the basis for a tradition of Christian notions of the sublime, which has shaped later accounts of English literary history within which the Romantic poets who follow have been placed. For Mitford, this classicism took the form of demonstrating links to ancient Greece and Rome though the examples he cited which seem to be Neoclassical, derived from Homer or Virgil.

That classicism, however, allows for an account of Modern English literary history in which the satiric renderings of pastoral noted may be traced to their origins in the writings of

---

<sup>446</sup> John Mitford, 'Essay on Gray's Poetry', p. cxxxix

Antiquity. Thomson's writing itself offers the basis, though, for the two readings represented in Lyttelton and Mitford's account of him. Thomson's interpretive readings of the literary past, and the way he constructed himself and his texts in manuscript, created the possibility enacted in those later readings of Thomson by Lyttelton and Mitford with which this chapter has been concerned. In that way, his own critical readings and his own material, poetic self-presentation, shaped the place he would hold in later literary histories. And it is precisely to the beginnings of those later, formal literary histories that I turn in the next chapter, when I examine Joseph and Thomas Warton's 'pastorals' and their accounts of the literary history within which they measure them.

## Chapter 5

### The Place of Pastoral in the Creative and Critical Writing of Thomas and Joseph Warton

The interpretative readings Thomas and Joseph Warton made of the pastoral imitations of the Ancients and Moderns gave occasion for their critical histories in which the two Wartons measured their verse against them. That writing allowed the Wartons to examine the manner in which pastoral enabled reflection upon how the literary inheritance in which they shared had shaped those authors' understanding of history. This chapter turns, then, to the multiple places of pastoral in the Wartons' careers to study the relationship between pastoral creativity and critical writing, and the dual nature of that pastoral mode of interpretative response to the literary past, to consider what may be learned from the habits of mind with which the Wartons fashioned the story of England. In this chapter, I reflect upon the ideas of literary history that may be formed from the patterns the Wartons perceived in the repeated turn among earlier poets to pastoral as a means through which to meditate upon it.

Among the observations Thomas Warton's made in his notebook Bodleian MS Dep e 305 about such writings is that the "General View of Modern Pastoral [...] began [...] with] Petrarch in Latin - whom Bocacce copied - [and] soon became a common species for young writers who then wrote all in Latin".<sup>447</sup> His comment offers evidence that such imitative pastoral possessed a recursiveness discerned in the manner in which each example served as an iteration in a series that employed the same conventions but discovered new ways of applied them. That recursive quality formed his early impressions of his literary inheritance and idea shaped the habits of mind with which Thomas and his brother Joseph adapted the methods of pastoral

---

<sup>447</sup> Oxford, Bodleian Library MS Dep e 305 fol. 9

convention to allude to earlier authors to compose verse that illustrated this. Because of that, Joseph and Thomas Warton's development differs from those who followed a traditional Virgilian programme in which poets followed the prescribed methods of Neoclassical pastoral of using the shepherd's perceptions of his actions and relations to objects of his rural existence.<sup>448</sup> Such imitation enabled poets to gain skill at conveying the simplicity characteristic of such pastoral through those methods of depicting the shepherd's nature. Understanding such shared habits of mind enabled the Wartons to craft interpretative responses to the Modern English verse they read that reflect the history of the use of such methods to communicate meaning. The allusive practices the Wartons learned to imitate determined how they applied the knowledge they gained because of the patterns they perceived in the manner with which poets paraphrased conventions, adapting the use of generic images to communicate an underlying generic idea. That, I will argue, enabled their satiric renderings of pastoral in which the relations they fashioned between images of pastoral and epic and of medieval romance illustrate how the aesthetic character they lent them could be employed to question the values underlying the conventions in which they were used.

Thomas Warton's Bodleian MS Dep e 305 demonstrates how his readings in Ancient and Modern Neoclassical pastoral and theory formed his habits of mind which shaped his creative and critical engagement with it. The manuscript notes he made about the writings of Rapin and Fontenelle precede a comparison of the Italian and French pastorals to that of the Ancients. His study of those succession of pastorals prompted Thomas to wonder how Dryden could have placed Spenser as the 'first among Modern pastoralists since Virgil' if Spenser's pastorals did

---

<sup>448</sup> Rene Rapin, p.5

not surpass those of the Ancients.<sup>449</sup> These observations framed the thoughts he recorded about Spenser's borrowings from and allusions to Chaucer and Ariosto's older works of the literary forms of satire and romance as he collected the evidence to test the validity of Dryden's claim.<sup>450</sup> Those comments served as the basis upon which Thomas Warton wrote his *Observations of The Faerie Queene of Edmund Spenser*, first published in 1754.<sup>451</sup> The sequence of his observations served as the evidence of a pattern that led him to view each literary work as part of the history of the development of English literature, which required the reader to consider the methods of allusion applied in successive results. It is this development that he then attempted to illustrate in his *History of English Poetry* (1774-1781).<sup>452</sup> Thomas' Bodleian MS Dep e 305 offers evidence of his research for his History into the role of Petrarch who composed his poetry during the 1300s after he makes notes about the Ancient Greek and Roman origins of pastoral, and the Italian, French, and English writers that imitated both the Ancients and Petrarch in the Renaissance period. Volume IV of his incomplete *History of Poetry* (1781) ends with the introduction to the section indicating he intended to turn to the pastoral genre after his discussion of Spenser and then satire.<sup>453</sup>

---

<sup>449</sup> Oxford, Bodleian MS Dep e 305, fol 1, 2-11, 23, 34, 31

<sup>450</sup> Oxford, Bodleian MS Dep e 305

<sup>451</sup> Thomas Warton, *Observations on the Faerie Queene of Spenser* (London: Printed for R. and J. Dodsley and J. Fletcher, in the Turl, Oxford, 1754)

<sup>452</sup> Thomas Warton, *The History of English Poetry From the Close of the Eleventh Century to the Commencement of the Eighteenth Century. To Which Are Prefixed Two Dissertations. I Of the Origin of Romantic Fiction in Europe. II On the Introduction of Learning into England. Volume the First By Thomas Warton, B.D. Fellow of Trinity College, Oxford and the Society of Antiquarians* (London: Printed for and Sold By J. Dodsley, Pall Mall; J. Walter, Charing Cross; T; Becket, Strand; J. Robson, New Bond Street; G. Robinson, and J. Bew, Pater-noster-Row; and Messers. Fletcher at Oxford, 1774); *Volume the Second* (London: 1778); *Volume III* (London: 1781)

<sup>453</sup> Thomas Warton, *The History of English Poetry From the Close of the Eleventh Century to the Commencement of the Eighteenth Century. To Which Are Prefixed Two Dissertations. I Of the Origin of Romantic Fiction in Europe. II On the Introduction of Learning into England. Volume IV. By Thomas Warton, BD Fellow of Trinity College, Oxford and the Society of Antiquarians* (London: Printed for and Sold By J. Dodsley, Pall Mall; J. Walter, Charing Cross; T; Becket, Strand; J. Robson, New Bond Street; G. Robinson, and J. Bew, Pater-noster-Row; and Messers. Fletcher at Oxford, 1781)

Thomas Warton's study of the allusive pastoral mode of interpretative reading to which Spenser belongs allowed him, as it did his brother Joseph, to discern a pattern in the manner through which changes in the use of literary conventions reflected the historical circumstances gave occasion for the development in cultural practices. That shaped their impression of the habits of mind with which earlier writers adapted literary conventions to reflect those practices which gave the literary conventions they used their recursive character. The Wartons' use of the noted imitative methods of allusion in their own verse formed the habits of mind with which they turned to redefine the arrangement and mutual relation of such elements of their creative writing. This allowed them to compose verse that reflected the Modern sensibility that had shaped the perceptions of their contemporaries. Because those methods formed their habits of writing, I will argue, their criticism demonstrates the recurring pattern of relations between developments in England's literature and its history.

The understanding the Wartons gained of that pattern enabled their study of how the manner and methods of satire determined the habits of mind because of which, and through which, earlier poets' use of the elements of epic and romance allowed them to derive meaning from their interpretative readings of it. That, in turn, shaped their understanding of how such meaning permitted those poets to measure the values their society once held within the illusive pastoral ideal of the innocence lost to them. The habits of mind the Wartons developed, I will suggest, reveals how that turn the poets made to consider the subjective meaning conveyed in older verse, allowed them to apprehend how that literary inheritance had determined their manner of conceiving of literary history. The imitative methods of fashioning relations between allusions the Wartons derived from the patterns of use in their models enabled them to reconstruct the relations of historical usages that delineated the patterns of the tradition of

Romances to which they appended their verse. The pattern of allusion in Spenser's *The Faerie Queene*, which Thomas noted to resemble Chaucer's use of such conventions to parody the chivalric lays, led Thomas to conceive of Spenser's text as a medieval romance in his response to John Upton's discussion of its epic form and character.<sup>454</sup> In doing so, Thomas, I will demonstrate, offered a different account of literary history which reflected how its terms drawn from the *querelle* between the Ancients and Moderns discussed in the previous chapters had shaped notions about the classicism or romanticism of that verse, and which defined its later reception, just as they had Thomson's.<sup>455</sup>

A return to the idea of the place of pastoral in a writer's career suggests how that mode of interpretative writing determined the way the Wartons understood their own poetic development within the alternative histories they wrote. I will discuss how the place the Wartons' criticism gave to pastoral in their literary histories offered the terms in which they assessed the place of their own pastorals in the alternate accounts to the development of Neoclassical pastoral familiar to readers then and today. A turn to the Wartons' pastoral satires will illustrate how the subjective knowledge gained through such imitative creative writing formed a poet's habits of writing and shaped the patterns of thought in his criticism within which he measured himself.

### **A Pastoral Beginning and a Pastoral Return within the Wartons' careers**

The first volume of *An Essay on the Writings and Genius of Pope* was published in 1756, while volume two was published in 1782. Notes which Joseph Warton used to compose *An Essay* are

---

<sup>454</sup> See Thomas Warton's notebook Bodleian MS Dep e 305, 'To Mr. Upton, on his New Edition of the Faerie Queene' in *Poems. A New Edition, With Additions. By Thomas Warton* (London: Printed for T. Beckett, in the Adelphi, 1737), and his *Observations on the Faerie Queene of Spenser* (London: Printed for R. and J. Dodsley and J. Fletcher, in the Turl, Oxford, 1754), p. 40

<sup>455</sup> See Robert J. Griffin's 'The Eighteenth-Century Construction of Romanticism: Thomas Warton and The Pleasures of Melancholy', *English Literary History* 59 (1992), 799-815

contained in an unbound manuscript of 204 leaves, Bodleian MS Dep.c.643.<sup>456</sup> Another notebook of Joseph's held by the Bodleian Library, MS Dep.e.293 entitled 'Memoranda, 1759' contains extensive notes about classical and English Literature which give the impression that Joseph had intended to use them in a revised edition of volume one in 1762.<sup>457</sup> Joseph Warton's *An Essay* offers the metaphors that suggest how his readings of the verse of the poets previously noted shaped his impression of the patterns of thought reflected in the patterns of expression he and his brother Thomas turned to imitate. The metaphors he chose offer evidence of how those patterns determined the aesthetic judgments which they denote, because of the manner through which Joseph's and Thomas' study of that imitative verse formed the shared habits of mind revealed in shared habits of writing. Joseph's *An Essay* gave evidence of how writers made use of such metaphors to engage with the discourse that arose in response to the *querelle*. The metaphors he selected reflected the manner through which the continued debate among his contemporaries, about the connection between the aesthetic character of the older verse and the affective response it elicited, formed his understanding and that of later readers of the accounts of literary history.

In his *Dedication to Reverend Dr. Young* which serves as preface to his *An Essay*, Joseph Warton draws upon Horace, writing, "that the most solid observations on human life, expressed with the utmost elegance and brevity, are MORALITY, and not POETRY ... and that it is a creative and glowing IMAGINATION, 'acer spiritus ac vis', and that alone, that can stamp a writer with this exalted and very uncommon character, which so few possess, and of which so

---

<sup>456</sup> Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS Dep.c.643

<sup>457</sup> Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS Dep.e.293



few can properly judge".<sup>458</sup> The Christian frame reflected in the distinction between morality and poetry Joseph Warton established determined those metaphors according to which he assigned poets to four categories. The works of the imagination of the three masters of 'the sublime and pathetic'—Spenser, Shakespeare, and Milton, he wrote, are to be distinguished from the satires of such men of 'wit and sense' as Dryden, Donne, Denham, and Cowley. The satires of those Renaissance poets, to whom Joseph added those of Ariosto and Pope, display excellent sense, but also possess a poetical character which, in Horace's verse, when transposed and inverted to test its virtue as Horace recommended, 'retain[ed] its lustre, like a diamond, unset, and thrown back into the rubbish of the mine.'<sup>459</sup> Pope, as I noted in Chapter 2, had annotated the passage in Denham's *Preface to The Destruction of Troy* in which Denham suggests why this is because 'Speech is the apparel of our Thoughts, so are there certain Garbs and Modes of Speaking, which will vary with the Times'; Denham wrote that because there are 'graces and happinesses' particular to a language, the task of the poet is to transfuse the spirit of his original, as when translating prose thoughts into 'poesie'.<sup>460</sup> Joseph's comments offer evidence that because of this, the notion he derived of the tradition of wit and sense differs from that of the sublime and the pathetic only in the character of that spirit or 'imagination' in which Pope's poetry shares, because it does not depend on its poetic conventions for its affective power.

Joseph's use of the metaphor of a diamond illustrates this. His description of that image amidst the rubbish, reminds of Marvell's own description of the dew drop as a gem which retains

---

<sup>458</sup> Joseph Warton, *An Essay on the Writings and Genius of Pope, Volume I* (London: Printed for M. Cooper at Paternoster-Row, 1756), p. v. The quotation "acer spiritus ac vis" is taken from Horace Satire I.4 line 46.

<sup>459</sup> Joseph Warton, *An Essay on the Writings and Genius of Pope*, p. ix

<sup>460</sup> Worcester, Hurd Library, no shelfmark, John Denham, 'Cooper's Hill', *Poems and Translations with the Sophy, Written by the Honorable Sir John Denham, Knight of the Bath, The Fourth Edition, To which is added Cato-Major of Old-Age* (London: Printed by T.W. for H. Harrington and sold by Jacob Tonson at Grays-Inn Gate in Grays-Inn-Lane, and Thomas Bennet at the Half-Moon in St. Paul's Church-Yard, 1703)

its heavenly light amidst the fallen earthly garden to which it descends noted in Chapter 2. This is an image to which Coleridge later turned to convey his affective response to Wordsworth's verse which used the image to allude to Marvell's poetry, as will be discussed in Chapter 5. Joseph Warton also drew attention to the 'stag-chase' in Pope's *Windsor Forest* in his discussion of the lines that describe the destruction that William the Conqueror wreaked, 'where he is speaking of the tyrannies formerly exercised in this kingdom'.<sup>461</sup> Pope, as I noted in Chapter 3, had turned to imitate the manner of allusion in such satires of Marvell's as *An Horatian Ode* and *The Nymph's Complaining for the Death of Her Fawn*, to form his readers ideas about William III through reference to William the Conqueror.<sup>462</sup> Marvell's *An Horatian Ode* made allusion to Cromwell's action against Charles I during the English Civil wars by referring to him as 'the Caldonian deer' who Cromwell, 'Happy if in the tufted brake / The English Hunter him mistake / Nor lay his hounds in near'.<sup>463</sup> Marvell's *The Nymph Complaining* likewise begins with the lines 'The wanton troopers riding by / Have shot my fawn and it will die' to make oblique reference to the Parliamentary Army's pursuit of Charles I under Cromwell.<sup>464</sup> Pope has used the metaphor of a stag-chase within *Windsor Forest* that served as royal hunting grounds in a similar manner to evoke memories of William the Conqueror and Cromwell within which to meditate upon the more recent figure of William III. The attention Joseph Warton drew to Pope's use of 'the descriptions of places, and images raised by the poet, [that] are still tending to hint, or leading to some reflection, upon moral life or political institution', suggests the connections that he made between Pope and the Renaissance poets of wit and sense because of Pope's use of the

---

<sup>461</sup> Joseph Warton, *An Essay on the Writings and Genius of Pope*, pp. 20-1

<sup>462</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'An Horatian Ode' and 'The Nymph Complaining for the Death of Her Fawn', *The Poems of Andrew Marvell*, ed. by Nigel Smith (Harlow: Pearson Longman, 2007), pp. 273-79 and 69-71

<sup>463</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'An Horatian Ode' (207), p. 279 lines 110-12

<sup>464</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'The Nymph Complaining for the Death of Her Fawn' (207), p. 69 lines 1-2

image of a hunted stag or deer as Marvell had done to comment upon the role each figure noted above had played in political history.<sup>465</sup> That Joseph Warton compared Pope's manner of satire to that of Denham's *Cooper's Hill*, to whom Marvell had also turned for a model, offers evidence of the transfusion of the spirit he perceived in the poems of each in which pastoral conventions served as the dress adapted to suit the time and occasion for writing. In *Cooper's Hill*, Denham made use of pastoral conventions describing Nature as 'Beauty with strength / above the valley swells' and 'in itself, seem proud, / To be the base of the majestic load, / Than which no hill a nobler burden bears' to lend an irony to its depiction of Windsor Forest as that which has begotten the monarchs of England in a similar manner to Pope's poem Windsor Forest. This recalls Marvell's own manner of using pastoral convention to describe feminine Nature in the figure of the garden as that which has nurtured the fawn who may be read as an allusion to Charles I. This also suggests the notions he formed about how the task of composing verse entailed a creative engagement with such earlier models which then enabled one to make a critical assessment of them to begin to write literary history.

Joseph Warton's *The Enthusiast, or the Lover of Nature*, reflects this understanding of writing poetry.<sup>466</sup> In the poem, Joseph adopted a satiric mode of writing to make an interpretative reading of the verse which he noted in his *Essay* within ideas drawn from pastoral. *The Enthusiast* was first published in 1744. Although there are not any modern editions of it or any complete works of Joseph Warton, the poem was included in Alexander Chalmers's *The Works of the English Poets, From Chaucer to Cowper* (1801) suggesting the reception of his verse

---

<sup>465</sup> Joseph Warton, *An Essay on the Writings and Genius of Pope*, p. 30

<sup>466</sup> Joseph Warton, *The Enthusiast: Or the Lover of Nature. A Poem*. (London: Printed. for R. Dodsley at Tully's Head in Pall-mall; and Sold by M. Cooper in Pater-noster-Row, 1744)

within ideas about the development of English literary history.<sup>467</sup> Early drafts of lines 15-25 and 168-79 of *The Enthusiast* may be found in his ‘Reflections on My Birthday’ in his ‘Winchester Gathering Book 1739’ prefaced on f.81 with ‘N.B. The verses on the next page were written by me at Winchester School 1740’.<sup>468</sup>

Christina le Provost notes the claim ‘Written in 1740’ added to print editions after 1763 is weakened by a revised image in Joseph’s autograph manuscript Bodleian MS Dep.c.642 dated 1741-42.<sup>469</sup> She writes that the revision in the final paragraph of *The Enthusiast* suggests that Joseph may have drawn material to amend a shorter version of the poem, which he composed in 1740 from this early version of *Fashion: An Epistolary Satire to a Friend*, published anonymously in 1742.<sup>470</sup> The revision offers evidence of how his imitative writing in a pastoral mode of interpretative response shaped his understanding of his historical present within the literary history of England. In the manuscript, Joseph makes use of language that drew upon pastoral theory his reading of earlier pastoralists to describe a ‘final haunt of peace’ to suggest the image of a place where tranquility resided. This then allowed him to make use of the recurring image of a garden to comment on the character of civilization as compared with the New World the innocence of the Eden: ‘From christian enemies and curst Iberian Rage | Dwellst with some indian Family in [groves] embowered’.<sup>471</sup> This is rewritten in *The Enthusiast* to read ‘O who will bear me to Western climes [...] | Yet unpolluted with Iberian Swords; | With simple

---

<sup>467</sup> *The Works of the English Poets, From Chaucer to Cowper, edited by Alexander Chalmers, 21 vols* (London: 1806)

<sup>468</sup> Oxford, Bodleian Library MS Dep e 291 fol 81-83

<sup>469</sup> Christina le Provost, ‘More Unacknowledge Verse by Joseph Warton’, *The Review of English Studies* 37 (147) (1986) 317-347 (p. 330); Bodleian MS Dep.c.642

<sup>470</sup> Christina le Provost, p. 330; Joseph Warton, *Fashion: An Epistolary Satire to a Friend* (London: Printed for R Dodleys at Tully’s-Head in Pall-mall; and sold by T. Cooper at the Globe in Pater-noster-Row, 1742)

<sup>471</sup> Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS Dep.c.642

Indian Swains that I may hunt'.<sup>472</sup> The revision turns again to the notion of a place frequented expressed in Joseph's imitative use of the metaphor of the garden to convey the sense of longing for that past innocence. Bodleian MS Dep.c.642 contains other similar passages, which Joseph did not include in his satire *Fashion*, but which appear in *Poems on Several Occasions* published anonymously in 1748 and later attributed to Thomas Warton the Elder.<sup>473</sup> Other early drafts of passages in *The Enthusiast* may be found in Joseph's autograph in Bodleian MS Dep.d.671.<sup>474</sup> A transcription of the poem in an unidentified hand is also included in MS Eng.misc.f.49.<sup>475</sup>

In *The Enthusiast*, an image Joseph Warton uses to evoke affective response illustrates how the recurring use of language and imagery within the classical and Modern verse from which he borrowed, fixed in his mind the idea of the sublime they convey:

And great Aeneas gaz'd with more Delight  
On the rough Mountain shagg'd with horrid Shades,  
(Where cloud-compelling Jove, as Fancy dream'd,  
Descended shaking his direful Aegis black)<sup>476</sup>

Joseph Warton's turns to describe Virgil's epic hero Aeneas' aesthetic impression of 'Delight which is evoked by 'the rough Mountain shagge'd' with 'Shades' he describes as 'horrid' recalling the language of both Lucretius' *De Rerum Natura* and Marvell's *On Mr. Milton's Paradise Lost* to convey the pleasure mixed with fear that the majesty of nature produces

---

<sup>472</sup> Joseph Warton, *The Enthusiast*, p.16

<sup>473</sup> Thomas Warton, *Poems on Several Occasions. By the Reverend Thomas Warton. Batchelor of Divinity. Late Vice of Basing stoke in Hampshire, and sometime Professor of Poetry in the University of Oxford* (London: Printed for R Munby and H S. Cox on Ludgate-Hill, 1748)

<sup>474</sup> Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS Dep d 671

<sup>475</sup> Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS Eng misc f 49

<sup>476</sup> Joseph Warton, *The Enthusiast*, p. 8

because of the idea of God's power it provokes.<sup>477</sup> The above lines imitate the methods used in Spenser's *The Faerie Queene* to refashion the image of the classical god of Virgil's epic, Jove, into that of the wizard of medieval romance, Merlin in Arthurian legend, a recurring figure in both Joseph and Thomas Wartons' poetry with whom they also credit supernatural power over both the natural world and men in a manner that suggests the likeness Joseph perceived, because of how earlier depictions of the two evoke dread. This medieval wizard, the history of which Thomas Warton delineates in *The History of Poetry*, he describes as a 'wicked spirit drear' who uses his 'magic pow'r | Oft-times with howling storms, and thunder loud | Deforms the night, and blackens nature's face'. Thomas notes that this figure of the wizard was a recurring figure in literary history, adapted from the Arabian poetry through the Saracens early encounters with the Roman settlement in Wales in the fourth century, and then transmitted through Geoffrey of Monmouth's *Historia Britannium* and the Arthurian legend.<sup>478</sup> The figure of the sorcerer was one Spenser later treated with irony in his satiric rendering of Arthurian legend in *The Faerie Queene* and upon which poets from Marvell and Milton and the Wartons drew as will be discussed later in this chapter.<sup>479</sup>

This interpretative mode of pastoral writing offered a means of developing the habits of writing which shaped the habits of mind with which the Wartons to meditate upon their literary

---

<sup>477</sup> Lucretius Carus, Titus, *T Lucretii Cari de Rerum Natura Libros Sex* (1717) and Andrew Marvell, 'On Mr. Milton's Paradise Lost' (1711)

<sup>478</sup> Thomas Warton, *Five Pastoral Eclogues The Scenes of Which are Suppos'd to lie among the Shepherds Oppress'd by the War in Germany* (London: Printed for R. Dodsley at Tully's Head in Pall-mall, 1745), lines 48, 49, 51-53; Thomas Warton, 'Dissertations. I Of the Origin of Romantic Fiction in Europe' in *The History of English Poetry From the Close of the Eleventh Century to the Commencement of the Eighteenth Century. To Which Are Prefixed Two Dissertations. I Of the Origin of Romantic Fiction in Europe. II On the Introduction of Learning into England. Volume the First By Thomas Warton, B.D. Fellow of Trinity College, Oxford and the Society of Antiquarians* (London: Printed for and Sold By J. Dodsley, Pall Mall; J. Walter, Charing Cross; T; Becket, Strand; J Robson, New Bond Street; G Robinson, and J Bew, Pater-noster-Row; and Messers Fletcher at Oxford, 1774)

<sup>479</sup> Edmund Spenser, *The Faerie Queene: The Shepheard's Calendar: Together with the Other Works of English* (1611)

history: imitating and adapting classical models and responses allowed the Wartons to study how earlier poets had turned to the genre's underlying ideal of the imagined innocence of a lost Golden Age to understand their historical present. Thomas Warton's notebook Bodleian MS Dep d 610 which contains early attempts at his *Five Pastoral Eclogues* illustrates this.<sup>480</sup> The pastorals were first published in print anonymously in 1745 when Thomas was seventeen. There are not any modern editions of Thomas's poetry. The standard edition of his verse *The Poetical Works of the Late Thomas Warton B.D.*, edited by Richard Mant, two vols. (Oxford, 1802), does not include his *Five Pastoral Eclogues*. Thomas's sister Jane had told Mant that her brother had denied authorship.<sup>481</sup> *Five Pastoral Eclogues* were included though in J. S. Cunningham's 'An Edition of the English Poems of Thomas Warton', an unpublished B. Little dissertation, Oxford 1952, that has been used as a supplementary reference edition.<sup>482</sup>

A second notebook of Thomas's, MS Dep d 611, also contains a draft of 'Eclogue Five', a draft of the title page, and two drafts of a preface to the set of pastorals.<sup>483</sup> The manuscript is a marbled quarto notebook, whose front cover is missing, and in which Thomas Warton wrote on both the unlined versos and rectos, and used as a workbook, recording notes recorded just as other Early Modern readers did in their commonplace books, along with his drafts. The *Preface* in it suggests that he composed his pastorals, as he thought about the context his readings in the Ancient and Modern literary traditions offered. Thomas Warton's notes in MS Dep e 305 show how he had begun to map the Ancient versus Modern divide by first offering comment upon the

---

<sup>480</sup> Oxford, Bodleian Library MS Dep d 610 fols 3-22

<sup>481</sup> Thomas Warton, *The Poetical Works of the Late Thomas Warton B.D.*, edited by Richard Mant, two vols. (Oxford: 1802), pp. xiii-xiv

<sup>482</sup> Alexander Lindsay, 'Thomas Warton, the Younger' in *Index of English literary manuscripts. Vol. 3, 1700-1800. Pt. 4, Laurence Sterne - Edward Young, with a first-line index to parts 1-4*, ed. by Alexander Lindsay (London: Mansell, 1997), 455-509 (p. 455)

<sup>483</sup> Bodleian MS Dep d 611 fols 15-17 and 30

Italians' imitation of the Ancients, and the French's imitation of both, and then Rapin's observation that the French had not composed pastorals in their language comparable to Virgil.<sup>484</sup> The second draft of Thomas' *Preface* concedes that pastorals are often looked 'upon by such a number of poets, easily composed, & that their thoughts and sentiments must be trite and vulgar', as Pope's *Discourse on Pastoral* had suggested.<sup>485</sup> In it, Thomas expressed his 'hope that the following pieces will be exempt from censure as they are formed on a plea entirely new & as their design is distinguished from any prosecutions of the kind either ancient or modern'; this, he admitted, was though he had 'endeavoured to imitate the simplicity of the Ancients' referring to the 'Bucolic of Virgil as something of this entire'.<sup>486</sup> The question he posed in the *Preface*, of whether depictions of rural life lauded in Neoclassical theory will agree with the taste of 'gentlemen who are more conversant in the fashionable ornaments of life', offers the reasoning for 'opposing of a peaceful and rural life with scenes of war' as Virgil had.<sup>487</sup> It suggests how Thomas' pastoral satires reflected the impressions he had formed of the Neoclassicists criticism of Virgil; and which shaped his reception of earlier satiric renderings of pastoral which combined pastoral elements with those of epic enabled critical reflection upon the periods in which they were composed in a manner similar to Virgil's verse.

In the same manuscript, Thomas Warton composed 'An Essay on Romantic Poetry' which Fairer has referred to as the Wartons' 'manifesto'.<sup>488</sup> The essay shows how Thomas' imitative pastoral verse, published in 1645, offers an example of the critical literary history he later composed. In 'An Essay', he discussed the development of the Ancients' method of

---

<sup>484</sup> Bodleian MS Dep e 305 fol 1

<sup>485</sup> Bodleian MS Dep d 611 fol 35

<sup>486</sup> Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS Dep d 611 fol 35

<sup>487</sup> Bodleian MS Dep d 611 fol 34

<sup>488</sup> Bodleian MS Dep d 611 fol 5-10; David Fairer, 'The Formation of Warton's History' in *History of English Poetry, Volume I*, ed. by David Fairer (London: Routledge, 1998)



narrative description in pastoral to elicit affective response as compared with that of the Moderns. He distinguished the poetry of the Ancients, which described human actions and nature, from what Thomas refers to as the 'Romantic' poetry of the Moderns, which drew upon such conventions as the recurring image of the magician in literary history to depict to 'the actions of spirits, in describing imaginary scenes, & making persons of abstract things, such as solitude, innocence and many others' which prompted ideas about that beyond that which may be apprehended through the senses in a similar manner to the sublime.<sup>489</sup> He noted the similar spirit in which Romantic poetry was conceived, though it was done with more judgment, so that this less extravagant verse formed his ideas about how it affected the imagination in the same manner as the old Romances.<sup>490</sup> In doing so, Thomas' 'Essay' provides the critical context in which his Romantic verse may be read within an alternate tradition to that of Neoclassical pastoral. That context offers evidence that the old romances served as the source from which later poets such as Marvell drew the methods he employs which lend an irony to use of pastoral language in such metaphysical poems as *The Garden* and *On a Drop of Dew*.

These meditations upon the conscious imitation of historical models, and at the same time, an innovative Romantic poetry, and its defense in relation to contemporaneous literary debates within those terms, anticipated Thomas Warton's literary career. His later poetical efforts brought to fruition this new allegorical poetry following the tradition of romances, which prompted critical writing that secured the position for it within English literary history he had claimed for himself with his initial publication of pastorals. The most clear example of this is in Thomas Warton's *History* in which he schooled his readers in the origins of the literary and

---

<sup>489</sup> Bodleian MS Dep d 611 fol 10

<sup>490</sup> Bodleian MS Dep d 611 fol 10

critical traditions into which he wrote himself, giving coherence to his literary works as evidence of development. Thomas Warton also suggested this to be true of Milton's juvenile poems which, he wrote, provided evidence of what readers would later find in *Paradise Lost*.<sup>491</sup>

Thomas Warton's own development as a literary critic progressed alongside that of his development as a poet. Just as Thomas Warton began with pastorals as a first literary composition, the beginning he made with his observations about pastoral in his Bodleian MS Dep e 305 situated *The Faerie Queene* in relation to the pastorals of the French and Italian. This allowed him to develop his methods of reading and assessing their pastorals and pastoral theory into the methods he employed as a literary historian.<sup>492</sup> Thomas Warton's final structure for his *History* is the development of these initial habits of reading and writing, which shaped the ideas he formed about English literary history and his place in it. Thomas's footnotes to his *History* in which he assessed the relation between his poetry and his literary inheritance offer evidence of the habits of mind underlying the habits of writing he formed from his study of the Modern English tradition of satiric renderings of pastoral. Evidence of those habits may also be found in the prefatory statements and glosses as well as the use of language and symbols of Chaucer, Spenser, Dryden, and Pope.<sup>493</sup>

---

<sup>491</sup> Thomas Warton, 'Preface' in *Poems on Several Occasions, English, Italian, and Latin, with Translations by John Milton, With Notes Critical and Explanatory, and Other Illustrations, By Thomas Warton, Fellow of Trinity College and Late Professor of Poetry at Oxford*. (London: Printed for James Dodsley in Pall Mall, 1785), p. a2

<sup>492</sup> Bodleian MS Dep e 305; Thomas Warton, *Observations on the Faerie Queene of Spenser*

<sup>493</sup> Geoffrey Chaucer, 'The Canterbury Tales' in *The Works of our Ancient and Learned English Poet Geoffrey Chaucer Newly Printed (Londini: Impensis Georg. Bishop, 1598)*; Edmund Spenser, *The Faerie Queene: The Shepheard's Calendar: Together with the Other Works of English* (1611); John Dryden, 'Preface', *Fables ancient and modern* (1700); 'Preface', *Sylvae, or, The second part of Poetical miscellanies* (1685); 'Preface', *Ovid's Epistles*, (1680); Alexander Pope, *The works of Alexander Pope, Esq; Vol. I.* (1736). These were the editions held at the Bodleian Library to which Thomas Warton would have been able to refer along with the manuscripts he consulted while holding the post of professor and conducting his research for his writings.

Such habits also determined the methods Thomas and Joseph Warton employed to place themselves within that tradition. The commentaries of both make use of the generic traits of the tradition of romances to assess the precursors to their works, and so define the standard by which they wished to judge their own works and for them to be judged. Both Thomas and Joseph made ample reference to the imagination and invention by which they critique Akenside's poetry in their letters, as well as the sublime strokes of the works they praised with which they lead readers to compare theirs through their allusions to that verse.<sup>494</sup> Thomas Warton's observation that *The Faerie Queene* is an allegorical poem offered the basis which supported the claim he makes in his *Preface* to his *Five Pastoral Eclogues* to have written one and the set of ideas he conveyed about what an allegorical poem is.<sup>495</sup> In his *History*, which traced the development of the elements of such allegorical poems in the tradition of romances, he devoted much attention to the conventions to be found in his own. Joseph Warton's *Essay* also justifies his judgments as a defense of Pope and not an attempt to detract from his reputation.<sup>496</sup> In it he wrote that the "largest portion of Pope's poetry were the didactic, moral, and satyric kind, good sense and judgment his characteristic excellencies, not invention and fancy ... [as] imagination was not his chief talent".<sup>497</sup> His comment that this is because Pope formed himself on such French models as Boileau, in the manner that Milton formed himself on Grecian and Italian models, may be read as a defense of his claims to the imagination in his poetry, based upon the notion of it he gained from reading both poets' verse.<sup>498</sup>

---

<sup>494</sup> David Fairer, ed., *The Correspondence of Thomas Warton* (Athens: The University of Georgia Press, 1995), p. 7

<sup>495</sup> Thomas Warton, *Observations on the Faerie Queene of Spenser*, p. 217-18; Thomas Warton, *Five Pastoral Eclogues*, p. 3-4

<sup>496</sup> Joseph Warton, *An Essay on the Genius and Writings of Pope*, p. 477

<sup>497</sup> Joseph Warton, *An Essay on the Genius and Writings of Pope*, p. 478

<sup>498</sup> Joseph Warton, *An Essay on the Genius and Writings of Pope*, p. 478

Pastoral then is both a beginning and a means of assessing writerly development because it provides a mode of writing through which its elements can be combined with those of other genres to measure the aesthetic and social values of each successive period against that of Ancient pastoral through which recurring patterns of thought emerge to the self and the observer. Thomas Warton's *Observations on The Faerie Queene of Edmund Spenser* allowed him to rehearse what he did for his own writings in his history. *The Faerie Queene* is, according to John Upton, Spenser's summative epic. It forms the expression of the habits of mind though that Spenser developed, because of his imitative habits of writing formed while composing his pastorals *The Shepherd's Calendar*.

It also gives reason for situating the two literary works in relation to each other. Spenser himself provided a 'Preface' for *The Faerie Queene* (1611) which provided the argument for the design of the poem and framed how it was to be received according to his purpose in selecting it. He noted what he was attempting to do as a historical poet who may thrust into the middle of things where it concerns him most to make an analysis of all, rather than a historiographer who discourses of affairs in an orderly fashion.<sup>499</sup> Here Spenser laid the foundation for the relation between epic and romance in which the structure of history in the form of epic-like narrative with its corresponding generic features allowed Spenser to treat the values of medieval Christian chivalry. Evidence that Thomas had formed this conclusion is offered in a letter to Richard Hurd on 22 October 1762, in which Thomas writes that he considered undertaking an edition of Chaucer as a project to follow his *Observations on Edmund Spenser's The Faerie Queene*.<sup>500</sup> That he considered undertaking this project also suggests the manner through which his study

---

<sup>499</sup> Edmund Spenser, *The Faerie Queene: The Shepherd's Calendar: Together with the Other Works of English*; (1611)

<sup>500</sup> David Fairer, 'The Formation of Warton's History', p. 19

into Spenser's use of allusion in his interpretative reading of Chaucer and Ariosto had shaped the habits of mind with which he perceived the recurring patterns in literary history. In Spenser's manner of achieving that, Thomas found it to resemble the method Chaucer derived from Geoffrey's *Historia* and Virgil's *Aeneid*.

Spenser first developed this method for writing a text that is a collaboration of creative and critical in *The Shepherd's Calendar*. The arguments and glosses which Spenser provided, much like the arguments which precede Chaucer's *The Canterbury Tales* and which offer a frame for what follows, permitted Spenser to offer explanation of archaic words and their origins so 'that in this kind, as in other wee might be equall to learned of other nations', as he explained to be his intent in his prefatory letter from E.K. addressed to his patron M. Harvey.<sup>501</sup> This allowed Spenser to use the arguments and glosses to provide references to other pastoralists, such as Marot's use of the French name Colin as pseudonym as Virgil had, to construct the history of pastoral as a context within which he wished *The Shepherd's Calendar* to be read.<sup>502</sup> Spenser, in doing so, distinguished his parodic pastorals as part of an English Christian tradition from the Neoclassical tradition. Spenser's renderings of pastoral exaggerated the simpleness and candor with which his shepherds spoke as compared with that of the Neoclassical tradition that emulated the simplicity of the Ancients through their depictions of shepherds that uttered their simple perceptions and to which the French Marot also belonged. Spenser's 'General Argument' gives further evidence of this. In it, Spenser explained that the Romans in the time of Julius Caesar began their year in March, while the Egyptians began theirs in September, which was the

---

<sup>501</sup> See Spenser's Preface to *The Shepherd's Calendar* in Edmund Spenser, *The Faerie Queene: The Shepherd's Calendar: Together with the Other Works of English* (1611)

<sup>502</sup> See Spenser's glosse to Januarie in *The Shepherd's Calendar* in Edmund Spenser, *The Faerie Queene: The Shepherd's Calendar: Together with the Other Works of English* (1611), p. 2

month, according to Rabbines, in which God made creation.<sup>503</sup> The reason Spenser gave for beginning *The Shepheard's Calendar* in January because that honored Jesus Christ's incarnation on 25th of December, positioned his eclogues in relation to the other cultures from which alternate accounts of literary history emanate.<sup>504</sup>

The first three volumes of Warton's *History* offer a similar critical context within which to situate his own pastoral satires. His incomplete fourth volume ends just before he proceeded to illustrate the relation between the literary tradition of the chivalric romance and pastoral from which he had drawn his influences. Joseph Warton also constructed that type of context for the reception of his poetry using his critical assessment of Pope's writings over the length of Pope's career in relation to the writings of his influences and those of his contemporaries. Pastoral, then, served as the means through which the two Wartons began to form their skill at criticism in ways that reemerge in their later commentaries. Yet, the seeming connection between their creative and critical development over the course of their careers, manifests itself in repeated patterns of thought in ways that prompt the question as to what early habits of writing, and corresponding habits of mind they formed, which a turn to the two Wartons' pastoral will answer.

### **Understanding Imitation and Allusion within a Recursive Pastoral Tradition**

Although the extant notebooks documenting Thomas Warton's researches into English Literature were compiled in the 1750s, as David Fairer notes, his *Five Pastoral Eclogues* (1745) suggest that he began his readings in English poetry much earlier.<sup>505</sup> Thomas' drafts of his 'Preface' to

---

<sup>503</sup> See Spenser's 'General Argument' to *The Shepheard's Calendar* in Edmund Spenser, *The Faerie Queene: The Shepheard's Calendar: Together with the Other Works of English* (1611)

<sup>504</sup> See Spenser's 'General Argument' to *The Shepheard's Calendar* in Edmund Spenser, *The Faerie Queene: The Shepheard's Calendar: Together with the Other Works of English* (1611)

<sup>505</sup> Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS Dep d 610-13, MS Dep e 279, MS Dep e 305; David Fairer, 'The Formation of Warton's History, p. 13'; Thomas Warton, *Five Pastoral Eclogues*

*Five Pastoral Eclogues* in MS Dep d 610 and MS Dep d 611 give the evidence why he turned to imitate Virgil's first and ninth eclogue, and adapted them to a new design in which he attempted to reconcile pastoral with the subject of war. The attention Thomas drew to the elegance with which they do so, also offers proof how Neoclassical pastoral theory, shaped the habits of mind with which he composed his critical response to the simplicity of Theocritus' *Idylliums*, despite the rudeness of some of his rustics, as compared with Virgil's. His use of the term elegance betrays that the rule he derived from his study of successive imitations of the conventions differed from that of the Neoclassicists in a manner that enabled him to use them to effect the simplicity necessary to his satiric renderings of pastoral.

Virgil's *Eclogues* and Pope's *Pastorals* provided Thomas with an earlier and later example in the sequence of imitations that form the noted recursive tradition of satiric renderings of pastoral.<sup>506</sup> Virgil's first eclogue begins with Meliboeus' comment which expresses the essence of pastoral simplicity, and offers critical commentary on the historical circumstances in which it was composed through his lament of its loss because the reality of war:

You Tityrus, lie under the canopy of a spreading beech, wooing the  
woodland Muse on slender reed, but we are leaving our country's  
sweet fields. We are outcast from our country you, Tityrus, at ease  
beneath the shade, teach the woods to re-echo "fair Amaryllis".<sup>507</sup>

Such statements led Neoclassicists to derive a rule of simplicity from the view of rural life Meliboeus expresses, as it gives delight in a manner that the Wartons must have recognized in

---

<sup>506</sup> John Dryden, trans. *The works of Virgil*; Alexander Pope, *The Works of Alexander Pope, Esq. Vol. I*

<sup>507</sup> Virgil, *Eclogues, Georgics, Aeneid I-VI*, trans. by H R Fairclough, rev. by G P Gould (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1999), p. 25

Dryden's application of it to his translation, to which they also allude. The tranquility that Neoclassicists noted to be characteristic of pastoral is suggested in the relation that Meliboeus constructs, between the ease of a shepherd and the physical displacement from such pastoral objects of pleasure, and the mental distress that results from war. Virgil defined the meaning of the pastoral element of the shepherd in terms of the emblems of the values of the country life. Virgil chose the beech, a generic image frequently used in pastoral convention, to evoke the aesthetic impressions associated with leisure, and thus ease through the ideas of shade and respite it suggests. The reed, a symbol of pastoral song, led Virgil's reader to assume such leisure to be condition of a happy state. Neoclassicist theorists such as Rapin concluded that such images prompted ideas of happiness and ease necessary to produce the aesthetic character of pastoral, because it represented to men 'the state of innocence of the Golden Age' from which they formed their impressions.<sup>508</sup> Such images did this though because the use of images allowed them to form an understanding of the relation of the shepherd to such objects denoting the typical actions of which his life of simplicity consists.

Virgil, however, redefined the meaning of the shepherd from that which might be inferred from Theocritus' descriptions of his condition. For Meliboeus, such emblems of leisure used to describe a shepherd's existence only have meaning in relation to the sweet fields that are his home country and denote a state of certainty necessary to mental ease. Virgil's depiction of it maintains the principle that simplicity of a shepherd's pastoral life, which the Neoclassicists perceived to be the guiding principle in Theocritus and Virgil's pastorals. Still, from Virgil's application of that rule, one may discern what he understood to be the relation between the shepherd, and that which describes his country life, to how the principle of simplicity might be

---

<sup>508</sup> Rene Rapin, pp. 7-8



used to communicate meaning which differs from that which the Neoclassicists suggested.

Pastoral, through its depiction of a shepherd's simple view which Neoclassicists associated with innocence, became a means for Virgil to comment on the effects of human conflict.<sup>509</sup>

Examining the writings of such poets whom the Wartons read enables one to discern the habits of mind in the poetic response they made to the patterns of allusive pastoral conventions they perceived in them. Identifying those habits allows one to understand those habits with which they later composed literary history. The first few lines of Pope's third pastoral imitate the beginning of Virgil's first noted above, to which Pope drew attention in his footnotes.<sup>510</sup> Pope's language mirrors Virgil's in maintaining the principle of simplicity from which Pope derived the convention for expressing it:

Beneath the shade a spreading Beech displays,

Hylas and Aegon sung their rural lays,

This mourn'd a faithless, that an absent Love,

And Delia's name and Doris filled the Grove.

Ye Mantuan nymphs, your sacred succour bring;

Hylas and Aegon's rural lays I sing.<sup>511</sup>

Pope's first two lines reflect the idea he forms, of the relation Virgil established between the beech tree, which he described explicitly as shade, and the respite to which it corresponds that permits the two shepherds Hylas and Aegon to engage in song. Pope redefined the relation,

---

<sup>509</sup> Annabel Patterson, *Pastoral and Ideology*, p. 3

<sup>510</sup> Alexander Pope, *The Works of Alexander Pope, Esq. Vol. I*, p. 38

<sup>511</sup> Alexander Pope, 'Spring Pastoral' in *The Works of Alexander Pope, Esq Vol I*, p. 42 lines 1-6

however, between the terms of the beech and song, so that the shade which connotes the happy state in which shepherds engage in such song conveys the meaning of respite in terms of the mental ease needed because of faithless love and subsequent abandonment. This use of the terms shade, beech, sung, and lays shows how allusion, a form of imitation, also possesses a recursiveness that does not only consist of the repetition of a pattern of usage, because the terms used to define the central concept result in a new meaning.

Those patterns of allusion shaped the manner through which the Wartons' verse draws upon the satiric renderings which exaggerate the mannerisms of different figures of medieval society in *The Canterbury Tales* of Chaucer, and the satiric renderings of pastoral of Spenser, Dryden, and William Collins, which imitated Chaucer's methods, to illustrate the patterns of thought that lend literary history that recursive character. The form of parody or burlesque which contemporary critics consider Chaucer's verse to be demonstrates how such writing did not demand that poets maintain 'a rigid set of generic rules' to reflect the critical reception of individual texts such as *The Rime of Sir Thopas* and *The Squire's Tale*. Eighteenth-century poets and critics employed the critical language they inherited from such texts to conceive of such parody as a form of criticism.<sup>512</sup> To offer a satire that formed this kind of critical commentary, Chaucer's *The Canterbury Tales* draws upon the older form of the epic, weaving in what Helen Cooper notes to be elements taken from georgic, the pastoral, the chivalric romance, the fabliau, and the pious tale, to form what Northrop Frye refers to as an 'encyclopedia of kinds'.<sup>513</sup> Thomas Warton's notes about Dryden's translation of Chaucer's *The Nun's Priest's*

---

<sup>512</sup> Joseph Dane, 'Genre and Authority: The Eighteenth-Century Creation of Chaucerian Burlesque', *Huntington Library Quarterly* 48 (1985), 345-62 (p. 347-48)

<sup>513</sup> Northrop Frye, *The Anatomy of Criticism* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1957); Helen Cooper, *The Structure of the Canterbury Tales* (London: Gerald Duckworth & Co, Ltd., 1983)

*Tale* entitled 'Vol. 3 Cock and Fox' includes cross references to Petrarch, Virgil, and Milton to whom he also turned to record his observations about their pastorals in his notebooks.<sup>514</sup> That suggests the manner through which allusive imitation using that critical language enabled this kind of parody. The speakers of each of Chaucer's tales represented a social position, which allowed Chaucer to exploit the parodic potential of each genre, to undermine his medieval readers' understanding of the stereotypical figures and the values, pagan and Christian, for which each served as example. The parson, the ploughman, and the knight each denoted the classical genres depicted in Virgil's *Eclogues*, *Georgics*, and epic *Aeneid* while the wife of Bath and the nun serve as emblems of the Modern genres of the fabliau and the pious tale they recount. Dryden's translations of *The Knight's Tale*, *The Wife of Bath's Tale*, and *The Nun's Priest Tale* made use of that allusive language to offer a re-reading of Chaucer that emphasized the elements of chivalric romance embedded in them. This allowed Dryden to fragment or discard Chaucer's 'view of the earlier forces that shaped epic narrative' in a similar manner to the interpretative process Colin Burrow notes in responses from Spenser to Milton to Homer's works.<sup>515</sup> In doing so, Dryden re-contextualized the older social values which he examines in Chaucer's romantic re-reading of Ancient epic in terms through which readers during the Restoration could apprehend its culture.

Thomas Warton's commentary about Spenser's interpretative response to medieval romance offered in *Observations* suggested that his readings of pastoral poetry provided him with the critical language he employed in it; Thomas' notebook records the evidence of Spenser's allusions to Chaucer's parodies that gave occasion for his doubt as to Dryden's claim

---

<sup>514</sup> Bodleian MS Dep c 640 fol 10

<sup>515</sup> Colin Burrow, *Epic Romance: Homer to Milton* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1993) p. 14

that Spenser is the best pastoralist since Virgil. The attention Thomas drew to the elegance of his model in Virgil's, as compared with the general opinion of pastoral as common and trite in character, may also be read within the context of his comments about Spenser and the example coarseness of the rustics in Theocritus' idylls offered to Virgil. His notebooks that contained his research into Greek poetry, as preparation for his lectures as Professor of Poetry, include translations of Theocritus' verse, as well as an essay entitled 'De carmine Bucolico Graecorum' that was later published as 'Dissertatio de Poesi Bucolica Graecorum' in his *Theocriti Syracusii quae supersunt, 2 vols.* (1770).<sup>516</sup> Evidence of the impressions Thomas Warton formed of the satiric elements in Theocritus as compared with Virgil and Spenser remains in his inclusion of *A Pastoral in the Manner of Spenser, From Theocritus, Idyll XX* in *The Union: or Select Scots and English Poets* for which Thomas served as editor.<sup>517</sup>

*A Pastoral in the Manner of Spenser* combines the form and conventions of the pastoral lover's plaint with Chaucerian parody in a 'paraphrastic imitation of the 20<sup>th</sup> Idyllium of Theocritus'; in offering this description, Richard Mant noted its resemblance to Spenser's *January*, and attributed it to Thomas Warton, though its author was not named in *The Union*.<sup>518</sup> Theocritus' *Idyll XX* begins with the following lines that paint the image of the object of the speaker's unrequited love:

Eunice laughed at me when I wanted a kiss, and in a mocking tone  
she said, 'Get away from me? Do you, an oxherd, want to me, you

---

<sup>516</sup> 'Thomas Warton, *Dissertatio de Poesi Bucolica Graecorum*' in *Theocriti Syracusii quae supersunt, 2 vols* (1770)

<sup>517</sup> 'A Pastoral in the Manner of Spenser, From Theocritus, Idyll XX' in *The Union: or Select Scots and English Poets* (Edinburgh: Printed for Archibald Munro & David Munro, 1753) p. 93-94

<sup>518</sup> Thomas Warton, *The Poetical Works of the Late Thomas Warton B.D.*, ed. by Richard Mant, two vols (Oxford: 1802), p. 112

poor thing? I've not learned to kiss country bumpkins, but to press  
townmen's lips with mine.<sup>519</sup>

Spenser's translated these lines of Theocritus written in Doric dialect into the Chaucerian diction Mant noted in Warton's poem. That allowed Spenser to recast Theocritus' rustic shepherdess as a lady to whom a knight made his troth in medieval romance:<sup>520</sup>

It is not Hobbinol, wherefore I plaine,  
  
Albee my love he seeke with daily suit:  
  
His clownish gifts and curtesies I disdain,  
  
His kisses, his cracknel, and his early fruit.<sup>521</sup>

This manner of paraphrase enabled Spenser to engage with Theocritus so that his parodic rendering of the Ancient shepherdess served as a frame for his critical reception of the values of chivalry conveyed in the medieval romance. Spenser's pastoral satire maintains the simplicity with which Theocritus' shepherdess speaks, and in doing so, suggests the virtue she lacks in a manner that undermines the image of the fair maiden in such romances. The sexual purity of such maidens was held as one of those values underlying the moral code of a knight's troth and a theme of such satiric renderings of pastoral during the Renaissance as Marvell's.

Thomas Warton's poem preserves both the rustic manner of Theocritus' and Spenser's female speakers and the sentiment they express:

---

<sup>519</sup> Theocritus, 'Idyll 20' in *Theocritus, Mochus, Bion*, ed. and trans. by Neil Hopkinson (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2015), p. 275

<sup>520</sup>

<sup>521</sup> Edmund Spenser, *The Shepherd's Calendar* in *The Faerie Queene: The Shepherd's Calendar: Together with the Other Works of English*; (1611)

As late I strove Lucilla's lip to kiss,  
 She with discourtesse reprov'd my will;  
 Dost thou, she said, affect so pleasant bliss,  
 A simple shepherd, and a losell vile?  
 Not Fancy's hand should join my courtly lip  
 To thine [...] <sup>522</sup>

The language he used, however, imitates the language of the verse of the Elizabethan period in which Spenser wrote to register the interpretative sense he derived from Theocritus' and Spenser's pastorals. Thomas Warton's use of elevated diction flouts the principle of decorum, so that his speaker's manner of expressing his perceptions of both his and his lady's actions, lend him the 'courtly' sophistication ill-fitted to 'a simple shepherd' that reminds of the speaker in Marvell's *To His Coy Mistress*. Marvell's speaker insinuates the affective state he elicits in his lady through reference to the 'youthful glew | [that] sits on thy skin like morning dew' just as Warton's speaker 'did blush, with grief and shame yblent, | Like morning rose with hoary dewe bespnt'.<sup>523</sup> This suggests the manner in which both Marvell and Thomas Warton amended the language of Theocritus' convention describing his speaker to have 'blushed like a rose in the dew', which Mant notes Spenser to have translated, 'My head bespnt with hoary frost I fynde'.<sup>524</sup> Thomas Warton's choice of reference to the dalliance as 'pleasant bliss', as compared with the humble station of her suitor to whom she refers as a 'losell vile', betrays the affected

---

<sup>522</sup> Thomas Warton, 'A Pastoral in the Manner of Spenser, From Theocritus, Idyll XX', p. 93 lines 1-6

<sup>523</sup> Thomas Warton, 'A Pastoral in the Manner of Spenser, From Theocritus, Idyll XX'; Andrew Marvell, 'To His Coy Mistress' in *The Poems of Andrew Marvell*, ed. by Nigel Smith (Harlow: Pearson Longman, 2007), p. 93 lines 11-2

<sup>524</sup> Thomas Warton, Thomas, *The Poetical Works of the Late Thomas Warton B.D.* (London: 1802), p. 113

manner of both the maiden sought and the speaker. That reflects how social values of the eighteenth century shaped Thomas Warton's critical reception of the idea of unrequited love within the context of medieval chivalry he discerns in Spenser's rendering as compared with Theocritus.

Thomas Warton's imitative pastoral satire illustrates the principle to be found in such parody to which Chaucer and Dryden also turned to depiction for the purpose of satire. In his *The Knight's Tale*, Chaucer used an exaggerated rendering of Theseus' gestures to again make his character manifest to his readers:

And in his armes, he hem all vp hent,  
And hem comforted in full good entent:  
And swore his oathe, as he was true knight  
He wolde don so ferforthly his might  
Upon the tirant Creon hem to wreake,  
That all the people of Grece shulde speake  
How Creon was of Theseus yserued;  
As he that hath his deth full well deserued.<sup>525</sup>

Dryden, by contrast, exaggerated the subjective impression Theseus' actions elicit in a manner that Fairer notes to be distinctly characteristic of the romantic mode.<sup>526</sup> This may be placed in

---

<sup>525</sup> Geoffrey Chaucer, 'The Knight's Tale' in *The Works of our Ancient and Learned English Poet Geoffrey Chaucer Newly Printed* (Londini: Impensis Georg. Bishop, 1598)

<sup>526</sup> David Fairer, *English Poetry of the Eighteenth Century*

contrast to the method of narrating action, as in the classical genres such as epic, of which Aristotle writes.<sup>527</sup> Dryden's rendering offers this interpretative sense,

To comfort each, full solemnly he swore,  
That by the Faith which Knights to Knighthood bore,  
And what e'er else to Chivalry belongs,  
He would not cease, till he reveng'd their Wrongs:<sup>528</sup>

Both Chaucer and Dryden's poems emphasize the hypocritical nature of the oaths and honour based upon displays of virtue to suggest the dubious character of the codes of behavior within Christian ideals upheld in their respective periods. In maintaining Chaucer's sense in *The Canterbury Tales*, Dryden rendering not only demonstrates that social values may be translated in any historical moment as modern dress and conventions are used to re-contextualize texts to suit contemporary circumstances. His translation shows that such methods as Chaucer's style of satire can be adapted to reveal the flawed logic of the ideals and the genres used to depict them.

Collins adopted Chaucer and Dryden's method of satire, grafting elements of the pastoral, the georgic, and the epic upon the chivalric romance in his second, third, and fourth eclogues; each features a Persian character representing the three estates in Virgil's works – a shepherd, a camel-driver in place of Chaucer's ploughman or a farmer, and a sultana in place of a knight or king.<sup>529</sup> The choice of the last enabled Collins to engage with ideas about virtue understood in terms of historical notions of sexual purity within the literary forms in which it had

---

<sup>527</sup> Gerrard Genette, p. 9

<sup>528</sup> John Dryden, 'Palamon and Arcite; or The Knight's Tale, from Chaucer' in *The Poems of John Dryden, Volume V, 1697-1700*, ed. by David Hopkin and Paul Hammond (Harlow: Pearson Longman, 2005)

<sup>529</sup> William Collins, *Persian eclogues. Written originally for the entertainment of the ladies of Tauris. And now first translated, &c* (London: printed for J. Roberts, in Warwick-Lane, 1742)



been treated. The first Eclogue provides the reader with a frame story in much the way *The Canterbury Tales* does where Selim, the poet-swain of Bagdat, addresses his lays to ‘Ye Persian maids’ and then proceeds to school them about the nature of female virtue.<sup>530</sup> The initial lines imitate those of Spenser’s *The Faerie Queene*. Spenser’s narrator addresses ‘ye gentle ladies’, noting

And as ye soft and tender are by kynde,  
Adorned with goodly gifts of beauties and grace,  
So be ye soft and tender eeke in mynde;  
But cruelty and hardnesse from you chace,  
That all your other praises will deface,  
And from you turn the love of men to hate.<sup>531</sup>

The beginning lines of Collins’ first eclogue draw upon Spenser’s use the language of pastoral convention to reveal the illusive character of female virtue. It does this in a manner that parodies the underlying ideal of an Age of Innocence whose loss occasions such a cultured poet to adopt the guise of the bardic shepherd:

Ye Persian maids, attend your poet's lays,  
And hear how shepherds pass their golden days:  
With wealth in courts, nor all that haunt the plains:  
Well may your hearts believe the truths I tell;

---

<sup>530</sup> William Collins, p. 5

<sup>531</sup> Edmund Spenser, *The Faerie Queene* in *The Faerie Queene: The Shepheard’s Calendar: Together with the Other Works of English* (1611)

'Tis virtue makes the bliss, where'er we dwell.<sup>532</sup>

The lines Selim speaks embeds a moral about Christian virtue, as one might find in the parables Jesus tells in the Gospels of the New Testament, within an introduction that lends irony to that of the classical pastoral. Collins, imitating Chaucer's and Dryden's method, uses Selim to offer the kind of visual rendering of the actions of biblical figures emulated in the pastorals of the 'Golden Age' that Neoclassical theory suggested to be the source of the simplicity that elicits delight in the reader; in doing this, though, his eclogue challenges both the technique of dramatic visualization and the ideal it depicts with the Christian aphorism.

Collins' use of a dramatic rendering of Selim's actions to characterize him in a manner undermines notions of the poet-prophet through biblical allusion:

Thus Selim sung, by sacred truth inspired,  
wise in himself, his meaning songs conveyed  
informing morals to the shepherd maid,  
Or taught the swains that surest bliss to mind,  
What groves and streams bestow, a virtuous mind.<sup>533</sup>

Though 'sacred truth' has inspired Selim, the speaker implies that Selim, conscious of his role, imparts his own lessons, rather than act as a mediator between God and his humble audience of Persian rustics. The speaker's description of Selim suggests that his mind has departed from observed reality and moved into his own subjective experience of it. His 'songs' represent both the 'meaning' in the 'informing morals' they convey and his 'meaning' to the 'shepherd maids'

---

<sup>532</sup> William Collins, p. 5 lines 39-42

<sup>533</sup> William Collins, p. 5 lines 10-12

as the sage he perceives himself to be. Collins imbued his language with Selim's consciousness to give colour to his emotion in a manner that, as Fairer notes, 'refracts it into palpable symbol'.<sup>534</sup> Collins dramatizes this kind of romantic subjectivity to re-cast the genre of the chivalric romance within a historical and social context within which his readers lived.

The first stanza of Collins' third Persian eclogue illustrates this manner through which successive imitations combine elements taken from different genres, as seen when comparing Chaucer and Dryden, to construct the relations to communicate a new sense of a pastoral idea. This allowed Collins to show how the notions that have shaped his contemporaries' understanding of their literary past have also shaped his ideas about writing in the pastoral mode as a means of critical assessment. The language Collins used in his third eclogue imitates both Virgil and Pope's:

In Georgia's land, where Tefflis' towers are seen,  
In distant view along the level green,  
While evening dews enrich the glittering glade,  
And the tall forests cast a longer shade,  
What time 'tis sweet o'er fields of rice to stray,  
Or scent the breathing maze at setting day;  
Amidst the maids of Zagren's peaceful grove,  
Emyra sung the pleasing cares of love.<sup>535</sup>

The image of respite that Collins' eclogue conveys is still dependent on the understanding of the relations established between the pastoral emblems of shade and song as it was in Virgil and

---

<sup>534</sup> David Fairer, *English Poetry of the Eighteenth Century*

<sup>535</sup> William Collins, p. 15 lines 37-48

Pope's pastorals. Shade remains that which casts a protective shadow. It maintains this sense of shade again using reference to the pleasure found among the fields, as Virgil did, but only to redefine the relation between the pastoral element of song and the notion of solace one finds in Pope's pastoral. Collins' re-interpretation of pastoral tranquility builds upon the successive results of Virgil's and Pope's depictions.

It is prefaced though with the image of the spires of a distant city looming beyond the field of rice to combine Arabian elements into medieval romance. This lends it the aesthetic character of a reverie to touch the imagination as Warton described.<sup>536</sup> In doing so, Collins established the context in which the notion of respite communicates a weariness of the world through language suggesting twilight, which gives the sense of the darker character of the Arabian elements that Warton noted to have been woven into the medieval romance.<sup>537</sup>

Dramatizing the kind of romantic subjectivity of Warton's description to re-cast the genre of the chivalric romance within a historical and social context allowed Collins to shape the way in which readers would interpret his verse. Their reading of it depends upon his grasp of the relation between the successive imitations he conveys within the context constructed from the notions which both earlier poets and his contemporaries held about their literary history that shaped his period.

Examining Pope and Collins' re-reading of Virgil shows how their generic formulations that communicate pastoral's aesthetic character of tranquility and ease, enumerate the ways in which a proposition may be fashioned about the nature of respite through each poet's use of the characteristics of shade, which differ from that found in Virgil. This illustrates how the habits of

---

<sup>536</sup> Bodleian MS Dep d 611 fol 10

<sup>537</sup> Thomas Warton, 'Dissertations I Of the Origin of Romantic Fiction in Europe',

writing formed from such imitative exercises in rhetoric, as those recorded in commonplace books of Cambridge schoolboys Costello describes, form the habits of mind that allowed such poets to reinterpret past works.<sup>538</sup> The manner through which those habits allowed them to do so also reflects the influence their historical moment had on shaping their understanding of the meaning they discern in them. What is common to each is that Pope and Collins responded to the idea inherent in Virgil that shade as a form of protection from sunlight, amending it to suggest a notion of respite as a postponement of the truth that one must eventually face, as it is revealed in the light of day. In Pope, the pain of absent love, and in Collins, the sufferings of the toils of day, and the implications of each about the nature of human experience, are obscured in the shade which an idyllic pastoral landscape offers.

The manner through which Thomas offered a critical response in his *Five Pastoral Eclogues* to that same notion of shade as protection from sunlight and respite as a means of delaying recognition of the truth, just as Pope and Collins had, illustrates a habit of mind shared among eighteenth century pastoralists.<sup>539</sup> Thomas wrote,

Arise, my Lycas, in 'yon woody wilds  
from a rough rock in deep enclosure hid  
Of thickest oakes, a gushing fountain falls,  
And pours it's airy stream with torrent pure:  
Which late returning from the field at eve

---

<sup>538</sup> See William Costello, *The Curriculum at Seventeenth-Century Cambridge* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1958) and Christopher Burlinson, 'The Use and Reuse of Early Seventeenth-Century Student Notebooks: Inside and Outside the University' in *Material Readings of Early Modern Culture: Text and Social Practices, 1580 – 1730*, ed. by James Daybell and Peter Hinds (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010), p. 230-231

<sup>539</sup> Thomas Warton, *Five Pastoral Eclogues The Scenes of Which are Suppos'd to lie among the Shepherds Oppress'd by the War in Germany* (London: Printed for R. Dodsley at Tully's Head in Pall-mall, 1745)

I found, invited by it's dashing sound,  
As thro' the gloom it struck my passing ear.  
Thither I mean to drive our languid flocks;  
Fit place to cool their mid-day hour.  
Due west it rises from the blasted beech,<sup>540</sup>

Warton's choice of the phrase 'woody wilds from a rough rock in deep enclosure hid / Of thickest oakes' suggests the meaning he derived from Virgil of the notion of shade as shelter, as in Pope and Collins' re-readings. The notion of shelter as a place of refuge from danger is more explicitly communicated in the image of the 'stream with torrent pure ... found, invited by it's dashing sound' that is hidden. This itself is a modification of Pope's use of pastoral convention in his Spring *Pastoral* to convey the sense with which the speaker perceives that 'headlong streams hang lift'ng in their fall'.<sup>541</sup> These generic constructions of Thomas' demonstrate the ways such shared habits of mind are the result of shared habits of writing. His poem imitates Pope and Collins' language while using pastoral imagery akin to that Virgil employed to construct the relation between shade and respite. His language borrows Collins' to dramatize the noted romantic subjectivity that lends it the darker aesthetic character of Arabian-influenced medieval romance. In doing so, Thomas Warton's verse builds upon the succession of propositions about the nature of the relation of shade and respite in Pope's and Collin's pastorals to offer an insight about that relation which depends on the three poets' shared understanding of the idea in Virgil to which they each respond.

---

<sup>540</sup> Thomas Warton, *Five Pastoral Eclogues*, p. 5 lines 1-10

<sup>541</sup> Alexander Pope, 'Summer Pastoral' in *The Works of Alexander Pope, Esq. Vol. I, With Explanatory Notes and Additions Never Before Printed* (London: Printed for B. Lintot, 1736), p. 41 line 84

Thomas Warton's lines appear to echo the notion Collins' speaker expresses of the bittersweet pleasure to be found in straying over the fields at twilight. His lines draw upon the notion of the comfort in the fields of one's country in Virgil to characterize a human need to delay the experience of painful circumstances. Thomas, however, chose the word 'gloom' to present the illusory nature of such bittersweet delight, as we find in Pope's lines referring to 'The evening dews that enrich the glade', which suggests the lack of relief shade provides though 'the low sun had lengthened every shade', and alludes to the idea to be found Pope's third pastoral that shade does not ameliorate melancholy.<sup>542</sup> Gloom describes the speaker's experience of the type of landscape at evening to which the dashing sound of the fountain invites the speaker to turn to a notion of the mid-day relief. Here Thomas' poem suggests that the pastoral beech, which is noted to be blasted, cannot provide such respite. The choice of the word 'gloom', however, also allowed Thomas Warton to redefine shade, so that his lines lead his reader through a sequence of perceptions which mirror the succession of responses of each poet to his models for using shade, to characterize the respite men desire. This reflects Thomas' understanding that the mental state which prompts men to seek shade as that to which there is no solace to capture the character of the longing for reprieve which afflicted the Modern subjectivity of his contemporaries.

The aesthetic character with which Thomas Warton imbued his *Five Pastoral Eclogues* enabled him to offer a form of criticism about the recursive literary history his allusive verse delineates. His method of using description in which his shepherd's perceptions and sentiments, appropriate to his humble rustic station, maintained the prescribed principle of decorum from the

---

<sup>542</sup> Alexander Pope, 'Autumn Pastoral' in *The Works of Alexander Pope, Esq Vol I, With Explanatory Notes and Additions Never Before Printed* (London: Printed for B. Lintot, 1736), p. 46 line 99-100

history of usage noted above to have originated in the parodies of Chaucer. This gave his verse the aesthetic character of simplicity such Neoclassical theorists as Rapin and Fontenelle lauded because of the ideas of innocence and happiness it evoked. That, however, allowed him to demonstrate how the poets' verse to whom he alluded had employed that simplicity to examine that longing for an innocence which pastoral was thought to represent. In his *Observations of Edmund Spenser's The Faerie Queen*, Thomas Warton made reference to an 'ingenious correspondent' of his, Thomas Percy, who had written that 'The Rhyme of Sir Thopas was intended by Chaucer as a kind of burlesque on the old romances'; evidence of this was given, he wrote, 'in these old romances nothing is so common, as impertinent digressions, containing affected enumerations of trees, birds, &c'.<sup>543</sup> Thomas' poem demonstrates how the eighteenth-century pastoralists noted imagined new ways in which this method could be used to redefine the relation between the shepherd speaker and the objects of the country, to offer insight about the illusory nature of the pastoral ideal of innocence lost.

That tradition in which Chaucer, Dryden, and Spenser wrote interwove the elements and details imitating Arabian-influenced Arthurian legend with the conventions of pastoral which allowed them to comment upon the values of chivalry that had shaped each of their societies and its perceptions of itself. The histories of England such as that of Geoffrey of Monmouth's to which Chaucer turned to as a source themselves are derived from the epics such as Virgil's *Aeneid* which attempt to trace the lineage of a nation. Spenser and Dryden drew upon the methods of these accounts of Virgil and Chaucer, combining the elements of epic with that of romance, which allowed them to offer parodic depictions of chivalry, whose use of the decorum and character of epic questioned the nature of such accounts of the English people. In his *History*

---

<sup>543</sup> Thomas Warton, 'Dissertations. I Of the Origin of Romantic Fiction in Europe',



of *English Poetry*, Thomas Warton later referred to Bishop Richard Hurd's *Letters on Chivalry and Romance*, which drew attention to how such satires served as the form of criticism Dane notes: 'Chaucer's design was intended to ridicule the frivolous descriptions and other tedious impertinences, so common in volumes of chivalry with which his age was overwhelmed, not to degrade in general or expose a mode of fabling, whose sublime extravagances constitute the marvelous graces of Cambuscan'.<sup>544</sup> Hurd had written that Chaucer's intent to not 'condemn the kind of writing' offered in the medieval romance 'may be seen by the different conduct of this tale [of Sir Thopas], from that of Cambuscan, which Spenser and Milton were so pleased with, and which with great propriety is put into the mouth of the Squire'.<sup>545</sup>

Hurd's comment suggests a different means of satire though to be found in the writing of Spenser's *The Faerie Queene*, as in Pope and Thomson, in which the subject matter of the heroic deeds of epic is given to the humble shepherd-speaker who narrates the actions of its knights and others figures, flouting the precepts of decorum noted. Spenser offered a heroic tale told by a speaker in Chaucerian language that reminded of Theocritus' lyric tone and epic meter combined with a use of Doric dialect. Adapting that method of using the decorum and character of the sublime reveals the illusory nature of the pastoral ideal of lost innocence within a Christian frame of reference. To do this, Thomas Warton reinvented such elements of Arthurian romance as the magician to evoke notions of the occult and historical ideas of the sublime, as noted. Thomas did so, however, in a manner that illustrates the ways in which it is not what is beyond human perception that allows us to apprehend the human condition. Instead, he shows how it is the experience of forces of evil that men fail to acknowledge to be within themselves that leads

---

<sup>544</sup> Thomas Warton, *History of English Poetry, Volume the First*, p. 433, sec 16

<sup>545</sup> Richard Hurd, *Letters on Chivalry and Romance*, letter XI (1765) 3:325

them to understand the character of their mortal lives. The insight to be drawn from his verse suggests how that the tradition of thought about pastoral ideology to which it belongs developed, because of the manner through which the imitation of habits of writing shaped the habits of mind with which each poet offered his critical reading of it. With these habits of mind writers, Thomas Warton looked to the past to extend the relevance of such a tradition to later understanding of his historical present. It is with such habits of mind that Thomas Warton turned to English literary history.

### **Patterns of Imitation and Transmission in Literary History**

The habits of mind Thomas Warton discerned in the recursive pastoral satires to which he alluded in his own verse formed the manner through which he re-constructed an account of the broader pattern of literary history from the patterns among the developments in literature necessary to it. These patterns offered the details in which the historical narrative he writes in his *Dissertation I: Of the Origins of Romantic Fiction* demonstrates that the tradition of romance itself is a successive series of recurrences.<sup>546</sup> For example, Geoffrey's history, according to Thomas Warton, relates the story of a giant Goemagot's fall into the sea off the coast of Cornwall; he noted though that it betrays its source as the fabler offers the story that King Arthur killed a similar giant on Saint Michael's Mount in Cornwall, which Thomas explained, is also in *The Faerie Queene*.<sup>547</sup> His *History* then traces Chaucer's inventions in a discussion which notes Geoffrey's chronicle to be the source of knowledge about Arabian magic for the story of Merlin's magical power to transform Uther to Gorlois and Ulfin to Brice to which he returns in his *History*.<sup>548</sup>

---

<sup>546</sup> Thomas Warton, 'Dissertations I: Of the Origin of Romantic Fiction in Europe',

<sup>547</sup> Thomas Warton, 'Dissertations I: Of the Origin of Romantic Fiction in Europe', p. b4-b6

<sup>548</sup> Thomas Warton, 'Dissertations I: Of the Origin of Romantic Fiction in Europe', p. b7

Both Wartons used this kind of details in their poetry to suggest the power of the Arabian or Arthurian magician to deceive the viewer in a manner that illustrates how they may be used to interpret the patterns of literary history. In *The Pleasures of Melancholy* (1747), Thomas' use of the image of the magician delineates the history of its usage through a sequence of allusions:

Of wily Comus, cheat the unweeting eye  
With blear illusion, and persuade to drink  
The charmed cup, that Reason's mintage fair  
Unmoulds, and stamps the monster on the man.  
Eager we taste, but in the luscious draught  
Forget the pois'nous dregs that lurk beneath.<sup>549</sup>

Thomas' lines above adapt the language and imagery of earlier poets to convey his understanding of the frequent turn to the figure to comment upon the nature of men. Through this, the tissue of allusions Thomas constructed demonstrates how the succession of poets have used the image of the magician to reflect upon the character of the society each inhabited.

In the above passage, Thomas borrowed the language of Milton's *A Mask Presented at Ludlow Castle, 1634* which makes that character palpable: 'To cheate the eye with bleare illusion ... T'inveigle, and invite th'unwarie sense | Of them that passe unweeting by the way'.<sup>550</sup> Thomas also echoed Marvell's *The Mower Against Gardens* that men are susceptible to the magician's power to deceive their perception of the nature of that which they encounter because of human pride.

---

<sup>549</sup> Thomas Warton, *The Pleasures of Melancholy. A Poem*. (London: Printed R. Dodsley at Tully's Head in Pall-mall; and Sold by M Cooper at the Globe in Pater-noster-Row, 1747), lines 87-92

<sup>550</sup> John Milton, 'A Mask Presented at Ludlow Castle in 1634', *The Poetical Works of John Milton: Vol II Containing, Paradise Regained, Samson Agonistes, and his Poems on Several Occasions, &c. A new Edition carefully corrected*. (London: printed in the Year 1731), lines 6-9

To man, that sov'reign thing and proud;  
Had he not dealt between the bark and tree,  
Forbidden mixtures there to see.  
No plant now knew the stock from which it came,  
He grafts upon the wile the tame.  
That the uncertain and adult'rate fruit  
Might put the palate in dispute.<sup>551</sup>

Thomas then drew upon Joseph Warton's use of this notion of the magician casting a deceptive illusion in such earlier uses of the figure of Milton and Marvell. His allusive language offers the sense he derived from the illustration in Joseph's pastoral poem *The Enthusiast* (1744) of how human pride makes men susceptible to self-deception:

... Inur'd Love,  
O whither, God of Rapture, art thou fled?  
While Avarice waves his golden Wand around,  
Abhorr'd Magician, and his costly Cup,  
Prepares with baneful Drugs, t'enchant the Souls,  
Of each low-thoughted Fair to wed for gain.<sup>552</sup>

Thomas's use of the notion of a mintage or coin to communicate this interpretative sense of Joseph's personification of avarice recalls Marvell's use of the image of a coin to satirize Charles II: That of four Seas Dominion, and of their guarding, / No token should appear but a poor

---

<sup>551</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'The Mower Against Gardens' (1681), lines 20-26

<sup>552</sup> Joseph Warton, *The Enthusiast*, lines 83-98

Copper Farthing'.<sup>553</sup> This Pope annotated with the comment, 'The copper farthings had a legend imparting the K's vind. of his dom. of the 4 seas', suggesting a similar use of the image.<sup>554</sup>

The sequence of allusions in Thomas Warton's *The Pleasures of Melancholy* allowed him to redefine the relation between actual sight and understanding in Milton to suggest that the magician's illusion merely prompts the victim, culpable in his own demise, to reveal his true nature, echoing both Marvell's and Joseph Warton's poems. The recursive pattern with which each poet used the magician to examine his historical present that Thomas' poem illustrates reveals the immutable character of human nature despite the belief in the continued development of its society. In doing so, the account it offers of the recurring pattern of ideas, conveyed through the successive uses of the magician, shows how that enables one to draw such insight from the recurring pattern of human history it represents.

Both Thomas and Joseph Warton's use of the image of the Arabian-inspired magician of the literature of chivalric romance demonstrates this within a pastoral context. Doing so allowed them to make use of the notion of the illusion of idyllic life amidst a pastoral setting men fashion for themselves, to satirize the modern man, whose manner of self-delusion reflects the persistently corrupt character of the society despite its developing sophistication. The recursive nature of this tradition of usage extends beyond each Warton's use of allusion to Milton's masque and Marvell's verse. Thomas Warton's *Dissertation I: Of the Origins of Romantic Fiction* uses the details of the Arabian magician's power to deceive a person's senses to delineate the pattern of development that gives the tradition of romances its recursive character.<sup>555</sup> Thomas'

---

<sup>553</sup> BL C 28 e 15, p. 100

<sup>554</sup> BL C 28 e 15, p. 100

<sup>555</sup> Thomas Warton, 'Dissertations. I Of the Origin of Romantic Fiction in Europe', p. a2-b4

discussion of the Arabian magician and other Arabian conventions that are then transmitted and adapted in the Early Modern period demonstrates that such a tradition of usage does not only imitate previous examples. The account he offers shows how each new literary development is defined in terms of the previous occurrence, because the manner in which the image is used is derived from the principle underlying the relation of ideas of which that metaphor is the expression.

A key aspect to understanding Thomas Warton's method is the relation between imitation and transmission he perceived in the details of literary history. He derived his manner of reconstructing such historical details from his own poetic practice noted above. He made use of the pattern of usage of Arabian conventions in later histories and the Arthurian romances derived from them he identified to redefine his readers' understanding of the notion of a nation's history. Thomas Warton wrote that Geoffrey of Monmouth's chronicle drew its details from a copy written in the Armorican language of the Welsh colonists planted in America in the 4th century of *Bruty-Benhind, or The History of the Kings of Britain*, around 1138. He then added that this enabled the transmission of Arabian conventions which American bards adopted because of their exposure to the Saracens.<sup>556</sup> Thomas Warton also contended that a fondness for demonstrating the descent of European nations from the Trojans originated with such later histories that borrowed from Geoffrey's *Historia Britannum* as Hunnibaldus Francus' Latin history of France which traced its origin to Francio, a son of Priam; that history recounts this in a manner similar to Virgil's *Aeneid* which suggests the Romans are the descendants of Aeneas.<sup>557</sup> Thomas also noted that Geoffrey's history translates the description of Hengist's burial, as 'not after the pagan

---

<sup>556</sup> Thomas Warton, 'Dissertations. I Of the Origin of Romantic Fiction in Europe', p. a6

<sup>557</sup> Thomas Warton, 'Dissertations. I Of the Origin of Romantic Fiction in Europe', p. b1

fashion, as Geoffrey renders the words of the original, but after the manner of the SOLDANS', as added proof that this chronicle contained the ideas transmitted to the Welsh bards through the Arabian inventions.<sup>558</sup>

Thomas' dissertation uses this detail to redefine the notion of a history as the beliefs about the Greek ancestry of the European monarchs which are passed from generation to generation in terms of the pattern of literary conventions authors have used that characterize the tradition of romance. That pattern provides the structure for Thomas' narrative within which he shapes our understanding of the history of English poetry. That pattern allowed Thomas to demonstrate how the transmission of history of England may be perceived through the history of imitation of the conventions. Interweaving such conventions of romance with pastoral conventions, as both Warton did, for example, allows authors to draw upon each genre's characteristics, to comment upon customs and beliefs through their depiction in English literature.

Thomas Warton's notebook MS Dep e 305 offers evidence that Thomas uses the terms of this relation between imitation and transmission to construct the context within which he began his research into the English literary tradition. Imitation and transmission served as a means for him to situate his pastorals within that Ancient versus Modern context as well.<sup>559</sup> What he noted to be instances of pastoral writing among the Ancient Greeks and Romans, and then the Italians and French, form a pattern of imitation of which the tradition of pastoral consists. The first folio of the manuscript records Thomas Warton's notes taken from Fontenelle and Rapin's discourses, which discussed the origins of the French imitations of Ancient pastoral, and the intent to

---

<sup>558</sup> Thomas Warton, 'Dissertations. I Of the Origin of Romantic Fiction in Europe', p. b4

<sup>559</sup> Bodleian MS Dep e 305

improve the French language through these attempts at emulation.<sup>560</sup> He noted that the Italians wrote the first pastoral dramas, and then that Rapin writes that the French did not have any pastorals in their language that compare to Virgil's writings, from which one may infer that the Italians copied the Ancients as well.<sup>561</sup> His inquiry into Dryden's claim as to Spenser's place as the best among modern pastoralists consists of notes about Spenser's imitations of elements to be found in Chaucer and Ariosto, which reveal that Spenser's model Ariosto drew influence from Chaucer.<sup>562</sup>

The examples Thomas Warton noted suggest that Spenser's method of imitation was much like that of the Anti-Ciceronians in the debates of the fifteenth and sixteenth century that would serve as prelude to the Ancients versus Moderns debates of the Neoclassical period.<sup>563</sup> The Ciceronians 'emphasized Virgil as a model' for poetry in a manner compatible to the Ancients notion of deriving rules of composition from a literary exemplar whose virtues could not be surpassed.<sup>564</sup> This position could be compared with the Anti-Ciceronians who sought new forms to satisfy the demands of a culturally different age.<sup>565</sup> The Anti-Ciceronians' theory of imitation, which Dryden later adopted, entailed transforming a detailed knowledge of the Ancient corpus by a process of fragmentation and selection, which the modern writer then refashioned through the employment of his imagination and own experience.<sup>566</sup> This emphasis on the 'present and the individual consciousness' allowed Modern authors to translate archaic or

---

<sup>560</sup> Bodleian MS Dep e 305 fol 1

<sup>561</sup> Bodleian MS Dep e 305 fol 1

<sup>562</sup> Bodleian MS Dep e 305 fol 31

<sup>563</sup> Thomas M. Greene, *The light in Troy: imitation and discovery in Renaissance poetry* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1982) p. 171-196

<sup>564</sup> Thomas M. Greene, *The light in Troy*

<sup>565</sup> Thomas M. Greene, *The light in Troy*

<sup>566</sup> Terence Cave, 'Ancients vs Moderns France' in *The Cambridge History of Literary Criticism*, eds by Christa Knellwolf and Christopher Norris (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2008), p. 418



obsolete linguistic and social conventions, so that a Modern poet could communicate the essence of their meaning, while improving upon those conventions in a manner that ‘relied on precedent to address dilemmas’.<sup>567</sup> This Modern notion of naturalizing the conventions through translation about which Thomas Warton commented, framed his understanding of the later English Christian authors use of Arabian conventions within the narrative he constructed. Thomas offered examples from Spenser's *The Faerie Queene* to record the evidence of a pattern of usage that supports the claims he later made about how imitation enables the transmission of literary conventions of an Arabian-influenced tradition of chivalric romance upon which he based his literary history.

Each of Thomas Warton's decisions reflects a habit of mind that fits his habits of writing to his purpose. Thomas' choice of categorizing *The Faerie Queene* as a chivalric romance, and not an epic as John Upton did, is appropriate as the epic is the suitable genre for the historian while the chivalric romance is suited to the allegorical writing of the historical poet. Spenser's explanation as to why he employed the method of a ‘historical poet who may thrust into the middle of things where it concerns him most to make an analysis of all’ in writing *The Faerie Queene*, rather than a ‘historiographer who discourses of affairs in an orderly fashion’, offered two possible methods with which to approach his *History of English Poetry*. By ‘thrusting[ing] into the middle and beginning his research into literary history with Early Modern pastoral and pastoral theory which concerned him most, Thomas was able to adapt the method of the historical poet to his analysis of the history of poetry with which he engaged in *Five Pastoral Eclogues*. The notes he recorded in MS Dep e 305 which commence at the point at which Rapi

---

<sup>567</sup> Paul Hamilton, 'History and Historicism' in *The Cambridge History of Literary Criticism*, eds by Christa Knellwolf and Christopher Norris (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2008), p. 27-28

and Fontenelle's Neoclassical pastoral theory turned to measure contemporaneous examples of pastoral against that of the Ancients allowed Thomas to examine the basis for Dryden's assessment of Spenser. This then enabled him to identify Spenser's models, and from that, the recurring uses of images and conventions which he used to demonstrate how English literature had developed, fitting the forms it took to the use within its historical and cultural context.

Both Upton and Thomas Warton's assessment of Spenser illustrates the concern in the eighteenth century to forge links between English national literature and the language of classical texts and the Bible which, Fairer writes, enabled them to rediscover continuity with their medieval and Elizabeth inheritance.<sup>568</sup> Thomas Warton's discussion of Spenser's poem shows how he employed the elements of the epic form in a satiric rendering, narrated by a rustic speaker in exaggerated Chaucerian language, that offered a humorous example of the ambitions that gave occasion for the turn in Elizabethan England to its ancient and medieval past to fashion an identity for itself. Thomas' turn to this kind of classicism to do so as well, illustrates the recurring understanding of the past reflected in the habits of mind that emerge from the patterns suggested in the habits of writing that look to the literary conventions of the past for example. That pattern suggested in the turn to pastoral convention among later poets to frame their depictions of their historical moments within the ideal of the lost innocence of a Golden Age betrayed the recurring patterns of human history made palpable in such expressions of humanity's fallen nature.

Thomas Warton's *History* demonstrates this through his use of the relation between imitation and transmission to develop an account of the history of his tradition of poetry, as it

---

<sup>568</sup> David Fairer, 'Creating a national poetry: the tradition of Spenser and Milton' in *The Cambridge Companion to Eighteenth-century Poetry*, ed. by John Sitter (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007) p. 185-86

corresponded to the changing customs of English national history. His explanation of the elements of a romantic tradition relies on its usages and meanings in other earlier literary forms. The tradition itself is defined in terms of its value within the arguments he makes for how alternate traditions arose. Thomas Warton showed that the recurring use of personification, for example, communicates the religious practices of England while reflecting the changing attitudes towards them.<sup>569</sup> Joseph Warton's personification of avarice in *The Enthusiast*, noted before, is an example of this. Joseph derives his method from the evolving tradition in which the techniques used to dramatize the lives of the saints in the miracle plays served as the example from personification of virtue and vice in the moralities developed.<sup>570</sup>

The manner in which Chaucer's *The Canterbury Tales* appropriates these techniques and their results also reflects the gradual shift in attitude towards the expression of religious belief that developed, according to Thomas Warton, into a national taste for allegory as evidenced in the kind of civil pageantries using personification.<sup>571</sup> He offered the masque at Kenilworth presented for Elizabeth I's entertainment using nymphs adopted from Arthurian legend to which EK refers in Spenser as example.<sup>572</sup> The use of figures from pagan mythology to personify Eliza and her attendants, a transition to the use of allusion to historical figures, suggests the degree to which, as Thomas noted, barbarism and religion was succumbing to the concerns of a sophisticated society.<sup>573</sup> This though provides the reasoning as to why ancient superstition could serve to build a royal mythology which may be found later in Pope's *Windsor Forest*.<sup>574</sup> The

---

<sup>569</sup> Thomas Warton, *The History of English Poetry, Volume III*

<sup>570</sup> Joseph Warton, *The Enthusiast*, lines 83-99

<sup>571</sup> Thomas Warton, *History of English Poetry. Volume III*, p. 499

<sup>572</sup> Thomas Warton, *History of English Poetry. Volume III*, p. 498

<sup>573</sup> Thomas Warton, *History of English Poetry. Volume III*, p. 499

<sup>574</sup> Alexander Pope, 'Windsor Forest' in *The Works of Alexander Pope, Esq., Vol. I, With Explanatory Notes and Additions Never Before Printed* (London: Printed for B Lintot, 1736)

distinction Thomas Warton made between the use of knights and damsels to personify the virtues of magnificence and chastity, and other purely allegorical embodied abstractions, reflects the manner in which he redefined the relation between personification and allegory in terms of the satiric methods exposing folly and vice derived from Chaucer's rereading of the dramatic form of the *Moralities*.<sup>575</sup> It is here at the end of volume 3 of the *History* that Thomas offered the terms within which his incomplete volume 4 might have defended his own reconstruction of the relation between a recursive English literary tradition of pastoral satire and English history as evidenced in his own poetry.

The English literary history that Thomas Warton wrote, then, differs from that which his contemporaries had thought to write or anticipated from him. As David Fairer notes, the plans of Pope and Thomas Gray which Thomas consulted organized literary history into schools named for the poet whom later writers emulated.<sup>576</sup> Such plans thus were based upon the notions of imitation and emulation as may be found in his *History*. However, the Bodleian manuscripts show, as Fairer explains, that Thomas departed from the systems of taxonomic classification of English literature into schools according to the plans of Pope and Gray.<sup>577</sup> Such plans would have necessitated an approach in which he attempted to take the particulars of literary texts and identify common elements as evidence of literary lineage to categorize various authors. That was the method which Rapin and Fontenelle had adopted in writing their pastoral essays. That, however led to a discussion in such Neoclassical discourse which, in its attempt to offer prescriptions to later writers, only noted the elements of the generic conventions to be used to create an aesthetic character. Such essays, as a result, were understood to recommend developing

---

<sup>575</sup> Thomas Warton, *History of English Poetry*, p. 242 and 499

<sup>576</sup> David Fairer, 'The Formation of Warton's History', p. 7-9

<sup>577</sup> David Fairer, 'The Formation of Warton's History', p. 9

skill in prosody or a kind of grammar to pastoral writing, rather than the ways structures could be used to communicate meaning.

Thomas Warton instead wrote a history that employed the relation between imitation and transmission to better understand how allusions allowed later poets to respond to a tradition of customs and beliefs. His *History* discusses the kind of creative responses to unexpected events to be found among the Modern authors that can account for the modification or evolution of literary or critical traditions and their underlying ideologies. It does this while still maintaining that they relied on precedent for examples to address the difficulties that adaptation to each historical present posed.

His *History* does not model the 'aesthetic transcendence of history', however.<sup>578</sup> Thomas Warton set aside the notion of a progressive literary history, which would have been the result of the method of Pope and Gray, to instead suggest a peak at the Renaissance era with an intended critique of near contemporary eighteenth century writing to come that was never completed.<sup>579</sup> Such a progressive literary history would preclude the eminence of the Ancients to the advantage of his contemporaries. It is interesting to note, as Fairer does, that Samuel Johnson expected the *History* to end with Pope and Augustan correctness, which might be thought of as the realization of Neoclassical prescription.<sup>580</sup> One might consider this the prevailing view of literary history to which Thomas also offered an alternate in which he placed himself.

The return in such literary criticism which Fairer notes to be evidence a desire of Thomas Warton, as well as Joseph Warton, to return to pure classicism, also enables the kind of

---

<sup>578</sup> Paul Hamilton, 'History and Historicism', p. 27-28

<sup>579</sup> David Fairer, 'The Formation of Warton's History', p. 7-9

<sup>580</sup> David Fairer, 'The Formation of Warton's History', p. 43

alternative literary history that Thomas wrote to that of eighteenth-century accounts which traced the lineage of the English Modern Poets: Chaucer, Spenser, Milton, and Thomson. His research into the history of the romantic tradition within which both Wartons situated their verse represents a way of conceiving of their literary inheritance that results because of the self-reflexive writing of the poets discussed in this thesis whom they took as model. Neoclassical prescriptions, by contrast, represented the eighteenth-century Augustans' return to classicism to emulate the restraints Roman authors placed on what Hardie refers to as the 'furor' associated with political violence, popular unrest, and political dissension that also haunted England after the Civil Wars and Glorious Revolution.<sup>581</sup> That, as noted, offered a means for the Wartons' contemporaries to distance themselves from their recent past. To that view of Augustus' reign derived from the contemporaneous writings of Livy, as Erskine-Hill notes, there is also an alternative account within which Augustus' rule was viewed as a necessary condition to the birth of Jesus Christ to reconcile the reality of the ill-effects of Augustus' government to providential history.<sup>582</sup>

The former though is the account that frames our grasp of the history of poetry between the 'affective reader response' of 'Milton's sublime' which Whigs such as John Dennis appropriated and Pope's skill at versification that considers the two to be of separate schools of verse.<sup>583</sup> It is only within this narrative about the history of Neoclassical literature that one may come to understand the tradition of romance to which Warton appends his pastoral satires. Such a tradition of romance differs from the Modern Rationalist tradition as compared with a

---

<sup>581</sup> Philip Hardie, *Augustan Poetry and the Irrational* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2016), p. 4

<sup>582</sup> Howard Erskine-Hill, *The Augustan Idea in English Literature* (London: Edward Arnold Publishers, Ltd., 1983) p. 46-47

<sup>583</sup> Christine Gerrard, 'Pope, Peri Bathous, and the Whig Sublime' in *"Cultures of Whiggism": New Essays on English Literature and Culture in the Long Eighteenth Century*, ed. by David Womersley (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 2005) p. 201-202

Neoclassical tradition derived from the examples of the Ancients. Thomas Warton's *History* does not suggest that precepts can be derived from the particulars of both Ancient and Modern examples to show how literature, like scientific knowledge, is the result of a cumulative objective understanding of universal principles about aesthetic experience.<sup>584</sup> His *History* demonstrates the degree to which each new subjective response to prior literary examples mirrors the recurring patterns of imitation and transmission of which his tradition of romance consists, and so suggest the recurring patterns of human history itself.

If this is the case, it is only within the narrative about the tradition that Thomas Warton constructed in relation to the history of Neoclassical literature that one may understand the place of pastoral in his career. If the account of literary history he wrote suggests the recursive nature of the tradition of which his pastoral satires are a product, this is because the historical moments in England to which the tradition of literature responded can only be understood as a successive series of historical developments. Those developments were defined within the terms of the events and consequent shifts in English culture and practice that responded to the recurring human experiences that such historical circumstances occasioned.

The narrative Thomas Warton wrote as prelude to his unfinished discussion of pastoral and satires in the fourth volume of his *History* suggest the manner through which his return to a discussion of pastoral is itself thinking that is recursive. Such habits of mind led Thomas Warton to reflect upon the place of his pastoral satires within the English literary history he wrote in terms of a succession of literary practices, each dependent on the forms and conventions that were the expression of the cultural practices and beliefs of that moment. His choice of pastoral

---

<sup>584</sup> Michael McKeon, 'Theory and Practice in Historical Method' in *Rethinking Historicism from Shakespeare to Milton*, ed. by Ann Baynes Coiro and Thomas Fulton (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012) p. 47

then, as a beginning and the place to which he returned to reflect on its relation to English history, suggests the recursiveness of his career in which the role pastoral served in each successive endeavor, reflects the understanding of pastoral he gained.



## Chapter 6

### Romantic Readings of the Renaissance and Its Legacies

‘It was the union of deep feeling with profound thought ... and with it the depth and the height of the ideal world around forms, incidents, and situations, of which, for the common view, custom had bedimmed all the lustre, had dried up all the sparkle and the dew drops’.<sup>585</sup> The affective power with which Samuel Taylor Coleridge later described the effect of reading William Wordsworth’s *Descriptive Sketches* (1793) in *Biographia Literaria* (1817) lies in Coleridge’s use of the image of dew drops.<sup>586</sup> The image of the dew drop is part of a long tradition of *ars lachrimandi* in which it is likened to a tear to engage with ideas about the relation between weeping as a gesture of faith and the moral character that gesture suggests.<sup>587</sup> Coleridge’s observation noted above draws upon this idea through allusion to Andrew Marvell’s use of the image as a dew drop, figured as a tear in *On a Drop of Dew* (1681), to paint the contrast between its virtue and the seductive earthly garden.<sup>588</sup> Coleridge’s turn to the image registers the meaning he derived from the sense Marvell and Wordsworth’s poems convey of the ideal innocence that had become unknown to the fallen world.

A letter to Sara Hutchinson in 1806 in which Coleridge transcribed Marvell’s *On a Drop of Dew* records Coleridge’s acquaintance with Marvell’s verse.<sup>589</sup> The publication of Wordsworth’s *To H. C.* (1807) gave occasion for his inclusion of the poem. In it, Wordsworth

---

<sup>585</sup> Samuel Taylor Coleridge, *Biographia Literaria*, ed. by James Engell and W. Jackson Bate, The Collected Works of Samuel Taylor Coleridge, Bollingen Series Volume LXXV (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1983), p. 80

<sup>586</sup> William Wordsworth, *Descriptive Sketches in Verse during a Pedestrian Tour in the Italian, Grisson, Swiss and Sovoyard Alps by W Wordsworth St John’s Cambridge* (London: Printed for J. Johnson, St Paul’s Church-Yard, 1793); Samuel Taylor Coleridge, *Biographia Literaria* (1983)

<sup>587</sup> Gary Kuchar, “Andrew Marvell’s Anamorphic Tears”, *Studies in Philology*, 103 (3) (2006), 345-381

<sup>588</sup> Andrew Marvell, ‘On a Drop of Dew’ in *The Poems of Andrew Marvell*, ed. by Nigel Smith (Harlow: Pearson Longman, 2007)

<sup>589</sup> Grasmere, Wordsworth Library, MS STC 34

description of Coleridge's son Hartley, which turns to the dew drop to represent Hartley's spirit, suggests the semblance between the dew drop of Wordsworth's imagination and that of Marvell's pastoral satire. The letter is itself part of a longer exchange between Wordsworth and Coleridge centered upon Marvell's use of the image that was recorded in the drafts of Wordsworth's 'Intimations' Ode and Coleridge's 'Dejection' Ode and 'The Day-Dream' as early as 1802.<sup>590</sup> This chapter then turns to the exchange of manuscripts during that period to reassess how it has shaped recent critics' understanding of Romanticism and the 'English poetic tradition' because that work has been seen by such scholars as Lucy Newlyn to form a culturally central 'system of opposition' as 'the continuity of Wordsworth's life, and the stability of his creative power' 'amount[s] to a fiction, against which Coleridge measure[d] himself'.<sup>591</sup>

This chapter considers then how the literary past formed their understanding of their historical present as they were formed by it. It draws upon Michael O'Neill's discussion of the illusive presence of Marvell in Coleridge and Wordsworth's early poetry as compared with the reception of Wordsworth's later verse among such contemporaries as Leigh Hunt who viewed Milton to be Wordsworth's 'forerunner'.<sup>592</sup> It considers Coleridge's creative and critical writing and its methods within Dustin Griffin's recent study about the efforts in the eighteenth century to appropriate Milton's literary style, separated from his political convictions. It does so to better understand how Coleridge employs them to respond to the omission of Marvell from accounts of literary history because of it.<sup>593</sup> William A. Ulmer discussion of the two poets' relationship draws upon Harold Bloom's ideas about the connection between anxiety and revisionism in his

---

<sup>590</sup> Stephen Maxfield Parrish, ed., *Coleridge's Dejection: The Earliest Manuscripts and the Earliest Printings* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1988) p. viii

<sup>591</sup> Lucy Newlyn, *Coleridge, Wordsworth and the Language of Allusion*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 2001)

<sup>592</sup> Michael O'Neill, 'Marvell and Nineteenth Century Poetry' in *The Oxford Handbook to Andrew Marvell*, ed. by Martin Dzelzainis and Edward Holberton (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2019), 756-72

<sup>593</sup> Dustin Griffin, *Regaining Paradise*, p. 7

theory of textual production to explain how the shadow of the literary past in which Wordsworth and Coleridge were cast shaped that exchange; what Ulmer views to be the two poets' 'appropriation and subversion' has been viewed to be an 'intertextual debate - a war of allusions'.<sup>594</sup> This chapter investigates the claims made by such scholars how such early poems of Coleridge's as his 'Dejection' Ode turned to Marvell's depiction of the dew drop and used it to engage in that intertextual debate with Wordsworth about Marvell and the English poetic tradition discussed which they had inherited. In doing so, it considers both how and why employing allusive language in a pastoral mode of interpretative reading of Marvell in particular formed both Wordsworth and Coleridge's manner of perceiving, and so, the knowledge Coleridge later gained from measuring his expressions of his understanding of himself against that of literary history, from Marvell to his contemporary Wordsworth.

Those early drafts entitled *To H.C.* and *Letter to \_\_\_* offer evidence of how Coleridge's longer engagement with both Marvell's and Wordsworth's verse shaped the development of his mind. Coleridge's *Ode to Tranquility*, first composed in 1801 and among his poems published in *Sybilline Leaves* (1817), imitates a passage in *Descriptive Sketches* that recalls the first two stanzas of Marvell's *The Garden*. Coleridge's allusive language offers evidence of the echoes of Marvell's satiric depictions of life amidst the sensual earthly garden Coleridge discerned in Wordsworth's verse.<sup>595</sup> This, I will argue, shaped the habits of mind with which Coleridge turned to interpretative writing to examine the notion of the loss of innocence of an idealized past represented in pastoral.

---

<sup>594</sup> William A Ulmer, 'Radical Similarity: Wordsworth, Coleridge, and the Dejection Dialogue', *English Literary History* 76 (2009), 189-213. Also see Harold Bloom, *The Anxiety of Influence: A Theory of Poetry* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1973)

<sup>595</sup> Samuel Taylor Coleridge, 'Ode to Tranquility' in *Poetical Words I Poems (Reading Text)*, ed. by J. C. C. Mays (Princeton, 2001); Andrew Marvell, 'On a Drop of Dew'; William Wordsworth, *Descriptive Sketches*.

Coleridge and Wordsworth's poems engage with that notion in a manner that reflects the subjective meaning they both derived from reading Marvell's wit within a broader context of the Renaissance pastoral within which it was read. That, I will suggest, allowed Wordsworth and Coleridge to re-imagine the Ancients and the Moderns' *querelle* about whether the virtue denoted in the longing for innocence continued to persist within the terms within which later writers came to define a classical and a Romantic tradition of poetry. Their turn to the image of the dew drop amidst a fallen garden suggests the recurring understanding reflected in the patterns of thoughts it represented that allowed them to apprehend their historical moment through the reflection of it they perceived in such turns to earlier depictions. These patterns illustrate how the habits of mind formed through imitative the habits of writing shaped the accounts of the classical and the Romantic traditions within which they were later received.

Coleridge's choice to adapt Marvell's use of the images of the dew drop and the garden to communicate the affective power of Marvell's satiric depictions of courtly swains uttering piercing insights, clothed in the simple language of pastoral, and Wordsworth's interpretative readings of them, enabled his critical response to Marvell's within the genre's ideals. Wordsworth, like Marvell, used the imagery of rural life amidst Nature to fuse a succession of feelings the images evoke with the thoughts such emotions prompt. That offers evidence of the literary value to be derived from the tradition of satiric renderings of pastoral discussed in earlier chapters. Comparing the writings of the three poets illustrates how poetic interpretation served as the mechanism through which Coleridge translated the subjective meaning he came to understand through the act of writing into knowledge of the permanent truths underlying human experience. That he could do this, I will argue, demonstrates how the principle underlying that

literary value permits such poems as Marvell's and Wordsworth's as *On a Drop of Dew* and *To H. C.* to be considered part of a tradition of pastoral.

For Coleridge, Wordsworth's language suggests his reading of Marvell's verse in a manner that spurred him to critical writing of a distinctive kind as well. His *Biographia Literaria* engages with literary conventions and traditions of which the use of the image of the dew drop is an example within ideas about accounts writers told of literary history. In it, Coleridge meditated on conventions and traditions through a comparison of Wordsworth to Shakespeare and Thomson and, most notably, Milton. Yet, Wordsworth's *Descriptive Sketches* and Coleridge's own description of it in *Biographia Literaria* adopted the rhetoric of Marvell's lyrics, which suggests the kind of poetic resemblance, as it simultaneously created the sort of distance that was true of Marvell's parodic verse.<sup>596</sup> That, I will argue, shows how Coleridge's readings of Marvell and Wordsworth formed his habits of mind, and so, shaped the pattern of allusion in his early verse that reflects the recurring patterns of thought from which a notion of literary value may be formed.

The literary value that pervades both Coleridge's creative and critical writings shows how he drew upon the social and aesthetics values expressed in the literature he read to shape the context in which his own would be received. Coleridge's use of Marvell's style of rhetoric suggests the position he fashioned for Wordsworth and himself within the tradition of verse discussed in previous chapter that was premised upon that literary value, which allowed later poets to interpret their historical present within the terms in which the Ancients and Moderns had measured theirs. His turn to do this, I will suggest, offers evidence of how the subjective meaning Coleridge gained from reading that verse within the terms he derived from the context

---

<sup>596</sup> Tom Lockwood, 'Marvell and Jonson', p. 585

within which and with which it engaged shaped his account of the development of English poetry. His *Biographia Literaria* offers an assessment of the received accounts of Marvell's kind of poetic wit and the Renaissance period in which he wrote such as those by Leigh Hunt's.<sup>597</sup> Coleridge's account also betrays his knowledge of the political context within which both Marvell and Milton were read. During the Restoration, Milton's name had been associated with 'rebellion, the author and his books evoking among Anglican Royalists a shrill memory of all the fury and chaos of the previous twenty years', charges to which Marvell offered defense on Milton's behalf.<sup>598</sup> Coleridge's account suggests how the subjective meaning he gained from reading within that historical context shaped his response in *Biographia Literaria* to the critical reception of Wordsworth's poetry because of the semblance it bore to that of Marvell and Milton. Coleridge's methods illustrate how literary conventions and traditions evolved to reflect the recurring meaning poets derived from their subjective impressions to their historical moments, and in doing so, offer evidence of how a literary value persists.

Coleridge's *Biographia Literaria* demonstrates how the method of working out the affective meaning he drew from his pastoral readings of Marvell and Wordsworth's verse enabled the mode of interpretative critical writing within which he offers his account of literary history. I will discuss why the literary value which underlies Coleridge's self-reflexive assessment of his and Wordsworth's responses to the social and aesthetic values that lend such Renaissance pastoral as Marvell's its distinctive character gives occasion to reconsider the accounts of that verse later critics have inherited. That literary value reconciles subjective experience with ideas about the knowledge of permanent truths embedded in literary depictions

---

<sup>597</sup> Leigh Hunt, Extract from 'The Examiner, 18 February 1816' in *William Wordsworth: The Critical Heritage*, ed. by Robert Woof (London: Routledge, 2001), 924-925

<sup>598</sup> Sharon Achenstein, 'Milton's Spectre in the Restoration: Marvell, Dryden and Literary Enthusiasm' in *Huntington Library Quarterly* 59 (1997), 1-29 (p. 2-3)

of human society and accounts of its history. This chapter then considers the manner through which that literary value determines the place that Coleridge gives to Wordsworth's writing in his critical account to understand the idea of literary history that may be formed from it.

### **Coleridge's Early Pastoral Readings: Marvell and Wordsworth**

Coleridge's *Biographia Literaria* offers evidence of how and why the likeness he found between Wordsworth's *Descriptive Sketches* and Marvell's verse served as the stimulus to a generative moment that led to the longer creative and critical response to their verse. *Biographia Literaria* considers the influence Wordsworth's writings have had upon Coleridge's aesthetic sensibility in language sometimes rich in allusion to Marvell, as noted. In *Descriptive Sketches*, Wordsworth echoed Marvell in a manner that may have reminded Coleridge of his verse,

Farwell those forms that, in thy noon-tide shade,  
Rest, near their little plots of wheaten glade;  
Those steadfast eyes, that beating breasts inspire  
To throw the "sultry ray" of young Desire;  
Those lips, whose tides of fragrance come, and go;  
According to the cheek's unquiet glow;<sup>599</sup>

Comparing these lines to Marvell's *The Garden* suggests the manner through which Marvell's depiction of man's fallen garden formed Wordsworth's understanding. The interpretative response he made in the passage to Marvell's description of the affective power of nature to shape his speaker's perceptions turns to imitate Marvell's language to convey the sense with which that garden represents an innocence lost to which his speaker longs to return. Marvell's address to 'Fair Quiet, have I found thee here,' identifies both the aesthetic character of the

---

<sup>599</sup> William Wordsworth, *Descriptive Sketches*, p. 14

garden intertwined with the understanding he derives which that character prompts of the idea of the 'Innocence thy sister dear' long absence. Marvell's comment to the two personified qualities that 'your sacred plants, if here below, Only among the plants will grow' betrays his recognition that it is because of the knowledge of sin he has gained from intercourse with human society that such 'Quiet' and 'Innocence' have long been absent.<sup>600</sup> This wisdom gained which Marvell's speaker gains he expresses by comparing the garden to 'Society ... [as] all but rude, | To this delicious solitude' to which men long to return 'When we have hither run our passions' heat, | [and] Love hither makes his best retreat'.<sup>601</sup> Wordsworth's lines then reveal the strong impression he has formed in which he bids 'Farewell' to betray the sense that he is parting with such a state of innocence as found in the garden by referring to 'those forms that ... rest near the plot of wheaten glade' to allude to Marvell's 'plants'.

Wordsworth's lines quoted above illustrate how Marvell's verse developed his aesthetic sensibility, and through it, his understanding of the subjective meaning he derived from its depictions of that garden. Wordsworth's poetic reply refashioned Marvell's Damon who recalls the first fallen Adam. Wordsworth's allusions such as 'sultry Ray' of young Desire' to Marvell's description of Damon the Mower's experience of it through reference to 'Juliana's scorching beams' which 'inflames the Days' and 'burns the fields and mower both' in and the 'Cheek's unquiet glow' in echoing the perception of the speaker of *To His Coy Mistress* of his lady's 'the youthful glew / Sits on the skin like morning dew' suggest the intensity of the passion with which his speaker once was consumed.<sup>602</sup> This was prefaced with the first two lines that recall

---

<sup>600</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'The Garden' in *The Works of Andrew Marvell, Esq In Two Volumes* (London, Printed for T Davies, in Russell Street, Covent-Garden, 1772) p. 170

<sup>601</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'The Garden' (1772), p. 171

<sup>602</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'Damon the Mower' and 'To His Coy Mistress' (2007)



Damon's expression of the longing for reprieve with which he is left after his encounter with Juliana:

Tell me where I may pass the fires  
Of the hot day, or hot desires,  
To what cool cave shall I descend,  
Or to what gelid fountain bend?<sup>603</sup>

Wordsworth's use of a similar kind of striking language to Marvell's poem fused sensory perception with the affective response it elicits, and so, captured the sentiment embedded in Renaissance pastoral. Wordsworth set the first two lines in contrast to the two that follow which give the sense of the effects of his speaker's experience of a fall into sinful desire, and lend a melancholy regret to his word, that suggests the price paid for the understanding he gained of the virtue he once possessed because of it. This offers the meaning he derived from Marvell's depiction which led him to the piercing insight about the knowledge attained through the experience of romantic love to which Damon's words lead. This allowed Wordsworth to illustrate how Marvell's poetry enables a vicarious experience of the sensuous apprehension of the feeling of longing to return to the state of lost innocence, represented in the language of pastoral that underlies the influence the image of the Edenic garden has upon men.

In August 1801, Coleridge began to compose *Ode to Tranquility*, which imitates the interpretative reading of Marvell's *The Garden* Wordsworth made in the lines quoted. The poem was first published in the *Morning Post* on 4 December 1801. Mark L. Reed speculates that the Lambs may have provided Wordsworth with a copy of Captain Thompson's edition of Marvell's 'Works' in 1802 from which Wordsworth transcribed *An Horatian Ode upon Cromwell's Return*

---

<sup>603</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'Damon the Mower', p. 133

*from Ireland*, though variants between the two versions offer reason to doubt this.<sup>604</sup> Duncan Wu notes that D. E. Wickham refers to Charles Lamb's letter to Godwin of 14 Dec 1800 in which he wrote, 'I remember two honest lines by Marvell (whose poems by the way I am going to possess)', in quoting from 'Upon Appleton House' as evidence.<sup>605</sup> It may be that the Lambs may have also provided the copy of Marvell which Coleridge read. Duncan Wu records though that Wordsworth wrote to Francis Wrangham in 1796 of the parallel Thomas Cooke noted between words of Juvenal's about Cicero and lines of Marvell's.<sup>606</sup> Wordsworth first wrote to Wrangham about their imitation of Juvenal in a letter dated 20 November 1795, which includes lines that Ernest Selincourt's suggests to have been written in the summer of 1795.<sup>607</sup> Wu conjectures that Wordsworth read Thomas Cooke's edition of Marvell 'Works' while visiting Wrangham who owned a copy of it by July 1795.<sup>608</sup> Cooke's edition offers a footnote to a couplet alluding to the incident between the Duke of Monmouth and Sir John Coventry that provided Wordsworth an example for emulation in his and Wrangham's imitation of Juvenal.<sup>609</sup> Wordsworth and Coleridge may have read Wrangham's copy by 1794, however. In a letter dated 26 September 1794, Coleridge sent his 'To Ann Brunton: imitated from the Latin of Francis Wrangham', which borrowed the image of Marvell's dew drop, and which Wrangham printed facing the Latin original in his *Poems* (1795).<sup>610</sup>

---

<sup>604</sup> Mark L. Reed, *Wordsworth: The chronology of the Middle Years* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1975) p. 672n

<sup>605</sup> Duncan Wu, *Wordsworth's Reading, 1800-1815* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995) p. 143

<sup>606</sup> Duncan Wu, *Wordsworth's Reading 1770-1799* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993), p. 95-96

<sup>607</sup> Ernest de Selincourt, ed., *The Early Letters of William and Dorothy Wordsworth (1787-1805)* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1935), p. 160

<sup>608</sup> Duncan Wu, *Wordsworth's Reading 1770-1799*, p. 95-96

<sup>609</sup> Andrew Marvell, *The Works of Andrew Marvell, Esq. In Two Volumes*. (London: Printed for T. Davies, in Russell Street, Convent Garden, 1772)

<sup>610</sup> Samuel Taylor Coleridge, *Poetical Words I Poems (Reading Text)*, ed. by J. C. C. Mays (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2001)

In 'To Ann Brunton', Coleridge used the image of dew drop to record the sentiment her passing elicits. Coleridge's use of the dew drop in these lines reminds of Marvell's poem comparing the human soul to a dew drop that emanates from heaven. Coleridge's reference to the 'Father' that drew 'The Life he gave' and mix'd the big Tear's dew' records the idea he forms about Marvell's description of 'the soul [as] that drop, that ray / Of the clear fountain of eternal day' as God the source of life and light from whose 'bosom of morn' that 'orient dew' is 'Shed'.<sup>611</sup> Coleridge's suggestion that 'nor was it thine to roll / the mimic feelings foreign to the soul in the next couplet that follows draws upon the idea in Marvell's pastoral that the Ann Brunton's soul is of the essence and nature of the her Creator: this is because the dew, as Marvell writes, 'Shines with a mournful light; / Like its own tear' because 'recollecting its own light' it 'Does in its pure and circling thoughts, / express / The greater Heaven in an heaven less'.<sup>612</sup> His reference to the 'heroic strain' which represents 'feelings foreign to the soul' thus distinguishes Ann Brunton and that which one would associate with the epic hero to convey her ideal innocence as compared with the fallen world she had inhabited. In this manner, Coleridge's use of language to allude to Marvell's pastoral depiction of the dew to convey the speaker's impressions of Miss Brunton's virtuous character resembles his comment that recorded his sentiments about the aesthetic effect of Wordsworth's *Descriptive Sketches* quoted at the beginning of this chapter.

Both Coleridge's and Wordsworth's poems offer evidence of how the conventions of writing in a pastoral mode allowed a poet to make use of the images, system of meanings, and underlying ideals of pastoral to which Marvell's depictions respond, and interpret his historical moment, as discussed in previous chapters. The design of Cooke's edition gave the historical

---

<sup>611</sup> Samuel Taylor Coleridge, 'To Ann Brunton: imitated from the Latin of Francis Wrangham' in *Poetical Words I Poems (Reading Text)*, ed. by J. C. C. Mays (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2001), p. 34 lines 21-4

<sup>612</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'On a Drop of Dew' (1772), p. 165

context within which to read Marvell's verse, and so, one from which Coleridge and Wordsworth could draw in responding to their own. Within Cooke's edition, *On a Drop of Dew* and *The Garden* were among the poems in the section entitled 'Carmina Miscellenea' that followed what Cooke referred to as Marvell's 'Poems on Several Occasions', and began the set with his verse to his former patron Lord Thomas Fairfax, which included his pastorals, followed by his 'State Poems', notes to them, and epistles. In the summer of 1650, Lord Thomas had declined Oliver Cromwell's request to continue to lead the Parliamentary Army at the time of the composition of *Upon Appleton House* which depicts Lord Thomas in retirement.<sup>613</sup> Like Marvell, Coleridge and Wordsworth wrote at a time of political upheaval. Napoleon had gained advantage during the French Revolution which erupted in 1789. At the time of *Descriptive Sketches*' publication in 1798, Napoleon led an expedition to Egypt that would occasion his rise to power. The feelings of anxiety expressed in *Ode to Tranquility*, which J. C. C. Mays attributes to Coleridge's looming separation from his wife Sara because of the political situation, prefaced those he later conveys in *Dejection: An Ode* in 1802.<sup>614</sup> The echo of Marvell in Coleridge's comment noted about *Descriptive Sketches* betrays the association that formed in Coleridge's mind between the poetry of Marvell and of Wordsworth and the occasion for his response.

Coleridge's *Ode to Tranquility* suggests the manner through which Wordsworth's turn to a pastoral mode in *Descriptive Sketches* allowed him to apprehend the sentiments such an occasion evoked and characterized the kind of Renaissance pastoral to which Marvell's belonged. Addressing a personified Tranquility, Coleridge wrote:

At morning through the accustomed mead:

---

<sup>613</sup> Ian J. Gentles, 'Fairfax, Thomas, third Lord Fairfax of Cameron (1612-1671), Parliamentary Army Officer, *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, ed. by Lawrence Goldman, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004)

<sup>614</sup> Samuel Taylor Coleridge, *Poetical Words I Poems*, p. 671

And in the summer's sultry heat  
Will build me a mossy seat;  
And when the gust of Autumn crowds,  
And breaks the moonlight clouds,  
Thou best canst raise, the heart attune,  
Light as the busy clouds, calm as the gliding moon.<sup>615</sup>

Coleridge's lines above illustrate how Wordsworth's manner of using images to convey his affective response to the feeling intertwined with the thought in Marvell's poetry shaped his reading of it. The existing manuscripts offer evidence, according to J. C. C. Mays, that the last ten lines were added a month after the ode's composition and included when the poem was published in *Sybilline Leaves* in 1817.<sup>616</sup> In the final lines of *Ode to Tranquility*, Coleridge offered the understanding he derived through imitative writing:

The feeling heart, the searching soul,  
To Thee I dedicate the whole!  
And while within myself I trace  
The greatness of some future race,  
Aloof with hermit's eye I scan  
The present works of man—  
A wild and dream-like trade of blood and guile,  
Too foolish for a tear, too wicked for a smile!<sup>617</sup>

---

<sup>615</sup> Samuel Taylor Coleridge, 'Ode to Tranquility', p. 672 -18-24

<sup>616</sup> Samuel Taylor Coleridge, *Poetical Words I Poems*, pp. 671-72

<sup>617</sup> Samuel Taylor Coleridge, 'Ode to Tranquility', pp. 672-73 lines 25-32

Coleridge adapted the pastoral conventions both poets use to record his feelings and thoughts as he works through his response to them. His phrases ‘The greatness of some future race’ which his speaker views with a ‘hermit’s eye’ reflects the understanding he derives of how a innocence shepherd might respond to the world’s sinful pursuit of ambition to which Marvell referred as men’s efforts ‘to win the palm, the oak, and bays ... Crowned from single herb or tree’ as compared with ‘all flow’rs and trees [that] do close | To weave the garland of repose’.<sup>618</sup> His turn to paraphrase *The Garden*’s first stanza in this manner offer evidence of how its ironic rendering of man’s life amidst an earthly garden has formed his ideas, and in doing so, betrays the insight about humanity’s fallen nature he came to apprehend through the semblance he perceives between Marvell’s society and his own.

Coleridge’s use of allusive language also suggests the manner through which that insight he derived is that which he attained because of the semblance he found between Marvell’s verse and Wordsworth’s *Descriptive Sketches*. This offers evidence of a shared habit of mind reflected in the pattern of thought to which each of the three poets turns to imitative habits of writing to capture the sentiment each successive depiction elicited. The poetic form of lyric, which both Marvell and Wordsworth employ, permitted the experiment through ‘self-observation’ through which Coleridge gained ‘knowledge of humanity ‘in the midst of society’”.<sup>619</sup> The allusive language Coleridge used within this form allowed him to adapt a pastoral mode of interpretative response in which he drew upon the striking images and their affective power described in each poem in the manner noted of Thomas Warton’s verse in Chapter 5. That, in turn, enabled Coleridge’s illustration of how Wordsworth’s depiction allowed him to apprehend the subjective

---

<sup>618</sup> Andrew Marvell, ‘The Garden’ (1772), p. 170

<sup>619</sup> Noel B Jackson, ‘Critical Conditions: Coleridge, “Common Sense”, and the Literature of Self-Experiment’, *English Literary History* 70 (2003), 117-49 (p. 119)

meaning he derived, because it allowed him to reason about Marvell's through Wordsworth's speaker.

It did so however in a manner that anticipated Coleridge's 'conversation poems' which attempted a 'discursion of the mind' that suggests the 'limits to such discourse ... in light of intuitive, sensuous experience'.<sup>620</sup> Marvell's verse offered evidence of how the poetic form of the conversation poem enabled experiment and self-reflection of which *Dejection: An Ode* consists, as shall be seen. These efforts enabled Coleridge, as he wrote in a notebook entry of 1803, 'to write my metaphysical works, as my Life & in my Life—intermixed with all the other events/or history of the mind and fortunes of S. T. Coleridge'.<sup>621</sup> Coleridge returned to his first encounter with Marvell and Wordsworth in *Biographia Literaria* at the time that both it and his *Sybelline Leaves* in which *Ode to Tranquility* were published, as will be discussed later in the chapter.

### **Romantic Responses to Marvell: Coleridge's 'Dejection' and Wordsworth's 'Intimations'**

A letter to Sara Hutchinson dated 4 April 1802 recorded Coleridge's creative response to the likeness he found between Marvell's verse and Wordsworth's allusive language to draw upon its use of imagery such as the dew drop within which to examine pastoral's aesthetic value of simplicity and the idea of virtue it was intended to convey.<sup>622</sup> In the letter, Samuel Taylor Coleridge enclosed the earliest version of a *Letter to* \_\_\_\_, which he later shortened and reshaped, and published in *The Morning Post* on 4 October as *Dejection: an Ode*.<sup>623</sup> Coleridge copied

---

<sup>620</sup> Ewan Jones, "'Less Gross than Bodily": Materiality in Coleridge's Conversation Poems', *The Review of English Studies* Vol 64 Issue 264 (2013), 267-88 (p. 287)

<sup>621</sup> Samuel Taylor Coleridge, *The Notebooks of Samuel Taylor Coleridge*, ed. by Kathleen Coburn (New York: Bollingen, 1957-2002), vol 1 entry no 1515

<sup>622</sup> Earl Leslie Griggs, ed., *Collected Letters of Samuel Taylor Coleridge, Volume II 1801-1806* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1966) p. 438

<sup>623</sup> Stephen Maxfield Parrish, ed., p. viii

extracts of the poem with revisions and additions, and sent 138 lines to William Sotheby on 19 July 1802, 18 lines to Robert Southey on 29 July 1802, and a partial text to the Beaumonts attached to Wordsworth's *Resolution and Independence* on 13 August 1803.<sup>624</sup> A complete manuscript of 'Dejection' from the period has not been discovered, but the first transcription of the complete text made by Sarah Stoddard in Malta around 1805 shows, according to Stephen Maxfield Parrish, that Coleridge had already begun working towards the final version which was later published in *Sybilline Leaves* in 1817.<sup>625</sup>

Evidence of the exchange between Coleridge and Wordsworth during which both 'Intimations' Ode and *Letter to \_\_\_* were composed is recorded in Dorothy Wordsworth's diary entry of 12 April 1802, which noted that Coleridge read his poem to them from a manuscript of it during a visit.<sup>626</sup> In William Wordsworth's letter to Coleridge on 16 April 1802, he wrote 'I was much pleased with your verses in D's letter; there is an admirable simplicity in the language of the first fragment, and I wish there had been more of the 2<sup>nd</sup>; the fourth line wants mending sadly in other respects the lines are good'.<sup>627</sup> Wordsworth's comment expressing how 'pleased' he was with the 'simplicity of the language' reminds of Wordsworth's *Descriptive Sketches*, and Coleridge's letter to Sara Hutchinson in 1806 that includes his annotated transcription of 'On a Drop of Dew'; in both, the two poets use of the term 'delicious' conveys the kind of aesthetic delight Neoclassicists attributed to the aesthetic character of pastoral.<sup>628</sup> Coleridge's poem offered the kind of depiction of simplicity that would elicit such delight. He alluded to the pleasure to be found in simple nature of Heaven's making:

---

<sup>624</sup> Earl Leslie Griggs, ed., *Collected Letters of Samuel Taylor Coleridge, Volume II*

<sup>625</sup> Stephen Maxfield Parrish, ed., p. viii

<sup>626</sup> Ernest de Selincourt, ed., p. 287

<sup>627</sup> Ernest de Selincourt, ed., p. 287

<sup>628</sup> William Wordsworth, *Descriptive Sketches*, p. 12; Wordsworth Library, MS STC 34, 'Letter from Samuel Taylor Coleridge to Sara Hutchinson'



Joy, Sara! the Spirit and Power  
 That wedding Nature to us gives in Dower  
 A new Earth and new Heaven  
 Undreamt of by the Sensual and Proud!  
 Joy is the sweet Voice, Joy the luminous cloud  
 We ourselves rejoice!  
 And thence comes all that charms or ear or sight,  
 All Melodies an Echo of that Voice,  
 All colors a suffusion of that Light!<sup>629</sup>

Coleridge's language gave reason for Wordsworth to Marvell's *On a Drop of Dew*. Coleridge's draft presents several phrases that are echoes which fused his subjective response to Marvell's poem. Marvell's poem describes the human spirit as 'that soul, that ray / Of the clear fountain of eternal day' which 'within the human flower be seen' then 'does ... express / The greater Heaven in an heaven less'.<sup>630</sup> Coleridge's lines 'the Spirit, the Power / That wedding Nature gives us in dower' records the idea of God as the source of the 'Joy' and 'Light' of His own essence which he gives in that soul when God places it in a human body at birth. In doing so, it suggests a 'creative release made possible through the confrontation states' that enables an idiom that 'conveys the combined operations of head and heart'.<sup>631</sup> There is the sense too that Coleridge derived the notion that only 'the Sensual and the Proud' are incapable of imagining it from the irony with which Marvell's speaker described the manner in which the dew drop, 'Rememb'ring still its former height, / Shuns the swart leaves and blossoms green' of his new earthly home,

---

<sup>629</sup> Earl Leslie Griggs, ed, p.438

<sup>630</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'On a Drop of Dew' (1772), pp. 165-6

<sup>631</sup> Michael O'Neill, 'Anxious Cares: From Pope's Spleen to Coleridge's Dejection in *Studies in the Literary Imagination* 44 (2011), 99-118 (p. 109 and 112)

despite its transformation into a flower of similar mortal physical nature.<sup>632</sup> Both Coleridge's and Wordsworth's poems reflect this manner through which Marvell's poem allowed them to apprehend the sinful character of their society through the fear for Hartley it evoked.

Wordsworth's letter to Coleridge of 16 April 1802 includes evidence suggesting Wordsworth recalled that in Marvell's writing to which Coleridge's *Ode* responded. In the letter, Wordsworth enclosed a copy of a poem remembering an incident with Dorothy that would later be published in *Poems, in Two Volumes* alongside Wordsworth's *To H.C.*<sup>633</sup> The extract recounts:

Not far from her abode I chanced to spy  
A single Glow-worm once; and at the sight  
Down from my Horse I leapt—and great joy had I  
I laid the Glow-worm gently on a leaf,  
And bore it with me through the stormy night  
In my left hand—without dismay or grief  
Shining, albeit with a fainter light.  
When to the Dwelling of my Love I came,  
I went into the Orchard quietly,  
And left the Glow-worm, blessing it by name,  
Laid safely by itself, beneath a tree.<sup>634</sup>

Wordsworth's use of the image of the glowworm reminds of Marvell's reference to glowworms in his verse *Damon among the Glowworms* (first published in 1681). Wordsworth's description

---

<sup>632</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'On a Drop of Dew' (1772), pp. 165-6

<sup>633</sup> Ernest de Selincourt, ed., p. 298-88, William Wordsworth, *Poems, in Two Volumes*

<sup>634</sup> Ernest de Selincourt, ed., p. 287-88

of the 'glowworm' which he 'bore .. with me through the stormy night' records the idea he forms of Marvell's description of the glowworm as 'Shining unto no higher end / Than to presage the grass' fall'. The lines his speaker utters which follow that 'in my left hand' with that glowworm 'shining, albeit with a fainter light' he 'to the Dwelling of my Love I came' echoes Marvell's speaker who explains that

The glowworm whose officious flame  
To wand'ring mowers shows the way,  
That in the night lost their aim,  
And after foolish fires do stray.<sup>635</sup>

These lines do so though by using language which intertwines Wordsworth's description of the action of his country suitor with the sentiment he feels to convey the idea of the ease of mind with which someone serves as the light leading the lost home. The hyperbolic language with which Wordsworth's speaker declares that 'without dismay or grief' he let the glowworm lead him and then 'blessing it by name / Laid it beneath a tree' imbues his depiction of the country lover with irony to suggest the naivety with which the speaker does so. The humor it lends to his depiction gives Wordsworth's affective response to the irony with which Damon responds to the glowworm in Marvell's poem,

Your courteous lights in vain you waste,  
Since Juliana here is come,  
For she my mind hath so displace  
That I shall never find my home.<sup>636</sup>

---

<sup>635</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'Damon Among the Glowworms' (1772), p. 136

<sup>636</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'Damon Among the Glowworms' (1772), p. 136

Wordsworth's poem then shows how Marvell's depiction allows him to come to understand the loss of innocence that arises because of sinful romantic desire. Wordsworth's inclusion of the poem suggests, then, why the notion of the comfort derived from the light that Nature gives in Marvell's and Coleridge's verse within ideas about pastoral gave occasion for writing.

Coleridge's *Ode* itself offers further evidence that Coleridge's response to those notions in Marvell also gave occasion for Wordsworth's inclusion of the poem in his correspondence. In the early manuscript draft of the poem Coleridge shared titled *Letter to \_\_\_*,<sup>637</sup> In it, Coleridge offered his perceptions of the life he shared with Sara, their family, and William and Dorothy,

And what we aught behold of higher Worth

Than that inanimate cold World allow'd

To the poor loveless ever-anxious Crowd,

Ah! From the Soul itself must issue forth

A Light, a Glory, and a luminous Cloud

Enveloping th Earth!

And from the Soul itself must there be se[nt]

A sweet & potent Voice, of its own Bir[th,]

Of all the sweet sounds of Life & Element.<sup>638</sup>

These lines must have also reminded Wordsworth of Marvell's *On a Drop of Dew*. The idea of a 'sweet & potent Voice of its own Bir[th], that the Soul, alluding to God, 'issue[s] forth' that is of its own essence—'Of all the sweet sound of Life & Element' or Nature—echoes Marvell's words describing 'the soul, that drop, that ray' which is born of God, 'the clear fountain of

---

<sup>637</sup> Stephen Maxfield Parrish, ed., *Coleridge's Dejection*, pp. 21-34

<sup>638</sup> Samuel Taylor Coleridge. 'Letter to \_\_\_' in *Coleridge's Dejection: The Earliest Manuscripts and the Earliest Printings*, ed. by Stephen Maxfield Parrish (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1988), p. 33 lines 298-306

eternal day' and 'could in the human flower be seen ... does express / the greater Heaven in a heaven less'. Coleridge's allusive language, in doing so, intertwines the idea he forms about Marvell's depiction with the feeling it evokes both about God as beneficent and the dew drop through which God gives of himself as that which gives delight. The lines quoted made use of one of several metaphors—that as the human soul as bearing the light of its Creator—he later used to provide an answer in his 'Intimations' Ode (1806) to the question he posed in May 1802, while he composed the first four stanzas of it. At the conclusion of the fourth stanza, Wordsworth wondered 'where has it gone, the gleam, the glory, the radiance that used to dress the landscape of childhood memory'.<sup>639</sup>

The lines with which follow reflect how Coleridge's interpretative response to Marvell's depiction of a dew drop shaped Wordsworth's:

That Soul that rises with us, our Life's Star,  
Hath had elsewhere at its setting,  
And cometh from afar:

These lines suggest that the habits of mind with which he reflected upon the nature of human life were the result of his turn to imitate Marvell's manner of fusing feeling with the thought it evoked as Coleridge had. Coleridge employs language to convey the belief in the presence of God in the human spirit, here referred to as 'That Soul' and 'our Life's Star' and the pleasure mixed with longing conveyed in the description of it in terms of a sun which sets to allude to its passing from the body at death and return to heaven. Wordsworth's reply drew upon Marvell's satire to echo Coleridge's lines referring to the 'Soul' from which issues 'A Light, a Glory, a luminous Cloud | enveloping the Earth'. He wrote,

---

<sup>639</sup> Stephen Maxfield Parrish, ed., *Coleridge's Dejection*, p. 11

Not in entire forgetfulness,  
And not in utter nakedness,  
But trailing clouds of glory do we come,  
From God who is our home:<sup>640</sup>

Wordsworth's turn to describe the human soul as that which emanates from the light of Heaven drew upon Coleridge's allusive language to express the idea he forms of God as the Father to whom we return, and the association he makes between God and heaven as 'our home', because of the longing for such happiness it evokes. In doing so, his verse offers evidence of how working through Coleridge's conceit enabled him to apprehend the subjective meaning he derived from Marvell's depiction.

To return to the lines of Marvell's *On a Drop of Dew* quoted above, Wordsworth's own verse *To H. C.* described Hartley Coleridge in a similar manner using the image of a dew drop, as noted. The language that Coleridge employed in the lines quoted drew upon that in Marvell's verse to record the interpretative reading they made within the pastoral ideas about lost innocence expressed through his use of the metaphor of the Edenic-like garden for the fallen world. That language which Coleridge and Wordsworth employed allowed them to use the image to characterize the loss of innocence as the darkness in which men feel the absence of heavenly light in the modern world to which Hartley was the remedy in their poems.

Coleridge's letter to Thomas Poole in October 1803 echoed Wordsworth's lines that follow those above in which he referred to Hartley as "O blessed Vision!"<sup>641</sup> In doing so, Coleridge conveyed the affective meaning *To H. C.* held for him. Coleridge wrote,

---

<sup>640</sup> William Wordsworth, *Poems, in Two Volumes*, ed. by Jared Curtis (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1983)

<sup>641</sup> Earl Leslie Griggs, ed., ii p. 525

Hartley is what he always was—a strange Boy—‘exquisitely wild.  
An utter Visionary! Like the Moon among the Clouds, he moves in  
a circle of Light of his own making—he alone, in a Light of his  
own. Of all human Beings I never yet saw one so utterly naked of  
Self—he has no vanity, no Pride, no Resentment | and tho’ very  
passionate, I never yet saw him angry with any body. He is, tho’  
now 7 years old, the merest Child, you can conceive—and yet  
Southey says, that the Boy keeps him in perpetual Wonderment—  
his Thoughts are so truly his own.<sup>642</sup>

Coleridge’s comment referring to Hartley as a ‘Moon’ illustrates how Marvell’s use of imagery in his depiction has shaped his manner of perceiving his son. It also suggests how Marvell’s conceit describing the soul as ‘that drop’ or ‘ray’ of ‘eternal day’ which ‘recollecting its own light / Does, in its pure and circling thoughts express’ the nature of ‘The greater Heaven in a heaven less’ offered him the means which allowed him to communicate the thought he felt. His use of a moon to describe Hartley as compared with the eternal Sun, referring to God, communicates the idea he forms because of Wordsworth’s depiction of Hartley through his interpretative use of Marvell’s conceit. The language Coleridge borrows from Marvell and Wordsworth alludes to the darker implications for Hartley because of his pure nature. Those echoes make the import of the feeling embedded in Wordsworth’s poem more explicit using the terms of Marvell’s depiction of the dew drop.

To return then to the quotations taken from Coleridge’s verse as compared with the lines of Marvell which inspired them, Coleridge’s allusive language possesses a similar wit to that

---

<sup>642</sup> Earl Leslie Griggs, ed., ii p. 525

distinct to such Renaissance poetry as Marvell's. Coleridge's use of Marvellian conceits maintains what T. S. Eliot called the kind of 'structural decoration lending a levity to a serious idea' that characterizes such wit.<sup>643</sup> The lightness with which Coleridge's verse treats the nature of the seduction and suffering the world holds for men allowed him to again adopt what Kermode refers to as the 'guise of a primitive poet'.<sup>644</sup> Coleridge's poem clothes that which Empson refers as 'the strong feeling all people share', and are the emotions men commonly feel about the essence of human life in such a world, in language that provides a rapid succession of feeling, fused with the thought it allows men to recognize.<sup>645</sup> This lends a simplicity and candor to the otherwise piercing insight with which he addressed the weightier concerns implicit in the personal encounter with the truth that is common to all human experience.

### **Writing and Reflecting in the Pastoral Mode**

Jared Curtis writes that Wordsworth's *To H.C.* was probably composed between March 27 and June 17, 1802.<sup>646</sup> The printer's copy was transcribed around Nov 12-14, 1806 from a manuscript belonging to Sara Hutchinson.<sup>647</sup> The language of Wordsworth's poem suggests the manner through which his exchange of letters and verse with Coleridge, centered around Marvell's *On a Drop of Dew*, formed the habits of mind with which he meditated upon the noted question he posed as to 'the gleam, glory, the radiance' that had dressed 'the landscape of childhood memory'. In lines 27-33 of *To H. C.*, Wordsworth echoed Marvell:

Thou art a Dew-drop, which the morn bring forth,

Not doom'd to jostle with unkindly shocks;

---

<sup>643</sup> T.S Eliot, 'Andrew Marvell', p. 312

<sup>644</sup> Frank Kermode, *English Pastoral Poetry*, p. 19

<sup>645</sup> William Empson, p. 25

<sup>646</sup> William Wordsworth, *Poems, in Two Volumes*, p. 100

<sup>647</sup> William Wordsworth, *Poems, in Two Volumes*, p. 100



Or to be trail'd along the soiling earth;  
A Gem that glitters while it lives,  
And no forewarning gives;  
But, at the touch of wrong, without a strife  
Slips in a moment out of life.<sup>648</sup>

These lines register Wordsworth's interpretative sense of Marvell's use of the dew drop to characterize the human soul in *On a Drop of Dew*, as committing it to paper allowed him to record how they shaped his understanding of the truth about human earthbound life.

Wordsworth's opening line '...a Dew-drop, which the morn brings forth' echoes that of Marvell's describing the 'orient dew, shed from the bosom of morn' to frame his meditation upon the dew drop's heavenly origin and its essence as that born of God's light. This then allows Wordsworth to meditate upon Marvell's depiction of human life in which the dew drop 'Restless it rolls and unsecure, / Trembling lest it grow umpure',<sup>649</sup> and to apprehend the suffering on earth to which the soul's virtue makes it subject: 'doom'd to jostle with unkindly shocks'.

Through that, Wordsworth then comes to understand Hartley's nature who, like Marvell's dew drop, he perceives to be 'loose and easy hence to go: / How girt and ready to ascend',<sup>650</sup> and thus communicates this sense with the final lines, 'But, at the touch of wrong, without a strife / Slips in a moment out of life. These lines express the affective meaning he derived from Marvell's poem, as it provided him with the structures of thought within which he examined his perceptions of Hartley. Wordsworth's choice of the word 'Gem' suggests the impression Marvell's characterization of had made upon him using the description of the 'light' which the

---

<sup>648</sup> William Wordsworth, 'To H.C.' in *Poems, in Two Volumes*, ed. by Jared Curtis (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1983)

<sup>649</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'On a Drop of Dew' (1772), p. 175

<sup>650</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'On a Drop of Dew' (1772), p. 175

dew drop receives. This light indicates both the soul's relation to heaven and implies the light that heaven thus lends to it. That the 'orient dew' which Marvell likens to a 'globe' and a 'tear' suggests it to be a pearl, and thus a 'gem' which 'glitters' with such light implies its rarity and its value in a manner through which Wordsworth's language demonstrates how Marvell's metaphor formed his notions about human life. That metaphor permitted him to make an analogy between his observations about Hartley and Marvell's depiction of the dew possessing his spiritual character as compared with the envious speaker.

To *H. C.*, which was to be included in the publication of Wordsworth's *Poems, in Two Volumes* (1807), suggests a semblance between it and *On a Drop of Dew* that would have given Coleridge occasion for including Marvell's lyric in his letter to Sara Hutchinson.<sup>651</sup> In *To H.C.*, Wordsworth borrowed from the language of Marvell's poem to describe the unusual quality of Harley's spirit in terms that likened him to Marvell's dew drop. *To H. C.* concludes with the lines 'And no forewarning gives; | But at the touch of wrong, without a strife | Slips in a moment out of life', as noted.<sup>652</sup> This is also where Coleridge ended his transcription of Marvell's poem:

How loose and easy hence to go

How girt and ready to ascend

Moving in but a point below

It all about does upward bend.<sup>653</sup>

Coleridge's choice to end with these words rather than the actual conclusion of Marvell's poem alluding to the dew drop's return to heaven recorded the affective power Wordsworth's reading of Marvell held for Coleridge. It suggests the semblance Coleridge perceived between Marvell

---

<sup>651</sup> William Wordsworth, *Poems, in Two Volumes* (1983)

<sup>652</sup> William Wordsworth, 'To H.C.' in *Poems, Two Volumes*

<sup>653</sup> Wordsworth Library, MS STC 34

and Wordsworth's poems about the effect life amidst the earthly garden has upon a human soul because of its innate virtue, and offers evidence that Coleridge, like Wordsworth, perceived Hartley to be like Marvell's dew drop who longed and was ever ready to return to its heavenly home. The two endings read together then reflect the manner through which Marvell's conceit of the dew drop shaped each poet's understanding of import of his subjective impressions of Hartley.

In the transcription, Coleridge added the comment in the margins 'delicious' next to the line 'How girt and ready to ascend'.<sup>654</sup> The word is one that Wordsworth also chose to allude to Marvell's *The Garden* in *Descriptive Sketches* in which Wordsworth's wrote,

Pale Passion overpower'd, retires and woos  
The thicket, where th' unlisten'd stock-dove coos,  
How bless'd, delicious Scene! The eve that greets  
Thy open beauties, or thy lone retreats.<sup>655</sup>

In *The Garden*, Marvell contrast the 'Society ... all but rude, | to this delicious solitude' to which we long to return 'When we have hither run our passions' heat, | [and] Love hither makes his best retreat', as noted.<sup>656</sup> Michael O'Neil writes that delicious is a marker of sensuous and aesthetic delight in Coleridge's conversational poems.<sup>657</sup> Such expression of delight recalls Neoclassical pastoral theory in which an aesthetic character of simplicity conveyed innocence and candor to connote a shepherd's moral purity. This quality gave reason for the appropriation of Milton's style, disengaged from his political convictions, as Griffin has written, and the eighteenth-century accounts of literary history Griffin notes such as that of Thomas Newton and

---

<sup>654</sup> Wordsworth Library, MS STC 34

<sup>655</sup> William Wordsworth, *Descriptive Sketches*, p. 12

<sup>656</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'The Garden' (1772), pp. 170-71

<sup>657</sup> Michael O'Neil, 'Marvell and Nineteenth Century Poetry', p. 763

Samuel Johnson which included Milton, but omitted Marvell.<sup>658</sup> The language to which Coleridge draws attention with his annotation also suggests why Marvell's pastorals such as *On a Drop of Dew* were omitted despite the delight it evoked. 'Girt' gives the sense with which the dew drop is bound in an earthly existence despite its desire to ascend to heaven. Earlier in the transcription, Coleridge glossed Marvell's choice of the word 'round-in' to describe the character of the dew drop.<sup>659</sup> He wrote 'Round-in: i.e. incloses itself round in—we sometimes say, 'a thing rolls itself round up'.<sup>660</sup> Coleridge's two annotations to his transcription, when taken together, draw attention to that sense Marvell conveys of the dew drop's fallen condition as one in which he is bound to an earthly existence within a mortal frame. Coleridge's choice of the word 'Delicious', then, suggests that his affective response of pleasure to Marvell's poem arose because of the irony with which Marvell's speaker describes the dew drop's virtuous character while he at the same time insinuates that the dew drop inherently sinful character causes it to feel the disdain for the earthly garden that keeps it bound to it. This registers Coleridge's reading of Marvell's verse itself within ideas about the pastoral ideal as discussed in earlier chapters – the loss of innocence represented in pastoral.

Coleridge's comments draw attention to Marvell's language likening earth to a garden to suggest humanity's susceptibility to seduction through the senses.<sup>661</sup> His annotations remind of the emphasis the Moderns placed upon pastoral's aesthetic character of simplicity conveyed through the language used to describe the shepherd's perceptions and actions to suggest his innocence. Those comments offer evidence that Coleridge came to apprehend their claims to

---

<sup>658</sup> Dustin Griffin, *Regaining Paradise*, p. 7

<sup>659</sup> Wordsworth Library, MS STC 34

<sup>660</sup> Wordsworth Library, MS STC 34

<sup>661</sup> Aurora Faye Martinez, *Feeling Fallen: A Re-telling of the Myth of the Fall in a Biblical Adaptation of Marvell's 'A Dialogue between Thyrsis and Dorinda'*, p. 226

such innocence as demonstrated in Modern pastoral through his affective response to the dew drop's mixture of disdain for the earthly garden and fear of its corrupting influence. The subjective meaning which his annotations recorded also calls to mind the recurring impression among the Ancients that such virtue did not persist in the Modern world. This is a fitting context within which to examine Wordsworth's *To H. C.*

Coleridge, in *Biographia Literaria*, turned in 1817 to consider the influence Wordsworth's writings had upon his aesthetic sensibility in language sometimes rich in allusion to Marvell. Marvell's poetry was not thought of as pastoral though, because its speakers suggest, as I have shown in previous chapter, the figure of a courtly swain withdrawing from society, rather than the simplicity of a shepherd unfamiliar with worldly cares. Yet Wordsworth's use of Marvell's imagery recreates the sense of reprieve from the concerns of the world derived from a rural retreat, which characterized the delight Neoclassicists believed to be the effect of pastoral. Coleridge's commentary also turns to the imagery of the garden, at times, to express the interpretative sense he gains from reading Wordsworth's *Descriptive Sketches* in relation to the source of several of its allusions in Marvell's verse:

In the form, style, and manner of the whole poem, and in the structure of the particular lines and periods, there is an harshness and acerbity connected and combined with words and images all a glow, which might recall those products of the vegetable world, where gorgeous blossoms rise out of the hard and thorny rind and shell, within which the rich fruit was elaborating.<sup>662</sup>

---

<sup>662</sup> Samuel Taylor Coleridge, *Biographia Literaria*, p. 77

This comment reminds of Damon the Mower's descriptions of the result of man's attempt to replicate God's creative act. Marvell wrote:

And yet these rarities might be allowed  
To man, that sovereign thing and proud;  
Had he not dealt between the bark and tree,  
Forbidden mixtures there to see.  
No plant knew the stock from which it came;  
He grafts upon the wild the tame:  
That the uncertain and adult'rate fruit  
Might put the palate in dispute.<sup>663</sup>

Coleridge's response to Wordsworth offers evidence of the terms he gleaned from Marvell's verses which framed his affective response. His comment adapts Marvell's ideas about 'forbidden mixtures' and 'adult'rate fruit' which result from men 'dealing between bark and tree' to draw an analogy between the combination of images and words Wordsworth uses in his verse and the 'products of the vegetable world' to suggest that the striking character of the strangeness of Wordsworth's verse, which like the 'adult'rate fruit' of Marvell's description 'puts the palate in dispute', and produces his delight. Such delight though only arises, according to the Neoclassicists, because of the ameliorating effect of descriptions of nature's beauty.

Coleridge's comment offers an account of Wordsworth's writing that invites a reading of it within a Marvellian context, which necessarily places the quality of his poems within the historical circumstances that prompted their composition. Like Marvell, Wordsworth was writing at a time of political upheaval as Napoleon had gained advantage during the French Revolution

---

<sup>663</sup> Andrew Marvell, 'The Mower against Gardens', p. 131

which erupted in 1789, as noted. Napoleon must have reminded Coleridge of Cromwell as it did Wordsworth, stirring him to creative response, as recorded in MS DC 38 in which Wordsworth transcribed Marvell's *An Horatian Ode on Cromwell's Return from Ireland* on the versos and his draft of Book IV of *The Prelude* on the rectos.<sup>664</sup> The echo of Marvell in Coleridge's comment betrays the association that formed in Coleridge's mind between the poetry of Marvell and of Wordsworth and the occasion for his response.

Further evidence of this may be found in *Biographia Literaria*. The quotation from it that begins this chapter likewise borrows the language of Marvell's *On a Drop of Dew* to note the affective response the aesthetic character of Wordsworth's writing holds for him. Coleridge's description of the lustre and sparkle of the dew drops to whose loss Wordsworth's poetry offered remedy echoes Wordsworth's own reference in his poem *To H.C.* to the dew drop that is 'A Gem that glitters while it lives'.<sup>665</sup> This use of the image of a gem to capture the lustre of verse of both wit and sense reminds of Joseph Warton's discussion of Horace's method to test the true poetical character of sublime verse, which cannot be reduced to tameness, when transposed into prose.<sup>666</sup> Coleridge related that at the age of twenty-four, Wordsworth recited to him a manuscript poem whose style had not struck him 'except indeed [in] such difference not separable from the thought and manner', whose Spenserian stanza would have authorised his 'descent into the phrases of ordinary life' more than could 'the heroic couplet'.<sup>667</sup> Wordsworth and Coleridge's turn to description using the tangible characteristics of dew drops allowed them to imitate the manner through which Marvell's poetry communicates its meaning using the aesthetic impressions his poetry elicits. This is in keeping with the familiar method of pastoral of which

---

<sup>664</sup> Wordsworth Library, MS DC 38

<sup>665</sup> William Wordsworth, 'To H.C.',

<sup>666</sup> Joseph Warton, *An Essay on the Genius and Writings of Alexander Pope*, p. ix

<sup>667</sup> Samuel Taylor Coleridge, *Biographia Literaria*, p. 80

Neoclassicists write. Both Coleridge and Wordsworth used the language of sensory perception to convey the palpable effects Marvell's imagery had upon them. That, however, enabled both poets to grasp Marvell's Renaissance wit in terms of these palpable effects of an otherwise intangible aesthetic character. In doing so, the two poets demonstrated the nature of pastoral as a mode of reading: they illustrate how they come to understand the affective meaning Marvell's poetry holds for them in terms of the mental effects its aesthetic qualities exert upon their sensibilities.

Coleridge's comment then suggests that his engagement with Wordsworth and Marvell's verse shaped his notions about how allusive language may be used to communicate his understanding of their poetry. The comment also suggests that this method of allusion was a self-conscious attempt to understand the nature of the aesthetic influence of poetry itself which prompted his *Biographia Literaria*. Coleridge use of interpretative language to render an element or idea present in the writing of Marvell or Wordsworth's response to it does so according to the affective meaning derived from its effect upon his sensibility, or Marvell's or Wordsworth's sensibility, as he perceived it. Coleridge's comment, then, betrays the manner through which the context of *querelle* between Ancients and Moderns shaped the habits of mind reflected in the habits of writings with which they turned to a pastoral interpretative mode of response. It also offers the basis for the terms within which those responses would be perceived to be part of a poetic tradition. Their method of allusion draws attention to the origins of the conventions they employed that suggest a classical tradition, which looked to establish connections to the past literary depictions in relation to which their verse might be read. The use of interpretative language to elicit affective response through the manner with which it makes ideas palpable lent itself to the notion of a Romantic tradition though as well.



Yet, Coleridge's response looks deeper into the darker recognition of the import of the sentiment each poet expressed using methods that gave reason for placing it within both a classical and a Romantic tradition of poetry. Coleridge drew upon Wordsworth's manner of putting complex concerns in simple turns with the sophistication of what Kermode notes to be a Renaissance cultured poet in the guise of a simple bardic shepherd.<sup>668</sup> Coleridge illustrated Wordsworth's likeness to Marvell by borrowing such images as the dew drop or the garden which both poets employed with skill to demonstrate how those images could be used to evoke a succession of sentiments from the memories of happiness of youth to the longing for its return. His imitative manner of doing so showed how that allowed him to convey the mixture of perception and affective response to the images described to shape our ideas about human experience through its manner of depicting Wordsworth's developing sensibility. This allowed Coleridge to examine the relation between sensation, feeling, and thought, to better understand how the imagination permits the reason to derive insight from aesthetic experiences, in a manner that was later thought to characterize the tradition of Romantic poetry. It also allowed him to suggest a recurring pattern of thought that arises, because of how the affective responses each successive poem elicits, shapes the habits of mind reflected in the allusive habits of writing, from which critics derived notions about a classical tradition of verse.

A different sense of the literary tradition may be derived, then, from the idea of the convention based upon Coleridge's use of Marvellian conceits that resemble those that were characteristic of the Renaissance writing considered to be pastoral in which Marvell's verse may be placed. Convention may be thought of as the method of poetic expression each later poet adapts which structures how they and their readers understand the strong feelings which most

---

<sup>668</sup> Frank Kermode, *English Pastoral Poetry*, p. 17-19

men commonly feel about human life. The habits of writing such as the use of allusive language centered around the recurring images of the dew drop, the garden, and the snake or viper which form Coleridge's pastoral mode of reading of Marvell and Wordsworth's verse reflects both the universal truth about the fallen condition in which humans live as evident in the sinful character of the human society of men's making, and the subjective meaning he realized, through committing his interpretative response to his encounter with it to writing. Conventions conceived in this manner are the basis of a notion of tradition in which such habits of writing communicate the habits of mind that shape the pastoral mode of interpretative reading, and so, form the way one understands literary history. A turn to Coleridge's *Biographia Literaria* will permit us to examine the truth of these notions.

### **Coleridge's *Biographia Literaria* and Notions of Literary History**

In 1817, Coleridge's returned to his early poetry and saw its publication in *Sybilline Leaves*. The volume included *Ode to Tranquility* and *Dejection*, as noted. *Dejection*, which had first been published in 1802 as a Pindaric ode addressed to William, was amended in address to Edmund, just as the lines taken from *Letter to \_\_\_* addressed to Sara were amended in their appeal to an unnamed Lady. *Dejection* is otherwise with little revision. The 1817 published version did, however, include for the first time seven lines which Parrish has written to be those which Coleridge quoted most often in his correspondence:

For not to think of what I needs must feel,  
But to be still and patient, all I can,  
And haply by abstruse research to steal  
From my own nature all the natural Man—  
This was my sole resource, my only plan:

Till that which suits a part infects the whole,  
And now is almost grown the habit of my Soul.<sup>669</sup>

These lines returned to the question Wordsworth posed in his early draft of lines included in *Intimation* as to where the gleam or radiance that had once dressed childhood memory gone. In the poem, Coleridge wrote,

But oh! each visitation [Fancy]  
Suspends what nature gave to me at birth,  
My shaping spirit of Imagination.<sup>670</sup>

Coleridge also spoke of

Fancy made me dreams of happiness,  
For hope grew round me, like the twining vine,  
And fruits and foliage, not my own, seem'd mine'.<sup>671</sup>

These lines Coleridge offers as preface to his disclosure,

Hence, viper thoughts, that coil around my mind,  
Reality's dark dream!<sup>672</sup>

Coleridge's description of the twisting vine and viper thoughts suggests the image of the serpent in the garden of Eden and man's fall into a state of sin. This offers evidence of how Marvell's use of the snake as an image to which his mower Damon turns to express his perceptions of both nature and his self to consider the effects upon the mind of the experience of sexual desire has shaped Coleridge's ideas about his experience of them. In *Damon the Mower*, Damon comments

---

<sup>669</sup> Stephen Maxfield Parrish, ed., *Coleridge's Dejection*, p. 8

<sup>670</sup> Samuel Taylor Coleridge, 'Dejection: An Ode' in *Coleridge's Dejection: The Earliest Manuscripts and the Earliest Printings*, ed by Stephen Maxfield Parrish (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1988), p. 58 lines 79-81

<sup>671</sup> Samuel Taylor Coleridge, 'Dejection: An Ode' p. 57 lines 79-81

<sup>672</sup> Samuel Taylor Coleridge, 'Dejection: An Ode', p. 59 lines 94-95

that ‘Oh what unusual heats are here, / Which thus are sunburned meadows sear’ and that ‘Only the snake that kept within, / Now glitters in its second skin’ to suggest the notion he has formed that because of its deceptive nature, the serpent is spared the consequences of his action. This, then, shapes Damon’s manner of behavior in his pursuit of Juliana, whom he desires and to whom he says ‘To thee the harmless snake I bring, / Disarm’d of its teeth and sting’ to deceive her into thinking that his intentions towards her are innocent of intention. For both his desire, and his attempt at deceiving her, however, Damon is punished as the speaker of the poem explains, ‘The edged steel by careless chance, / Did into his own ankle glance’ so that ‘By his own scythe, the mower mown’. Damon final words betray his suffering that is the result of his own sin:

Only for him no cure is found,  
Whom Juliana’s eyes do wound,  
‘Tis Death alone that this must do:  
For Death thou art a mower too.<sup>673</sup>

The lines, as written, offer two senses of the effects of sinful sexual desire – that Juliana’s eyes that ‘wound’ both injure and twist Damon perceptions. The manner in which Coleridge intertwines in the lines above in which the ‘viper thoughts, that coil around my mind/ Reality’s dark dream’ suggest how he then apprehends both senses of the consequences of vice through his experience of its effects: finds that his mind is both twisted by the thoughts his emotions prompt and rendered into a state in which his perceptions of his condition are colored by them, and thus feels pain because of his state of dejection that results. In doing so, Coleridge’s verse draws upon Marvell’s use of similar language to communicate this in a manner that reminds of Marvell’s

---

<sup>673</sup> Andrew Marvell, ‘Damon, the Mower’ (1772)

verse and the poetic tradition discussed in earlier chapters, whose imagery alludes to ideas about the state of misapprehension into which humanity is rendered, because of its sensuous corporeal nature.

Coleridge's lines quoted above suggest the reason for his return to reflect upon how his youthful efforts at the time of the publication of both *Sybilline Leaves* and *Biographia Literaria*. Coleridge's *Dejection: an Ode* reflected 'his concern with the relationship between his 'shaping spirit of Imagination' and 'nature', to which one may compare 'his sense of the relations between individual poems and genres', as his uses of genre enabled him to 'demonstrate the purpose of poetry'.<sup>674</sup> The formal devices and generic conventions offered the means of 'develop[ing] a certain experience of temporality, through the unfolding line, and a certain affective state, through the emotional tone or pitch'.<sup>675</sup> This means that the poet, as he commits his thoughts intertwined with his feelings to paper, but also the reader experience a heightened state of awareness of the relation between their affective state and the ideas it prompts as though it were occurring at that moment with each passing thought. The generic conventions of pastoral such as the images of the garden and the expressions in which they are used to intertwine the ideas conveyed with an aesthetic character which Coleridge adapted, and wove into his poetry, allowed him to demonstrate how a poet drew upon the memory and imagination to select each image in a succession. This then enabled Coleridge and his readers to reason about the feelings experience evokes and thoughts that one forms because of them. This also permitted him to demonstrate how a sensuous mode of perceiving the natural world shaped the mind, and how it thus shaped how one perceived oneself.

---

<sup>674</sup> Michael O'Neill, 'Coleridge's Genres' in *The Oxford Handbook of Samuel Taylor Coleridge*, ed. by Frederick Burwick (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012)

<sup>675</sup> Ewan James Jones, *Coleridge and the Philosophy of Poetic Form* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2014) p. 5

In this manner, the resources of pastoral allowed Coleridge to pursue his intention to compose metaphysical philosophy, as he recorded in his notebook entry in 1803, through self-reflexive verse that recalled that of Marvell. Through poetic form, he examined the connection between ‘human language and reason to the “intelligible” language of divinity incarnate in the natural world’, and ‘the reciprocity that exists between poems about nature and the divine poetry in nature that they ideally mirrored’.<sup>676</sup> The lines from *Dejection: An Ode* quoted above though reveal the truth about the human condition in which man’s fallen nature impedes his understanding. The poetry through which Coleridge learned this through self-examination in *Sybilline Leaves* gave occasion then for a return to the concerns in them in *Biographia Literaria*.

*Biographia Literaria* offers a ‘sort of epic of the individual mind’s development’, arranged in ‘the Homeric length’ of twenty-four parts, which examines how the poetic imagination operates through interactions with literary objects rather than nature.<sup>677</sup> In it, Coleridge attempted to reconstruct that in Wordsworth’s *Descriptive Sketches*, which first prompted a subjective response to its creative merit, and gave occasion for his critical writing. His explanation, however, suggests the difficulty Wordsworth’s poetic resemblance to Marvell posed, because of how it shaped the critical reception of his verse. Coleridge’s description of Wordsworth’s poetry in language that reminds of Marvell’s *Damon the Mower*, as noted, suggests it to be of a similar kind to the Renaissance wit to which T. S. Eliot later responds, and which frames his assessment of the Romantics.

Coleridge discussion about the aesthetic impression he forms of Wordsworth’s *Descriptive Sketches* uses language which itself exemplifies the kind of wit attributed to

---

<sup>676</sup> Ben Brice, *Coleridge and Scepticism* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007) p. 1

<sup>677</sup> Lawrence Buell, ‘The Question of Form in Coleridge’s *Biographia Literaria*’, *English Literary History* 46 (1979), 399-417 (p. 403)

Marvell. In doing so, he responds to the Neoclassical pastoral theory favored by eighteenth century critics such as William Hazlitt, Francis Jeffrey, and William Gifford who wrote for the *Edinburgh Review* and the *Examiner*, and to whom he refers to as ‘synodical individuals, and to which he adds a footnote attributing the term to Marvell.’<sup>678</sup>

The language was not only peculiar and strong, but at times knotty and contorted, as by its own impatient strength; while the novelty and struggling crowd of images acting in conjunction with the difficulties of the style, demanded always a greater closeness of attention, than poetry, (at all events, than descriptive poetry) has a right to claim. It not seldom therefore justified the complaint of obscurity.<sup>679</sup>

The complexity of expression to be found in Wordsworth’s *Descriptive Sketches* was the same sort of sophistication which Ancients and Moderns censured. According to that view, Wordsworth’s verse merited the complaint that it failed to express the innocence and candor that lent pastoral an aesthetic character of simplicity. The virtue this simplicity connotes was that which they sought to be the common view of England’s character through its literary history, as discussed.

Coleridge’s use of allusion to Marvell in these terms suggests his cognizance of the political subtext to those accounts of literary history. It also betrays his concern about the position to which Wordsworth’s verse might be relegated, because of the likeness his early writings such as *Descriptive Sketches*, *The Idiot Boy* in *Lyrical Ballads*, and *To H. C.* in *Poems*,

---

<sup>678</sup> Samuel Taylor Coleridge *Biographia Literaria*, p. 42: James Engell and W. Jackson Bate explain that Andrew Marvell used the term ‘Synodical Individuum’ in speaking of Samuel Parker in *The Rehearsal Transpros’d*. Samuel Taylor Coleridge applied the term to ‘the anonymous critics’ named above about whom he was writing.

<sup>679</sup> Samuel Taylor Coleridge, *Biographia Literaria*, p. 77

*Two Volumes* to Marvell that other critics discerned as well. Chapter 1 noted how such lyrics of Marvell's as *To His Coy Mistress* circulated in miscellanies such as The Haward Manuscript which situated it among libels.<sup>680</sup> Those libels offered sharp insight about the nature of sexual relations in the court as pretext for the exercise of power. Chapter 2 noted the character of Marvell's poetry in which it displayed the ironized wit of the Renaissance. Marvell's *The Garden* to which Wordsworth alluded in *Descriptive Sketches* might be read as verse of this kind. Such poetry satirized the need for reprieve after the pursuit of sexual intrigue masks the greater longing for retreat from the complexities of the world. These complexities were those as one might find in the more seductively dangerous life at court.

Wordsworth's seemingly apolitical poetry—*Descriptive Sketches*, *The Idiot Boy*, and his 'Intimations' Ode—which adopted the similar guise of the speech of a primitive poet in the manner Kermode describes, allowed him to clothe the weightier concerns that contemporaneous life prompted in innocent and candid expressions characteristic of pastoral to mask its potency.<sup>681</sup> Wordsworth echoed the longing for a return to simplicity that Marvell's speaker expresses in *The Garden* as has already been seen. Coleridge's description then of Wordsworth's *Descriptive Sketches* as the 'fruit' that emerges from 'the harshness and acerbity' with which his 'images' were 'a-glow' registered Coleridge's subjective response to the wit in his verse.<sup>682</sup> In doing so, it reminds of the distinctive qualities of Renaissance pastoral whose striking imagery and language render its astute insights more meaningful.

In Coleridge's comment above describing Wordsworth's *Descriptive Sketches*, evidence is given of his assessment of the aesthetic values underlying Marvell's kind of Renaissance wit

---

<sup>680</sup> Bodleian MS Don b. 8

<sup>681</sup> Frank Kermode, *English Pastoral Poetry*, p. 19

<sup>682</sup> Samuel Taylor Coleridge, *Biographia Literaria*, p. 77



within notions about both a classical and a Romantic tradition of poetry derived from the *querelle* between Ancients and Moderns. Coleridge made his assessment in the terms of what David Fairer notes to be a concept of organic empiricism explained by A. W. Schegel: ‘The organic form ... is innate; it shapes as it develops itself from within, and the fullness of its development is one and the same with the perfection of its outer form. Such is the life, such is the form’.<sup>683</sup> This concept influenced much of the eighteenth-century poetry leading to the political events of 1798. It was set in contrast to an Idealist notion of organic unity upon which much of the theory of Romanticism has been premised. As Fairer explains, the uncompromising binaries of mechanic and organic, and thus ‘fancy’ and ‘imagination’, and ‘dualistic allegory’ and ‘unifying symbol’, could be ‘mapped ... onto a historical grid that showed enlightenment mechanism overthrown by romantic organism, with the static, predictable patterns of Lockean associationism and Newtonian science giving way to a world of ideas that was dynamic and creative’.<sup>684</sup> This notion of organic empiricism drew upon John Locke’s notion of ‘one life’ as that which ‘partakes of one life’ or of ‘sustainability’ over time.<sup>685</sup> In doing so, it suggested a dynamic principle in which individual particles can form one common identity to incorporate change while maintaining continuity.<sup>686</sup>

Coleridge’s language employed a similar notion of the ‘organic’ to describe Wordsworth’s verse. At the time at which Wordsworth wrote, such vocabularies were employed to respond to the challenges posed to the values expressed in the poetry of the poets of the previous decades. Coleridge’s use of the terms harshness and acerbity suggests such poetry’s

---

<sup>683</sup> David Fairer, *Organising Poetry: The Coleridge Circle, 1790-1798* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009), p. 16

<sup>684</sup> David Fairer, *Organising Poetry*, pp. 16-7

<sup>685</sup> David Fairer, *Organising Poetry*, pp. 3 and 5

<sup>686</sup> David Fairer, *Organising Poetry*, p. 3

method of giving pleasure through its ability to strike the imagination – ‘a making the familiar strange and the strange familiar’ in his words, as T. S. notes.<sup>687</sup> His description of the knotty and contorted sentences suggests that such an effect is achieved through the rapid succession of sensations or emotions through which the reader is led in a series of metaphoric images. Such images do not resolve themselves to a single ameliorating picture as does Neoclassical pastoral. Instead, they dazzle with the complexity with which they depict modern life as suggested in Coleridge’s characterization of their effect as dew drops.

This pattern of allusion seen in Coleridge’s comment responds to the social values of his precursors, communicated through such aesthetic values in Marvellian terms, that again recall the censure of Rapin and Fontenelle of pastoral depicting the courtly swain, who speaks of weightier concerns in the guise of a shepherd. The familiar distinctions between country and court come to mind in which the sophistication and knowledge with which a courtier communicates his sense of modern life is to be valued. Coleridge’s description illustrates the organic principle through reference to the lines of connection across the disjunctive impressions and ideas Wordsworth’s language evokes. In doing so, Coleridge’s comment, made with the manner of Marvell’s wit, suggests the Renaissance view of the power of the human mind to master that which it encounters, as may be found in scientific enquiry and the exploration in which new countries were discovered. Coleridge’s choice of the word ‘dazzles’ suggests how Wordsworth’s verse shape one’s understanding of the use of the dew drop in the sense of a gem suggests the sentiment he felt towards the benefits to be gained.

If Coleridge responded in this manner, in doing so his comment suggests his association of Marvell’s wit and Wordsworth’s semblance to the less favorable characteristics of the

---

<sup>687</sup> T S Eliot, ‘Andrew Marvell’, p. 316

Renaissance period in which Marvell wrote. Implicit in Coleridge's description is the consequences of such discovery and what was attained through it. Both Wordsworth's and Coleridge used Marvell's symbol of the dew drop to connote an innocence and purity. This allowed them to voice their sense of the corrupting effect of society that is an implicit idea in Marvell's verse. Coleridge's comments draw our attention to the manner through which Wordsworth's dew drops add a lustre to life, which have been long absent, and alludes to the loss of allure which the world held and the loss of pleasure in life that accompanies it. Both Wordsworth and Coleridge expressed a longing for an ideal past in which innocence might be recovered in a manner that recalls the Renaissance turn to classical genres such as pastoral to retrieve its alternate values.<sup>688</sup> This longing represents the two poets' assessment of their own historical moment in a manner which betrays the darker recognitions to which they came in responding to Marvell's poetry. The pastoral readings both Wordsworth and Coleridge made reveals a pattern of thought in which such responses are made within the idea of lost innocence that pervades pastoral, as noted. Coleridge's use of allusive language to do so offers evidence of the literary value to be derived from such verse, as its affective power allows one to apprehend the larger truths about individual modern human experience underlying the subjective meaning gained.

Coleridge's discussion of Wordsworth serves as the occasion for reflection upon his juvenile poetry and suggests the ideas he drew from Marvell's style of Renaissance verse as he found in Wordsworth. In response to critics' reviews of his juvenile poetry, Coleridge wrote,

In the after editions, I pruned the double epithets with no sparing  
hand, and used my best efforts to tame the swell and glitter both of

---

<sup>688</sup> Rosalie Colie, p. 3

thought and diction; though in truth, these parasite plants of youthful poetry had insinuated themselves into my longer poems with such intricacy of union, that I was often obliged to omit disentangling the weed, from the fear of snapping the flower.<sup>689</sup>

This comment betrays the degree to which in imitating Marvell's use of imagery in a manner that allowed him to intertwine thought and feeling so that his poems enacted the process of reasoning about that depicted, Coleridge's verse drew similar impressions as that of Wordsworth's. It also suggests, however, the manner through which his pastoral readings spurred a mode of interpretative writing that occasions the kind of critical reflection that *Biographia Literaria* is. Coleridge wrote, 'Meantime the matter and diction seemed to me characterized not so much by poetic thoughts, as by thoughts translated into the language of poetry'.<sup>690</sup> Here Coleridge echoed Denham's 'Preface' to *The Destruction of Troy* in which Denham explained that because of the 'graces and happinesses' peculiar to a language, the poet is not 'to translate Language into Language, but Poesie into Poesie' as 'in pouring out of one language into another, it will all evaporate; and if a new Spirit will not be added in the Transfusion, there will remain nothing but a Caput Mortuum'.<sup>691</sup> Coleridge's comment, in doing so, offers insight into the poetic process: the 'thought is realized in the working out of conceits' as Keats explained, the use of metaphor and poetic diction in translating prose thoughts to poetry simply structures the experience they depict in a manner that allows us to understand them, as discussed.<sup>692</sup> This is at its simplest the

---

<sup>689</sup> Samuel Taylor Coleridge, *Biographia Literaria*, p. 7

<sup>690</sup> Samuel Taylor Coleridge, *Biographia Literaria*, p. 19

<sup>691</sup> Worcester, Hurd Library, no shelfmark, *Poems and Translations with the Sophy, written by the Honorable Sir John Denahm, Knight of the Bath, The Fourth Edition, To which is added Cato-Major of Old Age* (London: Printed by T. W. for H. Harrington and sold by Jacob Tonson at Grays-InnGate in Grays-Inn-Lane, and Thomas Beckett at the Half-Moon in St. Paul's Church-Yard, 1705)

<sup>692</sup> John Keats, 'Letter to John Hamilton Reynolds'

observation repeated often from Johnson's first writing of the Metaphysical poets to such more recent critics as T. S. Eliot who quotes Johnson in his essay *The Metaphysical Poets*: that the attempts of Marvell and the other metaphysical poets 'were always analytic'.<sup>693</sup> To realize this about one's own verse though also occasions the kind of enquiry, into the forming of the poetic mind, as Coleridge writes about himself.

Coleridge, however, was a sole response that recognised the semblance between Marvell and Wordsworth's verse as something more than an expression of sentiment towards contemporaneous politics. Coleridge wrote *Biographia Literaria* in 1817 two years after the Battle of Waterloo. In *The Examiner* of 18 February 1816, Leigh Hunt offered an acidic response to the publication of three sonnets on Waterloo by Wordsworth in John Scott's *The Champion* on 4 February'. In the review, he observed that 'Poetry has often been made the direct vehicle of politics', as he asserts that the battle of Waterloo

was won by the English literally speaking,—by that national spirit, character, and physical strength, which such politicians would have done away with long before this, had the precursors of MR. WORDSWORTH's youth, the MILTONS and MARVELLS, suffered it.<sup>694</sup>

Although Hunt's assessment suggests the view of Marvell as a patriot and champion of Republican virtue, it draws attention to the inherited view that aesthetic character served as a means of imbuing such poetry as Marvell's and Milton's with politically inflected sentiment. Similarly, the 'droll ridicule' of such poems of Marvell's as *The Character of Holland* that were 'received with inconsistent relish' suggests both Marvell's reputation for his 'Advice to a

---

<sup>693</sup> T.S Eliot, 'The Metaphysical Poets', p. 379

<sup>694</sup> Leigh Hunt, Extract from 'The Examiner', 18 February 1816, p. 924-25

Painter' verse satires and 'State poems' noted for the semblance they bear to libels and the mixed feeling in the period towards his lyrics which displayed a similar sort of Renaissance wit as them.<sup>695</sup>

That reception offered the context within which Coleridge engaged with the broader concerns about the nature of criticism and the influence of social and aesthetic values in determining the literary values upon which historians premise any account of literary history. Jerome McGann has influentially argued that the Romantic ideology perpetuated by its poets has led to readings of Romantic poetry that ignore the political and social context that informed it.<sup>696</sup> This recalls the practices of the eighteenth-century Whigs who fashioned accounts of English literary history that noted Milton's sublime for its Neoclassical aesthetics and continues to influence such accounts of pastoral as Chaudhuri's and McColley's. Key to Coleridge's discussion though is the understanding that to write criticism is to inevitably to defend one's own values underlying the critical position one takes. Of the reception of *Lyrical Ballads* (1802), Coleridge wrote,

In all perplexity there is a portion of fear, which predisposes the mind to anger. Not able to deny that the author possessed both genius and a powerful intellect, they felt very positive, but were not quite certain, that he might not be in the right, and they themselves in the wrong; an unquiet state of mind, which seeks alleviation by quarrelling with the occasion of it, and by wondering at the perverseness of the man, who had written a long and

---

<sup>695</sup> Michael O'Neill, 'Marvell and Nineteenth-Century Poetry', p. 758-59

<sup>696</sup> Jerome McGann, *The Romantic Ideology: A Critical Investigation* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1983), p. 1

argumentative essay to persuade them, that "Fair is foul, and foul is fair;" in other words, that they had been all their lives admiring without judgement, and were now about to censure without reason.<sup>697</sup>

Wordsworth's critics, as Coleridge explained, took to emphasizing the few faults in his poetry to disprove the literary theory which Wordsworth sets out in his *Preface*.<sup>698</sup> Of concern to Coleridge, though, were not the mechanisms by which critics judge. His comments insinuate that such points of style and diction as one uses in one's assessments reflect underlying principles and beliefs with which one views oneself. This suggests the doubtfulness of such men because of the manner in which they employ such points to mask the underlying reasons in their rhetoric and those in relation to whom they thus position themselves.

Evidence of this is given in the place to which Marvell is relegated in literary history. Hunt's comment suggests that Marvell's reputation as a satirist reflects his patriotic fervor, which could not be easily disentangled from the political context with which it engaged. Commentators saw aesthetic qualities as the weapons with which the political struggle over what social values were to define both the government and its nation were fought. This is clear in how such Whigs as Dennis appropriated Milton's sublime style, disengaged from his political sentiment, as evidence that their precepts for the expression of its underlying values were sound. Marvell's Renaissance wit as seen in his 'Advice to a Painter' poems and 'State' satires also manifested itself in his use of courtly swains clothed in shepherd's guise as speakers. Such wit, by contrast, was ill-suited to fashioning an image of the virtue of English character. Its dry

---

<sup>697</sup> Samuel Taylor Coleridge, *Biographia Literaria*, p. 71-72

<sup>698</sup> Samuel Taylor Coleridge, *Biographia Literaria*, p. 71

humor must have suggested the sophistication of someone intimate with political stratagems and human folly as compared with Milton's sublimity.

Coleridge's assessment of Wordsworth's poetry in *Biographia Literaria* notes the turn to demonstrate Wordsworth to be Milton's and Shakespeare's heir despite its oblique allusions to Marvell. This serves as an indirect defense of Coleridge's position within literary history. Much of his discussion meditates on the nature of criticism and how it mounts its attacks. He added though,

I am well aware, that in advanced stages of literature, when there exist many and excellent models, a high degree of talent, combined with taste and judgement, and employed in works of imagination, will acquire for a man the name of a great genius; though even that analogon of genius, which, in certain states of society, may even render his writings more popular than the absolute reality could have done, would be sought for in vain in the mind and temper of the author himself ...<sup>699</sup>

Here Coleridge engaged with the more recent efforts in the eighteenth century to appropriate Milton's literary style as indicative of his personal character of such biographers as Thomas Newton and the censure he received from such critics as Samuel Johnson through reference to him as a man that had acquired 'the name of great genius'.<sup>700</sup> He alludes to the methods such commentators used to direct attention to Milton's patriotism which underlay his personal feelings to which Coleridge referred as Milton's mind and temper, and of which his style was thought to be the expression, to disengage the strengths of Milton's poetic style from its political

---

<sup>699</sup> Samuel Taylor Coleridge, *Biographia Literaria*, p. 37

<sup>700</sup> Dustin Griffin, *Regaining Paradise*, p. 7



associations.<sup>701</sup> In doing so, however, he suggests that Milton's political position is what prompted interest in his writings in the period that followed. This also offers evidence as to why critics would relegate Coleridge to a place of obscurity as compared with Wordsworth.

It is of note as well that Coleridge wrote of the tactic of critics of only conceding the genius of an author through reference to literary works in which he is least like himself in writing.<sup>702</sup> In doing so, critics seduce readers, Coleridge wrote, into imitating this lesser poetry, such as Milton's *L'Allegro* (1632) and *Il Penseroso* (1632), and diverting their attention from the objects of their love and wonder.<sup>703</sup> In his discussion, he introduced the idea though that public opinion at times fashioned an image of an author that may not correspond to literary value to be found in his literary works. Milton was, as Coleridge described him, echoing the language of eighteenth-century commentators:

‘The same calmness, and even greater self-possession, may be affirmed of Milton, as far as his poems, and poetic character are concerned. He reserved his anger, for the enemies of religion, freedom, and his country’.<sup>704</sup>

Coleridge's characterization of Milton as a poet of calmness and self-possession reminds of the Moderns turn to laud the aesthetic qualities of simplicity and the innocence attributed to the shepherds of Neoclassical pastoral. In doing so, it recalls the values with which Neoclassical pastoral's proponents associated Milton to rewrite English national history in the account they gave of its literary history. However, Coleridge's use of allusive language to describe Wordsworth's verse draws attention to the literary qualities in which he resembled Marvell

---

<sup>701</sup> Dustin Griffin, *Regaining Paradise*, p. 7

<sup>702</sup> Samuel Taylor Coleridge, *Biographia Literaria*, p. 62

<sup>703</sup> Samuel Taylor Coleridge, *Biographia Literaria*, p. 61

<sup>704</sup> Samuel Taylor Coleridge, *Biographia Literaria*, p. 36

though he does not name Marvell which might have stirred prejudice against Wordsworth's poetry that might arise from opinions of Marvell's politics and his political satires. This method of allusion, then, allowed Coleridge to note the semblance between Wordsworth's and Marvell's verse without suggesting his political inclinations.

Coleridge's discussion of Milton offers a response to such reviews as Leigh Hunt's assessment of the 'Waterloo' sonnets in a manner that frames Coleridge's critical response to the qualities of Wordsworth's verse that are literary rather than social or political in nature. He noted his own intellectual response to the methods of shaping aesthetic impression. He did so, though, in a manner that suggests a notion of convention that emphasizes the habits of mind underlying the interpretative response which arise because of allusive habits of writing. Coleridge's language alluding to Marvell's use of the conceit of the dew drop, as noted, captures how the affective power of Wordsworth's verse shaped his understanding in a manner that draws attention to the relation between interpretative creative writing and the self-reflexive critical writing it occasions. More importantly, it suggests that the implicit literary value underlying his account of poetry is the result of the ideas he has formed within the context of the *querelle* between Ancients and Moderns. That literary value draws upon Neoclassical theory about the aesthetic impressions that the pastoral of both those Ancients and Moderns elicits and the concerns about the loss or persistence of the innocence depicted. In doing so, Coleridge's account offers evidence of the power of verse to demonstrate the permanent truths of human life through a recurring pattern of thought given in the affective responses to personal experience to each historical moment .

This literary value is key to Coleridge's account of his developing aesthetic sensibility, and through it, his poetic character. To Coleridge, Wordsworth fashioned himself into the kind of

man of which Wordsworth wrote in his letter to John Wilson June 1802 that represents human nature as it has always been – uncorrupted by the influence of human society.<sup>705</sup> Wordsworth's *Descriptive Sketches* conveys the thoughts and feelings Nature prompts in him that suggests an image of him that remind of Marvell's virtuous dew drop which 'round-in itself incloses its native element' in the manner that both Wordsworth and Coleridge noted to be true of Hartley.<sup>706</sup> For Coleridge, Wordsworth's poetry was striking because it enhanced his power to reason by prompting him to meditate upon his feelings that his depiction of the persons, objects, and experiences elicit. 'Coleridge's readiness to assimilate his mind to the mind of Wordsworth may be compared', as Lawrence Buell writes, 'to Wordsworth's impulse to assimilate himself to nature'.<sup>707</sup> This allowed him to demonstrate how interpreting Wordsworth's verse within the tradition of Renaissance pastoral upon which it draws enabled him to write a critical history of his development and of English literature. Coleridge suggests the manner through which Wordsworth's poetry modified the objects before him to shape his power of perception. In doing so, it allowed him to realize how Wordsworth's poetry enhanced his aesthetic sensibility to an 'ideal world' beyond that of perceptible natural world of forms, incidents, and situations to the mind of God.

In writing *Biographia Literaria*, Coleridge show how this is achieved. His phrases borrowed from the language of Marvellian conceits, which illustrate how writing in a pastoral mode allowed him to fuse his affective responses to Wordsworth's verse with the thoughts he forms. This enacted a similar process to the apprehending truth through the sensuous experience of nature that allows one to come to understand oneself within the persisting truths about human

---

<sup>705</sup> Ernest de Selincourt, ed., *The Early Letters of William and Dorothy Wordsworth*, p. 295

<sup>706</sup> Samuel Taylor Coleridge, 'Letter to \_\_\_'; William Wordsworth's 'To H C'

<sup>707</sup> Lawrence Buell, 'The Question of Form in Coleridge's *Biographia Literaria*', p. 404

nature depicted in it. This, then, allowed Coleridge to demonstrate the mechanism which realizes the literary value underlying his account of his personal literary history. This mechanism is that through which the verse has enabled both poets to consider how poetry renders men attune to the possibilities that language offers to aide their understanding through the subjective response such depictions elicit.

Coleridge makes a distinction in *Biographia Literaria* between creative and critical writing that allows one to form a sense of their relation as he apprehends it through writing literary history. Creative writing enables ‘Mr. Wordsworth's purpose to consider the influences of fancy and imagination as they are manifested in poetry, and from the different effects to conclude their diversity in kind’.<sup>708</sup> By contrast, critical writing offered Coleridge the means ‘to investigate the seminal principle, and then from the kind to deduce the degree’, rather than draw ‘a masterly sketch of the branches with their poetic fruitage. I wish to add the trunk, and even the roots as far as they lift themselves above ground, and are visible to the naked eye of our common consciousness’.<sup>709</sup> Here again Coleridge used the language of organic empiricism that framed his enquiry into the organic history of the mind within eighteenth century ideas about the ‘continued organisation of poetry’. Coleridge’s image of the tree echoes Locke’s concept of ‘one common life’ in which the ‘vital sustenance’ of poetry ‘links past and future’ in a manner that offers continual newness that at the same time possesses a continuous meaning.<sup>710</sup> Coleridge’s self-conscious admission that his reading has led him to investigate the seminal principle offers some sense of what for Coleridge is meant by literary value.

---

<sup>708</sup> Samuel Taylor Coleridge, *Biographia Literaria*, p. 87-88

<sup>709</sup> Samuel Taylor Coleridge, *Biographia Literaria*, p. 88

<sup>710</sup> David Fairer, *Organising Poetry*, p. 3

The notion of literary value that may be derived from Coleridge's writing moves beyond the notion of an aspect of the text to the worth it offers to society in any period. Wordsworth's project he undertook through such works as *The Prelude* and *Lyrical Ballads*, as Coleridge described it, sought to understand the aesthetics of poetry. In his *Biographia Literaria*, Coleridge, though, sought to understand the principle that enables aesthetic influence. His use of the metaphor of the tree suggests ideas drawn from Locke's empirical organicism through which our subjective perceptions of the natural world, though disjunctive, lead us to understand the one common life of which our identity consists. Coleridge's admission to his interest in metaphysics and psychology betrays his purpose of understanding the mind itself and the law by which nature exercises a common aesthetic influence upon men alike.<sup>711</sup>

In writing, then, Coleridge gives us the basis upon which one may form a sense of the relation between poetry and the history of it that is told. A poetic depiction provides an individual, historically specific instance of the meaning the universal truths of human experience holds for an individual poet. Literary history, by contrast, derives this underlying truth to place the individual merit of each literary example within a whole whose value is derived from the understanding of the human condition. This sense leads to the notion of a literary value discussed in earlier chapters as a persisting principle embedded in literature which enables one to translate the subjective meaning one derives from the views of social or aesthetic values depicted in individual works, into knowledge of those larger truths. A literary history is premised upon such a literary value in the sense that it realizes an underlying principle, the literary value, through that mechanism. That literary history offers evidence of this in the recurring patterns of thought given in each poem which shares a revelatory quality that allows each poet and his readers to arrive at

---

<sup>711</sup> Samuel Taylor Coleridge, *Biographia Literaria*, p. 85

the knowledge of the nature of his humanity through personal experience. A turn to Wordsworth's and Coleridge's individual responses to Marvell's verse demonstrates this: their separate interpretations of the affective meaning his poems held for them still led them to similar ideas about their lives and that literature which prompted their self-reflection.

Here, Coleridge revealed the debt he owes to his fellow literary historians and the place he has fashioned for himself among them. His comment above echoed Johnson's critique of Milton in which he noted the lack of what he considers to be a characteristic of permanent value to be found in the 'Metaphysical' poets such as Marvell that such 'attempts were always analytic'.<sup>712</sup> The notion that poetry and great poets have the potential to reveal something about nature through its semblance to men lies in this simple observation. It is this observation from which Johnson derived the insight that great literature is 'truth to nature'.<sup>713</sup> Coleridge turned to defend Wordsworth's literary merit worthy of a place among the great poets such as Milton, Shakespeare, Thomson, and Collins who follow this precept. In doing so, he echoed Mitford's account of the tradition of sublime and pathetic poetry.<sup>714</sup> Coleridge noted,

To find no contradiction in the union of old and new; to contemplate the Ancient of days and all his works with feelings as fresh, as if all had then sprang forth at the first creative fiat ... And therefore is it the prime merit of genius and its most unequivocal mode of manifestation, so to represent familiar objects as to awaken in the minds of others a kindred feeling concerning them and that freshness of sensation which is the constant

---

<sup>712</sup> T. S. Eliot, 'The Metaphysical Poets', p. 379

<sup>713</sup> Samuel Johnson, *Lives of the Poets*,

<sup>714</sup> Samuel Taylor Coleridge, *Biographia Literaria*; John Mitford, 'Essay on Gray's Poetry', p. cxxxix

accompaniment of mental, no less than of bodily,  
convalescence.<sup>715</sup>

This critical response to that idea he formed from his interpretative reading from Marvell to Wordsworth demonstrates the truth of its premise in pastoral terms. The affective power of the tradition of poetry, of which both he and Mitford wrote, lies in its fusing of the perceptions of objects of nature with the emotion it elicits to touch the imagination and develop one's understanding.

Despite differences of circumstance, each generation of poets within the tradition translated the subjective meaning they gained from their personal encounters with literature, and the aesthetic influence of the objects of nature, which such writing depicted into universal terms. Coleridge's *Biographia Literaria* suggests the value of this lies in how it allows men to apprehend the truth underlying human experience. Of such poetry, Coleridge explained,

Meantime the matter and diction seemed to me characterized not so much by poetic thoughts, as by thoughts translated into the language of poetry. I mention this, because in referring various lines in Gray to their original in Shakespeare and Milton; and in the clear perception how completely all the propriety was lost in the transfer ...<sup>716</sup>

Coleridge's notion of translating what he referred to as 'prose thoughts' into poetry suggests the notion of subjective meaning derived from attempting to preserve the sense in the literary source. The underlying idea that the virtue of such poetry is not its poetics, which differs from author to author, but the thoughts expressed also betrays the debt that Coleridge and each preceding poet

---

<sup>715</sup> Samuel Taylor Coleridge, *Biographia Literaria*, p. 59-60

<sup>716</sup> Samuel Taylor Coleridge, *Biographia Literaria*, p. 12-13

owes to his precursors for their manner of creative expression as well. Coleridge's manner of expression differs in the grammatical construction of his application of a literary convention. However, the habits of writing he formed in this practice of translation shaped his habits of mind. In doing so, they defined how he perceived literature and the place he defined for himself in literary history. Although each poet's writing may be historically, socially, and at times, politically inflected, it resonates regardless of the specific context of composition and reading because it holds as its primary literary value the power of literature to reveal one's nature to oneself. Coleridge's history of poetry delineates the development of his mind under the aesthetic influence of English verse which he shares with the English poets before him and results because of them.



## Chapter 7

### Conclusion

Writing in 1921, T. S. Eliot noted that Andrew Marvell and his fellow metaphysical poets were descended from a tradition of Renaissance writers who incorporated their erudition into their sensibility: their ‘mode of feeling was directly and freshly altered, he writes, by their reading and thought’ in a manner which allowed them to transmute ‘ideas into sensations’ or ‘transform an observation into a state of mind’.<sup>717</sup> The idea Eliot formed of their writing as a mode of perceiving reveals the manner through which his imitative use of that mode in his critical assessment of them had formed his understanding of literary history. The account he gives describes the literary development that followed in the latter part of the seventeenth century in terms of ‘the dissociation of sensibility’ that entailed the separation of the thought from feeling that were intertwined in Marvell’s verse, as seen in the that of two of his contemporaries – Milton who displayed a high degree of erudition and magniloquence and Dryden who was noted for his wit.<sup>718</sup> The turn in Eliot’s essays *The Metaphysical Poets* and *Andrew Marvell* to describe his aesthetic impressions of the writing of the three poets in terms drawn from inherited accounts offered the basis for developmental literary histories as that of Howard Erskine-Hill’s.<sup>719</sup> His account distinguishes between two lines of development and the uses to which the methods for eliciting the aesthetic impressions are put. Erskine-Hill’s account of English literary history from Dryden to Wordsworth examines the ways several poets used such methods as allusion and paradox to engage with larger political and social questions as compared with Milton. His study offers evidence as to how scholars have formed their notions of the genres of epic and satire

---

<sup>717</sup> T S Eliot, ‘The Metaphysical Poets’, p. 390

<sup>718</sup> T S Eliot, ‘The Metaphysical Poets’, p. 380-81 and ‘Andrew Marvell’, p. 310

<sup>719</sup> Howard Erskine-Hill, *The Poetry of Opposition and Revolution: Dryden to Wordsworth* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1996)

because of the responses such methods evoke. Those accounts reflect the ways in which Neoclassical theory about the methods that lent each genre its aesthetic character, prompted critics to think of genre in terms of the origins of such interpretative modes of writing.

This thesis has turned to reassess the evidence showing how the recursive character that writing in the pastoral mode lent to the creative engagements and critical reflection upon the literary past within the context of the *querelle* between Ancients and Moderns gave occasion for this. Lyttelton's and Mitford's reading of Thomson's verse within that context enabled their revised accounts of the development of a 'classical' and a 'Romantic' tradition within literature. The attention Eliot later drew to the lack of wit to be found in the writings of such Romantic poets as Wordsworth within the context of his discussion about the character of Marvell's verse and Milton's reflects the distinctions that had been made between the traditions of wit and sense and the sublime.<sup>720</sup> More recent accounts of the latter tradition have been predicated upon a notion of the Romantic bard derived from comparisons between the sublimity of Milton and Wordsworth's verse. In Chapter 2, I have shown how Marvell's satiric renderings of pastoral that employ the irony and wit characteristic of Renaissance verse took Milton's sublime epic as a point of departure against which to measure the historical and cultural circumstances in which they were written within the classical ideals upon which Milton drew. I then examined Pope's parodic essays about pastoral and verse in Chapter 3 within a longer tradition of such renderings in Virgil, Spenser, and Marvell that had turned to Theocritus for example to measure the writers, and their methods for imbuing their writings with an aesthetic character, to shape perceptions of the persisting virtue of the English people.

---

<sup>720</sup> T. S. Eliot, 'Andrew Marvell', p. 319

A look at Thomson's juvenile pastorals and *The Seasons* in Chapter 4 allowed me to consider how imitating that tradition enabled Thomson to gain insight from his readings of English literary history about the limits to which our fallen human nature impedes most from deriving meaning from their experience. In Chapter 5, I discussed Joseph Warton's essay which placed Pope among the poets of wit and sense whose satires, when transposed into prose, display both an excellent sense and a poetical character he noted in Horace.<sup>721</sup> In Chapter 6, I turned to Coleridge's allusive language that reminds us of that observation. Eliot's use of language that imitates Coleridge's allusions to Marvell suggests that *Biographia Literaria* in which Coleridge's use of such allusive language made be observed framed his critical assessment of literary history. Each author's turn to allusion in this manner suggests a longer critical history formed from the pattern of thought which emerges from the patterns of expression through which he measured his creative verse against his literary inheritance that occasioned his self-assessment. Eliot's use of the terms of magniloquence and wit to distinguish the two traditions that follow Marvell echoes those terms of the Ancients and Moderns. From this, an idea may be formed about the turn to satirize pastoral to denote a conscious attempt to understand each historical period within the ideal of a past innocence now lost, as compared with the emphasis placed on aesthetic character to demonstrate that such virtue continued to his present.

The history of English pastoral from the Renaissance to the Romantic period, as discussed in this thesis, was characterized by the desire among the noted poets to understand their present in historical terms through the reflection of it offered in the pastoral depictions expressing the ideals men were thought to have held during the Age of Innocence. The historical circumstances within which the several poets noted found themselves gave occasion for their

---

<sup>721</sup> Joseph Warton, *An Essay on the Genius and Writings of Alexander Pope*, p. ix

turn to pastoral. Writing in that mode enabled an interpretative reading of their literary past within that ideal of the innocence of a Golden Age. That mode allowed poets to reflect upon the longing for its return with which each period was afflicted. Through their satiric renderings, Marvell, Pope, Thomson, and the Warton found the means with which to view their historical moments with a critical eye. That, in turn, shaped the manner through which later poets and critics such as Wordsworth and Coleridge conceived of the periods in which they wrote and contemporaneous ideas about English literary history.

With each successive poet, the context of the period in which he was writing gave reason to re-examine the ideas presented in the verse he read to meditate upon his historical moment in ways that have revealed the recurring patterns of thought dressed to suit the times that reflected the recurring patterns within history. The manner through which Marvell, Pope, and Thomson recast the *querelle* waged between Ancients and Moderns illustrates how the past impressed its semblance on the present. Later accounts of literary history have revealed that each succeeding period could only define itself in relation to that past, as they have shown how the methods earlier writers had used to express their ways of perceiving continually formed that of those who followed. The terms of the debate between Ancients and Moderns from which the Warton and Coleridge derived their ideas of classical and Romantic traditions of poetry shaped notions of what constitutes literary history that continue to influence what contemporary critics determine to be canonical literature.

The Romantic tradition of Wordsworth and Coleridge, as it is described in Romantic and contemporary accounts of literary history, may be traced to the position of the Moderns derived from Neoclassical pastoral theory. The depictions the Moderns lauded of a shepherd's virtue developed into a theory of the sublime, as the method of expressing the shepherd's character

through his simple perceptions of nature gave reason for the idea writers formed about how his aesthetic sense allowed him to apprehend God's Hand. This notion served as the basis for the Neoclassical accounts of literary history in which Milton was presented as the image of the poet-prophet from which later poets and critics fashioned their image of the Romantic bard. Evidence of how such notions developed is offered in the turn to Milton as the exemplary example of that figure in which the sublime is the image of his mind, made palpable in his poetry.

That, however, has led to a partial understanding of how the uses to which the modes of representing different manners of perceiving were put shaped such accounts of developmental literary history. Critics who drew upon Neoclassical theory offered the descriptive character of the speaker's impressions in Milton's *Paradise Lost* as an illustration of sublime poetry that elicited an affective response that was presented as evidence of the virtuous character necessary to attaining the kind of understanding with which the poet-prophet was credited. The emphasis critics, biographers, and historians have placed on Milton's sublime style of language in offering his epic allowed them to cast it as a precursor for the depiction of affective response to nature enacted in *The Seasons*. Joseph Warton's impression that Thomson's *The Seasons* resembled such descriptive poetry in manner also gave occasion though for an alternate view of it. Although *The Seasons* was offered as the example emulated by Wordsworth's *The Prelude*, Mitford's criticism of those lengthy digressions prompted later critics' such as Sambrook to reassess its burlesque language that was not in keeping with the sublime.<sup>722</sup>

Mitford wrote that it is not the emotion itself which denotes the tradition of the sublime and pathetic in English literature.<sup>723</sup> Instead, he emphasized that the language of description enables us to apprehend the import of that depicted, which resonates with readers, because of the

---

<sup>722</sup> James Sambrook, ed., *The Seasons*

<sup>723</sup> John Mitford, 'Essay on Gray', p. cxxxii

ideas that sublime emotion prompts. This notion shaped Coleridge's and Eliot's sense of how the manner through which the language of the poetic tradition of wit could also be used to render men more attune to their affective responses to aesthetic influence through the ideas they form about it. The ideas they developed about how men are made to feel the character through their interaction with the objects and symbols representing the essence of its source reflect an understanding of the pastoral genre as the mode of writing which enables this. The account Eliot offered of the manner through which the text is realized through the author's interpretative process of 'finding the verbal equivalents' that 'fuse [his] thoughts and feelings' has allowed readers to reason as the poet did.<sup>724</sup> The methods in Marvell's verse, Eliot noted, imbued his pastorals with the irony that characterized his manner of satiric rendering which this thesis has shown to have served as the model Coleridge and Wordsworth adopted for illustrating how felt experience modified sensibility.

This thesis has discussed Coleridge's interpretative readings of Marvell's and Wordsworth's depictions of their speaker's affective response to the aesthetic influences used to convey generic ideals through the objects and persons described. Coleridge's conscious turn to the manner of the tradition of satiric renderings of pastoral of Theocritus, Virgil, and Spenser, as Marvell did, to achieve this gave occasion for him to translate the subjective meaning his readings held for him into knowledge of larger truths. This principle may also be derived from the accounts of that tradition noted. The sense and wit which Joseph Warton perceives in the ethical and moral verse of the Renaissance satirists among whom Marvell may be placed denotes the character of Wordsworth's verse which struck Coleridge in 'such difference not separable

---

<sup>724</sup> T S Eliot, 'The Metaphysical Poets', p. 381

from the thought and manner'.<sup>725</sup> That, in turn, influenced Eliot's account of that tradition of wit to which pastoral satire belongs.

The classicism noted in the works of the poets that Eliot viewed to possess the erudition of Milton, echoing Mitford, also reminds of the noted turn to the origin of the expressions of that poetical quality described in the writings of Antiquity among the Ancients. Such classicism illustrates the recurring pattern of thought reflected in that persistent turn in the verse of Marvell, Pope, Thomson, the Warton, Wordsworth, and Coleridge to an ideal of innocence of a golden age to capture the longing for the Edenic bliss lost to the modern world. The poetry of the authors which I have examined in this thesis shows that the literary value underlying the tradition of verse to which it belongs persisted through the turn to satirize pastoral which allowed the poets to gain the knowledge of the eternal truth of man's fallen state. This was achieved through the subject meaning they attained through the turn of each poet to examine his historical present within that ideal. The pattern that emerges with and because of the recurring turn to this mode of interpretative reading reveals the larger truth to be apprehended about the recurring patterns of human history it makes palpable. From this an idea may be formed of the tradition of satiric renderings of pastoral discussed as part of a broader literary history based upon the literary value derived. Such writing allows men to attain the understanding of humanity's fallen nature in which its irony makes pointed that the elusive innocence depicted in pastoral was never inherent to men.

This insight gives reason for contemporary critics such as Chaudhuri, McColley, and Haber who place Marvell's 'paradoxical' pastorals in opposition to Milton's *Paradise Lost* to pause as it draws attention to the need to re-evaluate the current notion of literary history in the

---

<sup>725</sup> Samuel Taylor Coleridge, *Biographia Literaria*, p. 80

biased accounts of the development of literature in England we have inherited. This notion does not represent the breadth of literature in a manner that reflects the uses to which the different modes of writing were put to examine contemporaneous society within any given historical moment to understand that development. Rather, the understanding to be gained from examining why such patterns reveal themselves in the turn to creative expression to consider the essence of one's subjective experience merits further meditation upon the nature of literary history. As David Hopkins notes, what Leavis asserts to be Eliot's break with notions of the past in his phrase the 'dissociation of sensibility' presents an instance in which Eliot captured the sentiment earlier writers had held upon further investigation.<sup>726</sup> That instance, like many others noted in this thesis, allows us to see the recurring habits of mind which betray how such authors were fashioned by them as they fashioned their accounts of England's literary history and their place in it. From the examples of past, both creative and critical, we may find ample reason to consider that literary inheritance as the mirror through which we might apprehend ourselves and the world we make as we are made. In the desire to fashion a revised history in which we attempt to re-imagine the past from which to create a distinct identity to distance us from those who preceded us, we may find a greater semblance from which to learn as we forge ahead.

---

<sup>726</sup> David Hopkins, 'Dr. Leavis's Seventeenth Century', *Essays in Criticism* 64 (2014), 293-317



## Bibliography

### Manuscripts

Chicago, Newberry Library, no shelfmark, James Thomson, 'Miscelany Poems'

Grasmere, Wordsworth Library, MS STC 34

London, Victoria and Albert Museum, Forester MS 598, James Thomson, *Juvenalia*

Oxford, Bodleian Library MS Dep e 279

Oxford, Bodleian Library MS Dep e 305

Oxford, Bodleian Library MS Dep e 305

Oxford, Bodleian Library MS Dep c 642

Oxford, Bodleian Library MS Dep d 610

Oxford, Bodleian Library MS Dep d 611

Oxford, Bodleian Library MS Dep d 671

Oxford, Bodleian Library MS Dep e 291

Oxford, Bodleian Library MS Dep c 643

Oxford, Bodleian Library MS Dep e 293

Oxford, Bodleian Library MS Don b 8, 'The Haward Manuscript'

Oxford, Bodleian Library MS Eng misc f 49

### Printed Books with Annotations

Cambridge, Mass. Harvard Library Sum 139, James Thomson, *The Seasons* (1744). This copy contains an inscription and original lines of verse in the handwriting of James Thomson and was intended as a gift copy to Miss Elizabeth Young.

Cambridge, Mass. Harvard Library EC65 Ev226 Y672ra (A), Rene Rapin, *Of Gardens, Four Books Written in Latin Verse by Renatus Rapinus and now made English by J. E.* (London: Printed by Thomas Ratcliffe & Nathaniel Thompson for Thomas Collins and John Ford at the Middle Temple Gate and Benjamin Tookes at the Ship in St. Pauls Church-yard, 1672). This copy was owned and annotated by Narcissus Luttrell, a contemporary of Andrew Marvell, collector, and member of British Parliament

Chicago, Newberry Library Case Y 185.M376, Andrew Marvell, *Miscellaneous Poems* (1681). This copy of Marvell's poems was bound with other pastorals and satires published from 1679 to 1680 by Narcissus Luttrell, and then acquired by James Bindley, a friend of John Nichols, followed by Bertram Dobell, Sir Charles Firth, and then Louis H. Silver.

London, British Library C 28 e 15, *Poems Relating to State Affairs, from Oliver Cromwell to this present Time: By the Greatest Wits of the Age* (London: 1705) 8th edition. This copy contains several of Marvell's satires and was owned and annotated by Alexander Pope.

London, British Library C 28 f 6, Virgil, *The works of Virgil: containing his pastorals, Georgics and Æneis. Translated into English verse; by Mr. Dryden. In three volumes. Adorn'd with above a hundred sculptures* (London: printed by Jacob Tonson at Grays-Inn Gate, 1709). This copy was owned and annotated by Alexander Pope.

London, British Library, C 134 c 1, James Thomson, *The Works of Mr. Thomson* (London: 1768). This copy was owned by the nineteenth century scholar John Mitford and includes his transcriptions of George Littleton's autograph amendments he made to *The Seasons* in British Library C 28 e 17.

London, British Library, C 28 e 17, James Thomson, *The Works of James Thomson* (London: 1738). This copy includes additions and amendments to *The Seasons* in both James Thomson and George Lyttelton's handwriting.

Swindon, England, The National Trust, shelfmark WIM, *The idylliums of Theocritus with Rapin's discourse of pastorals, done into English by Mr. Creech* (Oxford: Printed by L Lichfield for Anthony Stephens, 1684). This copy was owned and annotated by Narcissus Luttrell.

Washington, District of Columbia, Folger Shakespeare Library, shelfmark T855, *The idylliums of Theocritus with Rapin's discourse of pastorals, done into English by Mr. Creech* (Oxford: Printed by L. Lichfield for Anthony Stephens, 1684). This copy was part of the collection of John Dryden's books Percy G. Dobell secured while compiling a bibliography noting Dryden's sources for his plays.

Worcester, Hurd Library, no shelfmark, John Denham, *Poems and Translations with the Sophy, Written by the Honorable Sir John Denham, Knight of the Bath, The Fourth Edition, To which is added Cato-Major of Old-Age* (London: Printed by T.W. for H. Harrington and sold by Jacob Tonson at Grays-Inn Gate in Grays-Inn-Lane, and Thomas Bennet at the Half-Moon in St. Paul's Church-Yard, 1703). This copy was owned and annotated by Alexander Pope.

Worcester, Hurd Library, no shelfmark, Spenser, Edmund, *The Faerie Queene: The Shepheard's Calendar: Together with the Other Works of English ArchPoet Edm. Spenser. Collected into One Volume and Carefully Corrected* (Printed by H L for Matthew Lownes. Anno Domini 1611). This copy was owned and annotated by Alexander Pope.

Worcester, Hurd Library, no shelfmark, *The idylliums of Theocritus with Rapin's discourse of pastorals, done into English by Mr. Creech* (Oxford: Printed by L. Lichfield for Anthony Stephens, 1684). This copy was owned and annotated by Alexander Pope.

### Primary Texts

Oxford English Dictionary (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2020) <https://www.oed.com>  
[accessed 13 April 2021]

[Anon] *The Guardian*, ed. by John Nichol (Printed for John Nichol, 1789)

[Anon] *The Guardian*, ed. by John Calhoun Stephens (Lexington: University of Kentucky Press, 1982)

Bacon, Francis, *Of the Advancement of Learning* (Oxford: 1640)

Chalmers, Alexander, ed., *The Works of the English Poets, From Chaucer to Cowper, edited by Alexander Chalmers, 21 vol.s* (London: 1806)

Chaucer, Geoffrey, 'The Knight's Tale' in *The Works of our Ancient and Learned English Poet Geoffrey Chaucer Newly Printed* (Londini: Impensis Georg. Bishop, 1598)

Chetwood, Knightley, "'Preface to Pastorals", with a Defense of Virgil Against Some of the Reflexions of Monsieur Fontenelle' in *The works of Virgil containing his Pastorals, Georgics and Aeneis : adorn'd with a hundred sculptures, translated into English verse by Mr. Dryden* (London: Printed for Jacob Tonson, 1697)

Coleridge, Samuel Taylor, *Biographia Literaria*, ed. by James Engell and W. Jackson Bate, *The Collected Works of Samuel Taylor Coleridge*, Bollingen Series Volume LXXV (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1983)

-- *Coleridge's Dejection: The Earliest Manuscripts and the Earliest Printings*, ed. by Stephen Maxfield Parrish (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1988)

-- *Poetical Words I Poems (Reading Text)*, ed. by J. C. C. Mays (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2001)

-- *The Notebooks of Samuel Taylor Coleridge, Vol 1*, ed. by Kathleen Coburn (New York: Bollingen, 1957-2002)

Collins, William, *Persian eclogues. Written originally for the entertainment of the ladies of Tauris. And now first translated, &c* (London: Printed for J. Roberts, in Warwick-Lane, 1742)

Cooper, Anthony-Ashley, *Characteristics of Men, Manners, Opinions, and Times in Three Volume s*By the Right Honorable Anthony, Earl of Shaftsbury *The Fifth Edition corrected With the Addition of a Letter Concerning Design* (London: Printed by John Darbyl, 1732)

Dennis, John, *The Advancement and Reformation of Modern Poetry. A Critical Discourse, in Two Parts ... By Mr. Dennis* (London: Printed for Richard Parker, at the Unicorn under the Piazza of the Royal Exchange in Cornhill, 1701)

Dryden, John, trans., *The works of Virgil containing his Pastorals, Georgics and Aeneis : adorn'd with a hundred sculptures* (London: Printed for Jacob Tonson, 1697)

-- *Ovid's Epistles, Translated by Several Hands* (London: Printed for Jacob Tonson, 1680)

-- *Sylvae: or, the Second Part of Poetical Miscellanies* (London: Printed for Jacob Tonson, 1685)

-- *Fables, Ancient and Modern. Translated into verse from Homer, Ovid, Boccace and Chaucer; with original poems* (London: Printed for Jacob Tonson, 1700)

-- *The Poems of John Dryden, Volume V, 1697-1700*, ed. by David Hopkin and Paul Hammond (Harlow, England: Pearson Longman, 2005)

Eliot, T S, *The Complete Prose of T S Eliot: the Perfect Critic 1919-1926, Volume 2*, ed. by Anthony Cuda and Ronald Schuchard (Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press, 2014)

Evelyn, John, *A Character of England* (London: Printed for John Cook and are to be sold at the Ship in St. Paul's Churchyard, 1659)

Fontenelle, Bernard de Bovier, *Of Pastorals, published with Bossu's Treatise of the Epick Poem*, trans. by Pierre Motteux (London: Printed for Tho. Bennet at the Half-Moon St Paul's Churchyard, 1695)

Goodhugh, William, *The Gentleman's Magazine* (April 1818)

-- *The Observer* (18 September 1818)

-- *The English Gentleman's Library Manual* (1827)

Hill, Aaron, *The Creation a Pindaric Illustration of a Poem Originally Written by Moses on that Subject With a Preface to Mr Pope Concerning The Sublimity of Ancient Hebrew Poetry and a Material and Obvious Defect in the English* (London: Printed for T. Bickerton, at the Crown in Pater-Noster-Row, 1720)

Hunt, Leigh, Extract from 'The Examiner, 18 February 1816' in *William Wordsworth: The Critical Heritage*, ed. by Robert Woof (London: Routledge, 2001)

Hurd, Richard, *Letters on Chivalry and Romance*, letter XI (1765)

Lonsdale, Roger, ed., *The Poems of Gray, Collins, and Goldsmith* (New York: Longman Limited Group, 1969)

Lucretius Carus, Titus, *T Lucretii Cari de Rerum Natura Libros Sex* (Londini: E Typographaeo Mariae Matthews, Sumptibus T Child, B. Tooke, H Clements, W Churchil, 1717)

Marvell, Andrew, *Miscellaneous Poems* by Andrew Marvell Esq Late Member of the House of Commons (London: Printed for Robert Boulter, at the Turks-Head in Cornhill, 1681)

-- 'On Mr. Milton's Paradise Lost' in *Paradise Lost a Poem in Twelve Books The Author John Milton* (London: Printed for Jacob Tonson at Shakespear's Headover-against Catherine Street at the Strand, 1711)

-- *The Works of Andrew Marvell, Esq In Two Volumes* (London: Printed for T. Davies, in Russell Street, Convent Garden, 1772)

-- *The Works of Andrew Marvell, Poetical, Controversial, and Political; Containing Many Original Letters, Poems, and Tracts, Never Before Printed, with a New Life of the Author by Captain Edward Thompson* (London: Printed for the Editor, by Henry Baldwin, and Sold by Dodleys, in Pall-Mall, 1776)

-- *The Poems of Andrew Marvell*, ed. by Nigel Smith (Harlow, England: Pearson Longman, 2007)

Milton, John, *Paradise Lost a Poem written in Twelve Books*. By John Milton. Licensed and Entered according to Order (London: Printed, and to be sold by Peter Parker under Creed Churchneer Aldgate's and by Robert Boulter at the Turks Head in Bishpgate-Street and Martin Walker, under St. Durstan Church in Fleet Street, 1667)

-- *Paradise Lost a Poem in Twelve Books The Author John Milton* (London: Printed for Jacob Tonson at Shakespear's Headover-against Catherine Street at the Strand, 1711)

-- 'A Mask Presented at Ludlow Castle in 1634', *The Poetical Works of John Milton: Vol II Containing, Paradise Regained, Samson Agonistes, and his Poems on Several Occasions, &c. A new Edition carefully corrected.* (London: printed in the Year 1731)

Mitford, John, 'Essay on Gray's Poetry' in *The Works of Thomson Gray* (London: 1816)

-- 'Thomson's The Seasons and Their Various Readings', *Gentleman's Magazine* (December 1841),

Munby, A N L, gen. ed., *Sale Catalogues of Libraries of Eminent Persons, Volume I: Poets and Men of Letters* (London: Mansell, 1971)

Pope, Alexander, 'Messiah' in *The Spectator, Volume the First* (Printed for Peter Wilson, 1755)

- *The Works of Alexander Pope, Esq Vol I, With Explanatory Notes and Additions Never Before Printed* (London: Printed for B. Lintot, 1736)
- *The Works of Alexander Pope Esq In Nine Volumes Complete With His Last Corrections, Additions and Improvements Published by Mr Warburton With Occasional Notes* (London: Printed for J. and P. Knapton, H. Lintot, and J. and R. Tonson, and S. Draper, 1751)
- *The Prose Works of Alexander Pope, Vol 1*, ed. by Norman Ault (London: 1936)
- *Pastoral Poetry and An Essay on Criticism*, ed. by E. Audra and Aubrey Williams (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1961)
- *The Last and Greatest Art: Some Unpublished Poetical Manuscripts of Alexander Pope*, trans and ed by Maynard Mack (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 1984)

Rapin, Rene, 'Discourse of Pastorals' in *The idylliums of Theocritus with Rapin's discourse of pastorals, done into English by Mr. Creech* (Oxford: Printed by L. Lichfield for Anthony Stephens, 1684)

Spenser, Edmund, *The Faerie Queene: The Shepheard's Calendar: Together with the Other Works of English ArchPoet Edm. Spenser. Collected into One Volume and Carefully Corrected* (Printed by H. L. for Matthew Lownes. Anno Domini 1611)

Theocritus, 'Idyll 20' in *Theocritus, Mochus, Bion*, ed. and trans. by Neil Hopkinson (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 2015)

Thomson, James, *The Works of James Thomson*, ed. by George Lyttelton (London: 1750)

- 'Juvenilia' in *Liberty, The Castle of Indolence and Other Poems*, ed by James Sambrook (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1986)
- *The Poetical Works of James Thomson* (1830)
- *The Poetical Works of James Thomson* (1849)
- *The Seasons*, ed by James Sambrook (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1981)
- *The Complete Poetical Words of James Thomson edited with notes by J Logie Robertson* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1908)
- *Thomson's Seasons*, edited by Otto Zippel (1908)
- *The Seasons*, ed. by James Sambrook (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1981)

Virgil, *Eclogues, Georgics, Aeneid Books 1-6*, trans. by H. R. Fairclough, rev. by J. P. Gould (Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press, 1999)

Warton, Joseph, *Fashion: An Epistolary Satire to a Friend* (London: Printed for R Dodleys at Tully's-Head in Pall-mall; and sold by T. Cooper at the Globe in Pater-noster-Row, 1742)

-- *The Enthusiast: Or the Lover of Nature. A Poem.* (London: Printed for R Dodsley at Tully's Head in Pall-mall; and Sold by M. Cooper in Pater-noster-Row, 1744)

-- *An Essay on the Writings and Genius of Pope, Vol. I* (London: Printed for M. Cooper at Pater-noster-Row, 1756)

Warton, Thomas, 'To Mr. Upton, on his New Edition of the Faerie Queene' in *Poems. A New Edition, With Additions. By Thomas Warton* (London: Printed for T Beckett, in the Adelphi, 1737)

-- *Five Pastoral Eclogues The Scenes of Which are Suppos'd to lie among the Shepherds Oppress'd by the War in Germany* (London: Printed for R. Dodsley at Tully's Head in Pall-mall, 1745)

-- *The Pleasures of Melancholy. A Poem.* (London: Printed R. Dodsley at Tully's Head in Pall-mall; and Sold by M Cooper at the Globe in Pater-noster-Row, 1747)

-- *Poems on Several Occasions. By the Reverend Thomas Warton. Batchelor of Divinity. Late Vice of Basing stoke in Hampshire, and sometime Professor of Poetry in the University of Oxford* (London: Printed for R. Munby and H. S. Cox on Ludgate-Hill, 1748)

-- 'A Pastoral in the Manner of Spenser, From Theocritus, Idyll XX' in *The Union: or Select Scots and English Poets* (Edinburgh: Printed for Archibald Munro & David Munro, 1753)

-- *Observations on the Faerie Queene of Spenser* (London: Printed for R. and J. Dodsley and J Fletcher, in the Turl, Oxford, 1754)

-- 'Dissertatio de Poesi Bucolica Graecorum' in *Theocriti Syracusii quae supersunt, 2 vols.* (1770)

-- *The History of English Poetry From the Close of the Eleventh Century to the Commencement of the Eighteenth Century. To Which Are Prefixed Two Dissertations. I Of the Origin of Romantic Fiction in Europe. II On the Introduction of Learning into England. Volume the First By Thomas Warton, B.D. Fellow of Trinity College, Oxford and the Society of Antiquarians* (London: Printed for and Sold By J. Dodsley, Pall Mall; J. Walter, Charing Cross; T; Becket, Strand; J. Robson, New Bond Street; G. Robinson,

and J. Bew, Pater-noster-Row; and Messers. Fletcher at Oxford, 1774); *Volume the Second* (London: 1778); *Volume III* (London: 1781)

- *The History of English Poetry From the Close of the Eleventh Century to the Commencement of the Eighteenth Century. To Which Are Prefixed Two Dissertations. I Of the Origin of Romantic Fiction in Europe. II On the Introduction of Learning into England. Volume IV. By Thomas Warton, BD Fellow of Trinity College, Oxford and the Society of Antiquarians* (London: Printed for and Sold By J. Dodsley, Pall Mall; J. Walter, Charing Cross; T. Becket, Strand; J. Robson, New Bond Street; G. Robinson, and J. Bew, Pater-noster-Row; and Messers. Fletcher at Oxford, 1781)
- 'Preface' in *Poems on Several Occasions, English, Italian, and Latin, with Translations by John Milton, With Notes Critical and Explanatory, and Other Illustrations, By Thomas Warton, Fellow of Trinity College and Late Professor of Poetry at Oxford* (London: Printed for James Dodsley in Pall Mall, 1785)
- *The Poetical Works of the Late Thomas Warton B D, edited by Richard Mant, two vols.* (Oxford: 1802)

Whyte, Samuel, *Miscellanea Nova* (1801)

Wilmot, John, *Collected Works of John Wilmot, Earl of Rochester*, ed. by John Hayward (London: The Nonesuch Press, 1926)

- *The Complete Poems of the Earl of Rochester*, ed. by David Vieth (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2002)

Wordsworth, William, *Descriptive Sketches in Verse during a Pedestrian Tour in the Italian, Grisson, Swiss and Sovoyard Alps by W Wordsworth St John's Cambridge* (London: Printed for J Johnson, St Paul's Church-Yard, 1793)

- *Poems, in Two Volumes*, ed. by Jared Curtis (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1983)

## Secondary Texts

Achenstein, Sharon, 'Milton's Spectre in the Restoration: Marvell, Dryden and Literary Enthusiasm' in *Huntington Library Quarterly* 59 (1997), 1-29

Alpers, Paul, *What is Pastoral?* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1996)

Anderson, Linda, 'The Nature of Marvell's Mower' *Studies in English Literature, 1500-1900*, 31, 'The English Renaissance' (1991), 131-146

Attie, Katherine Bootle, 'Enclosure Polemics and the Garden in the 1650s', *Studies in English Literature* 51 (2011), 135-157



- Bardle, Stephen, *The Literary Underground in the 1660s: Andrew Marvell, George Wither, Ralph Wallis, and the World of Restoration Satire and Pamphleteering* (Oxford: Oxford University Press 2012)
- Bloom, Harold, *The Anxiety of Influence: A Theory of Poetry* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1973)
- Brett, Annabel, *Changes of State: Nature and the Limits of the City in Early Modern Natural Law* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2011)
- Brice, Ben, *Coleridge and Scepticism* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007)
- Brown, J, *Literary Gazette* (3 October 1818)
- Buell, Lawrence, 'The Question of Form in Coleridge's *Biographia Literaria*', *English Literary History* 46 (1979): 399-417
- Bullard, Paddy and Tadie, Alexis, 'Introduction' in *Ancients and Moderns in Europe: Comparative Perspectives*, ed. by Paddy Bullard and Alexis Tadie (Oxford: Voltaire Foundation, University of Oxford Press, 2016)
- Burlinson, Christopher, 'The Use and Reuse of Early Seventeenth-Century Student Notebooks: Inside and Outside the University' in *Material Readings of Early Modern Culture: Text and Social Practices, 1580 – 1730*, ed. by James Daybell and Peter Hinds (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010), 230-231
- Burrow, Colin, *Epic Romance: Homer to Milton* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1993)
- *Imitating Authors: Plato to Futurity* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2019)
- Burt, Richard and Archer, John Michael, eds., *Enclosure Acts: Sexuality, Property, and Culture in Early Modern England* (Ithaca, NY Cornell University Press, 1994)
- Callaghan, Michelle, *The 'Shepherd's Nation': Jacobean Spenserians and Early Stuart Political Culture 1612-1625* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000)
- Cave, Terence, 'Ancients vs Moderns France' in *The Cambridge History of Literary Criticism*, ed. by Christa Knellwolf and Christopher Norris (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008)
- Chaudhuri, Sukanta, *Renaissance Pastoral and its English Developments* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1989)

Citroni, Mario, 'The Concept of the Classical and the Canons of Model Authors in Roman Literature' in *The Classical Traditions of Greece and Rome*, ed. by J. I. Porter (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2006)

Clymer, Lorna, *Ritual, Routine, and Regime: Repetition in Early Modern British and European Cultures* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press for UCLA Center for Seventeenth and Eighteenth-Century Studies, 2006)

Colie, Rosalie, *The Resources of Kind: Genre-Theory in the Renaissance*, ed. by Barbara K. Lewalski (Berkeley & Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1973)

Cooper, Helen, *The Structure of the Canterbury Tales* (London: Gerald Duckworth & Co, 1983)

Costello, William, *The Curriculum at Seventeenth-Century Cambridge* (Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press, 1958)

Cousins, A D, 'Andrew Marvell's Mower Poems and the Pastoral Tradition', *International Journal of the Classical Tradition* 18 (2011), 523-46 (p. 537)

-- 'The Replication and Critique of Libertinism in Andrew Marvell's "To His Coy Mistress"', *Renaissance Studies* 28 (2013), 392-404

-- *Andrew Marvell: Loss and Aspiration, Home and Homeland in Miscellaneous Poems* (Abingdon: Routledge, 2016)

Curran, Louise, 'Reading Milton in Eighteenth-Century Poetic Miscellanies', *Eighteenth-Century Life* 41 (2017), 32-55

Dane, Joseph, 'Genre and Authority: The Eighteenth-Century Creation of Chaucerian Burlesque', *Huntington Library Quarterly* 48 (1985), 345-62

Davis, Gregson, *Polyhymnia: The Rhetoric of Horatian Lyric Discourse* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1991)

Daybell, James, 'Early Modern Letters-Books, Miscellanies, and the Reading and Reception of Scribally Copied Letters' in *Manuscript Miscellanies in Early Modern England*, ed. by Joshua Eckhardt and Daniel Starza Smith (Surrey: Ashgate Publishing Limited, 2014)

de Bruyn, Fran, 'From Virgilian Discourse to Agricultural Science: An Instance of Transvaluation of Literature in Eighteenth-Century Britain' in *Augustan Subjects: Essays in Honor of Martin C. Battestin*, ed. by Albert J. Rivero, (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 1997)

de Selincourt Ernest, ed., *The Early Letters of William and Dorothy Wordsworth (1787-1805)* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1935)

- Empson, William, *Some Versions of Pastoral* (Harmondsworth: Penguin Books Ltd, 1935)
- Erlich, Richard D and Harner, James, 'Pope's Annotations in His Copy of Dryden's Comedies, Tragedies, and Operas: An Exercise in Cryptography', *Restoration and Eighteenth Century Theatre Research* 10 (1971)
- Erskine-Hill, Howard, *The Social Milieu of Alexander Pope: Lives, Example, and the Poetic Response* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1975)
- *The Augustan Idea in English Literature* (London: Edward Arnold, 1983)
- *The Poetry of Opposition and Revolution: Dryden to Wordsworth* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1996)
- ed., *Alexander Pope, World and Word* (Oxford: Oxford University Press for the British Academy, 1998)
- Fairer, David, ed., *Pope's Imagination* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1984)
- *The Correspondence of Thomas Warton* (Athens: The University of Georgia Press, 1995)
- 'The Formation of Warton's History', *History of English Poetry, Volume I*, ed by David Fairer (London: Routledge, 1998)
- 'Creating a national poetry: the tradition of Spenser and Milton' in *The Cambridge Companion to Eighteenth-century Poetry*, ed by John Sitter (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001)
- *English Poetry of the Eighteenth Century 1700-1789* (London: Pearson Education, 2003)
- *Organising Poetry: The Coleridge Circle, 1790-1798* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009)
- Fletcher, Katherine, 'Uncertain Knowing, Blind Vision, and Active Passivity: Subjectivity, Sensuality and Emotion in Milton's Epistemology' in *Passions and Subjectivity in Early Modern Culture*, ed. by Brian Cummings and Freya Sierhuis (Farnham: Ashgate, 2013)
- Fowler, Alastair, *Kinds of Literature* (Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press, 1982)
- 'The Formation of Genre in the Renaissance and After', *New Literary History* 34 (2003), 185-200
- Foxon, David and McLaverty, James, eds., *Pope and the Early Eighteenth-Century Book Trade, The Lydell Lectures, Oxford 1975-76* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1991)
- Frye, Northrope, *The Anatomy of Criticism* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1957)

- Fulford, Tim, *Landscape, Liberty, and Authority: Poetry, Criticism and Politics from Thomson to Wordsworth* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, September 2009)
- Genette, Gerard, *The Architext: An Introduction* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1992)
- Gentles, Ian J., 'Fairfax, Thomas, third Lord Fairfax of Cameron (1612-1671) Parliamentary Army Officer, *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, ed. by Lawrence Goldman, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004)
- Gerrard, Christine, 'Pope, Peri Bathous, and the Whig Sublime' in "*Cultures of Whiggism*": *New Essays on English Literature and Culture in the Long Eighteenth Century*, ed. by David Womersley (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 2005)
- Gillespie, Stuart, *English Translation and Classical Reception* (Chichester: Wiley-Blackwell, 2011)
- Green, Peter, 'Introduction' in *The Poems of Catullus: A Bilingual Edition*, ed by Peter Green (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2005)
- Greene, Thomas M., *The light in Troy: imitation and discovery in Renaissance poetry* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1982)
- Griffin, Dustin, *Regaining Paradise: Milton and the Eighteenth Century* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1986)
- *Literary Patronage in England, 1650-1800* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996)
- *Authorship in the Long Eighteenth Century* (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 2014)
- Griffin, Robert J, 'The Eighteenth-Century Construction of Romanticism: Thomas Warton and The Pleasures of Melancholy', *English Literary History* 59 (1992), 799-815
- Griggs, Earl Leslie, ed., *Collected Letters of Samuel Taylor Coleridge, Vol. II 1801-1806* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1966)
- Haber, Judith, *Pastoral and the Poetics of Self-Contradiction: Theocritus to Marvell* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994)
- Hamilton, Paul, 'History and Historicism' in *The Cambridge History of Literary Criticism*, ed. by Christa Knellwolf and Christopher Norris (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008)
- Hammond, Brean, *Professional Imaginative Writing in England 1670-1740: 'Hackney for Bread'* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1997)

- *Pope Amongst the Satirists 1660-1750* (Tavistock: Northcote House Publishers, Ltd, 2005)
- Hammond, Paul, *Dryden and the Classical Traces of Rome* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999)
- *The Making of Restoration Poetry* (Cambridge: D.S. Brewer, 2006)
- *Notes & Queries* (June 2006)
- Hardie, Philip and Moore, Helen, *Classical Literary Careers and their Reception* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010)
- Hardie, Philip, ed., *Augustan Poetry and the Irrational* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2016)
- Heinzelman, Kurt, 'Roman Georgic in the Georgian Age: A Theory of Romantic Genres', *Texas Studies in literature and Language* 33 (1991), 182-214
- Hiltner, Ken, *What Else is Pastoral? Renaissance Literature and the Environment* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2011)
- Holberton, Edward, 'James Thomson's The Seasons and the Empire of the Seas', *Huntington Library Quarterly* 78 (2015), 41-60
- Hone, Joseph, *Literature and Party Politics at the Accession of Queen Anne* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2017)
- Hopkins, David, 'Dryden and his Contemporaries' in *The Oxford History of Literary Translation in English, Vol. 3, 1660-1790* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005)
- 'Dr. Leavis's Seventeenth Century', *Essays in Criticism* 64 (2014), 293-317
- Hopkinson, Neil, trans. and ed., *Theocritus, Moschus, Bion* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2015)
- Hutchings, W B, 'Can Pure Description Hold the Place of Sense: Thomson's Landscape Poetry' in *James Thomson: Essays for the Tercentenary*, ed. by Richard Terry (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2000)
- Ingelsfield, Robert, 'The British Library Revisions to The Seasons', *The Library* (1979), 62-9
- 'James Thomson, Aaron Hill, and the Poetic Sublime', *Journal for Eighteenth-Century Studies* 13 (1990)

- Jackson, Noel B, 'Critical Conditions: Coleridge, "Common Sense", and the Literature of Self-Experiment', *English Literary History* 70 (2003), 117-49
- Jones, Ewan James, "'Less Gross than Bodily": Materiality in Coleridge's Conversation Poems', *The Review of English Studies* Vol 64 No 264 (2013): 267-88
- *Coleridge and the Philosophy of Poetic Form* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2014)
- Kairoff, Claudia Thomas, 'Living on the Margin: Alexander Pope and the Rural Ideal', *Studies in the Literary Imagination* 38 (2005), 15-38
- Keats, John, 'Letter to John Hamilton Reynolds, November 22, 1817' in Quentin Skinner and Christopher Ricks, 'Up for Interpretation or What Is This Thing that Hearsay Is Not?' *Literary Imagination* 14 (2012), 125-42
- Kelliher, William H, 'Haward, Sir William'(1617-1704)', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, ed. by Lawrence Goldman (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004)
- Kermode, Frank, *English Pastoral Poetry: from the Beginnings to Marvell* (London: George G. Harrap & Co, 1952)
- *History and Value: The Clarendon Lectures and the Northcliffe Lectures* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1987)
- Kuchar, Gary, 'Andrew Marvell's Anamorphic Tears', *Studies in Philology*, 103 (2006), 345-381
- le Provost, Christina, 'More Unacknowledge Verse by Joseph Warton', *The Review of English Studies* Vol 37 No 147 (1986), 317-347
- Leask, Nigel, *Robert Burns and Pastoral: Poetry and Improvement in late Eighteenth-Century Scotland* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2015)
- Leavis, F R, *Revaluation: Tradition and Development in English Poetry* (London: Chatto and Windus, 1936)
- *The Common Pursuit* (London: Chatto and Windus, 1952)
- Leonard, John, *Faithful Labourers: A Reception History of "Paradise Lost," 1667-1970, Vol 2: Interpretative Issues* (Oxford: Oxford University, 2013)
- Levine, Joseph M, *The Battle of the Books: History and Literature in the Augustan Age* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1991)

- *Between the Ancients and the Moderns: Baroque Culture in Restoration England* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1999)
- Lindsay, Alexander, 'James Thomson' in *Index of English literary manuscripts. Vol. 3, 1700-1800. Pt. 4, Laurence Sterne - Edward Young, with a first-line index to parts 1-4*, ed. by Alexander Lindsay (London: Mansell, 1997)
- Lipking, Lawrence, *The Life of the Poet* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1981)
- Lockwood, Tom, *Ben Jonson in the Romantic Age* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005)
- 'Rochester and Rhyme' in *Lord Rochester in the Restoration World*, ed. by Matthew Augustine and Stephen Zwicker, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2015)
- 'Marvell and Jonson' in *The Oxford Handbook of Andrew Marvell*, ed. by Martin Dzelzainis and Edward Holberton (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2019)
- Lonsdale, Roger, ed., *The Poems of Gray, Collins, and Goldsmith* (New York: Longman Limited Group, 1969)
- Love, Harold, *English Clandestine Satire 1660-1702* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004)
- Loxley, James, 'Prepar'd at Last to Strike in with the Tyde? Andrew Marvell and Royalist Verse', *The Seventeenth Century* 10 (1995), 39-62
- 'On Exegetical Duty: Historical Pragmatics and the Grammar of the Libel', *Huntington Library Quarterly* 69 (2006), 83-104
- 'Echoes as Evidence in the Poetry of Andrew Marvell', *Studies in English Literature* 52 (2012), 165-85
- Mack, Maynard, *The Garden and the City: Retirement and Politics in the Later Poetry of Pope 1731-1743* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1969)
- *Collected in Himself: Essays Critical, Biographical, and Bibliographical on Pope and Some of His Contemporaries* (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 1982)
- trans. and ed., 'The Pastorals', *The Last and Greatest Art: Some Unpublished Poetical Manuscripts of Alexander Pope* (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 1984)
- Martinez, Aurora Faye, 'Feeling Fallen: A Retelling of the Biblical Myth of the Fall in a Musical Adaptation of Marvell's "A Dialogue between Thyrsis and Dorinda"' in *Music Myth, and Story in Medieval and Early Modern Culture* ed by Katherine Butler and Samantha Bassler (Woodbridge: Boydell and Brewer, 2019), p. 224-38

- McColley, Diane Kelsey, *Poetry and Ecology in the Age of Milton and Marvell* (Farnham: Ashgate Publishing, 2007)
- McDowell, Nicholas, *Poetry and the Allegiance in the English Civil Wars: Marvell and the Cause of Wit* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008)
- McGann, Jerome, *The Romantic Ideology: A Critical Investigation* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1983)
- McKeon, Michael, 'Theory and Practice in Historical Method' in *Rethinking Historicism from Shakespeare to Milton*, eds. Ann Baynes Cairo and Thomas Fulton (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012), 40-64
- McKillop, Alan Dugald, *The Background of The Seasons* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1942)
- 'Two 18<sup>th</sup> Century "First Works": 2. James Thomson's Juvenile Poems', *Newberry Library Bulletin* 4 (1955), 13-23
- *James Thomson (1700-1748) Letters and Documents* (Lawrence, Kansas: University of Kansas Press, 1958)
- McLaverly, James, *Pope, Print and Meaning* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001)
- Miller, Anthony, *Roman Triumphs and Early Modern English Culture* (Basingstroke: Palgrave, 2001)
- Mitchell, Sebastian, 'James Thomson's picture collection and British history painting', *Journal of the History of Collections* 23 (2011), 127-51
- Newlyn, Lucy, *Coleridge, Wordsworth and the Language of Allusion*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 2001)
- O'Neill, Michael, 'Anxious Cares: From Pope's Spleen to Coleridge's Dejection in *Studies in the Literary Imagination* 44.1 (2011): 99-118
- 'Coleridge's Genres' in *The Oxford Handbook of Samuel Taylor Coleridge*, ed. by Frederick Burwick (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012)
- 'Marvell and Nineteenth-Century Poetry: Wordsworth to Tennyson' in *The Oxford Handbook of Andrew Marvell*, ed. by Martin Dzelsainis and Edward Holberton (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2019) p. 758-59
- Parrish, Stephen Maxfield, ed., *Coleridge's Dejection: The Earliest Manuscripts and the Earliest Printings* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1988)



Patterson, Annabel, *Pastoral and Ideology: Virgil to Valery* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1987)

-- *Marvell: The Writer in Public Life* (Harlow: Pearson Education Ltd., 2000)

Pritchard, Alan, 'Marvell's *The Garden*: A Restoration Poem?', *Studies in English Literature* 23 (1983), 371-88

Reed, Mark L, *Wordsworth: The chronology of the Middle Years* (Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press, 1975)

Reynolds, Matthew, *The Poetry of Translation: From Chaucer & Petrarch to Homer & Logue* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011)

Ricks, Christopher, *Allusion to the Poets* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002),

Rivers, Isabel, *Classical and Christian Ideas in English Renaissance Poetry* (New York: Routledge, 1994)

Rogers, Pat, 'Form and Pattern in the Pastorals' in *Essays on Pope* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993), 37-53

-- *The Symbolic Design of Windsor Forest: Iconography, Pageant, and Prophecy in Pope's Early Work* (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 2004)

-- *Pope and the Destiny of the Stuarts: History, Politics, and Mythology in the Age of Queen Anne* (Oxford,: Oxford University Press, 2005)

Rosslyn, Felicity, 'Pope's Annotations to Tickell's Iliad Book One', *The Review of English Studies* Volume XXX Issue 117 (1979): 49-59

Rowland, Ingrid D, *The Culture of the High Renaissance: Ancients and Moderns in Sixteenth-Century Rome* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998)

Rumbold, Valerie, 'Appendix' in *The Dunciad in Four Books*, ed. by Valerie Rumbold (Harlow, Pearson Education, Ltd. 1999)

Sambrook, James, *English Pastoral Poetry* (Boston: Twayne Publishers, 1983)

-- *James Thomson 1700-1748: A Life*, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1991)

Schmidt, Robert, *Pope's Windsor Forest 1712: A study of the Washington University Holograph*, (St. Louis: Washington University, 1952)

Sherburn, George, *The Early Career of Alexander Pope* (Oxford: The Clarendon Press, 1934)

- ed., *The Correspondence of Alexander Pope, Volume 1 1704-1718*, ed by George Sherburn (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1956)
- Skinner, Marilyn B., *Catallus in Verona: A Reading of the Elegiac Libellus, Poems 65-116* (Columbus: The Ohio University Press, 2003)
- Snyder, Susan, *Pastoral Process: Spenser, Marvell, Milton* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1998)
- Solomon, Deborah, 'Walking the Commonplaces of Pastoral Precursors in Milton's Garden of Eden', *Seventeenth Century* 35 (2020), 773-98
- Terry, Richard, 'The Longer Eighteenth-century Poems (Akenside, Thomson, Young, Cowper and Others)' in *The Cambridge History of English Poetry*, ed. by Michael O'Neill (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010), 378-96
- Ulmer, William A., 'Radical Similarity: Wordsworth, Coleridge, and the Dejection Dialogue', *English Literary History* 76 (2009), 189-213
- Van der Walle, Kwinten, 'Editorialising Practices, Competitive marketability, and James Thomson's The Seasons', *Journal for Eighteenth Century Studies* 38 (2015), 257-76
- Williams, Abigail, *Poetry and the Creation of Whig Literary Culture 1681-1714* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005)
- 'Patronage and Whig Culture in the Early Eighteenth Century' in *Cultures of Whiggism': New Essays on English Literature and Culture in the Long Eighteenth Century*, ed. by David Womersley (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 2005)
- Wright, John Michael, 'Villiers, George, Second Duke of Buckingham (1628-1687)' *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, ed. by Lawrence Goldman, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004)
- Wu, Duncan, *Wordsworth's Reading 1770-1799* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993)
- *Wordsworth's Reading, 1800-1815* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995)
- Wynne, S. M., 'Gwyn, Eleanor [Nell] (1651-1687)', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, ed. by Lawrence Goldman (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004)